‘Changed by the Encounter’: The Learning and Change that Counsellors and Psychotherapists Experience as a Result of their Work with Clients

Submitted by Sarah Kistler Turner

to the University of Exeter

as a thesis for the degree of

Doctor of Philosophy in Education,


This thesis is available for library use on the understanding that it is copyright material and that no quotation from the thesis may be published without proper acknowledgement. I certify that all material in this thesis which is not my own work has been identified and that no material has been previously submitted and approved for the award of a degree by this or any other university.

.............................................(signature).
Consider Luke Skywalker’s task in the Star Wars trilogy as he struggles with the conflicting urges to kill or yield to his father… in the climatic scene, at the very heart of the Death Star, in the belly of the beast, he is finally able to cut the Gordian knot, not by killing or yielding but by fighting his father and at the point of victory, laying down his weapon and refusing to kill him. At once he is able to give his own love voice, to fulfil his destiny in a quite unexpected way, and to become a Jedi knight. The transformation is complete.

(Daloz, 1987, p. 147).

This thesis is dedicated to my family, past, present and future.
Abstract

This thesis focuses on the learning and change that counsellors and psychotherapists experience as a consequence of their work with clients. It details two qualitative studies: a constructivist grounded theory study, and a co-operative self-search inquiry (CSSI) that is based on both the heuristic and co-operative inquiry methodologies.

As part of the grounded theory study, I compared the learning and change in two cohorts of participants: a group of therapists who had had one or more significant experiences of working with clients with HIV, and a group that had had no such experiences. Following the theoretical sampling study and literature search, it became clear that no major differences seemed to be evident between the learning and change in both groups of therapists. I therefore constructed a model of general therapist learning and change from the findings of the grounded theory study. This model details the ways in which counsellors and psychotherapists learn and change both personally and professionally as a result of their work with clients. It also refers to the change process, difficult aspects of working as a therapist and other catalysts of learning and change for therapists.

For the CSSI, I studied my own and a co-researcher’s learning and change experiences, which were recorded in journals over a period of 9 months. The findings of this study complement those of the grounded theory study by providing further insight into the ways in which learning experiences occur for therapists.

I have linked my findings to some of the literature on education and learning, as well as the literature on transformative learning, and have discussed their implications for practice, training and supervision in counselling and psychotherapy. As part of my reflexive process, and congruent with the theme of learning and change, I have also provided details about the ways in which I have learnt and changed as a result of engaging in my doctoral studies.
Acknowledgements

As I began to finish writing this thesis, several of my friends either gave birth or started to think about having children. This thesis is my baby, born as a result of a long and sometimes difficult labour. Without the help of the people I acknowledge below, it might never have come into existence.

Firstly, and most importantly, thank you to my participants. Thank you to the therapists who took part in my grounded theory study, for your time, your honesty, your hospitality, your tea or coffee, your biscuits and pastries, and for giving me lifts. A special thank you to Neil, one of my best friends, and my co-researcher, for everything you put into our co-operative self-search inquiry.

Thank you to my first supervisor Christine, for your understanding, your patience, your encouragement, and the gentle way that you have given me some difficult feedback. Thank you also for having a life outside of research and for supporting me to do the same. Thanks to Cheryl, my second supervisor, for your interest in my work, and for providing some very useful feedback.

Whilst working on this thesis, I have undertaken counselling training, which has been necessary for the co-operative self-search inquiry. I therefore also wish to acknowledge my diploma course trainers, who have been fantastic, and my fellow trainees, who have been great company, because I have learnt so much from all of you. Thank you to my therapists John and Susan, and to all my clients, whom I am privileged to have spent time with.

Thank you to my partner Neil, for your encouragement and support, to Terry for the interesting e-chats, and to my other friends (including Jon and all dogs we have walked together) for the welcome distractions you have helped to provide.
Publications and presentations based on the thesis

2004
*Counsellors’ transformational learning experiences in HIV and AIDS counselling: The first four interviews.* Paper presented at the Annual School of Education Research Conference, Exeter University, 13th May.

2005

*Counsellors’ experiences of personal and professional change in HIV and AIDS counselling.* Poster presented at the British Association of Counselling and Psychotherapy Annual Research Conference, Nottingham, 21st May.


2006
‘Changed by the encounter’: The learning and Change that Counsellors and Psychotherapists experience as a result of their client work. Paper presented at the annual School of Education Research Conference, Exeter University, 13th May.

2007
*What two trainees have learnt from their client work: a co-operative self-search inquiry.* Poster accepted for presentation at the British Association of Counselling and Psychotherapy Annual Research Conference, York, 11th May.
## Contents

Dedication 2
Abstract 3
Acknowledgements 4
Publications and presentations based on the thesis 5

**Chapter 1: Setting the Scene** 8
- Introduction 9
- A context for Transformative Learning Theory 18
- Transformative Learning 32
- Counselling and Psychotherapy 52
- HIV and AIDS counselling 67
- Transformative Learning in People with HIV 78
- Aims and Research Questions 81

**Chapter 2: The Grounded Theory Study (Phase 1)** 83
- Methodological Issues 84
- Phase 1: Study Findings 143
- Phase 1: The Two Theories that Arose 173

**Chapter 3: The Theoretical Sampling Study (Phase 2)** 178
- Background 179
- Findings 180
- Literature Review 191
- The Adapted Model 228

**Chapter 4: The Co-operative Self-Search Inquiry (Phase 3)** 230
- Rationale 231
- Methodological Issues 232
- Findings 253

**Chapter 5: Connections and Conclusions** 263
- Contributions 264
- Links to the literature 268
- Limitations 273
- Recommendations 278
- Implications for Practice, Supervision and Training 279
- The Impact of the Research on the Researcher 282

References 289
Appendices

A1 and 2: Proposal and advertisement 310
B1, 2 and 3: Recruitment letters 316
C: Consent form 319
D: Transcript covering letter 320
E: Brief details for each participant 321
F: Vignette of each participant 324
G: Tom’s transcript 331
H: Lauren’s transcript 335
I: Formulating interview questions 339
J: Research journal extracts 341
K: Sample memos 344
L1 and L2: Research conference feedback and acceptance 345
M: Letter to CPR 347
N: Grounded theory study ethics approval 348
O: CSSI ethics approval 349
P: Conference report 353

List of Figures

1: The three phases of my research 16
2: The seven stages of reflectivity in perspective transformation 37
(adapted from Mezirow, 1981).
3: A new model of transformative learning 46
(adapted from Cranton, 1992).
4: Two theories of therapist change 175
5: The change process 177
6: General model of therapist change 229
7: Creative synthesis 262

Abbreviation

CSSI: Co-operative self-search inquiry
Chapter 1: Setting the Scene

‘The bounds of psychotherapy make it possible for the analyst to travel with the patient on a voyage of discovery’

(Schaverien, 2002, p. 34).