

A Critical Assessment of Ages Derived Using Pre-Main-Sequence Isochrones in Colour-Magnitude Diagrams

Cameron Pearce MacDonald Bell

Submitted by Cameron Pearce MacDonald Bell to the University of Exeter as a thesis for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy in Physics in September 2012.

This thesis is available for Library use on the understanding that it is copyright material and that no quotation from the thesis may be published without proper acknowledgement.

I certify that all material in this thesis which is not my own work has been identified and that no material has previously been submitted and approved for the award of a degree by this or any other University.

Signed:

Cameron P. M. Bell

Date:



Abstract

In this thesis a critical assessment of the ages derived using theoretical pre-main-sequence (pre-MS) stellar evolutionary models is presented by comparing the predictions to the low-mass pre-MS population of 14 young star-forming regions (SFRs) in colour-magnitude diagrams (CMDs).

Deriving pre-MS ages requires precise distances and estimates of the reddening. Therefore, the main-sequence (MS) members of the SFRs have been used to derive a self-consistent set of statistically robust ages, distances and reddenings with associated uncertainties using a maximum-likelihood fitting statistic and MS evolutionary models. A photometric method (known as the Q-method) for de-reddening individual stars in regions where the extinction is spatially variable has been updated and is presented. The effects of both the model dependency and the SFR composition on these derived parameters are also discussed.

The problem of calibrating photometric observations of red pre-MS stars is examined and it is shown that using observations of MS stars to transform the data into a standard photometric system can introduce significant errors in the position of the pre-MS locus in CMD space. Hence, it is crucial that precise photometric studies (especially of pre-MS objects) be carried out in the natural photometric system of the observations. This therefore requires a robust model of the system responses for the instrument used, and thus the calculated responses for the Wide-Field Camera on the *Isaac Newton* Telescope are presented. These system responses have been tested using standard star observations and have been shown to be a good representation of the photometric system.

A benchmark test for the pre-MS evolutionary models is performed by comparing them to a set of well-calibrated CMDs of the Pleiades in the wavelength regime $0.4\text{--}2.5\ \mu\text{m}$. The masses predicted by these models are also tested against dynamical masses using a sample of MS binaries by calculating the system magnitude in a given photometric band-pass. This analysis shows that for $T_{\text{eff}} \lesssim 4000\ \text{K}$ the models systematically overestimate the flux by a factor of 2 at $0.5\ \mu\text{m}$, though this decreases with wavelength, becoming negligible at $2.2\ \mu\text{m}$. Thus before the pre-MS models are used to derive ages, a recalibration of the models is performed by incorporating an empirical colour- T_{eff} relation and bolometric corrections based on the K_s -band luminosity of Pleiades members, with theoretical corrections for the dependence on the surface gravity ($\log g$).

The recalibrated pre-MS model isochrones are used to derive ages from the pre-MS populations of the SFRs. These ages are then compared with the MS derivations, thus providing a powerful diagnostic tool with which to discriminate between the different pre-MS age scales that arise from a much stronger model dependency in the pre-MS regime. The revised ages assigned to each of the 14 SFRs are up to a factor two older than previous derivations, a result with wide-ranging implications, including that circumstellar discs survive longer and that the average Class II lifetime is greater than currently believed.

Contents

1	Introduction	13
1.1	Historical Prelude	13
1.2	An Overview of Low-Mass Star Formation	14
1.2.1	The Interstellar Medium and Molecular Clouds	15
1.2.2	Models of Star Formation	16
1.2.3	From Pre-Stellar Cores to Stars	19
1.2.4	Rotational Evolution	26
1.2.5	Circumstellar Discs and Magnetospheric Accretion	30
1.3	Comparing Theory and Observations	34
1.3.1	OB Associations	34
1.3.2	Hertzsprung-Russell Diagram	35
1.3.3	Pre-Main-Sequence Evolution in the Hertzsprung-Russell Diagram	37
1.3.4	The Colour-Magnitude Diagram	40
1.4	Identifying Low-Mass Pre-Main-Sequence Stars	42
1.4.1	Infrared Excess	43
1.4.2	X-ray Emission	43
1.4.3	Lithium Absorption	44
1.4.4	H α Emission	46
1.4.5	Photometric Variability	46
1.4.6	Kinematic Methods	48
1.5	Summary	49
2	Fitting the Main-Sequence Population of Young Star-Forming Regions	51
2.1	Motivation	51
2.2	Sample of Young Star-Forming Regions	52
2.2.1	Cep OB3b	53
2.2.2	χ Per	53
2.2.3	IC 348	54
2.2.4	IC 5146	55
2.2.5	λ Ori	55
2.2.6	NGC 1960	56
2.2.7	NGC 2169	56

2.2.8	NGC 2244	56
2.2.9	NGC 2362	57
2.2.10	NGC 6530	58
2.2.11	NGC 6611	58
2.2.12	NGC 7160	59
2.2.13	Orion Nebula Cluster	59
2.2.14	σ Ori	60
2.3	Deriving Parameters from Main-Sequence Fitting	61
2.3.1	Distance Fitting	61
2.3.2	Interstellar Extinction and Reddening	63
2.3.3	Main-Sequence Ages	64
2.4	Main-Sequence Data	65
2.5	Main-Sequence Models	65
2.5.1	Creating the Bolometric Correction Relation	66
2.5.2	Atmospheric Models	68
2.6	A Maximum-Likelihood Fitting Statistic	70
2.6.1	Definition of the τ^2 Fitting Statistic	70
2.6.2	Limiting Cases	71
2.6.3	The Model Colour-Magnitude Diagram	72
2.7	Reddening and Extinction for <i>UBV</i> data	73
2.7.1	Colour and Extinction Dependent Reddening Vectors	73
2.7.2	Q-Method	75
2.7.3	Revised Q-Method	76
2.8	Fitting the Data	79
2.8.1	Isolating the Main-Sequence	79
2.8.2	Example 1: NGC 1960 - Uniform Reddening	80
2.8.3	Example 2: λ Ori - Variable Reddening	82
2.8.4	Results	83
2.9	Discussion	102
2.9.1	Derived Ages	102
2.9.2	Derived Distances	106
2.10	Model Dependency of Main-Sequence Ages	115
2.10.1	Effects of Updated Physical Inputs and Stellar Rotation	115
2.10.2	Effects of Different Main-Sequence Interior Models	116
2.10.3	Effects of Assuming Local Thermodynamic Equilibrium in Massive Stars	117
2.10.4	Summary	118
2.11	Effects of Assuming a Fixed Metallicity for Different Star-Forming Regions	119
2.12	Summary	119

3	Characterisation and Calibration of the <i>Isaac Newton</i> Telescope Wide-Field Camera Photometric System	122
3.1	Motivation	122
3.2	Observations	123
3.2.1	Zero-Point Stability	124
3.3	Data Reduction	124
3.4	Photometric Calibration	129
3.4.1	Creating INT-WFC System Responses	129
3.4.2	Comparing the SDSS and the INT-WFC System Responses	132
3.4.3	Transforming the Data into the Standard SDSS System	134
3.4.4	Traditional Photometric Calibration	138
3.4.5	Calibrating the Natural INT-WFC System	139
3.4.6	Testing the Calculated INT-WFC System Responses	139
3.4.7	Photometric Calibration Using the Transformations	142
3.5	Summary	145
4	A Benchmark Test for Pre-Main-Sequence Isochrones	147
4.1	Motivation	147
4.2	Pre-Main-Sequence Models	149
4.2.1	Input Physics of the Interior Models	149
4.2.2	Comparison of Pre-Main-Sequence Models	151
4.3	Comparing the Models and the Data – I. The Pleiades	153
4.3.1	The Pleiades Catalogue	155
4.3.2	Model Parameters	155
4.3.3	Discussion	156
4.4	Comparing the Models and the Data – II. Main-Sequence Binaries	156
4.4.1	The Sample	158
4.4.2	The Models	162
4.4.3	Discussion	162
4.5	Quantifying the Discrepancy	165
4.6	Summary	168
5	Fitting the Pre-Main-Sequence Population of Young Star-Forming Regions	169
5.1	Motivation	169
5.2	Observations and Data Reduction	170
5.3	Isolating the Pre-Main-Sequence	171
5.3.1	Literature Memberships	171
5.3.2	Isolating the Pre-Main-Sequence Without Literature Memberships	178
5.4	A Semi-Empirical BC- T_{eff} Relation	180
5.4.1	The Jeffries et al. Empirical Recalibration	180
5.4.2	A Revised Semi-Empirical Recalibration	181

5.5	Reddening and Extinction for Pre-Main-Sequence Stars	182
5.6	Fitting the Data	185
5.6.1	A Model for Dealing with Possible Non-Member Contamination . .	186
5.6.2	Pre-Main-Sequence Ages Derived using τ^2	188
5.6.3	Nominal Pre-Main-Sequence Ages	195
5.7	Summary	203
6	The Revised Pre-Main-Sequence Age Scale	205
6.1	Motivation	205
6.2	Comparing the Main-Sequence and Pre-Main-Sequence Ages	206
6.3	Final Assigned Pre-Main-Sequence Ages	208
6.3.1	Comparison with Literature Ages	210
6.4	Closing Words on Pre-Main-Sequence Isochrones	215
6.5	Implications of the Revised Pre-Main-Sequence Age Scale	216
6.5.1	Circumstellar Disc Lifetimes	216
6.5.2	Evolutionary Lifetimes of Young Stellar Objects	219
6.6	Summary	219
7	Conclusions and Future Work	221
7.1	Conclusions	221
7.2	Future work	223
7.2.1	Consistent Ages and Investigating Environmental Effects	223
7.2.2	Long-Term Calibration of Pre-Main-Sequence Evolutionary Models .	224
	Bibliography	226
A	Photometric Observations: Exposure Times	262
B	Pleiades Single-Star Sequence	267

List of Figures

1.1	Schematic evolution of a protostar	20
1.2	Schematic evolution of protostar SEDs	22
1.3	Idealised representation of the magnetic field structure of a CTTS	24
1.4	Rotation periods as a function of stellar mass in young open clusters	28
1.5	Hertzsprung-Russell diagram	36
1.6	Hertzsprung-Russell diagram with pre-MS evolutionary tracks and isochrones	38
1.7	$V, (V - I_c)$ CMD of the σ Ori association	43
1.8	Equivalent width of Li I against radial velocity	45
2.1	MS distance fitting for the Praesepe open cluster	62
2.2	Interstellar extinction curves for the Milky Way	63
2.3	Difference between nominal and measured $E(B - V)$	74
2.4	Difference between the original and revised Q-methods	77
2.5	Effect of age on MS isochrones in the $U - B, B - V$ colour-colour diagram	78
2.6	Best-fitting $U - B, B - V$ colour-colour diagram for NGC 1960	80
2.7	Best-fitting $V, B - V$ CMD for NGC 1960	81
2.8	Age-distance τ^2 grid for NGC 1960	82
2.9	Application of the revised Q-method for λ Ori	83
2.10	Best-fitting $V_o, (B - V)_o$ CMD for λ Ori	84
2.11	Age-distance τ^2 grid for λ Ori	85
2.12	Application of the revised Q-method for Cep OB3b	86
2.13	Best-fitting $V_o, (B - V)_o$ CMD for Cep OB3b	87
2.14	Application of the revised Q-method for χ Per	88
2.15	Best-fitting $V_o, (B - V)_o$ CMD for χ Per	89
2.16	Application of the revised Q-method for IC 348	90
2.17	Application of the revised Q-method for IC 5146	91
2.18	Best-fitting $U - B, B - V$ colour-colour diagram for NGC 2169	92
2.19	Best-fitting $V, B - V$ CMD for NGC 2169	93
2.20	Application of the revised Q-method for NGC 2244	94
2.21	Best-fitting $V_o, (B - V)_o$ CMD for NGC 2244	95
2.22	Best-fitting $U - B, B - V$ colour-colour diagram for NGC 2362	96
2.23	Best-fitting $V, B - V$ CMD for NGC 2362	97

2.24	Application of the revised Q-method for NGC 6530	98
2.25	Best-fitting $V_o, (B - V)_o$ CMD for NGC 6530	99
2.26	Application of the revised Q-method for NGC 6611	100
2.27	Best-fitting $V_o, (B - V)_o$ CMD for NGC 6611	101
2.28	Application of the revised Q-method for NGC 7160	102
2.29	Best-fitting $V_o, (B - V)_o$ CMD for NGC 7160	103
2.30	Best-fitting $U - B, B - V$ colour-colour diagram for stars in the vicinity of the ONC	104
2.31	Best-fitting $V, B - V$ CMD for stars in the vicinity of the ONC	105
2.32	Application of the revised Q-method for σ Ori	106
2.33	Best-fitting $V_o, (B - V)_o$ CMD for σ Ori	107
2.34	Application of the revised Q-method for the Pleiades	108
2.35	Best-fitting $V_o, (B - V)_o$ CMD for the Pleiades	109
2.36	Effect of atmospheric models on transforming the interior models	110
3.1	Stability of g_{WFC} -band zero-point as a function of time	125
3.2	Linearity curves for the INT-WFC four EEV CCDs	126
3.3	La Palma atmospheric extinction curve	130
3.4	Atmospheric absorption bands as modelled using an F8 star	130
3.5	Combined aluminium and MgF_2 coating reflectance spectrum	131
3.6	Normalised SDSS $ugriz$ and INT-WFC $(Ugriz)_{\text{WFC}}$ system responses . . .	132
3.7	Theoretical transformations between the SDSS and INT-WFC photometric systems	135
3.8	SDSS Stripe 82 standard star $u - g, g - i$ colour-colour diagram	140
3.9	SDSS Stripe 82 standard star $r - i, g - i$ colour-colour diagram	140
3.10	SDSS Stripe 82 standard star $r - i, i - z$ colour-colour diagram	141
3.11	Magnitude difference in the U_{WFC} -band between the WFC_{calc} and WFC_{obs} photometric catalogues	143
3.12	Magnitude difference in the g_{WFC} -band between the WFC_{calc} and WFC_{obs} photometric catalogues	143
3.13	Magnitude difference in the r_{WFC} -band between the WFC_{calc} and WFC_{obs} photometric catalogues	144
3.14	Magnitude difference in the i_{WFC} -band between the WFC_{calc} and WFC_{obs} photometric catalogues	144
3.15	Magnitude difference in the Z_{WFC} -band between the WFC_{calc} and WFC_{obs} photometric catalogues	145
4.1	Pre-MS evolutionary tracks for masses of 0.1, 0.5 and $1.0 M_{\odot}$	152
4.2	Pre-MS isochrones at an age of 4.6 Gyr	152
4.3	Two square degree three-colour mosaic image of the Pleiades	154
4.4	Optical/near-IR CMDs of the Pleiades	157

4.5	Difference between the observed and calculated system absolute magnitude as a function of the primary component mass	163
4.6	Difference between the observed and calculated system absolute magnitude as a function of the physical separation between components	164
4.7	Model dependent ΔBC corrections as a function of T_{eff} in the INT-WFC $(griZ)_{\text{WFC}}$ and 2MASS JH bandpasses	166
5.1	Cep OB3b $g_{\text{WFC}}, (g-i)_{\text{WFC}}$ CMD with literature members overlaid	173
5.2	Selection of bright stars in χ Per $g_{\text{WFC}}, (g-i)_{\text{WFC}}$ CMD	179
5.3	Positions of bright stars in χ Per on the sky	179
5.4	Variation in $A_{g_{\text{WFC}}}$ as a function of T_{eff}	183
5.5	Variation in $E(g-i)_{\text{WFC}}$ as a function of T_{eff}	183
5.6	Reddening vectors in the $g_{\text{WFC}}, (g-i)_{\text{WFC}}$ CMD	184
5.7	Best-fitting $g_{\text{WFC}}, (g-i)_{\text{WFC}}$ CMD for λ Ori	189
5.8	Best-fitting $g_{\text{WFC}}, (g-i)_{\text{WFC}}$ CMD for NGC 2362	190
5.9	Best-fitting $g_{\text{WFC}}, (g-i)_{\text{WFC}}$ CMD for NGC 2169	191
5.10	Best-fitting $g_{\text{WFC}}, (g-i)_{\text{WFC}}$ CMD for NGC 7160	192
5.11	Best-fitting $g_{\text{WFC}}, (g-i)_{\text{WFC}}$ CMD for NGC 1960	193
5.12	NGC 2244 $g_{\text{WFC}}, (g-i)_{\text{WFC}}$ CMD with 2 Myr model isochrones overlaid	196
5.13	Cep OB3b $g_{\text{WFC}}, (g-i)_{\text{WFC}}$ CMD with 6 Myr model isochrone overlaid	197
5.14	IC 348 $g_{\text{WFC}}, (g-i)_{\text{WFC}}$ CMD with 6 Myr model isochrone overlaid	197
5.15	IC 5146 $g_{\text{WFC}}, (g-i)_{\text{WFC}}$ CMD with 6 Myr model isochrone overlaid	198
5.16	NGC 2244 $g_{\text{WFC}}, (g-i)_{\text{WFC}}$ CMD with 6 Myr model isochrone overlaid	198
5.17	NGC 6530 $g_{\text{WFC}}, (g-i)_{\text{WFC}}$ CMD with 6 Myr model isochrone overlaid	199
5.18	NGC 6611 $g_{\text{WFC}}, (g-i)_{\text{WFC}}$ CMD with 6 Myr model isochrone overlaid	199
5.19	ONC $g_{\text{WFC}}, (g-i)_{\text{WFC}}$ CMD with 6 Myr model isochrone overlaid	200
5.20	σ Ori $g_{\text{WFC}}, (g-i)_{\text{WFC}}$ CMD with 6 Myr model isochrone overlaid	200
5.21	χ Per $g_{\text{WFC}}, (g-i)_{\text{WFC}}$ CMD with 14 Myr model isochrones overlaid	202
6.1	MS versus pre-MS age for the SFRs	207
6.2	Disc frequency as a function of revised pre-MS age	217

List of Tables

1.1	Phases of the ISM	15
2.1	Literature sources for the Johnson UBV photoelectric photometric data . .	65
2.2	MS ages, distances and reddenings for the sample of SFRs	121
3.1	Normalised calculated INT-WFC system responses	133
3.2	Theoretical transformation between the SDSS and INT-WFC photometric systems for unreddened MS stars	137
4.1	Sample of MS binaries	159
5.1	Literature sources used in the identification of pre-MS stars	172
5.2	Absolute pre-MS ages for SFRs with MS ages $\gtrsim 10$ Myr	194
5.3	Nominal pre-MS ages for SFRs with MS ages < 10 Myr	201
6.1	Near-IR excess fraction as a function of revised pre-MS age	218
A.1	$(UgriZ)_{\text{WFC}}$ exposure times for the sample of SFRs	262
A.2	$(UgriZ)_{\text{WFC}}$ exposure times for the Pleiades fields	265
A.3	$(UgriZ)_{\text{WFC}}$ exposure times for the SDSS Stripe 82 standard fields	266
B.1	Pleiades single-star sequence in the INT-WFC $(griZ)_{\text{WFC}}$ and 2MASS JHK_s bandpasses	267

Declaration

The work presented in Chapters 3 and 4 was taken from a paper published in the Monthly Notices of the Royal Astronomical Society by Cameron P. M. Bell, Tim Naylor, N. J. Mayne, R. D. Jeffries, and S. P. Littlefair entitled Pre-main-sequence isochrones – I. The Pleiades benchmark (MNRAS, 424, 3178).

Chapters 2, 5, and 6 contain work that will be published in the near future and represent the second instalment of the saga.

The photometric observations taken with the Wide-Field Camera on the *Isaac Newton* Telescope were obtained by Tim Naylor and myself. The *Isaac Newton* Telescope is operated on the island of La Palma by the *Isaac Newton* Group (ING) in the Spanish Observatorio del Roque de los Muchachos of the Instituto de Astrofísica de Canarias.

Near-IR photometric data for the sample of main-sequence binaries were obtained from the Two-Micron All-Sky Survey (2MASS), which is a joint project of the University of Massachusetts and the Infrared Processing and Analysis Center, funded by the National Aeronautics and Space Administration (NASA) and the National Science Foundation.

The final reduction of the *Isaac Newton* Telescope data and the calculation of the *Isaac Newton* Telescope bandpasses were performed by Tim Naylor.

The τ^2 fitting statistic used for fitting the models to the data is the brainchild of Tim Naylor and R. D. Jeffries.

The rest of the work presented in this thesis is my own.