Teaching and Learning Thinking Skills in the Kingdom of Saudi Arabia: Case studies from seven primary schools

Submitted by

Abdulrahman Alnesyan

To the University of Exeter as a thesis for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy in Education

April 2012

This thesis is available for Library use on the understanding that it is copyright material and that no quotation from the thesis may be published without proper acknowledgement.

I certify that all material in this thesis which is not my own work has been identified and that no material has previously been submitted and approved for the award of a degree by this or any other University.

Signature ........................................................................................................................................
Acknowledgements

In the Name of Allah, the Most Gracious, the Most Merciful

My greatest thanks to Allah who gave me the inspiration, time and ability to complete this thesis.

I would like to express my appreciation to my country, the Kingdom of Saudi Arabia, that gave me the opportunity to study in the United Kingdom.

In fact, many great people deserve recognition for their encouragement and support in the work of this study. I am grateful to my first supervisor, Professor Anna Craft, for her professional guidance, great support, comments and encouragement that have helped me at every stage.

I also wish to extend my deep appreciation and special thanks to my second supervisor, Dr Shirley Larkin, for her valuable support, comments and encouragement that have been helpful in this study.

I would like to extend my gratitude to everyone who has participated in my study, including my PhD colleagues for their time and advice. Finally, yet importantly, a special note of gratitude goes to my family: my mother, my wife, my brothers and sisters, for their continued support and encouragement throughout the period of the study. I extend my deepest thanks to my sweetheart daughter, Sahar, and my lovely son, Muath, with particular thanks and love.
Abstract

In recent years, teaching and learning thinking skills in primary schools through adoption of the infusion approach to thinking skills in school textbooks has increasingly become a focus of policy development in the Kingdom of Saudi Arabia (KSA). This study endeavoured to understand teachers’ and students’ experiences of teaching and learning thinking skills in primary schools. It aimed to explore teachers’ and students’ perspectives on, and current approaches to, the teaching and learning of thinking skills in the KSA primary curriculum; to investigate the impact of the factors which appear to guide teachers’ and students’ experiences of thinking skills in the classroom; and to identify possible challenges that face both teachers and students in developing these skills.

The study was undertaken within the interpretive paradigm. It adopts a socio-cultural perspective in its exploration of teachers’ and students’ experiences of teaching and learning thinking skills. Case study was employed as methodical way to yield in-depth detailed data to provide an understanding of the issues in the study. Three instruments of data collection provided insight: semi-structured interviews, classroom observation and group discussions. These presented a rich variety of data on topics regarding teaching and learning thinking skills, permitting triangulation to develop robust findings. The sample consisted of seven case study classes of male students from the upper years in primary schools in the KSA.

Several findings emerged from the data by using grounded theory analysis techniques, regarding the factors and challenges that influence teaching and learning thinking skills. Four significant outcomes are highlighted. The first is that teachers embracing the infusion approach to thinking skills as a natural part of the subject matter in textbooks was one of the most pervasive practices. Secondly, the study has highlighted the importance of the actual dynamics of interactions in classroom contexts via teachers’ and students’ complementary roles. Thirdly, spiritual/cultural inner motivation greatly influenced and shaped teachers’ and students’ practices of teaching and learning thinking skills. Fourthly, the study has shown the crucial importance of teachers’ and students’ identities in their performance of thinking skills. These four elements work together in a dynamic relationship in the particular socio-cultural context.
# Table of Contents

Acknowledgements 2  
Abstract 3  
Table of Contents 4  
List of Tables 10  
List of Figures 11  
List of Appendices 12  
Abbreviations and Terms 13  

## Chapter One: Introduction to the Study 14  
1.1 Introduction 15  
1.2 Rationale of the study 15  
1.3 Aims of the study and its associated questions 17  
1.4 Significance of the study 18  
1.5 Study Context 19  
  1.5.1 Background to the Study 19  
  1.5.2 Characteristics of the KSA society 20  
  1.5.3 The KSA Educational System 21  
  1.5.4 Thinking skills in the KSA Educational System 24  
1.6 Organisation of the Thesis 25  
1.7 Chapter summary 26  

## Chapter Two: Literature Review 27  
2.1 Introduction 28  
2.2 Definitions 28  
2.3 Importance of thinking skills 32  
2.4 Thinking skills frameworks 35  
  2.4.1 The Moseley et al model 36  
  2.4.2 Sternberg’s model of abilities as developing expertise (2001) 40  
2.5 Models and programmes of thinking skills across the curriculum 42  
2.6 Teaching and learning thinking skills 45  
  2.6.1 Can thinking skills be taught? 46  
  2.6.2 Sociocultural Perspectives on Thinking 47  
    2.6.2.1 Teaching and learning thinking may be individual or social 48  
    2.6.2.2 Thinking Skills as Cultural Tools 48  
    2.6.2.3 Teaching and learning transferable thinking skills 49  
  2.6.3 The major components of thinking skills processes 51  
    2.6.3.1 Strategies and techniques for organizing skills 52  


Chapter Three: Research Methodology

3.1 Introduction 75
3.2 Research paradigm 75
  3.2.1 Ontological assumptions 78
  3.2.2 Epistemological assumptions 79
3.3 The socio-cultural perspective 80
  3.3.1 Why is the socio-cultural perspective appropriate for this study? 82
  3.3.2 Mediation 85
    3.3.2.1 The active nature of mediation 87
3.4 The Sample 90
  3.4.1 Case Selection Technique 92
3.5 Research Design 93
  3.5.1 Case study 94
  3.5.2 Instruments of data collection 96
    3.5.2.1 The interview 97
    3.5.2.2 Observation 98
  3.5.3 Group discussion 100
3.6 The pilot study 102
3.7 The process of data collection 103
3.8 Ethical Considerations 104
3.9 Data analysis 106
  3.9.1 Grounded theory as a data analysis method 106
3.10 Trustworthiness of the study 108
3.11 Chapter summary 111
Chapter Four: Analytic Approach

4.1 Introduction 113
4.2 Pilot Study 113
4.3 Main Study 115
4.4 Data analysis 115
4.5 Instruments of data collection and analytic approach for each 118
   4.5.1 The teachers’ and students’ interview data analysis 118
   4.5.2 The classroom observation data analysis 121
   4.5.3 The group discussion data analysis 124
4.6 Chapter summary 131

Chapter Five: Thematic Findings

5.1 Introduction 133
5.2 Experience: ‘The experiences of teachers and students of teaching and learning thinking skill’ 134
   5.2.1 Enjoyment of thinking skills 134
      5.2.1.1 A ‘dynamic educational incubator’ 135
      5.2.1.2 Students’ Views 136
   5.2.2 Teachers’ preparation 136
      5.2.2.1 ‘The university preparation was just information and traditional theory’ 136
   5.2.3 Strategies and techniques for teaching and learning thinking skills 138
      5.2.3.1 Collaborative Learning 139
      5.2.3.2 Dialogue strategies 142
      5.2.3.3 Higher-Level questioning strategies 144
      5.2.3.4 Scaffolding strategies 147
      5.2.3.5 Cueing strategies 148
      5.2.3.6 Giving enough time 149
      5.2.3.7 The use of the language of thinking in the classroom 150
      5.2.3.8 Feedback strategies 151
      5.2.3.9 Individual techniques 152
   5.2.4 Students’ application of the thinking skills process 154
   5.2.5 The Textbook Exercises 156
      5.2.5.1 The infusion approach in the textbook 156
      5.2.5.2 Students’ experiences of the exercises 159
   5.2.6 Section summary 161

5.3 Factors: ‘Factors appearing to guide teachers’ and students’ experiences of thinking skills’ 163
   5.3.1 The perception of personal or ‘internal’ influences 163
      5.3.1.1 Relationship between thinking skills and beliefs 164
      5.3.1.2 Teacher experience and background 166
Chapter Six: Case Studies and interpretation

6.1 Introduction 205
6.2 Overall summary for all seven cases 205
6.2.1 Brief description of each case 206
   6.2.1.1 Case One 206
   6.2.1.2 Case Two 207
   6.2.1.3 Case Three 207
   6.2.1.4 Case Four 208
   6.2.1.5 Case Five 208
   6.2.1.6 Case Six 209
   6.2.1.7 Case Seven 209
6.3 Case Examples 210
   6.3.1 Progressive cases 213
      6.3.1.1 Case Three 213
   6.3.2 Traditional cases 228
      6.3.2.1 Case Two 228
6.4 Chapter summary 234
Chapter Seven: Summary of the findings

7.1 Introduction

7.2 Summary of the main findings

7.2.1 Insight into the research question one (RQ1):

7.2.1.1 The teachers’ and students’ views of thinking skills

7.2.1.2 Teachers’ preparedness

7.2.1.3 Strategies and techniques for teaching thinking skills

- 7.2.1.3.1 Collaborative learning
- 7.2.1.3.2 Dialogue strategies
- 7.2.1.3.3 Higher-level questioning strategies
- 7.2.1.3.4 Scaffolding strategies
- 7.2.1.3.5 Cueing strategies
- 7.2.1.3.6 Giving enough time
- 7.2.1.3.7 The use of the language of thinking in the classroom
- 7.2.1.3.8 Feedback strategies
- 7.2.1.3.9 Individual techniques

7.2.1.4 Students’ application of thinking skills

7.2.1.5 The textbook exercises as an infusion approach

7.2.2 Insight into the research question two (RQ2):

7.2.2.1 Influence type 1: personal or ‘internal’ influences

7.2.2.2 Influence type 2: external influences

- 7.2.2.2.1 Social and cultural context
- 7.2.2.2.2 A safe classroom environment
- 7.2.2.2.3 Extra-curricular programmes
- 7.2.2.2.4 Teacher roles
- 7.2.2.2.5 The relationship between teachers and students
- 7.2.2.2.6 The appropriate classroom

7.2.3 Insight into the research question three (RQ3):

7.2.3.1 Teachers’ Challenges

- 7.2.3.1.1 A lack of time
- 7.2.3.1.2 A lack of professional training
- 7.2.3.1.3 ‘Swimming against the stream’

7.2.3.2 Students’ Challenges

- 7.2.3.2.1 Weak student literacy
- 7.2.3.2.2 Power relations
- 7.2.3.2.3 Student perceptions of the teacher as potentially one of the challenges

- 7.2.3.2.4 A lack of time

7.2.3.3 Textbook Challenges

7.3 Chapter summary
Chapter Eight: Discussion of the main findings

8.1 Introduction 253
8.2 The overarching thematic finding of the study 254
  8.2.1 Overarching theme one: Teachers embracing the infusion approach to thinking skills via textbooks 254
  8.2.2 Overarching theme two: The teacher’s and students’ complementary roles 256
  8.2.3 Overarching theme three: Spiritual/cultural inner motivation 266
  8.2.4 Overarching theme four: The effects of teachers’ and students’ identities on teachers’ and students’ performance of thinking skills 268
8.3 Chapter summary 270

Chapter Nine: Conclusion

9.1 Introduction 271
9.2 Overview of the study 272
9.3 Limitations of the study 273
9.4 Implications of the study 274
  9.4.1 Implications for policy makers and the curriculum 275
  9.4.2 Implications for the teacher 278
  9.4.3 Implications for students 280
9.5 Suggestions for Future Research 281
9.6 Final Comments 283

References 285
Appendices 303
List of Tables

Chapter 1
Table 1.1 The number of schools, classes, students, teachers and administrative staff 22

Chapter 3
Table 3.1 The sample for all seven cases 91
Table 3.2 Comparison of criteria for analysis of research data (adapted from Hoepfl, 1997) 109

Chapter 4
Table 4.1 Number of interviews 119
Table 4.2 Number of classroom observations 122
Table 4.3 Number of group discussions 125
Table 4.4 Main study data analysis stages 127-130

Chapter 6
Table 6.1 Academic subject and age of students for all seven cases 206
Table 6.2 Categorisation of cases by types of practice 212
List of Figures

Chapter 1
Figure 1,1 Map of the KSA 20

Chapter 2
Figure 2,1 An integrated model for understanding thinking and learning Moseley et al (2005) 39
Figure 2,2 Sternberg’s (2001) model of developing expertise. 41

Chapter 3
Figure 3,1 Vygotsky’s mediational triangle (version from Edwards, 2005) 86
Figure 3,2 The process of data collection 104

Chapter 4
Figure 4,1 The grounded theory analytic process (adapted from Harwood, 2002) 116

Chapter 6
Figure 6,1 Types of practice in each case regarding teaching / learning thinking skills 213
Figure 6,2 Physical setting of case 3 classroom 215
Figure 6,3 The series of steps in applying thinking skills in case 3 225
Figure 6,4 Physical setting of case 2 classroom 229

Chapter 8
Figure 8,1 Types of classroom relationships in each case 260
List of Appendices

Appendix 1: An example of a textbook exercise 304
Appendix 2: Teachers’ semi-structured interview schedule 308
Appendix 3: Students’ semi-structured interview schedule 312
Appendix 4: The consent forms for all participants involved in the study 313
Appendix 5: The overall themes from analysis of students’ interviews 318
Appendix 6: The overall themes from analysis of teachers’ interviews 322
Appendix 7: The overall themes from analysis of group discussions 327
Appendix 8: The observation schedule 329
Appendix 9: The overall themes from analysis of classroom observation 330
Appendix 10: The local Ministry of Education plan of training programmes for the second term, 2009-2010 334
Appendix 11: Example of observation lesson 335
Appendix 12: Number of instruments of data collection 342
Abbreviations and Terms

CAS: The continuous assessment system

CASE: Cognitive Acceleration through Science Education

CPD: Continuing professional development

GT: Grounded theory

KSA: The Kingdom of Saudi Arabia

MOE: Ministry of Education

MOHE: Ministry of Higher Education

P4C: Philosophy for Children

ZPD: The zone of proximal development