What influences student teachers’ ability to promote dialogic talk in the primary classroom?

Submitted by Anne Fisher to the University of Exeter
As a thesis for the degree of
Doctor of Philosophy by Research in January 2011

This thesis is available for library use on the understanding that it is copyright material and that no quotation from the thesis may be published without proper acknowledgement.

I certify that all material in this thesis which is not my own work has been identified and that no material has previously been submitted and approved for the award of a degree by this or any other university.

Signature:
Acknowledgements

I would like to offer grateful thanks to my supervisor, Professor Debra Myhill, for her generous, and often intuitive, support during the process of writing this thesis. In understanding when to comment, and when to leave space for me to reflect, she has provided an exemplary role model which I aim to emulate in my own supervisory capacity.

Thanks are also due to Professor Kleine-Staarman for her helpful suggestions and comments about the reader’s experience.

To the three cohorts of postgraduate students, and particularly the nine case-study student teachers, I would like to extend my heartfelt thanks. The opportunity to engage in depth with the hopes, thoughts, values and beliefs of these students, rather than simply comment on their attempts to attain the QTS standards, was a privilege. Without their openness, and trust, it would not have been possible to gain insight into the ‘hidden’ factors which influence practice.

Finally, thanks are due to my two sons, both teachers, who were always sure that their mother was capable of becoming a researcher.
Abstract

This thesis examines what it is that enables postgraduate student teachers to promote the recently introduced curriculum innovation, dialogic talk, in primary classrooms. Drawing on literature relating to the way talk has been enacted in English classrooms for the last thirty five years, it suggests that patterns of verbal interaction have continued to prove resistant to change, despite policy imperatives and university courses.

Adopting a collaborative action research approach, data were collected in three cycles over three years to investigate the perceptions of three successive cohorts of postgraduate students of the role of talk in learning, and the place of the teacher in developing it. Using a sociocultural lens, students’ conceptual and pedagogic understanding of dialogic talk, and their ability to promote it, is examined in depth through nine case studies, as are the factors which the participants themselves identify as enabling or inhibiting engagement with innovation.

It is suggested that the lack of a commonly agreed definition, and of readily available theoretical guidance, has reduced dialogic talk to just another label. As such, it can play no significant part in developing practice beyond rapid question-and-answer routines of ‘interactive teaching’ and the potentially reductive IRF (Initiation, Response, Feedback) script recorded by researchers (Mroz et al, 2000; Myhill, 2006) before, and after the inception of the National Literacy Strategy (1998a).

Turning to the role of the university, it questions the place of the ‘demonstration lesson’ and whole cohort lectures, urging that significant changes need to be made to the role of the teaching practice tutor, and the nature of ‘partnership’ between schools and university departments. Finally, it speculates that without a significant change in the way university departments examine, and address, the values, attitudes and memories of talk that student teachers bring with them from their own primary classrooms, there will continue to be replication of practice.
# Table of contents

Acknowledgements .................................................................................................................. i

Abstract .................................................................................................................................. ii

Table of contents ....................................................................................................................... iii

List of figures ............................................................................................................................. x

Chapter 1 - Introduction ............................................................................................................ 1

1.1 Speaking from the heart ........................................................................................................ 1

1.2 The centrality of dialogue and the case for change ......................................................... 3

1.3 Assuming the mantle of expert ....................................................................................... 4

Chapter 2 - A Conceptual Framework ..................................................................................... 7

2.1 Systematic literature review .............................................................................................. 8

2.1.1 Clarification of terms ................................................................................................... 8

2.1.2 Search strategies ........................................................................................................ 12

2.2 Introduction to students’ experiences .............................................................................. 13

2.2 Dialogue in the Classroom: Revisiting Barnes ................................................................. 14

2.3 Patterns of discourse in the Literacy Hour ....................................................................... 16

2.3.1 Talk routines as a form of democracy ....................................................................... 19

2.4 The relationship between dialogue and pedagogy .......................................................... 20

2.4.1 New Literacies .......................................................................................................... 22

2.5 Exploring the social constructivist perspective ................................................................. 24

2.6 Dialogic talk ....................................................................................................................... 29

2.6.1 Dialogic Instruction ..................................................................................................... 30

2.6.2 Dialogic enquiry ......................................................................................................... 31

2.6.3 Dialogic teaching ....................................................................................................... 32

2.6.4 Exploratory talk ......................................................................................................... 34

2.6.5 The dialogic ideal and dialogic education ................................................................. 34

2.6.6 Dialogical pedagogy: developing affective conditions for learning ......................... 36
2.6.7 Bakhtin in the classroom: dialogic talk and conceptual learning .................. 38
2.7 Developing a professional identity ...................................................... 40
  2.7.1 The role of student teachers’ beliefs in broadening their teaching repertoire. 43
  2.7.2 The role of the mentor in developing practice .................................. 46
  2.7.3 The place of the university in developing thinking professionals .......... 49
2.8 Epistemological development as a factor in valuing dialogue ....................... 51
2.9 The complexities of teaching literacy .................................................. 53
2.10 Difficulties relating to the promotion of pedagogic dialogue ....................... 55
2.11 Conclusion ....................................................................................... 57

Chapter 3 – Methodology ........................................................................... 62
  3.1 Concepts explored by the research question ......................................... 62
      3.1.1 An Interpretive approach to enquiry ............................................. 63
      3.1.2 Interpretive Constructivism: an epistemological stance .................... 65
      3.1.3 Reflexivity .................................................................................. 66
      3.1.4 Collaborative research .................................................................. 67
  3.2 Research Design ................................................................................. 69
      3.2.1 Working with multiple data sets ..................................................... 74
      3.2.2 Case studies .................................................................................. 74
      3.2.3 Ethical and Political Considerations .............................................. 76
  3.3 Research Instruments .......................................................................... 79
      3.3.1 questionnaires .............................................................................. 79
      3.3.2 The open response questionnaire .................................................. 81
      3.3.3 End questionnaire .......................................................................... 82
      3.3.4 Reflective writing .......................................................................... 83
      3.3.5 Semi-structured interviews ............................................................ 84
      3.3.6 Video Stimulated Reflective Dialogue (VSRD) ............................... 88
      3.3.7 VSRD Cycle 1 ................................................................................ 92
      3.3.8 Introduction to VSRD Cycle 2 and 3 ............................................... 93
      3.3.9 Research instruments: live lesson observations ............................. 94
      3.3.10 Co-construction of interviews ....................................................... 95
6.1.1 Opportunities for debate and collaborative discussion with peers ............... 157
6.1.2 Ownership of discussion .......................................................................... 158
6.1.3 Questioning ......................................................................................... 159
6.1.4 Opportunities to question and challenge peers and the teacher .............. 160
6.1.5 Putting up one’s hand ........................................................................... 161
6.1.6 Analysis of the reflective writing ............................................................. 162
6.2 Selection of the case study partners ............................................................. 162

6.3. Case study 5: Francesca ......................................................................... 164
6.3.1 First encounters with VSRD ................................................................. 165
6.3.2 Contextual information drawn from field-notes ..................................... 165
6.3.3 e-mail reflection ................................................................................... 166
6.3.4 VSRD Francesca’s understanding of dialogic talk and its pedagogical purpose .................................................................................. 167
6.3.5 Francesca’s critique of her promotion of dialogic talk and concerns about it 168
6.3.6 Analysis of Francesca’s commentary ...................................................... 169

6.4 Case study 6: Dave ................................................................................. 170
6.4.1 First encounters with VSRD ................................................................. 171
6.4.2 Contextual information drawn from field-notes ..................................... 171
6.4.3 e-mail reflection ................................................................................... 172
6.4.4 VSRD in the final placement Dave’s understanding of dialogic talk and its pedagogical purpose ................................................................. 173
6.4.5 Dave’s critique of his promotion of dialogic talk and concerns about it ...... 173
6.4.6 Analysis of Dave’s commentary .............................................................. 174

6.5 Case-study 7: Serena .............................................................................. 175
6.5.1 First encounters with VSRD ................................................................. 176
6.5.2 Contextual information drawn from field-notes ..................................... 176
6.5.3 e-mail reflection ................................................................................... 177
6.5.4 VSRD in the final placement: Serena’s understanding of dialogic talk and its pedagogical purpose ................................................................. 178
6.5.5 Serena’s critique of her promotion of dialogic talk and concerns about it .... 178
6.5.6 Analysis of Serena’s commentary .............................................................. 180
6.6 Case study 8: Demelza................................................................. 181
  6.6.1 First encounters with VSRD ........................................... 182
  6.6.2 Contextual information drawn from field-notes............... 182
  6.6.3 e-mail reflection .......................................................... 183
  6.6.4 VSRD in the final placement: Demelza's understanding of dialogic talk and its pedagogical purpose ................................................................. 184
  6.6.5 Demelza's critique of her promotion of dialogic talk and concerns about it 184
  6.6.6 Analysis of Demelza's commentary ................................ 185

6.7 Case study 9: Elizabeth ............................................................ 187
  6.7.1 First encounters with VSRD ........................................... 187
  6.7.2 Contextual information drawn from field-notes............... 188
  6.7.3 e-mail reflection .......................................................... 189
  6.7.4 VSRD in the final placement: Elizabeth's understanding of dialogic talk and its pedagogical purpose ................................................................. 190
  6.7.5 Elizabeth's critique of her promotion of dialogic talk and concerns about it 190
  6.7.6 Analysis of Elizabeth's commentary ............................... 191

6.8 Reflection on Cycle 3 .................................................................. 192

Chapter 7: Discussion ...................................................................... 194
  7.1 Introduction: Drawing the threads together ....................... 194
  7.2 Scratching the surface and digging deeper: deep and surface understanding of dialogic talk ................................................................. 196
  7.3 Constructing a teaching identity ......................................... 199
    7.3.1 Examining prior experience ........................................ 200
    7.3.2 Classroom realities ..................................................... 203
  7.4 University versus school? ...................................................... 206
    7.4.1 Creating a teaching identity: the dialogic practitioner .... 209
  7.5 Talking to understanding ..................................................... 210
    7.5.1 Defining dialogic talk: a sociocultural approach to whole class discourse .... 211
    7.5.2 Achieving common understanding, or building new understandings? .... 214
    7.5.3 "Backing up Vygotsky" .................................................. 217
7.6 Talk as a democratic principle .................................................. 217

7.6.1 Pace .................................................................................... 219

7.7 Probing: using the answer as the fulcrum of the learning exchange .......... 220

7.7.1 IRF a limiting ritual? ............................................................. 222

7.7.2 The place of subject knowledge in developing pupil talk .................. 224

7.8 The way it always has been? ......................................................... 229

7.9 Considering the factors which impact on the promotion of dialogic talk..... 232

Chapter 8: Recommendations .................................................................. 235

8.1 Introduction .................................................................................. 235

8.2 Further research ............................................................................ 236

8.2.2 Considering epistemology ....................................................... 237

8.2.3 Developing the research culture through partnership ...................... 238

8.2.4 Examining ‘utterances’ ............................................................. 239

8.2.5 Sustaining innovation .............................................................. 240

8.3 Implications for practice ................................................................. 240

8.3.1 Practice in primary classrooms ............................................... 241

8.3.2 Practice in university .............................................................. 242

8.4 Recommendations for Future policy ............................................... 243

8.4.1 Talking the talk at university .................................................. 243

8.4.2 Walking the walk in school ..................................................... 244

Chapter 9: Endnote .............................................................................. 247

Appendix 1 Group questionnaire Cycle 1 .................................................. 251

Appendix 2 Entry Questionnaire Cycle 2 ................................................ 252

Appendix 3 Exit Questionnaire Cycle 2 ................................................. 254

Appendix 4: Talk Histories: Reflective Writing Cycle 3 ........................... 255

Appendix 5: Characteristics of Concern ................................................. 256

Appendix 6 Reflective Framework Dialogue ......................................... 259

Bibliography ....................................................................................... 262
List of figures

Fig 1: Search terms ........................................................................................................... 11
Fig 2: Literature Search ................................................................................................. 12
Fig 3: Final research design .......................................................................................... 73
Fig 4: Changes to the questionnaire design ................................................................. 79
Fig 5: Interview schedule .............................................................................................. 04
Fig 6: VSRD schedule .................................................................................................. 88
Fig 7: Interview questions ............................................................................................. 92
Fig 8: Introduction to data analysis using video ......................................................... 93
Fig 9: Lesson observation schedule ............................................................................ 94
Fig 10: Alterations to the English course .................................................................. 96
Fig 11: Overview of Group C ....................................................................................... 118
Fig 12: Categories and themes from the data .............................................................. 119
Fig 13: Simon’s reflective e-mail .................................................................................. 128
Fig 14: Susie’s reflective e-mail .................................................................................... 136
Fig 15: Bill’s reflective e-mail ....................................................................................... 143
Fig 16: Categories and themes from the data .............................................................. 148
Fig 17: Definitions of dialogic talk .............................................................................. 151
Fig 18: Using dialogic talk ........................................................................................... 152
Fig 19: Deep and surface features of dialogic talk ..................................................... 197
Fig 20: Pedagogical purpose of DT ........................................................................... 198
Fig 21: Factors influencing student teachers’ promotion of dialogic talk ............... 234