

The Role of Education in National Reconstruction and Reconciliation in Zimbabwe

**Submitted by Philip Bhebhe to the
University of Exeter
as a thesis for the degree of PhD
in July 2011.**

This thesis is available for Library use on the understanding that it is copyright material and that no quotation from the thesis may be published without proper acknowledgement.

I certify that all material in this thesis which is not my own work has been identified and that no material has previously been submitted and approved for the award of a degree by this or any other University.

Signature:



Table of Contents

Lists of Tables and Figures

Acknowledgements

Abbreviations

Abstract

Prologue	1
1. Introduction, Orientation and Research Questions	4
1.1 Introduction	4
1.2 Background of the researcher	8
1.3 Choosing this research topic	10
1.4 Motivation to carry out the research and its overall orientation	13
1.5 Research Questions	14
2. Context and Literature Review	18
2.1 Context	18
2.2 Socio-economic and political profile	20
2.3 Zimbabwe politics since Independence to 2008	30
2.3.1 <i>Overview: descent into lawlessness</i>	
2.3.2 <i>Robert Mugabe and the 5th Brigade, 1983-1987</i>	
2.3.3 <i>Mugabe's rule of terror, 1987-2008</i>	
2.4 Contexts for understanding education in Zimbabwe	53
2.5. Education Provision in Zimbabwe since 1980	58
2.5.1 <i>The first independence decade</i>	
2.5.2 <i>Education provision in Zimbabwe, 1990-2008</i>	
3. Methodology and research design	70
3.1 Introduction	70
3.2 Methodology	73
3.2.1 <i>General considerations</i>	
3.2.2 <i>Selecting a Theoretical Framework for the Research</i>	
3.2.3 <i>The Management of Data</i>	
3.2.4 <i>Organising and presenting data analysis</i>	
3.3 Research design and methods	98
3.3.1 <i>The initial questionnaire</i>	
3.3.2 <i>Interviews</i>	
3.3.3 <i>Sampling</i>	
3.3.4 <i>Access, the overall chronology of the fieldwork and the nature of conditions in the field</i>	
3.4 Limitations of the research design and interview method	121

4.	Ethical Considerations	123
4.1	Introduction	123
4.2	Informed Consent	125
4.3	Deception, access and acceptance	131
4.4	Sources of tension	133
4.5	Ethics of social research	135
4.6	Specific ethical dilemmas	138
	4.6.1 <i>Informed consent revisited</i>	
	4.6.2 <i>Researcher as exploiter</i>	
	4.6.3 <i>Researcher as intervener/reformer</i>	
	4.6.4 <i>Researcher as advocate</i>	
	4.6.5 <i>Researcher as friend</i>	
	4.6.8 <i>Reciprocity</i>	
4.7	Final reflections on research ethics	159
5.	Findings	161
5.1	Education in a country in crisis: the context for fieldwork in Zimbabwe, 2008-2010	161
5.2	The role of education in Zimbabwean reconstruction and reconciliation: views from the field of comparative perspective	168
	5.2.1 <i>Education in Zimbabwe: the absence of universal values</i>	
	5.2.2 <i>The politics of access and equality</i>	
	5.2.3 <i>Higher education and the brain drain</i>	
	5.2.4 <i>Purging the teaching force of those whose political involvement would make them unsuitable for any role in the reconstruction process</i>	
	5.2.5 <i>A new workforce: teacher education and preparation</i>	
	5.2.6 <i>Curriculum</i>	
	Curriculum and conflict	
	Language teaching	
	History and Geography	
	Environmental Education	
	5.2.7 <i>Learning resources and textbooks for traumatized children</i>	
	5.2.8 <i>Education for peaceful co-existence and tolerance</i>	
5.3	Prospects for reconstruction and reconciliation through education in Zimbabwe: key considerations	219
	5.3.1 <i>Education and conflict as an emerging field of study</i>	
	5.3.2 <i>The need for 'conflict-sensitive' education systems</i>	
	5.3.3 <i>Education systems in the aftermath of conflict: reconstruction through openness</i>	
	5.3.4 <i>Education as reconciliation and peace-building</i>	
	5.3.5 <i>Learning from the South African Truth and Reconciliation Commission</i>	
	5.3.6 <i>Curriculum renewal in crisis-torn countries</i>	
	5.3.7 <i>Appreciating the complexity of change</i>	
	5.3.8 <i>Why plans for implementing change can fail</i>	

6. Conclusions	256
6.1 Education for Reconciliation and Education for Reconstruction	256
6.1.1 <i>Physical Reconstruction</i>	
6.1.2 <i>Ideological Reconstruction</i>	
6.1.3 <i>Psychological Reconstruction</i>	
6.1.4 <i>Human Resources Reconstruction</i>	
6.2 Learning for the Zimbabwean case: globally applicable lessons	265
6.2.1 <i>Attending to stereotyping</i>	
6.2.2 <i>Attending to historic divides</i>	
6.2.3 <i>The words we use</i>	
6.2.4 <i>Making poverty history</i>	
6.2.5 <i>A National Unity and Reconciliation Commission</i>	
6.2.6 <i>'Culture', reconciliation and collective memory</i>	
6.3. Education for peaceful co-existence and tolerance -a universal viewpoint	281
Epilogue	289
References	292
Appendix A Managing raw data: creating contextual categories and undertaking thematic analysis of fieldwork data.	333
Appendix B Preliminary postal questionnaire (2008)	337
Appendix C Example of the field-based semi-structured interview schedule (2008-2010)	338

List of Tables and Figures

Table 3.1

The interview respondent sample – by gender, province, political party and occupation (face to face and telephone interviewees). 113

Figure 3.1

The Inter-relationship between the Building Blocks of Research. 71

Figure 4.1

The costs/benefits ratio. 124

Figure 4.2

Guidelines for reasonably informed consent. 127

Acknowledgements

Many thanks to my family for their love, encouragement and support, particularly to my daughter Carol for her practical help. Maggie Harmon also provided important practical assistance for which I am very grateful.

I also owe a debt of gratitude to Dr Jack Priestley for his support from its initial stages to the end of this project, as well as to my first supervisor Professor William Richardson for his excellent work without which I would not have completed both this programme and my Master of Science in Educational Research. I am grateful for his professional approach to supervision, constructive criticism, advice and practical assistance as well as his inspiration and friendship during the writing of this thesis.

I would like to express my sincere appreciation for the enthusiasm, openness and bravery of those people of Zimbabwe who participated in this study without whom it could not have succeeded. My regret is that, for ethical reasons, I cannot name the brave souls who risked so much to tell me their stories. They came from all ethnic groups and all sides of the political spectrum, from the media fraternity, industry, agriculture, education, health, the War Veterans' Association, the Central Intelligence Organization and the feared Zimbabwean Secret Police. Many had fallen victim to the violence that had consumed their country for almost thirty years, while others had themselves been torturers and even murders. No doubt each as a long journey ahead in their quest to find some meaning in all that they have been through.

Many of my colleagues and students over the years will, I hope recognise something of their own contribution to this study. There been many people who have supported and inspired me in various ways over a long period. Perhaps the most important of these were Rev L. M. Bhebhe for his work on conflict and conflict resolution and Rev Peter Ngwenya for his work

on equality. I owe a great deal to both of them. Needless to say, while they have inspired work which has contributed to this study, I am solely responsible for its contents.

To my sponsors, All Saints Educational Trust and, particularly, Stephen Harrow, the clerk to the Trust, I express my sincere thanks. This study programme would not have been started without your financial support.

Finally, I must single out my wife Nyengeterai (pray) and my son Harris (house ruler) and his wife Thandeka (lovable) for their love and support, which I can partially repay by dedicating this work to them.

Abbreviations

ANC	African National Congress
AU	African Union
CSO	Central Statistical Office
DFID	Department for International Development
EFA	Education for all
ESAP	Economic Structural Adjustment Programme
EU	European Union
Frelimo	Front for the Liberation of Mozambique
FTLRP	Fast Track Land Reform Programme
GDP	Gross Domestic Product
GNU	Government of National Unity
GPA	Global Political Agreement
ICC	International Criminal Court
IDPs	Internally Displaced Persons
IG	Inclusive Government
INEE	Inter-Agency Network on Education in Emergencies
IMF	International Monetary Fund
INGO	International Non-Governmental Organisation
JOC	Joint Operations Command
LCHR	Lawyers Committee for Human Rights
MDC	Movement for Democratic Change
MDC-M	Movement for Democratic Change - Mutambara
MDC-T	Movement for Democratic Change - Tsvangirai
MED	Ministry of Education and Culture
MDG	Millennium Development Goals
MNR	Mozambique National Resistance
NGO	Non-Governmental Organisation
PFZAPU	Patriot Front Zimbabwe African People's Union
Renamo	Mozambique National Resistance
RPA	Rwandan Patriot Army
RPF	Rwandan Patriotic Front
SADC	Southern African Development Community
SDF	Social Development Fund
TEMPUS	Trans-European Mobility Scheme for University Studies
TDP	Transitional Development Plan
TRC	Truth and Reconciliation Commission
UNESCO	United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization
UK	United Kingdom
UN	United Nations
UNHCR	United Nations High Commission for Refugees
UNICEF	United Nations Children's Fund
USAID	United States Agency for International Development
ZANLA	Zimbabwe African National Liberation Army
ZANU	Zimbabwe African National Union
ZANU (PF)	Zimbabwe African National Union (Patriotic Front)
ZAPU	Zimbabwe African People's Union
ZINTEC	Zimbabwe Integrated National Teacher Education Course.
ZIPRA	Zimbabwe People's Revolutionary Army
ZTV	Zimbabwe Television

Abstract

This study is a contribution to the growing literature on the subject of the role of education in national reconstruction and reconciliation in countries that have experienced conflict and severe dislocation. It takes as its focus the case of Zimbabwe during the period 1980-2010 but related to experiences of conflict in countries such as Angola, Liberia, Mozambique, Sierra Leone, Somalia, the Sudan and Rwanda in Africa and, elsewhere, in Bosnia, Iraq, Israel, Palestine, Lebanon and Northern Ireland. The field is a relatively young, dynamic and immensely complex area of study and interpretation.

The origins of my interest in this topic are as a witness to the spiral of decline and subsequent political violence in Zimbabwe since its independence in April 1980 during my tenure as, successively, Head teacher, Lecturer, Administrator, College Principal and Regional Director in the country between 1980 and 2005, and research work undertaken by me in Botswana, Zambia and Zimbabwe during these years.

Chapter One provides an introduction to this personal and national context. In Chapter Two there is a detailed account of Zimbabwean politics and educational provision between Independence and the onset of the fieldwork in 2008. This comprises mainly a documentary literature review but where respondents in my subsequent fieldwork placed on record important episodes in relation to these parallel narratives, such accounts are included here.

Chapter Three describes the design considerations that underpinned the empirical aspects of the project. Three separate field visits were made to Zimbabwe, in June to July, 2008, April to May 2009 and December 2009 to January 2010. In total the respondent sample comprised

encounters with 200 individuals in the field (through interviews and *via* participant and non-participant observation), supplemented by 90 semi-structured telephone interviews undertaken from the UK. In addition, at the commencement of fieldwork 41 postal questionnaires were administered in order to frame the main themes to be examined and to reach respondents in 'no go' areas and overseas (details are in section 3.3).

As fieldwork conditions were, at times, extremely difficult and dangerous (especially in 2008) data collection procedures often had to be improvised and there were many difficult ethical decisions to be made about responsible forms of field research in such circumstances. These procedures and considerations are set in out detail in sections 3.3.4 and 3.4 and in Chapter Four.

Chapter Five presents the findings of the empirical part of the project in the context of a wider scholarly literature. Eight key themes are identified from the Zimbabwean empirical: 1 data (section 5.2) and these are related to eight broad principles identified in the wider international literature (section 5.3).

In Chapter Six conclusions are drawn, including the specific insights that can be derived from the Zimbabwean case.