

**HUMAN RIGHTS EDUCATION IN ENGLAND AND MALAYSIA:
FAITH AND SECULAR SCHOOLS' KNOWLEDGE AND
PRACTICE.**

Submitted by **Zaimuariffudin Shukri Nordin** to the University of Exeter as a thesis for a degree of Doctor of Philosophy in Education, April 2010.

This study is available for Library use on the understanding that it is copyright material and that no quotation from the thesis may be published without proper acknowledgement.

I certify that all material in this thesis which is not my own work have been identified and that no material has previously been submitted and approved for the award of a degree by this or any other University.

(signed).....

Acknowledgements

I would like to take this opportunity to thank Associate Professor Cathie Holden and Dr Gill Haynes, who closely supervised my work, for their time and effort.

My research could not have been done without great support from all the Research Student Unit staff and my colleagues at the Graduate School of Education Exeter.

I would also like to thank the University Malaysia Sarawak for sponsoring my postgraduate studies in the United Kingdom.

Lastly, I would like to thank my wife, children and parents, who have been my inspiration.

I also hope my contribution to this field is useful.

Abstract

This thesis reports the findings of a study into human rights education (HRE) in four secondary schools in England and Malaysia. A key aim of the research was to investigate the extent to which faith may impact upon the delivery of HRE. For the purposes of comparison, one faith school and one secular school were sampled in each country. In each school, semi-structured interviews were undertaken with the curriculum coordinator and teachers responsible for delivering HRE and questionnaire surveys and focus group interviews were carried out with students in Years 8 and 9. Data were gathered in relation to: the nature and positioning of human rights education in each school; teachers' levels of confidence in delivering HRE and their pedagogical strategies; and the students' knowledge of human rights principles and the extent to which this knowledge shaped their attitudes and behaviour.

Findings from this study indicate that the teaching of human rights education is addressed differently in schools, depending on their staffing, curriculum priorities and religious status. In the English faith school, HRE was taught within the RE curriculum and was seen as a means to teach about Christianity; in the secular school, the emphasis was on human rights as universal values, delivered through the Citizenship curriculum. In both schools in Malaysia, where Islamic principles strongly underpin the national curriculum, human rights education was delivered as part of the Civics and Citizenship curriculum, but taught by RE teachers. Common concerns amongst teachers in both countries and both types of school related to appropriate training, sufficient curriculum time and confidence to teach about controversial issues. While there were school-level factors influencing delivery, these could not be disassociated from the wider socio-cultural, political and educational policy contexts.

The findings in relation to students' knowledge and practice of human rights also reflected the different contexts of each school and country. The key influences appeared less to do with religion (in that this did not appear to be a key factor in the differing responses from the two English schools) than with cultural, social and economic factors, though Islam underpins these in Malaysia. In general, English students had a deeper understanding of human rights but there was some dislocation between understanding

and actual attitudes and behaviour. In Malaysia, a much newer democracy, levels of understanding about human rights were somewhat lower but there were many issues on which English and Malaysian students expressed similar views. The most noticeable exception was in relation to respect for individuals regardless of their sexuality.

This was a small study and it is therefore not possible to generalise from its findings. However, it has raised some important issues about the teaching of HRE in both England and Malaysia. In both countries there needs to be further consideration of where in the curriculum HRE is best positioned, in order to ensure that it receives sufficient curriculum time and resources. More and better targeted in-service education is required to support teachers of human rights, with particular emphasis on the pedagogy of teaching controversial issues. In both countries it is important that teachers and students work together on understanding and practising the principles underpinning human rights.

Table of Contents

Acknowledgements	2
Abstract	3
Table of Contents	5
Abbreviations	11
Chapter 1 Introduction	12
1.1 Introduction	12
1.2 Purpose of the study	14
1.3 Research Design	15
Chapter 2 Literature Review	17
2.1 Human rights: an overview	17
2.2 Historical and philosophical origins and principles	18
2.3 The development of the modern human rights movement	20
2.4 Human rights in the United Kingdom	24
2.4.1 The development of human rights	24
2.4.2 Human rights and Christianity & civil law	24
2.5 Human rights in Asia	25
2.5.1 The development of human rights	25
2.6 Human rights in Malaysia	26
2.6.1 The development of human rights	26
2.7 Human rights and Islam & Islamic law	27
2.8 Challenges to human rights in modern society	29
- the need for human rights education.	
Chapter 3 Human Rights Education	34
3.1 Introduction	34
3.2 Human rights education in general	34
3.3 The rights of the child	35
3.4 History of citizenship and human rights education in England	36

3.4.1	Curriculum and practice	38
3.5	Human rights education in Malaysia	40
3.5.1	Curriculum in theory and practice	41
3.6	Key Differences: key questions for citizenship and human rights educators	43
3.7	Schools' structure and curriculum	44
3.8	England	44
3.8.1	Secular and faith schools	44
3.8.2	Curriculum in general	45
3.8.3	Intake	46
3.9	Malaysia	46
3.9.1	Secular and faith schools	46
3.9.2	Curriculum in general	47
3.9.3	Intake	48
3.10	Key issues for faith schools in UK and Malaysia	48
3.11	Key areas of the human rights and citizenship education curriculum	52
3.12	The rights of the child to express their own opinion and to participate through the use of school councils	52
3.13	The right of the child to protection from physical and emotional abuse	54
3.13.1	Corporal punishment	55
3.13.2	Bullying	56
3.13.3	The right of all races to be treated equally and with respect	59
Chapter 4 Research Design and Methodology		62
4.1	Introduction	62
4.1.1	My personal journey	62
4.2	Research approach	65
4.3	Research paradigms	66
4.3.1	Positivism	66
4.3.2	Interpretivism	66
4.4	Combining methodologies	67
4.4.1	A comparative study	68
4.5	Research questions and sub questions	69

4.6	Research contexts	70
4.6.1	Details of the English schools	70
4.6.2	Details of the Malaysian schools	71
4.7.	Phases of research	74
4.8	Research tools	76
4.8.1	The questionnaire	76
4.8.2	The interviews	77
4.8.3	Individual interviews with school staff	78
4.8.4	Focus group interviews with students	79
4.8.5	Analysis of interview data	80
4.9	Ethical issues	80
4.9.1	Gaining access	81
4.9.2	Informed consent	81
4.9.3	Issues of stress/harm	82
4.9.4	Issues of confidentiality	82
4.9.5	Issues of data storage	82
4.10	Pilot studies:-questionnaire and interview	82
4.10.1	Review of pilot study 2	85
4.10.2	Comments on the pilots of the questionnaires	85
4.11	Review of the pilots of the interviews	86
4.12	The data collection phase	87
4.12.1	Experience in England	87
4.13	Experience in Malaysia	88
4.14	Barriers and difficulties	89
Chapter 5 Data Analysis and Findings		92
5.0	Introduction	92
5.1	England	93
5.1.1	England School A	94
5.1.2	Location and student background	94
5.1.3	Curriculum	94
5.1.4	Coordinator Anderson interview	98
5.1.5	Coordinator Anderson: summary and discussion	101
5.1.6.	Teacher interviews	102
5.2	England: School B	107

5.2.1	Location and student background	107
5.2.2	Curriculum	107
5.2.3	Coordinator Bowden interview	109
5.2.4	Coordinator Bowden: summary and discussion	112
5.2.5	Teacher interviews	113
5.3	Malaysia	118
5.3.1	Malaysia: School C Location and student background	119
5.3.2	Curriculum	119
5.3.3	Coordinator interview	121
5.3.4	Teacher interviews	121
5.4	Malaysia: School D Location and background	122
5.4.1	Curriculum	123
5.4.2	Coordinator interview	123
5.4.3	Teacher interviews	123
5.5	Comparing schools, coordinators, teachers in England and Malaysia	125
5.5.1	Faith schools	126
5.5.2	Secular schools	129
Chapter 6 Findings From The Questionnaire		135
6.1	Students' perceptions of human rights in principle and in practice	135
6.2	Structure of the questionnaire	135
6.2.1	Knowledge of human rights in England	136
6.2.2	Knowledge of human rights in Malaysia	140
6.2.3	Comparative knowledge of human rights in England and Malaysia	144
6.2.4	Knowledge of democratic rights in England	146
6.2.5	Knowledge of democratic rights in Malaysia	147
6.2.6	Comparative knowledge and understanding of democratic rights in England and Malaysia	149
6.2.7	Personal understanding of human rights in England	150
6.2.8	Personal understanding of human rights in Malaysia	153
6.2.9	Comparison of personal understanding of human rights in England and Malaysia	154
6.2.10	Conclusion	155
6.3	Putting human rights into practice	156

6.3.1	Democratic rights in practice in England	156
6.3.2	Democratic rights in practice in Malaysia	158
6.3.3	Comparison of democratic rights in practice England and Malaysia	159
6.3.4	Freedom from abuse: practice and perceptions – England	159
6.3.5	Freedom from abuse: practice and perceptions -Malaysia	162
6.3.6	Comparison of freedom from abuse: practice and perceptions: England and Malaysia	164
6.3.7	Respecting diversity: expressed values - England	165
6.3.8	Respecting diversity: expressed values – Malaysia	169
6.3.9	Respecting diversity: comparison of expressed values England and Malaysia	172
6.3.10	Respecting diversity: values in practice – England	174
6.3.11	Respecting diversity: values in practice – Malaysia	177
6.3.12	Respecting diversity: comparison of values in practice between England and Malaysia	179
6.3.13	Respecting diversity: comparison between knowledge, expressed values and practice.	180
6.3.14	Learning about human rights – England	181
6.3.15	Learning about human rights - Malaysia	182
6.3.16	Learning about human rights in England and Malaysia: a comparison	182
6.4	Conclusion	183
Chapter 7 Discussion of Major Findings		185
7.1	Brief recap of rationale for research and restatement of research questions	185
7.2	Delivery of human rights education in schools	185
7.2.1	Place and nature of human rights education in curriculum	185
7.2.2	Responsibilities for delivering human rights education.	191
7.2.3	Pedagogical practices	194
7.3	Students’ engagement with human rights.	196
7.3.1	Knowledge and practice of human rights.	197
7.3.2	What accounts for differences in students’ knowledge and practice of human rights?	205

7.4	Implication and recommendations for Policy and Practice	206
7.4.1	The nature and place of human rights education in the curriculum	206
7.4.2	Teaching training	208
7.4.3	Promoting effective practice in human rights education	209
7.4.4	Whole school approaches to human rights education	212
7.4.5	Extending human rights education	213
7.5	Reviewing the study	213
7.6	Personal journey	216
	Bibliography	218
	Appendices	231
	Appendix 1 Timeline of Human Rights	231
	Appendix 2 Permission letter to secular school Malaysia	233
	Appendix 3 Permission letter to faith school Malaysia	234
	Appendix 4 Student questionnaire	235
	Appendix 5 Coordinator interview schedule	238
	Appendix 6 Teacher interview schedule	239
	Appendix 7 Focus group interview schedule - students	240
	Appendix 8 Exeter University BERA Ethical Certificate	243
	Appendix 9 Pilot Study questionnaire	246
	Appendix 10 Religious Education Scheme of Work Year 8	
	English faith school	250
	Appendix 11 Social Studies Overview – English secular school	254
	Appendix 12 Civics & Citizenship Scheme of Work - Malaysian	
	faith & secular schools	256
	Appendix 13 Student questionnaire data: England and Malaysia	258
	Appendix 14 Key Stage 3	269
	Appendix 15 Working definitions	270

Abbreviations

ACT	The Association for Citizenship Teaching
AST	Advanced Skills Teachers
CPD	Continuing Professional Development
CRE	Commission for Racial Equality
DfES	Department for Education and Skills
ECHR	European Convention on Human Rights
ITT	Initial Teacher Training
NIACE	National Institute of Adult Continuing Education
QCA	Qualifications and Curriculum Authority
SUHAKAM	Malaysian Commission of Human Rights
TDA	Training and Development Agency