Music is Movement

A Study into Aspects of Movement Representation of Musical Activities among Preschool Children in a Dutch Music Education Setting.

José Retra

Submitted by José Retra to the University of Exeter as a thesis for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy in Education, April 2010.

This thesis is available for Library use on the understanding that it is copyright material and that no quotation from the thesis may be published without proper acknowledgement.

I certify that all material in this thesis which is not my own work has been identified and that no material has previously been submitted and approved for the award of a degree by this or any other University.

(signature) ..................................................................................................................
ABSTRACT

Musical activities are at the centre of Music on the Lap, a Dutch approach to early childhood music education. The present study takes an in-depth look at the role of movement in these musical activities and thereby focuses on the representation of musical elements through movement. This study has among its aims the raising of more awareness for the conscious use of movement in early childhood music education.

Departing from an embodied approach within an interpretative design, the premise of the current study is that movement should be considered an important form of kinaesthetic representation through which preschool children can come to understand and learn different aspects of music. The musical movement responses of children aged 18 to 36 months in a regular Music on the Lap setting were investigated. The musical movement behaviour of the children, during specific musical activities, was captured on DVD and the individual responses of 27 children were analysed. Interviews with the participating teacher provided important additional information. Through microanalysis of the children’s movements, the study arrived at a theoretical interpretation: movement responses to music can be considered enactive symbols, creating direct and indirect representations of musical characteristics. To further musical learning the movements should be firmly based in a temporal framework of aural and verbal connotations in order to stimulate purposeful movement responses. This temporal framework should be structured by the teacher through a process of appropriate movement models and verbal guidance to arrive at meaningful movement actions, which can consequently generate implicit and explicit musical kinaesthetic and musical representational knowledge. In this process the children are actively participating to construct with body and mind their own musical knowledge.
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>TITLE OF THESIS</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ABSTRACT</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TABLE OF CONTENTS</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ACCOMPANYING MATERIAL: DVD</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ACKNOWLEDGMENTS</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>CHAPTER</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1 INTRODUCTION</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.1 EARLY CHILDHOOD MUSIC EDUCATION</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.2 MOVEMENT</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.3 AIM OF THE STUDY</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.4 EDUCATIONAL SETTING</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.5 RESEARCH APPROACH</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.5.1 Design and method</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.6 RESEARCHER PERSPECTIVE</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.7 WIDER IMPLICATIONS CONTEXT</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.8 OUTLINE OF THESIS</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 EDUCATIONAL SETTING</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.1 MUSIC ON THE LAP</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2 A PHILOSOPHY IN FLUX</td>
<td>21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.3 SONGS IN MOL</td>
<td>24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3 LITERATURE REVIEW</td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.1 INTRODUCTION</td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2 TOWARDS EMBODIED MUSICAL REPRESENTATION</td>
<td>27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2.1 Introduction to the connection of music and movement</td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2.2 A natural response</td>
<td>31</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2.3 Movement categories</td>
<td>34</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2.4 Extending the movement music connection</td>
<td>35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2.5 Early musical predispositions</td>
<td>40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2.5.1 Environment</td>
<td>40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2.5.2 Motor capabilities</td>
<td>41</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2.5.3 Temporal</td>
<td>42</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3 REPRESENTATION</td>
<td>43</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3.1 Towards a provisional understanding</td>
<td>43</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3.2 Musical Representation</td>
<td>45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3.3 Movements as symbols</td>
<td>49</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3.4 Temporal representation</td>
<td>50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3.5 Kinaesthetic representation</td>
<td>54</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3.6 Episodic representation / the musical environment</td>
<td>58</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.4 DISCUSSION</td>
<td>59</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4 METHODOLOGY I</td>
<td>61</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.1 INTRODUCTION</td>
<td>61</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2 RESEARCH APPROACH</td>
<td>61</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3 RESEARCH QUESTIONS</td>
<td>64</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
4.4 METHODOLOGICAL APPROACH ................................................................. 66
  4.4.1 The Case study .................................................................................. 70
  4.4.2 Direct observation ........................................................ .................. 70
4.5 DATA COLLECTION .................................................................................. 71
  4.5.1 Small pilot study ................................................................................ 71
  4.5.2 First study ........................................................................................... 72
  4.5.3 Location ............................................................................................... 73
  4.5.4 Recruiting Participants ........................................................................ 73
  4.5.5 The participants .................................................................................. 73
  4.5.6 Materials .............................................................................................. 74
  4.5.7 Stability of observations ....................................................................... 74
  4.5.8 Teacher/researcher role ........................................................................ 75
4.6 THE COURSE ........................................................................................... 77
  4.6.1 The lesson plan ................................................................................... 77
  4.6.2 Parent direction-sheet ........................................................................ 77
  4.6.3 Activity criteria ................................................................................... 78
  4.6.4 Parent diary ......................................................................................... 79
5 DATA ANALYSIS AND REPORT OF OBSERVATIONS OF THE FIRST STUDY .... 81
  5.1 INTRODUCTION ...................................................................................... 81
  5.2 AIMS ....................................................................................................... 81
  5.3 PROCESS OF ANALYSIS ....................................................................... 82
  5.4 MOVEMENT RESPONSES ................................................................. 83
  5.5 DEPENDENT MUSICAL MOVEMENT BEHAVIOUR ............................. 84
  5.6 ACTIVITY CONDITIONS ....................................................................... 86
    5.6.1 Lyrics/song meaning ........................................................................ 86
    5.6.2 Motor development ......................................................................... 87
    5.6.3 Tempo ............................................................................................... 88
    5.6.4 Objects ............................................................................................. 90
  5.7 KINAESTHETIC MUSIC REPRESENTATION ........................................... 91
    5.7.1 Construction modes ....................................................................... 91
    5.7.2 Timing ............................................................................................. 94
    5.7.3 Time-stream .................................................................................... 95
    5.7.4 Sequential representation ............................................................ 98
    5.7.5 Kinaesthetic reference .................................................................. 100
    5.7.6 Independent movements ............................................................... 101
  5.8 MOVEMENT CATEGORIES ..................................................................... 103
    5.8.1 Movement analysis criteria ......................................................... 103
    5.8.2 Movement types .............................................................................. 106
      5.8.2.1 Rhythmic movements ............................................................ 106
      5.8.2.2 Gestural movements ............................................................. 107
    5.8.3 Activity types and functions ....................................................... 107
      5.8.3.1 Rhythmic activity ................................................................. 108
      5.8.3.2 Sequential activity .............................................................. 108
      5.8.3.3 Timing-activity ................................................................. 108
      5.8.3.4 Gestural activity ............................................................... 108
  5.9 ANALYSIS OF PARENT DIARIES .......................................................... 109
    5.9.1 Without a cue ................................................................................ 109
    5.9.2 Semi-cued ...................................................................................... 111
8.4.2 Approach to practice ................................................................. 163
8.4.3 Movement .............................................................................. 164
8.4.4 Objects .................................................................................. 165
8.4.5 Representation ...................................................................... 166
  8.4.5.1 Whole body movements .................................................. 167
  8.4.5.2 Movement elements .......................................................... 169
8.4.6 Temporal representation ....................................................... 170
8.4.7 Teacher influence ................................................................. 171
8.4.8 Information construction ...................................................... 172
8.4.9 And beyond ........................................................................... 174
8.5 PLITSE PLETSE PLATER ............................................................. 176
  8.5.1 Structure .............................................................................. 176
  8.5.2 Approach to practice ........................................................... 177
  8.5.3 Movement ............................................................................ 179
  8.5.4 Objects ................................................................................ 179
  8.5.5 Representation .................................................................... 180
  8.5.6 Temporal representation ...................................................... 183
  8.5.7 Teacher influence ................................................................. 185
  8.5.8 Information construction ...................................................... 186
8.6 ONE TWO ................................................................................ 188
  8.6.1 Structure .............................................................................. 188
  8.6.2 Approach to practice ........................................................... 188
  8.6.3 Movement ............................................................................ 189
  8.6.4 Objects ................................................................................ 190
  8.6.5 Representation .................................................................... 191
  8.6.6 Temporal representation ...................................................... 193
  8.6.7 Teacher influence ................................................................. 195
  8.6.8 Information construction ...................................................... 195
  8.6.9 And beyond ........................................................................... 197
8.7 SEQUENTIAL ACTIVITIES .......................................................... 198
  8.7.1 Hands on you side ................................................................. 198
  8.7.2 Clap your hands now ............................................................ 200
8.8 TIMING ACTIVITIES ................................................................. 202
  8.8.1 Step step step ................................................................. 202
  8.8.2 Mommy bear and baby bear ............................................... 204
  8.8.3 Walk in a circle ................................................................. 205
8.9 GESTURAL ACTIVITIES ............................................................. 207
  8.9.1 Ora Viva ................................................................. 207
  8.9.2 The wheels of the bus .......................................................... 208
  8.9.3 Wie waa waaien ................................................................. 211
8.10 RHYTHMICAL ACTIVITIES ........................................................ 213
  8.10.1 Tap along ................................................................. 213
  8.10.2 Clap along ................................................................. 214
9 DISCUSSION AND IMPLICATIONS ............................................... 216
  9.1 INTRODUCTION ...................................................................... 216
  9.2 MOVEMENT ............................................................................ 218
    9.2.1 Dependent movement responses ...................................... 221
    9.2.2 Independent movements .................................................. 222