

**NORM DEVELOPMENT AND KNOWLEDGE CREATION IN THE WORLD  
SYSTEM – PROTECTING PEOPLE, INTELLECTUAL PROPERTY AND THE  
ENVIRONMENT**

**Submitted by Preslava Stoeva, to the University of Exeter as a thesis for the degree of  
Doctor of Philosophy in International Relations, January 2005**

This thesis is available for Library use on the understanding that it is copyright material and no quotation from the thesis may be published without proper acknowledgement.

I certify that all material in this thesis which is not my own work has been identified and that no material has previously been submitted and approved for the award of a degree by this or any other University.

---

Preslava Stoeva

## **Abstract**

This thesis develops a theoretical model to explain the creation of international behavioural norms drawing on two literatures: Constructivism in International Relations and the Sociology of Knowledge. This theoretical model draws attention to the interplay between scientific knowledge and normative concerns in the process of norms creation, to the role of non-state actors in norm construction, as well as to the importance of states in normative negotiations. I have also sought to uncover different types of power that both states and non-state actors have employed and the tactics of bargaining and persuasion which prevail and lead to the successful creation of international norms.

The proposed theoretical model is applied to three case-studies, which are the creation of the norm outlawing the use of torture, the norm protecting intellectual property rights in the pharmaceutical industry, and the norm for the protection of the atmosphere from the effects of human activities to prevent or slow down global warming. The historical reconstruction of events leading up to the legalisation and operationalisation of these norms has revealed important similarities in the way that these norms were negotiated. There is a resemblance in the manner in which scientific knowledge and normative beliefs interacted. All three case-studies exposed the degree to which non-state actors – NGOs, scientific communities, advocacy organisations, religious groups, businesses, etc. – participated in the creation of international norms, and although this is not a new concept in itself, it is worth reconsidering its intensity and the role of these actors in world politics. My research into the development of these three international norms has also emphasised the need for a better understanding of the points of closure in scientific, normative, and political debates. I argue that the way in which closure is reached is directly relevant to the strength, effectiveness and authority of the norm created.

## Table of Contents

<i>List of Acronyms and Abbreviations</i>	3
<b>1. Introduction</b>	5
Selection of Case Studies	15
Methodology	17
<b>2. Theorising Norm Development</b>	21
Theoretical Approaches	24
Social Constructivism	24
Theories of the Sociology of Scientific Knowledge	42
The Synthetic Theoretical Model of Norm Evolution	52
<b>3. Protecting Individuals from the Use of Torture</b>	72
Brief History of Torture	76
Normative and Political Context of the Post-War World	84
Theoretical Model and Empirical Findings	91
Conclusions	144
<b>4. Protecting Intellectual Property Rights in the Pharmaceutical Industry</b>	148
Brief History of Intellectual Property Protection	153
Theoretical Model and Empirical Findings	165
Conclusions	219
<b>5. Protecting the Atmosphere to Avoid Climate Change</b>	222
Brief History of Climate Change Research	229
Theoretical Model and Empirical Findings	243
Conclusions	284
<b>6. Conclusions</b>	287
Theorising Normative Change	290
Normative Change in world politics	298
Conclusions	312
<i>Appendix 1</i>	314
<i>Bibliography</i>	315

## LIST OF ACRONYMS AND ABBREVIATIONS

ACAT	Action by Christians Against Torture
ACTPN	Advisory Committee on Trade Policy and Negotiation
AGBM	Ad-hoc Group on the Berlin Mandate (relating to the Convention on Climate Change)
AI	Amnesty International
AOSIS	Allience of Small Island States
APPEN	Asia-Pacific Peoples' Environment Network
APT	Association for the Prevention of Torture
ASEP	Asian Society For Environmental Protection
BIRPI	United International Bureaux for the Protection of Intellectual Property
BIPs	Bilateral Intellectual Property Agreements
BITs	Bilateral Investment Treaties
BMA	British Medical Association
CAT	Convention Against Torture
CHR	Commission of Human Rights
CINAT	The Coalition of International NGOs Against Torture
CIOMS	Council for International Organisations of Medical Sciences
CO <sub>2</sub>	Carbon Dioxide
CoP	Conference of the Parties taking place under the Framework Convention on Climate Change
CPT	Consumer Project on Technology
CSCT	Swiss Committee Against Torture
ECOSOC	Economic and Social Committee of the United Nations
EU	European Union
FCCC	Framework Convention on Climate Change
FIELD	Foundation for International Environmental Law and Development
GATT	General Agreement on Tariffs and Trade
GCC	Global Climate Coalition
GCMS	General Circulation Models
GEF	Global Environmental Facility

GHGs	Greenhouse Gases
HAI	Health Action International
Health GAP	Global Access Project Coalition
IAPL	International Association of Penal Law
ICCPR	International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights
ICJ	International Commission of Jurists
ICRC	International Committee of the Red Cross
ICSU	International Council of Scientific Unions
ICTSD	International Centre for Trade and Sustainable Development
IIPA	International Intellectual Property Alliance
ILO	International Labour Organisation
INC	Intergovernmental Negotiating Committee to negotiate a framework convention on climate change
IP	Intellectual Property
IPC	Intellectual Property Committee
IPCC	Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change
IPRs	Intellectual Property Rights
IRCT	International Rehabilitation Council for Torture Victims
LDC	Least Developed Country
MIT	Massachusetts Institute of Technology
MSF	Medecins Sans Frontiers (Doctors Without Borders)
NASA	National Aeronautics and Space Administration
OECD	Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development
OMCT	World Organisation Against Torture
OPCAT	Optional Protocol to the Convention Against Torture
OPEC	Organisation of Petroleum Exporting Countries
PhRMA	Pharmaceutical Research and Manufacturers of America
PR	Public Relations
RCT	Research Centre for Torture Victims
SCEP	Study of Critical Environmental Problems
SCOT	Social Construction of Technology
SEI	Stockholm Environmental Institute
SMIC	Study of Man's Impact on Climate

SSK	Sociology of Scientific Knowledge
TB	Tuberculosis
TRIPs	Trade Related aspects of Intellectual Property Rights
UDHR	Universal Declaration of Human Rights
UNAIDS	United Nations Programme on HIV/AIDS
UNCED	United Nations Conference on Environment and Development (1992)
UNCHE	United Nations Conference on Human Environment (1972)
UNCTAD	United Nations Conference on Trade and Development
UNDP	United Nations Development Programme
UNEP	United Nations Environment Programme
UNESCO	United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organisation
UNFPA	United Nations Population Fund
UNGA	United Nations General Assembly
UNHCHR	United Nations Office of the High Commissioner for Human Rights
UNICEF	United Nations International Children's Emergency Fund
USITC	United States International Trade Commission
USTR	United States Trade Representative
VSO	Voluntary Service Overseas
WB	World Bank
WCED	World Commission on Environment and Development
WCP	World Climate Program
WHA	World Health Assembly
WHO	World Health Organisation
WIPO	World Intellectual Property Organisation
WMA	World Medical Association
WMO	World Meteorological Organisation
WPA	World Psychiatric Association
WTO	World Trade Organisation