

How is contemporary English spiritual and religious identity constructed and reconstructed by performance?

Submitted by Sarah Joanne Goldingay, to the University of Exeter as a thesis for the degree of *Doctor of Philosophy* in Drama, April 2010.

This thesis is available for Library use on the understanding that it is copyright material and that no quotation from the thesis may be published without proper acknowledgement.

I certify that all material in this thesis which is not my own work has been identified and that no material has previously been submitted and approved for the award of a degree by this or any other University.

(signature)

Abstract

The relationship between theatrical performance and religion in Western culture has always been complex and often troubled; and yet at points of encounter each provides fertile ground for exploring questions about how our religious and spiritual identity is constructed through society. This is particularly true of England today. The arrival of the 21st century seems to have heralded a renewed interest in questions surrounding religious practice and spiritual seeking.

When debates about the nature and implications of religious belief are so high on the cultural agenda, performance inevitably becomes a public site of these debates. This is reflected in the academy, and while sociologists of religion have become increasingly aware of the 'performative' aspects of religious practices, contemporary performance practitioners and theorists have become more concerned with questions of religion, spirituality and the sacred. This thesis acknowledges both aspects of this nexus. It contextualises these manifestations in popular culture through recent scholarship from the sociology of religion, and uses frameworks and discourse from performance scholarship to consider the implications of psychophysical practice on performative identity construction. To do this it critiques performance culture's use of religion and spirituality to describe both positive and negative aspects of performance and its genealogies, which at its most extreme, asserts the 'failure' of mainstream religion and moves to assume the mantle of religion itself.

This thesis, through textual and performance analysis, literature reviews, archival research and fieldwork argues that performance optics offer significant mechanisms for examining the efficacy of embodied practices that construct the infinite variety of religious, spiritual and cultural beliefs. It includes a series of case studies which explore how notions of 'Englishness' as civic-identity are interwoven with concepts of religiosity and responsibility. They are informed by my fieldwork as a participant and observer in acts of Christian and Spiritualist worship, in addition to my pilgrimage to Lourdes and Glastonbury with Goddess worshippers and Catholics.

This thesis asks how is contemporary English religious and spiritual identity constructed and reconstructed by performance?

Acknowledgements

I am grateful to the many people whose generosity made this PhD possible: those who have invited me into their worship communities, as well as my many academic, financial and emotional supporters.

The Arts and Humanities Research Council funded my time over the last three years and financed my visit to the Donner Institute for Research in Religious and Cultural History in Turku, Finland to give a paper. This has subsequently been published in the 21st volume of *Scripta Instituti Donneriani Aboensis* 'Postmodern Spirituality'. I am grateful to editors Tore Ahlbäck and Björn Dahla for their insight. Two other elements of the thesis have also already been published in *Studies in Theatre and Performance* 29:1 and *New Interpretations of Spirit Possession* (2010). I am indebted to their editors: first, Peter Thomson for his encouragement to write (quickly and courageously) on a controversial subject for *STP*, as well as for his editorial insight, and for Bettina Schmidt and Lucy Huskinson for their expertise on the nuances of writing a chapter for an interdisciplinary readership in an international collection. (See chapters one and six).

The drama department at the University of Exeter has been tireless in both its encouragement of my work and in challenging my thinking. In addition to the endless patience, insight, encouragement and much needed criticism provided by my supervisor Professor Mick Mangan, Dr Jerri Daboo, in particular, has demonstrated a knack for knowing just what question to ask, or what book to suggest in order to fuel my research when it has been close to stalling. Moreover, I am grateful to David Moss and his colleagues and students at the South West Ministerial Training College who have been consistently open, honest and responsive to my questions (and challenges) about (and to) their faith and beliefs. I am also indebted to Michael Evans and his fellow members of the Exeter Soul Rescue Group who transformed my understanding of contemporary Spiritualism and notions of authenticity.

Much of my fieldwork has been facilitated by my work as a researcher with the Ian Ramsey Centre for Science and Religion (Oxford). Our interdisciplinary pilgrimages have taken us to Lourdes, France with pilgrims from the Westminster Catholic Diocese and to the Goddess conference in Glastonbury run by Cathy Jones and the team at the Goddess Temple. In both cases, pilgrims were generous enough to share their spiritual journeys and life experiences with me in various rites, interviews and discussions. To them I am grateful. Moreover, my fellow researchers Miguel Farias, Wiebke Friese and Alana Harris have been both inspiring and grounding. Alana in particular, is a gifted scholar and insightful tactician, who has had the great talent (and good humour) to place things repeatedly in a much-needed perspective, for which I will be forever thankful.

But really, this is for those people who encouraged me to 'go and fly my kite': Mark, Mum and Dad. Thank you.

Table of Contents

<i>Abstract</i>	2
<i>Acknowledgements</i>	3
<i>Table of Contents</i>	5
Part One: Context	7
Chapter One: Introduction.....	8
Research Methodologies	9
‘Englishness’	11
Structure of the Thesis.....	11
Chapter Two: Research Context I - Social Science and Popular Culture.....	15
What would Jesus do? Vote BNP	15
A post-secular, apathetic, secular, fundamentalist society?	20
Dennett, Dawkins and Definitions of Religion	29
Secularisation and Apathy.....	36
Fundamentalism	49
Believing without belonging	53
Chapter Three: Research Context II - Performance Scholarship.....	61
Performance histories, methodologies and the antitheatrical assumption.....	61
“Holiness and Theatricality behave as if their love has never been consummated”	67
Performance Culture: residual, dominant and emergent narratives.....	70
Complications: Problems with the linear narrative	84
Theory for Performance/Religious Studies	108

Saving Each Other.....	121
Part Two: Case Studies.....	130
Chapter 4: ‘Mainstream’ C of E practice	131
The performance of the liturgy: scripting worship.....	133
The performance of the liturgy: enacting the script	157
Beyond the liturgy: Improvised Performances.....	167
The Rules: horizons of expectations and rhetorical contracts	178
Performance Creates Belief.....	184
Chapter 5: Segue on Catholic and Goddess pilgrimage	186
Performing in “a place apart”	187
The mythogeography of pilgrimage	191
Lourdes: Mountains and Town planning.....	192
Glastonbury: The tor and the High Street.....	196
Costume: dressing as your better-self.....	199
Chapter 6: Spiritualism, Mediumship and the complexities of Belief.....	203
Watching the Dead Speak	205
Performance 1: Shaun Dennis	210
Performance 2: Soul Rescue.....	216
Performance 3: Performing Possession?	224
Three in one: multiple states of consciousness.....	234
Chapter 7: Conclusions	240
Glossary.....	246
Bibliography	248

