Variable versus Fixed Rate Mortgages and Optimal Monetary Policy

Jack R Rogers
PhD in Economics
University of Exeter

November 2009
Variable versus Fixed Rate Mortgages and Optimal Monetary Policy

1 Volume

Submitted by Jack R Rogers to the University of Exeter as thesis for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy in Economics, November 2009.

This thesis is available for Library use on the understanding that it is copyright material and that no quotation from the thesis may be published without proper acknowledgement.

I certify that all material in this thesis which is not my own work has been identified and that no material has previously been submitted and approved for the award of a degree by this or any other University.

.............................................................(signature)
Abstract

The overall aim of the research presented in this thesis is threefold: To empirically examine monetary transmission to UK retail mortgage rates; to examine why fixed versus variable rate mortgage lending differs across EU-15 countries; and to build a DSGE model which can be used for analysing optimal monetary policy in economies with different proportions of fixed or variable rate mortgage contracts. Chapter 2 investigates the transmission from UK policy and a range of wholesale money market rates to retail mortgage rates using a single-equation error correction model (SEECP) framework, from 1995 to 2009. The results add to previous studies by showing that the UK retail banking sector is imperfectly competitive at the aggregate level. More specifically, discounted rates, and to a lesser extent fixed rates behave competitively, whilst standard variable rates do not, which can be interpreted as evidence of exploitation of inert borrower behaviour. A snap-shot of the relative levels of variable rate lending across EU-15 countries is taken in the next Chapter 3, illustrating general cross-country differences. Risk simulations show that economies more conducive to variable rate mortgages include those with relatively volatile, persistent, and low inflation; low and stable real interest rates; high real income growth; and low correlation between inflation and real interest rate shocks. Regressions show that macroeconomic histories may indeed be important determinants of variable rate mortgage prevalence. The final Chapter 4 integrates a quantity optimising banking sector that lends under either a fixed or variable rate, into a model with borrowing constrained households. This provides a framework that can be used to investigate relationships between the structure of debt contracts and monetary policy. In particular, the propagation of a productivity shock in the non-durable sector under Ramsey monetary policy is presented, and it is demonstrated that the introduction of overlapping debt contracts tempers the effect of the financial multiplier. An appropriate design of the composition of fixed versus variable rate debt contracts, both their length and interest rate composition, could therefore reduce the volatility of key economic variables, and so there are important policy implications.
Contents

1 Introduction

1.1 Aims and Objectives .................................................. 1
1.2 Policy Background .................................................... 2

1.3 Methodology ............................................................... 4
1.3.1 Overview .............................................................. 4
1.3.2 DSGE Modelling ...................................................... 6
1.4 Summary of Contributions and Suggested Extensions ............. 10

2 Monetary Transmission to UK Retail Rates ......................... 12
2.1 Methodology ............................................................... 16
2.2 Data and Analysis ....................................................... 21
2.3 Equilibrium Relationships ............................................ 22
2.3.1 Variable Mortgage Rates and Short Yields .................... 25
2.3.2 Fixed Mortgage Rates and Long Yields ......................... 27
2.4 Short Run Adjustment ................................................... 28
2.4.1 Estimation ............................................................ 28
2.4.2 Variable Mortgage Rates and Short Yields .................... 29
2.4.3 Fixed Mortgage Rates and Long Yields ......................... 31
2.4.4 Asymmetric Adjustment .......................................... 32
2.5 Conclusion ............................................................... 35

3 Lending Levels in EU-15 Countries .................................. 37
3.1 Introduction ............................................................... 37
3.2 Measuring Wealth and Income Risk ................................ 38
3.2.1 Wealth Risk .......................................................... 38
3.2.2 Derivation of Wealth Risk Equation ............................ 41
3.2.3 Income Risk .......................................................... 42
3.2.4 Derivation of Income Risk Equation ............................ 43
3.3 Theoretical Trade-Offs from Risk Simulations ..................... 44
3.4 Explaining Levels of VR/FR Mortgage Lending Across EU-15 ...... 49
3.4.1 VR/FR Mortgage Prevalence Across EU-15 .................... 49
## List of Tables

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Table Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2.2.1</td>
<td>Summary of Data</td>
<td>21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.3.1</td>
<td>Long Run Pass Through to Standard Variable Mortgage Rates</td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.3.2</td>
<td>Long Run Pass Through to Discounted Variable Mortgage Rates</td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.3.3</td>
<td>Long Run Pass Through from Government Bond to Fixed Mortgage Rates</td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.3.4</td>
<td>Long Run Pass Through from Interbank Loan to Fixed Mortgage Rates</td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.4.1</td>
<td>Short Run Pass Through to Variable Mortgage Rates</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.4.2</td>
<td>Short Run Pass Through to Fixed Mortgage Rates</td>
<td>31</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.4.3</td>
<td>Asymmetric Adjustment of Variable Mortgage Rates</td>
<td>33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.4.4</td>
<td>Asymmetric Adjustment of Fixed Mortgages</td>
<td>34</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2.1</td>
<td>Wealth Risk</td>
<td>40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2.2</td>
<td>Income Risk</td>
<td>43</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3.1</td>
<td>Annualised Parameters</td>
<td>48</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.4.1</td>
<td>Variable-Rate Mortgage Prevalence Index</td>
<td>50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.4.2</td>
<td>Regression Variables</td>
<td>51</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2.1</td>
<td>Summary of dynamic system</td>
<td>80</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A.2.1</td>
<td>Stationarity Tests (Whole Sample)</td>
<td>104</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A.2.2</td>
<td>Stationarity Tests (Pre-Crisis)</td>
<td>105</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A.3.1</td>
<td>Cointegration Tests (Whole Sample)</td>
<td>106</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A.3.2</td>
<td>Cointegration Tests (Whole Sample)</td>
<td>106</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A.4.1</td>
<td>Cointegration Tests (Whole Sample)</td>
<td>107</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A.4.2</td>
<td>Cointegration Tests (Whole Sample)</td>
<td>108</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
List of Figures

2.0.1 Spread of LIBOR (3 month) over Policy Rate. Line indicates August 2007. ......................................................... 13

3.3.1 Volatility Parameters and VR Conduciveness ................................................................. 46
3.3.2 Mean Parameters and VR Conduciveness ................................................................. 47
3.3.3 Inflation Persistence and VR Conduciveness ................................................................. 47
3.4.1 Scatter Plot of VR Prevalence and Inflation Volatility ................................................... 53
3.4.2 Scatter Plot of VR Prevalence and Nominal Interest Rate Volatility ............................ 53

4.7.1 Impulse responses to a productivity shock in ND sector with s.d. 0.005. In the model with banking sector and overlapping debt contracts 95% of impatient households are on variable rate contracts (Ψ = 0.05). 91
4.7.2 Impulse responses of interest rates to a productivity shock in ND sector with s.d. 0.005 for several values of Ψ. 92
4.7.3 Impulse responses of consumption to a productivity shock in ND sector with s.d. 0.005 for several values of Ψ. 93
4.7.4 Impulse responses of labour supply and real wages to a productivity shock in ND sector with s.d. 0.005 for several values of Ψ. 94
4.7.5 Impulse responses of debt, inflation, relative price, and the strength of collateral constraint to a productivity shock in ND sector with s.d. 0.005 for several values of Ψ. 95
4.7.6 Impulse responses to an iid ND productivity shock with s.d. 0.005 for different average lengths of debt contracts. 96
4.7.7 Variability of key variables as a function of Ψ. Productivity shock in ND sector with s.d. 0.1. 97