A Russian Eschatology:
Theological Reflections on the Music of Dmitri Shostakovich

Submitted by Anna Megan Davis to the University of Exeter as a thesis for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy in Theology in December 2011

This thesis is available for Library use on the understanding that it is copyright material and that no quotation from the thesis may be published without proper acknowledgement.

I certify that all material in this thesis which is not my own work has been identified and that no material has previously been submitted and approved for the award of a degree by this or any other University.
Abstract

Theological reflection on music commonly adopts a metaphysical approach, according to which the proportions of musical harmony are interpreted as ontologies of divine order, mirrored in the created world. Attempts to engage theologically with music’s expressivity have been largely rejected on the grounds of a distrust of sensuality, accusations that they endorse a ‘religion of aestheticism’ and concern that they prioritise human emotion at the expense of the divine. This thesis, however, argues that understanding music as expressive is both essential to a proper appreciation of the art form and of value to the theological task, and aims to defend and substantiate this claim in relation to the music of twentieth-century Russian composer Dmitri Shostakovich. Analysing a selection of his works with reference to culture, iconography, interiority and comedy, it seeks both to address the theological criticisms of musical expressivism and to carve out a positive theological engagement with the subject, arguing that the distinctive contribution of Shostakovich’s music to theological endeavour lies in relation to a theology of hope, articulated through the possibilities of the creative act.
Acknowledgements

I should like to express profound gratitude to my supervisor, Tim Gorringe, whose input and guidance have led to this thesis existing in the form it does today. Thank you, Tim, for your insightfulness, your encouragement, your generosity of time and your patience.

Grateful thanks are also due to all those who have offered comment, discussion and feedback on the thesis as it evolved: Nigel Groome; Katharine Hodgson; Alastair Logan; Morwenna Ludlow; Oane Reitsma; David Rogers; Bryan and Cecilia Winkett and Marion Wood, together with those who have attended the HuSS Postgraduate Conference at the University of Exeter, the Joint Postgraduate Conferences in Theology and Religion at the University of Bristol and the St. George’s Arts Festival in Beckenham.

Finally, I remain indebted to those without whose friendship and support this thesis might never have been completed: Clara Bradbury-Rance; Donna Cooper; Nigel Cheffers-Heard; Cheryl Davis and Dilly; Fenny Gill; Amber Griffiths and Tom; Rishad Motlani; Vicky Neale; Judith Parker; Sally Skerratt and Millicent and Vicky Stiles.

This thesis was funded by the University of Exeter and the Arts and Humanities Research Council, and supported by a book grant from St. Barnabas’ Church, Winchester.
Contents

Abstract 3
Acknowledgements 4

Introduction 11

PART ONE: THEOLOGY AND MUSIC 18

1. Music in the Great Tradition 19
   I. The Pythagorean Tradition 23
      (a) Pythagoras and Plato 23
      (b) Augustine and Boethius 26
   II. Musical Formalism 31
      (a) Immanuel Kant 31
      (b) Eduard Hanslick 37
   III. Jeremy Begbie 42
      (a) Music and Temporality 42
      (b) Music and the Cosmos 46
   IV. Conclusion 49

2. The Theological Significance of Musical Expressivism 51
   I. Musical Expressivism 54
      (a) Ancient Greek Influences 54
      (b) G. W. F. Hegel 57
      (c) Arthur Schopenhauer 61
      (d) Roger Scruton 64
   II. Music and Context 70
      (a) Theodor Adorno 71
      (b) Susan McClary 75
      (c) Heidi Epstein 80
   III. Theological Reflection on Musical Expressivism 85
PART TWO: SHOSTAKOVICH

3. Music and Culture: The Fifth Symphony

I. The Context of the Fifth Symphony
   (a) Soviet Expectations
   (b) *Lady Macbeth*
   (c) The Fourth Symphony
   (d) Issues in Interpreting the Fifth Symphony

II. The Fifth Symphony
   (a) ‘Fragments of Memory’
   (b) First Movement
   (c) Second Movement
   (d) Third Movement
   (e) Fourth Movement
   (f) Reception
   (g) Musical Ambiguity and the Preservation of Value

III. Theological Reflection on the Fifth Symphony

4. Musical Icons: The Seventh Symphony

I. The Context of the Seventh Symphony
   (a) Declaration of War
   (b) The Siege of Leningrad
   (c) Shostakovich and War

II. The Seventh Symphony
   (a) ‘War Symphonies’
   (b) First Movement
   (c) Second Movement
   (d) Third Movement
   (e) Fourth Movement
   (f) Reception
   (g) Performance in Leningrad

III. Theological Reflection on the Seventh Symphony
   (a) Dostoevsky and Russian Orthodox Theology
   (b) Icons in Dostoevsky
   (c) The Seventh Symphony as Musical Icon
5. The ‘Song of the Self’: The String Quartets 164
   I. The Second String Quartet 168
      (a) Context 168
      (b) Analysis and Interpretation 171
   II. The Eighth String Quartet 176
      (a) Context 176
      (b) Analysis and Interpretation 178
   III. The Thirteenth String Quartet 184
      (a) Context 184
      (b) Analysis and Interpretation 187
   IV. Theological Reflection on the String Quartets 191
      (a) Music and Interiority 191
      (b) G. W. F. Hegel and the ‘Negative’ 200

6. Music and Comedy: The Nose 204
   I. Shostakovich and The Nose 206
      (a) Creation 206
      (b) Preparation for Performance 210
      (c) Reception 213
   II. Comedy in The Nose 217
      (a) Satire 218
      (b) Parody 226
      (c) The Grotesque 231
   III. Theological Reflection on The Nose 237
      (a) Theology and Comedy 238
      (b) Theology and Tragedy 241

PART THREE: CONCLUSION 247

Conclusion 248

Bibliography 254
**List of Figures**

| Fig. 3.1  | Shostakovich, *Vozrozhdeniye*, Op. 46/1, bb. 18-29 | 100 |
| Fig. 3.2  | Shostakovich, Symphony No. 5, fourth movement, [120]-[121] | 100 |
| Fig. 3.3  | Shostakovich, Symphony No. 5, first movement, opening | 102 |
| Fig. 3.4  | Shostakovich, Symphony No. 5, first movement, \(^2[1]\) | 102 |
| Fig. 3.5  | Shostakovich, Symphony No. 5, first movement, \([1]^{1-2}\) | 103 |
| Fig. 3.6  | Shostakovich, Symphony No. 5, first movement, \([45]^{2-4}\) | 103 |
| Fig. 3.7  | Shostakovich, Symphony No. 5, second movement cello opening and first movement violin theme at \([1]^{1-2}\) | 104 |
| Fig. 3.8  | *Vechnaya pamyat’* (Eternal remembrance) | 106 |
| Fig. 3.9  | Shostakovich, Symphony No. 5, third movement, [86] | 106 |
| Fig. 3.10 | Mahler, *Das Lied von der Erde*, II ‘Der Einsame im Herbst’, \([3]^{1}\) | 107 |
| Fig. 3.11 | Mahler, *Das Lied von der Erde*, IV ‘Der Abschied’, \([41]^{2}\) | 107 |
| Fig. 3.12 | Shostakovich, Symphony No. 5, third movement, \([86]^{3}\) | 107 |
| Fig. 3.13a| Shostakovich, Symphony No. 5, third movement, [79] | 108 |
| Fig. 3.13b| Shostakovich, Symphony No. 5, third movement, [80] | 108 |
| Fig. 3.13c| Shostakovich, Symphony No. 5, third movement, [94] | 108 |
| Fig. 3.14 | Shostakovich, Symphony No. 5, fourth movement, \([97]^{2}\) | 109 |
| Fig. 4.1  | Shostakovich, Symphony No. 7, first movement, opening | 134 |
| Fig. 4.2  | Shostakovich, Symphony No. 7, first movement, \([6]^{2}\) | 134 |
| Fig. 4.3  | Shostakovich, Symphony No. 7, first movement, [19] | 135 |
| Fig. 4.4  | Shostakovich, Symphony No. 7, first movement, \([19]^{5}\) | 136 |
| Fig. 4.5  | Shostakovich, Symphony No. 7, first movement, [45] | 136 |
| Fig. 4.6  | Shostakovich, Symphony No. 7, first movement, \([60]^{4}\) | 138 |
| Fig. 4.7  | Shostakovich, Symphony No. 7, second movement | 138 |
| Fig. 4.8  | Shostakovich, Symphony No. 7, second movement, [76] | 139 |
| Fig. 4.9  | Shostakovich, Symphony No. 7, second movement, \([76]^{2}\) | 139 |
| Fig. 4.10 | Shostakovich, Symphony No. 7, third movement, three note motif | 140 |
| Fig. 4.11 | Shostakovich, Symphony No. 7, third movement, [106] | 140 |
| Fig. 4.12 | Shostakovich, Symphony No. 7, third movement, \([121]^{1}\) | 141 |
| Fig. 4.13 | Shostakovich, Symphony No. 7, fourth movement, \([150]^{1-5}\) | 141 |
| Fig. 4.14 | Shostakovich, Symphony No. 7, fourth movement, \([151]^{1-8}\) | 141 |
Fig. 4.15 Shostakovich, Symphony No. 7, fourth movement – comparison of rhythms at [19] and [179] 142

Fig. 4.16 Shostakovich, Symphony No. 7, fourth movement, [204] 143

Fig. 5.1 Shostakovich, String Quartet No. 2, Moderato, opening 172
Fig. 5.2 Shostakovich, String Quartet No. 2, Moderato, [5] 172
Fig. 5.3 Shostakovich, String Quartet No. 2, Theme and Variations, \([92]\) 175
Fig. 5.4 ‘DSCH’ motif 177
Fig. 5.5 Shostakovich, String Quartet No. 8, first movement, ‘sigh’ motif 179
Fig. 5.6 Shostakovich, String Quartet No. 8, first movement, dactylic pattern 179
Fig. 5.7 Shostakovich, String Quartet No. 8, second movement, [21] 179
Fig. 5.8 Shostakovich, String Quartet No. 8, fourth movement, opening 181
Fig. 5.9 Shostakovich, String Quartet No. 8, fifth movement, [66]-[66] 182

Fig. 6.1 Shostakovich, *The Nose*, Act 1, scene i, [40]-[41] 220
Fig. 6.2 Shostakovich, *The Nose*, Act III, scene vii, [299]-[301] 222
Fig. 6.3 Shostakovich, *The Nose*, Act III, scene vii, [303]-[306] 223
Fig. 6.4 Shostakovich, *The Nose*, Act II, scene i, [228]-[233] 226
Fig. 6.5 Comparison of pitches of captain’s voice in Berg’s *Wozzeck* and constable’s voice in Shostakovich’s *The Nose* 229
Fig. 6.6 Comparison of rhythms of captain’s voice in Berg’s *Wozzeck* and constable’s voice in Shostakovich’s *The Nose* 229
Fig. 6.7 Comparison of ‘polka in the tavern’ from Berg, *Wozzeck* and ‘gallop on the quay’ from Shostakovich, *The Nose* 230
Fig. 6.8 Comparison of Strauss’ ‘Jugendfeuer Gallop’ and Shostakovich’s gallop in *The Nose* 232
Fig. 6.9 Shostakovich, *The Nose*, Act I, scene iii, [95] 234
Fig. 6.10 Shostakovich, *The Nose*, Intermezzo after Act III, [463]-[464] 236
Fig. 6.11 Shostakovich, *The Nose*, Intermezzo after Act III, [479]-[480] 237
Note on Abbreviations

References to the score are made where possible citing the rehearsal figure and the number of bars preceding or following this. For example, [35]$^{1-3}$ refers to bars 1-3 after rehearsal figure 35.

Note on Translations

Translations of Russian names and places are cited consistently throughout, with the exception of those references occurring within direct quotations, where citations remain true to the translations of the original sources.