Using Cognitive Science to Think about the Twelfth Century: Revisiting the Individual through Latin Texts

Submitted by Edward Arthur Mullins, to the University of Exeter as a thesis for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy in History, October 2010.

This thesis is available for Library use on the understanding that it is copyright material and that no quotation from the thesis may be published without proper acknowledgement.

I certify that all material in this thesis which is not my own work has been identified and that no material has been submitted and approved for the award of a degree by this or any other University.

E. A. Mullins
Abstract

This study has several key purposes. First, it tests the potential applicability of the modern discourses of neuro- and cognitive science to the study of medieval texts and languages: more specifically, it does this by using two core methodological tools, namely *the embodied view of the mind* and a theory of metaphor developed collaboratively by the linguist, George Lakoff, and the philosopher, Mark Johnson, to explore the range of significances which may be drawn from the ways in which human life and existence are represented in a sample of twelfth-century Latin texts. Second, it challenges the view, held by some modern scholars, that by the medieval period Latin was an intrinsically inadequate language for the purposes of self-expression. And finally, it problematises the existing discourses in medieval studies on the individual, self, and subjectivity, first, by developing a new mode of analysing the mental lives of medieval people, and second, by challenging the view that advanced forms of self-awareness were “discovered” during the twelfth century.

By following this course, this study offers a number of fresh insights into twelfth-century texts and the phenomena of the individual, self, and subjectivity. Most importantly, it shows that the ways in which human life and existence are represented in medieval texts are best understood in terms of complex interactions between the biological mind and body and their effects in the world (especially their “socio-cultural” effects). From this conclusion, it is argued that the basis of the individual, self, or subject must be found, not just in socio-cultural development, but also the biological realities of human existence. Furthermore, this study contributes to existing literature on the twelfth century by exploring the range of influences, ancient and contemporary, which affected how medieval people thought about themselves and other people, while affirming their basis in the interaction between the mind, body, and culture.
Acknowledgements

Firstly, I would like to thank the University of Exeter for the generous funding which has made this study possible. I am extremely grateful to Drs Julia Crick and Catherine Rider for the invaluable advice, time, and unwavering support that they have invested in me and this study. My thanks also goes out to Professor Richard Gameson and Mr Richard Eales, both of whom set me on the course, as an undergraduate at the University of Kent, which led to the completion of this study. Many other people have helped me over the course of this study. Special thanks goes to Dr Sarah Toulalan for her invaluable critique and advice in regard to an early draft of parts of this study and Dr Mike Duffy for the support he extended to me as a teaching assistant in the Department of History at the University of Exeter. I would also like to thank the examiners of this study, Professor John Arnold and Dr Elliot Kendal, for their critique and suggestions. And finally I would like to thank my family and あやちゃん for the additional support, financial and otherwise, that they have given me over the course of researching and writing this study.
Contents

List of abbreviations 8

Part I

Chapter One: Introduction 11

1.1: Defining the problems and purposes of this study 11
1.2: Historiography and historiographical trends since c.1960 13
1.3: The place of this study in the historiography 28
1.4: Conclusion 34

Chapter Two: Theory and Method 36

2.1: Modern theories of the embodied mind 37
2.2: Lakoff’s and Johnson’s theory of metaphor 51
   2.2.1: Conceptual systems and types of metaphor 52
   2.2.2: Entailments and partial coherence among metaphors 54
   2.2.3: Metonymy and synecdoche 55
   2.2.4: Living by Metaphors 57
   2.2.5: How does Lakoff’s and Johnson’s work compare with
         medieval theories of metaphor? 58
   2.2.6: Genderless metaphors 61

2.3: Conclusion 62

Part II

Introduction 63

The Authors and Source Texts 65

Chapter Three: The Mind, Soul, and “Cognitive Phenomena” 72
3.1: The intellectual context

3.1.1: The soul, spirit, and mind in early Greek thought and Plato

3.1.2: Models for the Platonic view of the soul available in the medieval west: Augustine and Boethius

3.1.3: The period c.550-1200

3.1.4: Conclusion

3.2: Taking an embodied approach to the mind

3.2.1: Space and proportion

3.2.2: Materiality and weight

3.2.3: Motion, direction, and speed

3.2.4: Conclusion

3.3: Taking an embodied approach to the mind-body relationship

3.3.1: The separateness of mind, body, and soul

3.3.2: Partitioning the mind

3.3.3: Conclusion

3.4: Final conclusion

Chapter Four: The Body

4.1: Body parts

4.2: The situated body

4.2.1: Time, space, and the social world

4.2.2: Conclusion

4.3: The mind-body relationship in John of Salisbury’s “body politic” metaphors

4.3.1: Contextualising John’s thought
4.3.2: Mapping the mind onto the body 160
4.3.3: Conclusion 168

4.4: The face 170
4.4.1: Facial expressions 175
4.4.2: The face and its effects in the world 181
4.4.3: Conclusion 186

4.5: Compound metaphors 187

4.6: Final conclusion 190

Chapter Five: Mind, Body, and Culture 192

5.1: Pain and suffering 192
5.1.1: Transferred pain 194
5.1.2: Weeping and tears 199
5.1.3: Self-imposed pain and suffering 207
5.1.4: Conclusion 219

5.2: Aging and “old age” 220
5.2.1: Experiences of aging and stereotypes of old age 223
5.2.2: Conclusion 233

5.3: Sex and excretion; disgust and humour 234
5.3.1: Disgusting sex and excretion 237
5.3.2: Sex, excretion, and humour in Walter Map’s De Nugis Curialium 244
5.3.3: Conclusion 251

5.4: Final conclusion 251

Conclusion 253

6.1: Revisiting the individual through neuro- and cognitive science 254
6.2: Latin as a mode of self-expression in twelfth-century Europe 256

6.3: Working without gender in body history 257

Bibliography 261
List of Abbreviations

Boethius, Consolatio


Guibert, De Vita Sua


Isidore, Etymologiae


John, Letters i.


John, Letters ii.


John, Metalogicon


John, Policraticus

Policraticus, Of the Frivolities of Courtiers and the Footprints of Philosophers, trans. C. J. Nederman (Cambridge, 1990) and

Lewis and Short  

Liddell and Scott  

OED:  

OMT  
Oxford Medieval Texts published by Oxford University Press.

Orderic, Epilogue  

Peter, Letters  

PL  

PMLA  
The Proceedings of the Modern Language Association of America

The Life of Christina  