

The Gulf and Southeast Asia:
Regional Security Complex and Regional Security Community
A comparative study

Submitted by
Talal Mohammed Al-Khalifa

To the University of Exeter as a dissertation for the
Degree of Doctor of Philosophy in the
Institute of Arab and Islamic Studies

March 2012

This thesis is available for Library use on the understanding
that it is copyright material and that no quotation from the thesis
may be published without proper acknowledgement

I certify that all the material in this thesis
which is not my work has been identified
and that no material is included for which
a degree has previously been conferred
upon me.

Signed

Acknowledgments

One sets out on the project of a doctoral thesis with high aspirations and hope. One reaches the end of the project with relief, satisfaction and thankfulness. The total process is long and arduous, and during it many debts of gratitude are incurred, for helps and encouragement. Along the way friends and colleagues have encouraged me in this project; by reading, suggesting and correcting.

Most of all, the final outcome (less any faults that must be mine) is owed for its acceptance to Professor Tim Niblock, my supervisor – always urging accuracy, consistency and agreeable expression. I am grateful to my superiors in the Bahrain Forces for granting me the necessary time for undertaking the doctoral project. My family have looked on with patience and encouragement. I am grateful.

Abstract

The study covers two regions. These are shown to constitute 'Regional security complexes'. The Gulf region and the Gulf Cooperation Council (GCC) and the Association of Southeast Asian Nations (ASEAN) in the Southeast Asian region are the focus of study. The defence and security circumstances of the two regions and the responses of the regions' governments severally and cooperatively are examined. The study has had to take account of the geographic, historical, ethno-cultural differences between the two regions. These are shown to be influential in their respective security responses. Nonetheless, the thesis demonstrates how the regions can be understood in terms of a common theoretical framework.

The study is undertaken primarily within the framework of the theory of 'Regional Security Complex' (RSCT), as developed by Buzan and Waever in *Regions and Power*. Regional security complexes are areas of internal "security interdependence" and securitisation. The theory (RSCT) is discussed critically. 'Security Communities' is a major comparative feature of the study. Amitav Acharya develops this approach in *Constructing a Security Community in Southeast Asia*. Emphasis is on the "creative construction" of a 'security community'. The Gulf Cooperation Council may also be viewed in this way. 'Regional security complex' and 'regional security community' are not alternative theories of regional inter-state relations. The second is superstructural on the prior facts of regional security complexity. The GCC is

a partial response to regional security and is a securitising actor in the region. ASEAN is an attempt at region-wide inclusiveness and conflict avoidance.

Institutional management of security is described. The two regional approaches differ as beliefs that the “enmity/amity balance” is amenable to official regional policy and action: the Gulf and GCC are apparently locked in a dominant ‘enmity’ scenario; ASEAN seeks to establish a regime of ‘amity’. Whether ASEAN is notably less militarily oriented than the Gulf is questioned. States’ insistence on national security ‘resilience’ and ASEAN norms of ‘sovereignty’, ‘non-interference’ and conflict avoidance’ impede regional security development. ASEAN’s progress towards an ‘ASEAN Security Community’ is examined.

The study discusses practicalities of these policies. The application and limitations of ‘Revolution in military affairs’ (RMA) are discussed. The military are viewed as a principal operational actor in any regional security response to conditions of regional security complexity. An examination of state-military relations is based on the concepts of ‘grand strategy’ and ‘military doctrine’.

List of Contents

Acknowledgements	2
Abstract	3
Part 1	
Chapter One	
Introduction to the subject of the thesis	
(i) Introduction	9
(ii) Nature of the Study	9
(iii) Study of two regional security complexes	12
(iv) Geographical, Social, Cultural, Economic settings	13
(v) Conclusion	30
Notes	32
Chapter Two	
Regional Comparisons: the modern histories of the regions	
(i) Introduction	36
(ii) Arabian Gulf States	36
(iii) Iran	38
(iv) Southeast Asia	40
(v) Conclusion	45
Notes	46
Chapter Three	
Critical and analytic Review of the literature	
(i) Introduction	49
(ii) General literature – the Gulf	50
(iii) General literature – Southeast Asia	54
(iv) Regional security complex: core aspect of study	58
(v) Regional security communities	63
(vi) Security and securitization	67
(vii) Conclusion	70
Notes	73

Chapter Four

Regions, Regional Security Complex Theory and Regional Security Communities

(i) Introduction	82
(ii) Significance of Regional Complex Theory	84
(iii) Change in the ‘realist’ international system	86
(iv) Regional security complexes: removal of ‘overlay’	88
(v) Regions: distinct level in the international system	93
(vi) Regional security complex, regime, community	97
(vii) Structural significance of ‘amity and enmity’	100
(viii) Security and securitization in a RS Complex	102
(ix) Global system: autonomous regional dynamics	113
(x) Delineating RSC boundaries: States principal actors	116
(xi) ‘Regional Security Complex’, ‘regional community’	119
(xii) GCC, ASEAN communities structurally different	124
(xiii) Conclusion	126
Notes	129

Chapter Five

The Gulf and Southeast Asia: Regional Security Complexes and Regional Security Communities

(i) Introduction	135
(ii) Gulf regional security complex identified	137
(iii) Cross-currents of Arab secular and religious radicalism	140
(iv) Gulf a regional security complex differentiated	142
(v) Balances and shifts in amity and enmity in the Gulf	144
(vi) Iraq: an ambitious and fallen hegemon	150
(vii) Iran: assertive Gulf regional power	154
(viii) Saudi Arabia: a regional power	164
(ix) Southeast Asia: a regional security complex	174
(x) Vietnam an Indochina power. ASEAN anxieties	179
(xi) Vietnam in Cambodia, ASEAN: protection of Thailand	183
(xii) Ending Vietnam’s militancy. Paris Peace Agreement 1991	185
(xiii) Post-Peace Agreement. ASEAN enlargement	190
(xiv) Conclusion	195
Notes	198

Chapter Six

‘Defence’ and ‘Conflict – Avoidance’ and their institutionalization in the Gulf and Southeast Asia

(i)	Introduction	208
(ii)	The Gulf Cooperation Council: general institutional system	212
(iii)	Association of Southeast Asian Nations (ASEAN): general institutional system	222
(iv)	GCC: development of security and defence in the Gulf	230
(v)	Security challenges and security policy in the GCC	234
(vi)	GCC Peninsula Shield Force (<i>Al-Jazeera</i> Shield Forces)	240
(vii)	Toward a Rapid Deployment Force (RDF)	247
(viii)	ASEAN responds to regional security circumstances	257
(ix)	‘Defence’: ASEAN: principles, norms and declarations	263
(x)	ASEAN: towards a regional security community	270
(xi)	ASEAN Regional Forum (ARF)	274
(xii)	From Bali Concord I to Bali Concord II	284
(xiii)	ASEAN Charter: GCC and ASEAN Charters compared	289
(xiv)	Conclusion	294
	Notes	301

Chapter Seven

Practicalities of defence and security and their implications

(i)	Introduction	316
(ii)	Defence policy: Military mobilizations and expenditures	318
(iii)	Defence expenditures: conventional, asymmetric threats	327
(iv)	Technology of war: ISR and RMA	346
(v)	Conclusion	350
	Notes	355

Chapter Eight

Grand strategy, Military doctrine and Military culture. State and regional effects

(i)	Introduction	362
(ii)	Grand strategy: traditional state-centric concept	362
(iii)	Military doctrine: self images of armed forces	367
(iv)	Military culture: projecting cross-military relations	387
(v)	Conclusion	392
	Notes	396

Chapter Nine

Conclusion		404	
	Notes	417	
Bibliography		420	
Map	1	The Gulf	15
Map	2	Southeast Asia	19
Map	3	Southeast Asia: maritime chokepoints	341
Table	2.1	GCC states' populations (millions)	20
Table	2.2	ASEAN states' populations (millions)	23
Table	A	Gulf Defence, Security personnel	320
Table	B	SeA Defence, Security personnel	322
Table	C	Av. States' Defence Expenditures	328
Table	D	Gulf and Southeast Asia GDP: US\$bn	330
Table	E	Gulf military expenditure: US\$m	331
Table	F	SeA military expenditure: US\$m	332
Table	G	Iran defence expend: % GCC def. Expend	335
Fig	1	GCC - basic structure	220
Fig	2	GCC - Secretariat – general	221
Fig	3	ASEAN – basic structure	229
Fig	4	GCC military / security organization	256
Fig	5	ASEAN Regional Forum (ARF)	282
Fig	6	ASEAN Political-security community (ASC)	288
Fig	7	ASEAN Charter: security community	293