

**A comparative perspective on educational policies for
children of immigrants in Taiwan**

Submitted by Hsin-Jui Ho, to the University of Exeter as a thesis for the degree
of Doctor of Philosophy in Education, May 2012.

This thesis is available for Library use on the understanding that it is copyright
material and that no quotation from the thesis may be published without proper
acknowledgement.

I certify that all material in this thesis which is not my own work has been
identified and that no material has previously been submitted and approved for the
award of a degree by this or any other University.

Hsin Jui Ho

Signature:

Acknowledgements

This study would not have been possible without the support of many people. Firstly, I greatly appreciate the support of my supervisors. I am deeply grateful to Professor William Richardson for his wisdom, understanding and encouragement over the years of my study. I would also like to show my greatest appreciation to Dr Martin Levinson for his generous guidance and supervision. I wish to express my thanks to Professor Elizabeth Wood for her kind support and advice on this study.

I would like to thank Dr David Crook and Ms Sue Chedzoy for their expertise suggestions, which increases the academic rigour of the thesis.

A very big thank you to all the people who participated in, gave help to and supported this study. Also, I would like to thank all who have assisted me in my educational journey: my friends, my colleagues and National Taipei University of Education from which I graduated and for which I work.

Finally, I would like to thank my family for all they have done for me. My mum and my husband, Jerry, provided their full support. My two young children, Matt and Julia, have always stood by me and help relieve the enormous pressure throughout the study work. Your unfailing love and company was the greatest prop to sustain me in completion of this study.

Abstract

The education of immigrant children is a persistent concern in many western countries. Taiwan has begun to face this challenge in the last decade. The immigrants in this context are mostly females from Southeast Asia and mainland China, on the basis of marriage to a Taiwanese resident. Since Taiwanese society holds a prejudice against them, the children born to foreign mothers are believed to have a negative impact on the quality of the Taiwanese population and to create particular educational problems.

The study employs an interpretive approach combining components of international comparison and policy research. Within this qualitative methodology, mixed methods were used to collect data and gain multiple understandings of the phenomenon in Taiwan. These methods of document analysis, semi-structured interviews and participant observation of foreign mothers' communities, along with a documentary review of the UK experience of educational policy for immigrant children from the 1960s onwards, provide a comparative perspective that has considerable reference value for Taiwan.

It was found that the children of immigrant mothers in Taiwan do not appear to underachieve or fall behind, in contrast to the prejudice held by Taiwanese society. The study also explores the characteristics of disadvantage of children born to immigrant mothers. Through the comparative historical review of the UK and Taiwan, the study also found that when people are faced with different cultures, their attitudes appear to move through in a similar process of adjustment which interacts with and responds to policy formulation. In addition, some recommendations for educational policy for children of immigrant mothers in Taiwan are discussed. The study

proposes that learning plural mother tongues is a means to improve these children's self-identity, allowing them to develop bilingual advantages and contribute to the country's competitiveness.

Table of Contents

List of Tables.....	6
List of Figures	7
1. Introduction.....	8
1.1 The research problem.....	9
1.2 The Knowledge Gap	10
1.3 Research questions.....	13
1.4 Structure	13
1.5 Terminology	15
2. Methodology: policy research in comparative perspective	17
2.1 Goals of the study	17
2.2 Policy Research.....	18
2.1.2 Methodology for Policy Research	19
2.2.2 Problem definition	27
2.2.3 Agenda setting.....	31
2.2.4 Policy formulation and suggestion.....	35
2.3 International Comparison.....	36
Context matters	37
Focus for Research.....	38
Diminishing Bias	39
Opportunities in comparative research	40
2.4 Research design	41
2.4.1 Data Collection Procedure and Sampling.....	41
2.4.2 Data analysis	62
2.5 Ethical considerations	66
3. The Policy Problem.....	71
3.1 Education policy for minorities	71
3.2 Why compare the UK with Taiwan?.....	71
3.3 Taiwan.....	73
3.3.1 Phenomenon of foreign spouses in Taiwan.....	73
3.3.2 Children of Immigrant Mothers in Taiwan	87
3.4 The UK.....	94
3.4.1 A History of Ethnic Minority Education Policy of the UK, 1960-1990	95
3.4.2 Analysis of this History.....	132
4. Results and Analysis	149
4.1 Problem Definition.....	149

Cross country marriage and the cultural difference	150
Language	152
Weak family and social supports	155
Social Economic Status.....	157
Health.....	161
Prejudice	163
Labelling	167
Identification	168
Divorce.....	170
Multiple factors	171
Findings from fieldwork	172
Findings from documentary research.....	178
Summary of Problem Definition.....	179
4.2 Agenda setting of the educational challenge of children born to foreign mothers	182
4.3 Policy Formulation.....	190
Socioeconomic Status	191
The truth of disadvantage.....	196
Politics.....	199
Statistics	202
5 Discussion	208
5.1 International Comparison.....	208
5.1.1 The same path of integration.....	209
5.1.2 Following Contemporary Thoughts	210
5.1.3 Dissimilarities between UK and Taiwan.....	213
5.1.4 Contribution of the study to comparative research in education	219
5.2 Education Policy: principles and priorities	221
5.2.1 Equity and Justice	221
5.2.2 Empowerment	230
5.2.3 Multicultural Education Policy	239
5.2.4 Language as resource- plural Mother Tongue.....	251
5.2.5 Process of Policy Research	263
6. Conclusions.....	266
6.1 The Key Points.....	266
6.2 Recommendations.....	281
6.3 Contribution of this study	290
6.4 Reflections	293

6.5 Limitations and directions for future research	295
Bibliography	297
Appendix	318
Appendix A-Invitation of first stage Interview (English)	318
Appendix A-Invitation of first stage Interview(Chinese)	319
Appendix A-Invitation of first stage Interview (Vietnamese).....	320
Appendix A-Invitation of first stage Interview(Indonesian).....	321
Appendix B- Questions of First Stage Interview	322
Appendix C- Informed consent of first Stage Interview (English)....	326
Appendix C- Informed consent of first Stage Interview (Chinese) ...	327
Appendix C- Informed consent of first Stage Interview (Indonesian)	
.....	328
Appendix C- Informed consent of first Stage Interview (Vietnamese)	
.....	329
Appendix D- Questions of Second Stage Interview	330
Appendix E- Questions of final Stage Interview	333
Appendix F- Informed consent of second and final Stage Interview	
(Chinese).....	336
Appendix F- Informed consent of second and final Stage Interview	
(English).....	337
Appendix G- Certificate of ethical research approval	338
Appendix H- Royal County of Berkshire -Education for Racial	
Equality: policy paper 1	341
Appendix I- Extract from the Swann Report	343
Appendix J- Extract from the Studies regard to Children of foreign	
mothers.....	349

List of Tables

Table 2.4.1 Basic data of first stage interviews- I.....	53
Table 2.4.2 Basic data of first stage interviews- II	54
Table 2.4.3 Basic data of second stage interviews.....	57
Table 2.4.4 Basic data of final stage interview	59
Table 2.4.5 Basic data of conference participate	62
Table 3.3.1 The Number of Foreign Spouses	74
Table 3.3.2 The Number of Newly Married Couples	74
Table 3.3.3 The number of births by mother’s nationality of origin in Taiwan.....	75
Table 3.3.4 List of countries by GDP per capita (2008)	78
Table 3.3.5 The Number of Foreign Spouses with Residence Permit	79
Table 3.3.6 The Number of Foreign Spouses with Residence Permit (excluding China).....	84
Table 3.3.7 Statistics of Foreign Spouses’ Children in Elementary School.....	88
Table 3.3.8 Numbers of Foreign Spouses’ Boys & Girls in Compulsory Education (Categorized by Nationalities)	89
Table 3.3.9 Numbers of Foreign Spouses’ Boys & Girls in Compulsory Education (Categorized by Local Areas and Genders).....	90
Table 3.4.1 Pupils achieving 5 or more A*-C at GCSE/GNVQ: by sex and ethnic group, 2004, England	124
Table 3.4.2 Issues and controversies in the Swann Report: a model	136

List of Figures

Figure 2.2.1 Research Process Affecting Social Problems	18
Figure 2.4.1 Interview Sampling Procedure	49
Figure 3.2.1 Developmental model of intercultural sensitivity	73.133.209
Figure 3.4.1 Mullard's model	135
Figure 4.1.1 PLASC 2002 characteristics: Proportion achieving 5+ A*-C GCSEs for those entered for GCSEs in Maintained Schools in 2002	160
Figure 4.1.2 Risk level with the number of disadvantage factors (Daniels, 2008)....	172
Figure 4.2.1 The Agenda-Setting Process Rogers, Dearing, and Chang's (1991)..	190
Figure 5.2.1 Taipei County Happy New Inhabitants Quarterly	242
Figure 5.2.2 Approaches to multicultural curriculum reform (Banks, 1993)	248