Teachers’ understanding and implementation of a whole language approach to literacy in Taiwan: A study of early years’ teachers’ beliefs and practices

Ling-Ying, Huang

Submitted by Ling-Ying, Huang to the University of Exeter as a thesis for the Degree of Doctor of Philosophy in Education In July 2012

This thesis is available for Library use on the understanding that it is copyright material and that no quotation from the thesis may be published without proper acknowledgement.

I certify that all material in this thesis which is not my own work has been identified and that no material has previously been submitted and approved for the award of a degree by this or any other University.

Signature: Ling-Ying, Huang
Abstract

In recent years, state and national governments have introduced major programmes to reform literacy teaching, e.g. textbook programmes in the United States; the Literacy Block in Victoria, Australia (DEET, 1997, 1998); the National Literacy Strategy (NLS) in England (Department for Education and Employment (DfEE), 1998). These programmes are largely based on the growing body of evidence about what may constitute effective literacy teaching. Following the trend, Taiwan’s government is also recognizing that in order to meet the challenges of globalization and the desire to improve students’ PIRST in the literacy section year-on-year, Taiwanese should be well-equipped with new knowledge and literacy (Ministry of Education, Taiwan; 1999, 2000, 2003, 2005). One of the ways to make education and training more accessible is by providing better infrastructure, such as building new libraries and providing more books, as well as upgrading the teaching and learning practices through teacher training. There is also an urgent need to improve the declining standards in Chinese literacy (Ministry of Education, Taiwan; 1999, 2000, 2003, 2005). In 2000, the Taiwan Education Commission proposed a Reading Project in an attempt to deal with these challenges, which included the whole language approach (MOE, 2000). This approach was the key guideline for the implementation of the aims of early childhood education for the twenty-first millennium. Therefore, many nurseries and kindergartens claim that they have applied the whole language approach as part of their teaching policy, and have treated it as an important element of their curriculum design.

In order to explore the understanding of Taiwanese early year’s teachers regarding whole language approach and its implementation, a total of 200 questionnaires were
delivered to teachers at nurseries and kindergartens. 169 were completed and analyzed. In addition, three Taiwanese nursery teachers participated in an in-depth qualitative study to investigate the implementation of the whole language approach and to explore their understanding of it. During the course of the investigation, their beliefs about literacy teaching and the extent to which those beliefs are reflected in their classroom practices were examined. Their framing of the whole language approach was tracked for more than four months by means of interviews and classroom observations. The wealth of data and information collected revealed that although the whole language approach may be positively mandated on a large scale, individual differences between teachers may make the implementation of any such approach or reform more variable in its impact than researchers and policy makers would expect.

The findings indicate that, while teachers sought to include the whole language approach into their literacy teaching, their thinking often shifted and their concept of the whole language approach and literacy learning and teaching fluctuated.

The findings also highlight the complexity of these views. The key influences on teachers’ perceptions of literacy and literacy teaching form a continuum, ranging from a purely discrete skill-based curriculum, which reflects traditional Confucian beliefs, to social interaction, which supports the integration of the whole language approach. This range of beliefs is informed by a variety of different influences, including the experience of teachers; their personal background; their understanding of the needs of parents, as well as those of school requirements; government suggested guidelines, and, finally, cultural demands. Each of these influences represents a unique challenge to the beliefs of teachers. When drawn together, the combination of influences that emerge illustrates the complex ways in which teacher beliefs inform their pedagogical practice.
What the data reveals is that the pedagogical practices of teachers were pushed and pulled by these intervening forces, along a continuum between a whole language approach and a more traditional skill-based teaching. Therefore, it is not that they were slow to adopt the utopian whole language approach in practice, nor were they reluctant to change, but that their practice was in reality always constrained by these forces.

The findings also indicate that there are immense difficulties in understanding the concept of the whole language approach and a gap between the practitioners’ espoused theories and practice. The study revealed the complex nature of learning and teaching and the core issue for implementing reform, namely, the need to bridge the gap between theory and practice.

Based upon the findings of the study, implications for practice are also considered, namely, the need for government funding and subsidies to help nursery schools to mediate market forces; the restructuring of the bureaucratic and hierarchical management in nurseries; the empowerment of teachers through nurturing their pedagogical competence; support of professional career training; and the ongoing development and reformation of the philosophical underpinnings of teacher training.
# Table of Contents

Abstract ........................................................................................................................................... 1  
Acknowledgements ......................................................................................................................... 4  
Table of Contents ............................................................................................................................ 6  
Chapter one: Introduction .............................................................................................................. 13  
  1.1 Introduction .............................................................................................................................. 13  
  1.2 The origins of my interest ........................................................................................................ 13  
  1.3 Research objectives .................................................................................................................. 15  
  1.4 The research questions are: ..................................................................................................... 20  
  1.5 An outline of the thesis ............................................................................................................. 21  
  1.6 Summary .................................................................................................................................. 23  
Chapter two: Background Information .......................................................................................... 24  
  2.1 Introduction .............................................................................................................................. 24  
  2.2 An introduction of Taiwan ....................................................................................................... 24  
  2.3 Nursery Education in Taiwan .................................................................................................. 26  
  2.4 The nursery education system ............................................................................................... 27  
  2.5 Nursery curriculum .................................................................................................................. 28  
  2.6 Teacher’s qualifications and quality ......................................................................................... 30  
  2.7 The Teacher’s Role .................................................................................................................. 32  
  2.8 The Reading Project ................................................................................................................. 34  
  2.9 The Chinese Language ............................................................................................................ 37  
    2.9.1 Chinese literacy teaching in the nursery school .............................................................. 39  
  2.10 Summary ............................................................................................................................... 44  
Chapter three: Theoretical framework and literature review ....................................................... 45  
  3.1 Introduction .............................................................................................................................. 45  
  3.2 Learning theories ..................................................................................................................... 46  
    3.2.1 Behaviourism ..................................................................................................................... 46  
    3.2.2 Constructivism ................................................................................................................... 47  
    3.2.3 Socio-cultural theory of learning ..................................................................................... 50  
    3.2.4 Summary ........................................................................................................................... 56  
    3.2.5 Learning in Taiwanese Society ....................................................................................... 57  
  3.3 What is literacy? ....................................................................................................................... 63  
    3.3.1 Literacy as a set of individual skills .................................................................................... 64  
    3.3.2 Literacy as a set of social practices .................................................................................... 64  
    3.3.3 Whole language approach .............................................................................................. 67
Chapter Five: Questionnaire Findings

5.1 Introduction............................................................................................................................................ 151

5.2 Teacher reactions towards the whole language in the literacy classroom ........................................... 153
  5.2.1 How do teachers assess their own approach to teaching literacy? ................................................. 154
  5.2.2 Decision making in the literacy classroom ..................................................................................... 154

Chapter Four: Methodology ......................................................................................................................... 100

4.1 What I Believe ......................................................................................................................................... 100

4.2 My Epistemological Position .................................................................................................................. 101

4.3 My Philosophical Perspective ............................................................................................................... 104

4.4 Qualitative methods approach .............................................................................................................. 106

4.5 Exploring Teachers’ Beliefs ................................................................................................................... 108

4.6 Aim of the research ................................................................................................................................ 111

4.7 Research Design ..................................................................................................................................... 112
  4.7.1 Adopting a case study approach ....................................................................................................... 112
  4.7.2 Multi-Method designs of Data Collection ......................................................................................... 114
  4.7.3 Information Collection ..................................................................................................................... 115
  4.7.4 Questionnaires survey ..................................................................................................................... 119
  4.7.5 Recruitment of Teachers for Interviews and Observations ............................................................. 125
  4.7.6 Interviews with Teachers .................................................................................................................. 129
  4.7.7 Carrying Out the Observations ......................................................................................................... 133

4.8 Ethical Considerations ............................................................................................................................. 136

4.9 Quality control: issue of trustworthiness and generalization ................................................................. 138
  4.9.1 Trustworthiness of Data .................................................................................................................... 139
  4.9.2 Generalization ................................................................................................................................... 143
  4.9.3 Researcher Positionality .................................................................................................................... 145
  4.9.4 Accounting for subjectivity and bias ............................................................................................... 145

4.10 Analysis and Interpretation .................................................................................................................... 147
  4.10.1 Questionnaire Data .......................................................................................................................... 147
  4.10.2 Interview and Observation Data ..................................................................................................... 147

4.11 Summary ................................................................................................................................................ 150

Chapter Five: Questionnaire Findings ......................................................................................................... 151

5.1 Introduction ............................................................................................................................................ 151

5.2 Teacher reactions towards the whole language in the literacy classroom ........................................... 153
  5.2.1 How do teachers assess their own approach to teaching literacy? ................................................. 154
  5.2.2 Decision making in the literacy classroom ....................................................................................... 154
Chapter Six: Presentation of the interview and observation findings .................................. 177
   6.1 Introduction ................................................................................................................. 177
   6.2 Data sorting and initial data analysis .......................................................................... 180
   6.3 Data coding................................................................................................................ 182
      6.3.1 Rereading the coding, noting and coding prevalent categories ....................... 183
      6.3.2 Theme Emergence .............................................................................................. 185
      6.3.3 Summary ............................................................................................................ 189
   6.4 Interview and observation findings ............................................................................ 189
      6.4.1 The teacher in context......................................................................................... 191
      6.4.2 Views of Literacy............................................................................................... 194
      6.4.3 How the Teacher teaches .................................................................................... 208
   6.5 Summary.................................................................................................................... 242
Chapter Seven: Discussion ................................................................................................. 243
   7.1 Introduction ............................................................................................................... 243
   7.2 Relationship between Taiwanese nursery teachers’ beliefs and the whole language approach .. 245
      7.2.1 Making sense of real use and immersion in environmental print .................. 247
      7.2.2 Making sense of play and social activity ......................................................... 249
      7.2.3 Making sense of teachers’ general position about literacy instruction ...... 252
   7.3 The domain of change and challenge ...................................................................... 255
      7.3.1 Yes, positive rhetoric, but practice? ................................................................. 257
   7.4 The gap between espoused theory and practice ....................................................... 268
      7.4.1 A transitional model of pedagogy ................................................................. 273
Chapter Eight: Conclusion ............................................................................................... 279
   8.1 Introduction ............................................................................................................... 279
   8.2 The journey begins .................................................................................................. 279
8.2.1 Summary of teachers’ complex beliefs and practices............................... 280
8.3 Limitations of the study.................................................................................. 287
8.4 Recommendations .......................................................................................... 289
  8.4.1 For further research .................................................................................. 289
  8.4.2 Practical recommendations ...................................................................... 290
  8.4.2.2 Recommendations for nursery schools ................................................. 291
  8.4.2.3 Recommendations for teachers............................................................ 292

Appendices........................................................................................................... 295
Appendix One: TBALQ Questionnaire for the study ............................................ 295
Appendix Two: Seeking volunteer for taking interview and observation .......... 321
Appendix Three: Pre-interview protocol............................................................ 323
Appendix Four: Post-interview Schedules ......................................................... 325
Appendix Five: Observation field notes............................................................. 328
Appendix Six: Observation checking list............................................................ 333
Appendix Seven: Certificate of ethical research approval.............................. 339

Bibliography........................................................................................................ 342
## List of Tables

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table</th>
<th>Content</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Table 2.1:</td>
<td>The number of Nurseries</td>
<td>.............................................</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 4.1:</td>
<td>The three phases of study</td>
<td>.............................................</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 4.2:</td>
<td>The information of the questionnaire participants</td>
<td>.............................................</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 4.3:</td>
<td>Background Information of the Three Teachers</td>
<td>.............................................</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 5.1:</td>
<td>Teachers access their approach to teaching literacy</td>
<td>.............................................</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 5.2:</td>
<td>Teachers decision making in the literacy classroom</td>
<td>.............................................</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 5.3:</td>
<td>Teachers perceptions of literacy</td>
<td>.............................................</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 5.4:</td>
<td>Descriptive Statistics for whole language approach activities</td>
<td>.............................................</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 5.5:</td>
<td>Descriptive Statistics for skills based activities</td>
<td>.............................................</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 5.6:</td>
<td>Descriptive Statistics for whole language approach, child-centered items</td>
<td>.............................................</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 5.7:</td>
<td>Descriptive Statistics for traditional approach</td>
<td>.............................................</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 5.8:</td>
<td>Relation between beliefs and practices</td>
<td>.............................................</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 5.9:</td>
<td>Relation between beliefs and practices</td>
<td>.............................................</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 5.10:</td>
<td>The information of the questionnaire participants</td>
<td>.............................................</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 5.11:</td>
<td>Teachers' beliefs and teachers age range</td>
<td>.............................................</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 5.12:</td>
<td>Teachers' beliefs and Educational background</td>
<td>.............................................</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 5.13:</td>
<td>Teachers' beliefs and specialization</td>
<td>.............................................</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 5.14:</td>
<td>Teachers' beliefs and teaching experience</td>
<td>.............................................</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 5.15:</td>
<td>Teachers' beliefs and nursery school size</td>
<td>.............................................</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 5.16:</td>
<td>Independent Test of TBALQ by degree; specialist; number of pupils</td>
<td>..........</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 6.1:</td>
<td>Checklist of classroom observation</td>
<td>.............................................</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 6.2:</td>
<td>The categories within the theme of teacher in context</td>
<td>.............................................</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 6.3:</td>
<td>The categories within the view of literacy</td>
<td>.............................................</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 6.4:</td>
<td>The categories within the theme of how teachers teach literacy</td>
<td>..........</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table 6.5: Miss Liu’s lesson photo ................................................................. 208
Table 6.6: Miss Lyn’s lesson photo ............................................................... 209
Table 6.7: Miss Wang’s lesson photo ............................................................ 210
Table 6.8: Summary of classroom observation Data (Classroom Management) .... 213
Table 6.9: Summary of classroom observation Data (Literacy Environment) ......... 214
Table 6.10: Themes in the curriculum of the three participating schools .............. 215
Table 6.11: Themes in the curriculum of the three participating schools .............. 216
Table 6.12: Observation period of current research in the kangaroo nursery ........ 216
Table 6.13: Observation period of current research in the Lilly nursery ............... 218
Table 6.14: Observation period of current research in the Lion nursery ............... 220
## List of Figures

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Figure</th>
<th>Content</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Figure 2.1</td>
<td>Taiwan’s location</td>
<td>24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 5.1</td>
<td>Conception of whole language approach</td>
<td>153</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 6.1</td>
<td>Detailed procedures of the data analysis process</td>
<td>177</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 6.2</td>
<td>A sample of files managements</td>
<td>178</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 6.3</td>
<td>A sample of manual sorting (Miss Lyn pre interview)</td>
<td>180</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 6.4</td>
<td>An example of crash file</td>
<td>181</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 6.5</td>
<td>A sample of using Max sorting</td>
<td>181</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 6.6</td>
<td>A sample of rereading the coding, noting and coding prevalent categories</td>
<td>184</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 6.7</td>
<td>Final coding catalogues</td>
<td>185</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 6.8</td>
<td>View of literacy</td>
<td>190</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 6.9</td>
<td>General view of literacy</td>
<td>194</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 6.10</td>
<td>View of language skills and literacy</td>
<td>199</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 6.11</td>
<td>Perception of literacy learning in the classroom</td>
<td>201</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 6.12</td>
<td>Structuring literacy instructions</td>
<td>232</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 7.1</td>
<td>A continuum view</td>
<td>270</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 7.2</td>
<td>A continuum within a transitional model of pedagogy</td>
<td>274</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 8.1</td>
<td>The relationship relocated nursery system</td>
<td>291</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>