Power and Resistance in the Classroom:  
*Teachers’ and Pupils’ Narratives on Disaffection*

Submitted by Mohamed Moustakim to the University of Exeter  
as a thesis for the degree of  
Doctor of Education  
in June 2010

This thesis is available for Library use on the understanding that it is copyright material and that no quotation from the thesis may be published without proper acknowledgement.

I certify that all material in this thesis which is not my own work has been identified and that no material has previously been submitted and approved for the award of a degree by this or any other University.

Signature: M. Moustakim
Abstract

This study sought to analyse critically the discourse of pupils’ disaffection captured in the views of a teacher, a Learning Mentor and a group of six pupils from key stage 4 at a secondary school in south London. The analysis examined how some pupils acquired the label ‘disaffected’ and considered the extent to which dominant curriculum ideologies and power relations between teachers and pupils contributed to pupils’ disconnection from learning. Additionally, the study examined the effectiveness of the Alternative Education project organised by the school in a bid to engage disaffected pupils in learning.

The corpus of data was generated through a combination of semi-structured one to one interviews and a focus group interview. Drawing on Fairclough’s (1989, 2001, 2003) approach to Critical Discourse Analysis (CDA), excerpts from the data were chosen on the basis of their salience to the key themes of the study to describe, interpret and explain the opaque and contradictory discourse of disaffection.

The teachers’ narratives largely located explanations for pupils’ disconnection from learning in pupils’ cognitive, emotional and behavioural pathologies or the influence of a moral underclass culture in their communities. The pupils’ counter-narratives suggested that their disengagement was a rational response to a perception of de-motivating curricula and disrespectful teachers, resulting in a counter school culture, where resistance accorded status among peers and compliance with teachers’ demands for conformity earned the derisory label ‘Neek’.

The teacher’s narrative also revealed that curriculum overload and the preoccupation with attainment targets posed significant challenges in his attempts to engage disaffected learners. However, the success of the Alternative Education Programme highlighted the importance of flexibility and positive educator-pupil relationships in capturing and sustaining the interest of learners.

It is argued that an adequate analysis of the determinants of disaffection ought to consider the impact of instrumentality in education on relationships in the situational, institutional and societal contexts of schooling. Furthermore, the significance of class, ethnicity and gender on the academic under-achievement of black working class boys, can not be overstated.
LIST OF CONTENTS

Page

ABSTRACT 2
LIST OF CONTENTS 3
LIST OF TABLES AND ILLUSTRATIONS 6
LIST OF APPENDICES 7

CHAPTER 1 - INTRODUCTION 8
1.1 Background to the Study 10
  1.1.1 Defining Disaffection 14
  1.1.2 The Wider Context of Disaffection 15
1.2 Conceptual Framework 16
1.3 The Aims, Research Questions and Lenses Used in the Study 17

CHAPTER 2 - LITERATURE REVIEW 21
2.1 Constructions of Disaffection 22
  2.1.1 Teachers’ Perspectives on Disaffection 26
  2.1.2 Pupils’ Perspectives on Disaffection 28
  2.1.3 Affective, Behavioural and Cognitive Causes of Disaffection 29
  2.1.4 Labelling and the Construction of Deviant Identities 30
2.2 Power and Resistance in the Classroom 34
  2.2.1 Power In and Behind the Discourse of Disaffection 34
  2.2.2 Disaffection as Resistance to the School as an Institution 37
  2.2.3 Pedagogic and Curriculum Dimensions of Disaffection 39
2.3 The Impact of Gender, Ethnicity and Class on Academic Achievement 41
2.4 The Effectiveness of Strategies to Promote Pupils’ Engagement with Learning 44
2.5 Chapter Summary 49

CHAPTER 3 - RESEARCH METHODOLOGY 51
3.1 Developing a Research Approach 51
3.2 From Phenomenology to Critical Discourse Analysis 53
3.3 The Research Approach Taken in this Study 54
3.4 Criticality in Critical Discourse Analysis 56
### CHAPTER 4 - RESEARCH DESIGN

- **4.1** The Study Population
- **4.2** Setting up the Fieldwork
- **4.3** The Focus Group Interview
- **4.4** One to One Interviews
  - **4.4.1** Interview with a Year 10 Teacher
  - **4.4.2** Interview with the Learning Mentor
- **4.5** Data analysis
  - **4.5.1** Stage One: Description
  - **4.5.2** Stage Two: Interpretation
  - **4.5.3** Stage Three: Explanation
- **4.6** Ethical Considerations

### CHAPTER 5 - ANALYSIS AND DISCUSSION

- **5.1** Description
  - **5.1.1** How do Pupils Acquire the Label Disaffected? (83)
    - **5.1.1.1** The NASC Teachers’ Characterisation of Disaffection (83)
    - **5.1.1.2** The Teacher’s Perspective (84)
    - **5.1.1.3** The Learning Mentor’s Perspective (86)
  - **5.1.2** How Do Pupils Perceive Teachers’ Characterisation of Disaffection? (87)
  - **5.1.3** How Significant is the Influence of Peers on Pupils’ Engagement with Learning? (89)
  - **5.1.4** Pedagogic and Curriculum Dimensions of Disaffection (91)
    - **5.1.4.1** The Teacher’s Perspective (92)
    - **5.1.4.2** The Learning Mentor’s Perspective (93)
    - **5.1.4.3** The Pupils’ perspectives (94)
  - **5.1.5** The Effectiveness of the Alternative Education Programme (95)
    - **5.1.5.1** The Teacher’s Perspective (96)
    - **5.1.5.2** The Learning Mentor’s Perspective (96)
    - **5.1.5.3** The Pupils’ Perspectives (97)
  - **5.1.6** Metaphors in the Text (98)
- **5.2** Interpretation
  - **5.2.1** Ambiguity and Contradictions in the Discourse of Disaffection (103)
  - **5.2.2** The Economy of Respect (105)
- **5.3** Intertextuality in the Discourse of Disaffection (109)
  - **5.3.1** The Policy Context of Social Exclusion and Disaffection (110)
5.3.2 Curriculum Relevance 112

5.4 Explanation 116

5.4.1 The Impact of Instrumentality on Learner Engagement 117
5.4.2 ‘Race’, Gender and Class Inequality in Education 120
5.4.3 Oppositional Performances in the Classroom 123

CHAPTER 6 - CONCLUSION 127

6.1 Constructions of Disaffection 128

6.1.1 How do Some Pupils Acquire the Label ‘Disaffected’? 128

6.2 Pedagogic and Curriculum Dimensions of Disaffection 132

6.2.1 How Significant is Curriculum Relevance to Pupils’ Engagement with Learning? 132
6.2.2 How Significant are Pupils’ and Teachers’ Relationships on Pupils’ Engagement with Learning? 133
6.2.3 How Significant is the Influence of Peers on Pupils’ Engagement with Learning? 135

6.3 The Effectiveness of the Alternative Education Programme in Promoting Pupils’ Engagement with Learning 137

6.4 Reflections on the Research Process 139

6.5 Implications for Personal Development and Professional Practice 141

List of Appendices in Chronological Order 143
Appendices 144
Bibliography 165