State Building and Constitutional Politics in a Multi-Ethnic Society:
The Nigerian Experience

Submitted by Ali Simon Bagaji Yusufu to the University of Exeter
as a thesis for the degree of
Doctor of Philosophy in Ethno-Political Studies
in July 2012.

This thesis is available for library use on the understanding that it is copyright
material and that no quotation from the thesis may be published without
proper acknowledgement.

I certify that all material in this thesis which is not my own work has been identified
and that no material has been previously submitted for the award of a
degree by this or any other University.

X

ASBYUSUFU
Abstract
In response to competing group claims and the challenge to achieve pre-set triple national goals - recognising and accommodating ethnic diversity, achieving national unity and political stability, successive Nigerian governments from the colonial era to the present, have at various periods negotiated, constitutionalised and/or decreed state building strategies. This thesis offers detailed discussion and evaluation of some of these competing group claims and strategies using principles derived from the theoretical arguments of Michal Walzer, Charles Taylor and Will Kymlicka, and prescriptions based on the empirical arguments of Crawford Young, Eric Nordlinger, Donald Horowitz and Donald Rothchild. The thesis argues that some of the strategies adopted in response to the competing group claims were defensible in the very circumstances in which they were introduced, but were either not deep enough to offer an adequate political inclusion, or lacked the appropriate instruments that would have minimised recurrence of ethno-political conflicts and institutional instabilities. There were some strategies that either generated tension among groups, or were purely driven by strategic considerations for national unity, but were defensible. There were other strategies that were pragmatic at the very period they were adopted, but not defensible. The core theoretical finding of the thesis is that, the normative and empirical prescriptions validate the country’s various strategies for coping with diversity. However, application of some elements of the prescriptions in the Nigerian multicultural society has the potential to generate tensions leading to ethno-political conflicts and institutional instabilities. The important empirical finding of the thesis is regarding the role the inherent tensions between the triple national goals and the state building strategies play in the generation and recurrence of ethno-political conflict and institutional instabilities. The thesis argues that the underlying factors responsible for the prevalence of ethno-political conflict and institutional instabilities in the country include among others, the ascension of the military to power and its costly dominance of the political scene for about thirty five years, the immediate post-civil war period which coincided with the era of petroleum boom that created a deepening crisis of corruption, the perpetuation of large scale electoral and financial corruption, and manipulation of ethnic loyalties. Given the above underlying factors, this work observes that state building and Constitutional politics in Nigeria’s multi-ethnic society is a difficult task, especially taking into account the ethno-political conflicts and institutional instabilities associated with the Armed Forces over the years. On the basis of a detailed and interdisciplinary analysis, the thesis recommends constitutional and institutional safeguards for mitigating ethno-political conflicts and institutional instabilities in the course of future political development of Nigeria.
Table of Contents

Title Page/Declaration ................................................. 1
Abstract ........................................................................ 2
Acknowledgement .......................................................... 3
Table of Contents .......................................................... 5
List of Acronyms .............................................................. 8
List of Tables, Figures and Maps ......................................... 11

CHAPTER ONE
INTRODUCTION

1.1 Statement of the Research Problem ............................... 12
1.2 Theoretical and Empirical Framework of Analysis .......... 15
1.3 Significance of the Study ............................................... 19
1.4 Definition and Conceptual Clarification ......................... 21
1.5 Methodology ............................................................. 24
1.6 Synopsis of Chapters .................................................. 26

CHAPTER TWO
NORMATIVE AND EMPIRICAL APPROACHES TO ETHNIC RECOGNITION AND ACCOMMODATION

2.1 Introduction ............................................................. 29
2.2 Theoretical Arguments ................................................ 31
2.3 Empirical Arguments .................................................. 41
2.4 Relevant Issues ........................................................ 48
2.5 Summary ................................................................... 54

CHAPTER THREE
COPING WITH DIVERSITY: THE POLITICAL SYSTEM APPROACH

3.1 Introduction ............................................................. 56
3.2 Group Claims During the Pre-Independence Constitutional Conferences ........................................... 56
3.2.1 The Type of Political System ................................... 58
3.2.2 Minorities Claims to Separation 61
3.3 Evaluating the Claims and Agreements 66
3.3.1 The Political System and Diversity 67
3.3.2 Minorities’ Claims for Recognition in Separate States 78
Summary 86

CHAPTER FOUR
THE QUOTA SYSTEM AND SEPARATION OF MINORITIES APPROACH

4.1 Introduction 89
4.2 The Quota System Approach 89
4.3 The 1963 and 1967 Separation of Minorities Approach 92
4.4 Evaluation 94
4.4.1 The Quota System 95
4.4.2 The 1963 and 1967 Separation of Minorities 100
4.5 Summary 104

CHAPTER FIVE
THE FEDERAL CHARACTER (PRINCIPLE) APPROACH

5.1 Introduction 107
5.2 The Background 107
5.3 The 1975 Panel on State Creation 109
5.4 The Federal Character Policy 111
5.5 Evaluation 114
5.5.1 The Demand for more States 114
5.5.2 The Federal Character Policy 117
5.6 Desirable and Feasible Alternative Strategies 121
5.7 Summary 128

CHAPTER SIX
THE REVISED FEDERAL CHARACTER (PRINCIPLE) APPROACH

6.1 Introduction 130
6.2 The Political Bureau and Federal Character 131
6.3 The 1994/5 Constitutional Conference and Power Sharing 135
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>6.4 Evaluation</td>
<td>139</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.4.1 Recognition in Separate Units and the Problem of Slippery Slope</td>
<td>139</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.4.2 Federal Character and the Problem of National Citizenship</td>
<td>143</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.4.3 The 1995 Constitutional Agreements on Political Structure and Rotational Presidency</td>
<td>145</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.5 Summary</td>
<td>153</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>CHAPTER SEVEN</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>THE REVENUE ALLOCATION APPROACH</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.1 Introduction</td>
<td>157</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.2 Background to the Nigerian Revenue Allocation System</td>
<td>158</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.3 Trends and Developments in the Revenue Allocation System</td>
<td>160</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.4 Relevant and Potential Issues in the Revenue Allocation System</td>
<td>180</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.5 Evaluation and Framework for Revenue Allocation</td>
<td>184</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.6 Summary</td>
<td>186</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>CHAPTER EIGHT</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>STATE OWNERSHIP AND CONTROL (NATIONALISATION) OF OIL APPROACH</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.1 Introduction</td>
<td>190</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.2 The Oil Industry: From Foreign Concession to State Ownership</td>
<td>192</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.3 The Essence of the Oil Resource Conflict</td>
<td>200</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.4 Evaluation: Ownership and Control of Oil Resources</td>
<td>207</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.5 Summary</td>
<td>216</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>CHAPTER NINE</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>CONCLUSION</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.1 Summary</td>
<td>219</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.2 Findings</td>
<td>232</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.3 Recommendations and Conclusion</td>
<td>237</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>APPENDICES</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>BIBLIOGRAPHY</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>