J. S. Bach in Everyday Life:
The ‘Choral Identity’ of an Amateur ‘Art Music’
Bach Choir and the Concept of ‘Choral Capital’

Sigrún Lilja Einarzdóttir

Supervisor: Professor Tia DeNora
Second Supervisor: Dr Dana Wilson-Kovacs
J. S. BACH IN EVERYDAY LIFE: THE ‘CHORAL IDENTITY’ OF AN AMATEUR ‘ART MUSIC’ BACH CHOIR AND THE CONCEPT OF ‘CHORAL CAPITAL’

BY SIGRÚN LILJA EINARSDÓTTIR

SUPERVISOR: TIA DE NORA
SECOND SUPERVISOR: DANA WILSON-KOVACS

Submitted by Sigrún Lilja Einarsdóttir to the University of Exeter as a thesis for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy in Sociology in July 2012

This thesis is available for Library use on the understanding that it is copyright material and that no quotation from the thesis may be published without proper acknowledgement.

I certify that all material in this thesis which is not my own work has been identified and that no material has previously been submitted and approved for the award of a degree by this or any other University.

Signature: ..............................................................................................
ABSTRACT

This thesis presents research on an amateur composer-oriented Bach choir. Its main purpose is to study the development of musical identities and musical preferences of choir members as they take shape through the collective learning process of rehearsing and performing large-scale choral music. The study analyses how the choral participation and performance creates a certain type of ‘choral capital’ (a combination of social and cultural capital within the choral setting) and how the choristers reconstruct and relate to the composer (J.S. Bach) by creating ‘choral identities’ linked to the composer-orientation of their choir.

This study is based on an interdisciplinary approach, seeking concepts and ideas from different fields of study – primarily sociology and music sociology (music in everyday life and the concepts of social and cultural capital in the amateur choral setting) but also music psychology regarding concepts of musical and vocal identities, history of music (especially Bach scholars, previous biographical writings about J.S. Bach), music and education (choral singing as informal music education) and interdisciplinary studies on music, health and well-being.

The methodological approach of this research consists of a grounded theory based, single case study where the case was the Croydon Bach Choir in London performing J.S. Bach’s Mass in B Minor, using participant observation (where I sang with the choir for one semester) and qualitative interviews as main research methods and gathering demographic background data on choir members via paper-based survey. Whereas significant research on music performances has been conducted, so far choral research, where the direct participation of the researcher as a member of the choir is used as one of the main research methods, is still quite rare.

Results indicate that participants develop socio-musical identity both through their choral participation in general, performance experiences and early music consumption in the family household and the emphasis of the importance of choral singing as a fulfilment instead of pursuing a professional career. Through choral singing, participants developed ‘choral capital’ through a) the effects of collective learning on their musical taste and preferences (thus broadening their musical taste and preferences and reconstructing the composer) and b) the well-being factor of collective singing and communal learning through the process of rehearsing and performing the
Mass in B Minor. Furthermore, findings indicated that participants construct Bach as a genius and a devout Lutheran, an image that relates to the romantic image of Bach presented in the late 19th – early 20th century biographical writings on the composer. Thus in general, their choral activities form a valuable addition to their social and cultural capital (‘choral capital’), which they use as a source of well-being in everyday life. In addition, participants create a certain ‘choral identity’ by relating to the composer-orientation of their choir; the promotional label of Bach as a synonym for quality choral singing and the emphasis of challenging repertoire.

**Key words:** Music sociology, music in everyday life, musical identities, choral studies, choral music, Johann Sebastian Bach, baroque music, identity and performance, amateur musicians, social capital, cultural capital, choral capital, choral identity
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

ABSTRACT \hspace{1cm} 3

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS \hspace{1cm} 5

1 INTRODUCTION \hspace{1cm} 13
  1.1 BACKGROUND OF RESEARCH \hspace{1cm} 13
  1.2 AIMS OF THE RESEARCH - A SOCIO-MUSICAL STUDY \hspace{1cm} 15
  1.3 AN INTERDISCIPLINARY THEORETICAL CONTEXT \hspace{1cm} 16
  1.4 A SOCIO-MUSICAL METHODOLOGY \hspace{1cm} 18
  1.5 ORGANIZATION OF THE THESIS \hspace{1cm} 19

2 THEORETICAL CONTEXT \hspace{1cm} 21
  2.1 CHORAL SINGING: BACKGROUND, DEFINITIONS AND PREVIOUS RESEARCH \hspace{1cm} 21
    2.1.1 A choir - a choral singer - a choral conductor: Some definitions \hspace{1cm} 22
    2.1.2 Choral singing within the Western music tradition: Amateur / professional perspectives \hspace{1cm} 30
  2.2 CHORAL SINGING IN EVERYDAY LIFE \hspace{1cm} 35
    2.2.1 Musical identity, vocal identity - some definitions \hspace{1cm} 36
    2.2.2 Childhood influences on musical identities \hspace{1cm} 39
    2.2.3 Collective musical development through choral singing \hspace{1cm} 44
    2.2.4 Developing musical taste and cultural capital through choral singing \hspace{1cm} 48
    2.2.5 Developing social capital as well-being through choral singing \hspace{1cm} 53

3 SETTING THE STAGE OF THE RESEARCH: BACH'S MASS IN B MINOR \hspace{1cm} 59
  3.1 JOHANN SEBASTIAN BACH AND THE MASS IN B MINOR \hspace{1cm} 59
  3.2 THE CONSTRUCTION OF BACH'S GENIUS \hspace{1cm} 63
  3.3 THE VICTORIAN CHORAL TRADITION AND BACH«S ORATORIOS \hspace{1cm} 66
  3.4 BACH CHOIRS IN UK \hspace{1cm} 69

4 METHODS \hspace{1cm} 73
  4.1 INTRODUCTION: THE APPROACH OF THE RESEARCH \hspace{1cm} 73
  4.2 RESEARCH DESIGN: THE PILOT STUDY \hspace{1cm} 77
    4.2.1 The pilot choir \hspace{1cm} 77
    4.2.2 Methods of the pilot study \hspace{1cm} 78
    4.2.3 Choice of methods for on-going research \hspace{1cm} 79
  4.3 CHOOSING THE CASE: THE CROYDON BACH CHOIR \hspace{1cm} 80
    4.3.1 Choosing venue for data collection \hspace{1cm} 83
    4.3.2 Carrying out the research: Grounded theory based case study \hspace{1cm} 84
  4.4 CASE STUDY \hspace{1cm} 85
    4.4.1 Participant observation \hspace{1cm} 86
    4.4.2 In-depth, semi-structured interviews \hspace{1cm} 89
    4.4.3 Paper based survey \hspace{1cm} 91
  4.5 DATA ACCESS \hspace{1cm} 93
  4.6 DATA ANALYSIS \hspace{1cm} 95
    4.6.1 Analysis of the qualitative data \hspace{1cm} 95
4.6.2 Analysis of the quantitative data
4.7 VALIDITY, RELIABILITY AND GENERALIZABILITY OF THE RESEARCH
4.8 RESEARCH ETHICS AND PRIVACY
4.8.1 The voluntary and informed nature of participation
4.8.2 Data protection and storage
4.9 THE RESEARCHER'S STATUS WITHIN THE RESEARCH
5 PARTICIPANTS IN THE RESEARCH: THE CROYDON BACH CHOIR
5.1 THE CROYDON BACH CHOIR - HISTORY AND STRUCTURE
5.2 THE MUSICAL DIRECTOR OF THE CROYDON BACH CHOIR
5.3 CROYDON BACH CHOIR: GENERAL BACKGROUND DEMOGRAPHICS
5.4 THE INTERVIEWEES
6 MUSICAL IDENTITIES AND SOCIO-CULTURAL CAPITAL: INTRODUCING THE CONCEPT OF 'CHORAL CAPITAL'
6.1 MUSICAL IDENTITIES - MUSICAL BACKGROUND: PATHWAYS TO 'CHORAL CAPITAL'
6.1.1 First step: Childhood musical background and choral experiences
6.1.2 Second step: From adolescence into adulthood - identifying gender difference, vocal identity and internal / external encouragement
6.1.3 Third step: Choosing music as a career or a hobby? Amateur / professional perspectives
6.2 'CHORAL CAPITAL': DEVELOPING MUSICAL TASTE AND CULTURAL CAPITAL THROUGH CHORAL PERFORMANCE AND CONCERT EXPERIENCES
6.2.1 Musical taste and gender differences
6.2.2 Developing musical taste through musical performances and early concert experiences
6.3 'CHORAL CAPITAL': DEVELOPING SOCIAL CAPITAL AND COLLECTIVE WELL-BEING THROUGH CHORAL PARTICIPATION
6.3.1 The Bach Choral community in Croydon
6.3.2 The well-being factor of collective singing in everyday life
6.3.3 'Music as primary motor' - the performance itself as an attraction to singers and audience
6.4 SUMMARY AND CONCLUSIONS
7 'CHORAL CAPITAL' AND 'CHORAL IDENTITY' - A CASE STUDY: BACH (CHOIR) IN EVERYDAY LIFE AND THE MASS IN B MINOR
7.1 'BACH CHORAL IDENTITY': A MEANING OR A LABEL / EVIDENCE OF QUALITY CHORAL SINGING?
7.2 CONSTRUCTING 'MY BACH': BACH CHORAL SINGERS' PERCEPTIONS TOWARDS THE COMPOSER
7.3 THE WELL-BEING FACTOR IN THE MASS IN B MINOR: THE EMOTIONAL / RELIGIOUS / SPIRITUAL CONTEXT AND THE THRILL OF 'GETTING IT RIGHT' 181
7.4 THE COLLECTIVE GROUP SUPPORT OF LEARNING THE MASS IN B MINOR 186
7.5 THE SUPPORT AND LEADERSHIP OF THE MUSICAL DIRECTOR IN THE LEARNING PROCESS OF THE MASS IN B MINOR 196
7.6 SUMMARY AND CONCLUSIONS 201

8 DISCUSSIONS, CONCLUSIONS AND IMPLICATIONS 203

8.1 BACH CHORAL SINGERS: SOCIO-MUSICAL IDENTITIES AND PATHWAY TO 'CHORAL CAPITAL' AS A RESULT OF MUSICAL HISTORIES? 203
8.1.1 'Informal' musical background? 204
8.1.2 Musical histories - family influences? 204
8.1.3 Encouragement and musical confidence - gendered perspectives 205
8.1.4 Amateur Bach singers - broken dreams of professional career? 207
8.2 THE CULTURAL CONTEXT OF 'CHORAL CAPITAL:' LEARNING TO LIKE NEW MUSIC AND DEVELOPING 'CHORAL IDENTITY'?' 208
8.2.1 Choral singing influencing the development of musical taste and preferences? 208
8.2.2 The 'centrality of Bach' in the Bach 'choral identity' 214
8.2.3 'Choral capital' in perceiving the Mass in B Minor 217
8.3 THE SOCIAL CONTEXT OF 'CHORAL CAPITAL:' COLLECTIVE, PEER-LEARNING SUPPORT AND COMMUNAL WELL-BEING? 220
8.3.1 'Choral capital' in the social context of well-being 221
8.3.2 The value of collective learning of the Mass in B minor (under the leadership of the conductor) 223
8.4 FUTURE WORK 228
8.5 IMPLICATIONS 231

APPENDICIES 236

1 AN OVERVIEW (TABLE) OF PREVIOUS RELATED CHORAL RESEARCH 236
2 THE LIFE AND WORK OF JOHANN SEBASTIAN BACH 240
3 LIST OF BACH'S LARGE SCALE CHORAL WORKS 244
4 OVERVIEW OF BACH'S COMPOSITIONS 245
5 LIST OF BACH CHOIRS IN UK 248
6 FRAMEWORK FOR FIELD NOTES - PILOT STUDY 250
7 INTERVIEWS: REQUEST FOR VOLUNTEERS FOR INTERVIEWS - PILOT STUDY 251
8 INFORMATION / CONSENT FORM FOR INTERVIEWEES - PILOT STUDY 252
9 INTERVIEW QUESTIONS - PILOT STUDY 253
10 FRAMEWORK FOR FIELD NOTES FROM PARTICIPANT OBSERVATION - PHD STUDY 257
11 QUESTIONS FOR INTERVIEWS - PHD STUDY 258
12 INFORMATION/CONSENT FORM FOR INTERVIEWS - PHD STUDY 263
13 THE CROYDON BACH CHOIR - SURVEY 264
14 E-MAIL FOR A REQUEST OF MEMBERSHIP IN CROYDON BACH CHOIR AND PARTICIPATION IN A PHD RESEARCH 277
15 CONFIRMATION FORM - ADULT CHOIR, NO MINORS - PHD STUDY 280
16 RESEARCHER'S MUSICAL BACKGROUND 281
17 EXTRA RESULTS FROM SURVEY 290
18 EXTRACTS FROM FIELD NOTES 318
BIBLIOGRAPHY 331