Henry Jenner and the Celtic Revival in Cornwall.

Submitted by Samantha Rayne to the University of Exeter
as a thesis for the degree of
Doctor of Philosophy in English
in March 2012.

This thesis is available for Library use on the understanding that it is copyright material and that no quotation from the thesis may be published without proper acknowledgement.

I certify that all material in this thesis which is not my own work has been identified and that no material has previously been submitted and approved for the award of a degree by this or any other University.

Signature: …………………………………………………………………….
Abstract

This thesis seeks to explore the influence of Henry Jenner as one of the most prominent figures of the Celtic Revival in Cornwall and in the wider Celtic community. To contextualise this, it will examine the image of the Celts as a people in the first half of the twentieth century and the assertion of Celtic identity in that period through the Celtic Revival. The opening chapter examines the concepts of nations and nationalism, particularly Celtic nationalism. The second chapter focuses on the Victorian era as a motivating force for Henry Jenner and others to ‘write back’ against a long and insidious discourse of discrimination. Chapter Three goes on to look at how the political situation in both Britain and Ireland came to influence the nature of Celtic identity assertion and also the extent to which Jenner’s own political views impacted on the nature of Cornwall’s Celtic Revival. In Chapter Four the impact of tourism on Cornwall, and on Cornish identity, is examined, particularly how the image of Cornwall as a Celtic nation created by Jenner and others was embraced and manipulated by that industry. Chapter Five looks at the consequences of image manipulation on tourist-dependent regions. The final chapter concentrates more specifically on the work of Jenner and the Old Cornwall Societies, and the thesis concludes by appraising the influence of the ideas and beliefs of Henry Jenner on our contemporary vision of Cornwall. It focuses particularly on how the predominance of memory created a haunted identity which was embraced by the burgeoning tourist industry and examines how this identity has subsequently impacted on the economic well-being of the region. But it also concludes that Jenner’s legacy endures in so many of the positive images of, and statements about, Cornwall today.
Henry Jenner M.A., F.S.A. 1848-1934

1 Image of Henry Jenner. Personal photograph taken from The Jenner Papers, the Courtney Library, Truro.
Acknowledgements

I would like to thank Professor Marion Gibson for all her time, help and support with this thesis and for being so much more than a supervisor. I would also like to thank Doctor Garry Tregidga for his invaluable knowledge and advice throughout, and the Arts and Humanities Research Council, who provided the funding for our project. Thanks also go to Doctor Shelley Trower who conducted the interviews with me and has been supportive throughout too.

This project could not have been possible without the help of the staff at the Courtney Library in Truro, particularly Angela Broom, the staff at the Morrab Library in Penzance, and those at the Plymouth Proprietary Library. I also need to thank those at the University of Plymouth Library for allowing an Exeter student such ready access to their materials, and those in the Plymouth Central Library’s reference section for all their help.

On a personal level, fellow student Jo Esra has been a great support, as have my other employers and my family.
Contents

Abstract 2

Acknowledgements 4

Table of Contents 5

Introduction 6

Chapter One
Nations, Nationalism and Celtic Nationalism: The Theoretical Context 58

Chapter Two
Race, the Celts and Cornwall: Why Did Henry Jenner ‘Write Back’? 95

Chapter Three
The Cultural Politics of the Celtic Cornish Revival: Jenner, Catholicism, Cornish Liberalism and Legitimism 136

Chapter Four
The Growth of Tourism in Cornwall and the Role of the Revivalists 182

Chapter Five
Haunting and Identity: The Politics of Mystical Cornwall 218

Chapter Six
Language, Dialect and the Assertion of Celtic Identity in Cornwall 247

Conclusion 267

Archive Sources 285

Interviews 287

Bibliography 293
Introduction

This Thesis

By detailed examination of Jenner’s collection of papers at the Royal Cornwall Museum in Truro, and of the Jenner papers at the British Library in London and the County Record Office in Truro, this thesis will offer a new perspective on Henry Jenner himself. Held at the Royal Institution of Cornwall in The Courtney Library, Truro, the Jenner collection, the largest of the archives, consists of 20 boxes containing many of Jenner's personal documents, a majority of which are letters. The collection also contains drafts of Jenner's speeches, a selection of Legitimist magazines, newspaper articles, cards and photographs. The subject areas are varied but many of the documents relate to Cornish institutions including the Royal Cornwall Polytechnic Society, the Royal Institution of Cornwall, the Archaeological Society and various school education committees. Using this and other resources, it is hoped that Jenner’s and other Revivalists’ attempts at instilling pride in the concept of a Celtic Cornish identity can be placed within the context of the discourse of prejudice experienced by the Celtic peoples as a whole in nineteenth century England. Through the examination of the Celtic Revivalists’ work in Cornwall it is possible to attain an understanding of how the Celts went from being a maligned people to an ethnic group with recognisable and sought-after cultural traits, of which it was, and is, desirable to be a member. In particular it focuses on Jenner’s legacy and how the image of Cornwall he was so influential in creating endures in modern times in the symbols and ideas he revived and invented.
This thesis will also examine how Henry Jenner’s own political views informed his Revivalist agenda, with particular reference to his concept of ‘Merry England’ and his support for (and subsequent loss of interest in) the Legitimist cause. It will also demonstrate how the notion of the Celtic Cornwall created by Jenner and other Revivalists was manipulated by the tourist industry, and the consequences such identity manipulations had, and continue to have, on the county. Following on from this, the idea of Cornwall as a place associated with hauntings, and how this image affects it within the wider context, will be explored through comparison with other similar areas. The thesis concludes that Jenner’s legacy endures today both in Cornwall and in our understanding of the cultural politics of memory, haunting, the economics of tourism and nationalism itself.

The opening chapter provides a theoretical context for this work by examining the concept of nations and the nature of nationalism, particularly Celtic nationalism. Academics have debated the issue of what defines a ‘nation’ for years and there are several factors that have been identified as contributing to a people being recognised by themselves and others as a nation, including social factors such as a common history, a shared language, and a sense of common identity. A people may also feel they share ethnic or ‘racial’ origins, or have a common dominant religion. They may be linked by their geographical location, by a common political outlook, and by their economic lives. However, not all these characteristics have to be present in order for a people to be defined as a nation; some may be completely absent or present in varying degrees. In the case of Cornwall, some of the characteristics defined by scholars as important to
nation-formation can be useful in discussing Jenner’s work.²

As Liah Greenfeld stated, one of the functions of a ‘nation’ is that the population, however stratified in class or divided by other beliefs in reality ‘is perceived as essentially homogeneous and the lines of status and class as superficial’.³ Similarly, Benedict Anderson described nations as ‘imagined communities’ partly because he believed the affiliations between the nation’s members’ (most of whom will never meet) were perceived to be a ‘deep, horizontal comradeship’ however hierarchical that community may be in reality.⁴ Henry Jenner’s vision of ‘Merry England’, as discussed in this thesis, reflects this idea of a unified yet stratified society. Jenner was strongly opposed to socialism but was committed to the concept of a united Celtic Cornish people. In the case of the Celtic nations this sense of community was fostered not just within individual nations, but also between nations, too, so that, to some extent, they came to be seen as a cohesive whole. This can be envisaged partly as an ‘imagined’ identity, but historians have also identified tenable common historical experiences between the British Celtic nations, particularly in their relationship to the British state and to England. Again, Jenner was committed to these ideas of the unity of the Celtic nations and the idea that Cornwall was part of that family of nations.

The context of Jenner’s activities in a period of Irish nationalism was also important.


³ Liah Greenfeld, “Types of European Nationalism.” In Hutchinson and Smith, Nationalism 165.

Whereas within the Celtic nations themselves there was a fostering of a positive sense of Celtic identity, Powell noted that, as a result of the debates on Home Rule, there was what he described as ‘an English backlash against Celtic nationalism’ as the assertion of a strong Celtic identity threatened the unity of the British state. 5 During the same period there were those who viewed the Celtic parts of Britain in colonialis terms, including respected historian J. R. Seeley, who described them as ‘England’s inner empire’. 6 Norman Davis has also recently referred to the Celtic regions as constituting Britain’s ‘inner empire’, noting that part of it, Ireland, was breaking away at the same time that other areas were being added to the ‘outer empire’. 7 Jenner was working within this nationalist context; he was a supporter of both the Empire and of Cornwall, whilst remaining loyal to England. As such he was, publicly at least, opposed to anything that would threaten this unity, including Irish Home Rule. However, he saw Celtic unity as a separate issue and such political issues did not stop him from arguing the case for Cornwall joining with Ireland and other nations in the Celtic Congress in 1904.

Michael Hechter’s theory of Internal Colonialism, which posits that the Celtic nations of Britain and Ireland can be examined as ‘colonies’ of the British nation, was specifically structured to examine the relationship between what he termed the ‘Celtic fringe’ and England. Despite its critics, 8 the theory of internal colonialism has continued to be sited

---


6 J. R. Seeley. Quoted in Powell 93.


by other writers, including Janet Sorensen\textsuperscript{9} and Hugh Kearney.\textsuperscript{10} Using the internal colonial model, Sorensen identified how both the myth of the other and the suppression of the other are perpetuated:

The fault lines of modern bourgeois national culture are most apparent in the internal colonial relationship because, considered “other” in the interest of legitimating their political and economic domination, the internally colonized must, perversely, be seen as leaving the continuity of the national culture in-tact’.\textsuperscript{11}

Sorensen noted that the Celtic regions of Britain were often referred to as ‘the “training ground” for the repressive practices of [Britain’s] overseas Empire’, and concurred with Hechter that they too were subjected to political and cultural oppression.\textsuperscript{12} The situation with Home Rule in Ireland demonstrates how this relationship of oppression can be broken by a cultural nationalist assertion of a different kind. Discontented with the role assigned them by those of the dominant nation state, which, in the case of Ireland, was informed by racial prejudice, the people rebelled. Yet Henry Jenner was determined that Cornwall should remain part of the Empire, and was unswerving in his loyalty to England (if not always the sovereign) whilst at the same time asserting Cornwall’s claims to nationhood and to its separate Celtic identity. In fact, the Cornish had played a


\textsuperscript{11} Sorensen 2.

\textsuperscript{12} Sorensen 1.
significant role in the success of the British Empire. Due to the diaspora, Cornish people had colonised many overseas territories, exporting their skills and their culture and, at the same time with the myth of ‘Cousin Jacks’ and ‘Jennies’, bolstering Cornish identity back home.  

As well as examining the experiences of the Celtic nations who have a direct relationship with the British State, it is also useful to compare Cornwall’s relationship with Britishness with the relationship of that other Celtic nation, Brittany, with its dominant state of France. The same process of vilification of a Celtic ethnic group that had been observed in nineteenth century Britain was also apparent in Brittany, where similar forms of prejudice were aired. Works like Weber’s *Peasants into Frenchmen* not only highlighted the diverse nature of localised identities in France amongst the majority of the population, it also identified those prejudices towards the peripheral peoples of the nation, including those in Brittany who continued to use their Celtic Breton language.

In analysing Breton national identity, Reece pointed out that the correlation between modernisation and national political integration has been an established assumption among historians. It was presumed that as majority nationalist sentiments became more firmly established, so localised ethnic feelings would retreat. The case of the Celtic nations would, to varying degrees, seem to contradict this. In the case of Brittany this would have led to the eventual sublimation of its Celtic culture by the political, social and cultural imperatives of the larger French nation as the individual ethnic

---


identities of smaller localities would inevitably be overwhelmed by the cultural imperatives of nation states. Only by achieving this, it was thought, could the state remain unified to the extent that was needed in order to continue the process of modernisation. Yet due to the strength of Celtic nationalism, this process remains incomplete and the various Celtic nations continue to assert their individual ethnic identities, whilst acknowledging their place in the larger family of Celtic nations.

As with the definition of a ‘nation’, there is no broad consensus over what defines ‘nationalism’, although there is agreement over its significance, both as an ideology or movement by which a people are driven to act on behalf of their nation (be it culturally or politically motivated) and as an expression of allegiance by a people to their nation. In fact, the Dictionary of International Relations refers to nationalism as ‘the single most important factor shaping the structure and the process of the modern world’. 15

General agreement also occurs on the relative modernity of the concept of nationalism, with most writers on the subject placing its origins in both the French Revolution and the Industrial Revolution. 16

Hutchinson posits that there are in fact two different types of nationalism – the cultural, and the political. The nationalists of both groups may adopt some similar indicators of ethnic identity, but they have differing objectives. The political nationalist’s ultimate goal is that their nation gains representation as a national state, whereas for the cultural nationalists, like Jenner, what makes the nation important is its distinctive culture and


16 See Hutchinson and Smith, Nationalism 47.
history. For these cultural nationalists, then, ‘The glory of a country comes not from its political power but from the culture of its people and the contribution of its thinkers and educators to humanity’. These form a uniting force which brings the disparate threads of a nation together and for this reason Hutchinson argues that Revivalism ‘is often of considerable political import’ and should be regarded as a more progressive force.

Certainly, the Celtic Revivalists in Cornwall managed to maintain, expand and establish many important Cornish institutions that survive to this day. And the continued reaffirmation of Celtic nationalism serves to give prominence to the problems the region faces, some of which are unique to that area specifically because of its Celtic heritage. What is more, the status of ‘nation’ to Cornwall was, and remains, important to those within the county who would wish to see it gain greater recognition on a national British level, as a nation within a nation, be their motivations overtly political, or more cultural. Investigation shows that pride in their Celtic nationalism allows nations to assert themselves in the political arena and an examination of the roots of this nationalism helps to reveal their unique problems: how, in the terms defined by this thesis, the ghosts of the past continue to haunt the present.

The Celts and Celtic Nationalism

In 1986, whilst commentating on the plight of the Celtic people, Frank Delaney observed:

---


18 Hutchinson, “Cultural Nationalism and Moral Regeneration.” In Hutchinson and Smith, Nationalism 125.
Every Celtic culture ... seems doomed to eventual extinction. It may take several centuries, but the huge territorial imperative of the neighbouring dominant states, and the overwhelming force of other cultures cannot be resisted: newspapers, television, are no less imperial than actual military invasion. The recovery or attempted revival of Celtic cultures will dwindle inevitably.\(^\text{19}\)

As for the political potential of the Celtic fringe nations, he wrote that the failure of Welsh and Scottish nationalists at recent elections had demonstrated that ‘apathy, not antipathy, carried the day’.\(^\text{20}\) By contrast, Michael Hechter was, perhaps rightfully, more optimistic in the cases of Wales and Scotland in relation to their political status within the United Kingdom:

The prospects for achieving such equality for individuals of Celtic social origins in the United Kingdom seem relatively good in the long run. The continuation of Celtic nationalist ferment can only serve to increase the awareness of the plight of these regions, and their citizens, to England’s government and status-conferring institutions, most importantly, perhaps, the universities.\(^\text{21}\)

Until relatively recently, such issues of Celtic cultural identity had received little


\(^{20}\) Delaney 216.

academic attention. Writing in the 1970s, Reece opined the ‘nearly universal neglect’ of what he termed ‘ethnic minority nationalism’, whilst emphasising the importance of study in this area in the contemporary climate. The middle of the twentieth century witnessed the more radical members of several ethnic minorities, who felt that they had suffered subordination to the dominant state, fighting back against what they felt was the unfair oppression of their people. As Reece noted: ‘When such demands combine with widespread feeling within a minority that its members possess a distinct ethnic identity, then ethnic minority nationalism becomes a force with which the dominant majority must ultimately reckon’. The 1960s and 1970s had witnessed a string of nationalist atrocities, including assassinations by Basque nationalists, Irish terrorism (both in Ireland and in the United Kingdom) and Breton autonomists blowing up French communications installations. For Reece these events represented clear evidence that the assumption that modernisation meant the end of ethnic minority nationalist movements had ‘come a cropper’. However, he also believed that due to the lack of inquiry by historians into ethnic minority nationalism, ‘almost nothing’ was known about the origins of these peoples’ grievances. An investigation into the discourses of discrimination experienced by minority peoples with specific reference to their indigenous identities would help to reveal these origins.

Today, the cultural and political situation is very different. Huge dominant states in

22 Reece xiii.
23 Reece 225.
24 Reece xii.
25 Reece xv.
26 Reece xiii.
Europe have collapsed and splintered into ethnic factions with the decline of the Soviet Union. The contemporary media is unrecognisable due to the proliferation of satellite television channels and the internet, making the media impossible to control to the extent that it was in previous decades, and, at the same time, making it accessible to a majority of the people. Furthermore, those ‘apathetic’ peoples in Wales and Scotland have successfully gained a degree of political autonomy that was unforeseen.

Yet it could be argued that this recent upsurge of nationalism has traceable roots in the ‘Celtic Revival’ movement of the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries, which asserted both individual and collective identities for the six ‘Celtic’ regions: Ireland, Scotland, Wales, Cornwall, the Isle of Man, and Brittany. The nature of just what it was to be a ‘Celtic nation’ varied considerably but the regions were still able to form a cohesive whole through organisations such as the Celtic Congress and, later, the Celtic League. This thesis will argue that Henry Jenner’s legacy is still identifiable in recent nationalist culture and discourse, specifically in the way the Cornish people choose to express their identity both through the symbols they use (such as the flag of St. Piran and the anthem ‘Trelawny’) and in the adoption of a positive Celtic identity.

One thing these differing regions had in common was their mythologised, mystic past, which, to varying extents, haunts their present by impacting on perceptions of identity. By examining Cornwall as a case study of a Celtic nation, it is hoped that it will be possible to recognise how ideas of the past influence current debates about nationhood, locality and ethnicity in modern Britain and how they influence people’s conceptions of their own identity and locality. The notion of Cornwall as a ‘haunted’ location whose mythologised past is bound up with cultural, economic and political factors will also be
examined, particularly in relation to how this hauntedness is sold to tourists. And the tourist industry’s acceptance and exploitation of a distinctly ‘Celtic’ Cornwall will be traced through the changing nature of guidebooks in the twentieth century. It will be argued that it was Cornwall’s dependence on tourism, combined with the emergence of an essentially antiquarian ‘Celtic Revivalist’ movement, which resulted in the predominance of memory and remembrance in cultural constructions of this place.

The sort of nationalism generated by this Revival can be investigated through several media, including literature, through events like protests and also rallying points like flags or songs, all of which were used by Revivalists to substantiate Cornwall’s claim to Celtic nationhood. But it can also be investigated, as Ronald Hutton argues, through the special sorts of people who act as the dynamic agents in bringing that creation into being. In the case of the Celtic Cornish Revival, these people included, amongst others, Henry Jenner. Although there was earlier interest in Cornwall’s Celtic heritage, even in the mid-nineteenth century, the role of such figures can be seen as crucial in the formation and direction of historical change, and that will be the focus of this thesis, especially the work of Henry Jenner. Jenner was a major figure of his age, not just within Cornwall, but also on the larger stage, being acquainted with such figures as Dickens, Ruskin and Gladstone: even Queen Victoria knew of him.

Jenner came to be regarded as the principal authority on Cornwall and its history, becoming an iconic figure in the Cornish movement. Significantly, he compiled and


published the *Handbook of the Cornish Language* as well as presiding over the first Celtic Congress to be held in Cornwall. He was also appointed chairman of Cornwall County Council’s Committee for the Preservation of Ancient Monuments in 1913 and in 1917 he was made vice president of the Celtic Congress.  

He also became president of numerous societies including the Royal Cornwall Polytechnic Society in 1916 and the Royal Institution of Cornwall in 1922. He was inaugural president of the first Old Cornwall Society in St. Ives in 1920 and subsequently was made lifelong president of the Federation of Old Cornwall Societies in 1924. He also resurrected the Cornish Gorseth and was initiated as its first Grand Bard. Above all, he was dedicated to instilling in the Cornish people a sense of their own nationhood and identity that he felt had been lost.

However, to exact such a change, the social conditions must also be favourable. It is doubtful that the Revival of Cornwall’s Celtic heritage would have been embraced with such enthusiasm by as many people during the Victorian era, considering the negative connotations a Celtic heritage implied. Just a few decades previously writers such as Matthew Arnold had created an image of the Celtic people as impractical, emotional and generally unsuited to the modern world, and in the nineteenth century, as Chapter Two contends, such historic prejudices were used to further vilify the Celtic people.

---


30 Williams 32-34.


The use of the term ‘Celtic’ is problematic because, as Anne Ross noted; ‘the terms ‘Celt’ and ‘Celtic’ have different connotations for different scholars’. 33 Defining who exactly the Celtic people are is also difficult; Philip Payton observed that ‘archaeologists, historians, linguists and anthropologists cannot themselves agree a definitive answer to the question ‘who were (and are) the Celts?’’. 34 This thesis will make no attempt to refine such definitions, or to prove historical links between the ancient Celtic peoples of Europe and those who define themselves as such now. Instead, ‘Celtic’ is used in reference to a specific ethnic and cultural group as they exist in the modern world, who are willing to describe themselves as Celtic, and are viewed as being so by others. 35 Sometimes, as a consequence of their status, they have been subjected to a discourse of prejudice, but they have continued to self-define themselves as ‘Celtic’ peoples too. This in turn has led to ‘Celtic’ having political connotations beyond its cultural ones both within individual Celtic nations, and also as a Pan-Celtic grouping of nations.

The movement that increased so many people’s interest in Celtic Cornwall had its roots in the Romanticism of the eighteenth century with writers such as Southey, Wordsworth, Byron and Shelley all appropriating Celtic history imagery. 36 In English Romanticism

33 Quoted in Payton, Cornwall: A History 35.

34 Payton, Cornwall: A History 35.


and the Celtic World, Carruthers and Rawe describe ‘the British use and abuse of the Celtic’ as Celtic identity was appropriated in the service of British, and more particularly, English national identity by both comparison and exclusion. Continuing the Romantic tradition, writers such as Ernest Renan and, later, Matthew Arnold posited an image of the Celtic people as artistic, spiritual and other-worldly; they were the antithesis of the burgeoning urban English middle classes, whose allegedly prosaic and materialistic nature was associated with the process of industrialisation and social progress. By the nineteenth century, Cornwall, with its failing proto-industries, was portrayed as a traditional, even backwards community. By contrast, A. D. Smith also noted the importance of a popular living past in contemporary culture that could be ‘rediscovered and reinterpreted’ by ‘modern nationalist intelligentsias’ like Henry Jenner, to reconstitute more positive modern national identities.

The construction of an ethnic identity based on the Celtic culture of Cornwall never disappeared completely, but only survived because individuals like Jenner and his friend and fellow Revivalist Robert Morton Nance created a sense of homogeneous uniqueness that was so valuable to the community as a whole that its preservation was seen as vital and therefore must be defended. Sneja Gune identified such men as ‘the somewhat modernist figure of the poet-pedagogue, those individuals who, for whatever reason, have projected onto them the burden of formulating and expressing a minority’s cultural

37 Carruthers and Rawes 1.
38 Carruthers and Rawes 3.
representations, metaphors and distinctiveness, for a variety of readers in the world at large’. 41

Smith speculated that one of the reasons why these figures would choose to assert their chosen nation’s importance is that, by association, their own status increased as they moved from being members of a peripheral and, in the case of the Celts, maligned group to being at the forefront of a re-emerging nation. 42 They would, therefore, be the most likely people to benefit from myths of identity (in the first place) as they have ‘special access to cultural values’. They would also benefit from the advancing of their own nation to a position of greater significance and less marginality. 43 There is evidence of a desire to advance Cornwall’s position in the national context in a letter to Jenner from E. W. Newton 44 which expresses a keenness to forge ties with those in Westminster in order to advance the Cornish cause, 45 and also in the promotion of Celtic events on the national stage. 46 Whatever their motivation, the thinking and literary activism of men like Henry Jenner and Robert Morton Nance shaped, to a large extent, modern understandings of the region’s separate cultural identity.


42 Smith 84.

43 Smith 84.

44 E.W. Newton was secretary of the Royal Cornwall Polytechnic Society at the same time as Jenner was the president of it.

45 Jenner Papers, Box 6, Bundle 1. Letter from E.W. Newton to Henry Jenner 27th March 1917. Regarding meeting ‘a gentleman at the Ministry’ in London, familiar with Robert Hunt, interested in the work of the RCPS.

46 A. P. Graves wrote to Jenner requesting his help with the ‘selling of our enterprise’, The Celtic Congress, in both The Times and The Manchester Guardian. Jenner Papers, Box 8, Packet 7, Bundle 2, handwritten postcard from North Wales.
The importance of Jenner’s role can be observed by the esteem in which he was held by those in other Celtic nations. He was made a Bard of the Gorsedd of Brittany in 1903, elected vice president of the Celtic Association a year later and was awarded two honorary Masters degrees by universities in Wales. The work of Jenner and other Revivalists’ in raising the profile of Cornish identity was subsequently to be recognised by the other Celtic nations, and as early as 1910, Jenner, as the figurehead of the Cornish Revival, had been urged to attend the Pan-Celtic Congress in Brittany, and also encourage other ‘learned’ Cornish people to do so: the organisers wrote to him stating, ‘After the gallant fight you made for the recognition of Cornwall as a Celtic nation, that country must not be unrepresented at our great gathering’. Jenner consequently attended the event, convinced of its importance: as well as re-establishing a fitting historical place for the Celts, the Congress also sought to improve the status of contemporary Celts. Although not an overtly political organisation, the Congress stated one of its aims was ‘the examination and amelioration of the social conditions obtaining in the various Celtic countries’.

The Congress itself was the medium through which each of the Celtic nations’ federations could be drawn together into an international union with delegates from each representing their members. However, some members of the Congress held greater sway than others, with Brittany, Ireland, Scotland and Wales holding 30 seats each on the Congress’s General Council, and Cornwall and the Isle of Man holding only 10.

47 See Williams 31-33. Jenner was awarded M.A.s from the University of Wales in 1919 and 1920.


49 The Celtic Constitution 1918. Published leaflet.
Even the overseas Celtic societies of England, USA and Canada were granted 30 seats. Similarly, on the Executive Committee, Brittany, Ireland, Scotland and Wales had three representatives, the Isle of Man two, and Cornwall only one. In this context our appreciation of those in Cornwall wishing to improve its social and economic standing through the medium of Pan-Celtic unity must be tempered with a recognition of the county’s relatively lowly status within the Celtic family.\textsuperscript{50}

In a letter to Henry Jenner, ostensibly on the subject of the forthcoming first Celtic Congress to be held in Cornwall in 1932, Morton Nance outlined the difficulty of Cornwall’s position whilst making veiled references to the larger and more politically motivated Celtic nations:

\begin{quote}
I have just heard from Miss Douglas that the Manx delegate can be present if we hold the Congress as late as July 12 ... She says that the Manx people are specially interested in the Cornwall Congress, as that of the other small Celtic nation working under similar difficulties to their own, and I feel myself that the presence of the Manx delegation would make all the difference to the effect that the Congress will have upon our Cornish Celtic revival. They won’t drag in politics, and will put their Celticism in a reasonable way that will not antagonise Cornish people, as some of the things that other Celts may say might well do.\textsuperscript{51}
\end{quote}

\textsuperscript{50} The Celtic Constitution 1918. Published leaflet.

\textsuperscript{51} Jenner Papers. Box 9, Packet 6, Bundle 3. Letter from Morton Nance to Jenner. 29th March 1932.
Despite its relatively lowly status within the hierarchy of Celtic nations, those working for the Revival in Cornwall began to make achievements of real significance. One of their most important and lasting legacies is the Royal Cornwall Museum in Truro. Although originally opened in 1919, it took years of planning and fund-raising on behalf of many people. Jenner was involved in many aspects of the museum, from the design of the floor to organising the insurance on the building – from 1914 onwards he was in constant correspondence over this institution.\(^{52}\) Even after its opening, Jenner’s help was still needed to acquire funds to clear the debt still owing on the building.\(^ {53}\)

The museum was intended for the promotion and benefit of Cornwall with Holroyd-Mills (then president of the Royal Institution of Cornwall) claiming that its construction has been undertaken ‘in the highest interests of the County’.\(^ {54}\) Its initial stated aim was ‘to encourage and promote the study of literature, natural science, geography, archaeology, history, ethnology and fine and applied arts, with special reference to Cornwall’.\(^ {55}\) To this end, Holroyd-Mills was happy to report that the museum had been successful in attracting those who owned valuable private collections to donate their works for public use.\(^ {56}\) The museum also fulfilled its founders’ wishes of being a resource for the general public: in its first year it attracted, on average, over 160 people

\(^{52}\) Jenner Papers Box 4, Bundle 8. Various Letters.

\(^{53}\) Jenner Papers Box 4, Bundle 8. Letter from H. Holroyd-Mills (President of the RIC) to Jenner 9th Sept. 1920.

\(^{54}\) Jenner Papers Box 4, Bundle 8. Letter from H. Holroyd-Mills (President of the RIC) to Jenner 9th Sept. 1920.


\(^{56}\) Jenner Papers Box 4, Bundle 8. Letter from H. Holroyd-Mills (President of the RIC) to Jenner 9th Sept. 1920.
The Old Cornwall Movement

In 1920 the first Old Cornwall Society was founded in St. Ives, and by 1925 there were enough of these societies to form a federation. What the Societies allowed their members in Cornwall to do was to effect change on a local level and to connect with many ordinary Cornish people who would otherwise not have had access to the myriad pieces of information the organisations collected and distributed through the medium of the Old Cornwall magazine. The Federation of Old Cornwall Societies issued a pamphlet about their work entitled What They Are and What They Are Doing to explain their goals. This pamphlet differentiated the Old Cornwall movement from existing Cornish institutions by stating that it was not an antiquarian society, or a folklore society – its scope of learning would be broader than that. Neither was it a ‘learned’ one like the Royal Cornwall Polytechnic Society or the Royal Institution of Cornwall, and it was hoped that it would be more popular with the majority of Cornish people than these, being both ‘local’ and ‘unpretentious’. It was also important to state that although the movement sought to preserve Celtic Cornwall, it was not ‘anti-English’. In the contemporary political climate such a statement may have been necessary to allay the fears of those who looked to Ireland as a sister Celtic nation with a considerable anti-English element. In the Old Cornwall Societies, it was stated that all political, religious and social differences were to be ‘left outside’.

57 Jenner Papers Box 4, Bundle 8. Letter from H. Holroyd-Mills (President of the RIC) to Jenner 9th Sept. 1920.

58 “Old Cornwall Societies: What They Are and What They Are Doing.” Federation of Old Cornwall Societies pamphlet. 5.
Instead, the Societies sought to learn more about the traditions of Cornwall in order to bolster a sense of pride in being both an individual Celtic people and an ancient Cornish nation, and not because they were merely ‘quaint old stuff’ as, in this context, they served only to attract “visitors”. It was hoped that by instilling such pride in all generations in their Cornish nationality, the ‘implied inferiority of things Cornish’ that had been observed in the previous decades could be ended and the heritage of Cornwall preserved.

It was also hoped that the Old Cornwall Societies would serve to counteract the standardisation of nations, and in the very first edition of the *Old Cornwall* magazine this intention was stated: ‘To attempt ... to preserve the individuality of Cornwall is not a reactionary effort to “stop the clock” – As the up-to-date Henry Ford says – “Imitation is suicide”. Let us be ourselves and live’. In later editions of the publication, and despite its name, the rhetoric of a forward-looking organisation continued with the claim that by 1926 the societies, now numbering twelve, demonstrated by their popularity that they were ‘answering a definite need in the life of modern Cornwall’. Bernard Deacon noted that they did indeed ‘provide a bridge between the Revivalists and popular culture’.

---


61 S. W. Johns (compiler) *Old Cornwall Volume I 1925-1930* (St Ives: Federation of Old Cornwall Societies, 1943) No. 1. 42.

62 Johns, *Old Cornwall Volume I* 42.

Another important factor in the success of the Cornish Celtic Revival was the support given to Cornwall by other Celtic nations, particularly Wales, which had held a Gorsedd since the eighteenth century, and Brittany, where the Gorsedd had been successfully re-established in 1900.\textsuperscript{64} Jenner himself described the Cornish Gorseth as ‘an outward and visible sign of the full recognition by Wales as a sister Celtic nation’.\textsuperscript{65} Within the county itself, the work of the Old Cornwall Societies was vital in the Gorseth’s revival, Morton Nance stating that they had ‘hastened matters considerably in recent years by providing a solid backing of Cornish people imbued with local patriotism’.\textsuperscript{66} However, despite the best intentions of the Revivalists to involve as many people as possible in the Gorseth, Deacon has observed that by its very nature, being imbued with ritual, ‘bardic trappings’, and ‘stilted Cornish’, the Gorseth had little success in engaging the majority of the people of Cornwall as the Old Cornwall Societies had.\textsuperscript{67}

This early period in the history of the Old Cornwall movement was marked by harmonious relations with existing Cornish organisations, bolstered no doubt by the involvement of men like Jenner who held prestigious positions in most of them. In an article entitled ‘Sympathisers and Supporters’, the first volume of Old Cornwall commended the Royal Institution of Cornwall for its help and co-operation, and the Royal Cornwall Polytechnic Society for being ‘in full sympathy with our ideas’.\textsuperscript{68} This

\begin{itemize}
  \item \textsuperscript{65} Jenner Papers. Box 8, Packet 1. ms for ‘Who are the Celts and what has Cornwall to do with them?’ by Henry Jenner. 5.
  \item \textsuperscript{67} Deacon, \textit{Cornwall: A Concise History} 188.
  \item \textsuperscript{68} Johns, \textit{Old Cornwall Volume I} 43.
\end{itemize}
unity was seen as an important constituent in the strengthening of Cornish pride: ‘The Cornish Associations are coming together more and more, and the Cornish sense of nationality is becoming articulate, at home and abroad’. 69

Between 1925 and 1930, membership numbers in the Old Cornwall Societies had doubled, but the circulation of its magazine had remained the same70 and by 1930 the Old Cornwall magazine was in financial trouble, possibly due to the Depression and even the Societies were under threat from factional splits.71 Old Cornwall magazine was full of praise for the newly formed ‘youth movement’ Tyr ha Tavas, claiming that it represented the same aims as that of the Old Cornwall movement, primarily to instil in the young people of Cornwall an appreciation of their county’s history, language and lore; to promote kinship with other Celtic nations and to make them aware of Cornish people’s wider role in world affairs.72 Publicly, the new group was well supported and encouraged by Old Cornwall:

“Tyr ha Tavas” is in no way in opposition to or vying with any existing Cornish organisation, and, as seen from its aims, it is aligned with the work of the Old Cornwall Societies, the Gorseth of Cornwall, and all Cornish Societies ... to build up a better a greater Cornwall.73

69 Johns, Old Cornwall Volume I 44.
70 Johns, Old Cornwall Volume I 36.
72 S. W. Johns (compiler) Old Cornwall Volume II 1931-1936 (St Ives: Federation of Old Cornwall Societies, 1943) 5. 29.
73 Johns, Old Cornwall Volume II 5. 30.
B. Y. Couch reiterated this feeling of harmony, stating that Tyr ha Tavas ‘is in no sense antagonistic to the older movement, but is rather a natural development’.74

However, behind the scenes, Morton Nance wrote to Jenner voicing his concern about the burgeoning new movement, believing that it was depleting the numbers of Old Cornwall, and more importantly, was undoing the good work they had achieved so far:

I have written to young Hambly [Dr. E. H. Hambly, founder of Tyr ha Tavas] pointing out that the Old Cornwall movement is the Cornish National one and that there is no room for another ... Numerically they are nothing, but it seems that Old Cornwall which so badly needs young blood will lose these people if Allin-Collins insists upon heading his “party”. This frantic fellow is exactly of the breed to wreck all that we have been working for.75

He then referred to Allin-Collins, prominent language Revivalist and (in 1933) Bard of the Gorseth, as a ‘transparent fraud’ before concluding that, ‘It is a strange thing that Cornwall should have pitched upon “one and all” as a motto, when common unselfish work is so hard to find in it’.76

By June 1933, Morton Nance was beginning to question the motives of those who

74 Johns, Old Cornwall Volume II 5. 30.

75 Allin-Collins wrote Cornish Grammar, published in 1927.

joined this sister organisation: ‘I wish “Tyr Ha Tavas” were a little more Cornish that it seems to be. I am afraid several of them are people who for no particular reason have been drawn towards Allin-Collins’ classes, and, will have no interest in anything in Cornwall. However, I don’t know them and this may be wrong’. 77

In private, Jenner and Morton Nance appeared to be sceptical of both Tyr ha Tavas and it’s leadership, but by 1934 Jenner was, publicly at least, more positive about the new movement, stating in The Cornishman that, ‘When I reflect on the Tyr Ha Tavas, the land and language movement, I feel that my work has not been in vain ... I hope the Tyr Ha Tavas will prosper’. 78

However, in 1936 there had developed a more general feeling of disquiet within the Old Cornwall Societies with Tyr ha Tavas, with many senior members aggrieved that the ‘youth’ organisation was attempting to take over events. 79 In the end, Tyr ha Tavas failed to take root in Cornwall itself, being, as Deacon pointed out, ‘an organisation of exiles’ from various English cities. 80 It is interesting to speculate upon the private and public motivations of those more established figures of Jenner and Morton Nance to the challenge of the new organisation; there were certainly many contradictory opinions expressed by them within a few years as Tyr ha Tavas developed and changed. It is also likely that the seeking of a more political agenda for the Cornish Revival by some of the younger members of Tyr ha Tavas, particularly E. G Retallack and Francis Cargeeg,

---

77 Jenner Papers. Box 9, Packet 6, Bundle 3. Letter from Morton Nance to Jenner. 23rd June 1933.

78 Williams 105.

79 Johns, Old Cornwall Volume I 34.

80 Deacon, Cornwall: A Concise History 188.
concerned men like Jenner and Morton Nance.\textsuperscript{81}

The exclusion of politics may have been an advantageous policy, as Henry Jenner and his contemporaries had a difficult task in the revival of Cornwall’s Celtic identity: that of integrating Cornwall into the Celtic family of nations when the perceived political stances held by some of those nations clashed so dramatically with the views of the majority of the Cornish people, and when the Celts themselves were a vilified people. In Jenner’s own time, the issue of Irish Home Rule divided many and also helped bring prejudices against the Celts to the fore. As D. G. Boyce noted on the issue: ‘It would be a crude over simplification to see this as the ‘Celtic’ lands ranged against the ‘Saxon’; but often politics are about crude simplifications, and it was this wider racial aspect of the issue [of Home Rule] that made it more tractable’.\textsuperscript{82} George Orwell’s damning condemnation of the nature of Celtic Nationalism at the end of the Second World War is an example of how those nations had been categorized together as disparaging the English, whilst supporting their enemies: ‘Welsh, Irish and Scottish nationalism have points of difference but are alike in their anti-English orientation. Members of all three movements have opposed the war ... and the lunatic fringe has even contrived to be simultaneously pro-Russian and pro-Nazi’.\textsuperscript{83} The Victorian stereotype of the Celt also re-emerged when Orwell described the reasons for this anti-English orientation: ‘Its motive force is a belief in the past and future greatness of the Celtic peoples, and it has a


strong tinge of racialism. The Celt is supposed to be spiritually superior to the Saxon – simpler, more creative, less vulgar, less snobbish etc. – but the usual power hunger is there under the surface." 84

At various times in the first half of the twentieth century the notion of being Celtic differed greatly between the Celtic nations, meaning that on some issues, such as that of Home Rule, it was prudent for those leading the Revival in Cornwall, like Jenner, to remove political issues from the Celtic agenda in Cornwall. At other times the notion of the international unity of the Celtic people superseded the predominant political view of the nation, as happened in the Second World War when Cornish Revivalists committed to helping the Breton people despite the prevailing view of many of the Bretons as Nazi collaborators. 85 This connection between Brittany and Germany further highlights the international dimension to the study of Celtic matters from the middle of the nineteenth century onwards, and it is useful to look beyond the Celtic countries themselves, especially to Germany, when examining the nature of the Celtic Revival (see Chapter Three).

What the study of Cornwall in comparison to other Celtic nations shows is that these nations were far from being the homogeneous anti-English group depicted by Orwell. The nations’ political stances differed widely, both from each other, and within those individual nations too. Jenner himself was politically removed from many of his fellow Cornishmen, being a Conservative in a predominantly Liberal-supporting county.


However, some of the ideas that Jenner espoused in connection with his interest in the
revival of a Celtic Cornwall were not unrelated to the particular brand of Liberalism that
was so successful in the county in the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries,
principally Jenner’s views of hierarchical societies and his evocation of ‘Merry
England’ (as discussed in Chapter Three).

One Liberal cause that Jenner did not officially support, along with many fellow
Cornish people, was that of Irish Home Rule, an issue that once again raised old
prejudices and questions of Celtic identity. Tregidga observed a reputation ‘throughout
Britain’ for this opposition to Irish Home Rule in Cornish voters of the late 1880s and
1890s, and Payton also wrote of a ‘suspicion of Irish nationalism’ in Cornwall. Home Rule for Ireland was not a popular concept in Cornwall, partly because, as
Deacon observed, the predominantly Methodist Cornish were more likely to be
sympathetic to the Protestant Unionists than the Catholic Republicans. He also noted
that, in the event of independence for Ireland, the Cornish feared being excluded from
their fishing waters, and that the emigration of so much of the Cornish population had
‘reinforced an empire loyalty’ in the county with so many dependent on jobs in different
parts of Britain’s dominion.

So Jenner was not out of step with his fellow Cornish residents in his public opposition

87 Payton, Cornwall: A History 266.
88 Deacon, Cornwall: A Concise History 155. See also Garry Tregidga, “Representing the Duchy: Francis
89 Deacon, Cornwall: A Concise History 155.
to Home Rule. However, there were more secretive sides to his political allegiances, in particular his enthusiasm for the cause of Legitimism both in Britain and in Europe. Through its support of the Jacobite movement, Legitimism had strong links to Celtic independence and represented a more radical side of Celtic politics. As Britain was on the brink of war with Germany, it was certainly something that Jenner felt he had to remain secretive about, especially as the ‘rightful’ Jacobite heir to the throne was located in Bavaria. Sharon Lowenna connected both Jenner and his fellow Revivalist L.C. R. Duncombe-Jewell with the Legitimist ‘Firefly’ plot (to smuggle arms for the Legitimist cause in Spain), observing Jenner’s success in suppressing any knowledge of his role in it. In his biography of Aleister Crowley, Tobias Churton acknowledged Lowenna’s study of the plot and also noted that ‘Jenner handled secret negotiations with Bavaria as well as plots to put the Bourbon Don Miguel on the missing throne of France and, imminently, to secure the Spanish throne for the Bourbon Don Carlos VII of Spain’. Churton also claims that Jenner and Crowley got to know each other through Duncombe-Jewell, and Crowley himself claimed to be a fellow Jacobite. Secretive though he was, Jenner’s interest in the Legitimist cause was still known at the highest level and it is a fascinating period in his life which demonstrated the very real divisions in thinking between himself and the majority of Cornish people, whom he hoped to conscript to the cause of Celtic Cornwall.


In the aftermath of the Great War and partly, one suspects, because of his experiences during it, Jenner’s interest in Legitimism waned. The promotion of a Celtic Cornwall took over his life, albeit with his own unique focus, because at a time when the Celtic languages were being studied all over Europe, Jenner was more interested in other assertions of cultural superiority than he was in language promotion as the key indicator of national identity. In German academia particularly, as in Europe as a whole, the Celtic languages were seen as central to Celtic studies. Swiss linguist and Celticist Rudolf Thurneysen posited that this interest was prompted by the fact that large parts of German land were formerly Celtic-speaking areas.93 The two ancient peoples once occupied the same territory, with C. M. Lotspeich noting that the ‘Celts and Teutons’ were two distinct peoples living in close contact, the Celts being the ‘superior race’.94 With such perceived historic connections, the interest in Celtic history flourished with language being the main focus.

Elsewhere in Europe, the link between language and identity was expressed by peoples like the Czechs and Hungarians who had asserted their nationalism through their individual languages. This Europe-wide trend contextualises the importance of language to identity at this time and it was against this background that the Celtic Revival was taking place.95 These circumstances may help to explain Jenner’s initial interest in, and promotion of, the Cornish language; he published the first edition of his Handbook of

---


the Cornish Language in 1904. However, in later years Jenner’s focus expanded to a wider cultural vision for Cornwall as a Celtic nation.

The Politics of Celticity

The period prior to the outbreak of war, which has been described as a ‘golden age’ of Celtic studies and the interest in Celtic history and culture extended across Europe. Initial European interest in Celtic studies in the middle of the nineteenth century had primarily been as an historical discipline, prompted by the archaeological discoveries of Celtic sites at Hallstatt in Austria in 1846 and La Tène in Switzerland in 1858. However, during the twentieth century’s ‘golden age’, the emphasis had shifted from primarily cultural features to the Celtic dialects; academics from many European countries, including Austria, France, Denmark, Norway and the Netherlands, as well as those from Germany, would travel to the Celtic nations in order to learn their indigenous languages, before consequently establishing teaching courses in their home countries.

In what would turn out to be an unfortunate emphasising of historical connections, the links between Germany and the Celtic nations were further strengthened during the First World War with Germany actively exploiting the rift between Ireland and England by openly supporting Irish attempts at independence. Issues of race were once again employed, this time to stress Celtic superiority. Academic and political links remained

96 See Ó’ Dochartaigh, *Germans, Celts and Nationalism* 9. And also Grosjean, who described the period 1907-1914 as ‘the finest in the history of Celtic studies’, quoted in Ó’ Dochartaigh, *Germans, Celts and Nationalism* 145.

97 See Ó Dochartaigh, *Germans, Celts and Nationalism* 30.


99 See Ó Dochartaigh, *Germans, Celts and Nationalism* 30.
strong in the inter-war years too, with the continuation of the presence of leading
German academic figures in Ireland and the burgeoning Nazi Party overtly recruiting in
Ireland. A new myth of Celtic peoples was created as the taint of collaboration fell not
only on the Irish, but on that other Celtic nation of Brittany. Yet despite these problems
of perception, the Celtic nations still remained united together in organisations like the
Pan-Celtic Society and the Celtic Congress.

In order to comprehend why a unified Celtic identity was affirmed so strongly at the
beginning of the twentieth century and thus understand one of the contexts for Jenner’s
work, it is important to try and understand the circumstances under which this assertion
was taking place. It is particularly enlightening to examine the role of the Celt in the
Victorian consciousness with particular reference to the concept of race in this era. Race
is a hugely problematic term to define as it is a social construction whose meaning shifts
over time. There was little talk of race at all prior to the Romantic era, during which the
Enlightenment universalism of a common humanity was replaced by a cultural
pluralism which posited that different groups of people had different histories by which
their unique natures were moulded. But by the nineteenth century, humans had moved
from being considered as social rather than biological entities in scientific
understanding, and from being governed by social laws to natural laws. 101

In the Victorian era, then, science was used to differentiate between groups of people, or

---


‘races’, and the term ‘race’ was used as a social classification based on both physical distinctions and on biological descent. These ‘scientific’ methods for the separation of different peoples included polygenism (the idea that human beings descended from different lineages), physical anthropology, and phrenology (the study of skull shape). Implicit in the concept of differing races of people was the assumption that there was a hierarchy of the said races. However, the definition of ‘race’ in the nineteenth century was intimately entwined with class and sexuality in a way which we would not recognise today, and often the working class were treated as a separate ‘race’ in this definition.102 Because of the subjugation of certain groups, the divisions of ethnicity and class would often coincide with many of the people from the Celtic ‘fringes’ of Britain.

The concept of race in this broad context helped the Victorians to reconcile the notion of inevitable societal progress with the social disorder that accompanied it. In a hierarchical system of differing races, everyone would find their ordained place within society with only the superior ones reaching the apex of civilization. Thus race could be used to explain social inequalities, as inferior races would be frozen at lower points of development, unable to progress due to innate biological inadequacies. Today we think of race as being a colour-based concept, but in the nineteenth century, as has been noted, it was used in a much broader sense. In the days of the expanding British Empire, the construction of discourses of prejudice could be applied to ‘domestic savages’, like the Irish, as well as ‘foreign savages’ further afield. Both of these constructions where born out of, and to some extent came to replace, the romantic view of the ‘noble savage’.

Whilst the former, more benign idea didn’t completely disappear during the Victorian era, a fear of the primitive increasingly dominated, fuelled, in part, by the concept of progressive evolution.\textsuperscript{103}

The racism directed at the Celts in the nineteenth century was driven partly by a fear of this perceived savagery, but also by the needs of Empire itself. The subordination of the Celtic fringe to English expansionist intentions was essential for that success. The Empire was constructed on the belief that amalgamation was a progressive force and a ‘civilizing influence’, so those who contested the will of the Empire could be seen as ‘unprogressive’ and ‘primitive’. What Luke Gibbons describes as the ‘terror of colonialism’ began with the Celtic fringe, and although the stereotype of the warrior Celt was conserved, it was only deemed acceptable in the service of Empire.\textsuperscript{104} Gibbons asserts that the uniting of Britain was not integration, but subjugation ‘as benefited an innately inferior race’.\textsuperscript{105} Furthermore, ideas of separate races, which some thought could be extrapolated from Darwin’s theories on evolution and the descent of man, fuelled concerns that contamination between superior and inferior peoples was a possibility.\textsuperscript{106} This spurred the fear that the so-called superior races, such as the Anglo-Saxons, might be contaminated by contact with the Celts. L. P. Curtis observed that ‘any


\textsuperscript{105} Gibbons 40.

\textsuperscript{106} Social Darwinism, when referring to a struggle between races, has little to do with Darwin’s own theories – he wrote of a struggle between individuals within a species. When he talked of ‘races’, it was not in the Victorian sense of the word, but a way of classifying a group with shared characteristics. The Darwinian struggle for existence, then, is not one between groups but between individuals within a group. See Richard Dawkins, \textit{The Greatest Show on Earth: The Evidence for Evolution} (London: Transworld, 2010) 62. And Peter Jackson, and Jan Penrose.(eds) \textit{Constructions of Race, Place and Nations} (London: University College of London Press Ltd, 1993) 4.
mixture of the two peoples invariably resulted in the corruption or adulteration of the better (Anglo-Saxon) blood by the baser (Celtic) blood’. Conversely, the primitive Celt could benefit from the civilizing influence of the Anglo-Saxon. Curtis’s work is valuable here because, as Lees observed, he looked beyond the ‘clearly articulated opinions’ of the elite members of society and examined the stereotypes that were proffered to the masses through popular culture.

Having concluded that what Curtis deemed to be ‘Anglo-Saxonism’ actually existed, Walter Arenstein postulated that it was a pervasive theory that espoused the crude stereotype of the Celt. He went on to describe Anglo-Saxonism thus:

\[
\text{an ideology supported by anthropologists and historians that explained the glory of nineteenth-century English civilization as a consequence of a racial and institutional continuity dating back to those Anglo-Saxon invaders who brought back from the forests of fifth-century Germany such traits as reason, restraint, self-control, love of freedom and hatred of anarchy, respect for law and distrust for enthusiasm.}
\]

There is no shortage of evidence to argue that the Celts as a people were not only

---


differentiated from the majority of the British nation, defined in this era as ‘Anglo-Saxons’, but were subject to an oppressive discourse. It is difficult to comprehend just how strong the division between the Saxons and the Celts was in the nineteenth and early twentieth centuries and how inferior the Celts were thought to be, especially as so many people are now proud to call themselves ‘Celts’. Brian Sykes claimed that, ‘It is hard to imagine how ingrained was the sense that the people of Britain were split into two entirely different ‘races’ and how superior the Saxons felt about themselves’.

Indeed, stereotypes that Henry Jenner and the other people involved in Cornwall’s Celtic Revival were battling against had been ingrained for centuries in British society, as W. R. Jones observed. He uncovered ample evidence of the portrayal of the Celt as a savage barbarian in the late Middle Ages, employing the stereotypes of a lazy, poor, treacherous, depraved and cruel people who lived a primitive and brutish life isolated from civilization. Laura O’Connor described the division between the two groups as ‘the best (Anglo-Saxons) and the rest (Celts)’. Correspondingly, Simon Trezise stated that, ‘The full force of this racial stereotyping to distort the Victorian debate about the nature of the Celt should not be underestimated’. From this perspective of stressing perceived differences between Celts and Anglo-Saxons, not only were the Celts denigrated by unfavourable comparison, but this same perspective also served to

---


112 Laura O’Connor, Haunted English: The Celtic Fringe, the British Empire and De-Anglicization (Baltimore: John Hopkins University Press, 2006) xii.

emphasise the uniformity of the people of all the Celtic countries, a paradoxical benefit.

The second chapter will explore the evidence for this division. It will also attempt to prove that although the Irish were the most vilified of the Celtic peoples, the Cornish, both by association with their fellow Celts and due to prejudices specific to them, were also encumbered with a myth of inferiority.

It was a myth that men such as Henry Jenner sought to reverse; and Chapter Three explores how this was achieved. Realising the importance of a noble history to a people, he created a new myth of descent, a revised list of more positive Celtic character traits, as well as embarking on a campaign to get Cornwall accepted into the Celtic Congress. Acknowledging the crucial existence of a living Celtic language to such admission, he published his handbook of the Cornish language. He also emphasised the independent nature of the Cornish people in his speeches, as well as reiterating their glorious autonomous past.

However, it was no easy change to make, and even when it was made it could be argued that the distinctly Celtic Cornwall created by Jenner and others was subsequently used by those outside the county for their own means, especially those within the tourist trade. This manipulation of the past by those with a predominantly economic, as opposed to cultural, agenda has detrimentally altered perceptions of the county and of the Celtic nations in general. As they have called for greater political recognition, the perception of them as a mystical, even backwards, people unsuited to the practicalities of politics, has served to hold them back. Barry Cunliffe observed that although devolution, self-determination and local autonomy have become important issues, the
movement towards a form of local independence by the Celtic regions is still hampered by external perceptions: ‘[they] [are] made to look irrelevant and ridiculous by the theatrical nostalgia encouraged by the tourist industry’. This is the premise for the thesis that follows: that Celtic identity is to some extent ‘haunted’ by perceptions of the Celtic peoples and cultures created in the past by cultural activists like Henry Jenner and exploited by those in the tourism trade.

**The Politics of Tourism**

The importance of the tourist industry to Cornwall should not be underestimated: in 2007, 22 per cent of all working people in Cornwall were employed within tourism, by far the highest percentage in the South West. The next highest was Devon with 12 per cent, and the national average was only 4.7 per cent. However, this dominance did not, and does not, guarantee economic prosperity and the total visitor-related spend in the county that year was £1,633,554,000, nearly £660,000,000 less than that in Devon. As in the past, a vast majority of the visitors to Cornwall came from within the United Kingdom – 27,050,000 as opposed to only 2,683,000 from overseas. It is therefore visitors from the rest of Britain who have traditionally been the target of the tourism industry’s publicity. In recent years, in order to attract these visitors the county

---


has been marketed as a mystic, haunted location by tourism professionals, a trend which has its own strong heritage in Cornwall.

South West Tourism is the official organisation responsible for promoting and supporting the tourist industry in the counties of Cornwall, Devon, Somerset, Dorset, Wiltshire and Gloucestershire. Under the headline ‘Bid to attract supernatural fans’, their chief executive Malcolm Bell suggested to the BBC in 2004 that Cornwall should capitalise on its reputation as a haunted county in order to attract more visitors to the region. He claimed that the industry was becoming increasingly segmented and appealing to special interest groups, be they surfers or ghost-hunters, suggesting that this was the way forward. South West Tourism collected details of haunted accommodation because ‘many holidaymakers specifically ask to stay in such places’ and, he argued, that this was ‘an indication of a growing market’.\(^{118}\) Bell declared that: ‘The idea and desire to discover more about the unknown is very strong and, given that Cornwall’s history is steeped in myths and legends, its attracting people who have a desire to explain the unexplainable’.\(^{119}\) Graham King, the owner of one of Cornwall’s most popular destinations, the Museum of Witchcraft, in Boscastle, offered a positive but cautious response, warning against the dangers of ‘crass promotion’: ‘It’s lovely to have people coming along who are interested in spirituality and the Celtic connection and appeal of these wonderful Celtic lands, but you don’t want to over-exploit it because you could spoil it’.\(^{120}\)


\(^{119}\) “Bid to attract supernatural fans.” <http://news.bbc.co.uk/1/hi/england/cornwall/3546726.stm>

\(^{120}\) “Bid to attract supernatural fans.” <http://news.bbc.co.uk/1/hi/england/cornwall/3546726.stm>
A year later in July 2005, Sky Travel commissioned a survey to find the most haunted place in Britain to promote their forthcoming ‘Mysterious Britain’ season. A team of investigators, led by paranormal expert Lionel Fanthorpe, spent several months documenting and then mapping various cases of unexplained events, including sightings of ghosts and UFOs, the appearance of crop circles and ‘mysterious creatures’. It concluded that Cornwall, with the highest number of sightings, was ‘the spookiest place in the country’.¹²¹ Not surprisingly in the light of Malcolm Bell’s previous enthusiasm for the subject, the report’s findings were received positively by South West Tourism, who claimed that it would help to add to the overall mystique of the area. Bell observed that, ‘There are people who are interested in the paranormal who would come down here but might not have gone to Swindon or Coventry if it [the spookiest place] were there’.¹²² In this statement an interest in hauntings and unexplained events is connected with a particular landscape and surroundings and, whilst Cornwall is considered to be an attractive destination in its own right, it is also one which would appeal to a certain demographic in particular. It also implies that those interested in the paranormal are attracted to certain places but not others, and Swindon and Coventry – urban areas which could be deemed as unattractive – are advanced as the antithesis of the scenic holiday destination of Cornwall.

The president of the Paranormal Research Organisation based in Penzance, Ian Addicoat, was unsurprised by the Sky report’s conclusions: ‘There is so much history in


¹²² “Cornwall Boosted by ‘Spooky’ Tag.” <http://news.bbc.co.uk/1/hi/england/cornwall/4717719.stm>
the area – land of legend, gritty ghost stories and there are people who come here [Cornwall], and places like Tintagel, and base their holidays down here’. Of course every area has a history, but Cornwall has been designated a specific history by many people and certain myths created here are perpetuated for the benefit of the tourist trade. Amy Hale claimed that, ‘In the past 10 years, heritage and tourism operators have worked to integrate Cornish ethnicity into their attractions and their goods. Often this is done with a broader reference to Cornwall’s Celtic past’, and the idea of hauntedness is part of this Celtic identity.

The Revival was one of the key factors in making both the Celts and mysticism so popular, ironically both strengthening and threatening Cornwall’s Celtic identity. Because of Jenner and his associates, the county was, in the early twentieth century, developing upon an already established sense of a ‘Celtic Cornwall’ and the Celtic Revival helped to preserve traditions and a sense of community which may otherwise have been lost in the process of modernisation brought about, in no small part, by the rise of tourism. The sort of mass tourism on the scale experienced by relatively small Cornish towns and villages in the twentieth century inevitably and ironically disrupted the traditional communities that the Revivalists were trying to record and preserve. However, at the same time, this Cornish-Celtic identity proved to be a useful device in selling the county to potential visitors and thus to offer it economic support as traditional industries declined. In summary, the work of the Revivalists in Cornwall

123 “Cornwall Boosted by ‘Spooky’ Tag.” <http://news.bbc.co.uk/1/hi/england/cornwall/4717719.stm>


125 See Deacon, *Cornwall: A Concise History* 150-151.
constructed an image of the county which could be used to commodify it by those in the tourist industry at a time when Cornwall’s status as a Celtic nation was being strengthened by its inclusion in the Pan-Celtic movement.

The development of Cornwall’s Celtic identity can be traced through the literature of tourism, as well as in the work of the Revivalists like Jenner. Unlike in later years, in early travel guidebooks such as the early edition of *The Cornish Riviera* (1905) there is no mention of the Cornish as a Celtic people, or Cornwall as a Celtic land, and only a passing reference is made to the ‘romance and folklore’ of the region. King Arthur is mentioned only briefly, and even then he is associated with writers such as Tennyson and Malory, whose portrayal of Arthur was not that of the Celtic hero but as an English King. By contrast, there is a whole chapter dedicated to Cornwall’s industrial mining region with half a dozen photos to illustrate this less than picturesque area. Although by the early part of the twentieth century mass tourism in Cornwall was already viewed as the potential salvation of the Cornish economy, as Ronald Perry points out there was no mention of promoting Cornwall as a ‘Celtic’ place in order to attract visitors. The only early guidebook writer to mention ‘Celtic’ Cornwall was, tellingly, one who described himself as a native of the county. In his *Tourist’s Guide to Cornwall*, Walter Tregallas described his ‘brother Cornishmen’ as possessing ‘Celtic blood’, making them ardent and vivacious as well as self-reliant and versatile.\(^\text{126}\)

Perry claimed that it took the world slump of the 1920s and 1930s to see what he described as ‘the flowering of a Celtic theme’ in publicity material (although there was

evidence of the beginnings of this trend in Folliot-Stokes’ guidebook of 1912 – see below). The period would see the tourist industry become the dominant influence in fashioning representations of Cornwall, commodifying it for urban consumption. That this nostalgia for a pre-industrial ‘golden age’ in Cornwall’s history coincided with economic decline is thought by some to be a prerequisite of what was described as ‘a falsification of the past’ by Chase and Shaw in *The Imagined Past*. In order for the past to be idealised, the present must seem deficient in some way – there must be a feeling that the status of a society has been lost – and that the future offers little chance of redemption. It could be argued that this describes Cornwall’s economic situation in the early part of the twentieth century, having lost so much of its population abroad and its traditional industries having fallen into decline: it was a period broadly described by Philip Payton as ‘the Great Paralysis’.

Yet, although it was the Great Western Railway Company (GWR) who began promoting the idea of a ‘Celtic’ Cornwall heavily in the 1920s, previous writers had already recognised this standard of difference as an encouragement to travellers. A. G. Folliot-Stokes’ guide to *The Cornish Coast and Moors*, published in 1912, tellingly described by the author as a ‘key to the wild’ and dedicated to ‘all those who feel the witchery of the west’, contained much of the new mythology being constructed about Cornwall. The author wrote of an ancient ‘unconquered’ Celtic land, a land of mystery and legend

---


inhabited by a ‘foreign’ people; ‘as distinct from the English as the Bretons are from the French’.  

The depiction of the ‘Cornish Celt’ was as a warm-hearted and quick-witted type, but they were also a ‘dreaming, mystic creature’, far removed in character from the modern urban visitor. It was what was to become the conventional romanticised depiction of the Celt as a spiritual, non-materialistic being living in an ancient land where the ‘jaded city dwellers’ could come to escape the pressures of their lives. Part of this constructed image was drawn from the work of Celtic Revivalists like Henry Jenner who had been so keen to assert the county’s claim to an ancient Celtic heritage and to preserve what were seen as Cornish-Celtic traditions. There was an idea that such a heritage was being lost forever, the increase in tourism contributing in no small part to this.

Perry pointed out that the threat posed to Cornwall by the sudden mass influx of tourists and the subsequent erosion of traditional Cornish culture was one of the motivations behind much of the work of the Old Cornwall Societies, which sought to ‘gather ye fragments’ of traditional Cornish life before they became lost forever.  

The tourist industry too had a vested interest in local culture and folk tales, although there was less emphasis on an attempted historical accuracy, and more of a need to tie certain stories and traditions to specific locations for promotional purposes, as in the case of Tintagel and King Arthur. But there was also a relationship between tourism and the Old Cornwall Societies. Roy Pedersen has correctly observed that tourism has an impact on place identity. Such an invasion, with its inherent threat to the existing culture of a place, can be the incentive to try and preserve that which is vulnerable to loss. In places


131 Perry, “The Changing Face of Celtic Tourism in Cornwall” 100.
such as Cornwall, with its history of peripherality and individuality, such loss stimulated local writers to defend their ethnology and folklore: Jenner and the Old Cornwall Society activists provided much of that writing. This will be further explored in Chapter Three.

The Politics of Haunting

As the history of the tourism trade in the county attests, local identities are not always constructed by local people and images projected onto the so-called peripheral areas of Britain by those at the ‘centre’ have not always been positive. In recent years a pervading view has survived, constructed from past identities, of remoteness from modernity coupled with a retrogressive perspective. In 2007 a rather disparaging article appeared in The Guardian newspaper extolling the disadvantages of moving to the South West of England, one of which was that the region was deemed to be ‘the undisputed capital of British credulousness’, with ‘mumbo jumbo-drenched towns’, populated with ‘pseudo-druids and new agers’. If the South West in general has a reputation for a susceptibility to mystical beliefs, then Cornwall’s is perhaps even more pronounced: in his 2004 travel book A Fête Worse Than Death, author Iain Aitch noted whilst watching the Red Arrows in Fowey that ‘at least the locals had got used to the shock of horseless carriages by now. I imagine that those first Red Arrows shows must have instigated some end-of-the-world stories about ‘great flying devils’ and ‘metal birds’ from the local soothsayer’. 133

This thesis argues that modern views of the region have their roots in earlier identity


constructs based in part on the mystical image of Cornwall as a place where the uncanny is a part of everyday life and the people are thought of, at least in part, as an ‘other’. It could therefore be posited that the idealisation of a mystic, Celtic past by the so-called ‘Celtic Revivalists’ and others in the first half of the twentieth century has had an impact on this present view. In the context of this theory, the term ‘haunted’ is used both in a literal sense, because Cornwall is seen as a place full of ghosts, and also in the sense that Cornwall is haunted by its own past to the extent that it impacts negatively on its present and future. It will be argued that Cornwall’s reputation as a place firmly connected to the past through hauntings and other factors, often externally constructed identities of timelessness and mysticism, has had consequences for its economic well-being.

Although Cornwall has a reputation as a particularly ghostly place, a belief in ghosts themselves, and an interest in their stories, is by no means confined to this ‘peripheral’ region, nor was it at the time of the Revival. There was certainly a fascination in Britain with ghost stories in the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries, with Owen Davies describing the ‘English love affair’ with ghosts, and England being a ‘ghost-ridden nation’. As for their function, in his introduction to The Oxford Book of Twentieth-Century Ghost Stories, Michael Cox claimed literary ghost stories were designed to make the reader feel ‘pleasurably afraid’, to elicit a sense of the uncanny rather than of true horror and outright fear.

---


Despite this general interest in spectral haunting, Angela Bourke has emphasised the difference in beliefs and attitudes to the supernatural between central and peripheral regions at the end of the 1890s. She noted the conflict between the scientific, middle class optimism of the modernising nineteenth century, with its roads, railways and newspapers and ‘the increasing isolation and marginalization of those still invested in an older oral culture, who lived generally far from main roads’. Nicola Bown also observed that this social differentiation existed within the field of what we would now consider supernatural belief systems. To many spiritualists, who were predominantly from the middle classes, ghosts were just another aspect of the natural world awaiting scientific discovery. These spiritualists were keen to differentiate their beliefs from the ‘uneducated’ superstitions of ‘ignorant’ people ‘whose belief in supernatural beings and events was untouched by the rationalism of educated opinion’. However, by contrast Silver describes the ‘remarkable “trickle up”’ of folk belief in Victorian England, noting that ‘a surprisingly large number of educated Victorians and Edwardians speculated at length on whether fairies did exist or had at least once existed’, one of whom, famously, was author and correspondent of Henry Jenner, Sir Arthur Conan Doyle.

The politics of haunting thus had a contested aspect of social class, but it also had an ethnic aspect. As with ghosts themselves, who elicited a sense of the uncanny, the Celts

---


139 See Jenner Papers, Box 20 Loose hand written postcards from Conon Doyle at Windlesham, Crowborough, Sussex to Henry Jenner. No date.
combined the threatening with the known to produce an ‘otherness’ that was not totally foreign, but also not quite British either. Despite the romanticised interest in folk beliefs, the superstitions of the ‘lower’ classes and the Celts were still viewed as evidence of their ‘backwardness’ by many.

But what do ghosts represent to a nation or people? And what reason is there for the prevalence (perceived or actual) of ghosts in some areas rather than others? Laura O’Connor offers one explanation: broadening the debate on hauntedness in the Celtic regions as a whole, O’Connor noted that the ‘Celtic fringe’, by its very nature, carries connotations of hauntedness: ‘the fringe is constantly associated with liminality, twilit zones, misty horizons, chimerial visions, and vanishing lore. The constitutive nebulosity and malleability of the fringe draws attention to its phantasmic nature, to how it consists of that which haunts and unsettles the borders that circumscribe stable identities’. Kathleen Brogan claimed that: ‘Like history, ghost stories attempt to bring the dead back to life. In contemporary haunted literature, ghost stories are offered as an alternative – or challenge – to “official” dominant history’. Perhaps in a locality’s historiography, there is something missing, part of a past that is not being told through these means, but that is expressed through literature or oral history. Stories can be seen as cultural resources which are used by people to help in developing identities and the importance of stories to the construction of local identities can be recognised with reference to a specific genre of narratives, in this case, tales of haunting. These ‘texts of the interior’, as Wennö and Holmgren described them, are more likely to be formed with

---

140 O’Connor xiv.

the consent of the community and such stories can help in the recuperation of a people’s history.\textsuperscript{142} In Cornwall it will be posited that the nature of ghost stories in the region written at this time reflects a desire to purge the county of some of the ‘incomers’ brought to Cornwall by the tourist industry.\textsuperscript{143}

With this in mind, Brogan has argued that in American ethnic literature, the role of ghosts was ‘to recreate ethnic identity through an imaginative recuperation of the past and to press this new version of the past into service in the present’.\textsuperscript{144} She is bold in claiming that, ‘The transmission of stories – and most emphatically, ghost stories – creates ethnicity. Historical meaning and ethnic identity are established through the process of haunting’.\textsuperscript{145} This emphasises the importance of ghost stories as, through tales of haunting, specific aspects of the past are brought back to those in the present. Lyn McCredden similarly writes about identities themselves being haunted because, as they are all structured by desire and lack, they are always understood in terms of what they are not.\textsuperscript{146}

Ghosts can help to transmute traditions that are under threat during periods of distinctly virulent change, particularly during periods that lead to what Brogan described as ‘a


\textsuperscript{144} Brogan 4.

\textsuperscript{145} Brogan 18.

heightened anxiety about ethnic identity’. Thus ghosts can act as metaphors for this ‘desire and lack’, but also as conduits from the past, transposing it into the present, and the very nature of what is chosen to be brought back can be revealing of the societal group in question. So by studying tales of haunting in Cornwall, it is possible to reveal aspects of Cornish identity, as ghosts are also often used to defend a region in battles over regional possession and identity: they chase out incomers, especially those sceptical of the region’s mythical legends. There are numerous examples of such tales in Cornish literature in which the doubting incomer is driven mad or driven out by the local ghost: in other words, they do what the living did not succeed in doing. It is a pattern also noted by Shelley Trower: in relation to Donald Rawe’s Cornish ghost stories, she observed that ‘the opposition between the ancient and new, the Cornish and non-Cornish, provides a context for how some of the stories are about “newcomers” to Cornwall, who are sceptical with regards to traditional tales of the supernatural, and who are finally driven away’.

However, not all ghost stories are internally constructed and therefore reflective of the fears of the society that generated them. Owen Davies has observed that more recently it is the tourism industry that most often decides on the location of ghosts: ‘the idea of a whole community being ghost-ridden is an obvious product of modern tourism. It is a reversal of the historic position where communities desired to be rid of their spirits. Villages, towns and cities now boast of the number of ghosts they have’.

---

131 Brogan 131.
115 Shelley Trower 115.
62 Owen Davies 62.
64 Owen Davies 64.
64 Owen Davies 64.
But where did these stories originate from? How was this image of Cornwall established? This will be the theme of Chapter Four in which the influential work of writers like Norden, Polwhele, and Borlase will be discussed in relation to their contributions to constructed aspects of Cornish identity. It will be argued that their ideas remained resilient over the centuries and could subsequently be utilised by those involved in the tourism industry. Legendary historical figures, such as the prehistoric ‘Celts’, King Arthur and An Gof could also be evoked to facilitate the construction of identities in the present. Such figures were intimately connected with perceptions of Cornwall as un-English, ‘Celtic’ and ‘different’, and it was this distinctively ‘other’ identity that those both within and outside the Celtic nations nurtured and shared. Following on from these early writers, a distinctive contribution was made by the Cornish Revivalists through their composition and collection of ghost stories.

So it may be observed that there were two interconnected groups at work in Cornwall constructing identities of place and people, both with differing agendas: the Revivalists and those involved in the tourism industry. This thesis will examine Jenner’s role in this work.

**The Politics of the Cornish Nation**

One of the most important individual goals of Henry Jenner as a principal figure in the Celtic Revival was that it gained recognition for Cornwall as a ‘nation’. He was moved to proclaim that, as with Ireland, Scotland, Wales and Brittany, Cornwall could indeed be defined as a nation. Because nationalism is a concept that identifies a group of individuals with a nation, by proclaiming Cornwall to be such and the Cornish people to
be constituent in that nation, Jenner was giving the Cornish-Celtic Revival a nationalist agenda, however unintentionally or ambiguously expressed that was. Although Jenner had no overtly political agenda for Cornwall himself, the need for a revival of Cornish nationhood was born out of a necessity to see Cornwall receive greater recognition. Unlike many of those involved in the Celtic Revival, Jenner placed greater importance on a sense of national consciousness rather than a shared language, race or religion.

Max Weber acknowledged the role that men like Jenner play in the formation of national consciousness. He defined these ‘intellectuals’ as ‘a group of men who by virtue of their peculiarity have special access to certain achievements considered to be ‘culture values’, and who therefore usurp the leadership of a ‘culture community’.”¹⁵¹ Weber deduced that these intellectuals were ‘predestined’ to engender in their chosen community a ‘national idea’ of the group as, if not superior, then in some measure irreplaceable due to their unique culture and descent.¹⁵² This is undoubtedly the role which Jenner and his colleagues undertook in the Celtic Cornish Revival of the early twentieth century. However, in Weber’s theory, the process of cultural reinforcement by intellectuals would ultimately result in the progression from a nation to that more politicised entity, a state. This was not an outcome that Jenner would have wanted, his idea of nationhood being predominantly cultural. Nationalism in the Cornish context will be further discussed in Chapter Six.


¹⁵² Weber 25.
Chapter One

Nations, Nationalism and Celtic Nationalism

The Theoretical Context

There exist within the modern world several methods for defining and dividing its people. They can be culturally separated by ethnicity, differentiated by the increasingly devalued categorisation of ‘race’, or divided socio-politically into ‘nations’. However, all of these concepts, whether ethnic, political or racial, are interrelated, and they all help us to explain the present with reference to the past.\textsuperscript{153} To have a past is to have an identity and group solidarity, and the past is a malleable resource for both groups and individuals to use in the formation of those identities. As Immanuel Wallerstein observed, ‘the “real past” is inscribed in stone, the “social past” in soft clay’.\textsuperscript{154}

Fundamentally at the heart of the concept of ‘the nation’ is the distinction between ‘us’ and ‘them’ and, quite simply, adhering to a nationality is a way of distinguishing ‘your’ group of people from ‘theirs’. For this reason, the concept of nationhood is important as it is one way in which humans have chosen to delineate themselves, both by comparison and by exclusion. Distinctions like this lead to conflicts, and conflicts to the loss of life: in the modern age wars have been fought for nations. Therefore, the study of nations, and nationality generally, can tell us something fundamental about the nature of people and their seemingly innate desire to differentiate themselves.

\begin{footnotesize}

\textsuperscript{154} Wallerstein 301.
\end{footnotesize}
But defining what actually constitutes a nation has proved problematic. In 2003, whilst debating the treatment of ethnic minorities, the Parliamentary Assembly of the Council of Europe noted that there was ‘no common European legal definition of the concept of “nation”’, but thought it important to try and establish one in order to help address the question of the rights of national minorities in the twenty-first century.\textsuperscript{155} However, in the subsequent study by the European Committee on Legal Affairs and Human Rights a year later, it was concluded that it was ‘difficult, not to say impossible, to arrive at a common definition of the concept of “nation.”’\textsuperscript{156} In some member states, the term ‘nation’ is used in the civic sense, as a legal link between state and citizen, in some, as in Cornwall, it is used in the ethnic sense to denote a people who share a common culture and past, whilst in others it is used in both senses simultaneously.

Henry Jenner was not alone in defining Cornwall as a nation. The regularity with which the word has been, and is, applied to Cornwall reflects its status as more than just another English county.\textsuperscript{157} Often it is coupled with the description of Cornwall as ‘Celtic’, connecting it with the other Celtic nations of Britain, France and Ireland, and Jenner was as emphatic about Cornwall’s Celtic heritage as he was about its claim to nationhood; for him the two were inextricably linked.\textsuperscript{158} He believed that when a community felt itself to be a nation, if it had a sense of its own nationality, then it


\textsuperscript{157} Jenner Papers Box 6, Packet 8 ‘Is Cornwall a Celtic Nation?’ by Henry Jenner. In contemporary literature, see Colin Francis Murley, Cornwall: One of the Four Nations of Britain (Camborne: Cornish Stannary Publications, 1996) and the Mebyon Kernow magazine Cornish Nation.

\textsuperscript{158} Jenner Papers. Box 8, Packet 1. ‘Who are the Celts and what has Cornwall to do with them?’ by Henry Jenner, 1929.
became one, and the way this consciousness of nationhood came into being was through awareness of its own unique history. Thus for Jenner, a nation was firstly defined from within by referencing the insular shared past which differentiated it from its close neighbours. But in the case of Cornwall he also observed certain historical connections with the other ‘nations’ which were already recognised as such during what became known as the Celtic Revival.

Like Henry Jenner, Breton writer Ernest Renan believed that a nation needed to place value on its heritage as it was through remembrance of the ‘glories of the past’ that a nation would garner the collective will to attain similar achievements in the present, in Renan’s phrase: ‘To have accomplished great things together, to wish to do so again, that is the essence for being a nation’. This was Jenner’s fundamental objective for Cornwall, he wished to instil in the Cornish people a sense of understanding and pride in their past achievements in the hope that they would prove an inspiration to that nation in the present time. For both writers the solidarity of the nation was essential for its continued existence and the Cornish Celtic Revival, as well as the more general Celtic Revival can be seen as expressions of this.

Both Max Weber and Karl Deutsch thought that through such cohesion of a group and the collective will to enforce this cohesion in the future, the natural progression of nations was towards becoming political entities. Nation status was ultimately achieved by the attainment of the means to do this: ‘Nationalities turn into nations when they

---

159 Jenner Papers. Box 8, Packet 1. ‘Who are the Celts and what has Cornwall to do with them?’ by Henry Jenner, 1929.

160 Ernest Renan, “Qu’est-ce qu’ une nation?” In Hutchinson and Smith, Nationalism 17.
acquire power to back up their aspirations. Once national consciousness has been raised within a group by the cultivation of a sense of cohesion and ‘an attachment to group symbols’, it is difficult to see how this move towards the politicisation of a nation to become (as Deutsch described it) a ‘nation-state’ could not be an inevitable outcome: as Deutsch stated: ‘All group power thus acquired by members of the nationality leads them to ask for more’. Retrospectively, Deutsch cited the Polish, Czechs and Irish as nations who were perceived as such before their acquisition of political autonomy as they had been ‘states’ in the past.

Henry Jenner did not want this for Cornwall; his was a purely cultural nationalism with no separatist agenda. However, in John Hutchinson’s model of cultural nationalism, Revivalists like Jenner are cast in a more radical role than their description might imply. They may gain inspiration from traditional culture, but they are not traditionalists as their role in their nation is not one of ‘passive isolationism’,\textsuperscript{163} and, whilst expressing admiration for the community, they ‘reject its other-worldliness’.\textsuperscript{164} What may be sought is ‘a revived folk community’, but what actually results is ‘a modern science-based culture with native idioms’.\textsuperscript{165} It is certainly true that in an attempt to re-establish Cornwall as a high civilization with unique achievements, as portrayed by Jenner in \textit{The House of Damnonia}, the Revivalists created both a traditional \textit{and} a modern culture.

Following the establishment of such institutions as the Royal Geological Society of

\textsuperscript{161} Karl W. Deutsch, “Nationalism and Social Communication.” Hutchinson and Smith 29.

\textsuperscript{162} Deutsch 28.

\textsuperscript{163} Hutchinson, “Cultural Nationalism and Moral Regeneration.” Hutchinson and Smith 131.

\textsuperscript{164} Hutchinson, “Cultural Nationalism and Moral Regeneration.” 129.

\textsuperscript{165} Hutchinson, “Cultural Nationalism and Moral Regeneration.” 129.
Cornwall, the Royal Institution of Cornwall and the Royal Cornwall Polytechnic Society in the nineteenth century, those involved in the Cornish Celtic Revival continued to work in the fields of science and education as well as in history and folklore.\textsuperscript{166}

So it could be suggested that the Revivalists in Cornwall follow Hutchinson’s pattern for cultural nationalists: ‘Typically cultural nationalists establish informal and decentralized clusters of cultural societies and journals’.\textsuperscript{167} However with the passing of time these essentially non-political figures ‘are frequently driven into state politics to defend the cultural autonomy of the nation’.\textsuperscript{168} Conflict arises, as Hutchinson observed, when the ‘ageing traditionalists’ and the ‘educated young’ disagree over which path of nationalism to follow. This process was clearly at work in Cornwall in the middle of the twentieth century as the traditionalist cultural nationalists of the Old Cornwall Societies clashed with the younger and more radical members of Tyr ha Tavas.

In part the conflict is fuelled by the gap between what the cultural nationalists are initially inspired to achieve, the revival of their folk-culture, and what they actually do achieve by using this as a foundation. Because of this, Hutchinson argues that cultural nationalism deserves ‘a more positive role in the modernization process’ than has been accorded it by other historians.\textsuperscript{169}


\textsuperscript{167} Hutchinson, “Cultural Nationalism and Moral Regeneration.” 124.

\textsuperscript{168} Hutchinson, “Cultural Nationalism and Moral Regeneration.” 125.

\textsuperscript{169} Hutchinson, “Cultural Nationalism and Moral Regeneration.” 127.
Behind this evocation of the folk on the part of intellectuals and the intelligentsia is, first, a dynamic vision of the nation as a high civilization with a unique place in the development of humanity and, secondly, a corresponding drive to recreate this nation which, integrating the traditional and the modern on a higher level will again arise to the forefront of world progress.¹⁷⁰

What Revivalists actually admire in their own traditional communities, according to Hutchinson, is its human scale, ‘its rootedness in nature, family, locality and religion’.¹⁷¹ What they do not subscribe to is the notion of their people as ‘other-worldly’, as they reject that which could hold any of their people back. Instead these people must be seen as a ‘mobile society’ who interacted with other societies in their past to their benefit and yet were not assimilated into them. This relationship is clearly demonstrated in Jenner’s view of the Cornish people’s egalitarian relationship with the Romans as expressed in The Royal House of Damnonia (see Chapter Six). And this ‘active contact with other societies’ is also an important aspect of progressive nationalism and was clearly at work during the Celtic Revival with the establishment of Pan-Celtic organisations strengthening Celtic unity.¹⁷² However, it could be argued that Jenner’s role contradicts Hutchinson’s argument that Revivalists reject any ‘other-worldly’ view of their community. For Jenner, a belief in a mystical world was a cultural necessity, an important element of the folkloric traditions of a community: to

¹⁷⁰ Hutchinson, “Cultural Nationalism and Moral Regeneration.” 127.

¹⁷¹ Hutchinson, “Cultural Nationalism and Moral Regeneration.” 129.

sustain a belief in fairies, piskies and other such beings was to maintain links with an ancestral Celtic past.

In contrast to Hutchinson’s view, Hobsbawm thought that the link between progressive nationalism and the sort of cultural revivalism undertaken by such nationalist movements was inconsequential: ‘As the case of the British Isles shows, there is […] no necessary connection between cultural revival movements […] and subsequent national agitations or movements of political nationalism, and, conversely such nationalist movements may originally have little or nothing to do with cultural revivalism’.

Conversely, it could also be argued that the Revivalist movements of the late nineteenth and twentieth centuries provided the basis for proto-national groups in the Celtic nations, and, if it is going too far to describe Jenner and his ilk as nationalists in the political sense, then they most certainly provided the foundations for those who would proclaim themselves to be so. What they did was combine selective parts of Cornwall’s past with a contrived heritage and folklore to create an undoubtedly Celtic Cornish ‘nation’. As Gellner stated, ‘[n]ationalism uses the pre-existing, historically inherited proliferation of cultures and cultural wealth, though it uses them very selectively, and it most often transforms them radically. Dead languages can be revived, traditions invented, quite fictitious pristine purities restored’.

But how did the Celtic nations come to be in such a position where they were compelled to reassert their ancient identities in the first place? There are writers who have

---


174 Ernest Gellner, “Nationalism and Modernization.” Hutchinson and Smith, Nationalism 64.
examined the historical reasons for the socio-political marginalisation of Celtic cultures, in particular Michael Hechter. He begins his work, *Internal Colonialism: The Celtic Fringe in British National Development 1536-1966*, by supporting Wallerstein’s assessment of the core-periphery relationship: ‘The core seems to dominate the periphery politically and to exploit it materially’, ‘Peripheral industrialization, if it occurs at all, is highly specialized and generally geared for export ... Decisions about investment, credit and wages tend to be made in the core’.

This model helps to explain how the peripheral status of what Hechter refers to as the ‘Celtic fringe’ was initially established, but his own theory of ‘internal colonialism’ attempts to assess the impact and possible consequences of this ‘colonial’ status. Jenner undoubtedly saw the centre as a threat to Cornish identity in cultural terms, with centralised education and the imposition of a standardised English accent eroding local traditions and differences.

In formulating a theory that attempts to explain the situation of the regions of the Celtic fringe and the nature of Celtic nationalism, Hechter also hoped to examine separatism generally and, through the employment of his ‘internal colonialism’ theory, attempt to discover why separatist movements occur, and where they are likely to happen in the future. Hale noted that Hechter was criticised for assessing the Celtic areas as a whole, as opposed to examining their differing developmental status, but defended the importance of his work: ‘the fact that he did a sociological study of ‘Celtic’ peoples is significant and rare’.

---


Dismissing the diffusion model of social stratification, which posits that over time regional economic inequalities will diminish and peripheral cultural identities will be assimilated into those of the core state, Hechter argued that the very opposite happens. Regional inequalities will be exacerbated over time by the decisions made at the centre as the ‘superordinate group’ confines roles of high status within the nation to its own membership. Meanwhile the peripheral areas will assert their own cultural identities as a reaction against such domination.\textsuperscript{178} Hechter surmised of his theory that, ‘The internal colonial model would therefore seem to provide a more adequate explanation of the persistence of ethnic identity among peripheral groups in complex societies than do diffusion theories portraying the periphery as culturally and economically isolated from the core’.\textsuperscript{179}

In order to assert the importance of the ethnic dimension in the historic suppression of the Celtic nations, Hechter was careful to differentiate the culturally distinctive areas of the Celtic fringe from other equally economically disadvantaged areas. He claimed that in the areas with a distinctly Celtic identity, ethnic considerations would surpass those of class, and it is this which allows for a potential move from the state of assimilation to one of nationhood: ‘in those areas where there is a cultural division of labour, political demands will largely be formulated in ethnic terms, rather than those of social class. For ethnic solidarity may be said to occur whenever a group defines its boundaries in cultural terms’.\textsuperscript{180} Jenner was one who saw the bonds of ethnicity and kinship as

\textsuperscript{178} Hechter, \textit{Internal Colonialism} 9.

\textsuperscript{179} Hechter, \textit{Internal Colonialism} 39.

\textsuperscript{180} Hechter, \textit{Internal Colonialism} 345-346.
binding a people together through their shared history and it could be argued that he placed these far above class as a means of uniting the Cornish people.

However, there are those who dismiss the importance of the role of ethnic discrimination in the subsequent social and economic problems experienced by the ‘fringe’. In reviewing Hechter’s work, William Sloan recognised the value in analysing the role of the Celtic nations within the British Isles as internal colonies.\(^{181}\) Despite this he questioned whether the theory of internal colonialism could not be equally applied to other ‘dependent economy’ situations, therefore dismissing any ideas of Celtic particularity.\(^{182}\) Chapman raises this spatial issue too, noting the need for a more class-based analysis of the persecution of the Celtic peoples of Britain and Ireland: ‘If there is to be talk of the sufferings and oppressions of the Scottish Gael and the Irish, then it is necessary to remember what life was like for the people of industrial and urban England (and Scotland and Wales as well, of course) in the nineteenth century’.\(^ {183}\) However, as will be explored in the next chapter on race and the Celts, class and racial distinctions often corresponded.

Moreover, Hechter was criticised for under-emphasising the idea that Sloan claims Hechter’s analysis clearly demonstrated that it is imperialism that creates ethnic nationalism, ‘and not the suppression of ethnic national feeling which identifies imperialism’.\(^ {184}\) It was Hechter’s ‘obsession with ethnicity’ that Sloan seemed to have

\(^{181}\) Sloan, “Ethnicity or Imperialism?” 113.

\(^{182}\) Sloan, “Ethnicity or Imperialism?” 115.

\(^{183}\) Pittock, Celtic Identity and the British Image 258.

\(^{184}\) Sloan, “Ethnicity or Imperialism?” 115.
the strongest objection to, leading Hechter to ignore the oppressive role played by the imperialist structure of the British Empire. Furthermore, Sloan felt that not only did Hechter view the Celtic fringe as a homogeneous unit, but he failed to acknowledge structural differences within the Celtic regions themselves, ignoring the role of native elites within them.

In response to Sloan’s criticisms, Hechter stated that all of the regions that had significant separatist movements, which include the Celtic regions of Scotland, Wales and Brittany, as well as Catalonia, the Basque regions, Eritrea and Shaba province, were culturally distinctive from their core states. Hechter did not believe that the importance of ethnicity could be overestimated: ‘In all but the rarest cases, separatism is built upon a region’s assertion of ethnic distinctiveness. Its ideological force rests upon this claim to ethnic self-determination. For this reason the study of ethnicity is essential to the analysis of separatism’. Moreover, Hechter was adamant that imperialism was not the cause of separatism.

It is noticeable that Hechter did not include Cornwall in his list of countries with significant ethnic movements, instead noting the ‘relative weakness of Celtic ethnicity in nineteenth and twentieth century Cornwall’. He also stated that although the county was only partially incorporated into England, it was still ‘largely assimilated to

---

185 Sloan, “Ethnicity or Imperialism?” 125.

186 Sloan, “Ethnicity or Imperialism?” 116.


189 Hechter, Internal Colonialism 64.
English culture by the mid-seventeenth century’. However, Payton observed that Hechter’s views were criticised within Cornwall and that his ‘comments on the Cornish situation were essentially unsatisfactory’, revealing his ‘sketchy knowledge of Cornish history’ and his ‘inability to address himself successfully to the case of Cornwall’.

Instead of a weakness of Celtic ethnicity within the county, Deacon noted ‘a pattern of resistance to assimilation’, observing both ‘change and persistence’. He found substantial evidence for Cornwall fitting the internal colonial model as it is ‘relatively underdeveloped and is subject to external control but found evidence of cultural discrimination ‘more ambiguous’.

Thus, writing in 1983, he described the Cornish as ‘a submerged nationality’, happy to define themselves ‘as both Cornish and English’. Despite criticisms of his theory, Deacon concluded that Hechter’s internal colony model ‘provides a useful starting point for an alternative explanation of relations between the Cornish and the central core culture of England’.

However, as noted in the recognition of Cornwall as both English county and Celtic nation, similarities between the Celtic areas of Britain and areas of England that have experienced similar adversity do exist and help to refine the core-periphery relationship from the simple imposition of English culture and politics. By examining the spatial

---

190 Hechter, Internal Colonialism 64-65.
193 Bernard Deacon, “Is Cornwall an Internal Colony?” 263-266.
194 Bernard Deacon, “Is Cornwall an Internal Colony?” 268.
dimension of the relationship it can be seen that it was not so much a general ‘English’
culture that dominated, but more specifically a southern and even metropolitan culture.
As far back as the sixteenth century the core-periphery model can be applied to Britain
as a whole as areas of England, as well as the Celtic regions, were increasingly brought
under control by those in the south of the country. Kearney noted that the reaction of
those in the north, who were ‘by and large opposed to the growing religious, political
and economic influence of the south’, was matched by the Cornish in the Prayer Book
Rebellion of 1549.\footnote{Kearney 111.}

Again in the eighteenth century Kearney identified a distinct industrial ‘northern’
culture in which he paradoxically includes Cornwall with its tin and copper mining.\footnote{Kearney 149.}
In the nineteenth century Kearney posited a religious divide: ‘The contrast between the
cultures of Church and dissent was, to a great extent, one between a largely rural ‘south’
and a heavily industrialised ‘north’.\footnote{Kearney 155.} In this context, Cornwall can be seen to have
more in common with the more geographically remote north of England than the south.
And once more in the twentieth century, Kearney defined an economic split within
Britain which was said to consist of ‘Inner Britain’, i.e. the south-east of England, and
‘Outer Britain’, noting that during the political unrest of the 1920s which culminated in
the General Strike there was ‘very much a struggle between Inner and Outer Britain’,
not just England.\footnote{Kearney 203.}
However, despite an early call for a parliament in York in the North of England, separatist movements did not develop. It could be argued that the lack of any strong ethnic dimension to the collective identity of the region may have been a significant contributing factor to this absence of cultural and political self-assertion. In the north, the Danes and the Vikings had dominated, but as an ethnic group they had not experienced a cultural revival as the Celts had, and therefore their image was, if not a negative one, then not as ethnically defined within the region. In Cornwall, Jenner and his ilk, drawing on an ethnically separate past, had established the Cornish as a nation of Celts with a defined cultural identity, and laid the foundations for the more politically motivated movement that followed.

Meanwhile, Kearney observed another impediment to the success of any separatist movements within the Celtic regions themselves: that of divisions within the regions. ‘During the nineteenth century nationalist movements made some headway, particularly in the case of Ireland and Wales, but the internal cultural differences in those countries prevented any single national solution from being arrived at’. Davies makes a similar observation, noting the cultural and religious division in Wales between the northern and western districts and the rest of the country.

However, Hechter observed that many minority peoples have moved from an assimilated state to nationalism, and in the early twentieth century the Celtic peoples

---

200 Kearney 111.


202 Kearney 215.

203 Norman Davies 965.
became aware of their internal problems (and what had caused them) and began a
process that would eventually lead some of them to (albeit) differing forms of
nationhood.\textsuperscript{204} One of the key indicators of this process for Hechter is the self-assertion
by the Celtic peoples of their own worth, and the value of their culture. Through these
indicators of identity, a defiantly independent nationalism could be established.

In Cornwall, we see the inception of this process with Jenner’s adoption of a distinctly
‘Celtic’ Cornwall, wherein, in a reversal of nineteenth century stereotypes, to be Celtic
was to be superior to being Anglo-Saxon. As Hechter explains: ‘[t]o the extent that
social stratification in the periphery is based on observable cultural differences, there
exists the probability that the disadvantaged group will, in time, reactively assert its own
culture as equal or superior to that of the relatively advantaged core. This may help it
conceive of itself as a separate nation’.\textsuperscript{205} Jenner and his associates were clearly
instrumental in this process in Cornwall.

In describing these peculiarities, both Hobsbawm and Anderson emphasised the crucial
role of invention in their construction. Hobsbawm stressed the importance of invented
traditions, which he defined as those ‘actually invented, constructed and formally
instituted and those emerging in a less easily traceable manner within a brief and datable
period – a matter of a few years perhaps – and establishing themselves with great
rapidity’.\textsuperscript{206} Such inventions occur all the time, but in times of rapid social change or

\textsuperscript{204} Hechter, \textit{Internal Colonialism} xv-xvii.

\textsuperscript{205} Hechter, \textit{Internal Colonialism} 9.

upheaval when the structure of society is disrupted, their production is likely to increase because the process of industrial progress creates ‘voids’ as old social bonds are broken.\textsuperscript{207} As such, Hobsbawm believed that invented traditions could act as warning signals for the condition of the nation: ‘they are important symptoms and therefore indicators of problems which might not otherwise be recognised and developments which are otherwise difficult to identify and to date. They are evidence’.\textsuperscript{208}

Edensor objected to the implications of the term ‘invented’ when applied to traditions as it is implicitly dismissive of any sense of cultural continuity.\textsuperscript{209} Similarly, Pittock argued that ‘The idea that identities are mainly chosen, invented or dreamt up is ... a judgement on the past in the terms of a present agenda’.\textsuperscript{210} An example of this reaffirmation would be the popular Cornish anthem “Trelawny”, written by Rev. Hawker in 1826. As Morton Nance pointed out to Henry Jenner in 1931: ‘Its popularity is much more easily explained if it had a run of many years before it came out that Hawker had written it. A supposedly ancient song would be far more likely to be taken up than one by a modern song writer’.\textsuperscript{211} Grosby also warned of the danger of exaggerating the idea that traditions are ‘invented’, observing that many are merely ‘modified’ or ‘reaffirmed’, ‘[...] to concentrate one’s attention on the so-called invention of tradition is to ignore the problems posed by the existence of nations in better understanding human

\textsuperscript{207} Hobsbawm and Ranger 4-12.

\textsuperscript{208} Hobsbawm and Ranger 12.


\textsuperscript{210} Pittock, Celtic Identity and the British Image 129.

\textsuperscript{211} Henry Jenner Papers, Box 8, Packet 7, Bundle 1. Handwritten letter from Morton Nance to Jenner, 19 May 1931.
To Grosby, the crucial questions were ‘why do humans use traditions from the past to justify the present?’ And ‘why are they used to assert the various kinships that divide humanity, inevitably it might be said, into nations?’ Traditions are undoubtedly invented in some cases, but they are rarely produced without at least some reference to earlier cultural indicators. Any revived language, including Cornish, the supposedly ancient ‘mother-tongue’, as with other symbols of nationhood, create (as Hobsbawm observed) a paradox: ‘modern nations and all their impedimenta generally claim to be the opposite of novel, namely rooted in the remotest antiquity, and the opposite of constructed, namely human communities so “natural” as to require no definition other than self assertion’.  

It could be argued that the invented traditions of the Celtic nations were no more or less ‘invented’ than the grander narratives of the nations which sought to incorporate them. ‘Britain’ was as much a fabrication of historiography as ‘Celtic Cornwall’ and to hold ‘British’ as an ethnicity was no more or less arbitrary than adopting ‘Celtic’. It could even be argued that a localised ‘Celtic’ identity has a greater claim to historical roots. As Walker Connor observed, national consciousness is a mass phenomenon, not an elite one, and although it begins among the elite, the amount of time it takes to disseminate to the majority of the people may take centuries. It could therefore be said to flourish more easily within smaller groups.

---


213 Eric Hobsbawm, “The Nation as Invented Tradition.” Hutchinson and Smith, Nationalism 76.

Such a theory seems to confirm the strength and longevity of regional identities like those held within the Celtic nations, whilst casting scepticism over the alleged strength of more recent state nationalisms. Connor also stated that as national consciousness is a mass phenomenon, nation formation happened, at the least, later than is usually assumed and even, in some cases, not at all.\textsuperscript{215} He posited that even in the late nineteenth century, identities were still so localised that it would be inaccurate to ascribe a ‘national’ consciousness to the majority of the people within a nation.\textsuperscript{216}

Connor used France to illustrate his theory that nationalism as a phenomenon happened at a much later time than had previously been assumed. Having read Eugen Weber’s \textit{Peasants into Frenchmen: The Modernization of Rural France, 1870-1914}, he claimed that: ‘To the mass of peasants – and therefore most of the inhabitants of France – the meaningful world and identity seldom extended beyond the village’.\textsuperscript{217} The argument posited by Connor, that loyalties up until the nineteenth century remained localised and there was little recognition of nationality amongst the majority of the populations of nations, may account for the fact that within Britain the animosity directed at those from the Celtic parts of the British Isles was unmatched by anything administered to other nationhoods. The Celts fulfilled the role of a ‘primitivist’ peoples to those within the English nation in a way that was not applied to ‘foreign’ peoples. As Pittock observed, ‘It is arguable that in the eighteenth century more xenophobia was directed internally in

\textsuperscript{215} Connor 154-159.

\textsuperscript{216} Connor 154-159.

\textsuperscript{217} Connor 154.
the British Isles than externally towards France and other rivals. Furthermore, as a consequence of the role attached to the Celtic peoples in the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries as ‘other’, the subconscious linking of them to other ‘foreign’ peoples was established at this time and employed in a discriminatory manner when British nationalism was in the ascendency.

The success of the Empire was an important contributory factor to this burgeoning sense of British nationalism, with David Powell describing this as ‘a growing sense of Britishness’ in the nineteenth century. Although for much of the century, as in France, the outlook of the majority of the British people remained distinctly localised in its nature, this parochialism was progressively eroded by an increased political, cultural and economic integration, compounded by the First World War (which encouraged a sense of national unity against a common enemy), as central government policy expanded the role of the state. Powell also observed that, ‘Industrialization and the communications revolution of the Victorian period were powerful integrating factors, uniting disparate regional economies into a national industrial framework’. It was a trend that continued throughout the twentieth century as the educational system became more standardised (a trend towards which the objections of Henry Jenner are explored in Chapter Six) and government took a greater role in the management of industry, as well as providing social welfare on a hitherto unprecedented scale.

This imposition of the central state on peripheral localities was achieved through the

---

218 Pitock, Celtic Identity and the British Image 25.

219 Powell 175.

220 Powell 250.
various means under its control: socially, it had control of the education system as well as a large degree of control over the mass media, and centralised political and economic power which allowed decisions to be imposed on the peripheries in relation to the types of new industry that would be located there. The consequences of this social and economic dominance had corresponding incumbencies inherent in the power relationship between the two areas. As Reece noted:

The postwar history of national planning in Europe demonstrates that central policy makers typically view regions at the periphery mainly as zones for the supply of cheap labour, for the investment of public funds on such relatively non-remunerative projects as military bases, hospitals and educational facilities, and for the development of strictly seasonal industries like tourism. In each case the long-term consequence is to condemn the inhabitants of such regions to chronically lower incomes and standards of living than those enjoyed by citizens nearer the centre.\textsuperscript{221}

This seems to describe the economic situation in Cornwall in the twentieth century, an area of low wages and seasonal employment heavily dependent on its unpredictable tourist industry. As a result of this, far from believing, as Delaney presumed (see introduction), that the Celtic nations would find themselves increasingly culturally subjugated, Reece argued the opposite. He conjectured that the recognition of oppression through economic means, combined with the idea that cultural repression and discrimination had been imposed upon the Celtic peoples, was a catalyst for political action. It appears that the forecast that as a society moves towards modernity,

\textsuperscript{221} Reece 231.
and what Reece referred to as ‘majority nationalist feeling’ increases, ‘local ethnic sentiments’ would correspondingly diminish has been proved wrong.\textsuperscript{222}

A. D. Smith identified a correlation between periods of social upheaval such as that experienced by Cornwall in the early twentieth century, and the emergence of ethnic assertion through the employment of tradition, be it invented, reinterpreted or rediscovered.\textsuperscript{223} For Smith these myths serve an important social function: ‘the myths represent a means of adapting to rapid change’.\textsuperscript{224} The coming of mass tourism to Cornwall represented just such a threat to local identity, with traditional events manipulated for the tourist market, and historical sites, like Tintagel, assigned with newly imposed identities. As to why these myths are employed in the first instance, Smith asserted that they serve the intellectuals within society to begin with: ‘By tracing a distinguished pedigree for his nation, he [the intellectual] also enhances the position of his circle and activity; he is no longer an ambiguous ‘marginal’ on the fringes of society, but a leader on the advancing column of the reawakening nation’.\textsuperscript{225} Although it is true that Jenner constructed a noble heritage for the Cornish nation with The House of Damnonia, it was a consequence, rather than intent, that his social position was enhanced. Jenner had a long and successful career in London, he was acquainted with some of the most important people of his time, and was far from being an ‘ambiguous marginal’: he chose to move away from ‘the centre’ to ‘peripheral’ Cornwall, indeed he chose to be Cornish.

\textsuperscript{222} Reece 6.

\textsuperscript{223} Anthony D. Smith 83.

\textsuperscript{224} Anthony D. Smith 84.

\textsuperscript{225} Anthony D. Smith 84.
The Celtic nations, to varying degrees, have continued to assert their own identities and appeal for some level of autonomy stimulated by the recognition of their inferior status within the larger states. As Reece noted: ‘When such demands combine with widespread feeling within a minority that its members possess a distinct ethnic identity, then ethnic minority nationalism becomes a political force with which the dominant majority must ultimately reckon’. Indeed, it can be this very inferiority that accompanies minority status that attracts people to define themselves as ‘Celtic’. In commenting on the psychology of minority nationalism, Maryon McDonald observed that:

Nobody likes to identify with ‘oppressors’ or perpetrators of ‘genocide’, and anyone of any social conscience likes to feel that he or she is on the side of the oppressed. This simple but none the less compelling moral structure is but one aspect of the powerful symbolism that the Celts have working for them.

However, there are those who would deny the Celtic peoples their heritage and history, like Delaney who claimed that ‘it cannot be argued that a modern person living in a Celtic land ought to be regarded as a Celt any more than the invention of tartan may be accredited to the Celts’. Malcolm Chapman also denies any historical or cultural

---

226 Reece 225.

227 Maryon McDonald, We Are Not French! Language, Culture and Identity in Brittany (London: Routledge, 1898) 98.

228 Delaney 225.
links between the Celts of antiquity and those who recognise themselves as Celts in the present, and furthermore, these people are a distinctly inferior marginalised other: ‘Because ‘the Celts’ have consistently been peripheral, they have always seemed backward and strange to the centre, from which our theories of the social world were typically constructed’. Chapman links the triumph of a nationalist British agenda with a romanticisation of the peripheral areas of Britain: ‘There is, I believe, a close relationship between the final incorporation of the entire island into subdued civility, and the appearance of an idealisation of difference romanticism of internal ethnic variety that is a British invention’.

One of Amy Hale’s main criticisms of Chapman’s work is that he denied those who were from the peripheries any role in the construction of their own identities when he stated that: ‘Those from the periphery who seek self-presentation upon a larger stage might glory in the vision, but their script is written by others’. Similarly, Deacon identified what he described as ‘an under-awareness of the role of the Cornish people in making their own past’. Chapman’s view negates the role of men like Jenner who spent so much of his life on the ‘larger stage’ interacting with many of the key people of his time, and could be described as both a central and local figure.

Perhaps Chapman’s most damning condemnation was levelled at the ideas of both

---

229 Chapman 69.

230 Chapman 95.

231 Chapman 123.

232 Pittock, Celtic Identity and the British Image 225.

233 Deacon, Cornwall: A Concise History 182.
Celtic nationhood and a modern brotherhood of those nations:

There is much naïve terminological confusion behind the idea of the ‘Celtic nations’. From what has already been said, it will be clear that the notion that there is something that Scotland, Ireland, Wales, Cornwall and Man have in common, because they are ‘Celtic’, and the notion that they are thus similarly differentiated from England, which is not Celtic but rather ‘Anglo-Saxon’, are the product of lazy thinking or half-educated silliness.234

Instead of accepting that the term ‘Celtic’ may be used positively to confer solidarity upon a certain group of people, Chapman thought it a ‘categorical necessity’ within the British Isles to describe those who were ‘not English’: it is the very presence and dominance of England that leads to the imposition of this term, and the Celts were only united by their opposition of the dominant central power. By concentrating on ‘Celt’ as an anthropological, rather than a linguistic category, Chapman was able to present a case for the lack of real communality between the various Celtic nations. However, the Celtic languages have helped to bind those who regard themselves as Celts together, particularly in Cornwall, where those who speak Cornish can be understood by those who speak Breton, and the revived Cornish language has borrowed words from the Welsh. Jenner had made a speech to the Breton Gorsedd in Cornish and found himself well understood by the Breton speakers present,235 and he acknowledged the similarities

234 Pittock, Celtic Identity and the British Image 238.

235 Williams 68.
of the two languages in his *Handbook of the Cornish Language*. Such common cultural foundations must surely generate the feelings of commonality that Chapman dismissed as groundless (see page 94).

However, in the early twentieth century, it must be acknowledged that Cornwall’s ancient Celtic language was no longer in common use and hadn’t been since the eighteenth century, and even in the ‘sister nation’ of Wales where the Celtic tongue was still spoken Jenner foresaw its demise, the English language being set to prevail. However, he believed that this would make no difference to national consciousness in either place; it would remain ‘immortal’. Jenner identified how relatively inconsequential a common language was, using Switzerland as an example of a country which recognised itself, and was acknowledged by others, to be a nation despite being composed of inhabitants who spoke different languages.

One of the reasons why it is so difficult to assess the importance of Celtic nationalism, and why so many writers have such differing views on its importance, is because of the vastly differing interpretations of the relationship between the ‘peripheral’ Celtic nations and their respective ‘central’ nation states. Simon James’ opinion on the subject is that the relationship has been a disruptive one: ‘It is manifestly obvious that relations

---


237 Jenner Papers. Box 8, Packet 1. ‘Who are the Celts and what has Cornwall to do with them?’ by Henry Jenner, 1929.

238 Jenner Papers Box 8, Packet 1. ms for ‘Who are the Celts and what has Cornwall to do with them?’ by Henry Jenner. 28

between the peoples of the isles have often been violent and destructive, and indeed that conflict and fear of, and contempt for, those who are different, have been fundamental to the very creation and development of identities’.\textsuperscript{240} This view is in stark contrast to Chapman who sees the history of relations between the Celtic nations and the centralised power of the British state as fairly benign: ‘The relationship of Great Britain to the Celtic fringe has been endurably peaceful and stable for most of the last few centuries ... it is because of that stability that the Celtic fringe can imagine a history of continuous and undirectional oppression going back centuries.’\textsuperscript{241}

Although Hale found Chapman’s work to be valuable in its explicit analysis of Celtic stereotyping, she doubted whether he intended for this aspect of his work to be recognised, particularly as, despite the evidence within the text, ‘he refuses to admit to the fact that he is dealing with a discourse of oppression’.\textsuperscript{242} Murray Pittock’s objections, like Hale’s, were to Chapman’s assertions about the legitimacy (or lack thereof) of the moniker ‘Celtic’, and that he (Chapman) ignored the notion that there is an ‘imagined community’ of Celtic peoples, instead seeing their identity in terms of mere opposition: they have been romanticised as wild, savage and idealistic in contrast to those at the centre. However, there is a problem with this denial of Celticism in that British identity has, in the past, been expressed through its opposition to the Celts. Ultimately, Pittock worried that those writers who expressed views of the Celts in purely ethnic terms exacerbated prejudices which allow historians to write about them in such narrow ethnic terms, denying any political or geographical dimension to their

\textsuperscript{240} Simon James 143.

\textsuperscript{241} Chapman 257.

\textsuperscript{242} Hale, “Foot in the Mouth or Foot in the Door?” 167.
identity.\textsuperscript{243} Meanwhile, according to Pittock, the Celts as a people have expressed their own identity in civic and territorial terms, casting themselves in the role of ‘countries’ rather than ‘fringe’ nations.\textsuperscript{244}

Pittock did, however, agree with the assessment of Hechter that it is ‘tempting’ to view Wales, Scotland and Ireland as colonies, subject as they were to the denigration of their culture and the misrepresentation of their people. As he stated: ‘the Irish experience in the early twentieth century increased the degree to which some Scots and Welshmen began to view the plight of their countries as a colonial one’.\textsuperscript{245} However, as well as denigrating other cultures, part of the ‘glory of Empire’ was its diversity and Pittock noted a ‘degree of complicity’ in this celebration of localism.\textsuperscript{246} He concluded that the argument that the experience of the Celtic nations was a ‘colonial’ one cannot be dismissed. As Collis noted, throughout its history the term ‘Celt’ was a political one as much as an ethnic one, and in Britain and Ireland in the late nineteenth century, Celticity became a political phenomenon extending beyond the realms of language and into culture.\textsuperscript{247}

In agreement with Pittock’s assessment of the Celtic nations as having ‘colonial’ traits, Philip Dodd noted that the use of the word ‘colony’ in relation to Cornwall as a Celtic nation was ‘unsurprising’. In his examination of the extent of the colonisation of the


\textsuperscript{244} Pittock, \textit{Celtic Identity and the British Image} 6-7.

\textsuperscript{245} Pittock, \textit{Celtic Identity and the British Image} 109.

\textsuperscript{246} Pittock, \textit{Celtic Identity and the British Image} 106.

\textsuperscript{247} Collis 195-197.
Celts by the English, Dodd chose to use the role of the Newlyn School of artists, a
group of ‘outsiders’ who chose to move to St. Ives, as an example. Ignoring the part any
local initiatives may have played in the construction of Celtic Cornish identity, Dodd
attributed the tenacity of this particular aspect of identity to external forces, commenting
of the Newlyn School: ‘what was more determining was their construction of Cornwall
as Celtic. Inspired by the example of those artistic colonies in Celtic Brittany, the
colonists […] stabilized and fixed the identity of the Cornish as that of ancient
communities, closer to nature than metropolitan England’.248 He went on to extend his
analysis of the subordinate relationship between the Cornish and their ‘colonists’ to all
Celtic peoples: ‘The fate of Cornwall at the hands of the colonists may be taken as a
metaphor for the general relationship between the Celts and the English. The Celts are
licensed in their unique contribution to and place in the national culture: the cost is that
they know their peripheral place as the subject of the metropolitan centre’.249

This position has been strongly criticised by several writers, including Deacon, Cole
and Tregidga in Mebyon Kernow and Cornish Nationalism, who stated that:

the “post-Celtic” revisionists make a false (and patronising) assumption
that things only get discovered in the “centre” before being imposed on
the periphery. This ignores the way that, much earlier in the eighteenth
and early nineteenth centuries, the Cornish intelligentsia had already
constructed its own ethnic history ... in searching for their own origins

248 Philip Dodd, “Englishness and the National Culture.” Boswell and Evans Representing the Nation: A

249 Dodd 97.
they had rediscovered their Celtic past well before it was “invented” by the English. ²⁵⁰

Those involved in the Cornish Celtic Revival continued the work of the early pioneers of a new Cornish identity, constructing from within new ideas of what it meant to be a Cornish Celt, as well as establishing new and revived symbols of nationhood. The legacy of their work can be seen in the proliferation of the use of the flag of St. Piran, which was co-opted and popularised by the Revivalists. As Deacon noted: ‘this explicitly Cornish symbol, formerly confined to the Cornish cultural revival, is becoming embedded in local culture’, its use having extended beyond the confines of the ethnoregionalist movement to be seen at demonstrations of a politically wider nature, as well as now being used in an official capacity on the logo for tourist sites within the county. ²⁵¹

Such symbols of national pride make some observers optimistic for the future strength of Cornish ethnic identity. Historian Norman Davies observed that although the last Cornish speaker died in 1799, ‘two hundred years later, Cornish societies were among the most energetic on the worldwide Celtic circuit’, and despite the death of its language over two centuries ago, its revival gave hope that ‘dead voices could sing’.²⁵² And, by forging links with other Celtic nations, as Jenner did, this sense of nationalism was strengthened with what can be defined as a distinctly ‘Celtic’ nationalism. Once such an


²⁵² Norman Davies 976.
identity was established, those cultural nationalists who followed the early Celtic Revivalists realised that in order to help defend their newly appreciated cultural autonomy, they would need to engage in politics at a state level. In Cornwall this led to the formation of Mebyon Kernow, and to its subsequent transformation to a political party.

However, as *The Guardian* pointed out in an article ridiculing many aspects of culture in the South West of England, ‘niche nationalism’ is still a relatively weak political force in Cornwall. In the 2005 general election, it reported, Mebyon Kernow only received 3,552 votes, ‘2,759 fewer than the Monster Raving Loonies’. In assessing the results of Mebyon Kernow in elections, Deacon readily admitted that overall when compared to the successes enjoyed by the SNP or Plaid Cymru, it has performed ‘very poorly’, which compounds the idea that regional nationalism has failed in Cornwall compared to these other Celtic nations. However, when compared to the results achieved by Breton regionalist candidates in France, Deacon discovered that electoral failure was not limited to the Cornish movement. Deacon posited the theory that it may be possible for a distinct sense of regional identity to exist without a correspondingly successful ethnoregionalist party. There are other reasons for the failure of ethnoregionalist political parties other than an absence of regionalist identity, including a lack of internal resources and internal institutions, factionalism within the regional party itself, and a lack of media interest; and most of these factors are beyond

---


the control of those within the region.\textsuperscript{256}

As a more positive demonstration of Cornish separatist identity, and outside the realm of party politics, \textit{The Times} reported that 50,000 Cornish people signed the petition calling for a referendum on Cornish devolution: ‘That was one-tenth of the people in the county’. In the same article it also stated that there was ‘disillusionment’ in Cornwall, ‘and a sense of being overlooked’.\textsuperscript{257} In Cornwall, discrimination is perceived as a real problem by many of its inhabitants. As Philip Payton noted, in 1992 the Commission for Racial Equality found that ‘a substantial number of indigenous Cornish people ... feel disadvantaged compared with “incomers” in relation to class, income, housing, employment.’\textsuperscript{258} Despite discontent within Cornwall, Hechter and Levi commented that ‘it is noteworthy that in the area of Celtic nationalism in the British Isles there should be so much of a Welsh problem, yet so little of a Cornish one’ and concluded that the explanation for this apparent inconsistency ‘must lie in the realms of history’.\textsuperscript{259}

It could be argued that as Jenner’s personal vision for the Revival had no political agenda, as a result the movement as a whole within the county remained apolitical for much of the early twentieth century. However, because nationalism is a concept that identifies a group of individuals with a nation, by proclaiming Cornwall to be a nation,


\textsuperscript{257} Richard Johnson, “Passport to Padstow.” \textit{Sunday Times Magazine} 13 Apr. 2008: 42.


\textsuperscript{259} Michael Hechter, and Margaret Levi, “Ethno-Regional Movements in the West.” Hutchinson and Smith, \textit{Nationalism} 184-185.
and the Cornish people to be constituent in that nation, Jenner was giving the Cornish-Celtic Revival a nationalist agenda, however unintentionally or ambiguously expressed that was. Although Jenner had no political agenda for Cornwall himself, the need for a revival of Cornish nationhood was born out of a necessity to see Cornwall receive greater recognition and that has led to a more politicised nationalist movement.

But, since proclamations of the lack of Cornish nationalist fervour, Deacon stated that there has been ‘sparse academic discussion’ of the case of Cornwall (something that this thesis has aimed to address), and, despite there being what he described as a ‘categorization problem’ with Cornwall and Cornish nationalism, there is no doubt that ‘a Cornish nationalist movement exists’.260 Deacon pointed to previous explanations of Cornish nationalism which had either cast it as a Celtic region and therefore assumed an affiliation with general Celtic nationalism, or have ignored this aspect and viewed it as an English county which allowed many social scientists to cast its nationalist movement as ‘indistinct, invisible, even inconvenient’. What was needed, stated Deacon, was an approach that acknowledged Cornwall’s hybrid experience, since, as a consequence of its hybridity, ‘Cornwall occupies an intriguing and difficult conceptual space’.261 Henry Jenner acknowledged this twin identity, promoting Cornwall’s separate Celtic past but recognising the county’s place as part of, and loyal to, England, whilst also acknowledging its role within the wider Empire.

In Cornwall itself, Deacon observed that, unlike in Wales, ‘claims to non-Englishness


have always been contested.’ 262 Even within the Celtic nations themselves, Cornwall was initially denied its status by the Celtic Association. In *County, Nation, Ethnic Group: The Shaping of the Cornish Identity*, Deacon stated: ‘It is my contention here that the Cornish can best be viewed as an example of a people who created their own ethno-history but were unable and/or unwilling to transform themselves into a nation, partly because of the claims of a competing English ethno-history’. 263 The cultural Revivalists of Cornwall’s Celtic Revival in the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries would seem to have left a legacy that has failed to generate the necessary impetus needed for what Jenner wished to be a Cornish *nation*. This may, in part, be due to the work which the Revivalists concentrated most of their efforts on, their having more in common with those who Hutchinson described as ‘traditionalists’ rather than ‘Revivalists’. Instead of being ‘driven into state politics to defend the cultural autonomy of the nation’, 264 and rejecting ‘otherworldliness and its barriers to the equal contribution of all groups’; 265 they had instead displayed too much of the ‘passive isolationism’ of traditionalists, failing to represent the nation as a ‘progressive culture’. 266 Certainly Jenner himself was a cultural, not a political, nationalist and as his influence within the movement as a whole was so great, it could be argued that he stifled any attempts at politicising the cause of Cornish nationalism.


264 Hutchinson, “Cultural Nationalism and Moral Regeneration.” 125.

265 Hutchinson, “Cultural Nationalism and Moral Regeneration.” 129.

266 Hutchinson, “Cultural Nationalism and Moral Regeneration.” 131.
However, such claims to nationalism are still made and, it would seem, with increasing fervour, both in Cornwall and elsewhere. Increasingly, Cornwall looks towards Europe, rather than to Britain, in its quest for greater autonomy and the growing importance of the European state to its minorities is an important modern trend. In 2003 Deacon, Cole and Tregidga noted that the nationalism espoused by ‘submerged’ peoples and nations, such as those who constitute Europe’s ethnic minorities, ‘aims to reform over-centralised state structures’ in a ‘bottom-up’ approach which ‘tends towards radicalism in its politics’. By implementing concessionary measures from the ‘top-down’ the policy makers of the Council of Europe are hoping that states may circumvent the need for minorities’ initial recourse to radicalism.

In 2006 the Council for Europe clarified its position on ethnic groups:

The [Parliamentary] Assembly believes it is necessary to strengthen recognition of every European citizen’s links with his identity, culture, traditions and history, to allow any individual citizen or the civic nation to which he belongs as a citizen, and, more specifically, to satisfy the growing aspirations of minorities which have a heightened sense of belonging to a certain cultural nation.

It went on to encourage member states to adopt new legislation to protect their minority

267 Deacon, Cole, and Tregidga 3.

268 “The Concept of “Nation.””
cultures and apply positive discrimination, particularly within those minority regions.

All member states of the Council for Europe have also adopted the 2005 Warsaw Declaration and Action Plan, which states: ‘We shall foster European identity and unity, based on shared fundamental values, respect for our common heritage and cultural diversity […] We will continue our work on national minorities, thus contributing to the development of democratic stability’. 269 Not only has the policy of the European Council been devised to protect minority cultures, it is recognised that by protecting the rights of the various peoples of the Union, future conflicts may be avoided: ‘Europe’s chequered history has shown that the protection of national minorities is essential for the maintenance of peace and the development of democratic stability. A society that considers itself pluralist must allow the identities of its minorities, which are a source of enrichment for our societies, to be preserved and to flourish.’ 270 Such a policy of concession from national states would seem to represent a positive move towards avoiding future conflicts based on the dissatisfaction or frustrations of those within nationhoods who are most encumbered by the existing state structure. Because it is worth noting that nationalism, even Celtic nationalism, is not without its dangers in the modern world, and there are worrying echoes of biological racial theory in these recent scientific attempts to determine ethnic origins in Britain.

Innovations in DNA sampling claim to allow people to find out their ancestral groupings, including if they are ‘Celtic’ in origin. Once again the human need to


differentiate is supported by science as a way of separating ‘us’ from ‘them’. There are those who do not differentiate between ethnic and racial pride, and view any attempts by what are seen by some as the ‘ancient races’ of Europe to assert their identity as an attempt to promote their racial superiority. The rise of far-right groups and neo-Nazi groups in Europe also have worrying echoes from history and the group Caorann (Celts Against Oppression, Racism and Neo-Nazism) have identified a worrying trend with far-right groups co-opting Celtic symbolism, described by the group as ‘cultural theft’, and trying to recruit people of Celtic heritage to their cause.271

In 2005, the Irish Tribune reported on the case of Sharon Ebanks, an election candidate for the British Nationalist Party in Birmingham, who had been accused of sporting a Celtic cross tattoo as a neo-Nazi symbol. In defending herself, Ebanks claimed that the tattoo represented a ‘Skibbereen Cross’, commemorating Irish victims of the famine, a celebration of ‘a piece of white history, nothing more, nothing less’. The BNP itself declared that the Celtic cross was not a Nazi symbol; however, the use of the term ‘white history’ would seem to confirm the connection between the symbol and racism.272 Similarly, an outlet in Leeds became the subject of anti-fascist protests for selling what was deemed to be a flag brandishing the ‘Nazi Celtic cross’ used by the white supremacist organisation Stormfront.273


From one end of the twentieth century to the other, the image of the Celts has undergone a huge change: from the racial perspective of the nineteenth century, the Celts were an inferior people, whereas from the ethnic perspective of the twenty-first century, it has become desirable to be associated with them. It can only be hoped that the vision for a revival in cultural identity as perceived by Jenner and others can remain free from the shadow of racism that once so denigrated the Celtic people, but now threatens to glorify them.
Chapter Two

Race, the Celts and Cornwall

Why Did Henry Jenner ‘Write Back’?

The prejudices experienced by the Celtic peoples as discussed in the introduction might seem hard to understand today when many people are so proud and willing to define themselves as Celts. In 2006, the BBC screened a series entitled *Face of Britain* incorporating research from Walter Bodmer’s ‘People of the British Isles’ study which examined volunteers’ genetic variants in order to determine whether individuals were Celts – or ‘Ancient Britons’ – Vikings or Anglo-Saxons.\(^{274}\) When asked at the beginning of the testing process what the participants wanted the results to tell them, project manager Bruce Winney stated that most people wanted to be Celts or Vikings: ‘being Anglo-Saxon was definitely third on the list’.\(^{275}\) In his book *Blood of the Isles*, Brian Sykes concurred that the division between the ancient races of this land still existed, and history has favoured the Celt: ‘Even now, the division between Saxon and Briton ... is still not far beneath the surface. The Britons, personified by Arthur, are the truly indigenous people of the whole of Britain and the Saxons are treacherous imposters’.\(^{276}\)

In the Celtic regions of Wales and Cornwall, the volunteers questioned in Winney’s survey were keen to be genetically identified as Celts. When Non Torries from Wales

---

\(^{274}\) The genetic variants included those concerning rhesus negativity in blood tests and versions of the MC1R gene from DNA tests. See Robin McKie, *Face of Britain: How Our Genes Reveal the History of Britain* (London, Simon and Schuster, 2006) 120-1.

\(^{275}\) Sykes 122.

\(^{276}\) Sykes 52.
was told that she was 1.4 times more likely to be a Celt than an Anglo-Saxon, she was
‘delighted’, ‘I know I am Celtic and Welsh but it is good to have something like this,
which you feel so deeply, confirmed by science’. She also stated that she felt an
affinity with the people from the rest of Britain’s Celtic fringe in Cornwall, Ireland and
Scotland thanks not only to a shared heritage, but ancient languages: ‘I think this has to
do with the amount of time our people have all been living in these lands ... We have
been speaking languages like Welsh or Gaelic for much longer than the rest of the
country has been speaking English and that binds us in a special way.

The people found by the study to be most like the Ancient Britons were those in
Cornwall because, as Bodmer asserted, it is where the Celts would most likely have
been forced by the pressure of Anglo-Saxon expansion. The research in Cornwall was
conducted in conjunction with the Morrab Library in Penzance, who were asked to find
suitable volunteers for the project, the main stipulation being that they, both of their
parents and all four grandparents, must have been born and bred in Cornwall. The
library had no problem finding enough people keen to prove their Celtic connections.
One Cornish participant, Ken Sweet, whose ancestors were tin miners, was happy that
he was 1.9 times more likely to be Celt than Anglo-Saxon:

I am absolutely thrilled. It was good to have it confirmed that I am
a Cornish man. As far as I can see my ancestors could have been
among the very first people who came to Britain ... I think that

277 McKie, Face of Britain 123.

278 McKie, Face of Britain 54.

279 Personal conversations with participating staff at the Morrab Library, Penzance, November 2009.
makes us very special people and shows why my family feels such a bond with Cornwall.  

The team who conducted this survey are hoping to return to Cornwall in the future, this time to map the faces of local people.

When summarising modern attitudes to the Celts, Robin McKie, author of *Face of Britain*, was keen to differentiate between the scientific approach of the survey, which recognised the Celts as a biologically identifiable people, and the mystical construction of the Celts. He concluded that ‘a great deal of nonsense’ had been spoken on the subject with reference to lost civilizations and Arthurian kingdoms, to Druidic ancestors and a Celtic twilight. However, it is probable that the identity construct that McKie objected so strongly to, helped to sustain the Celts as a relevant and desirable group. By contrast with the mythical construction, what the modern methods of analysis of blood testing and DNA sampling could show was that those calling themselves Celts, according to McKie, had ‘the oldest bloodline in the country’ and also spoke ‘the most ancient languages in the British Isles’. Accordingly, he concluded: ‘That makes them a little bit separate and a little bit special’.

Despite McKie’s misgivings about their romanticised image, there is now obviously a positive association with the Celts as a people which was far from the case in Victorian

---

280 McKie, *Face of Britain* 123–4.

281 Personal conversations with participating staff at the Morrab Library, Penzance, November 2009.

282 McKie, *Face of Britain* 55.

283 McKie, *Face of Britain* 55.
times. During that era there were a few who did not subscribe to the conviction that some races were inferior to others, or that the Celts were a separate ‘race’ of people with definable traits who belonged in this ‘inferior’ category, but they were in the minority.\(^{284}\) Being a Celt in Victorian Britain brought a series of negative connotations, especially when compared to the Anglo-Saxon.\(^{285}\)

It has been argued that the roots of this Saxon English sense of superiority lay in the Reformation, when the Protestant church needed to detach itself from Roman Catholicism. In the newly created myth of descent, the English originated, not from some united band of defeated ancient Britons, but from a victorious race of Saxons, drawing inspiration from the Teutonic German Protestant church which had successfully triumphed over the ‘corrupt’ Church of Rome. This myth was to divide the British people, with the English as the superior race and the Celts grouped together as a defeated people.\(^{286}\) Conversely, the Irish and Cornish saw Protestantism as an imposition by the English, the situation in Cornwall resulting in the Prayer Book Rebellion of 1549.

By the nineteenth century the image of the Celts had incorporated earlier stereotypes of a poetic, yet troublesome race and romanticised them in a way which proved


detrimental to many of the people of the Celtic nations, allowing them to be portrayed as sub-human and therefore treated as such. Simon Trezise observed that during the Victorian period it was that racial definition of the Celt that dominated in the popular media genres of journalism, travel writing, melodramas, fiction and cartoons. The Irish were the most vilified of all the Celtic peoples and the characterisation of them, and the subsequent contestation of this characterisation, was, as Murray Pittock claimed, to have ‘the profoundest impact on the manner in which Celtic identity was expressed in the British Isles’.

Ernest Renan was just one of the writers who, although he eschewed eugenics, defined the Celts as a ‘racial’ group in the sense that they shared an origin, had common languages and belonged to defined geographical regions. Their traits, as he described them, were the same ones that the Victorians associated with children; they were imaginative and emotional, passionate and playful: in other words, they were a race in need of control. Strongly influenced by Renan, Matthew Arnold similarly espoused the notion that the Celt and the Teuton were ‘separated by an impassable gulf’. Unlike the Celtic Revivalists, who used positive aspects of the Celtic racial stereotype as a way of re-imagining the Celt in the present, the Romanticism of the nineteenth century, inspired by writers like Renan and Arnold, embalmed the Celtic

---

287 Trezise 55.

288 Pittock, *Celtic Identity and the British Image* 44.


291 Trezise 58.
people in the past, providing a welcome diversion from the progressive commercial age, whilst emphasising their inferiority. What men like Matthew Arnold saw as the future of Celtic culture was that it becomes a relic – an area of study that should become subsumed into English culture. Robert Young described this process thus:

‘Never was the colonial relation to other cultures in the nineteenth century more clearly stated: the force of ‘modern civilization’ destroys the last vestiges of a vanquished culture to turn it into an object of academic study’. It was this Romanticism, combined with discrimination, that defined the unequal relationship between Saxon and Celt and established the myth of the Celt as inferior in character and achievement – the very antithesis of the progressive Saxon.

In her analysis of the newspaper coverage of the ‘witch-burning’ at Clonmel in Ireland, in which a group of nine men, including the woman’s husband and father, tortured then murdered Bridget Cleary, believing her to be possessed or a fairy changeling, Angela Bourke identified the influence of both colonialist attitudes to the Irish and romantic Celticism. She observed the conflict between the scientific middle-class optimism of those in the cities and the isolation from the progressive forces of modernism experienced by those in the more peripheral regions of Britain. It was this gap between the ‘enlightened’ British justice system and the ‘incomprehensible, primitive superstitions of a colonised people’ that were made evident by the case, as the guilty men claimed that they genuinely believed Bridget to have been possessed and were trying to evict the spirit from her to save her

---

292 See also Trezise 55.

293 Young 71.

294 Bourke 580.
The story was widely reported and revealed much about contemporary attitudes to the superstitions and beliefs of the Irish, and of the Celts in general: it was a brutal crime that not only tainted a community, but an entire country and the Celts as a people. Popular author E. F. Benson, whose father had been Bishop of Truro before becoming Archbishop of Canterbury, had taken great personal interest in the case and studied the crime carefully, concluding in an article in *The Nineteenth Century* journal that the men should not be charged with murder, but with manslaughter. The judge who presided over the case was convinced by their malicious intent, accusing them of ‘moral and religious darkness’ and ‘monstrous darkness of the human mind’. Benson’s defence of the perpetrators rested in his attitude to them not as ‘dark’, but as primitive and child-like and therefore not sufficiently evolved to be in control of their own actions. Instead they were guided by their ignorant beliefs: ‘it would be in the spirit of that wise and merciful law which ordains that boys under a certain age may not be hanged for capital offences to spare these men, even if they are condemned; for children they are if, as can, I think, be proved, they have acted under the influence of such superstitious fears, as

295 Bourke 554.


297 Best remembered now for his Mapp and Lucia novels, Benson’s ghost stories were very popular in the 1920s and 1930s and he was frequently featured in *Pall Mall, Illustrated London News* and *Hutchinson’s Magazine*. From the introduction by R. Dalby to E. F. Benson, *The Collected Ghost Stories* (London: Robinson Publishing, 1992) xv-xiv.

298 Benson 617.

299 As reported in *The Belfast News* 6th July 1895 issue 24955. Quoted in Benson 617.
surely as the savage who fears his own shadow is a child’.  

There is an assumption here of the connection between ‘otherness’ and a belief in superstitions, as Benson also compared the men involved with other ‘primitive’ peoples including the ‘Hottentots’, the ‘Patagonians’, the ‘Veddahs of Ceylon’ and the ‘Chippewa Indians’, drawing comparisons in their folklore beliefs and a ‘widespread and primitive superstition’.  

He concluded by stating that: ‘It is impossible for educated and unsuperstitious people to appreciate the enormous force which such beliefs exercise on untutored minds as it is for the heathen to estimate the immense power of religion in determining the conduct of a man’.  

In the end Bridget’s husband was sentenced to twenty years of penal servitude.

Trezise has warned against underestimating the impact of this type of racial stereotyping of the Celt in the Victorian age on the debate about the very nature of the Celt: ‘race as an explanation, not just for ‘animal’ appearance but for ‘animal’ behaviour, meant that there was no need to explain Irish, Scots, Welsh or Cornish issues in terms of environmental problems such as poverty, dispossession of land and language, famine or English prejudices’. Instead, their self-evident biological inferiority, which produced a series of immutable character deficiencies, meant that the Celt was destined for evolutionary adversity and possibly even extinction.

300 Benson 623.
301 Benson 622-623.
302 Benson 623.
303 Trezise 58.
During the Irish Famine, *The Times* newspaper exemplified the attitude that if the Celtic people were suffering, then the reasons behind their problems were deemed to be racial, as the Celt was often mythologised as lazy, child-like and incapable of self-governance. Matthew Arnold made reference to this bias in his introduction to *Celtic Literature*, quoting what, for him, exemplified the paper’s attitude to the Celts: ‘Cease to do evil, learn to do good, was the upshot of its exhortations to the Welsh; by evil, *The Times* understanding all things Celtic, and by good, all things English’.  

Further evidence of Arnold’s assertion is not hard to find.

In 1848 the British Prime Minister Lord John Russell’s forthcoming visit to famine-ridden Ireland was reported in *The Times* and it was conjectured that the reason for the country’s problems lay in the character of the Irish people themselves. The Celtic Irish, according to the article, were unlike, and inferior to, the Saxon English in many ways: ‘The maxims and habits of Teutonic thought and action are alien to the Celtic mind’, it opined. Whereas the Saxon had ‘worked his way out of the groove of despotism’ by degrees and always within the rule of law, modifying it but always remaining with it, the Irish displayed no subordination to the law – ‘such principles and modes of action are strange and foreign to the Celts’. In contrast to Saxons who ‘never stopped working’ to improve their lot, the Irish peasantry had sunk into a ‘sullen inactivity’, and were only roused by rebellion. These characteristics were presented as congenital and long-standing: ‘Wherever the Celts have been collected together in separate masses, they have shown an innate hostility to the exercise of authority and the administration of


However, not all Celtic people were reportedly as ‘bad’ as the Irish: the Cornish surpassed other Celts as a consequence of their proximity to the English:

The Celts of Wales, with a thinner and more scattered population, have been more orderly than the Celts of Ireland; but the Celts of Cornwall, surrounded by English, familiar with English habits and principles, used to good treatment and high earnings, are far superior to their kindred both of Ireland and Wales.  

The example of the Cornish had shown that what the Irish needed was to be educated ‘en masse’ by England, to be ‘taught the meaning of duty’ in exchange for no more than their lives. Only when the lawless Irish had learned this lesson (as Irish soldiers who had been ‘broken down’ in the British army had demonstrated) would it be worth it to ‘lavish millions’ on feeding them.

This was not the first time that the newspaper had compared the Irish and the Cornish people; in 1845, at the beginning of the Great Famine, The Times sent a commissioner to Cork to assess what it referred to as The Condition of the People of Ireland.  

---


308 “Lord Russell’s Visit to Ireland.” Front Page.

natural resources to obtain wealth and comfort, but with no determination to do so. Despite the enterprising example set to them by the ‘Englishmen and Scotchmen who have settled among them’, the natives of Cork reportedly neglected the natural resources of minerals, fish and farmland. As a result of their own apathy, ‘these poor exertionless, good-natured, apathetic men, do in reality almost starve’, their only solution being to cause political agitation with England, whilst at the same time relying on her financial help.

By contrast in Cornwall, where natural conditions were reportedly less favourable than in Cork – the mines being less rich, the seas empty and the farmland of poorer quality – the Cornish prospered due to their work ethic, skill and knowledge: ‘Despite his barren soil, despite the fact that his coasts will not supply him with fish, despite the difficulties and uncertainties which hem him in on every side, he labours with intelligent enterprise and persevering industry and he deserves his reward of plenty and comfort’.310

All of this alleged financial and domestic security was achieved by the Cornish despite having ‘the money for which they labour’ sent over to Ireland to pay for food for the ‘deluded’ Irishmen who starve ‘amid the bounties of nature’ and wrongly blame their plight on the Act of Union. The Commissioner’s solution to the starving Irish people’s problems was insensitive under the circumstances: ‘Proclaim a general fast-day, and pray to God that in His mercy He will vouchsafe to you common sense’. In reality in this decade, the Cornish people themselves were rioting because of food shortages.311


311 Payton, Cornwall: A History 170.
If the Cornish were often portrayed in the press as a more benign breed of Celt than the Irish, in literature they were sometimes themselves viewed as dangerous savages, as was demonstrated by the proliferation in tales of wrecking, complete with lurid details of wanton violence. With no real evidence to support accusations of the behaviour they contained, such tales managed to gain popularity anyway, casting the Celtic Cornish as savages in stories by numerous writers. George Borlase’s account of the practice is a particularly damning example: ‘When the tinners observe a ship on the coast they arm themselves with sharp axes and follow those ships. They’ll cut a large trading vessel to pieces in one tide, and cut everybody that offers to oppose them ... I have seen many a poor man half dead, cast ashore and crawling out of the reach of the waves, fallen upon and, in a manner, stript naked by these villains’. 312 In an article in The English Chronicle, John Robeson gave a dehumanising portrait of the Cornish during a wrecking: 'the shrieks of the sufferers excite no painful emotion, but become like music to the ears of the human vultures who wait their evening prey, and often deprive of life the supplicating wretches whom the fury of the ocean has spared.'313

In his book The Land’s End (1908), W. H. Hudson claimed that the Cornish justified their brutality by claiming wrecking was ‘an inherited knowledge’ – ‘It’s in the bone, and we can’t help it’. 314 He believed that, far from being the imposition of outsiders seeking a dangerous and frightening “other” close to home, it was the Cornish themselves who kept these fables alive as – unlikely as it sounds – they were flattered

---


313 Quoted in Vivian 27.

by such tales.

Vernon notes that this perception of Cornwall as a ‘primitive “Celtic” land of myth and romance’, against which the progress of the Anglo-Saxon English was measured, linked the people of that county to those in the wider Empire. Whether they were ‘colonial primitive’ people or the Celts of ‘the savage within’, they needed to be controlled as they all represented an earlier stage of development. 

Unfortunately in this era there was no shortage of ‘scientific’ evidence to support the prejudiced accusations of inferior human behaviour by the Celtic people. During the mid-nineteenth century there was a profusion of books postulating polygenism – the existence of separate ‘races’ of men, and the idea that those races were the predominant factor in determining both character and behaviour.

One of the most popular and influential writers was Robert Knox who wrote *The Races of Man* and spread his doctrine through a series of lectures, which helped to distribute his ideas widely both in Britain and abroad, helping to mould contemporary thought on race. Knox saw the races of Britain as being clearly divided into the ‘barbarous’

---


Celts and the Saxons whose differences were both physical and, more importantly, intellectual. The Celtic character was summarised by Knox as being: ‘Furious fanaticism; a love of war and disorder; a hatred for order and patient industry; no accumulative habits; restless, treacherous, uncertain’. Their flaws also included the fact that they were papists and Jacobites.\textsuperscript{318} He conceded that they may have been ‘notable warriors’ but they had no understanding of liberty and were therefore ‘incapable of implementing ideas of freedom in government’. Furthermore, they were second only to the Scandinavian race in terms of their disruptive influence on the peace of Europe.\textsuperscript{319}

As a result of this dangerous combination of immutable traits, the Celtic people were regarded as a serious threat to the political stability of England: ‘The really momentous question for England, as a nation, is the presence of three sections of the Celtic race still on her soil’.\textsuperscript{320} Knox was a supporter of the libertarian ideas of the French Revolution, but in order to master this problematic Celtic race he concluded that only their subjugation would work: ‘As a Saxon, I abhor all dynasties, monarchies, and bayonet governments, but this latter seems to be the only one suitable for the Celtic man’.\textsuperscript{321}

Similarly, Karl Marx recognised the rebellious nature of the Celtic people and gave Knox’s accusations of their disruptive potential credence by stating that the reason social revolution had yet to occur in England, despite having the ‘material

\begin{footnotes}
\item[318] Knox 2010, 27.
\item[319] Quoted in Banton 73.
\item[320] Knox 2010, 27.
\item[321] Knox 2010, 27.
\end{footnotes}
prerequisites’ to do so, was the lack of subversive spirit in the English workforce: ‘The revolutionary fervour of the Celtic worker does not fit in with the slow temperament of the Anglo-Saxon worker’. ³²²

Knox directly connected the source of the ‘evil’ that resided in the Irish with their Celtic race, his only solution being that they should be expelled from England – ‘England’s society requires it’, he insisted. ³²³ His rampant hatred of the Celtic race also extended to the Scottish; commenting on those who had lost their homes during the Highland Clearances he stated: ‘And why should you return, miserable and wretched man, to the dark and filthy hovel you never sought to purify’. ³²⁴ If the Celts’ contribution to society was pernicious, then their contribution to culture and learning was non-existent: ‘As a race, the Celt has no literature ... There never was any Celtic literature, nor science, nor arts’. ³²⁵ Vincent Cheng claims that we cannot dismiss Knox’s ideas as those of a ‘racist madman’, as his books and ideas ‘were among the most respected and influential of the century, helping shape contemporary understandings of race’. ³²⁶

Another influential voice on the subject of race in Britain was John Beddoo. Unlike


³²⁴ Quoted in Sykes 84.

³²⁵ Knox 2010, 218.

Knox, Beddoe had no underlying agenda to purge Britain of the Celtic people, his work being initially inspired by the age-old question of the hair colour of the Celts. It was conducted purely out of an interest to record the races of Britain as they were, before the influence of the railways broke up traditional communities. He travelled the country observing and recording hair and eye colour, as well as using phrenology which he believed were all crucial in determining racial and ethnic identity. As with Knox, Beddoe cannot be dismissed as a dissonant or unpopular thinker, since he was a member of several eminent scientific societies, and his research was well respected by other writers, including James Cowles Prichard (who endorsed Beddoe’s research), and Francis Galton and Havelock Ellis, both of whom were influenced by him. He was also a founder member of the Ethnological Society and the Anthropological Institute, and received the Huxley memorial medal for his work.

Beddoe suspected that, in the populations of both Wales and the West of England, there were traces of ‘some Mongoloid race’ in their facial features, especially amongst the Cornish. The Celts in general were thought to be related to Cromagnon man by head type, who in turn was related to the ‘Africanoid’. They were further differentiated from the Anglo-Saxon on Beddoe’s ‘Index of Nigrescence’ which showed the Cornish to be the darkest people in England, most resembling fellow Celts, the Scottish

---


329 Beddoe, The Races of Britain 9.

Highlanders.\textsuperscript{331}

In \textit{On the Stature and Bulk of Man in the British Isles}, Beddoe also mistakenly linked physical appearance with social position. The role of different people in society depended on their physical type and the men of Cornwall were described as being the finest and largest in Britain, which meant that they yielded ‘more than their fair share of ability and energy for the national benefit’.\textsuperscript{332} This cast them in the restricted role of workers, striving away for the good of the nation, but unlikely to rise above this preordained function.

As stated earlier, unlike Knox and others, Beddoe’s extensive research had no propagandist motive – he had no great theory on the nature of races to prove, he wished only to ‘lay a sure foundation ... whereon insight and genius may ultimately build’.\textsuperscript{333} Unfortunately his own underlying prejudices, the prejudices of his age, showed through with the use of words like ‘purity’ and although he asked no explicit questions concerning the status of those on his index, the implicit message was clear – in no way could the ‘darkness’ attributed to the Cornish be connected with superiority. Despite his benign intent, he, like many others, was giving prejudice against the Celtic people of Britain and Ireland a scientific basis by making comparisons to the dark-skinned and ‘inferior’ ‘negro’.\textsuperscript{334}

\textsuperscript{331} Beddoe, \textit{The Races of Britain} 285. For table, see 160-161.

\textsuperscript{332} Quoted in Angelique Richardson “Beddoe, John (1826–1911).”<http://0www.oxforddnb.com.lib.exeter.ac.uk/view/article/30666>

\textsuperscript{333} Beddoe, \textit{The Races of Britain} 299.

\textsuperscript{334} Today, Beddoe’s work can be found quoted on white supremacist websites like Stormfront.
Writer and historian Thomas Carlyle was just one of those who drew such a comparison when he travelled to Ireland in 1849, referring to the people there as ‘human swinery’, and a ‘black howling Babel of superstitious savages’. His brutal answer to the Irish Question was to ‘Black-lead them and put them over with the n*****s’. The comparison was extended to the Cornish well into the twentieth century with C. E. Vulliamy describing the ‘Cornish peasant’ as an ‘untainted aboriginal’, in possession of ‘a restful depth of ignorance’, whilst also having ‘a Mid-African simplicity’. In part, this association with the ‘negro’ lay behind the interconnected depiction of the Celts, and particularly the Irish, as chimps or monkeys. The simianisation of the Irish, justified by the ‘science’ of phrenology, was particularly prevalent in Punch magazine through a series of cartoons in the mid-nineteenth century in which the Irish were shown with large protruding jaws and masses of facial hair.

The writer Charles Kingsley also employed the simian stereotype, when reporting on a trip to Sligo in 1860, to express his horror at what he encountered there:

I am haunted by the human chimpanzees I saw along that hundred

---


337 Quoted in Vernon 59.

miles of horrible country. I don’t believe they are our fault. I believe [...] that they are happier, better, more comfortably fed and lodged under our rule than they ever were. But to see white chimpanzees is dreadful; if they were black, one would not feel it so much, but their skins, except where tanned by exposure, are as white as ours.  

As fellow Celts, this simianization of the Irish transmogrified to the Cornish too. The popular author, naturalist, correspondent of Henry Jenner and founding member of the RSPB, W. H. Hudson, explicitly linked Cornwall and Ireland, claiming the Irish were ‘racially related’ to the Cornish, and resembled them in disposition. He described what he saw as the more primitive western regions of the county as ‘the Connemara of Cornwall’, where the people were most comparable to the Irish in feature and expression, ‘an expression which even more than features makes him [the Cornishman] differ so greatly from the Anglo-Saxon’. In fact, the further into Cornwall he ventured, the more primitive and Celtic he found the people to be. Hudson did not think all Cornish people were primitive but he identified a definite ancient type within Cornwall which he described as ‘this little blackie or brownie of Bolerium’, that being the Roman name for the far end of Cornwall, where the ‘least mixed’ of the Cornish were found. Land’s End itself was thought by Hudson to be the most


340 W. Hudson handwrote letters to Jenner in December 1919. Their tone is friendly and casual. See Jenner Papers. Box 24, Packet 3, Bundle 2.

341 Hudson 30.

342 Hudson 156.

343 Hudson 104.
unchanged place with the wildest people in Cornwall due to its isolation and remoteness from the civilizing influence of ‘Saxon England’, whilst the county as a whole was described as one of England’s ‘backwards districts’.\(^ {344}\) Hudson claimed that the Anglo-Saxons who lived among the Cornish found it hard to countenance the weaknesses of the Cornish, partly because these Saxons had a very high opinion of themselves, but also because they found it hard to tolerate their faults and vices which were ‘so unlike those of the English’, that the two disparate groups were destined to quarrel.\(^ {345}\)

Although the Celts were differentiated from the Anglo-Saxons, they were comparable to each other in personality and as well as being similar in appearance, and consequently Hudson expected to observe uniformity in the behaviour of these people. When hearing reports from a policeman who had moved to Cornwall from South Wales at the differences in temperament between the two, he found this difficult to comprehend as the Welsh were fellow Celts.\(^ {346}\) He was also surprised that a people ‘so markedly Celtic’ as the Cornish did not conform to the stereotype of being poetical – quite the opposite, in fact.\(^ {347}\) However, he also found that the Cornish did conform to the convention of possessing a typically ‘Celtic cruelty’ which was due their ‘black blood’.\(^ {348}\)

In *The Land’s End*, Hudson drew heavily on such existing Victorian stereotypes of the

\(^{344}\) Hudson 59.

\(^{345}\) Hudson 138.

\(^{346}\) Hudson 131.

\(^{347}\) Hudson 189.

\(^{348}\) Hudson 145.
Celts, particularly on those that cast them as dark, simian and child-like, all of which he employed in his descriptions of the Cornish. He characterised one farmer he met as ‘hardly like a human being’ at all, reminding him of ‘an orang-utan and at the same time of a wild Irishman of a very low type’, ‘swinging his [...] monkey-like arms about’, ‘while pouring out a torrent of gibberish’. At Sennan Cove he found a further example, a man ‘chattering, screeching and gesticulating more like a frenzied monkey than a human being’. 

On comparing the Cornish Celts to children, Hudson concluded, as E. F. Benson had with the Irish peasants of Clonmel, that the Cornish peasant was easier to understand than the English one ‘because he was nearer, mentally, to the child’, as well as possessing the ‘natural happiness of the savage’. He also concluded that the intelligence of the Cornish was ‘like that of the lower animals ... non-progressive’. For Hudson, the Cornish character ‘marked a lower stage in mental development’. This association of the Cornish people, and in particular the Cornish ‘peasant’, with a child-like mentality, was the key to what made them so easy to understand. Hudson claimed that ‘when we live with savages or uncivilised people, it is very much like living with children; we get to know them as we never know the civilized beings we

349 Hudson 103.
350 Hudson 104.
351 Hudson 192.
352 Hudson 128.
353 Hudson 139.
354 Hudson 191.
spend our lives with although they are our own people’. British historian Lord Acton had posited a similar theory in 1862, when he declared that: ‘The Celts are not among the progressive, initiative races, but among those which supply the materials rather than the impulse of history... The Persians, the Greeks, the Romans and the Teutons are the only makers of history, the only authors of advancement’.  

In the language employed by Hudson it is easy to see the connection between class and race in the Victorian consciousness. The “lower” classes of Cornish society were the most primitive because they were the most unmixed, whereas, according to Hudson, ‘the mixing process has been infinitely greater in the upper ranks’, their Celtic nature had been sufficiently diluted to produce a more ‘civilized’ being. A similar conclusion was reached by the 1893 Ethnographic Survey of the United Kingdom, which employed anthropological study and an examination of local folklore in order to determine the characteristics of the various ‘races’ of the people of Britain whilst identifying the more ‘primitive’ areas of the country.

In common with writers like Knox and Beddoe, the Ethnographic Survey posited instructive correlations between the physical and mental racial characteristics of people from different parts of the country. And, as with Beddoe, the survey was conducted at a time when it was thought that the traditional ways of life and clear boundaries of local difference were being eroded by modernisation:

355 Hudson 191.


357 Hudson 187.
the evidence is slipping out of our grasp. The centripetal forces, which impel the country folk towards our great towns, and the rapid means of transit from place to place, of which even the poorest are constantly availing themselves, are fast effacing all special local peculiarities, and inextricably mixing the races of which our population are composed.358

In the Victorian era the perceived connection between the physical and the intellectual was strong and the study of folklore was seen as important anthropological work for differentiating between the races of Britain:

When an archaeological map of any county has been constructed, and some particular region of that county ... is observed to be specially rich in any one kind of evidence of ancient occupation, that region will assuredly be an excellent hunting ground for the enquiries into folk-lore and into physical anthropology, and a most hopeful locality for the discovery of any correlations that may exist between them.359

In an announcement in *Folklore* in 1892 on a proposed survey, the journal listed

---


exactly what the survey would be examining:

(1) Physical Types of the Inhabitants.
(2) Current Traditions and Beliefs.
(3) Peculiarities of Dialect.
(4) Monuments and other Remains of Ancient Culture; and
(5) Historical Evidence as to Continuity of Race.\(^{360}\)

The information was gathered by groups which included the Anthropological Institute, the Folklore Society, and Society of Antiquaries. It concluded, as W. H Hudson had done, that the ‘purity’ of the Celtic Cornish as a people – which was found to be substantial – was linked to their primitiveness. This meant that as well as displaying character traits which could be found in children, they were also thought to be sexually promiscuous, as with other ‘primitive’ peoples.\(^{361}\) ‘The Cornish Celt’, the Ethnographic Survey concluded, in a sentence which covered a multitude of sins, ‘is prolific and exceedingly prone to sexual irregularity’.\(^{362}\) The more uncorrupted the Celts were by other races, the more backwards the circumstances in which they lived. It was also thought that the Cornish possessed the ‘characteristically Celtic’ faults of being suspicious, argumentative and feuding.


There is undoubtedly more than a race issue involved in all of these diatribes; there are also, as mentioned earlier, the issues of class and of religion. However, as the evidence suggests, to many eminent Victorian thinkers the notion of ‘race’ determined how a people would think and act to such an extent that their class – their place in society – and their religion were natural progressions of their inferior race. In fact, all behaviour, be it social, political or cultural, could be attributed to racial identity. The Cornish when depicted as good, hard workers were thought to be so because of the physicality and ‘natural’ behaviour of the Celt, but equally they needed to be controlled because of their naturally rebellious nature. In the hierarchy of races the primitive Celts were labourers, not rulers. If anything, Ireland’s continued allegiance to the Catholic Church, as with Cornwall’s embracing of Methodism, compounded the idea that they were unable to be integrated and therefore needed to be subjugated. History and circumstance had not determined how they had acted, they were Celts, it was their innate and immutable character, and they had no choice.

It was also possible to justify the decline of the Celtic race as a natural result of ‘social evolution’: as Knox observed, the Celts were simply not fit to continue. Such thinking allowed the British government to drag its heels over famine relief in Ireland and elsewhere. Even at the end of the nineteenth century, it was still possible to take the view that the Celtic mind was of an inferior type to that of the Teuton, a situation which arose from immutable physical differences over which people had no control.\(^{363}\)

One of the reasons why the Celts, and those from the working classes in particular, had been demonised in much of Victorian society, was that many of them had been forced to emigrate to England to find work. In 1862, *Punch* magazine published a particularly savage attack on the immigrant Irish community in London under the title ‘The Missing Link’, which anticipates the language and comparisons that Hudson was to apply to the Cornish:

A gulf certainly, does appear to yawn between the Gorilla and the Negro. The woods and wilds of Africa do not exhibit an example of any intermediate animal. But in this, as in many other cases, philosophers go vainly searching abroad for that which they could readily find if they sought for it at home. A creature manifestly between the Gorilla and the Negro is to be met with in some of the lowest districts of London and Liverpool by adventurous explorers. It comes from Ireland, whence it has contrived to migrate ... When conversing with its kind it talks a sort of gibberish. It is, moreover, a climbing animal, and may sometimes be seen ascending a ladder laden with a hod of bricks.364

Like the Irish, many Cornish people had been forced to leave home because of poverty prompted, in the case of Cornwall, by the collapse of traditional industries. Many fled abroad, but some remained in England and many of them migrated to the North East to work in the only industry they knew – mining. In

364 Curtis, *Apes and Angels* 100.
1865 nearly 300 Cornish miners (enough to run a mine) many with their families, moved to Cramlington in Northumberland to replace evicted striking local workers. They were obviously unpopular with the local population whose houses they now occupied and were abused as ‘strike-breakers’ and ‘black-legs’ as any incomers in such circumstances would have been, but they were also labelled as ‘foreigners’ too. They marked themselves out by speaking a strange language and the women were criticised as being ‘little better than gypsies with their dark complexions’. 365 They were also perceived as separate by what they brought with them, and kept – their dress (traditional pit clothes were flannel and shorts, but the Cornish wore duck jackets and trousers), their Methodist faith (not that they were welcome in local chapels anyway) and their distinct ways: they would whitewash their cottages as they had done at home, and unlike the local men, would not hand the bulk of their wages to their wives and ‘did not shame to help their wives to wash, or even to cook’. 366

These early immigrants were not the only fugitive Cornish people to experience prejudice in the North East of England. One of the unusual results that Face of Britain survey uncovered was a profusion of Cornish names in the 1881 census in the Middlesbrough area as miners from the county continued to flee starvation and poverty to take up jobs in the rapidly expanding industrial north. In the 40-year period from 1841 to 1881, Middlesbrough’s population increased nearly ten-


fold and hundreds of Cornish miners and their families helped fuel this growth. By creating a database of British surnames Paul Langley’s team from University College, London discovered that these Cornish emigrants were to be found outside the city centre, ghettoised in certain outlying communities.367

The work of Richard Webber on the social mobility of Celtic immigrants in this area shows that the Cornish remained in these distinct communities in the suburbs of Middlesbrough, and that the descendants of these people are still ‘highly localised’ with little evidence of the integration into the indigenous population displayed by later immigrant groups. As with the descendants of Irish and Scottish migrants, those of Cornish descent continue to live in some of the most deprived neighbourhoods in the Middlesbrough area.368 Research for the Face of Britain series also concluded that, despite ‘significant improvements’ in the general quality of life and the development of a more meritocratic society, families of Cornish origin ‘remain in low socio-economic groups’.369 Perhaps part of the explanation for this continued segregation lies with the way in which the Cornish were initially perceived as a ‘foreign’ and ‘strange’ people, more comparable with gypsies than migrants from other areas of England.

We are used to reading about anti-Irish prejudice, but in reality in the nineteenth century there was also an anti-Celtic one which extended to justifying the Highland Clearances


369 McKie, Face of Britain 191.
or Britain’s role in the Irish Diaspora. Sometimes the Cornish were direct victims of this racism, sometimes they were held up as a superior example of the Celtic race due to the influence of neighbouring England. It is remarkable, given the hatred and degradation of the Celts in general and the Irish in particular, that Jenner would ever wish to associate the Cornish and Cornwall with them.

However, that is exactly what he set out to do and in assessing Henry Jenner’s role in the Celtic Revival, the question is raised – how did the Celts move from their position in the middle of the nineteenth century as a maligned and inferior race to being a people it was desirable to be connected to? The work of the Celtic Revivalists, and particularly, in the case of Cornwall, Jenner, undoubtedly made a significant contribution to this rebranding of the previously vilified Celtic nations, instilling people with a sense of pride in their origins by constructing a new and ennobled Celtic identity.

The common traits of the Celtic people had been posited by those wishing to denigrate the Celts – they were all as bad as each other in some eyes – but the people involved in the cultural Revival of the Celtic nations chose to emphasise similarities to bond their people together. In 1901 the first Pan-Celtic Congress was held in Dublin with the aim of encouraging co-operation in the study of ‘Celtic languages, history, music, literature and other aspects of the common Celtic culture’. The Revival can be viewed as a response to many things, including the sense of dislocation associated with modernisation, but it can also be seen as a reaction to the negative depiction of one group of people by another. The amalgamating of the Celts as one racial group to be

---

demonised for their alleged inferiority ironically had the effect of promoting a sense of unity amongst these beleaguered peoples which men like Jenner drew on during the Celtic Revival.

**Pan-Celtic Unity and Henry Jenner’s Vision of Celtic Cornwall**

The Victorian concept of race, as previously discussed, placed the Celts as a people in an inferior role compared to that of the Anglo-Saxons. The Victorian view of the origins of the British nations also generally dismissed their contribution to English culture and history, with historians such as Thomas Pitt Taswell-Langmead choosing to emphasise the importance of the Teutonic peoples in this pro-German climate. Prior to the First World War the views of Taswell-Langmead as expressed in the early editions of *English Constitutional History, from the Teutonic Conquest to the Present Time* would have been commonplace:

> It is not unusual to speak of the English as a mixed race formed out of the fusion of the Britons, the Anglo-Saxons, the Danes, and the Normans; but this form of expression is apt to convey an erroneous idea of the facts. No modern European is, indeed, of pure unmingled race; yet in all some one element has maintained a clear and decided predominance. In the English people this predominant element is the Germanic or Teutonic.\(^{371}\)

The Great War put an end to the popularity of this ideology and allowed those involved

---

in Celtic organisations to assert the importance of the Celtic renaissance, sometimes, as with Jenner’s *House of Damnonia*, in direct opposition to the attendant doctrines that belief in Teutonic superiority brought. In his preface to the Celtic Conference reports of 1917–18, the President, E. T. John stated in reference to the Revival:

This awakening has become vitally essential to the well-being of humanity, under the stress of widespread materialist reaction; for, whatever may be the fate of Teutonism in the field, it has won the homage of assimilation and imitation, conscious and unconscious, in the most diversified and unexpected quarters, completely conquering its antagonists, even though it moves itself to the inevitable and final failure. Conquered or unconquered, vanquished or victorious, it still triumphs so long as human civilization and international relations base their final sanctions upon force as the dominating factor most assuredly the negation of the gospel of Celticism.\(^{372}\)

In this context, Teutonism was associated with war, whilst Celticism was a far more benign, but beleaguered force, with John referring to the ‘gospel’ of Celtic culture. The promotion of this force for good in the world, and therefore an aim of the annual meetings and of the Congress Committee, was the reinstatement of the importance of Celtic culture in history. Similarly in Cornwall, Morton Nance proclaimed that those involved with the Congress in Cornwall supported anything that would ‘improve the

intellectual and social status of Celtic countries’. 373

By contrast, Teutonism, like Empire, was a force for standardisation that depended upon the universal imposition of a doctrine to the exclusion of all others. It was this standardisation that the renaissance of Celtic identity challenged. Figures like Morton Nance were well aware of the detrimental effects of standardisation on both countries and people: he described this trend for ‘doing what everyone else is doing’ as ‘the foe to all personal and local individuality’. 374 Through the medium of the Congress, Morton Nance thought that it was possible for the collective might of the Celtic nations, with implied reference to the Breton nation in particular, to unite against this prevailing trend: ‘the Celtic Congress attempts to stem this current imitation, one that heads for the extinction of everything Celtic in favour of a standardised London or Paris made substitute’. 375 Apparently, the Bretons’ individual identity and importance were considered to be as much under threat from their centralising and marginalising government as the Cornish. When publicly stating the case for Cornwall’s involvement in the Pan-Celtic movement, it was this fear of being left in a minority that was the significant factor, and Cornwall could only gain strength from fellow members: ‘the force of example given by perfectly normal and civilized people who refuse to be standardised and who stand by the ancient language and cultural possibilities of their

373 Jenner Papers. Box 8, Packet 7, Bundle 1. ‘The Celtic Congress and Cornwall’, cut newspaper article by Morton Nance.

374 Jenner Papers. Box 8, Packet 7, Bundle 1. ‘The Celtic Congress and Cornwall’, cut newspaper article by Morton Nance.

375 Jenner Papers. Box 8, Packet 7, Bundle 1. ‘The Celtic Congress and Cornwall’, cut newspaper article by Morton Nance.
own Celtic countries must always have a tonic effect’.\textsuperscript{376}

For Morton Nance the future of Cornwall depended upon this hitherto absent assertion of local pride which competed with what was seen by him as an ‘English’, as opposed to ‘British’, threat to identity through the demands of empire:

In Cornwall, either by nature or more probably in imitation of English ways, we are shy of talking Cornish patriotism ... we abstain from real or figurative flag-waving for Cornwall ... our own tiny Cornwall does desperately need to have its flag flown and trumpet blown if it is not to be swallowed up entirely in the vast empire that its sons have done so much to build.\textsuperscript{377}

It was in this context that Henry Jenner began to rewrite the image of the Cornish Celt. In defending the Cornish against the various allegations of the inferiority of the Celtic race, Jenner used the same methods and language that other writers had used it to vilify them, but inverted them. He asserted the racial superiority and purity of the Celts and specifically the Cornish, as well as employing some of the pre-existing Celtic stereotypes to assert Cornwall’s claim to Celtic nationhood. However, in the hands of the intellectuals like Jenner who led the Cornish Celtic Revival, the ‘flaws’ of the Celtic people were transformed into positive shared character traits. Their imaginative and poetic nature was teamed with a thirst for knowledge, and their clan spirit and religious

\textsuperscript{376} Jenner Papers. Box 8, Packet 7, Bundle 1. ‘The Celtic Congress and Cornwall’, cut newspaper article by Morton Nance.

\textsuperscript{377} Jenner Papers. Box 8, Packet 7, Bundle 1. ‘The Celtic Congress and Cornwall’, cut newspaper article by Morton Nance.
fervour celebrated: they were also hospitable, kind and honest. According to Jenner, all of these attributes were to be found in the Cornish, as they were in all Celtic people. In 1921 at a lecture given to the University College in Exeter, entitled Who are the Celts?, Jenner defined them as those who had and still possess a Celtic race or national consciousness, as well as a Celtic language, and although language and blood were not always necessary for national consciousness, they had both been ‘factors in producing it’ in the Cornish people. National consciousness was to Jenner the most important factor in nationality and although a language, race or religion could unite a community, it was only through history that a nation could come to define itself as such. To Jenner, Cornwall was ‘undoubtedly’ a nation, and its nationhood was inextricably linked to its Celtic heritage: ‘When Cornishmen cease to recognize the existence of their Celtic heritage then only will their Cornish and therefore Celtic nationality cease’. Jenner, therefore, wholly accepted the idea of a separate Celtic racial identity and was keen for the Cornish to be seen within it as, for him, this identity was a positive asset.

Jenner’s more general views on race as expressed in his introduction to the Handbook of the Cornish Language, whilst unexceptional for his time, now seem outdated to modern readers. In his recently revised edition of the Handbook, Michael Everson chose to move some of Jenner’s more contentious remarks on the issue of race from the main


379 Jenner Papers. Box 6, Loose Item, page 5.

380 Jenner Papers Box 6, Packet 1 ‘Who are the Celts and what has Cornwall to do with them?’

body of the text to footnotes, so that the modern reader may chose to ignore them. Everson argued that just because such views were ‘‘commonplace’’ in Jenner’s time does not make them accurate or admirable, and he reproduces the offending paragraph on races purely on the grounds that it appeared in the first edition, whilst noting that the ideas contained therein are both ‘mistaken’ and ‘wholly unacceptable’ to a contemporary audience. By contrast, a contemporary review of the volume from 1904 merely notes that this section will be ‘the most interesting part of his book’ to many of its readers.

The passage in question contends that the ancestors of those on the Celtic fringe of Britain were Britons, Saxons or Normans – people of white Aryan descent – and therefore superior to the ‘aboriginal’ people who inhabited the middle of England. In what Saunders describes as ‘a subtly modified form of social Darwinism’ and Jenner himself referred to as ‘a survival, perhaps, of the unfittest’, these ‘aboriginal’ ancestors hid in the woods whilst any fighting took place. Meanwhile the descendants of the Cornish and others ‘went out to fight, and not infrequently to be killed’. This continuing selection process meant that only the best fighters survived and was described by Jenner thus:

the labouring classes of Devon, Cornwall, Somerset, Wales and

---


the Welsh border are of a type infinitely superior in manners, morals, and physique to the same class in the Midlands, because they now consist almost entirely of the descendants of the free Britons who were driven westward rather than submit to the overwhelming invasion of the Teutonic tribes.  

We have no idea specifically where Jenner derived his views on the racial superiority of the Cornish from, but there was a theory on the origins of the Cornish expressed less than twenty years earlier by John Beddoe in *The Races of Britain*: ‘Cornwall probably gave the last refuge to the free British warriors, who were gradually forced back by the West Saxons into the peninsula, while their serfs, accustomed to the yoke, may have bowed their necks for the most part to that of the strangers’.  

As a result of this process the “lower classes” in Cornwall and Scotland in particular were of an infinitely superior type to any but the highest echelons of society:

the natives of what are known as the “Celtic” parts of these islands are more purely Aryan than any except the upper and the upper middle classes of the so-called “Anglo-Saxon” districts of Britain. And of the Celtic parts of Britain, the Highlanders of Scotland and the Cornish are probably of the most unmixed Aryan or white race.

---


Because of this alleged superiority, Jenner was confident that all echelons of Cornish society would participate in helping to revive that cornerstone of Cornish Celtic identity, the language. He was therefore unsurprised by the enthusiasm for the learning of the Cornish language which had been shown by ordinary Cornish folk who included ‘hard-working clerks, small businessmen, shopkeepers and artisans’. He had made a very clear distinction between this group of men in Cornwall, ‘the classes that form the backbone of Cornish Methodism’, and their counterparts in England, describing them as ‘a very different sort of people from the same classes in a non-Celtic country’.389 This point of difference was seen by Jenner as a demonstration of the innate superiority of the ‘Celtic working man’ over the ‘“Anglo-Saxon” working man’, the Celt of this class having a natural hunger for knowledge absent in the non-Celt and, according to Jenner, usually succeeding in its acquisition.390

In the light of subsequent world events, such views may seem unsettling and potentially socially disruptive to modern audiences, but they do give further indication as to why Jenner thought all social groups within Cornwall could be included in his Revival campaign – clearly the Cornish were a superior nation with a greater than (English) average intelligence. Jenner himself did not see that he had written anything controversial or innovative: ‘I am not expecting to astonish Celts by this. With them such things are common enough’.391

389 Jenner Papers,Untitled document, Box 6, Packet 2.
390 Jenner Papers,Untitled document, Box 6, Packet 2.
391 Jenner Papers,Untitled document, Box 6, Packet 2.
Yet Jenner, though keen to link the Celtic nations together to preserve their Celtic nationality, was anxious to disassociate this sentiment from any insinuation of disloyalty (at least publicly) to either the ‘neighbouring kingdom’ of England, the sovereign, or the British Empire, claiming that: ‘The whole history of Cornwall is against any such ideas’. With the contentious issue of Irish Home Rule to the fore, the Celtic Association in general was keen that political issues should remain separate from their work. Contrary to the situation in Ireland, Jenner claimed that there was no desire within Cornwall for Home Rule. He argued:

There is no wish on anyone’s part to translate the Irish political expression “Sinn Fein” into Cornish, to agitate for Home Rule for Cornwall, in any way to disparage the neighbouring kingdom of England or to foment disloyalty to England’s King or to the British Empire. The whole history of Cornwall is against any such ideas.

However, despite having no sympathy with the political ideas of the Home Rule supporters, or of the more general hatred of the English in Ireland, he conceded that such feelings undoubtedly aided the revival of Gaelic and, by extension, had ‘preserved the Celtic character of Ireland’ to the point that there was no doubt as to the Celtic consciousness of that nation. It was this consciousness, inspired as it was by Ireland’s Celtic history, that could serve as a motivation to Cornish people, and not the more radical political stance that country had adopted.


393 Jenner, The Celts in Cornwall 11.

Jenner further disassociated the Cornish from the Irish in his essay by marking a differentiation between the Celts who used the Goidelic languages of Ireland, Scotland and The Isle of Man and the Brythonic language Celts of Cornwall, Wales and Brittany. Because the Goidelic Celts were relatively unaffected by the Roman invasion and conquest of Britain, and, in Jenner’s words, they ‘never went to school with Rome’, they had been left ‘almost entirely unaffected’ by Roman ideas of order and ‘civilization’.395 As a result, Jenner concluded that those Celts were now not only more purely Celtic in terms of their language, but also in their mentality too.396 Nevertheless, despite any bias towards one particular language group of Celts over another, they were both deemed to be racially superior to Anglo-Saxons in Jenner’s inversion of the pre-existing stereotype. The division between Brythonic and Goidelic Celts (usually referred to as Gaels) had been a common one during the early modern era; however, with the imposition of the myth of Saxon supremacy a unified Celtic identity began to be forged.397

The superiority of the Celts in general, and the Cornish in particular, was to be a recurring preoccupation for Henry Jenner. In a draft of his speech to the Pan-Celtic Congress at Carmarthen in 1904 entitled *Is Cornwall a Celtic Nation?*, he not only constructed a strong enough case for Cornwall being a Celtic nation to grant the Cornish access to the Celtic Congress, he also determined that they should not be associated


with Anglo-Saxons, considering this a terrible fate to befall a people like the Cornish:
‘are you willing to say to your sister nation, go away, don’t come here playing at being a Celt. Go and be – anglo-saxon [sic].’
Furthermore Jenner noted that in the Middle Ages the ‘official expression’ – ‘in Anglia et Cornubia’ – in England and Cornwall, [was] used then as we would use ‘in England and Wales’ now’. This suggested that Cornwall was truly considered to be a separate entity from the rest of England, strengthening Jenner’s argument about its racial difference.

To support his assertions that Cornwall belonged in the community of Celtic nations, Jenner offered historical evidence beginning in 936 when Athelstan drove the Cornish out of Devon and established the Tamar as a boundary between England and Cornwall:
‘This is what the Saxons called “conquering” Cornwall, but as a matter of fact they never did conquer it’. In a different draft of the same speech, Jenner claimed that Cornwall’s unique natural boundaries had made it ‘impossible’ for Saxon invaders to surround the county and to ‘absorb the inhabitants’ as had happened elsewhere.
Because of this Jenner felt able to assert that the Cornish were one of the most ‘Celtic’ of all the Celtic peoples: ‘The Cornish are mainly of Celtic blood. They are probably of more unmixed Celtic descent as a whole than any of the other Celtic nations, except perhaps the Bretons of Leon’. This is in contrast to his views expressed in The Celts in Cornwall in which, as mentioned earlier, he claimed that the Goidelic Celts, who

---

400 Jenner Papers. Box 6, Packet 6, Page 1.
didn’t ‘go to school with Rome’, had remained more purely ‘Celtic’ as a result. Such contradictions demonstrate the evolutionary nature of Jenner’s articulation of Cornwall’s Celtic identity in the early days of the Revival as he sought to construct a new myth of origin, and foster a sense of Celtic unity. Such unity was a relatively recent idea, a Celtic league having been formed briefly in 1886 and the first Pan-Celtic Conference being held in 1901.\textsuperscript{403}

Despite his concentration on Cornwall, Jenner placed great emphasis on the importance of Celtic unity, as embodied by the Celtic Congress. For all the early Celts’ attributes as a warrior people – ‘fine, fighting men, and good horsemen, brave and war-like’ – Jenner also considered them to be of a ‘quick-tempered and quarrelsome’ nature.\textsuperscript{404} As a consequence, as the various tribes fought amongst themselves and failed to unite, the first Celtic period in Europe was ended and the Celts’ great territory contracted to the Celtic fringe: ‘This want of unity has always been a source of weakness to the Celts’.\textsuperscript{405} It was a stark warning from history to the Congress, and a compelling reason to admit this nation of Celts into the fold. In doing so the other Celtic nations could prove that their ‘want of unity’ was not an immutable character trait, but a former flaw which they had progressed beyond. Thus Jenner intervened decisively in the racial politics of the period to use ideas of Celtic racial identity to unite Cornwall with other Celtic polities.

\begin{footnotes}
\item[404] Jenner Papers. Box 8, Packet 1.
\item[405] Jenner Papers. Box 8, Packet 1.
\end{footnotes}
Chapter Three

The Cultural Politics of the Celtic Cornish Revival
Jenner, Catholicism, Cornish Liberalism and Legitimism

In 1886 the Liberal party was split over the issue of Irish Home Rule, with the official Liberals supporting the idea, and the Liberal Unionists opposing it. Gladstone’s first Home Rule Bill had failed to make it through the House of Commons in this year as the Unionists and Conservatives voted together to block it.\(^{406}\) Three years later, intent on bolstering support for the cause, Gladstone embarked on a tour around Britain speaking on various issues, Home Rule being the predominant one. He arrived in Cornwall in June, opening his first speech in Falmouth to cheers from the crowd by stating the depth of support his party held in the region: ‘We are entitled to regard the county of Cornwall as an ancient seat of Liberalism ... we have looked to Cornwall as a main prop of the Liberal cause in the West of England’.\(^{407}\) The next day he made a speech at Truro at which he reiterated the high level of support for his party in the county, exclaiming that Liberalism ‘pervades nearly the whole population’, adding that it was ‘in the very air of the county’.

Gladstone commented that the unsurpassed depth of support for Liberalism was so pervasive that ‘the atmosphere is Liberal’, before describing Cornwall as ‘this home of


the old British race’, making reference to the idea of the Celts as the most ancient of the Britons.\textsuperscript{408} He went on to link the Liberalism of Cornwall with its Non-conformism, reportedly to loud cheers from the crowd, before noting that as Methodists the people of Cornwall had encountered difficulties in relation to the established church just like the Irish Catholics. His endorsement of Home Rule for these similarly oppressed people was again reportedly met with cheers from the assembled crowd.\textsuperscript{409} He was also, of course, trying to bolster support for his party which was in the minority at the time in the county, the Liberal Unionists and their Conservative allies holding the majority of seats.\textsuperscript{410}

On his third day in Cornwall he reiterated his admiration for the county’s political character, manifestations of which ‘surrounded me at every point of my tour’, as well as the uniformity of support for the Liberal cause throughout his journey. Whilst in the county, Gladstone had been the guest of his close friend Charles Acland, the MP for Launceston. He used this speech to praise Acland and his family, and also other ‘ancient’ Cornish families\textsuperscript{411} who, to Gladstone, seemed to act as benign rulers and moral guardians for those not of a ‘high station’.\textsuperscript{412} He praised the powerful families of Cornwall, those ‘blessed with wealth and leisure’, for fulfilling the role of models of good behaviour for others: ‘Although I am disposed to place my main confidence in the

\begin{footnotes}
\item[408] “Mr. Gladstone in Cornwall.” \textit{The Times} 13 June 1889: 7.
\item[409] “Mr. Gladstone in Cornwall.” \textit{The Times} 13 June 1889: 7.
\item[410] Deacon, \textit{Cornwall: A Concise History} 155.
\item[411] The Aclands were, in fact, a Killerton-based East Devon family but were a prominent land-owning family in Cornwall.
\item[412] “Mr. Gladstone” \textit{The Times} 14 June 1889: 5.
\end{footnotes}
bulk of the nation ... I regard it as an immeasurable blessing to a community when the
men of the families of high station set an example to the rest of their fellow countrymen
as has been set by the Acland family’.413 Such moral responsibility, Gladstone noted,
was not uncommon in the region, the Aclands ‘do not stand alone in Cornwall in that
respect’.

Whilst praising the efficacy of this hierarchy, Gladstone also spoke, paradoxically, of
equality and its importance to the increased stability of the country as a whole whilst
alluding to threats to stability, extolling ‘the principles of liberty combined with loyalty,
principles of order and of justice and of equal rights of the whole community of all
portions of the United Kingdom which we want to make a great deal more truly united
than it has been for some considerable time’.414 Gladstone thus combined a desire for
the continuation of the social hierarchy he had seen in Cornwall with a seemingly
paradoxical one for greater equality, and such ideas find resonance with Jenner’s
ideology of ‘Merry England’. In this ideology, medieval social distinctions led,
paradoxically, to a more egalitarian society, as people knew their places in the
established hierarchy and were content to stay there. Such ideas are usually associated
with Benjamin Disraeli and the Conservative party, which was probably Jenner’s natural
home, and it is interesting to see Gladstone, Disraeli and Jenner all agreeing on this
feudal vision. However, in Gladstone’s case, it must also be seen as an attempt to retain
the support of the landed families when others were defecting to the Liberal Unionists.

Partly due to the influence of Gladstone, it could be stated that the political atmosphere

413 “Mr. Gladstone” The Times 14 June 1889: 5.

414 “Mr. Gladstone” The Times 14 June 1889: 5.
in Cornwall prior to the Revivalist movement was moving towards a distinctly traditional one and the increasingly orthodox policies of the Liberal party, with their foundations in class division, proved to have enduring popularity in Cornwall beyond the governance of Gladstone himself. At the end of the nineteenth century, Payton argues that Cornish politics had been radical in social matters, but later Deacon noted that Liberal Unionism in the county ‘corroded the long-term vitality of Cornish Political radicalism’: it had become more fossilised by the early 1900s. Michael Dawson also noted that ‘[T]he ‘new Liberalism’ and social reform were unimportant ... The Gladstonian tradition remained central to Liberalism because it accurately reflected the pre-occupations of the party’s core supporters in the region’. This view is supported by Tregidga who also noted ‘a deep reverence for the cause of Gladstone’ in the county. Popular support for Liberalism in Cornwall remained an identifying characteristic of the county despite the growth of the Labour Party elsewhere. And despite the individual political inclinations of those leading the Celtic Revival in Cornwall, Gladstonian Liberalism also reflected the more antiquarian aspects of the Revivalist movement.

Meanwhile, other Celtic nations had a much more explicit separatist agenda and, as


416 Deacon, Cornwall: A Concise History 156.


Garry Tregidga observed, the debate on Irish devolution had wider implications for the rest of the Celtic nations: ‘it is no coincidence that the main period of nationalist activity in Scotland and Wales occurred at times when the political controversy over Ireland was at its highest. The political interests of the Celtic nations were directly connected’.\(^\text{419}\) As early as 1905, local self-government was advocated for Britain and Ireland by David Lloyd George, then Liberal MP for Carnarvon in Wales. In an interview in *Pall Mall Magazine* in June of that year he said: ‘As for Home Rule, I want local self-government not only for Ireland, but for Scotland, Wales –’\(^\text{420}\) When questioned on the issue of Home Rule for Cornwall, which was ‘inhabited by a separate race’, Lloyd George replied ‘Then let us say local self-government for the West of England, which is largely Celtic’. He concluded by stating that ‘My ideal is the heptarchy’, referring back to the Anglo-Saxon division of the now United Kingdom into seven separate kingdoms.\(^\text{421}\)

As Lloyd George’s statement shows, the Celtic nations had come to be regarded as a more united entity through the Celtic Revival and it was thought probable that if Ireland were granted the concession of domestic self-government, then other Celtic nations would follow. In both Wales and Scotland, movements already existed advocating greater political freedom in the form of the Scottish Home Rule Association and Cymru Fydd in Wales, both of which were founded in 1886, the


\(^{421}\) Quoted in Chartres, “Mr. Churchill And The Heptarchy,” 686.
year the first Irish Home Rule bill was proposed in Parliament.422

Later in 1905 Lloyd George once again suggested the idea of self-government for the Celtic nations, much to the derision of the Leader of the Opposition Arthur Balfour, a staunch opponent of Home Rule in any form.423 Speculating on the carving up of the United Kingdom, a concept which prompted laughter in Parliament, Balfour questioned ‘[w]as that plan to be forced down our throats whether we liked it or not?’ If some members of the Liberal party, including the leader, Herbert Asquith, had their way, Balfour complained, ‘Home Rule would already have been forced on us’.424

According to Andrew Bonar Law, who succeeded Balfour as Conservative leader of the opposition, Irish Home Rule was just the ‘latest plan to “restore the heptarchy”’.425 To some this seemed a very real possibility: The Times editorial, commenting on Bonar Law’s speech, claimed that Prime Minister Asquith was committed to a heptarchy, and that ‘The blessings of Home Rule are not to be confined to Ireland ... Scotland, Wales, and presumably England too, are to be endowed with separate parliaments’.426

In September 1912 Winston Churchill, then First Lord of the Admiralty, made his


own speech in Dundee advocating a heptarchy. However, Home Rule opponent Balfour did not think Churchill was serious in his endorsement of this idea, calling Churchill ‘the most ingenious master of political irony the world has probably ever seen’. He thought Churchill had been ‘greatly misunderstood’ and that his intention had been to make Home Rule seem ‘utterly ridiculous’ in his speech. In extending his argument from Ireland to the rest of the United Kingdom, Churchill had, according to Balfour, managed to make the idea seem ‘utterly absurd in the eyes of every man who read it’, an assessment which drew cheers from those in the House of Commons. Richard Toye claims that, although obliged by his party leader Gladstone to speak up for Home Rule, Churchill did indeed have reservations about the issue, as did Lloyd George. Toye also notes that by extending the idea of self-government to other areas of the United Kingdom as well as Ireland, both men were attempting to ‘remove the issue’s sting’ although it could equally be argued that they were attempting to arrive at a practical solution to a difficult problem. Indeed, Liberals needed to show the wider relevance of Home Rule to all since just focusing on one area – where they no longer had any seats – was not practical politics. Additionally the concept of a federal Britain made more logical, constitutional sense rather than giving special treatment to just one area.


431 Toye 113.
Despite his own links to Catholicism, Jenner was, as noted in Chapter One, officially opposed to Home Rule and disassociated his own brand of Celtic Revivalism from that of Ireland, managing to keep the more unpopular political characteristics of the Revival in other Celtic countries separate from those in Cornwall. The issue of Home Rule, and Cornish opposition to it, may have contributed to the reluctance of those involved in the promotion of a Celtic Cornish identity in the early part of the twentieth century to tie the movement to any political ideology. There are hints that, in his support for the Jacobite cause (as discussed later in this chapter), Jenner may not have been completely opposed to some form of autonomy, at least for the Scottish nation. There were others, associated with Cornish Liberalism, who were openly willing to assimilate Celticism, but Jenner was not one of them. He was not a natural party politician and his views were distinctly anti-democratic. This natural disposition, coupled with his position of power within the Cornish Celtic Revival, could be said to have prevented any meaningful engagement between those involved in the Cornish-Celtic Revival and the majority of the Cornish people. There were those working within the Revival who did hold more conventional Cornish Liberal views, but Jenner’s own perspective differed so strongly from theirs that the movement as a whole contained conflicting narratives and therefore lacked a unity of political purpose.

Jenner’s conservatism expressed itself in a number of ways. Just as Morton Nance had expressed concern about the potential disruption to society by members of the Celtic Congress, so Jenner expressed concern at the changes in society wrought by the Great War and the threat of left-wing revolution. With Jenner, this fear of a Socialist future for Britain would manifest itself in his desire to ‘restore’ society to ‘Merry England’, his

---

432 For example, Quiller-Couch and Browning Lyne.
rather ironically named, and necessarily highly idealised, aspiration to a medieval past:

It is well known that there are those, unhappily, who make it their business to foment class hatred and discontent, who prate all manner of “tommy rot” about “divine discontent”, as if it could ever be a desirable thing to make people unhappy. Some, no doubt, are genuine, if wrong-headed, idealists, but most of them are something else, and they are all tools, consciously or otherwise, of these mischievous enemies of civilization, the Bolsheviks.  

In reality, proponents of ‘divine discontent’ were Christian Socialists, usually Anglicans, who advocated moral and educative solutions to social problems, particularly those facing the poorer members of society. A speech made by Jenner in 1920 to the Royal Polytechnic Society is particularly revealing about his political stance. In this he comments on remarks made by Herbert Lewis (Liberal) MP with reference to rural libraries and their role in society, and he began by commenting on the usefulness of the scheme – helping to ‘allay the unrest that was driving young people into already overcrowded towns, and to mitigate the dullness of country life, especially during the winter months’.  

References:

433 Henry Jenner, The Renaissance of Merry England: Presidential Address at the Summer Meeting of the Royal Cornwall Polytechnic Society (Falmouth: Cornish Echo Co.1920) 10.


However, Jenner soon expanded to wider societal issues and although he denied any political motive, claiming of the Royal Cornwall Polytechnic Society that ‘this is not a political society, and I am not a member of parliament’, his political allegiances were evident in his speeches.\textsuperscript{436} He also had a more general interest in society as a whole, particularly its unity, which was obviously tainted by his right-wing, anti-Socialist bias. He agreed with Lewis that reading books, and in particular ‘the right ones’, would lead to people having a ‘better understanding of each other’, believing that many quarrels in society come from a misunderstanding between different groups of people. But he also believed that Lewis’ proposal, though good, was only part of the solution.

Jenner then went on to expound his own theory of Merry England – ‘the Merry England in which all classes joined together in common amusements and pastimes, and were all friends together’. The revived Romanticism of the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries that pervaded aspects of the Celtic Revival was affected by this myth of a rural medieval idyll. However, as folklorist Roy Judge observed, the concept of Merry England was a far from consistent articulation of the country’s past, based as it was on ephemeral foundations: it was ‘a world that has never actually existed, a visionary, mythical landscape, where it is difficult to take normal historical bearings’.\textsuperscript{437} William Morris idealised this ‘golden age’ as a socialist utopia, whereas for Jenner and others it was the hierarchical nature of this society which held its appeal, based as it was (in his vision) upon a strict and immutable class structure that was increasingly under threat. What Jenner advocated was far from Morris’s socialist utopia where all classes were


equal, but a return to a ‘mediaeval state’, as he believed that ‘mediaeval village life must have been very jolly at its best’. In Jenner’s idyllic reconstruction of the past, England was a place of far more peace and security than the history books, with their obsession with wars, would have led us to believe. The amusements undertaken by all were ‘neither vulgar nor immoral’ consisting as they did of ‘church festivals, folk-songs, folk-dances, village dramas and the rest’.

Here we can see the basis for Jenner’s interest in folk culture, not merely as an historical interest, but as a way of galvanising society, in the hope that it can be returned to a mythical golden age – the merry, medieval period. Jenner truly believed that ‘class-hatred’ was lessened in a society in which people of all classes played the same games in peacetime and fought alongside each other in war. Later in his speech he expanded on this idea of the classes being brought together by a medievalist revival. The work done thus far to try and promote this idea with folk revivals was described by Jenner as ‘small scale’, and he believed what was needed was ‘to make them more general, in every parish in the kingdom’.

The blame for the ending of this idyll was placed at the feet of Puritanism, which, according to Jenner, broke the continuity of tradition, as well as the Great Rebellion, and finally the Commonwealth which collectively had ‘worked their will on once Merry


England’. The more educated people in society became less inclined to join in the games as they once had, and without their influence, Jenner claimed, ‘the sports of the people tended to become low, vulgar and often cruel’ after the Restoration. The problem was exacerbated in the eighteenth century, a period of ‘Whig ascendency’ and the Hanoverian dynasty which brought with it ‘the German class-snobbery’. As a result of these factors, Jenner claimed that this century had ‘hit upon the wrong way’ to use class distinctions, which in themselves he had no objection to, as his vision of a hierarchical medieval society demonstrated.

John Saunders Lewis occupied a similar role to Henry Jenner within the Welsh Celtic Revival: like Jenner he was a charismatic figure who dominated much of the Revival. The two men also shared religious affiliations, both being Roman Catholics, both were tainted with allegations of fascist allegiance, and both believed that it was important for their respective nations to establish noble myths of historical formation. Both cast the Celts as one of the original peoples of European civilization in order to rid their nations of a ‘sense of inferiority’. And, like Jenner, Saunders Lewis looked back to the Middle Ages as a golden age for his communities. However, unlike Jenner, he laid the blame for the ending of this idyll on capitalism and the imposition of the centralised state and, although opposed to socialism, he believed in a policy of perchentyaeth – ‘distributing property among the mass of the members of the nation’. Whereas Jenner’s vision for the revival was apolitical, Saunders Lewis was overtly revolutionary in his political thinking, founding Plaid Cymru in 1925, and was even arrested and


442 Saunders Lewis quoted in John Davies 591.
imprisoned for setting fire to a government building. 443

Though Jenner claimed neutrality in party political matters at the beginning of his aforementioned speech on Merry England, his political views are discernible throughout, particularly in regard to the Labour Party and what he perceived as their insistence that the “people” or “folk” consisted only of the proletariat. Jenner’s belief, by contrast, was that ‘we’ (Jenner and his middle-class ilk) had as much of a claim to be part of the people as ‘the so-called “working-classes”’. 444 It was their right to participate in the folk culture and claim ‘our share of the things worth having’ which motivated Jenner. He admitted that a return to the old ways might be difficult, but ‘is not so impossible as it looks’, and far more likely in the contemporary climate: ‘Unlike the Restoration period, the present is a time at which what may be called antiquarian revivals of old manners and customs are possible, though not necessarily in their exact old form’. 445

Jenner contrasted the Revival he deemed would work in practice in the new environment of a post-war society with the Oxford Movement of the mid-nineteenth century, in which the Clergy ran events to amuse “the poor” who ‘had to do as they were told’ which, Jenner claimed, they didn’t resent ‘in the least’. However, in the new social environment, ‘if any form of Merry England is to be restored’ then the people

443 John Davies 591 – 592. On 8 September 1936, the UK government’s bombing school building at Penyberth was set on fire: Saunders Lewis, Lewis Valentine, and D. J. Williams claimed responsibility and were subsequently sentenced to nine months imprisonment.


themselves would have to run it, bearing in mind that ‘the people’ as defined by Jenner meant everyone and not just the ‘labouring classes’. In her article entitled “Rethinking Henry Jenner”, Amy Hale observed the ‘medievalist’ nature of the early Revival movement and there is little doubt that Jenner’s own views contributed significantly to this.\footnote{Amy Hale, “Rethinking Henry Jenner.” Ed. Philip Payton, \textit{Cornish Studies Thirteen} (Exeter: University of Exeter Press, 2005) 311.}

Jenner’s vision of a ‘Merry England’ was also formed in the Anglo-Catholic tradition, and his involvement in the Anglo-Catholic movement has been investigated by David Everett.\footnote{David Everett, “Henry Jenner and the Anglo-Catholic Movement” in Williams 243-255.} It is difficult to determine the extent to which the Anglo-Catholicism of many of the Revivalists, including Jenner, separated them from the majority of the Cornish people who adhered to Methodism. On one hand, the relationship between the Church and Methodism was affected by the rise of Anglo-Catholicism in Britain as, with its emphasis on ritual and imagery, Anglo-Catholicism represented the antithesis of the simplicity of the Methodist faith. And its increased popularity ‘inevitably tended to harden denominational distinctions’, according to A. K. Hamilton Jenkin.\footnote{A. K. Hamilton Jenkin, \textit{Cornwall and its People}. 1945. Newton Abbot: David and Charles, 1970. 199.} However, it must be noted that Hamilton Jenkin, who is described by Payton as a ‘reluctant Revivalist’, was also a man who ‘objected to the Anglo-Catholic tone of the Revival’.\footnote{Payton, \textit{Cornwall: A History}. 265.}

Alternatively, it could be argued that the Methodist movement did not wholly break away from the Catholic Church and both movements speak of a ‘mutual understanding’
between the two faiths. Historically, John Wesley himself had demonstrated a willingness to forge links with Catholics, even writing *Letter to a Roman Catholic* in 1749 which, it was claimed, was ‘marked by a conciliatory tone and a frank acknowledgement of a common faith and doctrine with Catholics’. Furthermore, ‘Wesley pleaded for Catholics and Protestants to “reason together” rather than engage in “endless jangling about opinions”’. And despite their undoubted previous differences, in the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries Methodists were prominently involved in the ecumenical movement towards greater Christian unity, so it is claimed that: ‘As the twentieth century progressed, Methodist attitudes toward Roman Catholics began to be transformed’. Both faiths were also connected by a shared history of persecution by the Established Church in England, and, as previously mentioned, Gladstone had made reference to this to the Cornish people in 1889.

Yet despite this, Cornwall remained fundamentally anti-Catholic in both politics and religion and in some ways it is remarkable that men like Jenner, through the Celtic

---


Revival, managed to bring the predominantly Catholic nations of Ireland and Brittany together with the other Celtic nations, including Methodist Cornwall. It could be argued that one of the reasons for this was that the Celts and those from the religions that dominated within many of the Celtic nations shared an historic discourse of prejudice. In her essay “Celts, Women and the Rise of the English Gentleman”, Nerys Patterson argues that Celts and those who were considered religious dissenters (along with women) were subjected to similar persecution. Despite its critics, towards the middle of the twentieth century, Deacon noted that ‘other Methodists were beginning to overcome their suspicion of the Cornish revival’, notwithstanding the Anglo-Catholic implications it harboured. However, Payton observed that there was still opposition to the rise of Anglo-Catholicism at a local level in Cornwall, and as unifying as the Celtic Revival was, there still remained deep ideological differences between the nations.

One aspect of Jenner’s life that he was more secretive about than his Anglo-Catholic beliefs was his aforementioned commitment to the Jacobite cause. The study of his interest in Legitimism – the attempt to restore monarchs whose hereditary rights to the throne had been denied – reveals the link between this cause and a wider interest in the Celtic Revival made by both Jenner and others. Both the Jacobites, as the Legitimists in Britain were known, and the Revivalists shared common goals of restoration based on a vision of a past which had been altered by a dominant opposing force. In the case of

---


456 See Clemo and Harris in Deacon, Cornwall: A Concise History 190.

457 See Clemo and Harris in Deacon, Cornwall: A Concise History 190.

458 Payton, Cornwall: A History 266.
those involved in the Celtic Revival, this meant greater recognition of the status of the Celtic nations, extending to a complete break with England for some (especially in Ireland). In the case of the Jacobites, it meant a reversal of an historical injustice which had begun in 1688 when the Catholic King, James II of England and Ireland, and VII of Scotland, was deposed in the Glorious Revolution.

The son of Charles I, James was not only England’s last Catholic monarch; he was also the last absolute monarch who ruled without the consent of Parliament. On his throne Parliament placed not James’ Catholic son James Francis Edward but his Protestant daughter and son-in-law Mary and William, breaking the traditional line of succession. From this time onwards there were groups of Jacobites who believed that the ’rightful’ heir to the throne should be restored. In Jenner’s time the traditional line of succession led to Princess Ludwig of Bavaria, a direct descendent of Charles I through his daughter’s line. By contrast the reigning monarch, Queen Victoria, was only descended from Charles’ sister.

In 1898 Pearson’s Magazine published an article on the contemporary situation of Jacobite supporters in Britain entitled *New Kings on Old Thrones* by B. Waters. It defined several distinct groups with varying degrees of commitment to Legitimism.

---

459 Even up until the 1930s, Jacobitism was described as a ‘definite political movement’, see Daniel Szechi, *The Jacobites: Britain and Europe 1688-1788* (Manchester: Manchester University Press, 1994) 12.


Firstly there were those who held Jacobite opinions but were politically inactive and ‘fully aware of the hopelessness of the cause’. The next group were the members of the Order of the White Rose, described by Waters as a ‘sleepy society’ of ‘bookworms’ indulging in ‘harmless ceremonies’ and reading ‘dreary papers on unimportant details of history’. 462

In fact, the White Rose organisation, which had been revived in 1886, was described by Murray Pittock as having a ‘political and moral agenda far beyond that contingent on the return of the Stuart monarchs’. 463 Not only did they want the ‘legitimate’ monarchy returned, they also sought a return to the absolutist values which that monarchy had governed with. Many of these more active Jacobites in the Order also supported Home Rule for both Scotland and Ireland and the restoration of Catholic peers, publishing a calendar with a ‘correct’ list of the members of the House of Lords. Furthermore, they sought greater religious freedom for Catholics in general who were still discriminated against under the law. They also had a wider interest in Legitimism abroad as many European monarchs were similarly thought to have been denied their rightful thrones in Spain, France, Italy and Germany. The Order’s members included such figures as Marmaduke Langdale, the poet and Irish nationalist, and the occultist MacGregor Mathers who, under the Jacobite peerage system, was also Count of Glenstrae. 464

Another group were described by Waters as being more serious in the pursuit of their


464 Pittock, The Invention of Scotland 122-123.
chosen cause and consisted of secret societies like the Legitimist Club, the Thames Valley Legitimist Club, and the White Cockade Club. Although secretive in their internal workings, they would openly celebrate Jacobite anniversaries such as the one described by Waters which was held to honour the death of Charles I: ‘On the 30th of January they wear mourning, and send a deputation to decorate King Charles I’s statue ... with a wreath of flowers’.\textsuperscript{465} The ceremony was also reported in the \textit{New York Times} in 1902 as a ‘solemn religious service’ commemorating the “murder” of Charles I.\textsuperscript{466}

In the \textit{Pearson’s Magazine} article Henry Jenner is mentioned as belonging in the first group of Legitimists – those inactive Jacobites who realised how ‘hopeless’ the cause really was – along with a man described as ‘the head of this section’, Lord Ashburnham.\textsuperscript{467} Both men were said to be known to Queen Victoria for their Stuart sympathies, Jenner himself having attended the Stuart Exhibition in London in 1889,\textsuperscript{468} and Waters claiming that ‘She followed the movement closely, and knows the names of its leading lights. One of them, a Mr. Jenner, was presented to her ... but she at once turned her back on him, saying curtly: “I have heard of Mr. Jenner.”’\textsuperscript{469}

\textsuperscript{465} B. Waters, “New Kings on Old Thrones.” \hspace{1em} <http://homepage.ntlworld.com/forgottenfutures/kings/kings.htm> See also Josephine Leslie-Moir, “Charles I,” \textit{Notes and Queries} 21 Mar 1914: 233-234, for further explanation of the distinction between the various Legitimist societies.


\textsuperscript{467} B. Waters, “New Kings on Old Thrones.” \hspace{1em} <http://homepage.ntlworld.com/forgottenfutures/kings/kings.htm>

\textsuperscript{468} Handwritten letter From Jenner to Michael Barrington. 14 May 1928. The Jenner Collection 1873-1934. The British Library. Ref. no. ms 88884/54.

Ashburnham was also snubbed by the Queen when Gladstone nominated him for the position of her Lord-in-waiting. She cancelled the nomination on the discovery that Ashburnham was the recognised representative of a European pretender, Don Carlos of Spain.\footnote{470}

However, far from being ‘inactive supporters’ as the article stated, Jenner was an active member and Chancellor of the Order of the White Rose and Lord Ashburnham was its President.\footnote{471} Jenner also subsidised, and wrote for, the Legitimist magazine \textit{The Royalist}, a journal said to deal with Irish and Welsh Jacobitism and Cornish identity.\footnote{472} Ashburnham’s own commitment to the cause was undoubtedly great: it was reported that he donated vast amounts of his own personal income to Legitimist causes and was known as ‘the English Representative of Don Carlos’ in the press as well as to Queen Victoria.\footnote{473} Along with other Legitimists like the aforementioned Langdale and Mathers, he was also in favour of independence for some of the Celtic nations and was appointed chairman of Gladstone’s British Home Rule Association in 1886.\footnote{474} Such


connections cause speculation as to whether Jenner’s public opposition to Home Rule was just that, a ‘public’ opposition, and perhaps his private views on the matter differed somewhat.

Both Jenner and Ashburnham also supported the Legitimist cause in Europe, becoming involved in what would become known as the ‘Firefly’ plot. In July 1899, Lord Ashburnham had chartered the vessel ‘Firefly’ to smuggle arms into Spain in order to help the restoration of the pretender to the Spanish throne, Don Carlos VII. Ashburnham also supplied its cargo of munitions, but the boat was captured before it could deliver the arms. Its unfortunate captain was Lieutenant Vincent English, a fellow member of the Order of the White Rose with Jenner and Ashburnham, but also Vice-Chairman of the more radical Thames Valley Legitimist Club. This scandal demonstrated that although many of the Legitimists were publicly conservative in the support of their cause, privately they were more radical and active. It also emphasised that the distinction between the different groups of supporters as outlined in “New Kings on Old Thrones” was ambiguous.

Sharon Lowenna highlighted both Jenner’s role in the ‘Firefly’ plot, along with that of fellow Cornish Language Revivalist and Times war correspondent L. C. R. Duncombe-Jewell. The two men were not only united by their interest in Celtic matters, having been co-founders of Cowethas Kelto-Kernuak (The Cornish Celtic Society), but also by their support for the Jacobite cause. She stated that Jenner was ‘implicated’ in the

---


scandal having given Ashburnham information about the use of secret codes, but had managed to ‘cover up his own complicity’. For Duncombe-Jewell the twin convictions of Celtic unity and support for the Jacobite cause were connected together by history, as the same markers of identity that made a nation ‘Celtic’ were also designated to Jacobites. As Lowenna noted, part of Duncombe-Jewell’s reasoning for Cornwall being admitted into the Celtic Congress was that the Cornish Celts had a proud tradition of fighting for both the Catholic faith and the ‘Legitimate’ monarchy. Lowenna presumes that he was referring to the 1549 Prayer Book Rebellion, when a new Protestant Book of Common Prayer was forced upon an unwilling Cornish population, and also the Civil Wars, in which the majority of the people of Cornwall were overwhelmingly committed to the Royalist cause. This seems a fair assumption.

At the beginning of the twentieth century Legitimist activity was accelerated in Britain by a sudden turn of events. In 1902 the New York Times reported on the renewed enthusiasm of the Jacobite League and the Order of the White Rose, and also revealed that there were now branches of the Order of the White Rose active within the United States. The sudden increase in activity had been initiated by the illness of the King, Edward VII, which ‘appeared likely to have a fatal termination’. This prompted Legitimist groups to prepare a proclamation that would announce Queen Mary III and IV, as the aforementioned Princess Ludwig of Bavaria would be, as the rightful


claimant to the British throne, ‘declaring her to be the true monarch’.

However, although this event brought Legitimist claims to the fore, the King would in fact live for another eight years and by that time the political climate of Britain and Europe had changed considerably.

The Order of the White Rose had always been, by its nature, a secretive organisation but in the contemporary political environment its support for the German Princess Ludwig of Bavaria was bound to attract attention. The collection of Jenner’s Papers in Royal Cornwall Museum Library contains a family portrait postcard from the Princess herself from 1910 as well as seven further photographs of the Bavarian Royal family. There are also several Christmas cards from Germany and correspondence with a Baroness Waffen. Even prior to the First World War Jenner became aware that connections to Germany were something which should be concealed, and in 1899 he wrote to his friend M. A. Lumbye urging him to do just this: ‘If you think it advisable you might say that while I was abroad last year you sent all my letters at frequent intervals to addresses all of which were in Switzerland and none in Bavaria, and received postcards and letters from me from Switzerland only’. Much as he wished to disguise that fact that he visited Germany, he continued to do so, visiting Munich in 1911.

---


481 Jenner Papers. Box 13, Bundle 2.


Aware of the shifting nature of the political scene, perhaps chastened by the ‘Firefly’ scandal, and also realistic about how little support there was for the Jacobite cause in the current climate, Jenner urged that Legitimists desist from attempting any radical action. He stated that ‘Commemorative work is not disapproved of’, and he had been active in the campaign to have the right to place a wreath under the statue of Charles I himself, but that ‘active work ... is not approved of’.\textsuperscript{484} The resultant decline of interest in the Order of the White Rose was acknowledged by Jenner when he admitted to Lumbye that its future was now ‘a puzzle’ although it seemed to him that it was ‘a pity for it to die out’.\textsuperscript{485} He compared the Legitimist campaign to that of Irish Home Rule, concluding that they were ‘not analogous’. Jenner knew that there was not enough understanding of, or support for, the idea of restoring a Jacobite monarch to the throne, unlike the situation in Ireland: ‘No political education was needed there, and the land agitation touched people in their tenderest places – their pockets’.\textsuperscript{486}

It was at this time that Jenner began a correspondence with Michael Barrington who had recently published a book on a loyal Jacobite hero John Grahame, entitled \textit{Grahame Of Claverhouse, Viscount Dundee 1648-1689}.\textsuperscript{487} The two men shared an interest in this figure, Jenner having been editor of the 1903 edition of his autobiography \textit{Memoirs of the Lord Viscount Dundee} (1714).\textsuperscript{488} The Catholic Grahame had remained loyal to

\begin{thebibliography}{99}
\bibitem{484} Jenner Papers. Box 13, Packet 5, Bundle 2. Handwritten letter from Jenner to Lumbye 15 Dec. 1911.
\bibitem{486} Jenner Papers. Box 13, Packet 5, Bundle 2. Handwritten letter from Jenner to Lumbye 15 Dec. 1911.
\end{thebibliography}
James II/VII during the Glorious Revolution but had gained what both Jenner and Barrington believed was an unfair reputation as “Bluidy Clavers” for his alleged persecution of Presbyterian Covenanters. Barrington believed that he had found a kindred spirit in Jenner, not only in his Catholic and Legitimist views, but also on wider political issues: ‘As to the corruption of party politics whether of 1688 or 1911, I am heartily of your opinion’. Both men were politically conservative and opposed to Socialism. Similarly, Jenner trusted Barrington enough to admit in a private letter ‘in strict confidence, not for any sort of publication’ that he had first been made aware of him (Barrington) by the then heiress of the Stuarts, who he stayed with in Munich.

Having already attempted his own re-writing of Grahame’s story in his introduction to Claverhouse’s memoirs, Jenner wrote that he was pessimistic about Barrington’s new attempt at salvaging Claverhouse’s savage reputation. For his part, Barrington thought that Jenner had ‘done more good than you suppose’ and that when he had lent the book to those who had ‘hitherto blindly accepted the conventional idea’ of Claverhouse’s role in history, as a murderous and fervent Catholic, opinions had indeed been altered. Barrington expressed frustration at the ‘thick-headed fanatics’ who perpetuated Claverhouse’s ‘bloody’ reputation, but had also reported some success with converts to their cause, even in Scotland itself. Both men believed that history had misjudged this


491 The heiress had written to Jenner to ascertain if he had heard of Barrington who wished to dedicate his book to her. Handwritten letter to Barrington by Jenner. 14 May 1928. The Jenner Collection 1873-1934. The British Library. Ref. no. ms 88884/54.


The two men grew sufficiently close for Jenner to invite Barrington to his home in Cornwall in 1911.\footnote{ Jenner Papers. Box 13, Bundle 10. Handwritten letters to Jenner by Barrington in London from 10 Nov. 1911.}

Jenner’s interest in the Scottish Nationalist cause, as well as Legitimism, was also evident in his war-time correspondence with a Lieutenant Malcolm Stewart, a supporter of the Scottish Nationalist Movement and a serving member of the Cameron Highlanders, who, despite being stationed ‘just a few hundred yards from the German front-line’, was still keen for the Celtic movement to ‘make progress’ and saw Jenner as an important figure of this cause.\footnote{ Jenner Papers. Box 13, Bundle 10. Handwritten letters to Jenner by Stewart from Sept. 1915.}

Further evidence is Jenner’s substantial personal collection of Legitimist magazines and in particular editions of the Scottish nationalist magazine \textit{The Fiery Cross} from 1909 and 1910.\footnote{ Jenner Papers. Box 13, Bundle 9. \textit{The Fiery Cross} magazine, issues 32 (1909) and 33,34,35,36 and 38 (1910).}

Its political nature is spelt out on its distinctive cover which depicts a Kilt-wearing man brandishing the eponymous fiery cross, as well as a shield bearing the legend ‘Albainn Gu Brath’ (Scotland Forever). Underneath this image the confrontational slogan reads “Woe to the wretch who fails to rear / At the dread sign the ready spear!”
In the front of every issue the object of the Scottish Nationalists was stated: they wanted nothing less than ‘The constitutional recovery of the rights, honours, and dignities lost to our nation in its past history, and more especially since the Revolution of 1689’. This would be achieved, in the first place by the restoration of ‘our ancient and legitimate hereditary Royal Stuart Family’, the installing of Princess Ludwig of Bavaria on to the British throne as Queen Mary III of Scotland and Great Britain, and VI of England, France and Ireland. The declaration also demanded the restoration of the Scottish National Parliament, ‘of which our nation was defrauded by an illegal convention in 1706’.\(^{497}\) According to the magazine, the loss of the legitimate monarch saw the loss of many of the privileges and markers of national identity of the Scottish nation. Here again, many Celtic Revivalists and Legitimists shared a common goal, that of greater national independence, as well as advocating the re-establishment of the clan system in the Highlands and the ‘restoration and preservation of its Celtic language and national garb’, in this case, the kilt.\(^{498}\) Also aligned with Jenner’s particular brand of Celtic Revivalism, the Scottish Nationalists were ‘opposed to socialism in every form’.\(^{499}\)

Meanwhile in England the Jacobite cause as a whole was being disrupted by a dispute between the two leading groups of Jacobite supporters, the Order of the White Rose and the Thames Valley Legitimist Club. It concerned an article on the Order of the White


Rose written by a Mrs Leslie Moir (née Foulds) of the Thames Valley Legitimist Club in *Notes and Queries*, in which, Lumbye claimed, she had insinuated that the Order of the White Rose was extinct and ‘its work had passed to her club’, the Thames Valley Legitimist Club. It was Jenner who intervened between the warring factions, noting that ‘the curse of the Jacobite party has always been an utter inability to agree’. In a series of letters he attempted to resolve the dispute for the greater good of the Legitimist cause: ‘At this particular moment, when almost anything might happen in the world of politics, it is particularly foolish for those who hold Legitimist views to fight amongst themselves’.

Although the Legitimist cause in Britain seemed to be deteriorating, in March 1914 Jenner had read with interest an article in the local press which gave him cause to believe that in France Legitimism may have been about to succeed: ‘A well-informed Paris correspondent of the *Western Morning News* ... has been talking lately about the immense spread of Royalism in France ... He seems to think that the Republic is really doomed, and that a restoration, of sorts, is in sight’. In France the situation was complicated by two rival pretenders, the Legitimist James who was unwilling to put forward a claim to the throne and the Orleanist Philippe. Although Jenner favoured

---


James as the rightful monarch (he felt that the title of the Duke of Orleans was ‘shaky’) he thought the most important aspect of this succession was that the King was a ‘Legitimate’ King, and not ‘an elected one’: ‘On the whole, as King James has not the remotest chance, I am inclined to hope that it will come off and that we shall see a Philip the Somethinth (I do not know what his number will be)\textsuperscript{505} crowned at Rheims... It will be a lot better than the Republic anyhow’.\textsuperscript{506}

Lowenna noted Jenner’s opposition to Republicanism, which, along with atheism and Socialism, were viewed as the enemy forces.\textsuperscript{507} For Jenner, these were the same things that threatened his idea of a medievalist Celtic Cornwall, as expressed in his vision of ‘Merry England’, and the same things that stood in opposition to Legitimist aims. However, even before the beginning of the twentieth century the ideals which Jenner so fervently supported were thought by some to be outdated, as Waters observed: ‘this is the age of democracy, and, while we may live to see many existing thrones fall, it is unlikely that many of the pretenders, all of whom represent the old reactionary ideas of authority, will ever regain the positions which their ancestors have lost’.\textsuperscript{508} By contrast, Jenner saw the future rather differently, proclaiming in 1911:

My own forecast is that a Socialist break-up of things in general (or an Armageddon sort of European war, perhaps both) is threatening,

\textsuperscript{505} The ‘King’ in question would have been Philippe VIII.

\textsuperscript{506} Jenner Papers. Box 13, Packet 5, Bundle 2. Handwritten letter from Jenner to Lumbye 28 March 1914.

\textsuperscript{507} Lowenna, “Noscitur A Sociis’: Jenner, Duncombe-Jewell and their Milieu,” 75.

\textsuperscript{508} B Waters, “New Kings on Old Thrones.” <http://homepagentlworldcomforgottenfutureskingskingshtm>}
and may come. Then will follow a personal tyranny, which will break down, and then – what? Meanwhile in all politics we live from hand to mouth, doing as far as possible what seems right for the moment.509

There was to be no return to absolute monarchy in Europe, but the predicted war was only three years away. By the outbreak of the War the dissolution of the Order of the White Rose had been all but complete. Jenner declared that although ‘not dead yet ... it does not do anything in particular, and all it can be expected to do is to keep itself just sufficiently alive to provide a sort of continuity’.510 It also faced a new threat as the need for secrecy within the organisation had increased. A mutual Legitimist friend of Jenner and Lumbye’s had been questioned by ‘mysterious individuals’; Lumbye wrote to Jenner to inform him of this disturbing event: ‘On very excellent authority Rawson and I have heard that the Military Authorities have got an idea that the Jacobites are in communication with Munich and are giving them information’ he wrote, adding that the questioning of their fellow Jacobite sympathisers ‘shows the necessity for keeping quiet under present circumstances’.511

Jenner too felt himself to be under suspicion, despite his work for the war effort, and he


felt that it was his Jacobite sympathies which led to this suspected slur. He did not believe that his commitment to the Jacobite cause and his commitment to the war effort posed any sort of moral dilemma:

The Jacobites at the time of the wars which ended a century ago, when England was in the same danger and difficulty as now, gave in their allegiance to the existing government ... If any military authorities think that any people holding Legitimate views are likely to be traitors to their country in such a need as this, they must be singularly ignorant of history.512

By the time the War had ended the Order of the White Rose had dissolved and Jenner’s commitment to its cause had been altered by the work he had performed for the war effort. Having caused ‘a large number of men to take the oath of allegiance to King George’, his opposition to the ‘pretender’ King had diminished. Although Jenner continued to accrue Legitimist journals and documents, having in his possession The Jacobite (which described itself as ‘The only Jacobite newspaper in New Zealand’) from 1922 and 1923, two editions of The White Cockade from 1928, and The Royal Stuart Calendar from the same year, the nature of his support for Legitimism had changed.513 Furthermore, Jenner had identified new and more serious enemies in the form of Socialism and Bolshevism, claiming that ‘it behoves all who are against those to support the de facto monarchs, and not to confuse the issues by urging Legitimist


513 All magazines are located in Jenner Papers. Box 13, Bundle 9.
claims’.  

Part of this new found support for those who were previously considered usurpers was the support that these monarchs had shown for that enemy of Socialism: fascism. ‘Two de facto Kings, those of Spain and Italy, have recently shown by their support of fascism’. He was pleased to note ‘that they can rise to the occasion and assert themselves, very much to the advantage of their countries, and a similar thing might happen here’. A year later he reiterated these views in a letter to his friend Lumbye marked ‘private’: ‘the struggle is not between rival dynasties but between any sort of dynasty at all, any sort of decent government, on the one side, and Labour, Socialism, Communism and Bolshevisms etc. on the other’. Tregidga observed Jenner’s ‘right-wing sympathies’ which were so at odds with many of his fellow inhabitants of Cornwall. He was, as Murrough O’Brien concluded, ‘a child of his age’, noting that: ‘His praise for the clerkly class does little to reassure the modern reader: the virtues of “the little man” have always furnished fascism with its most potent rallying cry’. However O’Brien also described Jenner as ‘a patriot in the widest sense, believing in a Cornwall that was part of the British Empire’, and it is doubtful that the way fascist

---


518 Tregidga, “Representing the Duchy.” 165.

ideas came to be expressed in Europe would have held any appeal to him.520

Other Legitimists were still keen to continue their active work throughout the war and beyond, but in 1923 Jenner wrote to fellow Jacobite, Mr. Meller, who was keen to revive the organisation, to state; ‘I think that the Order of the White Rose was killed by the War, and I do not see any good object to be gained by reviving it’.521 He was also urged by Barrington to consider joining the Royal Stuart Society as late as 1928, but claimed to be ‘too old for that sort of thing’ at 80.522 Instead, Jenner told Meller that he was now devoting his attention to Celtic Cornwall, whilst stating, as mentioned before, that such interest was completely unrelated to the Irish Sinn Féin movement, Cornwall ‘having no quarrel with the neighbouring Kingdom of England’.523 His choice of words is interesting here as it assumes that the Duchy of Cornwall is a separate entity to that of its ‘neighbouring Kingdom’. A year later Celtic Cornwall had taken up much of Jenner’s working life, as he explained to Lumbye:

I am too busy with local matters in Cornwall to have time for anything else, even if I had not lost interest in it [the Order of the White Rose]. I am on any number of local committees, and President or Vice-President of most local societies ... that are


working for the good of Cornwall, which is my chief interest in these days, and has been so ever since I retired and came to live in my native land ... Each post brings me letters from people (generally complete strangers) who want to know about Cornish matters ... I am governor or manager of various schools ... and on all sorts of education committees.\(^{524}\)

Although he claimed to have abandoned the Legitimist cause, there are signs, apart from his continued collection of Legitimist journals, that Jenner kept an interest in such matters. Although he had signed up many Cornishmen to the oath of allegiance, he never took it himself because ‘That was my idea of the duty of those who theoretically hold Legitimist opinions, and the five years that have passed since the war ended have not materially altered the situation’.\(^{525}\) But the focus of his Legitimism had shifted from practical involvement before the war to a ‘purely commemorative and historical’ one after it.\(^{526}\)

In line with this new ethos, Jenner gave a speech to the Royal Institution of Cornwall in 1920 entitled *An Incident in Cornwall in 1715*,\(^{527}\) about Cornwall’s role in a Jacobite rising. The plot, which was to see the ‘rightful’ king land in Cornwall to awaiting Jacobite supporters and thereafter seize control of Plymouth,


was leaked to the government and consequently suppressed. Although details of the rising were well known to Jenner and his audience, Jenner thought that many people’s view of the event had been misinformed by a contemporary account from an anti-Catholic, anti-Jacobite Whig, hence the need to revise this piece of Legitimist history.\(^{528}\) As with the case of Grahame of Claverhouse, Jenner sought to redress what he saw as an inaccurate portrait of Jacobite history.

Apart from recruiting Cornish men for the War, one of Jenner’s most important roles involved helping Belgian refugees who were one of the first peoples to be displaced from their own country. Many of them fled their homeland to Britain and some ended up in Cornwall. Jenner was appointed as Honorary Secretary of the bureaucratic Relief Committee, opining that ‘The Belgian Refugees here give me a lot of trouble, but not quite so much as the Relief Committee does’.\(^{529}\) Another cause of complaint was in his role as recruiting officer, a task that he thought could have been made easier were it not for the religious and political prejudice he and fellow Catholic Lumbye encountered: ‘They ought to make one of us recruiting officers a J.P. [Justice of the Peace] It would save a lot of trouble, but as the two of us are neither Radicals nor Methodist class-leaders, there is not much chance of such a thing in Cornwall’.\(^{530}\) It seems that Jenner himself was well aware that his differing political and religious views did indeed serve to detach him from the majority of Cornish people. Instead, he chose to emphasise what they had in

\(^{528}\) Henry Jenner, “An Incident in Cornwall in 1715.” 557. Jenner thought the author was most likely John Tonkin.


common – their Celtic roots.

Although the inevitable disruption of the war made it difficult for Jenner and others to sustain an interest in Celtic matters, the Celtic Congress still managed to stage an emergency meeting at Swansea in 1917. It was concluded that it would be impossible at such a time to try and continue with the important goal of trying to promote the Celtic languages, at least until the war had ended. The Congress also resolved to keep politics as a separate issue to that of Celtic studies, although it was not so much an apolitical organisation as a multi-political one. In a newspaper article written by Robert Morton Nance entitled ‘The Celtic Congress and Cornwall’ he stated that: ‘This is the Celtic Congress. It is not a political association, and within it meet people of very different political views who yet all approve of its objects’. Although this did not preclude political organisations from joining the Congress and it was moved that ‘we shut out no society provided it is doing real and genuine service for Celtic studies’, the nature of such groups in the different Celtic countries varied considerably, and although it was also decided that, with regard to political societies, ‘we should take recognisement of the language and literary work and determine to have no knowledge of their other activities’, this must have been problematic in reality.

In 1916, in an attempt to differentiate Cornwall from some of the more radical

---

531 Jenner Papers. Box 6, Packet 5, Bundle 1.

532 Jenner Papers. Box 6, Packet 5. Notes from the emergency meeting of delegates of the Celtic Congress at Swansea 4 Aug. 1917.

533 Jenner Papers. Box 13, Packet 5, Notes from the emergency meeting of delegates of the Celtic Congress at Swansea 4 Aug. 1917.
Celtic nations, Jenner reiterated that Cornwall’s ‘separate national sentiment’, as had been expressed throughout its history, ‘never had in it any mixture of loyalty to a rightful sovereign’. In view of Jenner’s support for the Jacobite cause this statement could be construed as ambiguous, but he was committed to Cornwall as part of a United Kingdom and an apolitical Revival. Morton Nance was of a similar mind, as his aforementioned enthusiasm for the presence of those from the Isle of Man at the Celtic Congress reveals: ‘I feel myself that the presence of the Manx delegation would make all the difference to the effect that the Congress will have upon our Cornish Celtic revival. They won’t drag in politics, and will put their Celticism in a reasonable way that will not antagonise Cornish people, as some of the things that other Celts may say might well do’. What is more, the Isle of Man had its own parliament (the Tynwald) with the power to pass laws within its own region and potentially this could have been something for the Duchy to aspire to. Within the family of Celtic nations, the Isle of Man was another of the smaller nations, and it is worth considering the relative positions of power and influence held by the Cornish and Manx people as opposed to the Irish, Scots or Welsh. If Home Rule was an important issue to those more dominant nations but not to the Cornish or Manx, it was prudent to remove politics from the Cornish Revivalist agenda altogether.

As a leading scholar of Celtic studies, Jenner may also have been aware of a pro-German faction amongst some nationalists in Ireland both before and during World War I. Although Jenner had close connections to Germany prior to the outbreak of war as

---


part of his commitment to the Legitimist cause, as mentioned earlier, his commitment to
this cause declined considerably during the war. It is interesting to speculate on whether
Jenner’s attitude as to the relative unimportance of language to Celtic nationality, one
which set him apart from so many Celtic scholars, arose from his knowledge of the
connection between the two made elsewhere.

In Germany Celtic studies was already a well-established discipline by the outbreak of
the war. In 1896 a journal of Celtic languages and literature – *Zeitschrift für Celtische
Philologie* (Journal of Celtic Philology) – had first been published, which still exists
today, and a professorship of Celtic languages was also established at Berlin University
in 1901.\(^{536}\) Incumbents of the post of chair of Celtic studies at Berlin University were
German nationalists, including Kuno Meyer, who held the post in Berlin from 1911 and
caused controversy in Britain and Ireland with a pro-German speech during December
1914.\(^{537}\) Julius Pokorny who also held the post insisted on his Germanic roots even
when the Nazis assigned him as Jewish, causing his eventual emigration.\(^{538}\) Both men
were also supporters of the Irish Independence movement, Meyer having founded a
School of Irish learning in Dublin in 1903, and Pokorny having met and corresponded
with Irish nationalist Roger Casement during the war.\(^{539}\)

<http://www.historyireland.com/volumes/volume8/issue1/features/?id=230>


Dochartaigh, *Germans, Celts and Nationalism.*

\(^{539}\) Ó’ Dochartaigh, *Germans, Celts and Nationalism* 40-41.
The potential of an indigenous Celtic language to raise cultural awareness was not lost on those within Germany who were supportive of Irish nationalism.\textsuperscript{540} According to Pól Ó’ Dochartaigh there were also those who were aware of the political benefits for Germany of an involvement in Celtic, and more particularly, Irish, studies.\textsuperscript{541} German Celtic scholars were aware that closer connections between Ireland and Germany could be detrimental to England and exploited the anti-English faction in Ireland accordingly. In 1914 leading German Celtic academic Pokorny gave a speech on ‘Ireland’s enmity towards England’, whilst Swiss Celticist and linguist Rudolf Thurneysen published a book entitled \textit{Irland und England}, which emphasised the benefits of Irish–German collaboration. Meanwhile, the Chair of Celtic studies in Berlin, Kuno Meyer, travelled to the USA to dissuade American Irish association members from supporting US involvement in the war.\textsuperscript{542} As Ó’ Dochartaigh observed, ‘[t]he potential aim of these activities was clearly to establish unity in the face of a common enemy, England’.\textsuperscript{543}

During the war itself, links between Ireland and Germany continued to be forged with the formation of the Deutsch-Irische Gesellschaft – the German-Irish Society – in 1917, one of the main purposes of which was, according to Ó’ Dochartaigh, ‘to use Ireland as a subject with which to attack England at a time when Germany and England were at war’.\textsuperscript{544} In both countries, England’s difficulty was seen as Ireland’s opportunity, and the timing of the Easter Rising in 1916 seemed to confirm the view that there were

\textsuperscript{540} Ó’ Dochartaigh, \textit{Germans, Celts and Nationalism} 10.

\textsuperscript{541} Ó’ Dochartaigh, \textit{Germans, Celts and Nationalism} 10.

\textsuperscript{542} Ó’ Dochartaigh, \textit{Germans, Celts and Nationalism} 41-42.

\textsuperscript{543} Ó’ Dochartaigh, \textit{Germans, Celts and Nationalism} 43.

\textsuperscript{544} Ó’ Dochartaigh, \textit{Germans, Celts and Nationalism} 43.
those within Ireland willing to take advantage of England’s plight, and of Germany’s assistance. The Kaiser himself even sent a message of support to the Irish people, stating that ‘His majesty follows the struggle for liberation in brave Ireland with interest and lively sympathy, in the awareness that the German sword has led many a nation to victory’. Nationalist supporters Roger Casement and Joseph Plunkett even travelled to Berlin to try and secure German support for their cause.

The appeal to Irish nationalists of German support lay in the positive depiction of the Irish people by Celtic academics in Europe. In contrast to Victorian England’s representation of the Irish as an uncivilised people, culminating in the simian stereotype, German scholars rewrote this fallacy of barbarism in much the same way as Jenner had done for the Cornish. Pokorny, writing on ‘the English “barbarian theory”’, commented that it ‘not only led to the Irish being portrayed as despicable, cultureless people outside the British Isles, but also began to have devastating effects in the country itself, since the people became ashamed of their own language and literature and gradually forgot their glorious past’. Ó Dochartaigh noted that by contrast ‘German writings emphasized the civilizing and Christianizing influence which Irish culture had had on much of Europe ... The overall theme was that this beautiful Irish civilization had been destroyed by centuries of English occupation’. In 1917, Pokorny used


547 Pokorny quoted in Ó Dochartaigh, Germans, Celts and Nationalism 64.

548 Ó Dochartaigh, Germans, Celts and Nationalism 43.
existing ‘anthropometric’ data from the nineteenth century to “prove” that Ireland contained more ‘purely Aryan’ people than England, and that many of those in England who appeared to be Aryan were actually of Irish origin.\textsuperscript{549} It is unsurprising that Irish nationalists were as drawn to this depiction of their nation as they were repelled by the English one.

There will always be a problem when one group of people proclaim themselves to be great or pure as implicit in such an assertion is that another group is less so and therefore inferior. During the war, German scholars had made claims of greater Aryan purity in order to assert Irish racial superiority over the English.\textsuperscript{550} In the 1930s the Nazis began to use these ideas of racial superiority, founded in Celtic scholarship, to compound their own race theories by relating the ancient Germanic people to the, already elevated, Celtic people.

After the Great War links between Germany and Ireland had remained strong with German scholars travelling to Ireland to lecture on Celtic matters in the 1920s and even appearing in great works of Irish literature (Pokorny is mentioned in Joyce’s \textit{Ulysses} and he and others also appear in the works of Flann O’Brien).\textsuperscript{551} These links, initially forged in academia, had always had nationalist connotations and these became increasingly pertinent with the rise of the Nazi party in Germany and abroad. In 1936 when the German Society for Celtic Studies was founded by two members of the Nazi party, Ludwig Mühlhausen and Adolf Mahr, at least two Irishmen attended their

\textsuperscript{549} Ó’ Dochartaigh, \textit{Germans, Celts and Nationalism} 45-46.

\textsuperscript{550} Ó’ Dochartaigh, \textit{Germans, Celts and Nationalism} 45.

\textsuperscript{551} Ó’ Dochartaigh, \textit{Germans, Celts and Nationalism} 74.
Mahr was resident in Ireland from 1934 until the outbreak of the war, having been appointed as Director of the National Museum of Dublin by Éamon de Valera, as well as being leader of the Irish section of the Nazi party. His job was to conscript Germans resident in Ireland into the Nazi party, but, according to Irish military files, he also ‘made many efforts to convert Irish graduates and other persons with whom he had associations to Nazi doctrines and beliefs’. Meanwhile, Mühlhausen was responsible for the broadcasting of Nazi propaganda to Ireland in Irish during the Second World War.

In 1937 Germany further strengthened its ties with this neutral nation by appointing Eduard Hempel as Minister Plenipotentiary for the Third Reich, essentially Hitler’s representative in Ireland, a post he held until the war ended in 1945. Once again there were those in Germany who thought that the animosity between England and Ireland caused by the unresolved issue of Irish partition could be exploited for the benefit of the German war effort, with SS officer Edmund Veesenmayer being selected by the Nazi party (specifically von Ribbentrop) to help ensure this happened. Although on this occasion relations between England and Ireland did not end in violence, in his victory speech Churchill was damning in his indictment of what he saw as the Irish

---

552 Ó’Dochartaigh, *Germans, Celts and Nationalism* 110-111. The men in question were Charles Bewley and Séamus Ó Duilearga, then director of the Irish Folklore Commission.

553 Ó’Dochartaigh, *Germans, Celts and Nationalism* 99.


555 Ó’Dochartaigh, *Germans, Celts and Nationalism* 110.


557 Duggan 121.
government’s collusion with the enemy. According to Churchill, Ireland (its leaders, not its people) had hindered the war effort for England when Ulster and Scotland had helped. Under these circumstances England had shown ‘restraint and poise’ by not attacking Ireland for its actions and ‘left the de Valera Government to frolic with the Germans’. Upon relations between England and its neighbour had been damaged as, as John Duggan observed, in Ireland ‘resentment at Churchill’s victory speech lingered on’. However, Ireland wasn’t the only Celtic country to be tainted by the stain of Nazi collusion.

The reputation of the people of Brittany suffered due to the work of some leading Breton nationalists, particularly Bezen Perrot, the Breton nationalist unit of the SS. Both before and during World War II they, and by extension other Bretons, were associated with anti-French and even pro-Nazi attitudes, supporting Germany as a means of gaining Breton independence. Bezon Perrot were openly inspired by the Irish nationalists of the Easter Uprising and the IRA, and adopted a distinctly ‘Celtic’ uniform (incorporating ‘Scottish’ caps) in their battle to turn France’s misfortune into Brittany’s opportunity for autonomy. The Germans were keen to harness any anti-French sentiment by supporting the Bretons – a Celtic race seen as more ‘pure’, and closely related to the Germanic ideal, in some eyes than other French people. These factors helped to make an insidious connection, as Orwell had, between all the Celts and


559 Duggan 245


561 Leach “Bezen Perrot.” <http://www4.uwm.edu/celtic/ekeltoi/volumes/vol4/4_1/leach_4_1.html>
the Nazis (see introduction).

It was a connection that the Nazis themselves made and thought they may have been able to exploit to their own ends. In 2002 Treve Crago discovered a publication concerning the activities of Breton Nationalists during the Second World War. The report by SS general Werner Best recommended that, having manipulated Breton dissatisfaction with the French State to their own ends, Germany should similarly consider taking advantage of what was perceived anti-English feeling in Wales and Cornwall:

The independence of the Breton people under German protection, serves directly the interests of Germany to bring the future English state under the dependence of the German Reich. Because it is always possible, that apart from Brittany, to raise up against the English state the Celtic elements of Wales and of Cornwall. And to create in this manner the pretext to intervene with the interior affairs of the English.⁵⁶²

In reality, this would have been unlikely to work as Cornish nationalists were anti-Nazi and, as Jenner had expressed, loyal to Britain.

The role of Celtic Breton nationalists in resisting the Nazi regime may be less well documented than some of the Breton people’s collaboration with them, but the Old Cornwall magazine reported one such example. On September 5th 1942, a Cornish-

Breton demonstration was held in Penzance in honour of “Fighting France”. It was claimed to be the first time that a group of representatives of the Free French people had been invited to Britain by a British organisation: ‘After all, the Cornish as representing the oldest of the British peoples would have some right to take the lead’. The event was said to be the ‘natural outcome’ of a union between the nations that had begun in 1903 with Henry Jenner being initiated as a Bard of the Breton Gorsedd at Lesneven. It had been further cemented in 1939 at the Chateaulin Gorsedd, when the Grand Bards of these two Celtic countries had reunited the two halves of the sword Celtia to symbolise their unity. During the event Professor Sellon invoked the spirit of Arthur as an inspiration to the beleaguered Celts:

the legend of the undying Arthur, “He shall come again.” It is a tradition as familiar in Brittany as in Wales or Cornwall. At the present time the story in another form is being repeated all over that unhappy country and its aptness to the present situation is striking:

“In the day when the Breton people are held in bondage by the people from the East, a Celtic leader shall come across the sea to free them.”

The repatriation of Arthur as a Celtic hero which Jenner was such a part of had firmly taken root by this time.


564 ‘A.R.’ 516.
In 1943, Robert Morton Nance led a resolution that was unanimously carried at the Cornish Gorseth to establish the “Friends of Brittany”. Because of the ‘close kinship’ between the two Celtic nations, the Gorseth pledged to do everything possible to assist the Breton people in Cornwall, particularly those still serving in the Forces, and to ‘help Brittany in the future’ too.\footnote{“Friends of Brittany,” 71.} The Gorseth sought donations to fund its work, but also requested that the Cornish people give practical help too, including providing hospitality to Breton soldiers and sailors on leave in the county, donating clothing and linen, and supporting the Red Cross’s ‘Prisoner of War’ fund which arranged for parcels to be sent to Breton prisoners from the Friends of Brittany.

As was acknowledged during the Cornish and Breton demonstration, it was Henry Jenner who helped forge the bonds between these two nations. Jenner’s vision for unity between the Celtic nations remained, in public at least, an apolitical one. And despite all the political issues surrounding the Celtic nations in the first half of the twentieth century, his vision for Cornwall remained focused on the more cultural aspects of its Celtic identity. Such thinking may have made building and maintaining bonds between the various nations easier.
Chapter Four

The Growth of Tourism in Cornwall and the Role of the Revivalists

The dichotomy of certain regions is that the thing that attracts people to them is that which will be destroyed by great numbers of people; how this dichotomy is managed varies both over time and from place to place. Cornwall is a relatively poor region within the United Kingdom which is heavily economically dependent on the tourism industry. Just how poor Cornwall is is demonstrated by its eligibility for Objective One funding by the European Union. During the 1998 Hansard Debate in Parliament in which Cornwall’s subsequent eligibility for this grant aid status was argued, Cornwall’s impoverishment was spelt out by Ms Candy Atherton, MP For Falmouth and Camborne, who claimed that the county’s gross domestic product was only 68 per cent of the EU average coming bottom of the UK statistics that year, (the cut-off for Objective One at the time was 75 per cent).\(^{566}\) However, as well as emphasising the region’s relative poverty, its unique Celtic identity was also forwarded as a reason for separating Cornwall from Devon, an administrative union which had in the past masked the county’s economic problems. Cornwall was described in the House as a county possessing ‘distinct cultural and historical factors reflecting a Celtic background’, Atherton asserted: ‘Let us get this absolutely clear. Let us be honest and say that Cornwall is a cultural region in its own right’.\(^ {567}\)


\(^{567}\) “Hansard Debate.” <http://www.publications.parliament.uk/pa/cm199798/cmhansrd/vo981022/debtext/81022-23.htm>
In 1999, no longer statistically incorporated with Devon (also known as the ‘Devonwall’ process) Cornwall was duly granted its Objective One status. This successful separation emphasised the continued importance of the county’s Celticity and demonstrated how its Celtic heritage has been used for the benefit of the region to distinguish it from other areas economically and culturally. However, Cornwall’s identity has, in the past, been economically exploited by others, particularly those seeking to attract visitors to it. In particular, the construction of Cornwall as a mystical, ancient and haunted land has been used to market the county to tourists for decades, a trend which has continued into the twenty-first century despite the changes wrought on both the Cornish landscape and society by the collapse of traditional industries, and the consequent rise of mass tourism. Due to the importance of the past and memory, as perpetuated by the tourist industry in Cornwall’s present, the examination of this constructed and exploited past is central in understanding Cornish identity. It is an identity that Henry Jenner played an important role in defining.

The relationship between tourism and place identity is defined by social relationships already in place and the Cornish landscape had a long-established reputation as one abundant in ‘sacred’ sites thanks to the work of writers including John Norden, William Borlase, and Richard Polwhele, all of whom contributed to the recording of sites which had undergone sacralisation from Neolithic times onwards. In the work of all three writers we find precedents for the work of the Celtic Revivalists of the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries, and figures like Jenner were able to draw on the observations made in earlier centuries to construct a convincing historical Celtic identity for Cornwall and the Cornish people.
John Norden conducted his survey of the Duchy of Cornwall at the end of the sixteenth century: a combination of social study, history and cartography. His maps were the first to use symbols to denote places of interest, such as mines, and his maps of the Duchy are littered with barrows, megaliths and other ancient sites which had taken years to record. He described the county as ‘adorned with infinite like ornamentes’,\(^\text{568}\) and thought the ordinary folk of Cornwall to be generally ‘harsh, harde, and of no suche civile disposition’,\(^\text{569}\) their violent and dangerous sports of wrestling and hurling reflecting this. And of their relationship with their English neighbours he wrote; ‘they yet retayne a kinde of conceyled envye agaynste the Englishe, whome they yet affecte with a desire of revenge for their fathers sakes’.\(^\text{570}\) To Norden, Cornwall was a land apart: ‘thruste from the reste of the Continent so farre into the weste ... Nature has so confined it’.\(^\text{571}\) This influential survey portrayed the Cornish as a race of people separate to, and unlike, the English – not quite as civilised.\(^\text{572}\) Norden noted that the Duchy of Cornwall itself was more akin to another Celtic nation than to other English counties, ‘united unto the principallitye of Wales’, both being happier under princes than kings.\(^\text{573}\) Jenner drew on Norden’s ideas for his own Celticity, with the Cornish people being linked to the Welsh by both tradition and language but he refuted the idea of the Cornish


\(^{569}\) Norden 22.

\(^{570}\) Norden 22.

\(^{571}\) Norden 17.


\(^{573}\) Norden 20.
as less civilised than their English neighbours.\(^{574}\)

Despite Cornwall having so many monumental sites from various historical periods no one had published a comprehensive survey of them until William Borlase did so in 1769. His work *Antiquities Historical and Monumental of the County of Cornwall* chronologically described and illustrated the sites of Cornwall, linking many of them to the Druids. He was later criticised for being ‘unduly speculative’\(^{575}\) in his conclusions concerning many of the sites links to Druidic worship, but in the eighteenth century, the people of prehistoric Britain were regarded as a single race of people known as the ‘Ancient Britons’ whose spiritual life was ruled by the Druidic priesthood.\(^{576}\) He also understandably, given their regularity, mistook some of Cornwall’s more curious natural phenomena for man-made objects.

Yet despite these errors, Borlase’s work was still regarded by P. A. S. Pool as ‘a scholarly achievement of the first magnitude’ due to his knowledge of the county and his connections within it, as well as the meticulous and systematic nature of his research.\(^{577}\) Borlase was a highly respected scholar and Fellow of the Royal Society who seemingly offered ample evidence of a county with a profusion of Druidic sites and a history of heathen rites. Hutton credits Borlase with being the first writer to reveal ‘to

---


576 Pool in Borlase x.

577 Pool in Borlase x.
the world of scholarship … the richness of the Cornish prehistoric heritage’.\(^{578}\) However, this Rector of Ludgvan and St. Just was wholly disapproving of what he speculated the ancient practitioners of the Druid faith actually did. According to Borlase’s rather lurid accounts, these abominable heathen ceremonies involved blood sacrifices, ritual murder and naked women.\(^{579}\) It may not have been Borlase’s intention, but, according to Ronald Hutton, such reports ‘did wonders for antiquarian interest in Cornwall’.\(^{580}\)

Borlase helped to construct an image of Cornwall as a land apart, a place of difference marked out by its past. It was an image that would be exploited by the tourist industry in the early twentieth century. However, certain Revivalists, particularly Henry Jenner, were keen to disassociate Cornwall from the Druids and all that their presence implied. When proposing a Cornish Gorseth at Boscawen-Un he wrote that there was little evidence of a connection between the Druidical institutions described by ancient historians like Strabo and the Bardic systems in Wales and Brittany.\(^{581}\) Jenner also noted that contemporary thinking on Druidism was that it was not a Celtic religion, but a Pre-Celtic one, not that any of this mattered to the writers of tourism publicity.\(^{582}\)

When he came to reinvent the Cornish Gorseth he made sure that, unlike the Welsh Gorsedd, there was no order of Druids, only Bards, therefore eliminating any such


\(^{579}\) See Hutton, *The Druids* 104-105.


\(^{581}\) Henry Jenner in Williams 185.

\(^{582}\) Henry Jenner in Williams 188.
confusion. The Welsh Gorsedd had been largely reinvented by Edward Williams (who assumed the name of Iolo Morganwg), a man whose scholarship Jenner had little faith in, stating that Williams might be described in Triad form as ‘one of the Three Champion Liars of the Island of Britain’, and a man who had “‘faked’, freely’ many aspects of the Gorsedd. Jenner was also swayed by the fact that some of the Catholic clergy in Brittany disapproved of the title ‘Druid’ because of the association with Paganism, despite the fact that many of the Breton Gorsedd were, like Jenner himself, ‘good Catholics’. Although Jenner rejected Borlase’s claims for a Druidic past in Cornwall, rightly pointing out the lack of historical evidence for it, the connection had already been established thanks, in no small part, to Borlase.

Much tourist literature ignored Jenner’s research and instead chose the power of a good story over scholarship. Even before Jenner, the connection had already been established in tourist literature. In A Handbook for Travellers in Devon and Cornwall, John Murray made reference to Borlase, describing ‘Druidic circles’, and claiming (as Borlase did) that ‘there can be little doubt that these venerable relics were the rude hypaethral temples of our Druidic forefathers’.

Following in Borlase’s tradition, in the early nineteenth century Richard Polwhele published two important and influential histories of Devon and Cornwall. A. L. Rowse observed that Polwhele’s book on Devon was just a straightforward county history,

---

583 Henry Jenner in Williams 185.

584 Henry Jenner in Williams 192.

‘comparable with other county histories’, but his companion volume was a different matter: ‘But Cornwall is not just another English county: it is not English at all’.\footnote{Richard Polwhele, \textit{History of Cornwall: Volumes I and II}. 1803-1808 (Dorking: Kohler and Coombes Ltd, 1978) Forward.} Part of what differentiated the Duchy, for Polwhele, was its history of Druidism and Paganism, traces of which Polwhele claimed were still to be found in the superstitions of the people, the ‘vulgar’ still worshipping at wells and brooks.\footnote{Polwhele, \textit{History of Cornwall} 39.} Cornwall was also separated by its language, by the fact that it remained unconquered until the reign of Athelstan and had had little Roman interference; even thereafter the Damnonians continued to struggle against the encroachment of the Saxons.\footnote{Polwhele, \textit{History of Cornwall} 2.}

Dafydd Moore commented that along with his contemporaries, Hugh Downman and Richard Hole, Richard Polwhele ‘worked to create a romantic myth celebrating the region’s eventful history and the traditions of heroism and sacrifice this history brought forth’.\footnote{Dafydd Moore, “Patriotism, Politeness, and National Identity in the South West of England in the Late Eighteenth Century”. \textit{ELH} 76, 3 (2009): 748.} However, Polwhele did not seek to elevate the Celtic culture as many Romantic writers did, instead, like Borlase, he emphasised the ‘unsavoury nature’ of the past with tales of savage Druids and their ‘pagan blood rites’.\footnote{Moore 748.} Jenner would echo Polwhere’s view of the relationship between the Cornish and the Romans and Saxons in his work \textit{The Royal House of Damnonia}. To both writers Cornwall remained a land apart for as long as it could and thereafter fought to retain as much of its own culture as possible.
The landscape of Cornwall was further differentiated from the rest of England in the
nineteenth century by William Marshall in his report to the Board of Agriculture of
1817. In an article for the Old Cornwall movement, M. Mortimer observed that one of
the reasons why Cornwall looked so different to the rest of England was the way the
land had been cultivated in previous centuries. Using Marshall’s report, Mortimer noted
that the feudal system which had helped define the English landscape had ‘barely
existed’ in Cornwall, and the subsequent and equally transforming enclosure of land,
‘what there was of it’ in the county, had happened at a different (earlier) time in
Cornwall and had taken a distinct form.\footnote{591} Marshall’s report had identified the
uniqueness of Cornwall and of its agricultural practices: ‘Damnonian husbandry is as
foreign to the practice of the kingdom at large as the lands on which it has been nurtured
are to those of its other departments’.\footnote{592}

What had really defined the Cornish landscape in the seventeenth century was not
farming but mining, as much of its prosperity lay in tin. This trend continued and at the
time of Marshall’s survey the Cornish were importing corn and renting out their
farmland to neighbouring Devonians. Mortimer claimed that it was only when tin
mining became less prosperous, as the mines became deeper, that the Cornish undertook
farming ‘as a last resort’, just at the time when the rest of the country turned to
industrialism. The geography and history of Cornwall’s past have combined to create a
unique and ultimately less refined landscape which Mortimer described as ‘peculiarly


\footnote{592} Marshall, quoted in Johns and Oliver 46.
ancient’. As well as drawing on historical descriptions of Cornwall’s profusion of scared sites and its distinctive people, the tourism industry also used Cornwall’s wilder and less domesticated environment and the rugged rurality of the landscape to differentiate it from the rest of rural England in publicity literature.

**Landscape and Memory in Modern Tourism**

There is little doubt from the historical works of Norden, Borlase and Polwhele, and also from modern surveys, that Cornwall has a profusion of sacred sites, but what effect has this had on the region? Oubiña et al. conducted research on sacred landscapes, which they defined as areas with a high number of ‘sacred’ sites comprising of barrows, rock art, standing stones, petroglyphs, and hill forts. They chose to study Galicia in North West Spain, an area where some of its people are at present fighting to be recognised as a Celtic nation in much the same way that the Revivalists did in Cornwall over a century ago.

As in Cornwall, in Galicia – and in particular the Fentáns region of Galicia – there are a high number of sacred sites as well as naturally occurring geological formations which have not always been differentiated as such. These have been continually appropriated and reinterpreted by successive groups for their own cultural purposes. The research conducted in Galicia reinforces the idea that pre-existing sacred areas are used in the invention of traditions by successive cultures – both traditions and the landscape take on

---

593 Mortimer 460.


new meanings, but they are based on older ritual uses of that landscape. An area like Cornwall or Galicia with a larger number of ancient sites will continue to be defined by its unique sacred landscape, and differentiated from others by it, throughout the ages.

As an indicator of difference, Cornwall’s profusion of sacred monuments has proved to be another magnet for attracting visitors to the Duchy, as it has to areas with similar landmarks both in this country and around the world. Ancient Sacred Sites Tours organises holidays in Ireland and Egypt as well as South West England, which in this case includes Tintagel, Glastonbury and Salisbury. The company promises to take participants on a ‘spiritual journey’ to ‘magical sacred landscapes’ where they could participate in ‘Druidic rituals’.  

Similarly, Goddess Tours International combines world and British vacations to Crete, Malta and Gozo, Ireland and Cornwall. Cornwall has been chosen as a destination because it has ‘one of the highest number of ancient sites for its area in the whole of Europe,’ as well as being ‘one of Britain’s most unspoiled and spiritual places’.  

British travel organisation Secret Landscape Tours lists Avebury, Stonehenge, Glastonbury, North Wales, and Cornwall as its destinations. As with the other companies, Cornwall’s profusion of ceremonial sites is intrinsically linked to its mysticism and spirituality and it is this sense of magic, generated by the sacred landscape which holds the key to its appeal: ‘One can see why so many saints, mystics


and artists were drawn to this truly magical land’. Within Britain and Ireland, many of the destinations included in the itineraries of the ‘sacred landscape’ tour companies are the same as those included in the itineraries of travel companies who prioritise the Celtic aspect of these places.

Today there are many examples of Cornwall being promoted as an ancient and ghostly land by tourism operators: the website for Tintagel, alleged by Geoffrey of Monmouth and others to be the home of King Arthur, claims that the castle is part of a larger mystical sphere.

If you love a good ghost story there is no better place to visit than Cornwall. Steeped in mystery, history, legends, folklore and reported ghost sightings; Cornwall is an intriguing place indeed. If you have ever thought of yourself as a ghost hunter, Cornwall is one place that you may end up being very busy.599

According to the website Into Cornwall, which advertises itself as ‘your one stop solution to enjoying Cornwall’, this sense of ghostliness is combined with Cornwall’s Celtic heritage to create an atmosphere of ancient mysticism: ‘It is said that “the spirits of the Celts, possibly the spirits of yet older people, dwell amidst those rocks ... The dead hold undisputed possession of all around; no ploughshare has dared to invade this sacred spot, and every effort made by modern man to mark his sway is indicated by its


Contemporary popular perceptions of Cornwall coincide with those of the tourism industry and the contributions made by writers on some of the most popular online communities support this view of a haunted land: ‘Cornwall is reputedly the most haunted county in the British Isles. With its long history of pirates, ghosts, pixies and other legends, it’s always had a mystical feel about it’. 601

There is no official approach to the marketing of Cornwall as a Celtic land in the same way that there is to promoting the county as a haunted one (see introduction, page 42), but that doesn’t mean that tourism operators don’t draw upon Cornwall’s Celtic past to attract visitors of that inclination. The company Cornish Celtic Tours offers a whole day’s worth of visits to mystic and historic sites on its King Arthur tour, including stops at Tintagel, Boscastle and Dozmary Pool. 602 Another company, Celtic Spirit Journeys, offers entire holidays in England, Scotland, Ireland and Wales which are described by them as ‘More than a tour, these are sacred journeys, spiritual quests, pilgrimages of the soul’. Their ten-day Avalon to Atlantis tour begins at Avebury and Glastonbury before following ‘the Path of the Dragon’ to the ‘Celtic kingdom’ of Cornwall where, as with Cornish Celtic Tours, they visit Tintagel and Boscastle as well as St. Michael’s Mount, various stones and the holy well at St. Madron. It is also noted that in many of these mystical locations the traveller will be able to purchase a wide variety of Celtic-themed...

---


Tourist operators and advertisers who have been willing to exploit the county’s unique past for many decades are, it could be argued, following in a tradition of earlier operators like the Great Western Railway company (GWR). During the 1920s and 1930s the company drew upon a number of existing facets of Cornish identity as well as establishing some ‘myths’ of their own to market the county. As David Wragg observed, GWR didn’t know the extent to which its advertising campaigns worked during its existence as there was little research done on its effectiveness. However, proof of the impact a GWR campaign could have come with a 1928 newspaper advertisement urging people to take ‘Earlier Holidays’ which generated 12,000 letters from interested customers.

As far as its influence in Cornwall is concerned, GWR’s holiday empire extended to motor coaches for taking tourists to places that couldn’t be reached by train, and also ownership of the first-class Tregenna Castle Hotel. Perhaps the greatest indicator of success is that the image of Cornwall which GWR helped to construct still endures to this day and, although by the middle of the twentieth century the power of the railway companies had declined (9 out of 10 visitors arrived in Cornwall by car by the 1950s)

---


605 Wragg 188.

they left a compelling legacy. In order to examine the impact of the tourist trade of the early twentieth century on Cornish identity in more recent times, it is useful to try and comprehend its scope and origin. It will be argued that the identity of a Celtic Cornwall as defined by Jenner and others was used and manipulated by those who wished to market Cornwall as a land of difference.

Mass Tourism and Cornwall

Despite undergoing an early ‘proto’ industrialisation, the economic situation in Cornwall deteriorated in the nineteenth century. By the end of the century both agriculture and industry were in decline and as a result there was a mass migration of many of the county’s workforce. Meanwhile improvements in the transport network, particularly the railways, coupled with an interest in Romanticism in general, and the Celts in particular, produced a great deal of interest in the region with a huge proliferation in the number of incomers. Although prior to the Second World War there is little recorded about the activities of travel industry in the county and there are no figures for the number of holidaymakers who visited Cornwall, there is still evidence of the impact of tourism.

In common with many English resorts the boom in seaside holidays in the first half of the twentieth century led to an influx of people. Figures from the national censuses on the population of some Cornish coastal resorts show the growth rate of these towns between 1911 and 1951, in particular Newquay and Bude (both of which appeared in

---


the top thirty towns in England and Wales for percentage growth). In that forty-year period, Newquay’s population grew from 4,415 to 9,930 – a rise of 125 per cent – and Bude’s by 156.5 per cent, extraordinary growth given that during this period many Cornish towns experienced out-migration too. It must be noted that many other resorts in the county would have had large visitor numbers without a subsequent increase in resident populations and that there must have been a disproportionate effect of large numbers of visitors on the relatively small towns and villages of Cornwall. By 1954, 1.4 million people were visiting the county per annum, and ten years later it rose to 2.1 million, but even at the beginning of the century the South West of England was, according to John K. Walton, ‘already out pacing the other quiet coastlines’ of Britain.

By the end of the nineteenth century many of the leading lights of the Cornish Revival recognised the importance of the tourist industry as a potential economic lifeline and consequently the 1898 editions of the Cornish Magazine ran a series of articles entitled ‘How to Develop Cornwall as a Holiday Resort’. Edited by Arthur Quiller-Couch (known as ‘Q’), the magazine called for the opinions of ‘eminent Cornishmen and others’ for suggestions on this subject. One of the problems which many contributors identified was the difficulty many people found in getting to and from Cornwall in the first place. The MP for Truro, Sir Edwin Durning-Lawrence, complained that Cornwall needed greater accessibility to improve its prosperity and said he had written to the

---


chairman of GWR several times on this matter.\textsuperscript{611} It was, lamented another contributor, Edward Hain, eight and a half hours from Paddington to Penzance.\textsuperscript{612} It was deemed easier to travel to the South of France and back again than to get from London to Falmouth. Later issues of the magazine commended GWR for taking such suggestions seriously and making crucial improvements to services to and within Cornwall. Given the condition of the roads in the county, the company could confidently boast that it was indeed ‘quicker by rail’. By 1912 the time taken for that route had fallen from eight hours and thirty-two minutes in 1900 to six hours and thirty-five minutes.\textsuperscript{613}

Because the railways were originally established to service industry rather than for passenger usage, it was not until around the turn of the century in the final days of expansion that many of the branch lines in Cornwall were opened, and journey times began to fall in this manner, the South West being one of the last places to have its resorts linked to the main rail network. Although Bude was joined up in 1898, places like Looe had to wait for over a decade before being connected to main line Britain.\textsuperscript{614} These lines were crucial to the success of the tourist trade in the county and their impact is reflected in the increasing number of passengers using GWR in the twentieth century – in 1900, 80,944,483 passengers (excluding season ticket journeys) travelled by GWR,

\textsuperscript{611} A.T. Quiller-Couch, \textit{The Cornish Magazine Volume One: July to December 1898} (Truro: Joseph Pollard, 1898) 71.

\textsuperscript{612} Quiller-Couch, \textit{The Cornish Magazine} 72.


\textsuperscript{614} Walton, \textit{The British Seaside} 73-74.
but by 1924, this figure had risen to 140,241,113.\textsuperscript{615}

A significant number of contributors to \textit{The Cornish Magazine} also emphasised the importance of promoting the county which was not widely known as a tourist resort, and in particular emphasising its beautiful and unique landscape; a few suggested it be advertised as a place of difference. By contrast, some writers, significantly not natives of the county, recommended it not be developed at all but remain remote and peaceful, citing Bude as an object lesson in what can go wrong: ‘Great rows of cheaply run-up lodging-houses ... every abomination of the jerry builder is to be seen here’.\textsuperscript{616}

Originally in the magazine Q himself agreed that Cornwall’s charm lay in its physical beauty and remoteness, but ‘in the presence of destitution and actual famine’, a result of economic decline and a population diminished by emigration, he would consider any cure. ‘It is all very pretty for a visitor to tell us that the charm of Cornwall is its primæval calm, that it seems to sleep an enchanted sleep, and so on, but we who inhabit her wish (and not altogether from mercenary motives) to see her something better than a museum of a dead past’.\textsuperscript{617}

However, only a few years later Q expressed regret at his comments. In his collection of articles from \textit{Pall Mall} magazine, \textit{From a Cornish Window} (originally published in 1906), Q noted that the views of many of those generated by this subject of ‘How to

\textsuperscript{615} “A Brief Review of the Company’s Hundred Years of Business”. \textit{Great Western Railway Magazine} 47, 9 (1935): 495–499.

\textsuperscript{616} Quiller-Couch, \textit{The Cornish Magazine} 263.

develop Cornwall as a holiday resort’ led those working on the *Cornish Magazine* to rename the topic: ‘How to bedevil it’.\(^{618}\) He found himself increasingly ‘out of sympathy’ with it and increasingly in agreement with those who expressed regret at the results of the commercialisation of Cornwall, particularly Miss J. H. Findlater who had warned that ‘Unless Cornishmen look to it, their country will be spoilt before they know it’.\(^{619}\) It was Miss Findlater who had been so scathing of the development of Bude, and she was also horrified by a visit she had paid to Tintagel only to find a modern hotel ‘built in imitation of Arthur’s Castle ... I do not think I am wrong in stating that the drainage is brought down into that cove where long ago (the story runs) the naked baby Arthur came ashore on the great wave!’\(^{620}\)

Q confessed ‘with shame’ that he had hesitated in castigating those who were so ready to relinquish the county to commercial exploitation, as Miss Findlater had: ‘my willingness to temporise was foolish’.\(^{621}\) By 1906 there were signs of improvement in the county’s traditional industries that led Q to believe that Cornwall would not have to depend on visitors’ money for economic stability. He feared he had been premature in assuming that tourism was the only way to secure the county’s economic future, but was too late to prevent its worst excesses: ‘For my punishment ... hideous hotels thrust themselves insistently in my sight as I walk our magnificent cliffs, and with the thought of that drain leading down to Arthur’s cove I am haunted by a vision of Merlin erect

---

\(^{618}\) Quiller-Couch, *From a Cornish Window* 193.


\(^{621}\) Quiller-Couch, *From a Cornish Window* 194.
Henry Jenner seemed to be in agreement with Q’s earlier assessment of the Cornish economic situation, thinking people needed to be encouraged to visit Cornwall for their holidays. In April 1926, he wrote a letter to Winston Churchill, then Chancellor of the Exchequer, receipt of which was acknowledged by Churchill’s office, in which he proposed a tax be levied on British tourists who travelled abroad for their holidays, having found out from Sir Felix Pole (General Manager of Great Western Railways) that in the previous year five million people had done so. He suggested the sum of £1 per head on these travellers in the hope that some may be encouraged to stay in Britain for their vacation and that those who still travelled abroad would generate income through this levy.

Jenner claimed this suggestion was ‘quite altruistic’ as he himself travelled abroad annually and as a resident of Cornwall he stated that ‘the fewer tourists come to Cornwall the better, as far as I am concerned’. He also declared no other financial interests prompted his proposition as he had no shares in any hotels or lodging-houses, nor did he intend to rent out his own house ‘though I live in full view of the Cornish sea’. Nor was he motivated by the idea of imposing a “luxury tax”, as he held no sympathy with those he described as being from ‘the Puritanical camp of penalising enjoyments’, but was quite happy to please the “see-your-own-country-first” people’ and those who stayed in Britain to holiday. Jenner realised the increasing necessity of

---

622 Quiller-Couch, From a Cornish Window 194.


the tourist industry at this time and although his comment that he wished fewer tourists would come to Cornwall suggests that he may have shared Q’s earlier reservations, he did not put them above the need for economic improvement. Jenner may have been primarily motivated by cultural factors in his work for the Revival but, as can be seen from his aforementioned letter to Churchill concerning tourism and the plight of Cornwall, there was an awareness of the economic problems of the county and a desire to alleviate them. And although he keenly promoted Arthur as a Celtic hero, rather than a British king, he would also have disapproved of the attachment of Arthur to Tintagel, finding no evidence to link him to that area.  

Although it is difficult to differentiate between ‘insiders’ and ‘outsiders’ in Cornwall, many of the contributors to Q’s article who actually lived in Cornwall all year round, like Jenner, seemed motivated to develop the local economy, which would certainly have benefited from his proposed holiday tax. It is an attitude in contrast to most of those in The Cornish Magazine who were occasional visitors to Cornwall, and indeed to many artists who chose to make the county their home. They wished keep the place to themselves, unchanged and suspended in time. Miss J. H. Findlater who had been so worried about the developments at Bude and Tintagel did not think Cornwall should have been developed at all, admiring its remoteness: ‘that exquisite peace and sort of primeval calm which now distinguishes it from other counties’.  

Whilst Q found himself in agreement with Miss Findlater’s views on the over-development of Cornwall, he was less enamoured with this romanticised view of it. However, when Cornwall did start to become a potential holiday destination, its main attraction was not as an exotic

---


626 Quiller-Couch, The Cornish Magazine 235.
and mythical land of romance, as it would come to be marketed, but as a health resort.

In contrast to the image of Cornwall as a land comparable with Italy or Brittany for climate that was used in later years, in early guidebooks and travel writers’ reports its reputation was that of a rugged county with unfavourable weather. Stockdale’s *Excursions in the County of Cornwall* (1824) noted that although the winters in Cornwall were very mild, it was prone to strong winds and storms. The climate was not advertised as an incentive for visitors at this time, but the storms were said to have health benefits for the local population, being ‘extremely conducive to the healthiness of the inhabitants, by clearing the air of pernicious vapours which exhale from the mines’, an idea calculated to appeal to only the hardiest visitor.627

In *Murray’s Handbook for Devon and Cornwall*, published in 1859, Cornwall was compared unfavourably to Devon and described as a bleak and barren county with only its coastline to recommend it to potential visitors. The weather was characterised by Atlantic storms and gale force winds which ‘would scarcely be credited by a stranger ... even the tombstones in the churchyards are supported by masonry as a protection against the wind’; and by persistent rain – quoting the Cornish adage that ‘the supply for the county is a shower on every weekday and two on a Sunday’.628

This emphasis began to shift in the mid-nineteenth century as the industrial revolution changed much of the rest of the country irrevocably, but left much of Cornwall

---


untouched. In 1861, Sir Joseph Fayrer wrote an article in the *British Medical Journal* stating that he could not understand why people should be so ignorant as to the health benefits of visiting Cornwall: ‘It seems hardly to be known that the conditions so essential to the invalid exist in our islands; and yet it is so, for the south coast of Cornwall presents them in a marked degree’. Fayrer himself had been sent to Falmouth by his doctor, Sir Edward Sieveking, when he suffered from bronchitis, and not only did he recover but he was also impressed by the local scenery.  

The image of Cornwall as a health resort was starting to be established and began to appear in travel guides at around this time. In 1887 Walter Tregallas published the *Tourist’s Guide to Cornwall* in which he praised the health benefits of the Cornish weather: ‘For the invalid suffering from chest or throat complaints the well-known advantages of the climate of the south of Cornwall are greater than those of any other part of the kingdom’. Typically, as with other nineteenth century guidebooks, Tregallas was quite methodical and prosaic in his description of the county itself, with no mention of a mythical land full of legends and ghosts. An earlier book, *Excursions in the County of Cornwall* by F. W. L. Stockdale, published in 1824, claimed to form ‘a complete guide for the traveller and tourist’, but he too made no mention of a spiritual or supernatural Cornwall.

The Great Western Railway Company also began to recognise ‘health giving’ Cornwall

---


630 Tregallas 15.

631 Stockdale title.
as a marketable image and soon established it as the ultimate antidote to city life. The 1905 edition of *The Cornish Riviera*, published by GWR, described the county as ‘beyond the shadow of a doubt the winter health and pleasure resort *par excellence* of the United Kingdom.’  

632 The Duchy did not so much resemble foreign countries as better them for climate without the ‘costly and fatiguing’ travel. Thanks to GWR, even the journey itself allowed an opportunity for healthiness, the carriage windows of the train being made of special glass to allow ultra-violet light to pass in during travel.  

633 GWR publicity material also accentuated a sense of difference and emphasised the ‘foreign’ nature of Cornwall, as well as its favourable climate, by drawing comparisons with the exotic Italy (see below). This was a reversal of earlier portraits of the county in the guidebooks issued in the early and mid-nineteenth century. Naming its train and guidebook *The Cornish Riviera* helped GWR to establish the new myth of a temperate location with exotic unfamiliarity. Now Cornwall was seen as a place blessed with such good weather that health benefits were almost inevitable.


633 Walton, *The British Seaside* 76.

634 “Great Western Publicity.” The Great Western Archive. 16 July 2012. <greatwestern.org.uk>
The guide also contained tables of meteorological statistics to substantiate its climate claims, as well as the testimonies of various physicians, including Fayrer’s own aforementioned doctor and physician ordinary to Queen Victoria, Sir Edward Sieveking. He pointed out the disadvantages of foreign travel as a restorative; the weary journeys, the lack of home comforts, the suffering induced by mosquitoes and the unpredictability of the climate. By contrast, Cornwall’s climate was so consistently mild, especially in the winter months, that it made the perfect destination for sufferers of various complaints. Retired doctor Edward Samuel Lee thought it to be ‘most valuable’ in the treatment of the lung diseases so common in the urban industrial regions of Britain, including ‘Bronchitis, certain forms of Asthma and Phthisis in its advanced stages’.

Phthisis, also known as Tuberculosis, caused more deaths in industrialised countries than any other disease during the nineteenth and early twentieth centuries. By the late nineteenth century it was thought that between 70 and 90 per cent of the urban populations of Europe and North America were infected with it, and in about 80 per cent of those cases the disease proved fatal. Thought to be an inevitable result of industrialisation, infection rates in some cities reached nearly 100 per cent according to public health officials. In the absence of an effective medical treatment, doctors recommended their wealthier patients travel to exotic climates such as Venice or Rome.

---

635 Great Western Railway Company 15.

636 Great Western Railway Company 16.

for fresh air and sunshine.\textsuperscript{638} Scenic Cornwall offered advantages over these places: firstly it had a mild and equitable climate unlike European destinations which were prone to sudden and harmful alterations in temperature, and secondly it was relatively cheap and therefore more likely to be affordable to workers from England’s industrial cities. Consequently \textit{The Cornish Riviera} guidebook of 1905 was keen to stress that Cornwall had advantages for ‘every invalid’, as well as for British tourists ‘of all classes’, and that bringing it to general attention was ‘in the best interests of the British householder and taxpayer’.\textsuperscript{639} This view was endorsed by Dr. Paris, former president of the Royal College of Physicians (1846–1856) and reputedly the first medical man to draw attention to the health advantages of Cornwall.\textsuperscript{640} In 1919, the grand manor house of Tehidy near Camborne was converted to the Cornwall Sanatorium for sufferers of tuberculosis,\textsuperscript{641} and, on a less scientific and more mystical footing, it was well-known that the Men-an-Tol megalithic stone could cure lymphatic tuberculosis (scrofula) in children by passing the patient though its hole three times whilst naked.\textsuperscript{642}

The idea of health tourism is one which has returned to Cornwall in recent years, albeit in a very different form to that of the last century. The new focus for promoting


\textsuperscript{639} Great Western Railway Company 9.

\textsuperscript{640} Great Western Railway Company 11.


Cornwall as a health resort is Cornwall’s only private hospital, The Duchy near Truro, which is able to offer a range of up-to-date services in pleasant rural surroundings, attract patients from outside the county for treatments including cosmetic surgery, orthopaedics, eye operations and vascular surgery. It is Cornwall’s ‘stunning environment’ and relative isolation which have helped make the hospital so popular with medical tourists who have traditionally travelled abroad in order to save money on treatments. The implication in the idea that operations can be carried out ‘discreetly’ in Cornwall is that the county is still perceived and marketed as being isolated from the centre of things, just as it was in the nineteenth and twentieth centuries.643

**The Cornish Celtic Revival and Tourism**

At the end of the nineteenth century, Cornwall’s renown as an industrial power and great mining nation was diminishing and its people were being forced to leave to obtain work. By the beginning of the twentieth century the Cornish Celtic Revival had begun. In some ways this Revival can be seen as a reaction to modernisation in that the Celts became a romanticised people linked firmly with the past. However, as well as this often externally imposed identity, the Revival could also be seen as a way of introducing stability and continuity into a society by those within it in times of unprecedented change. Shaw and Chase observed that a society in such circumstances would become inward looking; ‘theology was a sort of consolation for their loss of status and power’.644 The traditions of a society, which link contemporary lives with those in the past, represents continuity through their recreation and enactment and help to give a sense of stability to a society in crisis. The Celtic Revival of the late nineteenth

643 “The Duchy Hospital.” Duchy Hospital website. 2. <http://www.duchyhospital.co.uk/default.aspx>

644 Shaw and Chase 3.
and early twentieth centuries saw the resurrection and invention of a series of traditions connecting contemporary society to an idealised Celtic past by Jenner, among others.

The tourism industry would selectively capitalise on the romantic and appealing evocation of Cornwall as a Celtic land. In *The Construction of Heritage*, David Brett identified a connection between what he described as ‘pseudo-traditions’ and the development of the tourist trade’s attempts to use versions of the past as templates to change the course of the future. According to Brett, it would ‘package’ local differences and preserve the ‘real life’ of the people which modernity had erased.\textsuperscript{645} Traditional events revived by those interested in the heritage of Cornwall’s Celtic past became magnets for visitors and money spinners for those involved in the tourist trade.

As a result of this packaging, the attitude of those in the tourism industry and of people like Jenner and others in the Old Cornwall Societies to events such as the Helston Furry Day obviously differed greatly. It was sometimes advertised as Helston Flora (or Floral) Day – a name which could be taken as a corrupted English name for this Cornish celebration. In *The Cornish Riviera*, S. P. B. Mais referred to it as a Furry Dance, rather than a day, in which the inhabitants of the town danced in couples in and out of each other’s houses, but had very little to say on the origins of the festival or the reasons for holding it.\textsuperscript{646} However, the early editions of the guide did not mention it at all and the chapter on that region of Cornwall concentrated on the mining industry.\textsuperscript{647}


\textsuperscript{647} Great Western Railway Company 53-59.
The research done by Jenner on Furry Day is indicative of the attitude of many of the Revivalists to the traditions of Cornwall – meticulous investigation into the event’s historical roots and a willingness to contribute to the Celtic heritage of Cornwall, but not at the expense of ignoring contrary evidence or over-speculating beyond that evidence. This scholarly approach allowed Jenner to produce a well-rounded argument about the origins and meaning of this festival, tracing it back through various written references, the first mention of it being in *The Gentleman’s Magazine* in 1790.

Jenner considered the explanation of the word “furry” as offered in *The Gentleman’s Magazine* as a derivation of “flora”, identifying it with the Roman “Floralia”, but rejected this ‘tempting’ explanation of classical origins for the celebration. Instead Jenner found a later allusion to “furry” (by the Rev. W. W. Skeat in 1884) as the local pronunciation of the Middle English and old French word “ferie” (or in Latin “feria”) meaning a feast or holiday. Jenner did not reject the idea of a link with the Roman Floralia but believed it ‘akin’ to the festival and not necessarily derived from it. Instead the Helston Furry Day was probably appropriated by the church to synchronise with a Christian festival: ‘It is ... quite possible that, like many May customs the Helston Furry Day is of Pagan origin, and is connected with the fertility and vegetation myths of which Sir James Frazer has so much to say in “The Golden Bough”’. 648

Despite many of the ideas and traditions generated by the Revivalists being appropriated by the tourist industry, including Furry Day, Ronald Perry found little evidence of direct collusion between them and tourism publicists. The Revivalists were

648 Jenner Papers. Box 6, Packet 10.
striving to push Cornwall forwards, not drag it back into the past. Vernon observed that the interests of the Revivalists and those of the tourist industry were at odds, the Revivalists were keen to promote the ‘real’ Cornwall, but by the early twentieth century they saw their vision corrupted. However, John Lowerson claimed that ‘There is a strong element of local collusion, even of pushing the changes along,’ although Payton noted that the unequal power relationship between Cornwall and England made such collaboration inevitable.

The tourist industry used certain aspects of the image of Celtic Cornwall that the Revivalists defined to create a romanticised view of Cornwall and the Cornish people, identifying them with a pre-industrial golden age. However, although the Revivalists were keen to connect Cornwall to its Celtic past, they were also involved in established scientific and educational organisations such as the Royal Geological Society of Cornwall, the Royal Institution of Cornwall, and the Royal Cornwall Polytechnic Society.

Consequently, there were what Vernon describes as ‘frequent denunciations of the effects of tourism and its materialist exploitation of Cornwall’s “Celtic” spiritual resources’ by the Revivalists who saw themselves as ‘the guardians of this “Celtic” spirit and tradition’. The Old Cornwall magazine review of Cornwall and the Cornish

---


650 Lowerson quoted in Payton, Cornwall: A History 258-259.

651 Payton, Cornwall: A History 259.

652 Vernon 167.
by A. K. Hamilton Jenkin described it as ‘a judicious correction of the type of guide-book that offers the “quaintness” of Cornish people as an attraction for visitors’. Hamilton Jenkin also recorded his exasperation at the way Helston’s festival had been corrupted by the ‘alien crowds’ drawn to Furry Day who ‘come only to gaze in wonder or amusement at a “quaint” old ceremony of whose significance they know little and probably care less’.

Cornwall’s Celticity – its ‘difference’ – was being sold to tourists and Cornwall’s increasing dependence on tourism, combined with the more antiquarian aspects of the Revivalist movement, meant that memory and remembrance took on great significance in the cultural constructions of the county. S. P. B. Mais’s aforementioned The Cornish Riviera was published in 1928 and became a best-seller. It had echoes of Henry Jenner’s ‘Merry England’ fantasy comparing ‘Old England’, which was receding, especially in the Home Counties, with Cornwall: ‘in the Duchy medievalism still exists, the candle lit by the early saints still burns, the age of chivalry is emphatically not dead, and our most remote ancestors still haunt the ancient places’. Guidebook depictions of Cornwall as an ancient ghostly land compounded its image as a place removed from modernity, and the message was clear – the further you were from London, the further you were from civilization.

The underlying assumption of most travel guides of this era seems to be that most holidaymakers were from busy urban locations, described in one book as the ‘hive of

---

653 Johns, Old Cornwall Volume II 6, 37.

654 Hamilton Jenkin 451.

655 Mais, 1934 7.
life’, and would therefore find in Cornwall an antidote to their modern busy existence. The possibility of meeting the native Cornish people in their wild landscape, coupled with myriad myths and tales of hauntings, was used to tempt potential visitors. In contrast to the factual and prosaic nature of previous guidebooks, publications like Arthur Mee’s The King’s England: Cornwall became more romantic in their descriptions of the county, Mee claiming he intended his guide ‘to convey something of its [Cornwall’s] atmosphere’. Mee’s descriptions of Cornwall evoked ‘uncanny’ spiritual feelings: ‘It is magic that comes leaping into the mind when we think of Cornwall, and in truth it is a magic place ... at times there is an eeriness in this grim rock bound coast, so that unadventurous people do not always feel easy in its presence. Certainly Cornwall is no place for the man who has no mystery’.

Significantly, in these later books, the Cornish were portrayed as a more distinct, yet non-threatening people. Mee described them as ‘a little less English than other English people in the land’. Cornwall itself was now considered a land apart. The assertions of Cornwall’s separate history by the Revivalists became evident in tourists’ guidebooks: ‘We do not wonder that Cornwall was the last piece of our country to be included in England; rather do we wonder that this mystic and romantic place belongs to us’. There was a direct appeal to the romantic-minded traveller who would find a ‘tinge of aloofness’ in the race of the people, the atmosphere of the place and in the

---


658 Mee 1.

659 Mee 1.

660 Mee 1.
county’s history: ‘No one who would enjoy the rich infinity of our enchanted land can neglect Cornwall’.\textsuperscript{661} Even the industrial areas of Cornwall were romanticised, as Mee claimed that the white pyramids of China Clay mounds would become more appealing to the traveller as their affinity with the county grew, the local ‘Cornish folk’ already finding ‘real beauty’ in them.\textsuperscript{662} He was equally elegiac on the subject of Tintagel, claiming that any Cornish man knew that the spirit of King Arthur was to be found in Tintagel. He was keen to promote its mystical credentials: ‘At Tintagel we can believe anything, it is the magic bit of England – the past is alive, and poetry is true, and music and imagination are the only things’.\textsuperscript{663}

In guidebooks of the nineteenth and early twentieth centuries, Tintagel was sometimes ignored, but more often the portrayal of the place and its history was more prosaic than later descriptions.\textsuperscript{664} In \textit{Excursions in the County of Cornwall}, Stockdale tactfully casts doubt on Arthur’s connection to Tintagel and even on his actual existence. Commenting on Lord Chancellor Bacon’s account of the Arthurian myth he remarked that ‘His history has ... been so blended with the marvellous ... that some authors have been disposed to doubt even his having ever existed; and certainly the circumstances connected with his asserted birth at Tintagell [sic], are not among those parts of his story which are most entitled to credit’.\textsuperscript{665}

\textsuperscript{661} Mee 2.

\textsuperscript{662} Mee 3.

\textsuperscript{663} Mee, introduction.


\textsuperscript{665} Stockdale 108.
Murray’s *Handbook of Devon and Cornwall* (1856) was similarly sceptical: ‘The early history of Tintagel Castle is to be gleaned only from tradition. There is no authentic record of its origin’, although it was admitted that the visitor to this place would probably be reminded of stories of Arthur and his ‘stalwart knights’ by their surroundings, ‘calculated to encourage a truant fancy’. Here, as with Stockdale’s book, the guide then went on to give an historical account of the origins of the Arthurian legend as well as a detailed geological and architectural description of Tintagel itself. In the 1905 edition of *The Cornish Riviera*, Tintagel’s chief attractions were the rugged coastline and ‘invigorating air’. Its connection to King Arthur was ‘immortalised in men’s minds’ by the Victorian poet Tennyson whose *Idylls of the King* represented Arthur as the English king of a dying society.

Jenner was an authority on the subject of Arthur in Cornwall and presented numerous papers on the subject as well as writing to the press to inform people of the lack of evidence connecting Arthur to Tintagel. However, as mentioned earlier, his protestations made little difference to most of those who promoted Tintagel as an attraction, and by 1934 the area of interest for tourists had expanded to become, in the words of *The Cornish Riviera*, ‘King Arthur’s Country’ and ‘crowd-covered’ Tintagel has become a victim of its own allure, being unfavourably compared to the relatively

---


667 Murray 221-2.


undepveloped Damelioc: ‘There [Tintagel] it is not always easy to believe. Here it is impossible to disbelieve’. Meanwhile descriptions of the myth of Arthur had similarly been expanded to include Gorlois, Duke of Cornwall, Uther Pendragon, King Mark, and Tristan and Iseult.

The Revivalists, and Jenner in particular, who had presided over the International Arthurian Conference in Truro in 1930, were keen to reclaim Arthur as a symbol of Celtic resistance. But although the connection forged between Arthur and the ancient Britons or Celts became evident in tourist industry material, Jenner saw as little foundation for the claim that Arthur was actually a king as he did for connecting him with Tintagel. He claimed that all accounts purporting this were derived from Geoffrey of Monmouth’s assertion of Tintagel as ‘King’ Arthur’s birthplace which Jenner considered had been an invention by the author. His own extensive research revealed no such connection, although he thought of Castle-an-Dinas as having the most likely link: ‘There is ... no reason to reject absolutely the local tradition which associates this hill-fort with the historical Arthur’.  

Unfortunately for him the myth of ‘King’ Arthur and his Tintagel castle were already embedded in the public’s consciousness by successive generations of writers including Geoffrey of Monmouth in his History of the Kings of Britain, Sir Thomas Malory, with Le Morte d’Arthur, Tennyson, and William Howship Dickinson in King Arthur

670 Mais, 1934 141.

671 Jenner Papers. Box 8, Packet 2, Bundle 3.


in Cornwall, amongst others.\textsuperscript{674} What Jenner did succeed in doing was helping to ‘repatriate’ Arthur as a Cornish Celtic hero, a leader of the Britons who tried to fight against the Saxon invasion. Although he provided some of the material on which the tourism industry constructed its myth of Arthur in Cornwall, he did not concur with the story they established in their publicity.

But in defining the Cornish as a Celtic race, the Celtic Revivalists had unwittingly created an identity which could be exploited by tourism promoters as an indicator of difference. Now travellers could experience the foreignness of a people in their own country. Even up until the 1950s in tourist literature, the Cornish were still seen as a race apart, and very much a Celtic race apart: ‘a hardy and independent race, whose Celtic ancestors toiled and lived close to nature ... dark and alien types persist among the hospitable countryfolk ... belief in drolls and piskies is inherent’.\textsuperscript{675} In this new mythology, the Cornish people’s Celtic nature was linked to their primitive belief in superstitions, and the people themselves were linked to their wild land. They were viewed as parochial and detached from modern life with other aspects of Cornish identity conspicuously ignored by tourism publicity, including the international nature of Celtic Cornwall in the wake of the Diaspora.

The Celtic Cornwall of tourist guides was, by contrast, provincial and secluded, reflecting its role within England as the repository of a traditional life that was fast disappearing from much of the rest of the country due to industrialisation. In reality, the Celtic Revival linked Cornwall with the rest of the Celtic nations and

\textsuperscript{674} William Howship Dickinson, King Arthur in Cornwall. 1900 (Charleston: BiblioLife, 2009).

with the people of those nations who had moved, or more likely been displaced, in previous decades. Again, those involved in the Revival in Cornwall contributed to the Celtic mythology, but their international focus was quite different from that of tourist literature: however, it was their work on folklore which remained of most interest to those seeking to promote Cornwall.

The idea of a Celtic Cornwall for tourist operators has been established for some time and, as guidebook evidence suggests, even pre-dates the Celtic Revival. However, it could be said that the Revival still had implications for the tourist industry, coming as it did at a time when the industry was rapidly expanding. The idea of an independent land with an identity separate to that of the rest of England was one that men like Jenner were keen to establish, but it was also one that those involved in tourism could use to promote the county to outsiders. The form in which it did this often ignored the scholarship of Jenner and others as they selectively constructed an image of Cornwall that in some ways reflected that of the Celtic land of the Revivalists, but in others did not. It could be said that aspects of the Revivalist agenda for Cornwall were too forward-looking and therefore ignored by an industry that capitalised on Cornwall’s past, possibly to the detriment of its future.
It is posited in this thesis that Cornwall, as a region, has gained a reputation as a haunted locality and that this focus on the importance of memory and the past is reflected in people’s perceptions of Cornwall, the Cornish and Cornish identity. This image has been an enduring one whose roots can be traced back, to some extent, to the Celtic Cornish Revival and the identities constructed at this time. In particular, it can be traced to many of the Revivalists’ collecting and recording of folkloric customs and tales of hauntings. Such tales could subsequently be used by those within the tourist industry as a way of promoting the county as a place of difference where the uncanny was part of everyday life. It is an image that remains to this day and can still employed to promote the county because the idea of a haunted land has retained its popularity.

The History Press is the largest local and specialist history publisher in the United Kingdom and nearly a third of all the local history books sold in Britain are published by them. Their representative for the South of England claims that books on Cornwall, particularly ghost stories, are the only ones from a different county that sell well in all other parts of the UK, and despite there being comparatively few outlets for them within the county itself, it is still one of the bestselling areas; only London

---

One of their bestselling titles of 2010 was *Paranormal Cornwall* by Stuart Andrews and Jason Higgs. The introduction to this book describes the county as a haunted region; a mythical landscape with disrupted history and a sense of the uncanny: ‘Protruding from the rugged hills, forts and castles can still be seen, with the sounds of battle still ringing out over the strange mists and fog’.

In 2010, an interview was conducted with the authors of this book along with Kevin Hynes, who, like Andrews and Higgs, works for Supernatural Investigations UK. This organisation describes itself as ‘an experienced team of serious paranormal researchers comprised of those with both scientific and psychic approaches’. Although the team carry out investigations across the whole country, they find that they get the most positive response from those in Cornwall and found that staging events of a paranormal nature is always easiest there. When asked why this might be, Stuart Andrews replied: ‘We always found that Cornwall’s reputation as a land of magic helped in both selling tickets [the group run charity nights] and arranging venues’. Of the county itself, he commented that ‘There is something to be said about the geology of Cornwall being largely granite (if one subscribes to the recording or “stone tape theory” of ghosts being replayed or even trapped within quartz and similar materials), there is also of course the

---

677 Personal conversation with Ian Pearson, History Press Rep, held at Waterstone’s in Plymouth, 7th October 2010.


679 Andrews and Higgs 7.


681 Personal interview conducted with Stuart Andrews, Jason Higgs and Kevin Hynes at Waterstone’s in Plymouth, 4th Sept. 2010
relative remoteness and untouched qualities of a lot of the locations within Cornwall’. 682

The investigators were also asked if, in their experience, the people they meet and work with see Cornwall as a “Celtic” place, and if so, why do they think this is? To which they answered:

We would have to say yes, but being honest this opinion is more of a general one regarding preconceived cultural origins, rather than one held by those in the paranormal field. As many friends or colleagues outside of the field have expressed this opinion as those within the supernatural realm – for want of a better expression! We would definitely state that this preconceived idea of Cornwall being the land of Celtic mystery helps when arranging our vigils. 683

Although by no means comprehensive, the interviews conducted by myself and Shelley Trower with visitors to the county at various tourist destinations within Cornwall in the summer of 2009 reflected this idea that Cornwall is identified as a Celtic land, with over two-thirds of interviewees answering positively when asked if they thought of Cornwall as a “Celtic” place, and one-third of them also thought that Cornwall was a particularly “haunted” place too.

Since the 1950s opinion polls have shown a consistent rise in ghost-belief amongst the


683 Emailed interview with Stuart Andrews conducted on 12th Nov. 2010.
British. In a 2003 MORI poll 38 per cent of the population claimed to believe in ghosts and 19 per cent claimed to have seen or felt one. This was corroborated by ICM-conducted interviews in 2004 when 42 per cent of the people said they believed in ghosts.\textsuperscript{684} Similarly, a Populus poll in 2005 showed that 34 per cent of the population claimed to believe in ghosts, and the popularity of such shows as Living TV’s \textit{Most Haunted} seems to reflect this.\textsuperscript{685} Reformation theology, Enlightenment philosophy and Victorian mass education have all failed to dent this belief.\textsuperscript{686} As Owen Davies observed, ‘To be haunted by the dead would seem to be part of the human condition’.\textsuperscript{687}

In recent years there have been several televised paranormal investigations in Cornwall, including an ITV Westcountry visit to the First and Last Inn at Sennen in 2005. The same company also visited Gweek Inn near Helston (as did Radio Cornwall), and both Bodmin Jail and Jamaica Inn have been used as locations on the aforementioned \textit{Most Haunted} programme.\textsuperscript{688} However, the tradition of the ghost hunter, a media-friendly maverick psychic investigator, now a regular TV feature, began earlier in the twentieth century. In 1936 Harry Price began a series of radio broadcasts from haunted houses and in the same period William Henry Paynter ‘zipped around the country’ investigating various haunted houses and phantom sightings and gave talks on his experiences.\textsuperscript{689} Paynter worked extensively in Cornwall collecting ghost stories and folklore tales, and

\textsuperscript{684} Owen Davies 241.

\textsuperscript{685} Owen Davies 241.

\textsuperscript{686} Owen Davies 249.

\textsuperscript{687} Owen Davies 249.

\textsuperscript{688} See Andrews and Higgs 43-71.

\textsuperscript{689} Owen Davies 97.
was also a contributor to the *Old Cornwall Magazine*.\(^{690}\)

Jason Semmens noted that Paynter’s research ‘revealed how far supernatural beliefs in the early twentieth century were indelibly part of the mental outlook of the Cornish, just as they had been in the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries’.\(^{691}\) Paynter himself claimed, in 1948, ‘The past goes further back in Cornwall than any other part of England. It’s well to remember that it is to the Celtic blood and age that we owe so much of our mystic temperament, which is especially noticeable to-day in persons dwelling in isolated villages and on the moorlands’.\(^{692}\) Semmens also claimed that ‘The intensive folklore-collecting programme advocated and encouraged by the Old Cornwall movement itself contributed to Cornwall’s reputation as a particularly “folky” or “witchy” place, where the uncanny was part of everyday life’.\(^{693}\) This opinion appears to be supported by the contents of the *Old Cornwall* Magazines, as from 1925 until 1930, nearly seventy articles were published on the subject of the supernatural or superstitions. Only the Cornish language and dialect received more coverage.\(^{694}\)

There is undoubtedly a paradox between the continuation of folk beliefs within Cornwall, as recorded by Paynter and the more forward-thinking ideas of those involved in the Cornish Celtic Revival. As mentioned previously, Jenner in particular wanted

\(^{690}\) Johns, *Old Cornwall Volume I* 41-44.


\(^{692}\) Semmens 181.

\(^{693}\) Semmens 59.

\(^{694}\) Johns, *Old Cornwall Volume I* 37.
Cornwall to be recognised as a nation in order to strengthen its identity. The Revivalists were also committed, through the Celtic Congress, to the future betterment of social conditions for those within all the Celtic nations.\textsuperscript{695} Such progressive ideas seem to jar with the perpetuation of traditional beliefs within Cornwall which served to portray it as an ancient mystical land far removed from modernity and its practicalities.

Recorder of traditional stories and Cornish folklore Robert Hunt observed this dual identity as he travelled the county, visiting ‘each relic of Old Cornwall’ and meeting with the local people in order to ‘gather up every existing tale of it ancient people’.\textsuperscript{696} As Payton noted of Hunt: ‘He recognised that beneath the veneer of scientific and technological progress so typical of mid-nineteenth century Cornwall, there was an older, traditional belief that for him defined the authentic if somewhat disturbing, primeval Cornish character’.\textsuperscript{697} Payton himself observed that ‘Technological advanced and industrially complex, Cornwall was nonetheless far removed in distance and culture from the urbanized, metropolitan centres of Britain’.\textsuperscript{698} It was this situation, and its consequences, that those involved in the cultural promotion of the county wished to alleviate as they sought for greater recognition and an investment, both culturally and financially, in the future of Cornwall.

However, as the tales of Cornish hauntings recorded by so many writers attest to, there was an inconsistency between the modernist aspirations of the Revivalists and the continuation of folk belief which some of them helped to record. This relationship was

\textsuperscript{695} The Celtic Constitution 1918. Published leaflet.

\textsuperscript{696} Robert Hunt, \textit{Cornish Folklore} (Redruth: Tor Mark, 2000) 2.


\textsuperscript{698} Payton, “Bridget Cleary and Cornish Studies: Folklore, story-telling and Modernity.” 203.
further complicated by the arrival of mass tourism in Cornwall and with it, as will be discussed further, the linking of specific ghost stories to specific locations that compounded Cornwall’s reputation as a mystical land. As contested in the previous chapter, there may have been little direct collusion between the Revivalists and the tourism industry at first, but there is little doubt that links existed between the material that certain Revivalists produced and the marketing stories used for the promotion of tourism within the county. Commenting on author M. A. Courtney’s work on Cornish folklore, Payton suggested that; ‘It may be that Courtney, who had collected her material in a populist book *Cornish Feasts and Folklore*, had more than a commercial eye to a burgeoning tourist trade which sought Cornish ‘difference’ and encouraged an exotic ‘other’’.  

699 Similarly, Deacon said of the 1920s and 1930s in Cornwall that, in these latter years of the tourism boom, there were ‘explicit links’ between the material in guide books of that time and the Revivalists.  

700 Companies like GWR were able to draw on the repository of ghostly tales collected by writers like Hunt and Courtney, and by the Old Cornwall societies, compounding Cornwall’s reputation as a mystical land and locating it firmly in the past.

At the same time, the reality of the economic situation which prompted many to see tourism as the possible salvation of the county was unsurprisingly hidden from the tourist gaze. However, its established reputation both as a haunted place and as a place of economic deprivation had an impact on Cornish identity and attempts to shape it. In his work on the subject of landscaping death, Patrick Laviolette sought to investigate, in his words, ‘the material relationships between death and the revival of Cornish

---


700 Deacon, *Cornwall: A Concise History* 190.
He wrote of Cornwall as a place with ‘an obscure and diffuse sense of “deathliness”’; it has a ‘dead’ language, there was the death of its industry and of its people, as thousands left due to economic hardship (death and departure are described as ‘close cousins’ by Laviolette) and were in turn replaced by retired in-migrants. He also observed that along with the renewal and creation of optimistic myths of cultural resurgence, ‘rueful myths about death and despair’ were also revived and invented.

These myths distinguished the region as one of ‘enchantment’, and in such an atmosphere the occurrence of ‘strange or morbid’ events did not seem unlikely. Laviolette contests that ‘to a degree there exists a prominent belief in Cornwall that the culture and land themselves are dying’, but also asserts that the ‘deathliness’ of the region ‘helps keep Cornwall alive’ as ‘death is a meta-narrative about cultural survival’. Identity cannot be fostered without acknowledging the past and the past is steeped in death. The people of the region are constantly looking back because their identity is constantly threatened, and ‘the very prominence of death itself becomes a significant motive for identification and group solidarity’.

In this context, hauntings could be seen to operate in particular places as forms of

---


702 Laviolette 215.

703 Laviolette 215-240.

704 Laviolette 217.

705 Laviolette 237.

706 Laviolette 237.
cultural memory, as evidence of a reluctance to abandon the past, and as a means of keeping the past alive in the face of the dramatic changes that began at the end of the nineteenth century. It was a time of social and political upheaval, especially in Cornwall, which had lost its status as a modern industrial nation and had experienced a diaspora, but also saw tourism booming along with second home ownership. The pre-existing prejudice against the Celtic people in general was also still evident at this time. We see echoes of the perception of Celtic people as an “other” in contemporary views on ghosts. The author of *Victorian Hauntings: Spectrality, Gothic, the Uncanny and Literature*, Julian Wolfreys, described ghosts in the same way that the Cornish and other Celtic people have been defined, as ‘double’ (in his term) as they are ‘familiar enough to be disturbing and strange enough to remind us of the otherness that inhabits the self-same’.  

The Victorian era of which Wolfreys was writing did not end with the death of the Queen: as Cox and Gilbert observed, it remained relevant well into the following century as ‘those born and educated in this era shaped the early twentieth century’; this would include people like Jenner.  

So even into the twentieth century, when it was assumed that many of the mysteries of science had been solved and a belief in the supernatural could correspondingly have been expected to decline, ghost stories continued to proliferate, with Cox claiming that: ‘The increasing pace of material change did not extinguish supernatural fiction: it was, on the contrary, a

---


prerequisite for its development’. In *Victorian Ghost Stories*, Cox and Gilbert further explained that ‘the ghost story seemed to thrive precisely because it dealt in possibilities that were in fundamental opposition to the explicatory march of science’: they defied empirical logic. Events in the twentieth century influenced the very nature of ghost stories too as they moved from Gothic tales to contemporary tales of ordinary people trying to cope with extraordinary situations, particularly the First World War and the consequent upheaval of society in general.

Often ghost stories derive from traumatic experiences like wars, or, in the case of Cornwall, from the sudden influx of ‘outsiders’, and the supernatural has been resorted to as a way of recovering a lost past through mythical and fictional means. Societies often resort to ‘golden ages’ like Jenner’s ‘Merry England’ in times of trauma and change: the past is pulled into the present and ghosts are an effective way of doing this, bridging the gap between the lost past and the disrupted present. They can act as both tools of memory and of cultural renewal because, as Brogan notes, ‘ghostly “kinship” replaces biological descent as the basis for ethnic affiliations’.

In certain areas ghosts can act as a way of binding those who feel a claim to that region with its previous inhabitants, as the ghosts are often those of ancestors who still reside in and fill the

---

709 Cox xii.

710 Cox and Gilbert xv.


712 Brogan 12.
place: it is a ‘recolonizing’ of the present by the past. In this way ghost stories can be a method of idealising the past by a community or a nation and just as these myths and past tales of hauntings can be influenced by current events, so current events can be influenced by them in turn.

More recent works on ghosts and identity, like that of Judith Richardson, have emphasised these social, political and historical implications of haunting. Richardson examines how different narratives are born out of, and subsequently influence different areas. As Richardson states, ‘hauntedness affects the real world’ and hauntings are often symptomatic of real problems of possession and belonging: ghosts have a purpose for those in the present. The value in examining an area’s ghosts is in what they can reveal about the communities which produce them, from the number and type of ghosts to the times in which they are produced. As Richardson explained ‘Ghosts operate as a particular, and peculiar, kind of social memory, an alternate form of history-making in which things usually forgotten, discarded, or repressed become foregrounded’. In Richardson’s work, haunting is a sign of social division and the ghost story is a form of social memory marking the return of the repressed.

---

713 Richardson 192.
715 Richardson 3.
716 Richardson 201.
717 Richardson 3.
Richardson focuses on the Hudson River Valley between Manhattan and Albany as a study area, which, like Cornwall, has ‘developed a reputation as an uncommonly haunted place’. At first glance it would seem that the two regions – the Hudson Valley and Cornwall – are quite different and therefore it is strange to compare any area of America, a country deemed by Richardson to be forward-facing, with a ‘sense of pastlessness’, with a region with such a long history. However, many of the problems the two areas experienced in their respective pasts were the same, as both regions share a long-standing reputation for hauntedness, and could be said to be ‘rife with claims of exceptional ghostliness’. They also share strong folklore and storytelling traditions that have recorded many tales of hauntings. Other media, from guidebooks and traveller’s tales to historical accounts, as well as films and television, the theatre, and more recently the internet, have all contributed stories of ghostliness to these areas too. They also share a reputation as distinctly rural locations when in fact both had heavily industrialised regions which consequently experienced an unpicturesque decline that did not fit in with the image marketed by their respective tourist industries, but did produce a whole new series of ghosts.

Both places also developed reputations as timeless and unchanging compared to more ‘central’ locations; however, Richardson asserts that ghosts tend to appear in places where this sense of ‘historical continuity’ is under threat due to societal disruption. She describes the Hudson Valley’s past in just these terms: ‘This restless and contentious history, replete with acts of dispossession, marginalization and violence was

---

719 Richardson 25.

720 Richardson 2.

721 Richardson 2.
ripe for the development of regional haunting, not least because it left a considerable supply of ghosts’. This description has echoes of Cornwall’s history, especially in claims of peripherality and social disruption.

As a result of a disrupted history with its marginalisation and social disquiet, Richardson said of the Hudson Valley that: ‘Ghosts congregate here not in spite of the social and historical discontinuities; they congregate here because this is a complex, contentious place, and because they themselves are shifty creatures, drawn to uncertainty and capable of reflecting back to a diverse, restless society the spectrum of its desires and anxieties’. Hauntings emanate from social and historical tensions caused by development and obsolescence, the ‘restlessness of history’ and are ‘driven in part by ambivalent relationships between region and metropolis’. Often ghosts serve a purpose directly related to the threats that certain areas are under. Bergland observed of ghosts that they are ‘the things that we try to bury, but that refuse to stay buried, they are our fears and our horrors’, and goes on to argue that ghosts are sometimes as desired as they are feared, especially as they can act in the defence of a territory.

Those in certain territories may feel this need to be defended for several reasons. In the case of the two areas in question, in the twentieth century both the Hudson Valley and

722 Richardson 23.

723 Richardson 209.

724 Richardson 5.


726 Bergland 6.
Cornwall became popular tourist destinations as the railways opened both areas up to travellers. There emerged a strong contrast in both places between the guidebook image of the place, fostered by Romanticism, and a denial of the reality of decline and disruption. As industry died in both places (in the early twentieth century in the Hudson Valley, and earlier in Cornwall), and as Romanticism began to take hold of the public consciousness, both public and private transport links were improved and tourism increased in these places where the geography was so well suited to romantic tastes. The areas of ‘unpicturesque decline’ were increasingly ignored.

More permanent incomers also arrived in the form of writers and artists who colonised the regions (in an imperial sense, according to Richardson). Some of these incomers became the most fervent advocates for the preservation of the region as they romanticised both the land and its people. There is a contrast between the attitude of incomers and those already resident in the county: Jenner and others involved in the Old Cornwall movement were also dedicated to the preservation of local culture and landscapes, but not if it appeared to be at the expense of the local people. If the old had to make way for the new, they asked only that the old be recorded so it would not be forgotten. In 1914, Thurston Peter sent a letter, eventually intended for those involved in a road widening project in Camborne, to Jenner (fellow member of the Association for the Preservation of Ancient Monuments) for his approval. He wrote:

I am informed that by widening your road you will cover Mary’s Well ... Camborne having developed from a village to an important commercial town, it is inevitable that things of this kind should occur, and sentimentalist as I am I do not for one moment protest
against the inevitable, but I venture ... to ask whether it is not possible for you to place there some tablet to keep the memory of the site.\footnote{727 Jenner Papers. Box 4, Bundle 8. Typed letter from Thurston Peters to Mr. J. M. Holman, but forwarded to Henry Jenner and dated 4th Nov. 1914.}

By contrast, many incomers could afford to be less practical and more romantic about their adopted home and its people. As Richardson noted, ‘regional treatments of Hudson Valley “folk” in the 1930s and 1940s often relegated them to a level of quaintness and antiquity in ways that both augmented their local colourfulness and justified their marginalization’.\footnote{728 Richardson 198.} These colonising ‘outsiders’ also delivered some of the most enduring myths, for example Washington Irving’s Legend of Sleepy Hollow or Daphne Du Maurier’s Jamaica Inn. In such situations, ghosts were used in the defending of territory because local people were actually being displaced, their local culture was being overwhelmed and their history altered: as Richardson explained of the Hudson Valley, ‘acts of restoration have also been acts of dispossession’.\footnote{729 Richardson 200.}

As observed in Chapter Four, the geographical features of an area can help to determine its identity. With the landscape of both areas, the very nature of the territory itself lends itself to hauntedness in both its diverse natural features and its proliferation of man-made monuments, which have individually given rise to tales of the mystical, and hauntings and which also combine to inspire romantic reactions. According to Richardson, the Hudson Valley was ‘ripe for hauntedness, both in the psychological and...
cultural associations it evoked.⁷³⁰ Likewise in the haunted landscape of Cornwall, Tilley and Bennett asserted that natural places can take on supernatural significance; there are many landscape features that look like ancestral creations, but are, in fact, natural phenomena.⁷³¹

The very real problem is that in these two areas of haunting, the past is very much in the present, and it is a past that has often been constructed, or corrupted, by others. This invented past is given such value that its preservation from modern day encroachments often means that the actual folk of the place are dispossessed of their homeland in the cause of the preservation of the mythical construction of the region in question. If areas of a region are thought to possess a particular quality worth preserving, then preservation and restoration may take priority over the needs of the ethnic population of that area. Industry may be dissuaded or moved away from valued picturesque locations with historical connections, connections that are often mystical constructs by outsiders. This conservation-induced displacement has been a recognised phenomenon by, amongst others, Dawn Chatty and Marcus Colchester: the ‘backwards’ nature of certain peoples and places attracts tourists, which leads to the desire to preserve an area, often to the detriment of the indigenous population.⁷³²

Differentiating ideas from ‘outsiders’ and ‘insiders’ produces conflict, and in Cornwall,

---

⁷³⁰ Richardson 16.


unlike the Hudson Valley, we must add the dimension of ethnicity. Although there is a
differentiation between the predominantly Dutch influenced Hudson Valley area and the
‘English’ city of New York, it could be argued that the Cornish sense of a Celtic
ethnicity makes its individual identity even stronger. Semmens claimed that it was this
strong sense of Celtic ‘otherness’ that truly differentiated it in its belief systems, and the
county also had other markers of identity born out of its Celticity.\(^{733}\) Henry Jenner
undoubtedly contributed to this sense of Cornish Celtic otherness by helping to establish
an historical link between the ancient Celtic peoples of Britain and contemporary
Cornish people as well as a corresponding cultural link: he claimed that ‘through its
[Cornwall’s] people, racially mixed though they are, there still flows the blood and
inspiration of a prehistoric native ancestry, and among the oldest Cornish men and
women of many an isolated village or farm, there yet remains some belief in fairies and
pixies’.\(^{734}\) Yet he also noted that these ancient beliefs had been corrupted. Whereas once
piskies and fairies were seen as a separate race, ‘neither divine nor human’, who shared
the contemporary world with humans, in Jenner’s time the definition was changing.\(^{735}\)
There had emerged ‘a very modern idea’ that these creatures were now held to be
‘spirits of the dead’, an idea that to a ‘pre-Reformation Cornishman’ would have been
‘unthinkable’: Cornwall was, more than ever, a haunted land.\(^{736}\)

Historically, Methodism being the dominant religion in Cornwall also helped create a

\(^{733}\) Semmens 59.

Smythe Ltd, 1977) 170.

\(^{735}\) Jenner in W.Y. Evans-Wentz, 168.

\(^{736}\) Henry Jenner, “Piskies: A Folklore Study.” A paper read at the summer meeting of the Royal Cornwall
Polytechnic Society, Falmouth. Sept. 2nd (1915).
sense of difference from its ‘English’ neighbours as well as helping to perpetuate existing beliefs. Its preachers were generally tolerant of their communities’ superstitions and John Wesley himself was not only a believer in ghosts, but was supposed to have appeared as one in order to admonish his followers for backsliding. As a result of this tolerance of traditional beliefs, as Methodism spread (usually in areas like Cornwall and Wales, already renowned for superstitious beliefs) so did the propagandist allegations of the Anglican church that the movement was responsible for fostering a belief in spirits, ghosts and witches. As Owen Davies observed, such beliefs were seen as a sign of credulity and ignorance. Equally, to reject ghosts was a good way of allaying suspicions of Methodist sympathies.

Davies also noted that there were ghost beliefs specific to Cornwall. He defined ghosts as ‘the manifestation of the souls of the dead before the living’ and in Cornwall, he noted that fairies and ghosts both fitted this description with fairies being referred to as ‘spirits’. They continued to be linked together even when fairy belief in the rest of England was disappearing from the seventeenth century onwards. However, he refused to speculate on whether Cornwall’s history of Celtic traditions has anything to do with this unique view. There were others, particularly within the Old Cornwall movement, who were less reticent to make the connection, including Jenner, although he could not offer an explanation for it: ‘I do not know why it is so, but to this day the fairy faith is

737 Owen Davies 87.

738 Owen Davies 122.

739 Owen Davies 122.

740 Owen Davies 2.

741 Owen Davies 3.
stronger among the Celtic nations’. In *The Fairy-Faith in Celtic Countries*, the anthropologist and writer Walter Yeeling Evans-Wentz offered his explanation, stating that the ‘natural aspects’ of the Celtic nations ‘impress man and awaken in him some unfamiliar part of himself,’ as a result this ‘gives him an unusual power to know and to feel invisible, or psychical influences’.  

Henry Jenner was engaged in a lengthy correspondence with Evans-Wentz, whilst the latter was at Jesus College, Oxford, on the subject of mystical beliefs and, in particular, Evans-Wentz’s book, *The Fairy-Faith in Celtic Countries*, for which Jenner contributed the introduction to the chapter on Cornwall. Jenner’s interest in the mystical is not easy to trace but Tobias Churton makes reference to Jenner’s relationship with leading occultist Aleister Crowley, and he also corresponded with psychologist and psychic researcher, Edmund Gurney. Gurney thought Jenner to be knowledgeable on the subject of psychic matters and, whilst Jenner was working at the British Museum, sought his help in acquiring ‘authentic reports’ on the subject.

Evans-Wentz tried to secure the help of pre-eminent scholars in each of the Celtic countries to write the relevant introductions to his book, Dr. Douglas Hyde having written about Ireland and the Right Hon. Sir John Rhys about Wales. For Cornwall, he

---

742 Henry Jenner, “Piskies: A Folklore Study.”

743 Evans-Wentz xxx.


745 Churton.

requested Henry Jenner, whom he described as ‘a true Celt whose name is inseparable from that of Cornwall’, adding that by contributing to his book, Jenner would ‘make it a scientific document of the utmost value to Celtic scholars’. Evans-Wentz was keen to employ those he deemed to be the foremost scholars in all the Celtic countries to support his theories of fairy belief, gleaned from three years of anthropological study that was both ‘sympathetic’ and ‘scientific’ in nature, claiming that he ‘daily felt the deep and innate seriousness of his [the Celt’s] ancestral nature’.

This anthropological approach to the Celts reflects their status as an ‘other’, and Evans-Wentz drew comparisons between them and other ‘uncorrupted’ peoples; the ‘Australian Arunta’ and the ‘American Red Man’ with their ‘natural minds’, that remain ‘ever open to unusual psychical impressions’. Yet Evans-Wentz claimed that the Cornish, more than any other Celtic race had lost touch with their past:

The Cornishman’s vision is no longer clear. He looks upon cromlech and dolmen, upon ancient caves of initiation, and upon the graves of his prehistoric ancestors, and vaguely feels, but does not know, why his land is so holy, is so permeated by an indefinable magic; for he has lost his ancestral mystic touch with the unseen – he is ‘educated’ and ‘civilized’. The hand of the conqueror has fallen more heavily upon the people of Cornwall than upon any

---


748 Evans-Wentz xxx.

749 Evans-Wentz xxxvi-xxxvii.
other Celtic people, and now for a time, but let us hope happily
only for this dark period of transition, they sleep – until Arthur
comes to break the spell and set them free.\footnote{Evans-Wentz 13.}

As Carl Phillips observed in his work \textit{Mystical Geographies in Cornwall}, Evans-Wentz
as both criticising the education system for causing the people of Cornwall to lose their
‘ancestral mystic touch with the unseen’ (Evans-Wentz).\footnote{Evans Wents, quoted in Carl Phillips 149.} Jenner was no less
disparaging in his assessment, claiming it had caused the ‘lower classes’ to become
‘ashamed’ of their faith and to ‘despise and endeavour to forget it’.\footnote{Evans-Wentz 163.}

However, in the second decade of the twentieth century it was still possible for Jenner to
write that: ‘It is generally believed that ancient Cornish legends, like the Cornish
language, are things of the past only, but I am now no longer of that opinion’.\footnote{Evans-Wentz 170.}
Jenner’s contribution to Evans Wentz’s book demonstrates Jenner’s own interest in a
mystical Cornwall as well as his desire for the continuation of what he deemed to be an
historical Celtic belief system.

Another practice that was still widespread in Cornwall was that of ghost laying. Owen

\begin{footnotesize}
\footnote{Evans-Wentz 13.}
\footnote{Evans Wents, quoted in Carl Phillips 149.}
\footnote{Evans-Wentz 163.}
\footnote{Evans-Wentz 170.}
\end{footnotesize}
Davies wrote that this practice was ‘most prevalent in south west England’, and even until the end of the nineteenth century, the famous Cornish ghost-layer Rev. Thomas Flavel, the seventeenth century vicar of Mullion, was still remembered, as was Richard Dodge, Vicar of Talland who, it was reputed, ‘could raise ghosts, or send them into the Red Sea, at the nod of his head’. The Botathen Ghost by R. S. Hawker is a fictional account of just such a figure, but presented as a second hand account drawn from the journal, letters and local accounts of one Parson Rudall of Launceston, a ‘powerful minister, in combat with supernatural visitations’. He is portrayed as an eccentric figure, made all the more so by his isolated existence in a small Cornish community far away from ‘civilized regions’. The ghost laying ritual itself seems to have more in common with pagan or Druidic rituals than any Christian exorcism, involving the drawing of a circle and pentangle and a crutch made of rowan.

Such tales serve to link the contemporary people of Cornwall to their ancestral past, as in Donald Rawe’s In Killigarrek Wood (1976), in which the protagonist becomes involved in an ancient Celtic ceremony:

At times he was carried back, away into the long lost yet never forgotten world of Celtic heroism, legend and myth. Celts are

---

755 Owen Davies 77.


757 R. S. Hawker in Cox and Gilbert 66.

758 R. S. Hawker in Cox and Gilbert 65.

759 R. S. Hawker in Cox and Gilbert 71.
supposed to be born with their heads looking back over their shoulders. Perhaps; but he knew it was that very quality of respect, indeed veneration, for the past which made Celtic tradition so persistent, so indelible and indestructible, despite all the horrors perpetrated against it by Roman and Germanic lusts for power.\textsuperscript{760}

There are clear echoes of Jenner’s vision of a Celtic Cornwall here, as well as his representation of the Cornish Celts as expressed in works like \textit{The Royal House of Damnonia} and \textit{The Celts in Cornwall}.\textsuperscript{761} Later in the tale, other more recent examples of Celtic oppression are mentioned: the massacre at Anglesey, the defeat of Glendwr, the butchery at Culloden and the ‘iron suppression of Ireland’, as well as events from Cornish history: the fate of Flamank and An Gof at Tyburn, the demise of the language and the submission of culture to that of England.\textsuperscript{762} If we accept the idea of the Celtic nations as having colonial status (as Michael Hechter does)\textsuperscript{763} then we can also posit that they can be, as Sneja Gunew observed, haunted by their colonial history in the way Rawe describes.\textsuperscript{764}

Smuggling and wrecking have also generated many ghost stories in Cornwall, including \textit{The Lady with the Lantern}, as recorded by Robert Hunt, in which the


\textsuperscript{761} Jenner \textit{The Celts in Cornwall} and Jenner \textit{The Royal House of Damnonia}.

\textsuperscript{762} Rawe 130.

\textsuperscript{763} See Hechter \textit{Internal Colonialism}.

\textsuperscript{764} Gunew.
spirit of a mother who lost her child in a wrecking is observed searching for him on tempestuous nights. But perhaps the most famous tale of Cornish smugglers is du Maurier’s *Jamaica Inn* which, more than any other story, helped establish a brutal reputation for wrecking and a callous disregard for human life in general that has tainted generations of Cornish people since. The current publicity material for the Inn emphasises that the ‘legendary’ venue was a place where both travellers and smugglers would stay, and that its troubled past has generated a number of ghosts over the decades. The official website even quotes the television programme *Most Haunted*, which claimed that the episode they filmed there was ‘one of the spookiest programmes ever recorded’. It also noted that: ‘For years there have been many stories of hauntings at Jamaica Inn and recently the Ghost Society has made in-depth investigations and compiled a report based on their findings’. Although inspired by du Maurier’s book, this now-claimed hauntedness bears little relation to the contents of the novel which has an altogether darker tone and more sinister implications creating a reputation for the Cornish that persists in modern times.

There is a sense in the book that the local people are haunted by their heathen past, and that their Christianity has been tainted as a result, the local vicar claiming of the church

---


that: ‘They do not know that beneath the foundation-stone lie the bones of their pagan ancestors, and the old granite altars where sacrifice was held long before Christ died upon His cross’.\textsuperscript{769} Similarly ‘pagan footsteps trod upon the hills’ so the land itself bore the memories of another godless age.\textsuperscript{770} The text itself has references to ‘haunting and uncanny light’,\textsuperscript{771} ‘pagan barbarism’,\textsuperscript{772} and Druids.\textsuperscript{773} This was an image of Cornwall that Jenner was keen to dispel, his vision for Cornwall was strongly Anglo-Catholic and he denied any hint of Druidic worship in its Celtic past. Yet again the power of a good story prevailed over historical evidence (or lack of in the case of the Cornish and wreckers) and the myth has proved an enduring one.

One of the most common themes in tales of hauntings in Cornwall is of the sceptical metropolitan outsider who is punished for their lack of respect for local superstitions and legends in some way. In a way, these locally composed tales are another form of ‘writing back’: instead of the local people being maligned for their primitive folk beliefs, it is the incomers who are punished for their lack of belief. History is being rewritten through the returning ghosts of the past. Sometimes the protagonists of stories pay for their scepticism with their lives, as in A Skeleton in the Cupboard, originally a one-act drama, but written as a story by Donald Rawe. The husband Terence is the sceptic: ‘Because we’re in Cornwall and it’s supposed to be a haunted sort of place, we

\textsuperscript{769} du Maurier 280.
\textsuperscript{770} du Maurier 39.
\textsuperscript{771} du Maurier 260.
\textsuperscript{772} du Maurier 277.
\textsuperscript{773} du Maurier 278.
have to have noises. I’ve no doubt they’re all perfectly natural and explicable'.  

Of course, they turn out to be anything but and although Terence’s more believing wife escapes at the end of the tale, he is not so lucky and is killed by the eponymous spectre.

As mentioned previously, the popular writer of the Mapp and Lucia novels, E. F. Benson, had strong Cornish connections. In many tales of hauntings pertaining to Cornwall the impression is given that if one strays even slightly off the beaten track, then another darker and more primitive world exists, where superstition is rife and ghosts are prevalent. Benson’s *Negotium Perambulans* (the pestilence that walks) is one such tale and is set in Polearn in West Cornwall, which is described in the story thus: ‘Such isolation of a little community, continued, as it had been, for centuries, produces isolation in the individual as well ... they are linked together ... by some mysterious comprehension: it is as if they have all been initiated into some ancient rite, inspired and framed by forces visible and invisible’.  

The story also includes one of the commonest themes in Cornish ghost tales, that of an incomer to the community, usually from London or occasionally another metropolitan area. Benson constantly contrasts London, which is seemingly populated by the modern and rational people, with Cornwall where the folk are spiritual and instinctive.

Another hugely popular story both in Britain and America was *The Uninvited* by Irish author and historian Dorothy Macardle, which was subsequently made into a

---

774 Rawe 125.

775 Benson 228.
Hollywood film by Paramount Pictures.\textsuperscript{776} The tale is presented as a true life account of a couple who move from London to the South West, the female character, Pamela, commenting ‘Why did the ancient races all drive one another westward? And the fairy isles are all in the western seas. And the western people have more magic, haven’t they?’ She then asks ‘Is there a Celtic strain in North Devon? ... You would expect it, wouldn’t you, here, between Cornwall and Wales?’\textsuperscript{777} The common themes of the area are also included since the male character, Pamela’s husband Roddy, is writing a play about wrecking, and the couple feel they are terrorised by two ghosts that affect the house they reside in: ‘The studio’s as cold as the Celtic hell,’ Roddy comments.\textsuperscript{778}

A correspondent of Henry Jenner, Arthur Conan Doyle, also set tales in Cornwall. In \textit{The Man with the Twisted Lip}, Sherlock Holmes describes the case as ‘the Cornish horror – strangest case I ever handled’.\textsuperscript{779} Dr. Watson described it as set at ‘the further extremity of the Cornish peninsula’, and once again the ancient history and supernatural atmosphere of the county are evoked:

In every direction upon these moors there were traces of some vanished race which had passed utterly away, and left as its sole record strange monuments of stone, irregular mounds which

\textsuperscript{776} The book had 12 reprints between 1942 and 1944. See Dorothy MacArdle, \textit{The Uninvited}, 1942 (New York: Bantam, 1966)

\textsuperscript{777} MacArdle 4.

\textsuperscript{778} MacArdle 14.

contained the burned ashes of the dead, and curious earth-works which hinted at prehistoric strife. The glamour and mystery of the place, with its sinister atmosphere of forgotten nations appealed to the imagination of my friend ... The ancient Cornish language also arrested his attention.\textsuperscript{780}

In such an atmosphere, even the normally logical Holmes is driven to try a rash and dangerous experiment that nearly takes the lives of him and Doctor Watson.

As previously mentioned, in Cornwall fairies and ghosts were closely connected in a way that was unique to that county, as in the story of ‘The Fairy Dwelling on Selena Moor’ in William Bottrell’s \textit{Traditions and Hearthside Stories of West Cornwall}, in which the fairies represent the spirits of the heathen dead.\textsuperscript{781} Evans-Wentz, also identified the connection between mystical creatures and ghosts in Cornwall, the ‘small people’ also being identified as the souls of heathen dead folk, who were not fit to enter heaven, but not evil enough to be cast down to hell.\textsuperscript{782}

It was not only through the writing of ghost stories that the myth of Cornwall as a haunted place was established; it was partly due to the work of the Old Cornwall movement, within which Jenner was such an important figure, that helped to resurrect and preserve (and even invent) Cornish legends, embedding them into local culture, and

\textsuperscript{780} Conan Doyle 46-47.


\textsuperscript{782} See W.Y. Evans-Wentz.
consequently local identity. The Cornish Diaspora had meant that local society had been irrevocably changed, and one of the initial ambitions of the Old Cornwall Societies was that it should bring the diffuse people of Cornwall together again. It was hoped that the magazine in particular ‘should be of the greatest use in binding together the scattered little Cornish nation’. This was achieved in part through an extensive folklore collecting programme, and by the reviving and publishing of old tales, as well as the invention of new stories that, like those mentioned above, reflected the social problems Cornwall faced in the first half of the twentieth century after the collapse of traditional industries and the large influx of ‘outsiders’ (some as tourists, some more permanent).

In particular, the frequency with which ghost stories featured an outsider from London moving to Cornwall and failing to acknowledge the importance of local superstitions reveals the social impact of in-migration on a hitherto unprecedented scale. As well as reflecting Cornwall’s contemporary social problems, such stories also harked back to a mystical Celtic golden age with their references to ancient practices and beliefs. They conjured up aspects of Cornish Celtic identity which have, for better or worse, survived into the present, partly because of Henry Jenner.

783 Johns, Old Cornwall Volume I Loose editorial note.
Chapter Six
Language, Dialect and the Assertion of Celtic Identity in Cornwall

The contemporary situation of Galicia in Spain at the beginning of this century is not unlike that of Cornwall at the turn of the nineteenth in terms of its relationship with the Pan-Celtic fellowship as a whole. There is presently contention over whether the region of Galicia has a claim to Celtic status and therefore a place within this wider Celtic community, just as there was with Cornwall in the early twentieth century. In both cases there were or are those who believe that such claims have little historical foundation and, as with Cornwall nearly one hundred years earlier, the Celtic League refused to list Galicia as a Celtic nation on linguistic grounds. This refusal of acceptance has done little to deter those in the Galician area who believe it to be a ‘Celtic’ land from engaging in a range of specifically ‘Celtic’ cultural activities. Many towns now stage Celtic fiestas in the summer months and the International Festival of the Celtic World at Ortigueria is an annual music event that attracts over 100,000 people. Given the extent of such activities, there is little doubt that there are those in the region who believe that this area of Spain has a Celtic heritage because of both its history and its contemporary expressions of ‘Celtic’ nationality. Those in Galicia could well look to


Cornwall as an example of a Celtic nation once denied its status, but now wholly accepted within the family of Celtic nations.

It must be acknowledged that by the time of the Celtic Revival which arguably began at the end of the nineteenth century, as Bernard Deacon observed, Cornwall already had an established sense of Celtic identity and the mood in the county and elsewhere, particularly Wales and Brittany, was conducive to a further assertion of both local and group identity.\(^{787}\) Similarly, Lowerson refers to the period between the 1770s and the 1860s as one where insider representations of Cornwall, bolstered by its Celtic identity, became more important than they had been previously, or indeed, since.\(^ {788}\) As we have seen in previous chapters, out of this existing sense of Celtic identity emerged the Old Cornwall Movement. One of its key figures, Robert Morton Nance, acknowledged this earlier work, particularly that done to retrieve and revive the Cornish language – a key indicator of Cornish identity – by a group of enthusiasts in the eighteenth century, claiming that without their contribution a large amount of the language which was utilised during the Revival would have been lost.\(^ {789}\) He was also keen to acknowledge that in founding the Old Cornwall Societies, he was only bringing together ‘into one room’ those that had been working on the preservation of all things Cornish for years previously.\(^ {790}\)

\(^{787}\) Deacon, *Cornwall: A Concise History*.

\(^{788}\) See Payton and Westland 8.

\(^{789}\) Jenner Papers. Box 8, Packet 7, Bundle 1. ‘The Celtic Congress and Cornwall’, cut newspaper article by Robert Morton Nance.

One of the ideas forwarded by Jenner was that there was a commonality of specifically ‘Celtic’ shared traits, be they linguistic, cultural or social, may have been asserted in Cornwall in the Cornish-Celtic Revival of the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries, but it first found international organisational form in the Pan-Celtic Congress, first held in 1838 in Abergavenny, Wales. It was not until nearly thirty years later that another was held at Saint Brieuc in Brittany. This century also saw the formation of the short-lived Pan-Celtic Society (1888) and the Celtic Association (1899). Out of these organisations the Celtic Congress was formed in 1900, which promptly postponed Cornwall’s application of membership due to the lack of a living Celtic language. It was this lack that Jenner and others set out to remedy.

In Cornwall there were early signs of an interest in a language revival. And, as early as July 1877, The Times reported on plans for an early Congress of Celtic philological and antiquarian scholars, which was eventually held near Penzance in Cornwall in 1878 and conducted by Henry Jenner and the Rev. Lach-Szyrma, specifically marking the supposed centenary of the death of the last reputed speaker of the Cornish language. This event was an early attempt to involve other Celtic nations in Cornwall’s revival, just as the previous year’s Congresses by the British Archaeological Association (held in August 1876) had brought such Celtic scholars to Cornwall before. However, this time they would be discussing that marker of Cornwall’s Celtic identity, the language.


During the event papers on the history and affinities of the ancient Cornish tongue were given in a move inspired by the interest generated by the recently translated and published manuscripts in the ancient vernacular under the auspices of the Cornish Manuscript Society.\(^794\)

There were also early signs of this cultural rehabilitation outside the county too, as Simon Trezise’s work on nineteenth century literature confirms.\(^795\) Trezise observed more positive stereotypes of the Celts (particularly the Cornish Celts) began to emerge in the writings of (famous detractor of the Irish) Charles Kingsley and Devonian writer Sabine Baring-Gould.\(^796\) Baring-Gould observed the difference between Celts and Saxons close to home, claiming that ‘In my own county of Devon we have on one side of Dartmoor a people in which the volatile sparkling ichor exists to a good extent…In fact, the people are more than half Celts; on the other side of the moor the population is heavy, unimaginative and prosaic – the dreadfully dull Saxon prevails here’.\(^797\)

Elsewhere, however, there was a denial of any tradition of Cornish literature. In *The Literature of the Celts* in 1902, Professor Magnus Maclean commented that ‘(Cornwall) never produced much of a Celtic literature’. Furthermore he claimed that ‘Cornish dialect has no literature to show, and therefore is not concerned in the special Celtic

---


\(^795\) Trezise, 54-68.


\(^797\) Quoted in Trezise 62.
revivals characteristic of the literature in other dialects”. As noted by Bernard Deacon, such exclusion and denial was to have lasting consequences with Cornwall continuing to assert and justify its claims to Celticity even after inclusion in the Pan-Celtic fold. It would take the work of a dedicated group of enthusiasts to establish Cornwall’s claim to Celtic nationhood in the face of this initial scepticism.

Henry Jenner was arguably the most dominant figure of all the Revivalists on a public level, and one of the best remembered. As has been noted, Jenner was keen to establish the Cornish Celts as a chosen people, to instil pride in the people of what he considered to be a nation. He wrote *The Royal House of Damnonia*, an account of Cornwall’s early Celtic history, to assert the county’s claim to cultural superiority through its past. Having experienced the assertion of Saxon predominance throughout the nineteenth century, in *The Royal House of Damnonia* Jenner employed a contrary depiction of the myth of superiority by linking the Celtic areas of Cornwall, Wales, and Brittany to the superior Roman civilization. By contrast, Germanic invaders had conquered most of England and had eradicated signs of this great and cultured race, their Latin language having been superseded by the ‘less-cultured majority’.

Jenner discerned that the ‘strong infusion’ of Latin in the languages of Welsh, Cornish and Breton was evidence that in these regions the Roman civilization persisted for some

---


centuries more than elsewhere. He reiterated the superiority of the House of Damnonia (the people of the Celtic tribe of the Dumnonaii who resided in the South West of Britain) by stating that the persistence of Roman culture in that region, and the subsequent lack of intervention by Germanic invaders, resulted in that House being ‘more civilised than any of the other British Royal Families’. Furthermore, they ‘evidently held a very leading position among the British Kings, until they were cut off from the other kingdoms in 577, and this was probably due to their being more Roman and less barbaric than the rest’. 801

What is more, the Roman towns and houses of Damnonia remained until the ‘Wessex invaders’ destroyed them, resulting in a widespread reviling of the Saxons in this area: ‘We have evidence that the Britons of Damnonia and South Wales down to a comparatively late date not only hated the Saxons as destructive and brutal enemies, but also looked down upon them as uncouth, dirty people, with no manners’. 802 As evidence of this discrimination, Jenner claimed that St. Aldhelm had witnessed the people of Damnonia and South Wales washing and scouring anything, such as plates and drinking vessels, that a Saxon had used. The saint was astonished by such behaviour, but was, according to Jenner, ‘only a Saxon and could not see the point of such fastidiousness’. 803

However, eventually, Jenner conceded that the Roman civilization ‘diminished under German pressure’, and the ‘general barbarism’ that accompanied it spread over


Damnonia, a situation that persisted until ‘the Normans came and taught the Saxons manners’. Having successfully reversed the myth of Saxon supremacy, Jenner concluded: ‘The story of the Damnonian Kingdom, if we only knew all its details, would probably prove to be that of the extinction of a higher civilization by means of a lower, and all the sadder because the extinction was no sudden catastrophe, but a slow and gradual process’. The erosion of Cornwall’s own language was a similarly gradual process as its use receded and eventually died out altogether. Its revival as a spoken language became one of Jenner’s main goals.

Jenner’s own public interest in Celtic matters began in 1873, when he read a paper entitled ‘The Cornish Language’ to the Philological Society, and two years later presented one on the Manx Language. In that same year, 1875, he toured Cornwall with the Rev. Lach-Szyrma, vicar of Newlyn and fellow Revivalist, to find survivals of the Cornish language. After the aforementioned Congress at Penzance in 1878 he then appears to have lost interest in, or had time for, the Celtic languages, at least publicly, until the formation of Cowethas Kelto-Kernuak (the Celtic Cornish Society) in 1901.

One of the reasons why he may have abandoned his interest in Cornish was that he had little support, or it was possible that he was distracted by other projects. However influential Jenner came to be, one man could not work alone and after displaying this initial interest, Jenner abandoned this work until he found a like-minded figures such as L. C. R. Duncombe Jewell (founder of Cowethas Kelto-Kernuak), which Morton Nance

---


described as ‘his discovery of kindred spirits’. Importantly, he also began to associate with other Celts in Brittany and Wales, becoming a member of the Celtic Association in 1903, as well as being made Bard of the Gorsedd of Brittany in the same year.

Cowethas Kelto-Kernuak was the first organisation to explicitly promote Cornwall as a Celtic nation. Amy Hale described it as ‘the first articulation of the cultural politics to come within a Pan-Celtic context’. The organisation listed its goals as the preserving of ancient monuments in the Duchy, ensuring the continuation of its national sports of hurling and wrestling, and reviving both the language and the Cornish Gorseth, all of which were unique to the county and therefore could be regarded as symbols of nationhood. However, in its primary goal of gaining admittance into the Celtic Association as a Celtic nation, it failed and, despite the support of such eminent members of Cornish society as author and editor of The Cornish Magazine Arthur Quiller-Couch and fellow author Thurston Peters, it became moribund in 1903. A year later, former Cowethas Kelto-Kernuak Vice President Henry Jenner would take up the cause of the Cornish language and the Duchy’s fortunes as a Celtic nation would change. However, just at this time Jenner embarked on his career working for the British Museum Library where he would remain for thirty-nine years in what was described by one of his modern-day counterparts as ‘quite a chequered career’.

806 Johns, Old Cornwall Volume II 8, 3.


809 Personal email correspondence with Archives and Records Assistant at the British Museum Library. 17 Nov. 2009.
In 1875 Jenner demonstrated his early interest in the Celtic languages by arranging for the British Museum to accept the communications of the Clergy of the Isle of Man on the grounds that they reflected the contemporary state of the Manx language. He began in the Department of Manuscripts as a senior assistant, but in 1879, according to museum records, his work was found to be ‘insufficient in quality and, in general, inaccurate’ by his superior. It was recommended that Jenner be cautioned and moved to the Department of Printed Books where he would be reported on after three months. Here, Jenner was to flourish and in 1885 he was commended for his ‘good services’ in superintending the transfer of papers to the newspaper room. In 1887 Jenner boldly suggested an entirely new system for storing papers – movable ‘hanging’ bookcases which would save precious space without the necessity of structural alteration. The idea was accepted and by 1888, under Jenner’s supervision, the new ‘hanging presses’ had increased the accommodation for books in the museum library considerably. As a reward Jenner received a gratuity of £100 ‘in recognition of his services in connection with the introduction of hanging bookcases’, and two years later he was promoted to the rank of First Class Assistant, the highest position he appears to have held until his retirement in 1909. His other great achievement at the museum was overseeing the drastic and radical rearrangement of books in the museum’s reading-room when it was renovated in 1907, a project that The Times deemed to be ‘a great success’.

---

810 From copies of British Museum Library Trustees Meeting Minute indexes, supplied via email by Bryony Leventhall, Archive & Records Assistant, British Museum. 17 Nov. 2009.

811 From copies of British Museum Library Trustees Meeting Minute indexes.

812 Williams 30.

Apart from his job at the British Museum Library, other interests away from the Cornish language seem to have preoccupied Jenner until the turn of the century and from his correspondence and papers it seems that his support for the Legitimist cause was foremost among these interests. Yet Jenner realised that the crucial factor in Cornwall’s acceptance into the wider Celtic community was the revival of the Cornish language. In line with eighteenth and nineteenth century thinking, language and race were inextricably linked for the Celtic Association, with language being an important indicator of the unity of a nation or people and a living Celtic language being, to this day, the ultimate test of admission. Originally all the Celtic languages (and, by extension, people) were linked by Edward Lhuyd in the seventeenth century, but it was during the Romantic movement that language became, as Payton described it, ‘the principle badge of nationality and ethnic kinship’. Lhuyd himself spent four months in Cornwall studying and recording the language with the help of the Cornish people who not only taught him Cornish but, according to Jenner, ‘translated the literature for him, and put all their knowledge at his disposal’.

Despite being remembered as the champion of the Cornish language, Jenner himself saw language as secondary to the feeling of ‘national consciousness’ as a way of binding a group of people together: ‘It may be said that national consciousness is the

---


815 Payton, Cornwall: A History 159.

816 Payton, “Paralysis and Revival” 29.

817 Jenner Papers Box 6, Packet 2.Untitled document. Morton Nance is more critical of Lhuyd’s work, noting that his four months in the county would have been better spent among the ‘unlearned but habitual Cornish speakers’ rather than ‘amateur philologers like John Keigwin’, see Jenner Papers Box 8, Packet 2, Bundle 3, ‘Celtic Words in Cornish Dialect’.
most important factor in nationality, and that a community, however heterogeneous in
language, race or religion, is a nation when it feels itself to be a nation, and the cause of
that consciousness must be sought in history.\footnote{818} In stating this, Jenner rooted the
national consciousness of the Cornish people firmly in that nation’s past, as we have
seen in previous chapters, and the indicators that many would view as binding a nation
together such as their shared language, culture or religion as contemporary factors, and
therefore less relevant.

Jenner reiterated the point that language was secondary when he drew attention to the
fact that, although other Celtic countries had kept their own ancient languages alive,
they were far from being universally spoken and the majority of those people already
included in the Pan-Celtic community, like the Cornish people, spoke only English. ‘If
Celtic nationality is denied to English-speaking Cornishmen, it must equally be denied
to those many members of the other Celtic nations who speak no Celtic language –
which is absurd. When Cornishmen cease to recognize the existence of their Celtic
heritage then only will their Cornish and therefore Celtic nationality cease.’\footnote{819} It could
be argued that there was some inconsistency in Jenner’s argument that although the
Celtic language of Cornwall held little importance in the composition of Cornish
nationhood, its Celtic heritage was vital to it. At the same time, that very language was a
vital constituent of that heritage. However, Jenner was resolute in his contention that it
was how a people felt about their nation that ultimately bound them together; ‘though
the Cornish have lost their language and speak English, they have a very strong national

\footnote{818} Jenner Papers Box 8, Packet 1. ms for ‘Who are the Celts and what has Cornwall to do with them?’ by
Henry Jenner. 5

\footnote{819} Jenner Papers Box 8, Packet 1. ms for ‘Who are the Celts and what has Cornwall to do with them?’ by
Henry Jenner. 11
consciousness and know that they are not Englishmen. It would seem that neither
language nor blood is necessary for this national consciousness, though they have both
been factors in producing it’. 820

In fact Jenner’s interest in the Cornish language was coupled with his regard for the
importance of the Cornish dialect, an interest shared with many other Revivalists who
thought it to be of utmost importance, although unfairly maligned. In identifying
discourses of prejudice based on language in the Celtic countries, Laura O’Connor
identified “accented” English as an excluding force along with the other languages of
Gaelic, Welsh and Scots, suggesting that all lead to a marginalisation from the
‘Anglophone mainstream’. 821 The work of the Old Cornwall Societies addressed this
prejudice against accented English and, through the medium of both the society’s
magazine and the Cornwall Education Authority, sought to emphasise the dialect as an
important cultural indicator. In the Societies’ Old Cornwall magazines there were over
90 articles on the subject of the Cornish language, but there were also an equally
substantial number on the Cornish dialect – 84 in all. 822 Furthermore, on Jenner’s
suggestion, a pamphlet was issued by Cornwall Education Committee urging school
children in the county to collect dialect words. 823

In 1919, Jenner had also proposed to the Royal Institution of Cornwall that a more

820 Jenner Papers Box 6 Packet 5 ‘Who Are the Celts?’ Inaugural lecture at University College, Exeter by
Henry Jenner. 1921. 5

821 O’Connor xv.

822 See index, Johns, Old Cornwall Volume I.

823 Jenner papers, Box 8, Packet 7, Bundle 1. Letter to the editor of the Western Morning News and
mercury by Jenner: ‘Old Cornish Speech’.
general scheme for the collection of rural lore and language by school children be implemented in Cornwall through the local Board of Education, with Morton Nance seconding the motion. As well as preserving that which would otherwise have been lost, it was hoped that the scheme would also establish within the younger generation an interest in local lore, providing for the future ‘a body of people really interested in the antiquities of Cornwall’.

The scheme received a great deal of interest and support in the county, with the local press describing it as a truly educational endeavour which would stimulate children’s educational curiosity as well as saving Cornwall’s heritage. The scheme was subsequently adopted by the Education Committee of Cornwall County Council, who, according to Jenner himself, took it up ‘quite enthusiastically’ as ‘it did not take them long to appreciate the educational value of the scheme’. He also found that the schoolteachers implementing his proposal were similarly impressed, having ‘fully grasped’ Jenner’s idea. However, as Carl Philips noted, finding any evidence as to the achievements of this scheme are ‘elusive, if at all extant’.

Similarly, the Old Cornwall Societies were committed to dialect preservation. In one Old Cornwall article on the dialect by W. M. Symons he stated that ‘one of the avowed

---


825 Jenner Papers. Box 8, Packet 7, Bundle. Cut newspaper article, ‘Cornish Language – Preserving Celtic Words and Customs – County Scheme’.


827 Carl Phillips 177.
objects of the Old Cornwall Movement is “the preservation of the Cornish Dialect”.\footnote{828} He then went on to explain why the movement was dedicated to this aim. They did not want dialect words treated as a museum piece, ‘to put them safely in cold storage so that future generations of anglicised Cornishmen shall know how their forefathers may have spoken’, but were avowed to keep the dialect alive by encouraging its use.\footnote{829} As with the Cornish language, there was an acute awareness of a similar conflict between English and the Cornish dialect. The fear was that the supplanting of the Cornish language with the English language was set to be repeated with the Cornish dialect, such was the prejudice against it. Symons claimed that ‘it is almost impossible to teach English without condemning Dialect’, and that those who spoke in their native accent were made to feel embarrassed and inferior when in the company of those who did not share it: ‘Let anyone stand up and make a speech in Cornish Dialect – speaking naturally – and he is immediately written down as an ignoramus. Why?\footnote{830} Symons compared this negative reaction to Cornish people with their fellow Celts who were not exposed to such ridicule: ‘A Scot ... is not considered uneducated even if his accent is almost beyond the comprehension of a southerner’\footnote{831}

The Old Cornwall Societies were dedicated to dispelling the myth that the Cornish accent was ‘the mark of the uneducated’ and fit only for use by ‘the funny man’ in plays by encouraging members to keep Cornishness in their voices and give readings and recitations in the dialect, as well as write stories, songs and plays in the Cornish

accent. Of all the work undertaken by the Revivalists, Jenner described the plays that Morton Nance had written in the dialect to be ‘the most valuable work that is being done right now’. Morton Nance himself even went so far as to describe the dialect itself as an actual language in his introduction to *Old Cornwall*, entitled ‘What We Stand For’: ‘Cornish dialect speech ... is far from being a dead language’.

Furthermore, as well as being important in its own right, the dialect was seen as vital to the revival of the Cornish language itself. In an edition of *Old Cornwall* from 1931, E.G. Retallack Hooper described it as ‘a gateway to Cornish’, stating that the dialect was the key to the pronunciation of the language, as well as the order of its words, its idioms and intonation. He was also aware that the line between dialect and Cornish was ambiguous and that many ‘dialect’ words in contemporary use were in fact remnants of the language. Old Cornwall Society members like Morton Nance worked simultaneously on both the language and the dialect: at the same time that he collected Celtic words still in use in West Cornwall, he was also, as Jenner noted, writing plays in the dialect.

Jenner in particular worried about the loss of the Cornish dialect fearing that already the pronunciation used for certain Cornish place-names had been altered due to the use of a

---


833 Jenner Papers Box 6, Packet 5. Document on Celtic education in Cornwall.


835 Johns, *Old Cornwall Volume II* 2, 2: 34.

836 Jenner Papers Box 6, Packet 5. Document on Celtic education in Cornwall.
pernicious form of standardised English and the subsequent ignoring of ‘traditional contractions, or the older sound of the letters’: ‘The present pronunciation of Cornish place-names is not altogether a safe guide to the old pronunciation, because of late years there has been considerable alteration, owing to the spread of “education”, whereby the “London twang”, taught in the Board-school training colleges as standard English, is everywhere gradually superseding the old pronunciations’. 837

In order for Cornwall to maintain its traditional speech patterns in the pronunciation of place-names, Jenner believed that it was necessary to observe the dialect of the older generation and glean as much as possible from the remnants of the traditional Cornish language: ‘Still, a good deal may be learnt from the mouths of old people, and from the spelling of words whose derivation there is no doubt, especially when, as is frequently the case, these spellings where phonetic representations of Cornish sounds, adopted while the old language was still in use’. 838

This work was vital to the preservation of the Cornish language. As Arseny Saparov observed in his work on place-names and national identities:

[P]lace-names are some of the most durable national symbols. They can outlive most material artefacts of a civilization. The material components of the cultural landscape may disappear or be destroyed, the civilization that created them may also disappear but its place-names will most

837 Jenner Papers, Box 8, Packet 7, Bundle 2 Handwritten note by Jenner ‘Some rough notes on the present pronunciation of Cornish Names’.

838 Jenner Papers, Box 8, Packet 7, Bundle 2 Handwritten note by Jenner ‘Some rough notes on the present pronunciation of Cornish Names’.
probably survive. In this capacity place-names are important features of national and territorial identity.\textsuperscript{839} 

Similarly, Helleland reiterated their importance by stating that place-names were ‘vital for the knowledge of our past’ as they are not only linguistic expressions, but also identifiers of the landscape; ‘As such they convey particular values to those who are familiar with the names’ and, as a result, they can incite perceptions of identity to certain places’.\textsuperscript{840} Saparov also noted that most place-names ‘undergo continual development within a language changing phonetically and semantically’, which means that they can be used as an indication of cultural transformation or, if preserved, can help maintain cultural identity’, a role which Jenner clearly recognised.\textsuperscript{841}

Jenner’s belief in the importance of the dialect may help to explain why he didn’t seek to promote the language itself as something every Cornish person should learn in order to strengthen a sense of national identity, believing that even in regions of bilingualism such as Wales ‘the more generally useful language will no doubt prevail, but the Celtic spirit and national consciousness will be immortal’.\textsuperscript{842} For Jenner, this immortality would be achieved through a revival and preservation of other aspects of Celtic Cornish culture such as hurling, wrestling, folk songs and dances: on these subjects he wrote


\textsuperscript{841} Saparov 180.

\textsuperscript{842} Jenner Papers Box 8, Packet 1. ms for ‘Who are the Celts and what has Cornwall to do with them?’ by Henry Jenner. 28
‘Why revive old ... why not make new ... partly because we know that old is good ... partly as (the) past (is) of antiquarian interest’. Despite his concern for the Cornish language, it was this folk culture that really constituted identity for him. However, despite his own view that language was ‘less than ever a final test of race’, he understood the importance of reviving Cornish to Pan-Celtic organisations and also the importance of these organisations to Cornwall as a way of strengthening its own sense of Celtic identity.

Having already joined the Celtic Association himself, and in the knowledge that a living language was part of the qualification for Cornwall’s inclusion in the Celtic Association, he published his *Handbook of the Cornish Language* in 1904. One month later, armed with a revived mother tongue, he gave his speech entitled ‘Cornwall: A Celtic Nation’ at Pan-Celtic Congress and the county was duly granted membership of the Celtic Association. Earlier drafts reveal the original title was to be ‘Is Cornwall a Celtic Nation?’; however, Jenner later removed any doubt raised by the use of a question in this matter. At one stage he even crossed out the word ‘Nation’, but the final speech revealed the extent to which Jenner believed Cornwall justified the epithet. Not only did history prove this to be the case, but the feeling of separate nationality persisted into his own time, he argued.

The speech also revealed that although Jenner considered himself a Celt by birth, he was Cornish by choice: ‘It is true that most of the Celtic in my composition (and there is

843 Jenner Papers Box 8, Packet 10. Small hand-written note by Jenner.


845 Williams 31.
a good deal of it) is of the Highland Scottish sort, though there is also some Welsh and a little Irish, and if I could only be sure of tracing a little Breton descent, I might form a sort of Pan-Celtic Congress all to myself ... So you see that in spite of all temptations to belong to other nations I remain a Cornishman. It is interesting to note Jenner’s paraphrasing of Gilbert and Sullivan’s *He is an Englishman* from *H.M.S Pinafore* here, as he replaces the lyric ‘in spite of all temptations / To belong to other nations / He remains an Englishman’ with his own Cornish version.

In 1909 Jenner retired from the British Museum, allowing him to move back home to Cornwall and concentrate his energies on the revival and renewal of Celtic Cornwall, and there is little doubt that he was committed to a long-term regeneration of Cornish culture. Having successfully gained the county admission into the Celtic Association, Jenner began to plan a revival of the Cornish Gorseth as early as 1907. In 1909 he was elected a member of the Celtic Association’s committee for the Pan-Celtic Congress, an important post and one to which, it was claimed, ‘Cornwall could not furnish a more distinguished name’. He also enquired about the possibility of a federation scheme for Celtic societies to the Association, although, as with the Gorseth, the federation would not come to fruition for many years. By 1912 the Cornish language was well established enough within the Pan-Celtic community for the Manx Language Society to

---

846 Jenner Papers Box 6, Packet 8 ‘Is Cornwall a Celtic Nation?’ by Henry Jenner.


849 Jenner Papers Box 6, Bundle 1 Handwritten letter from A. Perceval Graves to Henry Jenner, 22nd Nov. 1909.
appeal to Jenner, as the leading light of the language revival, to assist them in achieving similar success themselves. In a letter to Jenner, the Manx cultural activist, folklore collector and author, Sophia Morrison, requested that he, as a ‘well-known Celtic scholar’, ‘come to the help of the smallest and poorest of the Celtic societies’: a request which reflects Jenner’s own importance and Cornwall’s status within the Celtic community. Morrison’s request demonstrates how, in the politics of language revival, as in so much else in the culture of the Celtic Revival, Jenner’s influence was vital, and his legacy persists.

---

850 Jenner Papers Box 24, Packet 20. Letter from S. Morrison (Manx Language Society Secretary) to Jenner, March 25th 1912.
Conclusion

Put simply, the existence of Cornish nationalism in the present cannot be explained without reference to the Cornish Celtic Revival, and, in his lifetime, Jenner was probably the most influential person in this movement. It is both significant and justifiable that Henry Jenner has an entry in the *Oxford Dictionary of National Biography*; its author Peter W. Thomas noted Jenner’s ‘enormous influence over the Cornish movement and iconic status within it’. Echoing criticisms of Jenner’s reluctance to engage his culturally inspired vision of a Celtic Cornwall with any political issues, he went on to state that:

> it has been observed that much of the ethos of the movement’s early period constituted a middle-class, apolitical harking back to a semi-mystical, pre-industrial, Catholic Cornwall. None the less, without the vision and prodigious work rate of the pioneers, notably Jenner himself, the platform from which the movement has expanded and matured would not have existed.\(^\text{851}\)

Thomas concluded that ‘Jenner was able to combine his romantic vision of Cornwall with genuine scholarship, while his conviction of separate Cornish nationhood and his local patriotism went along with loyalty to Great Britain and the Empire. He retains a

unique position within the history of the Cornish revival.\textsuperscript{852}

Within the Cornish movement itself, Jenner is also remembered as a pioneer; Ann Trevenen Jenkin (first female Grand Bard of the Cornish Gorseth) claims that Jenner ‘helped to put Cornwall on the map, linguistically, idiosyncratically and culturally’,\textsuperscript{853} and without him ‘we might not have had a Gorseth Kernow established in 1928, or the Cornish branch of the Celtic Congress as early as 1904’.\textsuperscript{854} Jenner also extended the idea of an independently identifiable Celtic Cornwall beyond the realms of that region, with Jenkin claiming that he ‘had an essential part to play’ in getting Cornwall recognised at, and admitted to, the Celtic Congress.\textsuperscript{855}

Peter Pool similarly observed that Jenner’s ‘polymathic knowledge, vast capacity for work and dominant personality meant that from 1909 onwards Jenner came to dominate the resurgent cultural life in Cornwall’.\textsuperscript{856} However, he also noted that Jenner’s name and influence continued long after his death in 1934. One of his lasting legacies was the Jenner Memorial Fund, set up to continue his work and to ensure his name would forever be affiliated to that work.\textsuperscript{857} Later on, the Jenner County Memorial Awards were instigated to help those researching Cornwall’s history and culture. Furthermore, the

\begin{footnotesize}
\textsuperscript{852} Peter W. Thomas, “Henry Jenner Biography.” <http://www.oxforddnb.com/articles/75/75066-article.html> \\
\textsuperscript{853} Williams 14. \\
\textsuperscript{854} Williams 15. \\
\textsuperscript{855} Williams 14. \\
\textsuperscript{856} Quoted in Williams 18. \\
\textsuperscript{857} Williams 19.
\end{footnotesize}
Royal Institution of Cornwall issued a medal (the first was in 1936) to those conducting research in the fields in which Jenner himself had been most active. Jenner’s interests, in relation to his activities in the Celtic Revival, can clearly be seen in our contemporary conception of Cornwall, and his vision of ‘Old Cornwall’ still has echoes in modern Cornish identity.

As Chapter Two demonstrates, the Celts were once a much-maligned people and in a sense Jenner was ‘writing back’ against the racial prejudice of Victorian Britain. But he was doing it in the language of his time and his notion of racial differences between Celts and Saxons as expressed in the introduction to his Handbook of the Cornish Language would be best left in the past. However, as can be seen from the appropriation of the notion of Celtic purity by the far right, they remain with us. And recent innovations within the scientific community have contributed to this, however unknowingly, as they allowed those within the British Isles to discover their genetic roots and be assigned an ethnic grouping accordingly. Bryan Sykes, author of Blood of the Isles, which contained the results of the first major survey of DNA ‘fingerprinting’ in Britain, thought that the results suggested that Britain was a more unified nation, at least genetically, than was previously supposed: ‘Although Celtic countries have previously thought of themselves as being genetically different from the English, this is emphatically not the case’. He further claimed that ‘this is significant, because the idea of a separate Celtic race is deeply ingrained in our political structure, and has historically been very divisive. Culturally, the view of a separate race holds water. But

858 Williams 19.

from a genetic point of view, Britain is emphatically not a divided nation.860 This was the conclusion drawn from the research which revealed that ‘the maps show that Celts are most dominant in areas of Ireland, Scotland and Wales. But, contrary to popular myth, the Celtic clan is also strongly represented elsewhere in the British Isles’.861

Based on this research the myth that Jenner conveyed in The House of Damnonia, that the noble and ancient Celtic people of these Isles were swept from England by the Anglo-Saxons, would seem to have been inaccurate and perhaps unnecessarily divisive. However, there are those who have chosen to interpret the information conveyed in the survey in a different, and no less divisive, way. In 2003, Stephen Steward published an article in the Glasgow Herald entitled ‘DNA suggests the Celts held their ground; Scientists shatter Anglo-Saxon myth’.862 Stewart claimed that:

For decades, historians have believed that successive waves of invaders, such as the Anglo-Saxons, drove out the indigenous population of the British Isles, labelled Celts, pushing them to the fringes of Ireland, Scotland, and Wales […] However, work by a team of scientists on the Y chromosome, which is passed from father to son, has shown the native tribes left their genetic stamp throughout the UK and not only in the

---


He went on to allege that Anglo-Saxons had managed to dominate British history ‘merely because they kept better written records than their indigenous counterparts.’  

The article has since appeared on the website for the far-right group Stormfront (whose slogan is ‘White Pride, World Wide’).

Jenner may have been successful within Cornwall, and perhaps beyond, when contributing to the rehabilitation of the image of the Celts, but the division of people into racial groups will always be problematic. It could be argued that although the myth of Anglo-Saxon superiority has, for the most part, ended, the desirability now attached to being Celtic, aligned with the modern means of ‘proving’ that one is Celtic, has led to new (albeit at present marginalised) issues concerning race within the British Isles.

Another one of Jenner’s preoccupations that seems to come from another era was that of Legitimism (although the Order of the White Rose appears in its modern form as a group on Facebook). For Jenner, the Jacobite cause was linked to, and informed, his own brand of Celtic nationalism which harked back to an era when Scotland in particular had a greater degree of independence. However, Legitimism was historically a questionable idea in the county. As Daphne du Maurier noted in her book Vanishing Cornwall, when the clergy sought to discredit the increasingly popular John Wesley,

863 Steward 11.

864 Steward 11.

they chose to start a rumour associating him with the Young Pretender Charles Stewart in order to dissuade the loyal and traditionally royalist Cornish people from following him.\footnote{Daphne du Maurier, *Vanishing Cornwall* (London: Penguin, 1967) 118.} So, with Legitimism, and with other issues, Jenner’s personal views were at odds with the majority of the Cornish people and he was more necessarily secretive about his involvement in the Order of the White Rose than he was about his Anglo-Catholicism or his right-wing sympathies, all of which led to accusations of elitism inevitably being levelled at the Old Cornwall movement as a whole.

There was certainly a reliance on educator-intellectuals, many of whom were, like Jenner, from different social and religious backgrounds than a majority of the Cornish population and it was almost inevitable that such social revision would have been led by such figures – having both the means and the motivation to exact change. However, there is little doubt that Henry Jenner, whilst aware that the Old Cornwall movement had an important educational value, was also aware of its potential social function too in what he described as ‘the present social conditions’ in the time of the First World War.\footnote{Henry Jenner, *The Renaissance of Merry England: Presidential Address at the Summer Meeting of the Royal Cornwall Polytechnic Society* (Falmouth: Cornish Echo Co.1920) 10.} And he was not beyond using the movement to impose his ideology onto others, in particular his ideas about a ‘Merry England’ renaissance and the role that the preservation of folklore and tradition had to play in this. For Jenner, social cohesion and, as he saw it, social continuity with a previous age, were to be achieved through the Celtic Revival.

But Jenner also had to maintain a balancing act between supporting Celtic unity in order
to reinforce Cornish identity, and avoiding the unpopular political aspects of, in particular, Irish nationalism (and possibly Scottish nationalism as expressed through Jacobitism) and, despite his apolitical public outlook, reading the Legitimist magazines Jenner owned, a more radical side of his Celtic nationalist fervour is revealed. It could be said that Jenner’s inability to engage with the majority of the Cornish people, separated as he was by such issues as Legitimism and his Anglo-Catholicism, led to his cultural, as opposed to political, vision of a Celtic Cornwall. However, Saunders-Lewis of Plaid Cymru, a man who held a similar position within the Welsh Celtic Revival to Jenner in Cornwall, was also a Catholic and he also harked back to a medievalist golden age. But Saunders-Lewis being at odds both religiously and politically with the majority of the Welsh people did not in itself lead to an apolitical nationalist movement and, to this day, Saunders Lewis remains a hero to Welsh nationalists. Although both men could be accused of failing to connect fully with the majority of their fellow residents, perhaps Wales was a country in need of a nationalist hero in a way that Cornwall was not. Nicky Bell observed that ‘like many famous revolutionary leaders who have come before and after him, Lewis gave a voice to a nascent nationalist movement that was desperately in need of a spokesman’. 868

In some ways nationalism is not a radical concept: it is about the unity and continuity of a nation, and the cultural Celtic nationalism in the early part of the twentieth century proposed a continuation of that which has gone before in both Cornwall and Wales. It could be argued that in Cornwall this nationalist vision was, to some extent, a personal one crafted by Jenner. However, political nationalism requires that changes be made and

therefore the radical Saunders Lewis can be seen as beginning this process. As Bell noted ‘history has remembered Lewis remarkably well [...] He is considered by many historians to be the father of modern Welsh nationalism. Clearly, there was something about Lewis beyond his political vision which endeared him not only to the nationalist movement, but to all of Wales’. Jenner is remembered as a much less radical figure with a lack of engagement in the political side of Celtic nationalism, but then Cornwall’s situation was very different to that of Wales.

It would take more time for the Cornish Revival to yield a political party in Mebyon Kernow, but for all the accusations that the Cornish Revival was non-political and that its early figures like Jenner ‘held back’ any progress towards a politicisation of the movement, it must be remembered that Cornwall started from a different place than the larger nations of Ireland, Scotland and Wales. Jenner had to argue the case for Cornwall even being considered a Celtic nation to begin with, and once it had gained admission to their ranks, the region still held a decidedly junior position. The Celtic Revival united six very different nations in terms of politics, religious belief, and attitudes towards England. Jenner’s skill was to balance all of these factors, remaining loyal to Cornwall’s Celtic past and to the idea of a united Britain and wider Empire.

Tim Saunders claimed that although the concept of Celtic Cornwall was not originally formulated by Jenner (as argued within this thesis, scholars such as Polwhele and Borlase had previously advanced such an idea) what Jenner did was to ‘formulate a theory that, with one important qualification, is the basis of Cornish nationalism today’

---

(the one qualification being that of the doctrine of race). Jenner and his associates succeeded in re-establishing and embedding the idea of a Celtic Cornwall, which was demonstrated in the aforementioned series of interviews conducted by me and Shelley Trower in 2009 and 2010 when we asked the interviewees if they thought of Cornwall as a Celtic place. Unsurprisingly, those who were from the county or had strong connections to it (often being involved in specifically Cornish organisations) answered overwhelmingly that they thought it was. However, when the same question was posed to those who were visiting various tourist sites in the region, most of whom were from outside the county, again, the majority of those interviewees (24 of the 32 questioned) said that yes, they thought of Cornwall as a Celtic place.

The embedding of the idea of a Celtic Cornwall can also be demonstrated by the subsequent appropriating of this image by the tourist industry. Tourism, for better or worse, is now Cornwall’s major industry and the Revivalists helped it to succeed as it moved from health resort to a mystical, haunted land. A contemporary view on Cornwall in relation to tourism by John Lowerson expresses this sentiment: ‘For most English enthusiasts the Celtic is essentially an “Other”. As such it offers a peculiar meld of geographical and temporal remoteness, a partially accessible strangeness, and, for an increasing number of people, a value standard by which their own circumstances are judged and even made tolerable’. It is this idea of a Celtic Cornwall, which is so heavily dependent on Jenner’s defining of it, that has attracted, and continues to attract so many people to the region. However, this status of ‘otherness’, brought about by

---

870 Tim Saunders “‘The Answer is Simple’: Henry Jenner and the Cornish Language.” Williams 37.

indicators of identity established during the Revival, justifies marginalisation; local people are displaced or disregarded and denied jobs because of the needs of outsiders’ images of the place.

American travel writer Paul Theroux observed both Cornwall’s reputation as a mystical place, as well as the effects of the tourist industry on it when he journeyed around the British coast for his book *The Kingdom by the Sea*. When he reached Cornwall he observed that ‘Cornwall was peculiarly uneven ... it looked to be the most haunted place in England, and then its reputation for goblins seemed justified’. 872 However, he also noticed that the Cornish had come to recognise their marginalised status and react against it: ‘Cornish pride was extraordinary, and it was more than pride. It had fuelled a nationalist movement’. 873 It is a movement that is, in part, reacting to the tourism industry: ‘I had a feeling that it was the tourists who had made the Cornish nationalistic, for no one adopted a funny native costume quicker or talked more intimidatingly of local tradition than the local person under siege by tourists’. 874 As Trevor Fishlock noted in *The Times* ‘The pressure of tourism has helped to make the Cornish people look more closely at themselves and their situation. There has been a growth of regional, or national, feeling an effect of tourism and of the general development of national feeling throughout the Celtic fringes’. 875

---


873 Theroux 115.

874 Theroux 117.

It could be argued that the Celtic identity of Cornwall constructed by the Celtic Revivalists was used and ingrained in the national consciousness by the tourist industry and has subsequently held back that region, creating the above-mentioned animosity. As Alan Kent observed ‘The mere mention of Cornwall globally conjures up a certain set of images […] the weight of past perception hangs heavily around the neck … how does one begin to assert new images of Cornwall?’\textsuperscript{876} Even in the most up-to-date guidebooks, such as the 2010 edition of the Goldeneye guidebook for Cornwall, the image is still that of a mystical land: ‘Cornwall is a county of great diversity, of strange customs and superstitions, of romantic legends and Arthurian myths. A county with its own language, culture and outlook. Remote and cut off from the rest of Britain by the River Tamar, the Cornish have developed a proud individuality and resilient independence.’\textsuperscript{877} The guide notes that Cornwall is indeed still haunted by its past, stating that ‘The landscape is haunted by countless landmarks of early man (and relics from the industrial past)’.\textsuperscript{878} Not only did those in the Old Cornwall Societies help cultivate the image of Cornwall as a haunted other, embarking on a folklore collecting programme that aided this, but they were also dedicated to preserving those ‘countless landmarks’ whose physical presence added to the feeling of mysticism in the county.

However, there are signs that, although Celtic Cornwall is very much an established idea in the consciousness of many, new images of Cornwall are competing and co-


\textsuperscript{878} Fricker Introduction.
existing with the old and those interviewed by Shelley Trower and myself mentioned surfing and the Eden Project as things that they now associate with Cornwall. But the image of Cornwall as a beach holiday resort in a place that is not quite like the rest of England persists and the indicators of difference are everywhere, from the aforementioned flag of St. Piran to the use of the Cornish language on signs throughout the county.

Despite its more visible use, the spoken language remains relatively unused. In July 2002, the Cornish language was given official status by government charter but, as Deacon, Cole and Tregidga noted, working against the Cornish were ‘the imposition of an English national curriculum in schools and the impact of other Anglicizing bodies such as English Heritage’. Cornwall cannot boast a living language, and there are those who think it unlikely to ever be truly revived, Trevor Fishlock observing that ‘a genuine revival of spoken Cornish seems as unlikely as the reconnexion of a severed head’. However, this does not stop it being an important indicator of contemporary Cornish identity, the road signage in Cornish being one of the lasting consequences of the Revival.

As previously noted, keeping the Cornish dialect alive was seen as an important role for the Old Cornwall Societies, with Jenner complaining about the pernicious influence of the ‘London twang’ on so many young Cornish people, and Morton Nance bemoaning the portrayal of those with Cornish accents as unintelligent. Precisely the same issues

879 Deacon, Cole and Tregidga 103.

remain alive for those defending Cornish identity today. In a 2008 article on Cornish Nationalism in the *Sunday Times*, Richard Johnson interviewed several Cornish people about their experiences. One man complained ‘The media portrays us a thickos ... They give us ‘Mumerset’ accents on TV – that’s anything from East Anglia to Long John Silver – and make out we’re stupid’.\(^{881}\) It seems that the Cornish are still having the same argument that the Old Cornwall members did decades ago. As the author of the article pointed out ‘[A]ccent in Cornwall is a big thing. As the language is struggling, it’s an indicator of nationality’. But as one interviewee noted ‘[O]ur accent is being diluted ... Our youngsters sound like they’re in EastEnders’.\(^{882}\) It seems that the ‘London twang’ identified by Jenner remains a threat.

In the same article, it was observed that 50,000 Cornish people signed the petition for a referendum on Cornish devolution, the author noting that ‘There is disillusionment in Cornwall – and a sense of being overlooked’. His rather damning conclusion on the state of Cornish nationalism in general was ‘[S]o Cornishness and a growing sense of Cornwall’s Celtic history, still seems to amount to little more than so much flag-waving’.\(^{883}\) However, in 2004 Alistair Sooke reported in *The Telegraph* that the Cornish people ‘remain the most fiercely independent of any county in the British Isles’. He went on to quote a survey that found that 44 per cent of Cornwall’s residents felt more Cornish than English, British or European: ‘That gives Cornwall the highest level of

---


\(^{882}\) Johnson 42.

\(^{883}\) Johnson 42.
“local patriotism” in the land”. And there are those who believe that there is more substance behind the outward signs of nationalism, which seems to be based on Jenner’s particular perception of Cornish nationalism. Joanie Willett conducted a survey of 150 people in the main streets of 16 Cornish towns to ascertain if there was a distinct sense of Cornish identity. She concluded that: ‘a developed sense of “Cornishness” – often opposed to “Englishness” and “Britishness” – does exist within Cornwall, and that this was linked primarily to genealogy and perceptions of Cornish descent’. Descent was, of course, the cornerstone of Jenner’s claims for Celtic nationalism in Cornwall as expressed in The House of Damnonia; it was because the Cornish were descended from the ancient Britons (or Celts) that they have the right to proclaim their Celtic nationality in the present age. That such feelings of nationalism today are based on descent and not language, religion, class or any other indicators that Jenner himself found to be secondary is a testimony to the strength and resilience of his vision.

Other aspects of Jenner’s specific idea of Cornish nationalism also persisted in the nature of the movement’s relationship with England and Britain. In the 1960s, members of Mebyon Kernow, then a cross party organisation, Peter Bessell and John Pardoe wrote to The Times to express their party’s hopes for the future of Cornwall. It was a vision that, like Jenner’s before them, kept Cornwall loyal to both England and the Empire, or, by this time, the Commonwealth: ‘It is our contention that the Cornish people have the same right to control their country, its economy and its political future


as the other Celtic peoples of Scotland and Wales. Historically and culturally Cornwall is also a land separated from England and has far closer ties with the rest of Celtic Britain.\textsuperscript{886} They went on to state that ‘Nationalism in Cornwall, Scotland and Wales does not imply disloyalty to Crown, Commonwealth or Parliament. On the contrary, it seeks to strengthen all three, while giving the people of those countries autonomy at least equal to that enjoyed by the inhabitants of Northern Ireland, the Channel Islands and the Isle of Man’.\textsuperscript{887} They further claimed that the ‘ancient Celtic races’ who had contributed so much to democratic freedom are ‘tired of the years of exploitation and neglect which have been their only reward’.\textsuperscript{888} In this statement we see the connection of Celticity and economic deprivation being made explicit.

As the Cornish nationalist movement progressed towards politicisation, so the symbols that the Revivalists established as markers of Cornish identity further pervaded the national consciousness. By the 1980s, Marcus Tanner was able to discern an awareness of Cornish nationalist sentiment throughout the county: ‘there is a shift of mood taking place in Cornwall’.\textsuperscript{889} Whilst visiting the county he observed that St. Piran’s flag ‘flies now from church towers and town halls, as well as decorating the rear bumpers of many cars’.\textsuperscript{890} The symbols that Jenner and his associates helped to popularise have had an effect on Cornish identity: ‘This nationalism on the cheap, however superficial, is a new


\textsuperscript{887} Bessell and Pardoe 11.

\textsuperscript{888} Bessell and Pardoe 11.

\textsuperscript{889} Marcus Tanner, \textit{The Last of the Celts} (New Haven: Yale University Press, 2004) 246.

\textsuperscript{890} Tanner 247.
phenomenon. It effects wider dissemination of a feeling of Cornishness’. What had finally happened, claimed Tanner, was that this Cornishness, which one could say is related directly to that posited by the Revivalists, had begun to affect the ‘working classes’ – the majority of Cornish people: ‘Now it is visible, not merely in the slogans painted on bridges and the white paint daubed over municipal signs, but in the number of signatures collected for a Cornish assembly’. Like Bessell and Pardoe, Tanner concluded that it was recognition of the county’s poor economic state that had aroused such feelings: ‘It is economic resentment that is fuelling the revival of interest in Cornwall’s own identity, not delayed anger at its centuries-old subjugation by King Athelstan, or regret for the death of the Cornish language. The Cornish do not want much and even nationalists are not very interested in separation or a republic’.

Cultural differences and economic differences are now linked together in Cornwall and the perception of Cornwall as a neglected region is bound to its identity as a region of difference.

Perhaps one of the more radical ideas for Cornwall’s future is that proposed by The Cornish Constitutional Convention, a cross-party, cross-sector association formed in November 2000 with the objective of establishing a devolved Assembly for Cornwall (Senedh Kernow). However, like Jenner, Bessell and Pardoe before them, they make it clear that they are not campaigning for any form of separatism or independence from Britain: ‘The aim of the Convention is to establish a form of modern governance which strengthens Cornwall, her role in the affairs of the country, and positively addresses the

---

891 Tanner 247.

892 Tanner 247. 50 000 signatures were collected in 2001.

893 Tanner 249.
problems that have arisen from more than a century of growing isolation and loss of confidence. And once again, Cornwall’s Celtic heritage, its culture, is evoked in order to substantiate claims for any future improvements in its political and economic situation. Andrew George, MP for St. Ives and Vice Chair of the Cornish Constitutional Convention, stated that:

Cornwall has a distinct Celtic heritage, separate language and a unique constitutional relationship with the Crown. However, the Constitutional Convention has always maintained that we’re not seeking to cut Cornwall off – quite the opposite – we’re campaigning to cut Cornwall into the celebration of diversity. Cornwall has much to offer if its distinctiveness were to be properly recognised. It would open up new horizons rather than shut them down.

And just as Jenner realised the importance of Cornish people being taught Cornish history in schools, so those in the modern nationalist movement recognise the role of education in instilling a sense of national pride. The difference is that those in modern organisations have made the connection between cultural and political nationalism, with political nationalism being a consequence of its cultural counterpart. It is urged by John Angarrack, Cornish nationalist and founder of Cornwall 2000, that those who find (in

---


language that reflects that of Hechter, Gibbons and others) the ‘colonial policy’ of Westminster objectionable should: ‘do what they can to ensure that Cornish history is not only properly articulated, but also disseminated into schools. Only by this means will democracy flourish, the will of the people prevail and Cornwall find a more productive balance between centralisation and autonomy’.

He added that ‘[w]hen it comes to the important Cornish dimension in British history, pupils are prevented from finding the evidence, weighing it up and reaching their own conclusions’.

Jenner fully understood the importance of educating people in their own history, as well as instilling a sense of national pride and identity. However, the link between cultural and political nationalism was not made, either because it was not seen as a necessary consequence, or because the relatively radical consequences would not have been popular at that time in Cornwall.

In 2009, Deacon commented that Cornwall’s nationalist movement has sustained itself ‘culturally’ for ‘more than a century’, and ‘politically’ for ‘more than half a century’. It is argued that Cornwall’s political nationalism emerged from, and was a consequence of, its earlier cultural nationalism.

It is further suggested that this cultural nationalism was shaped, to a considerable extent, by Henry Jenner’s personal vision of a Celtic Cornwall, and his tireless, determined and persistent efforts to promote the Cornish Nationalist identity as it is widely recognised today.

---


897 “Suppression of Cornish Identity.” <http://duchyoofcornwall.eu/duchy05.php>

Archival Sources

This list contains a brief description of the principle archival sources that were used in researching information for this thesis. Additionally, I made extensive use of the resources held at the Morrab Library in Penzance, particularly those held in the Jenner Room which contains an extensive collection of material relating to the Celtic history of Cornwall as well as holdings on other Celtic countries. I also examined the collection of material on Cornish history and, specifically, the Old Cornwall Societies held at the Proprietary Library in Plymouth. The Local Studies department at the Central Library in Plymouth also provided useful information on Cornwall in general and the history of GWR in particular.

The Henry Jenner Collection:

As mentioned in the introduction, this collection at The Courtney Library in Truro consists of 20 boxes containing many of Jenner's personal documents, drafts of his speeches, a selection of Legitimist magazines, newspaper articles, cards and photographs. The collection is relatively well catalogued and I was able to access all 20 boxes for the purposes of research for this thesis.

The Henry Jenner Collection X1141:

Held at the Cornwall County Record Office in Truro, this uncatalogued collection consists of 6 boxes of Jenner's documents including the first four chapters of his
unfinished and unpublished autobiography 'Four Score Years and More: The Memories of Henry Jenner M.A., F.S.A.' The rest of the collection contains letters, newspaper articles, and various notes and transcripts. Despite not yet being catalogued, thanks to the knowledge of the staff at the Record Office I was able to examine several relevant documents from this collection.

**The Jenner Papers ms88884:**

Containing correspondence from the period 1873 – 1934, as well as a few newspaper articles and other printed documents, this collection at the British Library contains 58 folders of items which are in the process of being catalogued. Many of the items are letters concerning Jenner’s time working at the Museum Library. There are also a significant number of personal family letters as well as correspondence on the Celtic languages, primarily Manx but a few on Welsh, Breton and Cornish too. Most useful to this thesis was Jenner’s own letter on the subject of his Legitimism and relationship to those involved in the cause.
Interviews

This thesis was undertaken as part of the AHRC funded project entitled Myth, Mysticism and Celtic Nationalism. Another component of the overall project was a series of interviews which were constructed by Dr. Shelley Trower and myself to try and answer some of questions posed by the project, including: how are some places, such as Cornwall, felt to be particularly ‘haunted’ by a mystical past? What impact does this perception have on their identity politics? And how do other Celtic nations compare?

Although conducted on behalf of the AHRC, the interviews were also undertaken in association with the Cornish Audio Visual Archive. All recordings were collected using appropriate consent forms approved by the Oral History Society and the interviews were practiced in line with ethical guidelines of the British Library.

The interviews were of two types. One group was a series of 32 short interviews conducted at Tintagel, Boscastle, The Truro Museum and The Eden Project during the summers of 2009 and 2010 by myself and Dr. Shelley Trower. The interviewees were nearly all from outside the county as the idea was to determine how Cornwall is viewed by these 'outsiders'. In particular, and in line with the aims of the overall project, we were interested in perceptions of the county as a haunted, Celtic place. The questions asked were as follows:

Where have you come from?
What 3 things come to mind when you here 'Cornwall'?

Do you think of Cornwall as a Celtic place?

Do you think of Cornwall as part of England?

Do you think of Cornwall as a particularly haunted place?

How would you describe the Cornish landscape?

As we were keen to see how the views of these 'outsiders' contrasted to those within the county, 28 longer interviews were recorded with various people connected with Cornwall and Cornish institutions, including first female Grand Bard of the Cornish Gorseth Anne Trevenen-Jenkin, and Cornish language teacher and Cornish Bard Clive Baker.

All the interviews are preserved by the Cornish Audio Visual Archive at its public access centre at the Cornish Studies Library in Redruth, although selections of them are also available on the internet at the following website:
http://www.gregmusser.com/cava/

As quoted on page 220, this is the full transcript for the interview I conducted with Stuart Higgs of Supernatural Investigations UK on 12th November 2010.

Please could you tell me a bit about the work you do and how it is carried out?

A difficult question to answer concisely, but essentially our cases are either in response to requests from venue owners who are experiencing strange activity (reports from
guests or staff for example); or originate from an approach from ourselves, should it be
more of a reputation based haunting/anomalous experiences. No two cases are the same
and no two cases (regrettably) follow the same pattern or process, largely due to fitting
in with the client’s requests, business opening hours or the distance involved in
travelling to a venue. Typically we would subdivide into two groups (to allow
comparison of independent findings) and investigate the different areas of a property,
swapping around without discussion until after the event. A normal investigation might
comprise one or more ‘sensitive’ members of the team identifying their own psychic
findings, which is then balanced with more technically biased members looking for
psychological or rational explanations for the events experienced. We then compile a
report to record our findings, highlighting any similarities between the two teams and
the previously reported incidents, which are then submitted to the client. Breaking down
the techniques used further, they could be broadly identified as: dowsing/psychic
impressions, observation of the environment and those participating, photo and video
recording of the investigation and experimental techniques (this could include
consensual séances, psychology trials, temperature monitoring, measuring electro-
magnetic fields etc.). We do not normally undertake investigations into people’s own
homes (especially if children are involved) instead referring them to a GP,
electrician/plumber etc. and to record a diary of events for at least one month, so that we
are sure all rational avenues have been explored. We are mindful that there are
individuals who can potentially cause damage to vulnerable persons by assuming (or
indeed declaring) that their unusual experiences are defiantly of a paranormal nature.
Although our team is made up of both firm believers and harden sceptics, we are all
keen to ensure that this field is largely delving into the unknown, so always stress the
following to our clients: We always aim to present our findings to clients in an open
way but must stress that any information gained from a medium, sensitive or other means can not be scientifically proven. These findings are not presented as fact.

You must have done a lot of research over a long period of time, how did you collect all the ghost stories detailed in the book?

A lifetime of reading is one of the main sources, combined with our own research and investigations at Cornish properties – several of which we were (frustratingly) not allowed to include at the venue’s request. We can’t really summarise it better than from our draft blurb to the publisher: Paranormal Cornwall takes you on a journey around this mysterious county. With eye witness interviews, press reports and previously unpublished investigation accounts carried out by the authors and their dedicated paranormal team, Supernatural Investigations.

In the store [Waterstones bookshop, New George Street, Plymouth] you mentioned that you found it easier to get events staged in Cornwall than other locations – why do you think this is?

Either there is something in the water, or people in Cornwall are just more trusting when it comes to allowing access and seemingly less worried about the potential dangers (health & safety) of allowing people who are relatively unknown (to them) to wander around their property in the dark. When we used to do commercial charity nights we always found Cornwall’s reputation as a land of magic helped in both selling tickets and arranging venues. This was echoed by the Charity Events Manager we worked with, who lived on the Devon/Somerset border but described how she almost automatically tried to arrange a venue in Cornwall (rather than on her doorstep) for
most events, from Bungee Jumping to haunted tours; again not just because it was easier to arrange but also because she knew she would have higher numbers turn up – ironically the majority were not local so would have had to travel from (or through) Somerset and Devon anyway!

Is there much media interest in your work, locally or nationally?

Not as much as there used to be, the rise of ghostly TV programmes has pretty much saturated the market and to an extent flogged it to death, however despite writing books, that’s not what we are in it for! We have done local radio, tv, magazines, newspapers as well as national magazines, newspapers and even international tv, but we have never been able to trace any direct benefit in terms of new members or venues as a result from any media work. A lot of the people who are interested in this line of work, are too heavily influenced by the tv programmes and the unsubstantiated psychic and physical findings they always encounter – the reality is very different and we’re glad to only have those with at least some sense of rationality about themselves.

In your experience, do the people you meet and work with see Cornwall as a 'Celtic' place, and if so, why do you think this is?

We would have to say yes, but being honest this opinion is more of a general one regarding preconceived cultural origins, rather than one held by those in the paranormal field. As many friends or colleagues outside of the field have expressed this opinion as those within the supernatural realm – for want of a better expression! We would defiantly state that this preconceived idea of Cornwall being the land of Celtic mystery helps when arranging our vigils.
Within your field, is Cornwall seen as a particularly haunted place, compared to the rest of the country?

Aside from the logistics of arranging investigations, the short answer would have to be yes – but with a pinch of salt. There is something to be said about the geology of Cornwall being largely granite (if one subscribes to the recording or ‘stone tape theory’ of ghosts being replayed or even trapped within quartz and similar materials), there is also of course the relative remoteness and untouched qualities of a lot of the locations within Cornwall. Dave Wood, chairman of ASSAP and his partner, Nicky (both very sceptical and focused on the scientific angle) have both commented to us we have worked with have also commented about how they regret moving from Cornwall as the venues closer to them (they now live in Swindon) don’t seem to be as active! That said this question prompted to us to analysis the ratio of activity level experienced at our investigations across the counties, and in percentage terms, venues in Cornwall aren’t particularly more active than the rest of the country, just that is where most our studies have taken place in the first and last county.
Bibliography

<http://stjames-hamptonhill.org.uk/History/ThrYears/1900/02KngCor.htm>

<http://www.wesleyjohnston.com/users/ireland/past/history/18861893.html>


<http://the-natural-gardener-s-bookshelf.727561.n3.nabble.com/file/n727689/A_HISTORY_OF_GARDENING>


<http://infotrac.galegroup.com/itw/infomark/369/12/126779246w16/purl=rc2_TTDA_2_The+Ancient+Cornish+Tongue>


Andrews, Stuart and Higgs, Jason. Paranormal Cornwall. Stroud: The History Press,
2010.


“A Brief Review of the Company’s Hundred Years of Business”. *Great Western Railway*
“The British Museum Reading-Room.” *The Times* 31 Oct. 1907: 9


“Claim English Throne; Renewed Activity of the Order of the White Rose and the


“Cornish Celtic Tours.” Cornwall Online website. 4 Aug 2011. <http://www.cornwall-online.co.uk/cornishcellictours/Welcome.html>


“The Duchy Hospital.” Duchy Hospital website. 2. <http://www.duchyhospital.co.uk/default.aspx>


of the British Association for the Advancement of Science: 1893. London, 1894.


“Great Western Publicity.” The Great Western Archive. 16 July 2012. <greatwestern.org.uk>


Hale, Amy and Payton, Philip, ed. *New Directions in Celtic Studies.* Exeter: University


The Henry Jenner Collection 1873-1934. The British Library. Ref. No. ms88884
The Henry Jenner Collection X1141. Cornwall County Record Office, Truro. Boxes 1-6


Jenner, Henry. “An Incident in Cornwall in 1715.” Journal of the Royal Institution of Cornwall. 68 (1921): 552-558


Jones, Kelvin, I, ed. Anne Jefferies and the Fairies. Penzance: Oakmagic Publications,


Co, 1864.


McDonald, Maryon. We Are Not French! Language, Culture and Identity in Brittany. London: Routledge, 1898.


“Mr. Gladstone.” *The Times* 12 June 1889: 10

“Mr. Gladstone in Cornwall.” *The Times* 13 June 1889: 7

“Mr. Gladstone in Cornwall.” *The Times* 14 June 1889: 5


Nott, J. C. and Gliddon, G. R. *Types of mankind: or Ethnological Researches, based upon the ancient monuments, paintings, sculptures and crania of races, and upon their natural, geographical, philosophical, and biblical history*. London: Trubner and Co, 1854.

312


“Palladio and Britain: Well-known Palladian houses in the region.” Royal Institute of British Architects website. 6 Aug. 2011.


Saunders, Tim. “‘The Answer is Simple’: Henry Jenner and the Cornish Language.”


Sorensen, Janet. “Internal Colonialism and the British Novel.” *Eighteenth Century*


Penzance: Patten Press, 1997. 107-128


Topinard, Dr. Paul. “To Dr. John Beddoe.” <i>Journal of the Anthropological Institute of Great Britain and Ireland</i>. 1 (1898): 329


West, Shearer, ed. The Victorians and Race. Aldeshot: Ashgate, 1996.


