RENAISSANCE IDEAS OF PEACE AND WAR, 
AND THE HUMANIST CHALLENGE TO THE 
SCHOLASTIC JUST WAR: THE DISPUTATIO DE PACE 
ET BELLO OF 1468; ERASMUS AND MACHIAVELLI

Thesis for a Doctor of Philosophy in Politics

Michael John Cailes

April 2012
RENAISSANCE IDEAS OF PEACE AND WAR,

AND THE HUMANIST CHALLENGE TO THE SCHOLASTIC JUST WAR: THE

DISPUTATIO DE PACE ET BELLO OF 1468; ERASMUS AND MACHIAVELLI

Submitted by Michael John Cailes to the University of Exeter

as a thesis for the degree of

Doctor of Philosophy in Politics

In April 2012

This thesis is available for Library use on the understanding that it is copyright
material and that no quotation from the thesis may be published without proper
acknowledgement.

I certify that all material in this thesis which is not my own work has been identified
and that no material has been previously submitted and approved for the award of a
degree by this or any other University.

Signature .................................................................
ABSTRACT

This thesis compares and contrasts Renaissance ideas of peace and war, focussing on the humanist challenge to the scholastic just war tradition. I argue that rather than representing a strong continuity of the latter, the period is more accurately seen as being without adequate ideas on the justification for, and moral restraint in, war. I consider two paradigmatic writers, Erasmus and Machiavelli, and argue that despite evident differences in the underlying religious and social ontology, there is also an instructive commonality in their challenge to the weak representation of the just war tradition.

I first set the ideas in their historical and intellectual context: aspects of contemporary warfare, the church and the papacy; medieval traditions and ideas; and the scholastic tradition and Renaissance humanism. I then examine a mid-fifteenth century disputation, *Disputatio de pace et bello*, which differentiates sharply between the humanist challenge and contemporary church orthodoxy. This is evident from very different understandings of the concepts of peace and war, and is further reflected in their approaches to the justification of war, and to its conduct. I apply this template of ‘concept’, ‘justification’ and the ‘conduct’ of war, throughout the thesis. I consider a range of interpretations of Erasmus, and argue that he is a pacifist by conviction, but is forced to prevaricate. This is especially clear when he accepts a necessary war of last resort, but does not allow for adequate and acceptable means with which to conduct it. In Machiavelli’s thought, I emphasise the key relationship between politics and war, and argue that far from advocating unrestrained violence, he insists on applying a firm ‘bridle’ on the use of force. There is, however, little aspiration for peace. Finally, I briefly follow these ideas through into the Early Modern period, concluding that Lipsius exemplifies a necessary re-balancing of ideas on peace, war, and the just war tradition.
De laudibus pacis.................................................................101
Rodrigo Sánchez.................................................................112

Commendatio belli.................................................................112

De difficultate verae pacis.......................................................130

Discussion and Summary.....................................................143

CHAPTER 4 – ERASMUS....................................................151

Introduction..............................................................................151

Primary Literature.................................................................152

Style.......................................................................................155

Context...................................................................................158

Concepts of Peace and War..................................................165

The Justification for War in Erasmus....................................172

Interpretation and Ambiguity................................................172

Case Against War.................................................................177

Just War.................................................................................185

Summary...............................................................................190

The Conduct of War in Erasmus...........................................191

The Evil of Soldiering..........................................................193

A Paucity of Ideas for Improvement.....................................198

Summary and Conclusions....................................................202

CHAPTER 5 – MACHIAVELLI...............................................207

Introduction..............................................................................207

Concepts of Peace and War..................................................211

Peace and War.....................................................................211

War and Politics...................................................................218

Finance...................................................................................224

Types of War.........................................................................226

The Humanitarian Dimension..............................................232