Can ASEAN Benefit from the European Union’s Experience in the Field of Facilitating Corporate Collaboration?

Submitted by Soyeon Kim to the University of Exeter
as a thesis for the degree of
Doctor of Philosophy in Law
In July 2011

This thesis is available for Library use on the understanding that it is copyright material and that no quotation from the thesis may be published without proper acknowledgement.

I certify that all material in this thesis which is not my own work has been identified and that no material has previously been submitted and approved for the award of a degree by this or any other University.
ABSTRACT

Regional integration in the Association of Southeast Asian Nations (ASEAN) received a boost in 2007 when they explicitly announced their objective to build an ASEAN Economic Community (AEC), i.e. a single market and production base in the region. Pursuing the ASEAN single market means that ASEAN shares with the European Union (EU) the common interests of developing regional economic integration, taking action to combat the cost of market fragmentation.

The aim of this thesis is to put forward suggestions directed at the realisation of the ASEAN single market in the field of economic integration and cooperation in the business sector based upon the experience of the EU in developing its internal market. To achieve this objective, the thesis investigates current conditions for business cooperation and collaboration and analyses existing barriers to effective cooperation in ASEAN. In the framework of a comparative analysis of the two regional developments where it is relevant, the analysis is mainly based on library-based research complemented by the socio-legal research method of interviewing ASEAN experts and also, businesses within ASEAN.

The major barriers identified in cross-border business activities are based on ASEAN Member Countries’ protectionist techniques to control foreign inward investments. The ‘ASEAN Way’ of consensus-based decision-making and a lack of compliance and enforcement mechanisms and of working judicial institutions obstruct the development of efficient mechanisms for the purpose and also, the efficacy of the AEC initiatives and the ASEAN industrial economic cooperation schemes. Considering the limits of the related ASEAN instruments in facilitating corporate collaboration and promoting intra-ASEAN trade and investments, four different areas of mechanisms drawn from the EU’s experience are considered. After conducting an evaluation of the viability and the potential benefits of those mechanisms in ASEAN, the thesis proposes that the most useful area, promising practical benefits, would be the introduction of uniform and universally recognised business entities to facilitate collaboration and cooperation within ASEAN. Recognition of such entities as national entities within every Member Country will help to obviate these protectionist tendencies and improve the development of intra-ASEAN trade.
# Table of Contents

List of Abbreviations ......................................................................................................................... 8

Chapter 1  Introduction .......................................................................................................................... 11

1.1 Background: General Considerations on ASEAN and Intra-ASEAN Trade .................. 11

1.2 Objective and Research Questions .............................................................................................. 20

1.2.1 Objective and Scope of the Research ...................................................................................... 20

1.2.2 Research Questions .................................................................................................................... 20

1.3 Methodology .................................................................................................................................. 22

1.3.1 Research Methods ....................................................................................................................... 22

1.3.2 Interviews .................................................................................................................................. 23

1.4 Structure of the Thesis .................................................................................................................... 31

Chapter 2  ASEAN and the EU ........................................................................................................ 35

2.1 Introduction .................................................................................................................................... 35

2.2 Aims of ASEAN and the Implementation Challenge .................................................................... 41

2.2.1 Establishment of ASEAN Economic Community .................................................................. 41

2.2.2 Evolution of the ASEAN Charter ............................................................................................. 53

2.3 Institutional Framework of ASEAN and the EU ......................................................................... 64

2.3.1 Institutional Settings .................................................................................................................... 64

2.3.2 Enforcement Mechanism ............................................................................................................ 78

2.4 Conclusion: What ASEAN Needs to Do ..................................................................................... 84

Chapter 3  Major Barriers for Foreign Business Activities in ASEAN ................................................. 90

3.1 Introduction .................................................................................................................................... 90

3.2 Barriers Affecting All Foreign Investors in ASEAN: Protectionist Techniques in ASEAN Member Countries ......................................................................................................................... 93

3.2.1 Total or Sectoral Exclusion of Foreign Investors ................................................................. 96

3.2.2 Regulating Equity Joint Ventures between Foreign and Local Enterprises .................... 102

3.2.3 Restriction on Foreign Shareholdings and Foreign Ownership in Privatisation and Domination of Public Enterprises ......................................................................................................................... 113

3.2.4 Screening and Process-Related Restrictions ............................................................................. 121

3.3 Conclusion: An Analysis of Barriers ............................................................................................. 132

Chapter 4  Cross-Border Business Cooperation Developments within ASEAN .............................. 140
4.1 Introduction .................................................................................................................. 140

4.2 ASEAN Economic Community Instruments ................................................................. 143
   4.2.1 From Preferential Trade Agreement to ASEAN Free Trade Area ....................... 143
      (1) Preferential Trade Agreements ............................................................................. 143
      (2) ASEAN Free Trade Area .................................................................................... 146
   4.2.2 ASEAN Framework Agreements on Services ...................................................... 152
   4.2.3 Framework of ASEAN Investment Area ............................................................. 162
      (1) ASEAN Agreement for the Promotion and Protection of Investments .............. 162
      (2) Framework Agreement on the ASEAN Investment Area .................................... 164
      (3) ASEAN Comprehensive Investment Agreement ................................................ 168

4.3 Industrial Economic Cooperation in ASEAN ............................................................. 171
   4.3.1 From ASEAN Industrial Projects to ASEAN Industrial Joint Ventures ............ 171
      (1) ASEAN Industrial Projects .................................................................................. 171
      (2) ASEAN Industrial Complementation .................................................................. 173
      (3) ASEAN Industrial Joint Ventures ...................................................................... 175
   4.3.2 ASEAN Industrial Cooperation Scheme .............................................................. 176

4.4 Conclusion .................................................................................................................... 184

Chapter 5  EU Corporate Mobility Mechanisms .................................................................. 188

5.1 Introduction .................................................................................................................. 188

5.2 Barriers for Corporate Collaboration and Cross-Border Mobility within the EU ........ 191

5.3 EU Mechanisms on Corporate Collaboration and Cross-border Mobility ............... 207
   5.3.1 Removal of Tariff and Other Barriers to Trade .................................................... 208
   5.3.2 Harmonisation of Company Laws ....................................................................... 210
      (1) Harmonisation Approach ................................................................................... 210
      (2) EU Company Law Directives ............................................................................. 214
      (3) Conclusion on European Company law harmonisation ..................................... 223
   5.3.3 Promotion of Freedom of Establishment for Companies ..................................... 226
      (1) Free Movement of the Self-Employed ................................................................. 226
      (2) Development of Case-Law in the Court of Justice .............................................. 232
   5.3.4 Introduction of Supranational Business Vehicles ................................................ 255
      (1) European Company or Societas Europea ............................................................ 255
      (2) European Economic Interest Grouping .............................................................. 263
(3) European Private Company or Societas Privata Europea.................................268

5.3.5 Mutual Recognition of Foreign Companies in the EU..............................272

5.4 Conclusion .................................................................................................274

Chapter 6 Implications from the European Experience for the Development of the ASEAN Economic Integration in Business Sector .................................................................277

6.1 Introduction: Suggested Mechanisms ..........................................................277

6.2 Evaluation of the Suggested Mechanisms .....................................................279

6.2.1 Mutual Recognition of Foreign Companies in ASEAN ...............................279

6.2.2 Protection of Rights of Establishment through the ASEAN Institutions ....283

6.2.3 Harmonisation of ASEAN Company Laws and Business Regulations ........286

6.2.4 Creation of Supranational Corporate Entities .........................................289

6.2.5 Results of Evaluation .............................................................................295

6.3 ASEAN Business Cooperation Partnership ..................................................296

6.3.1 Benefits and Features ............................................................................296

(1) Advantages of ASEAN Business Cooperation Partnership .......................299

(2) Differences from European Economic Interest Grouping .........................303

6.3.2 Contents of the ABCP Agreement .............................................................307

(1) Regulatory Format ....................................................................................307

(2) Contents .....................................................................................................309

(3) Formation ..................................................................................................309

(4) Registration ...............................................................................................311

(5) Legal personality and Taxation Status ......................................................311

(6) Membership ..............................................................................................312

(7) Publicity .....................................................................................................313

6.3.3 Prospects and Challenges in Implementation ..........................................314

6.4 ASEAN Private Company ...........................................................................316

6.4.1 Benefits and Features ..........................................................316

6.4.2 Contents of the APC Agreement .............................................................322

(1) Regulatory Format ....................................................................................322

(2) Governing Law ........................................................................................323

(3) Formation and Cross-border Requirement ..............................................326

(4) Registration and Transfer of the Registered Office ..................................329
(5) Legal Capital........................................................................................................332
(6) Articles of Association and Organisation ......................................................339

6.4.3 Prospects and Implementation Challenges ..................................................343
6.5 Conclusion ........................................................................................................348

Chapter 7  Conclusion............................................................................................352

Bibliography.............................................................................................................359

Books.........................................................................................................................359

Articles .....................................................................................................................371

Appendix A: Interview Questions for ASEAN Experts ........................................382
Appendix B: Interview Questions for Businessmen ...............................................385
Appendix C: Interview Supplementary Note ..........................................................386
Appendix D: Example of Information Sheet ............................................................391
Appendix E: Example of Consent Form ..................................................................393