



Environmental regimes in the Caribbean and implications for the dynamics and distribution of its coral reefs

Submitted by **Iiana Carolina Chollett Ordaz** to the University of Exeter
as a thesis for the degree of
Doctor of Philosophy in Biological Sciences
in September **2011**

This thesis is available for Library use on the understanding that it is copyright material and that no quotation from the thesis may be published without proper acknowledgement.

I certify that all material in this thesis which is not my own work has been identified and that no material has previously been submitted and approved for the award of a degree by this or any other University.

Signature:

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read "Iiana Chollett", written over a dotted line.

Acknowledgements

This has been a journey across three continents, with many pleasant finds along the way. The journey started in Venezuela, in bed, during hepatitis convalescence, when my Dad, my nurse at the time, gave me a push to get the PhD application ready. It was time to go. The trip started and it took me to England and then to Australia. It has been a long and winding journey. I am grateful to all that I have found (and kept) on the way.

I am very thankful to my supervisor Pete for providing me (a stranger!) with the opportunity to start this project. I will always remember our first meeting with a smile.

I am terribly grateful to all members of the Marine Spatial Ecology Lab (both in their Exeter and Brisbane configurations) for their friendship, expertise and proof-reading. You are a very nice bunch of smart people, you know?

I would like to express my special gratitude to Frank Müller-Karger, for being my supervisor in all but name. And also to the crew in IMaRS, USF: Chuanmin Hu, Brock, Digna and Laura, always so helpful. I appreciate the comments and discussion given by John Hedley, Jorge Cortés, Scott Heron, William Skirving, Bernhard Riegl, Mark Eakin and Eduardo Klein.

I am grateful to all the funding sources that supported my PhD: the University of Exeter, the ORSAS scheme, the World Bank, the European Space Agency, El Pilon 101 and the FORCE project.

This journey would not have been possible without my family. Thanks so much for letting me go and supporting me all this time, y perdon por los momentos que me he perdido.

I.

Abstract

Over evolutionary time coral reefs have been exposed to the influence of diverse environmental forces which have determined their structure and function. However, the climate of the earth is changing, affecting many biological systems, including coral reefs. Through this thesis the static and dynamic environment of the Caribbean basin was characterized using remote sensing and *in situ* data sources. This information was used to understand how present environmental conditions have shaped reef ecosystems and how the changing climate might jeopardize them.

Focusing on physical constraints that drive many aspects of coastal ecology, a region-wide categorisation of the Physical Environments of the Caribbean Sea (PECS) was developed. The classification approach is hierarchical; including a first level of 16 physicochemical provinces based on sea surface temperature, turbidity and salinity data; and a second level considering mechanical disturbance from wave exposure and hurricanes. The PECS categorisation will facilitate comparative analyses and inform the stratification of studies across environmental provinces in the region.

Montastraea spp. forereef habitats have the highest biodiversity and support the largest number of ecosystem processes and services in the Caribbean. One of the aspects of the physical environment, wave exposure, was used to predict the distribution of these habitats in the Caribbean basin with high accuracy (79%). The distribution of the habitat is constrained in environments of high exposure, a pattern likely to be driven by high rates of chronic sediment scour that constrain recruitment. This approach constitutes a fast and inexpensive alternative to traditional habitat mapping and complements global efforts to map reef extent.

Recent changes in temperature have impacted ecosystem function across the globe. However, the nature of the responses has depended upon the rate of change of temperature and the season when the changes occur, which are spatially variable. In the Caribbean Sea, temperature trends are highly variable in space (ranging from -0.20 to $0.54^{\circ}\text{C decade}^{-1}$) and most of the warming

has been due to increases in summer temperatures. The highly detailed spatial and temporal patterns assessed can be used to elucidate observed ecological responses to climatic change in the region.

In the face of increased temperatures it has been suggested that reefs may become increasingly restricted to locations of naturally low thermal stress, such as upwelling areas. However, when analysing the degree to which seasonal upwelling reduces the local thermal stress experienced by corals, it is clear that upwelling areas do not always offer meaningful protection. Hypothesised areas need to be assessed individually in order to evaluate their capacity as a refuge against climate change.

In this thesis large progress has been made in assessing the ocean climate of the Caribbean basin by quantifying spatial patterns and their rate of change. Although some insight into the consequences of these seascape patterns to the function and distribution of marine systems has been provided, more can be done to fully exploit the datasets produced.

List of Contents

List of Figures	8
List of Tables	12
Author's declaration	13
1 General Introduction	15
The Caribbean Sea	15
Oceanography from space	17
Present climate as a determinant of reef function and distribution	19
Hurricanes	19
Wave exposure	20
Temperature	21
Turbidity	22
Salinity	23
Climate change as a threat to reefs	23
Refuges from thermal stress	24
Thesis overview	25
Significance and innovation	26
References	27
2 Physical environments of the Caribbean Sea	31
Abstract	31

Introduction	32
Methods	34
The dataset	34
Classification	36
Results	39
SOM classification	39
Physicochemical provinces of the Caribbean Sea	43
Physical disturbance in the Caribbean Sea	45
Discussion	47
References	49

3 Predicting the distribution of *Montastraea* reefs using wave exposure

52

Abstract	52
Introduction	53
Methods	55
Results	58
Discussion	64
Ecological drivers of distribution patterns	66
Geological context	67
Model efficacy and transferability	67
References	71

4 Seasonal and spatial heterogeneity of recent sea surface temperature trends in the Caribbean Sea and southeast Gulf of Mexico

74

Abstract	74
Introduction	75
Methods	77
Dataset	77
Statistical methods	77
Results	79
Overall SST trends	79
Seasonal SST trends	82

Discussion	83
SST trends in the Caribbean Sea and southeast Gulf of Mexico	83
Limitations of the analyses	87
References	89
5 Upwelling areas do not guarantee refuge for coral reefs in a warming ocean	93
Abstract	93
Introduction	94
Methods	96
Data source and study locations	96
Identifying upwelling and warming events	98
Prerequisite 1: Synchrony of upwelling and warming events	98
Prerequisite 2: Reduction of thermal stress by upwelling	99
Results	100
Prerequisite 1: Synchrony of upwelling and warming events	100
Prerequisite 2: Reduction of thermal stress by upwelling	102
Net outcomes of synchrony and impact on thermal stress	102
Discussion	104
References	106
6 General Discussion	110
Suitability of the tools	110
Limitations of remote sensing products to monitor coastal processes	110
The issue of spatial scale: different scales for different questions	114
Further applications	116
Understanding the influence of different environments in marine systems	116
Understanding the effects of differential warming rates in marine ecosystems	118
Making progress in seascape marine ecology in the Caribbean	119
References	121

List of Figures

- Figure 1.1.** Caribbean basin (8-28°N, 58-89°W) 16
- Figure 1.2.** Different remote sensing methods and classes of sensors used in satellite oceanography along with their applications (redrawn from Robinson 2004). 18
- Figure 1.3.** Conceptual diagram for the thesis chapters. CH2: Environmental provinces of the Caribbean, CH3: Static climate, characterized by wave exposure, as predictor of reef habitats, CH4: Recent temperature trends in the Caribbean, CH5: Upwelling as a refuge from warming. 25
- Figure 2.1.** Average sea surface temperature map (AVHRR 1993-2008) and marine ecoregions in the Caribbean Sea (8-28°N, 89-58°W) according to Spalding et al. (2007): (43) Northern Gulf of Mexico; (63) Bahamian; (64) Eastern Caribbean; (65) Greater Antilles; (66) Southern Caribbean; (67) South-western Caribbean; (68) Western Caribbean; (69) Southern Gulf of Mexico; (70) Floridian. 33
- Figure 2.2.** Overview of the SOM algorithm: each pixel within the temperature (average, mMM, MMM), turbidity and salinity input maps (1) is taken as an input vector (2), the input for the SOM algorithm. N input vectors (where N is equal to the number of pixels in the image) are linked to the output layer through weighted links (3). The output layer (4) is, in this case, a matrix composed by 16 (4x4) units in a hexagonal grid, where lines indicate the connections among units, and the update neighbourhood of the first (black) unit is defined by the grey gradient, with lighter colours highlighting farther units. 37
- Figure 2.3.** Metrics used to identify the optimum number of clusters (a) Caliński and Harabasz index (CH); (b) within cluster sum of squares (wSS) and between cluster sum of squares (bSS). In grey values corresponding to 16 clusters, the partition chosen. 40
- Figure 2.4.** Spatial arrangement of the 16 physicochemical provinces in the Caribbean Sea and selected examples (A-N), described in Table 2.II. 41
- Figure 2.5.** Topological arrangement of the SOM showing the relative location of the clusters. (a) The proportion of pixels associated with each numbered cluster is indicated by

the size of each hexagon, where larger hexagons indicate a larger number of pixels represented by that cluster. (b) Euclidean distances between the centre of neighbouring clusters, where the hexagons represent the clusters, the lines connect neighbouring clusters, and the colour in the regions containing the lines indicate distances between clusters. Darker colours represent larger distances and lighter colours smaller distances. 42

Figure 2.6. Grid showing the location of the 16 clusters and the average value for each cluster for each environmental variable (darker colours represent larger values): (a) average SST; (b) maximum monthly mean of SST; (c) minimum monthly mean of SST; (d) turbidity; (e) salinity. 42

Figure 2.7. Chronic and acute physical disturbance regime. (A) Chronic stress given by wave exposure (Jm^{-3}). The wind rose in the top right corner shows the average wind conditions (1999-2008) for the entire basin; (B) Acute stress given by the frequency of occurrence of hurricanes category 1-5 in the last 157 years (1851-2008). 46

Figure 2.8. Case study of Northern Bahamas. (A) Physicochemical provinces, (B) chronic and (C) acute physical disturbance regime. 47

Figure 3.1. Study area (16-20°N, 87-89°W) and ground truth locations. 56

Figure 3.2. (A) Logarithm of average wave exposure (J m^{-3}) for the Belize Barrier Reef. Wind rose in top left corner shows the wind distribution for the entire area. (B) Ratio between wave exposure calculated using the daily approach (Figure 3.2A) and the climatological approach commonly followed in the literature. Values of 1 indicate where estimates with both approaches are identical. 59

Figure 3.3. Predicted probability of presence of *Montastraea* reefs against the logarithm of wave exposure. Lines on the x axes show wave exposure values for presence (1) and absence (0) of habitats, the continuous line the fitted model, and the circles and whiskers the average and standard error of presence/absence data for five categories of wave exposure. 60

Figure 3.4. (A) Standardized residuals obtained by the logistic model plotted against their spatial coordinates. (B) Variogram of the residuals. 61

Figure 3.5. Predicted likelihood of *Montastraea* reefs in the Belize Barrier Reef. (A) Map for the entire area. (B) Map showing only predictions in forereef areas as identified by the MCRMP. 63

Figure 3.6. Predicted likelihood of *Montastraea* reefs in forereef areas (as identified by the MCRMP) of Lighthouse reef. Ground truth areas were represented outside the forereef in order to improve readability. 64

Figure 3.7. Histogram of wave exposure values for the entire Caribbean region (A) and Belize (B). Wave exposure was calculated using the same approach described in the

Methods section but at a coarser spatial resolution (1 km) and using only coastlines provided by the freely available Global Self-consistent, Hierarchical, High-resolution Shoreline Database. 68

Figure 4.1. (A) Decadal SST trends in the Caribbean; (B) associated standard deviation (Equation 4); (C) significance of the trend. Stars indicate the locations for Table 4.1 and Figure 4.2. 80

Figure 4.2. Observed monthly SST, model fitting and linear trend (ω) in $^{\circ}\text{C decade}^{-1}$ in four locations of the wider Caribbean marked with stars in Figure 4.1: (A) Barbados (13.12 $^{\circ}\text{N}$, 59.65 $^{\circ}\text{W}$); (B) Belize (18.00 $^{\circ}\text{N}$, 87.50 $^{\circ}\text{W}$); (C) Northern Bahamas (26.65 $^{\circ}\text{N}$, 78.40 $^{\circ}\text{W}$); (D) Yucatan upwelling (21.68 $^{\circ}\text{N}$, 86.98 $^{\circ}\text{W}$); (E) Venezuelan eastern coastal upwelling (10.44 $^{\circ}\text{N}$, 64.35 $^{\circ}\text{W}$). 81

Figure 4.3. Seasonal temperature trends in the Caribbean and associated significance. (A) winter (December-February) trends; (B) significance of the trend in winter; (C) spring (March-May) trends; (D) significance of the trend in spring; (E) summer (June-August) trends; (F) significance of the trend in summer; (G) autumn (September-October) trends; (H) significance of the trend in autumn. 84

Figure 4.4. (A) Trends in annual ranges of temperature (summer-winter); (B) significance of the trend. 85

Figure 4.5. Number of years required to be able to detect the decadal linear trends described in Figure 4.1.A at 95% confidence level (Equation 5). Note this study used time series of 25 year length. 87

Figure 5.1. Assessed regions in (a) Colombian Caribbean; (b) Pacific Panama; (c) Oman; and (d) Northern Madagascar. Upwelling areas showed in dark gray and non-upwelling areas in light gray. 97

Figure 5.2. Probability of occurrence of upwelling and warming events, as well as their joint incidence in (a) Colombian Caribbean; (b) Pacific Panama; (c) Oman; and (d) Northern Madagascar. Warming events were identified when HotSpots in the region (considering upwelling and adjacent non-upwelling areas) exceeded 1 $^{\circ}\text{C}$. Upwelling conditions were identified when temperatures in upwelling areas were three standard deviations below the monthly average temperature experienced in the same month in a neighbouring, non-upwelling area. Probabilities were calculated from monthly incidence of upwelling/warming conditions in 21 years; whiskers indicate 95% confidence intervals (1985-2005 AVHRR Pathfinder data). 101

Figure 5.3. Monthly distribution of temperature averages (lines) and frequency of thermal anomalous events (percentage of weeks when $\text{HS} > 1$; bars) in upwelling and non-upwelling

nearby areas in (a) Colombian Caribbean; (b) Pacific Panama; (c) Oman; and (d) Northern Madagascar. Horizontal lines highlight warm months in upwelling (dark gray) and non-upwelling (light gray) areas, when monthly temperatures were less than 1°C below the maximum monthly mean (1985-2005 AVHRR pathfinder data). 103

Figure 6.1. (a) Average turbidity (diffuse attenuation at band 3 or k490, SeaWiFS 1997-2008); (b) Bathymetry (GEBCO_08 grid v 20091120) for the wider Caribbean. 111

Figure 6.2. Number of surface *in situ* salinity observations in 0.25° grid areas included in the WOA database 114

Figure 6.3. Diagram illustrating the relevant spatial and temporal scales of several oceanographic processes and the approximate resolution of some satellite/sensors (base diagram of ocean processes from Dickey 1990). 115

Figure 6.4. Conceptual diagram for thesis chapters (from Figure 1.3, Chapter 1). CH2: Environmental provinces of the Caribbean, CH3: Static climate, characterized by wave exposure, as a predictor of reef habitats, CH4: Recent temperature trends in the Caribbean, CH5: Upwelling as a refuge from warming. 116

Figure 6.5. (a) Average SST; (b) SST maximum monthly mean and (c) SST trends in sea surface temperature in the wider Caribbean (AVHRR Pathfinder, 1985-2009). Stars show locations in Jamaica, St. Lucia and La Blanquilla (Venezuela) mentioned in the text. 119

List of Tables

Table 2.I. Average and standard deviation of average SST, mMM, MMM, turbidity proxy and salinity for each of the 16 clusters	43
Table 2.II. Physicochemical provinces of the Caribbean Sea.	44
Table 2.III. Issues that would benefit by referencing the PECS classification.	49
Table 3.I. Regression coefficients, standard errors, t-values and p-values for the logistic model of prediction of <i>Montastraea</i> reefs.	60
Table 3.II. Error matrix describing the agreement between the observed and predicted presence and absence of <i>Montastraea</i> reefs using a cut-off value of 0.5. Average and 95% confidence intervals of observed frequencies from 1,000 trials, where 75% of the observations were used for model fitting and 25% for evaluation.	62
Table 4.I. Non-linear random effects parameter estimates (Equation 1) and significance for the five locations marked with stars in Figure 4.1 and plotted in Figure 4.2. Note that the units of ω are annual (not decadal) trends in $^{\circ}\text{C year}^{-1}$.	82