GENDER AND CONFLICT TRANSFORMATION IN PALESTINE WOMEN'S POLITICAL ACTIVISM BETWEEN LOCAL AND INTERNATIONAL AGENDAS

Submitted by

Sophie Richter-Devroe

to the University of Exeter, Institute of Arab and Islamic Studies as a thesis for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy in Middle East Politics October 2010

This thesis is available for Library use on the understanding that it is copyright material and that no quotation from the thesis may be published without proper acknowledgement.

I certify that all material in this thesis which is not my own work has been identified and that no material has previously been submitted and approved for the award of a degree by this or any other University.

S. Ridh - De

Signature:

ABSTRACT

This thesis takes a gender-sensitive approach to the Israeli-Palestinian conflict and asks whether and how Palestinian women's different formal and informal political activism in 'peacebuilding' and 'resistance' can make a contribution to positive sustainable social and political change. Taking a bottom-up qualitative approach to conflict research, and deriving data mainly from in-depth interviews, participant observation and textual analyses, I problematise mainstream international conflict resolution and gender development approaches, revealing their mismatch with the Palestinian reality of prolonged occupation and settler colonialism on the ground.

I critique in particular two aspects of mainstream gender and conflict approaches: Firstly, the essentialist feminist assertion that women are better 'peacemakers' than men due to their (alleged) more peaceful nature, and, secondly, the 'liberal' peace argument that dialogue is the best (and only) way to resolve conflict. These two claims are hardly applicable to the Palestinian context, and their implementation through policy programmes can even block genuine political and social change. Through their tendency to trace the roots of conflict in social gender relations and at the level of identity, they tend to give a distorted depoliticised picture of the conflict. Doing so, they risk alienating local constituencies and might even exacerbate social and political fragmentation.

My analysis counters such (mostly western-originated) mainstream gender and conflict initiatives by starting from the local. Proposing a contextualised gender-sensitive approach to conflict transformation, which pays attention to intra-party dynamics such as 'indigenous' gender constructions and the political culture of resistance, I trace those forms of female political agency that are able to gain societal support and are conducive to sustainable social and political change. Bridging theoretical insights from the fields of conflict resolution and gender theory and questioning some of their widely held assumptions, I hope to contribute to knowledge in both fields.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Acknowledgements	viii
Note on Transliteration	ix
List of Arabic Terms	Х
CHAPTER I: INTRODUCTION	1
1. Gender and Conflict Resolution	2
2. Culture and Conflict Resolution	3
3. The Palestinian Case Study	5
4. Empirical, Analytical and Conceptual Contributions	8
4.1. Empirical Contributions	8
4.2. Analytical Contributions	9
4.3. Conceptual Contributions	10
5. Structure of the Thesis	11
CHAPTER II: METHODS AND METHODOLOGY	15
1. Research Design: Choice of Research Methods and Sample	17
1.1. Research Methods	17
1.2. Research Sample Overview	22
2. Fieldwork in Palestine	26
2.1. The Crisis of Objectivity	26
2.2. In the Field: Did Mustafa Barghouthi attend the Anti-wall Demonstrations?	27
2.3. Positionality and Intersubjectivity	30
2.4. Towards a Historically-Grounded Feminist-Deconstructive Approach to Self/Other	39
3. Writing about Palestine	41
3.1. The Crisis of Representation	41
3.2. "You Should not Have any Moral Judgements"	42
3.3. Writing about, with or for Palestinian Women Activists?	43
3.4. Towards a Politically-Engaged Humanist Scholarship	48
4. Conclusion	49

CHAPTER III: REVIEW OF THEORETICAL LITERATURE AND CONCEPTUAL FRAMEWORK	51
1. The UNSCR 1325 and Questions it Provokes	51
1.1. Contexts of Women's Political Activism	52
1.2. Practices of Women's Political Activism	53
1.3. Meanings of Women's Political Activism	53
1.4. Discourses and Framings of Women's Political Activism	55
1.5. Proposals for Change	55
2. Peacebuilding in a Context of Settler Colonialism and Occupation	56
2.1. Liberal Conflict Resolution Theories	57
2.2. Critical (Post-)Structural Conflict Transformation Theories	59
2.3. Local vs. International Definitions of Peace and Peacebuilding?	60
3. Gender Activism in a Context of Occupation and Statelessness	62
3.1. Liberal Approaches to Women and War	63
3.2. Feminist Intersection Approaches to Gender and War	64
3.3. Local vs. International Definitions: Gender, Women, Female or Feminist Movements?	68
4. Conclusion	70
CHAPTER IV: HISTORY OF WOMEN'S ACTIVISM IN PALESTINE	73
1. Women's Activism pre-48: Charitable Organisations and the Great Revolt	75
1.1. The First Arab Women's Congress	76
2.2. The Great Revolt	76
2. The 1948 Expulsion: The Nakba, Land and Women's Honour	79
2.1. Women's Informal Political Activism	80
2.2. Women's Formal Political Party Activism	81
3. The 1967 Defeat: Thawra, Institutionalised Sumūd and the Popular Committees	85
3.1. The Nationalist Modernist Agenda: Armed Struggle and the Female Militant (Fidā'īyya)	86
3.2. The Nationalist-Traditionalist Agenda: Institutionalised Ṣumūd and the Steadfast Peasant Mother (Aṣ-Ṣāmida)	88
3.3. The Lead-Up to the First Intifada: Committees and Mass Populism	90
4. The First Intifada	96
4.1. Different Forms of Women's Nonviolent Resistance	97
4.2. Palestinian and Israeli Women's Joint Anti-Occupation Activism	99
4.3. Competing Gender Regimes and the Intifada's Long-Term Impact on Social Change	104

5. The Oslo Accords: Fragmentation and NGOisation of the Women's Movement	108
5.1. The Nationalist Agenda of the General Union of Palestinian Women	109
5.2. The Feminist Agenda of the NGOs	110
5.3. The Religious-Political Agenda of the Islamic Women's Movement	111
5.4. Attempts at Unifying the Movement: The Women's Affairs Technical Committee	112
6. Conclusion	114
CHAPTER V: PALESTINIAN WOMEN'S PEACE ACTIVISM	117
1. Historical Overview of Palestinian Women's (Joint) Peace Activism	118
1.1. The Oslo Peace Process	118
1.2. The Second Intifada	120
1.3. NGOisation of Peacebuilding	122
1.4. Feminisation of Peacebuilding	123
2. Mainstreaming Gender and Conflict: The International Women's Commission and Diverging Interpretations of UNSCR 1325	124
2.1. UNSCR 1325 and the International Women's Commission	124
2.2. Participation	126
2.3. Protection of Rights	141
2.4. Women's Empowerment and the UN's 'Gender-Sensitive' Perspective	147
3. Conclusion	152
CHAPTER VI: PALESTINIAN WOMEN'S NONVIOLENT RESISTANCE	156
1. Theories of Collective Nonviolent Resistance	157
1.1. Nonviolent Resistance in Conflict Transformation Theories	159
1.2. Nonviolent Resistance in Social Movement Theory	160
1.3. Gendered Approaches to Nonviolent Resistance in Conflict Transformation and Social Movement Theories	161
2. Historical Overview of Palestinian Women's Nonviolent Resistance	163
2.1. Nonviolent Resistance during the First Intifada	163
2.2. Post-Oslo: Localisation, Internationalisation and Professionalisation of Nonviolent Resistance	165
3. Mobilising Structures of Women's Nonviolent Resistance	171
3.1. Organisational Forms of Women's Nonviolent Resistance	171
3.2. Forms of Women's Nonviolent Resistance	174

4. The Structural Context of Female Nonviolent Resistance Activism	177
4.1. Political Opportunity Structures	177
4.2. Social and Cultural Opportunity Structures	181
5. Framings of Female Nonviolent Resistance	185
5.1. Non-Gendered Framings of Nonviolent Resistance	185
5.2. Gendered Framings of Nonviolent Resistance	189
6. Transformative Potential of Female Nonviolent Resistance	196
6.1. Political Transformative Potential	197
6.2. Social (Gender) Transformative Potential	198
7. Conclusion	201
CHAPTER VII: PALESTINIAN WOMEN'S EVERYDAY RESISTANCE	205
1. Theories of Everyday Resistance	207
1.1. Survival and Coping Strategies in Track III Developmental Peacebuilding	208
1.2. Theories of Everyday Resistance in Anthropological and Sociological Literature	211
2. Historical Overview of Women's Everyday Resistance	214
2.1. Women as Bearers of Cultural Authenticity and the PLO's Institutionalised Şumūd Policies	215
2.2. The First Intifada and Collective Ṣumūd as "Suspension of Life"	217
2.3. The Second Intifada and Individual Ṣumūd as "Affirmation of Life"	218
3. ^c Amal - Everyday Resistance at the Material Level	219
3.1. Cases	221
3.2. Tightening of Israeli Spatial Control	224
3.3. Tightening of Patriarchal Control	228
4. 'Amal - Everyday Resistance at the Ideational Level	231
4.1. Cases	234
4.2. Resisting (the Effects of) Israeli Settler-Colonial Policies	238
4.3. Resisting Different Forms of Patriarchal Control	241
5. Conclusion	245

	240
CHAPTER VIII: CONCLUSION	249
1. Context of Palestinian Women's Political Activism	249
2. Practices of Palestinian Women's Political Activism	251
3. Meanings of Palestinian Women's Political Activism	252
4. Discourses and Framings of Palestinian Women's Political Activism	254
5. Theoretical Implications	256
ANNEX I	259
ANNEX II	261
Bibliography	265