Farm Animal Welfare and Sustainability

Alison Hodge

Submitted by Alison Hodge to the University of Exeter as a thesis for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy in Geography in December 2010

This thesis is available for Library use on the understanding that it is copyright material and that no quotation from the thesis may be published without proper acknowledgement.

I certify that all material in this thesis which is not my own work has been identified and that no material has previously been submitted and approved for the award of a degree by this or any other University.

…………………………………………………………………….
Abstract

This thesis is concerned with acknowledging farm animals and their co-presence in the more-than-human space of the livestock farm, and with accounting for them responsibly in sustainability debates. The enrolment of farm animals as actors in political agendas for environmental sustainability, and farm animal welfare suggests that there are new ways of seeing and being with farm animals that permit their relational presence and recognise their subjectivity. Indeed geographers have in recent years acknowledged animals and their relations with humans, and they have begun to recognise the nature of animal subjectivities. However, within the fundamental rethinking of animals that has been provoked by these discussions, I suggest that farm animals have remained relatively invisible. Occupying ethically confusing terrain, farm animals have nonetheless been visible in a set of philosophical positions regarding their moral status, yet these debates present a rather confusing picture in which the farm animal as an individual is conspicuous by its absence.

In seeking to redress the invisibility of farm animals within these debates, and recast them in relation to humans and the broader farm ecology, this thesis attempts to set out an epistemological and methodological framework through which farm animals might become visible as individual fleshy beings. Drawing on the concept of agricultural stewardship and new agendas in farm animal welfare science, it makes use of new methodological tools that have emerged in the social sciences to conduct a relational study of the livestock farm; a study in which farm animals themselves participate. It also considers how the divisions that have been constructed between humans, farm animals and the environment can be re-configured as a more unified political science of the livestock farm.
Acknowledgements

I gratefully acknowledge the support of all the individuals and organisations who have contributed information and assistance during the preparation of this research. I am particularly indebted to the farmers, veterinary’s and all of the interviewees that have given up their time to participate, and to the farm animals that I have had the privilege to meet and observe as I have sought to gain insight into their animalian lives. Without their involvement this research would not have been possible.

Special thanks must go to my supervisor Professor Henry Buller for his patience and encouragement throughout the research project. I am also very grateful to both the Economic and Social Research Council and the Rural Economy and Land Use Programme for making this research possible by providing me with a studentship (award number PTA-224-2005-00004) which is linked to research award number RES-224-25-0041 2005-2007 ‘Eating Biodiversity: An Investigation of the Links Between Quality Food Production and Biodiversity Protection’.

Finally, I would like to say a very special thank you to my partner Steve Whiteley, and our children Adele and Corinne for their encouragement, patience and understanding throughout the inevitable peaks and troughs of this research.
# Table of Contents

i. PREFACE

“There is so much life here”

i.i. Key Research Themes 18
i.ii. Research Questions 21
i.iii. Towards the making of the thesis 21

## CHAPTER 1

Placing Farm Animals 27

1.1. Introduction 27
1.2. Farm Animals in Animal Geography 31
   The emergence of a new Animal Geographies 31
   Accounting for Non-Human Agency: networks, actants and hybrids 34
   Acknowledging (Farm) Animal Subjectivities 39
   Thinking Relationally: Intersubjectivity and Relationality 45
1.3. The Ethical Status of (Farm) Animals 53
   The Question of Equality 54
   Animal Rights 56
   In Defence of Speciesism 59
   Ecological Holism 62
1.4. End points 66

## CHAPTER 2

Care, Welfare and Response-able Husbandry 69

2.1. Introduction 69
2.2. Sustainability and Stewardship 70
   Care 73
   Understanding 78
2.3. Livestock Farming and Animal Welfare 79
   The Science of Animal Welfare 81
   Biological Functioning: An Outcome-Based Approach to the Welfare of Farm Animals 82
   Enter the Psychologists: Animal Feelings and Emotions 85
   ‘Natural’ Environments and Welfare 89
   A Holistic Approach to Farm Animal Welfare 91
   Towards a Quality of Life (QoL) 93
2.4. Farm Animal Welfare Policy in Britain 95
2.5. End Points 100
CHAPTER 3

Messy Methodologies

3.1. Introduction
3.2. Towards an Ethnographic study of the Livestock Farm
   The language of livestock farming
3.3. Learning about animal bodies
3.4. Generating research materials and reliable witnesses
3.5. Farm Survey
3.6. Interviewing
3.7. The emergence of scale in livestock farming practice

CHAPTER 4

The Ecology of the Livestock Farm

4.1. Introduction
4.2. The ‘Nature’ of Livestock Farming
   Spaces of ‘First’ and ‘Second Nature’
   Subversion
   Fixing
   Negotiation
   Summary
4.3. Feeding the System
   The Farm Rotation
   Recycling Animal Wastes
   Summary
4.4. Aesthetic Representations of the Livestock Farm
   Farm Animals and the Aesthetic of Agricultural Ecologies
   Access and Sustainability
   Summary
4.5. End Points

CHAPTER 5

Modes of Ordering: Herd, Flock and Field

5.1. Introduction
5.2. Productive Modes of Ordering
   Summary
5.3. Biological Modes of Ordering
   Practices of Intervention
   Summary
5.4. Animal Orders
   Summary
5.5. End Points
### CHAPTER 6

The Co-ordination of Care and the Welfare Experience of Individual Farm Animals

6.1. Introduction 229
6.2. Care and the Individual
   - Visibility and Behaviour: Non-Conformity 232
   - Visibility and Technology: Mediated Relations 237
   - Visibility and Empathy: Knowing the Individual 239
   - Visibility and Selection: Inequalities in Care 243
6.3. Routine Care and Welfare 251
6.4. Care and Individual Performance 258
6.5. Care and Observing the Individual 267
6.6. Culling as Care 269
6.7. Summary 274
6.8. End Points 275

### CHAPTER 7

Bringing it all Together: Towards a Cosmopolitics of the Livestock Farm

7.1. Introduction 277
7.2. Key Findings 277
7.3. Weaving a Cosmopolitics of the Livestock Farm
   - Cosmopolitics 283
   - Livestock Farming: A complex site of associations 285
   - Hitherto Cosmopolitics 286
   - Complexity in Practice 288
   - Cosmopolitical Representation 290
   - Farming Practice: selective representation and competing interests 292
   - Cosmopolitics: representing the non-human 294
   - Farming in Practice – representing the non-human 296

### APPENDICES

A. Farmers Interview Guide (Beef) 301
B. Farmers Interview Guide (Sheep) 309
C. Farmers Interview Guide (Pigs) 317
D. Interview Guide for Veterinary’s 325
E. Interview Guide for Natural England 331
F. Interview Guide for RSPB 335
G. Interview Guide for EBLEX 341
H. Interview Guide for Farm Assurance Officers (Freedom Food) 345

### BIBLIOGRAPHY

351
List of Figures and Illustrations

Figure i.1  Touching moments  13
Figure 2.1  The Practice of Caring  74
Figure 2.2  The Mediation of Care  76
Figure 3.1  Pen 1 at Dingwell Cattle Mart  110
Figure 3.2: Pen 2 at Dingwell Cattle Mart  111
Figure 3.3: Image taken from authors garden, to give some indication of the proximity within which animals were observed  115
Figure 3.4: The bull seperates a cow from her calf in rediness for mating  116
Figure 3.5: Image of Cattle Spider Chart  124
Figure 3.6: Image of Pig Spider Chart  125
Figure 3.7: Image of Sheep spider Chart  126
Figure 4.1: Managed and unmanged spaces on the farm  135
Figure 4.2: Sheep grazing a moorland feild  137
Figure 4.3: Sheep Carcass on Bodmin Moor  141
Figure 4.4: The Nature of Bodmin Moor: It’s so full of life here!  142
Figure 4.5: A flock of Redwings working over field outside the house  161
Figure 4.6: Remnants of a stone circle, stone hut and standing stone on a Cornish moorland farm.  170
Figure 5.1: Chewing bootlaces  216
Figure 5.2: Playful pigs  216
Figure 5.3: Pigs of all sizes, age and gender for fattening  217
Figure 5.4: Caring in the cow community  218
Figure 5.5: Group work  219
Figure 5.6: The pampered bull and his faithful followers  219
Figure 5.7: The bull has separated the calf from its mother prior to mating 220
Figure 5.8: Father and son interactions 220
Figure 5.9: Calf-minding 221
Figure 6.1: Maintaining contact with livestock through everyday practices 236
Figure 6.2: Human-pig interactions 247
Figure 6.3: Lost amongst the flock, a lame sheep grazing 256
Figure 6.4: Handheld EID Scanner being used to read the tags of individual sheep. 259
Figure 6.5: Software applications allow data transfer from EID Scanner to computer 259
Figure 6.6: Computerised Cattle Record Card 260
Figure 6.7: On-Farm Recording with AGROSOFT WINPIG 261
Figure 6.8: Example of Breeding Herd Calculator 263
Figure 6.9: Sow feed costing calculator. 264

List of Tables

Table 3.1: Participating farming systems and the type of environment on which they operate 118