Institutionalising Islamic Political Parties in Indonesia:
A Study of Internal Fragmentation and Cohesion in
the Post-Soeharto Era (1998-2008)

Submitted by Firman Noor to the University of Exeter
as a thesis for the degree of
Doctor Philosophy in Arab and Islamic studies
In March 2012

This thesis is available for Library use on the understanding that is copyright material
and that no quotation taken from the thesis without may be published without proper
acknowledgement.

I certify that all material in this thesis which is not my own work has been identified
and that no material has previously been submitted and approved for the award of a
degree by this or any other University.

Signature:
Abstract

The thesis will address the question of why Islamic political parties, in the first decade of the reform era, suffer internal fragmentation and have failed to develop cohesion, while one Islamic party has been able to develop and consolidate. This thesis will explore and analyze factors and reasons behind the problem of the cohesion of the Islamic political parties by associating it with the existence of party institutionalization. For this purpose, this thesis would be a study of comparative institutionalization of Islamic political parties, particularly between the National Wakening Party (PKB) and the Prosperous Justice Party (PKS). PKB is a good exemplar for an Islamic party that experienced severely fragmented parties. In fact, this party has became the largest among Islamic political parties and including one of the worst fragmentations among all new political parties in Indonesia. Meanwhile, PKS has been able to maintain its internal discipline and unity, although factionalism and fragmentation have become commonplace during the first decade of the Reform Era. This thesis believes that the more a party have been institutionalized, which is indicated by the existence of procedural leadership in decision-making process, the effectiveness of internal conflict resolution mechanism, the continuation of systematic cadrerization and the commitment to the shared values, there is a bigger chance of the party to preserve its cohesion. On the other hand, the less a party have been institutionalized which is indicated by the ineffectiveness of procedural leadership, the failure of internal conflict resolution mechanism, the impediment of systematic cadrerization, and the failure to provide ideology as the guidance of policy and uniting values, there is more possibility for the party to be fragmented.
List of Contents

Title 1
Abstract 2
List of Contents 3
List of Tables and Illustration 7
Abbreviations 8

Chapter I: Introduction 10
   1. Background 10
   2. Research Question 14
   3. Hypothesis 15
   4. Objectives 17
   5. Theoretical Framework 17
      5.1. Islamic Parties 20
      5.2. Fragmentation and Cohesion 25
         5.2.1. Fragmentation 25
         5.2.2. Cohesion 29
      5.3. Party Institutionalisation 35
      5.4. Party Institutionalisation and Fragmentation or Cohesion: Dimension 41
         5.4.1. Procedural Leadership in Decision Making Process 42
         5.4.2. Conflict Resolution Mechanism 43
         5.4.3. Systematic Cadreization 45
         5.4.4. The Commitment to the Shared Values or Ideology 46
   6. Methodology 48
   7. Structure 50

Chapter II: The Development of Islamic Political Parties: The Experience of Fragmentation and Cohesion in the Pre-Reform Era 53
   1. The Pre-Independent Era 53
   2. The Independent Era (1945-1998) 57
   3. Overview 65

Chapter III: Political Biography of the PKB 69
   1. Background to the PKB’s Emergence 69
   2. The NU Tradition and the PKB’s Political Orientation 75
   3. Organisational Structure 82
   4. Political Activities 85
   5. Closing Remarks 92

Chapter IV: Political Biography of the PKS 93
   1. Background 93
   2. The Foundation of Ideology and Political Orientations 98
   3. Organisational Structure 105
   4. Political Activities 109
   5. Closing Remarks 117

Chapter V: Procedural Leadership in Decision Making Process: The Case of PKB 118
   1. Introduction 118
2. Legal-Formal Aspects and Background 119
3. The Rule Implementation Condition and Tendencies 124
   3.1. The Emergence of Unconstitutional Phenomena 124
   3.2. Overshadowing Party’s Constitution: The Role of Wahid 132
4. The Impact: Towards Fragmentation 136
   4.1. The Emergence of Internal Resistance 136
   4.2. Factions Formation and Fragmentation 139
5. Overview 142

Chapter VI: Procedural Leadership in Decision Making Process: The Case of PKS 143
1. Introduction 143
2. Legal-Formal Aspects and Background 143
3. The Implementation Situation and Tendencies 149
   3.1. The Majelis Syura as the Pre Eminent Body 149
   3.2. The Musyawarah as the Main Way 155
4. Impacts to the Party: The Preservation of Cohesion 161
   4.1. The Development of Trust 161
   4.2. Upholding Party Cohesion 164
5. Overview 167

Chapter VII: Conflict Resolution Mechanism: The Case of PKB 168
1. Introduction 168
2. The Absence of Formal Conflict Resolution Mechanism (CRM) 168
3. The Internal Dynamics 174
   3.1. Inappropriate Responses to Conflict Potential 174
   3.2. The difficulty to Localise the Conflict 178
4. The Impact: The Fragmentation Development 181
   4.1. Faction Strengthening: Towards Formal Fragmentation 181
   4.2. The Disappearance of Constructive Dialogue: the Fragmentation Affirmation 184
   4.3. The Third-Party “Resolution”: the Fragmentation Strengthening 188
5. Overview 192

Chapter VIII: Conflict Resolution Mechanism: The Case of PKS 193
1. Introduction 193
2. The Elements of CRM 193
   2.1. Dewan Syariah (The DS) as the Main Institution 193
   2.2. Other Supporting Institutions 195
3. The Implementation of CRM 199
   3.1. The First Stage of Conflict Prevention 200
   3.2. Advanced Mechanism of Conflict Prevention 201
   3.3. A Special Case of National Policy Making Process 206
4. The Internal Situation 210
   4.1. The Capability to Detect Conflict Potential 210
   4.2. The Capability to Localise the Conflict 212
5. The Impact: Party Cohesion Maintenance 214
6. Overview 219

Chapter IX: Systematic Cadrerization: The Case of PKB 221
1. Introduction 221
2. Cadrerization in Its Legal-Formal Aspect 222
3. Implementation 225
   3.1. Inconsistency in Conducting Cadrerization 225
   3.2. Party Recruitment and Subjectivism 228
4. The Emergence of Supporting Tendencies for Fragmentation
   4.1. The Failure to Preserve Common Understanding on the Rules of the Game
   4.2. The Weakening of Esprit de Corps
   4.3. The Loose Attitude towards Party’s Rules of the Game
5. The Impact of the Above Tendencies towards Party
   5.1. The First Fragmentation
   5.2. The Second Fragmentation
   5.3. The Third Fragmentation
6. Overview

Chapter X: Systematic Cadrerization: The Case of PKS
1. Introduction
2. Legal-Formal Situation
3. Implementation
   3.1. Cadrerization: Halaqah and Cadres Maintenance
   3.2. Recruitment: Finding the Proper Cadres
4. Internal Supporting Tendencies for the Party Cohesion
   4.1. Preserving a Common Approach and Understanding
   4.2. Preserving Loyalty
   4.3. The Development of Trust
5. The Impact of the Above Tendencies on the Party Cohesion
6. Overview

Chapter XI: The Commitment to Shared Values: The Case of PKB
1. Introduction
2. Shared Values and their 'infusion' in the PKB
   2.1. Nationalism, Aswaja and their limitations as factors of cohesion
   2.2. The Limited Efforts towards Shared Values’ Development
3. The Failure of “Value Infusion” and the Absence of Commitment
   3.1. Prominent Figures as a Driving Force
   3.2. Value Free and Expendable Tools Phenomenon
4. The Impact: From Defending Leader’s Interests towards Fragmentation
   4.1. Leaders’ Interests as “Legitimate Sources” to Act
   4.2. Instrumentalist Group Formation in the Absence of Shared Values
   4.3. The Conflict Continuation and the Trial of Commitment
5. Overview

Chapter XII: The Commitment to Shared Values: The Case of PKS
1. Introduction
2. The Existence of Shared Values
   2.1. The Dakwah Struggle as a Central Value
   2.2. Shared Values Maintenance
3. Internal Situation: The Existence of Collective Commitment
   3.1. Party as ’receptacle’ of group idealism
   3.2. The Emergence of the Spirit of Collectivism
4. Preserving Internal Cohesion
5. Overview

Chapter XIII: Comparison and Conclusion
1. Comparison
   1.1. Procedural Leadership
   1.2. Conflict Resolution Mechanism
   1.3. Systematic Cadrerization
1.4. Shared Values Infusion 340
2. Conclusion 342
  2.1. The Relation between Variables 342
  2.2. Suggestion for Further Research 350

Appendices 352
1. The Political Principles of PKB 352
2. The Declaration Script of PKB 354
3. The Declaration Charter of Justice Party 355
4. The Declaration of Prosperous Justice Party 358
5. The Central Managing Board of PKB 1999-2000 360
6. The Central Managing Board of PKB 2000-2005 362
7. The Central Managing Board of PKB-Matori 2002-2005 364
8. The Central Managing Board of PKB-Gus Dur/Alwi 200-2005 366
9. The Central Managing Board of PKB-Semarang 2005-2010 369
10. The Central Managing Board of PKB-Ulama 2005-2010 372
11. The Central Managing Board of PKB-Parung 2008-2010 376
12. The Central Managing Board of PKB-Ancol 2008-2014 378
13. The Central Managing Board of PK 381
14. The Central Managing Board of PKS 2003-2005 384
15. The Central Managing Board of PKS 2005-2010 386
16. Table of Score 389

Glossary 390
Bibliography 395
List of Tables and Illustrations

Tables
Table 1: Comparison of Party Institutionalisation between PKB and PKS 16
Table 2: Dimension of Party Institutionalisation 37
Table 3: The 1971 Election Result 70
Table 4: The DPR Seats Proportion of Each Element in PPP 72
Table 5: The Top Three Provinces that Provides DPR Seats for PKB 86
Table 6: The 1999 Election Result 88
Table 7: Comparison of Results the 2004 Election and the 2009 Election 114
Table 8: The Result of the Election for the Chairperson of the MS in 2005 MMS 161
Table 9: PKS’ Membership Grades 254
Table 10: Membership Grades for Holding a Party Position at National, Provincial and District Level 256
Table 11: Comparison of the of the Procedural Leadership Conditions to the Decision Making Process Applied by PKB and PKS 332
Table 12: Comparison of the CRM Conditions Applied by PKB and PKS 336
Table 13: Comparison of the Conditions of Systematic Cadrerization Applied by PKB and PKS 339
Table 14: Comparison of the Shared Values Infusion Conditions Applied by PKB and PKS 342

Illustrations
Picture 1: The Orbit of *Dakwah* 96
Chart 1: Conflict Resolution Management in PKS 208