



THE ECOLOGY OF BIOERODING SPONGES ON CARIBBEAN CORAL REEFS

Submitted by *Manuel Alejandro González Rivero* to the University of Exeter

as a thesis for the degree of

Doctor of Philosophy in Biological Sciences

In December 2011

This thesis is available for Library use on the understanding that it is copyright material and that no quotation from the thesis may be published without proper acknowledgement.

I certify that all material in this thesis which is not my own work has been identified and that no material has previously been submitted and approved for the award of a degree by this or any other University.

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to be "M. A. González Rivero", written in a cursive style.

Signature:

Declaration by author

This thesis is composed of my original work, and contains no material previously published or written by another person except where due reference has been made in the text. I have clearly stated the contribution by others, to jointly-authored works, statistical assistance, survey design, data analysis, significant technical procedures, professional editorial advice, and any other original research work used or reported in my thesis.

Statement of Contributions by Others to the Thesis as a Whole

Peter J. Mumby provided supervision, support and funding for the project. Christine Schönberg supervised and supported discussions over the progress in Chapters 2,3 and 5.

Renata Ferrari provided funding and support over fieldwork and contributed to the discussions of Chapters 2, 3 and 5.

Alexander V. Ereskovsky and Jane Fromont contributing with methodological guidance, interpretation and discussion of histological images (Chapter 2).

Laith Yacob, contributed, as a jointed author in Chapter 4, with analytical model development and discussions.

Published Works by the Author Incorporated into the Thesis

González-Rivero, M., L. Yakob, and P. J. Mumby. 2011. The role of sponge competition on coral reef alternative steady states. *Ecological Modelling* 222:1847-1853.

González-Rivero, M., R. Ferrari, C. H. L. Schönberg, and P. J. Mumby. 2012. Impacts of macroalgal competition and parrotfish predation on the growth of a common bioeroding sponge. *Marine Ecology Progress Series* 444:133-142.

Additional Published Works by the Author Relevant to the Thesis but not Forming Part of it

Ferrari, R., M. Gonzalez-Rivero, J. C. Ortiz, and P. J. Mumby. 2012. Interaction of herbivory and seasonality on the dynamics of Caribbean macroalgae. *Coral Reefs*:1-10. DOI: 10.1007/s00338-012-0889-9

ABSTRACT

Sponges contribute to large number of functions in coral reef ecosystems. Among these, bioerosion is perhaps one of the most widely studied, largely due to the important contribution of excavating sponges to the carbonate budget on coral reefs (up to 95 % of the total internal bioerosion). Despite our current knowledge, much of the literature is centred on individual-based observations, and little is known about their ecological role and interactions with other reef taxa in complex coral reef systems. The aim of this thesis was to quantify the ecological interactions of bioeroding sponges with major reef taxa by scaling up individual observations to population and ecosystem-based approaches. A cosmopolitan, abundant and highly competitive bioeroding sponge from Glover's Atoll, Belize (*Cliona tenuis*) was used as model species. Monitoring of *C. tenuis* populations throughout 2009 indicated a trade-off between reproduction and growth, with the highest growth rates ($31.4 \pm 5.6 \text{ mm.y}^{-1}$) occurring in summer, and a peak in reproductive output during winter. Populations typically show strong left-skewed size frequency distributions, mostly represented by juvenile-size individuals (46%), suggesting that regulating mechanisms (e.g. competition and predation) may be acting in constraining the transition of juveniles to adult sizes. Long-term in situ manipulations showed no effect of predation, yet competition with macroalgae significantly reduced the size of the sponge by $38\% \pm 11\%$ (SE). While *C. tenuis* exhibit high growth and recruitment rates that could theoretically result in rapid population growth, the likelihood of sponges forming an alternative stable state as reefs sustain greater levels of disturbance is unclear. An analytical modelling approach of the interplay between macroalgae, coral and sponge was used to explore the likelihood of alternate stable states. The results show that irrespective of successful sponge invasion, inclusion of this third antagonist (in the interplay between coral and macroalgae) can qualitatively affect the likelihood of alternative stable state. The model exhibits emergent properties suggestive of intransitivity between the three competing taxa. Despite the potential of *C. tenuis* to benefit from disturbance, there are few cases in the literature reporting increases in bioeroding sponge

abundance followed disturbance. Therefore, regulating mechanisms such as competition with other taxa, recruitment limitation or mortality are expected to exert demographic control on the populations of bioeroding sponges when space limitation is relaxed due to coral mortality. To determine processes regulating sponge populations, an individual-based spatial modelling approach was used to simulate the population dynamics of *C. tenuis* in a dynamic ecosystem environment. Using an orthogonal hypothesis testing approach, it was found that competition, and to a lesser extent partial mortality of the sponge tissue, largely regulate the population structure of *C. tenuis*. While reductions in coral cover may temporarily favour the rapid colonization by sponges, the competitive superiority of macroalgae may steal the opportunity from the opportunists.

Keywords: Porifera, *Cliona tenuis*, coral reefs, Caribbean, ecology

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

This project was funded by the Fondo Nacional de Ciencia, Tecnología e Innovación (FONACIT) of Venezuela, and the contribution of various funding sources from co-authors of this work, such as: Wildlife Conservation Society (WCS) and Khaled bin Sultan Living Oceans Foundation (LOF) through fellowships to Renata Ferrari, and the Natural Environment Research Council (NERC), and ARC Laureate Fellowship through fellowships to Peter J. Mumby.

A large number of people have contributed, either directly or indirectly, to make this work possible. For those intense but highly rewarding hours and logistic support in the field, many thanks to Wildlife Conservation Society Belize and Glover's Atoll Marine Research Station staff, and especially Janet Gibson, Alex, Sandra, Danny, Feygon, Yvette and Dol. I would like to particularly thank to my colleague and friend Renata Ferrari, without whom this work would have never reached the proposed goals (and even more!) and with whom I had amazing, yet unforgettable adventures in Glover's Atoll and the Mesoamerican barrier reefs. Along with Rena many people made this a very special time in the field: To Alex Tilley, Ana Teresa Herrera Reveles, Bryan Edwards, Ray Tilley, Emma Kennedy, Mary Ledlie, Natalia Ferrari, Marie Smedley, Tony Nunez, Elroy Tucker, Sharel Nolberto, Adam Kowalski, Amy Millman, Tanya Barona, Andres Roberts, Cody and Nick Page, all kindly and enthusiastically volunteered hours under and above the water; thanks a million to you all. I am also grateful to Dr Darryl Whitehead and Prof David Merritt for the use of the histology and microscopy facilities at the schools of Biomedical Sciences and Biological Sciences, University of Queensland, and to Dr Alvine Mehinto and Prof Charles Tyler, at the College of Life and Environmental Sciences, University of Exeter, for providing facilities and training for the histological processing of samples.

For critical and inspirational discussions throughout the PhD, first I would like to thank my supervisor Pete Mumby, who provided me with support and the framework to develop the

research here presented, and whose critical thinking greatly contributed to my development during this PhD. I would like to extend my most sincere thanks to Christine Schönberg who was more than an invited advisor in this thesis, but also a mentor and guru along this endeavour into the ecology of sponges. I would also like to acknowledge the reviewers of this Thesis, Prof Emma Johnston and Dr Alastair Harborne, whose comments and discussion greatly improve the latest stage of this manuscript. To the Marine Spatial Ecology Lab crew, Exeter and UQ versions, this wouldn't have been half what is presented here with your support. In particular, Shay O'Farrell, Iliana Chollett, Renata Ferrari, Yves-Marie Bozec, Alyssa Marshell, Christopher Doropoulos, Nick Wolff, Jez Roff and Juan Ortiz who kindly discussed and commented on the science here presented. To my family, whose constant support has always been of great help, and to Adri, to whom there are no words to thank for her support along this time, thank you!

CONTENT

GENERAL INTRODUCTION 12

CARIBBEAN CORAL REEF ECOLOGY: AN OVERVIEW	12
CORAL REEF SPONGES AND THEIR ROLE IN ECOSYSTEM DYNAMICS	13
THE ROLE OF SPONGES IN THE FACE OF CORAL REEF DISTURBANCE	13
BIOERODING SPONGES: PUTATIVELY BENEFITING FROM DISTURBANCE	15
THE THESIS SCOPE	16
OUTLINE OF RESEARCH CHAPTERS	17
REFERENCES	19

LIFE-HISTORY TRAITS OF A COMMON CARIBBEAN CORAL-EXCAVATING SPONGE, *CLIONA*

***TENUIS* (PORIFERA: HADROMERIDA) 23**

ABSTRACT	24
INTRODUCTION	25
MATERIALS AND METHODS	26
RESULTS	30
DISCUSSION	37
ACKNOWLEDGMENTS	43
REFERENCES	43
APPENDIX	46

IMPACTS OF MACROALGAL COMPETITION AND PARROTFISH PREDATION ON THE GROWTH

OF A COMMON BIOERODING SPONGE 47

ABSTRACT	48
INTRODUCTION	48
MATERIALS AND METHODS	50
RESULTS	56
DISCUSSION	60
ACKNOWLEDGMENTS	63
REFERENCES	64
APPENDICES	66

THE ROLE OF SPONGE COMPETITION ON CORAL REEF ALTERNATIVE STEADY STATES 72

ABSTRACT	73
INTRODUCTION	74
METHODS	75
STUDY SITE AND DATA COLLECTION	75

MATHEMATICAL MODEL	76
RESULTS	79
DISCUSSION	83
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS	86
REFERENCES	86

ASYMMETRICAL COMPETITION REGULATES FUGITIVE SPECIES OUTBREAKS FOLLOWING

CORAL REEF DEGRADATION: **89**

ABSTRACT	90
INTRODUCTION	91
METHODS	93
STUDY SPECIES	93
STUDY AREA	95
POPULATION MODELLING OF <i>CLIONA TENUIS</i> IN AN ECOSYSTEM CONTEXT	95
MODELLING HYPOTHESIZED DRIVERS OF THE POPULATION STRUCTURE	97
TESTING THE MODEL PERFORMANCE	100
UNDERSTANDING THE ROLE OF REGULATING MECHANISMS	101
RESULTS	102
DISCUSSIONS	108
ACKNOWLEDGMENTS	111
REFERENCES	111
APPENDIX	118

GENERAL DISCUSSION **121**

REFERENCES	125
------------	-----