The Role of Education in National Reconstruction
and Reconciliation in Zimbabwe

Submitted by Philip Bhebhe to the
University of Exeter
as a thesis for the degree of PhD
in July 2011.

This thesis is available for Library use on the understanding that it is copyright material and
that no quotation from the thesis may be published without proper acknowledgement.

I certify that all material in this thesis which is not my own work has been identified and
that no material has previously been submitted and approved for the award of a degree by this
or any other University.

Signature: __________________________
Table of Contents

Lists of Tables and Figures

Acknowledgements

Abbreviations

Abstract

Prologue

1. Introduction, Orientation and Research Questions
   1.1 Introduction
   1.2 Background of the researcher
   1.3 Choosing this research topic
   1.4 Motivation to carry out the research and its overall orientation
   1.5 Research Questions

2. Context and Literature Review
   2.1 Context
   2.2 Socio-economic and political profile
   2.3 Zimbabwe politics since Independence to 2008
      2.3.1 Overview: descent into lawlessness
      2.3.2 Robert Mugabe and the 5th Brigade, 1983-1987
      2.3.3 Mugabe’s rule of terror, 1987-2008
   2.4 Contexts for understanding education in Zimbabwe
   2.5. Education Provision in Zimbabwe since 1980
      2.5.1 The first independence decade
      2.5.2 Education provision in Zimbabwe, 1990-2008

3. Methodology and research design
   3.1 Introduction
   3.2 Methodology
      3.2.1 General considerations
      3.2.2 Selecting a Theoretical Framework for the Research
      3.2.3 The Management of Data
      3.2.4 Organising and presenting data analysis
   3.3 Research design and methods
      3.3.1 The initial questionnaire
      3.3.2 Interviews
      3.3.3 Sampling
      3.3.4 Access, the overall chronology of the fieldwork and the nature of conditions in the field
   3.4 Limitations of the research design and interview method
### 4. Ethical Considerations

- **4.1 Introduction**
- **4.2 Informed Consent**
- **4.3 Deception, access and acceptance**
- **4.4 Sources of tension**
- **4.5 Ethics of social research**
- **4.6 Specific ethical dilemmas**
  - **4.6.1 Informed consent revisited**
  - **4.6.2 Researcher as exploiter**
  - **4.6.3 Researcher as intervenor/reformer**
  - **4.6.4 Researcher as advocate**
  - **4.6.5 Researcher as friend**
  - **4.6.8 Reciprocity**
- **4.7 Final reflections on research ethics**

### 5. Findings

- **5.1 Education in a country in crisis: the context for fieldwork in Zimbabwe, 2008-2010**
- **5.2 The role of education in Zimbabwean reconstruction and reconciliation: views from the field of comparative perspective**
  - **5.2.1 Education in Zimbabwe: the absence of universal values**
  - **5.2.2 The politics of access and equality**
  - **5.2.3 Higher education and the brain drain**
  - **5.2.4 Purging the teaching force of those whose political involvement would make them unsuitable for any role in the reconstruction process**
  - **5.2.5 A new workforce: teacher education and preparation**
  - **5.2.6 Curriculum**
    - Curriculum and conflict
    - Language teaching
    - History and Geography
    - Environmental Education
  - **5.2.7 Learning resources and textbooks for traumatized children**
  - **5.2.8 Education for peaceful co-existence and tolerance**
- **5.3 Prospects for reconstruction and reconciliation through education in Zimbabwe: key considerations**
  - **5.3.1 Education and conflict as an emerging field of study**
  - **5.3.2 The need for 'conflict-sensitive' education systems**
  - **5.3.3 Education systems in the aftermath of conflict: reconstruction through openness**
  - **5.3.4 Education as reconciliation and peace-building**
  - **5.3.5 Learning from the South African Truth and Reconciliation Commission**
  - **5.3.6 Curriculum renewal in crisis-torn countries**
  - **5.3.7 Appreciating the complexity of change**
  - **5.3.8 Why plans for implementing change can fail**
6. Conclusions 256

6.1 Education for Reconciliation and Education for Reconstruction 256
   6.1.1 Physical Reconstruction
   6.1.2 Ideological Reconstruction
   6.1.3 Psychological Reconstruction
   6.1.4 Human Resources Reconstruction

6.2 Learning for the Zimbabwean case: globally applicable lessons 265
   6.2.1 Attending to stereotyping
   6.2.2 Attending to historic divides
   6.2.3 The words we use
   6.2.4 Making poverty history
   6.2.5 A National Unity and Reconciliation Commission
   6.2.6 ‘Culture’, reconciliation and collective memory

6.3 Education for peaceful co-existence and tolerance -a universal viewpoint 281

Epilogue 289

References 292

Appendix A
Managing raw data: creating contextual categories and undertaking thematic analysis of fieldwork data. 333

Appendix B
Preliminary postal questionnaire (2008) 337

Appendix C
Example of the field-based semi-structured interview schedule (2008-2010) 338
List of Tables and Figures

Table 3.1
The interview respondent sample – by gender, province, political party and occupation (face to face and telephone interviewees). 113

Figure 3.1
The Inter-relationship between the Building Blocks of Research. 71

Figure 4.1
The costs/benefits ratio. 124

Figure 4.2
Guidelines for reasonably informed consent. 127
Acknowledgements

Many thanks to my family for their love, encouragement and support, particularly to my daughter Carol for her practical help. Maggie Harmon also provided important practical assistance for which I am very grateful.

I also owe a debt of gratitude to Dr Jack Priestley for his support from its initial stages to the end of this project, as well as to my first supervisor Professor William Richardson for his excellent work without which I would not have completed both this programme and my Master of Science in Educational Research. I am grateful for his professional approach to supervision, constructive criticism, advice and practical assistance as well as his inspiration and friendship during the writing of this thesis.

I would like to express my sincere appreciation for the enthusiasm, openness and bravery of those people of Zimbabwe who participated in this study without whom it could not have succeeded. My regret is that, for ethical reasons, I cannot name the brave souls who risked so much to tell me their stories. They came from all ethnic groups and all sides of the political spectrum, from the media fraternity, industry, agriculture, education, health, the War Veterans' Association, the Central Intelligence Organization and the feared Zimbabwean Secret Police. Many had fallen victim to the violence that had consumed their country for almost thirty years, while others had themselves been torturers and even murders. No doubt each as a long journey ahead in their quest to find some meaning in all that they have been through.

Many of my colleagues and students over the years will, I hope recognise something of their own contribution to this study. There been many people who have supported and inspired me in various ways over a long period. Perhaps the most important of these were Rev L. M. Bhebhe for his work on conflict and conflict resolution and Rev Peter Ngwenya for his work
on equality. I owe a great deal to both of them. Needless to say, while they have inspired work which has contributed to this study, I am solely responsible for its contents.

To my sponsors, All Saints Educational Trust and, particularly, Stephen Harrow, the clerk to the Trust, I express my sincere thanks. This study programme would not have been started without your financial support.

Finally, I must single out my wife Nyengeterai (pray) and my son Harris (house ruler) and his wife Thandeka (lovable) for their love and support, which I can partially repay by dedicating this work to them.
### Abbreviations

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Abbreviation</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ANC</td>
<td>African National Congress</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AU</td>
<td>African Union</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CSO</td>
<td>Central Statistical Office</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DFID</td>
<td>Department for International Development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EFA</td>
<td>Education for all</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ESAP</td>
<td>Economic Structural Adjustment Programme</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EU</td>
<td>European Union</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Frelimo</td>
<td>Front for the Liberation of Mozambique</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FTLRP</td>
<td>Fast Track Land Reform Programme</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GDP</td>
<td>Gross Domestic Product</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GNU</td>
<td>Government of National Unity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GPA</td>
<td>Global Political Agreement</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ICC</td>
<td>International Criminal Court</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IDPs</td>
<td>Internally Displaced Persons</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IG</td>
<td>Inclusive Government</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>INEE</td>
<td>Inter-Agency Network on Education in Emergencies</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IMF</td>
<td>International Monetary Fund</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>INGO</td>
<td>International Non-Governmental Organisation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>JOC</td>
<td>Joint Operations Command</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LCHR</td>
<td>Lawyers Committee for Human Rights</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MDC</td>
<td>Movement for Democratic Change</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MDC-M</td>
<td>Movement for Democratic Change - Mutambara</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MDC-T</td>
<td>Movement for Democratic Change - Tsvangirai</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MED</td>
<td>Ministry of Education and Culture</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MDG</td>
<td>Millennium Development Goals</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MNR</td>
<td>Mozambique National Resistance</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NGO</td>
<td>Non-Governmental Organisation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PFZAPU</td>
<td>Patriot Front Zimbabwe African People's Union</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Renamo</td>
<td>Mozambique National Resistance</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RPA</td>
<td>Rwandan Patriot Army</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RPF</td>
<td>Rwandan Patriotic Front</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SADC</td>
<td>Southern African Development Community</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SDF</td>
<td>Social Development Fund</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TEMPUS</td>
<td>Trans-European Mobility Scheme for University Studies</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TDP</td>
<td>Transitional Development Plan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TRC</td>
<td>Truth and Reconciliation Commission</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UNESCO</td>
<td>United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UK</td>
<td>United Kingdom</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UN</td>
<td>United Nations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UNHCR</td>
<td>United Nations High Commission for Refugees</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UNICEF</td>
<td>United Nations Children's Fund</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>USAID</td>
<td>United States Agency for International Development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ZANLA</td>
<td>Zimbabwe African National Liberation Army</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ZANU</td>
<td>Zimbabwe African National Union</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ZANU (PF)</td>
<td>Zimbabwe African National Union (Patriotic Front)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ZAPU</td>
<td>Zimbabwe African People's Union</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ZINTEC</td>
<td>Zimbabwe Integrated National Teacher Education Course.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ZIPRA</td>
<td>Zimbabwe People's Revolutionary Army</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ZTV</td>
<td>Zimbabwe Television</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Abstract

This study is a contribution to the growing literature on the subject of the role of education in national reconstruction and reconciliation in countries that have experienced conflict and severe dislocation. It takes as its focus the case of Zimbabwe during the period 1980-2010 but related to experiences of conflict in countries such as Angola, Liberia, Mozambique, Sierra Leone, Somalia, the Sudan and Rwanda in Africa and, elsewhere, in Bosnia, Iraq, Israel, Palestine, Lebanon and Northern Ireland. The field is a relatively young, dynamic and immensely complex area of study and interpretation.

The origins of my interest in this topic are as a witness to the spiral of decline and subsequent political violence in Zimbabwe since its independence in April 1980 during my tenure as, successively, Head teacher, Lecturer, Administrator, College Principal and Regional Director in the country between 1980 and 2005, and research work undertaken by me in Botswana, Zambia and Zimbabwe during these years.

Chapter One provides an introduction to this personal and national context. In Chapter Two there is a detailed account of Zimbabwean politics and educational provision between Independence and the onset of the fieldwork in 2008. This comprises mainly a documentary literature review but where respondents in my subsequent fieldwork placed on record important episodes in relation to these parallel narratives, such accounts are included here.

Chapter Three describes the design considerations that underpinned the empirical aspects of the project. Three separate field visits were made to Zimbabwe, in June to July, 2008, April to May 2009 and December 2009 to January 2010. In total the respondent sample comprised
encounters with 200 individuals in the field (through interviews and via participant and non-participant observation), supplemented by 90 semi-structured telephone interviews undertaken from the UK. In addition, at the commencement of fieldwork 41 postal questionnaires were administered in order to frame the main themes to be examined and to reach respondents in 'no go' areas and overseas (details are in section 3.3).

As fieldwork conditions were, at times, extremely difficult and dangerous (especially in 2008) data collection procedures often had to be improvised and there were many difficult ethical decisions to be made about responsible forms of field research in such circumstances. These procedures and considerations are set out in detail in sections 3.3.4 and 3.4 and in Chapter Four.

Chapter Five presents the findings of the empirical part of the project in the context of a wider scholarly literature. Eight key themes are identified from the Zimbabwean empirical data (section 5.2) and these are related to eight broad principles identified in the wider international literature (section 5.3).

In Chapter Six conclusions are drawn, including the specific insights that can be derived from the Zimbabwean case.