The Gulf and Southeast Asia: 
Regional Security Complex and Regional Security Community 
A comparative study 

Submitted by 
Talal Mohammed Al-Khalifa 

To the University of Exeter as a dissertation for the 
Degree of Doctor of Philosophy in the 
Institute of Arab and Islamic Studies 

March 2012 

This thesis is available for Library use on the understanding that it is copyright material and that no quotation from the thesis may be published without proper acknowledgement 

I certify that all the material in this thesis which is not my work has been identified and that no material is included for which a degree has previously been conferred upon me. 

Signed .....................................
Acknowledgments

One sets out on the project of a doctoral thesis with high aspirations and hope. One reaches the end of the project with relief, satisfaction and thankfulness. The total process is long and arduous, and during it many debts of gratitude are incurred, for helps and encouragement. Along the way friends and colleagues have encouraged me in this project; by reading, suggesting and correcting.

Most of all, the final outcome (less any faults that must be mine) is owed for its acceptance to Professor Tim Niblock, my supervisor – always urging accuracy, consistency and agreeable expression. I am grateful to my superiors in the Bahrain Forces for granting me the necessary time for undertaking the doctoral project. My family have looked on with patience and encouragement. I am grateful.
Abstract
The study covers two regions. These are shown to constitute ‘Regional security complexes’. The Gulf region and the Gulf Cooperation Council (GCC) and the Association of Southeast Asian Nations (ASEAN) in the Southeast Asian region are the focus of study. The defence and security circumstances of the two regions and the responses of the regions’ governments severally and cooperatively are examined. The study has had to take account of the geographic, historical, ethno-cultural differences between the two regions. These are shown to be influential in their respective security responses. Nonetheless, the thesis demonstrates how the regions can be understood in terms of a common theoretical framework.

The study is undertaken primarily within the framework of the theory of ‘Regional Security Complex’ (RSCT), as developed by Buzan and Waever in Regions and Power. Regional security complexes are areas of internal “security interdependence” and securitisation. The theory (RSCT) is discussed critically. ‘Security Communities’ is a major comparative feature of the study. Amitav Acharya develops this approach in Constructing a Security Community in Southeast Asia. Emphasis is on the “creative construction” of a ‘security community’. The Gulf Cooperation Council may also be viewed in this way. ‘Regional security complex’ and ‘regional security community’ are not alternative theories of regional inter-state relations. The second is superstructural on the prior facts of regional security complexity. The GCC is
a partial response to regional security and is a securitising actor in the region. ASEAN is an attempt at region-wide inclusiveness and conflict avoidance.

Institutional management of security is described. The two regional approaches differ as beliefs that the “enmity/amity balance” is amenable to official regional policy and action: the Gulf and GCC are apparently locked in a dominant ‘enmity’ scenario; ASEAN seeks to establish a regime of ‘amity’. Whether ASEAN is notably less militarily oriented than the Gulf is questioned. States’ insistence on national security ‘resilience’ and ASEAN norms of ‘sovereignty’, ‘non-interference’ and conflict avoidance’ impede regional security development. ASEAN’s progress towards an ‘ASEAN Security Community’ is examined.

The study discusses practicalities of these policies. The application and limitations of ‘Revolution in military affairs’ (RMA) are discussed. The military are viewed as a principal operational actor in any regional security response to conditions of regional security complexity. An examination of state-military relations is based on the concepts of ‘grand strategy’ and ‘military doctrine’.
# List of Contents

## Acknowledgements

Part 1

### Chapter One

Introduction to the subject of the thesis

(i) Introduction 9
(ii) Nature of the Study 9
(iii) Study of two regional security complexes 12
(iv) Geographical, Social, Cultural, Economic settings 13
(v) Conclusion 30
Notes 32

### Chapter Two

Regional Comparisons: the modern histories of the regions

(i) Introduction 36
(ii) Arabian Gulf States 36
(iii) Iran 38
(iv) Southeast Asia 40
(v) Conclusion 45
Notes 46

### Chapter Three

Critical and analytic Review of the literature

(i) Introduction 49
(ii) General literature – the Gulf 50
(iii) General literature – Southeast Asia 54
(iv) Regional security complex: core aspect of study 58
(v) Regional security communities 63
(vi) Security and securitization 67
(vii) Conclusion 70
Notes 73
Chapter Four

Regions, Regional Security Complex Theory and Regional Security Communities

(i) Introduction 82
(ii) Significance of Regional Complex Theory 84
(iii) Change in the ‘realist’ international system 86
(iv) Regional security complexes: removal of ‘overlay’ 88
(v) Regions: distinct level in the international system 93
(vi) Regional security complex, regime, community 97
(vii) Structural significance of ‘amity and enmity’ 100
(viii) Security and securitization in a RS Complex 102
(ix) Global system: autonomous regional dynamics 113
(x) Delineating RSC boundaries: States principal actors 116
(xi) ‘Regional Security Complex’, ‘regional community’ 119
(xii) GCC, ASEAN communities structurally different 124
(xiii) Conclusion 126
Notes 129

Chapter Five

The Gulf and Southeast Asia: Regional Security Complexes and Regional Security Communities

(i) Introduction 135
(ii) Gulf regional security complex identified 137
(iii) Cross-currents of Arab secular and religious radicalism 140
(iv) Gulf a regional security complex differentiated 142
(v) Balances and shifts in amity and enmity in the Gulf 144
(vi) Iraq: an ambitious and fallen hegemon 150
(vii) Iran: assertive Gulf regional power 154
(viii) Saudi Arabia: a regional power 164
(ix) Southeast Asia: a regional security complex 174
(x) Vietnam an Indochina power. ASEAN anxieties 179
(xi) Vietnam in Cambodia, ASEAN: protection of Thailand 183
(xiii) Post-Peace Agreement. ASEAN enlargement 190
(xiv) Conclusion 195
Notes 198
Chapter Six

‘Defence’ and ‘Conflict – Avoidance’ and their institutionalization in the Gulf and Southeast Asia

(i) Introduction
(ii) The Gulf Cooperation Council: general institutional system
(iii) Association of Southeast Asian Nations (ASEAN): general institutional system
(iv) GCC: development of security and defence in the Gulf
(v) Security challenges and security policy in the GCC
(vi) GCC Peninsula Shield Force (Al-Jazeera Shield Forces)
(vii) Toward a Rapid Deployment Force (RDF)
(viii) ASEAN responds to regional security circumstances
(ix) ‘Defence’: ASEAN: principles, norms and declarations
(x) ASEAN: towards a regional security community
(xi) ASEAN Regional Forum (ARF)
(xii) From Bali Concord I to Bali Concord II
(xiii) ASEAN Charter: GCC and ASEAN Charters compared
(xiv) Conclusion
Notes

Chapter Seven

Practicalities of defence and security and their implications

(i) Introduction
(ii) Defence policy: Military mobilizations and expenditures
(iii) Defence expenditures: conventional, asymmetric threats
(iv) Technology of war: ISR and RMA
(v) Conclusion
Notes

Chapter Eight

Grand strategy, Military doctrine and Military culture. State and regional effects

(i) Introduction
(ii) Grand strategy: traditional state-centric concept
(iii) Military doctrine: self images of armed forces
(iv) Military culture: projecting cross-military relations
(v) Conclusion
Notes
Chapter Nine

Conclusion

Notes

Bibliography

Map 1 The Gulf 15
Map 2 Southeast Asia 19
Map 3 Southeast Asia: maritime chokepoints 341

Table 2.1 GCC states’ populations (millions) 20
Table 2.2 ASEAN states’ populations (millions) 23
Table A Gulf Defence, Security personnel 320
Table B SeA Defence, Security personnel 322
Table C Av. States’ Defence Expenditures 328
Table D Gulf and Southeast Asia GDP: US$bn 330
Table E Gulf military expenditure: US%m 331
Table F SeA miritary expenditure: US$m 332
Table G Iran defence expend: % GCC def. Expend 335

Fig 1 GCC - basic structure 220
Fig 2 GCC - Secretariat – general 221
Fig 3 ASEAN – basic structure 229
Fig 4 GCC military / security organization 256
Fig 5 ASEAN Regional Forum (ARF) 282
Fig 6 ASEAN Political-security community (ASC) 288
Fig 7 ASEAN Charter: security community 293