Making sense of dyslexia

A life history study with dyslexic adults
mapping meaning-making and its relationship to the development
of positive self-perceptions and coping skills

Submitted by Ruth Gwernan-Jones, to the University of Exeter as a thesis
for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy by Research in Education, September 2010.

This thesis is available for Library use on the understanding that it is copyright material and that no
quotation from the thesis may be published without proper acknowledgement.

I certify that all material in this thesis which is not my own work has been identified and that no
material has previously been submitted and approved for the award of a degree by this or any
other University.

This research was funded by ESRC Studentship number PTA-031-2006-0057
For Bill, Edward and Gary, 
without whom I would not have thought of doing this thesis;

and for Alun, Bob, Cheryl and Gert, 
without whose support I would not have finished it.
ABSTRACT

It has been acknowledged for some time that personal experience, relationship and emotional factors are important aspects of difficulties in learning to read and write; however there is still little research carried out in this area. This thesis explores the way in which eight adults make sense of their difficulties with reading and writing and identification of dyslexia; and their process of developing more positive self-perceptions and coping strategies. The study is guided by standpoint theory, with priority given to participants’ perceptions about difficulties in reading and writing rather than to academic and/or practitioner perspectives.

Analysis of interviews is carried out through a life history methodology that identifies discourses of dyslexia in order to situate the way difficulties are understood and addressed. The discourses include four identified by Pollak (2005) and identification of six additional discourses of dyslexia that were present in both the literature review and at least half of the participant interviews. In the analysis, use of these discourses is mapped alongside the life story of each participant using the Model of Vocational Success (MVS) (Gerber et al. 1992) as a framework for classifying the development of positive self-perceptions and coping mechanisms.

The participants’ life histories reveal that, without identification of dyslexia, difficulties with reading and writing are most often attributed by others such as teachers, peers and/or parents to low intelligence and/or lack of effort. Some participants rejected this understanding and others internalised it. Experience of ‘niche’ where the participant found themselves to be successful in a specific context best supported the development of positive self-perceptions and coping strategies before identification of dyslexia. Identification of dyslexia provided a means of making sense of difficulties, bolstered self-belief in intelligence, and initiated changes in support and personal motivation which, for the majority of participants, were notably beneficial.
This PhD makes a number of unique contributions to knowledge about dyslexia, particularly through its prioritization of the voice of dyslexic people over professional voices. The identification of six additional discourses of dyslexia contributes to knowledge about the way difficulties with reading and writing can be understood and talked about, and exploration of how these discourses link to the MVS contributes knowledge about the advantages and disadvantages of these discourses to dyslexic people. The discourse ‘Hemispherist’ (Pollak 2005) was found to offer the most opportunity for dyslexic adults to develop positive self-perceptions and take constructive action to compensate for difficulties.
# Table of Contents

Title page ..................................................................................................................................................... 1
Dedication .......................................................................................................................................................... 2
Abstract ............................................................................................................................................................ 3
Table of Contents .......................................................................................................................................... 5
List of Tables .................................................................................................................................................. 8
List of Figures ............................................................................................................................................... 9
Abbreviations ................................................................................................................................................. 11

Chapter 1: Introduction ................................................................................................................................... 12
Personal introduction ........................................................................................................................................ 12
The development of the concept of dyslexia ................................................................................................. 17
   Roots in medicine ....................................................................................................................................... 17
   Development of intervention and conceptual approaches ........................................................................ 18
Outline of the thesis ....................................................................................................................................... 22

Chapter 2: Literature Review ........................................................................................................................ 23
Introduction .................................................................................................................................................... 23
Educational and employment outcomes for poor readers ........................................................................... 25
Studies on self-perceptions and psychological well-being ........................................................................... 27
Research interviewing dyslexic people .......................................................................................................... 32
   Perceptions of school experience ............................................................................................................... 34
      Humiliation, punishment and trauma ......................................................................................................... 35
      Teachers ................................................................................................................................................. 36
      Parents ............................................................................................................................................... 38
      Bullying ............................................................................................................................................... 39
   Perceptions about being identified as dyslexic ......................................................................................... 40
      When dyslexia is not identified ............................................................................................................... 40
      Reaction upon identification of dyslexia ................................................................................................. 41
      The need to conceptualise difficulties with reading and writing ......................................................... 43
      The label ‘dyslexia’ means different things in different contexts ......................................................... 46
   Ways of understanding dyslexia: discourses .............................................................................................. 48
Chapter 3: Methodology .................................................................................. 65

Research design ....................................................................................... 65
Epistemology .......................................................................................... 68
Theoretical perspective ......................................................................... 69
Research strategy .................................................................................. 71
Standpoint theory .................................................................................. 71
Life history ............................................................................................. 74
Method ..................................................................................................... 74

Life history research ............................................................................... 75
Objectivity vs. subjectivity, representation and rigour in life history research .... 76

The life story ............................................................................................ 82
Narrative .................................................................................................. 83
Discourse .................................................................................................. 86
Identity/self ............................................................................................. 90
Impact of time in life and context of interview ....................................... 94

The life history .......................................................................................... 95
Analysing the life story: narrative analysis and analysis of narrative .......... 95
Ethical issues involved in re-representing others .................................. 99
The process of contextualisation ............................................................. 100
What’s wrong with me? .......................................................................... 101
Stupid/lazy ................................................................................................ 102
Educational responsibility ...................................................................... 104
Extra-able .................................................................................................. 105
Show them ............................................................................................... 107
Niche .......................................................................................................... 108
The Model of Vocational Success (MVS) ................................................ 109

Chapter 4: Data Analysis and Discussion .................................................. 113

The process of interviewing participants .............................................. 113
The sample ............................................................................................... 113
LIST OF TABLES

Table 2.1. Description of interview studies reviewed .................................................................33-34

Table 2.2. Description of Pollak’s (2005) four discourses of dyslexia ........................................49

Table 4.1. Participant information ..................................................................................................114

Table. 4.2. Description of aspects of the MVS .............................................................................126

Table 4.3. Description of new discourses of dyslexia identified ..................................................127-128

Table 5.1. Use of discourse by each participant ............................................................................212

Table 5.2. Number of times each discourse links to an aspect of the MVS .................................220

Table 5.3. Examples of criteria for rigour in the thesis .................................................................237
LIST OF FIGURES

Figure 2.1. Diagram of Azjen’s (1985) ‘Theory of Planned Behaviour’
taken from Gwernan-Jones & Burden, 2010).................................................................................. 29

Fig 2.2. Gerber et al.’s (1992, p485) diagram of the Model of vocational success............................... 55

Fig. 3.1. Diagram of the research framework. The research questions will be answered
through a Life history method including analysis of discourses of dyslexia and use
of the Model of Vocational Success (Gerber et al., 1992); the methodology of standpoint
research; and the theoretical perspective of critical theory, founded upon a social
constructionist epistemology ........................................................................................................... 67

Fig 3.2. The reciprocal relationships between lived experience, narrative, discourse and identity......... 91

Fig. 3.3. Heron’s (1996) ‘ways of knowing’, a framework for understanding the relationships
between pre-verbal and verbal knowledge....................................................................................... 93

Fig. 3.4. Famous people who are dyslexic, from the British Dyslexia Association website

Fig. 4.1a. The circular nature of the process of data analysis in this study........................................... 121

Fig. 4.1b. Adam’s map...................................................................................................................... 136

Fig. 4.2. Alice’s map........................................................................................................................ 146

Fig. 4.3. Amber’s map..................................................................................................................... 154

Fig. 4.4. Bob’s map ........................................................................................................................ 165

Fig. 4.5. Country Boy’s map......................................................................................................... 176

Fig. 4.6. Elizabeth Kirner’s map .................................................................................................... 187

Fig. 4.7. Pablo Jenning’s map ....................................................................................................... 199

Fig. 5.1 Number of times each discourse linked to an aspect of the MVS....................................... 218
Fig. 5.2 Comparison of the number of times dyslexia discourses vs. non-dyslexia discourse
(Niche) links to aspects of the MVS

Fig. 5.3a/b. Comparison of participants’ maps showing patterns of links to the MVS. Before identification of dyslexia links result most often from experiences of niche (represented by the Niche discourse) linking to Goodness of Fit, Social Ecologies and/or the Persistence/Goal Oriented/Desire triad, and these frequently contribute to Understanding. Identification of dyslexia often initiates Recognition, Acceptance, Understanding and/or Learned Creativity, and experiences of niche following identification tend to be interpreted through discourses of dyslexia.

Fig. 5.4 Comparison of participants’ maps showing the development of discourse. What’s wrong with me? and DRW=Stupid/lazy appear in the context of school. The Patient and Student discourses originate with identification of dyslexia, with the Hemispherist discourse following on with development of knowledge about strengths and weaknesses. The remaining ‘greenish’ discourses occur according to context and experience. Educational responsibility follows realisation that difficulties can be compensated for. The Dyslexia=Stupid/lazy discourse is usually in reference to participants’ perceptions of the way the general public views dyslexia.
ABBREVIATIONS

ADD  Attention Deficit Disorder
A-level Advanced Level General Certificate of Education
ASD  Autistic Spectrum Disorder
AS-level Advanced Subsidiary Level General Certificate of Education
CSE  Certificate of Secondary Education
DSA  Disabled Student’s Allowance
FE   Further Education
fMRI functional Magnetic Resonance Imaging
GCSE General Certificate of Secondary Education
HE   Higher Education
LD   Learning Disabilities
LEA  Local Education Authority
MVS  Model of Vocational Success
NVQ  National Vocational Qualification
O-level General Certificate of Education Ordinary Level
PGCE Post-Graduate Certificate in Education
SEN  Special Educational Needs
SLI  Specific Language Impairment
SpLD Specific Learning Difficulty