

Polish Identity in Rural England.

Submitted by Kirstie Louise Bowden, to the University of Exeter as a thesis for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy in Geography, September 2012.

This dissertation is available for Library use on the understanding that it is copyright material and that no quotation from the thesis may be published without proper acknowledgement.

I certify that all material in this thesis which is not my own work has been identified and that no material has previously been submitted and approved for the award of a degree by this or any other University.

SIGNED:..... DATE:.....

ABSTRACT

With Polish accession to the European Union in 2004 came an unprecedented wave of Polish migration to England. Marking it apart from previous waves of migration which settled in urban areas, this wave settled across the settlement hierarchy, resultantly described as geographically “ubiquitous” by Bauere et al (2007). This thesis takes as its inspiration a triad of influences; this migration wave; what the author deems seminal texts in rural geography (Philo 1992, Askins 2009, Panelli et al 2009); and personal circumstance (living in a rural area receiving Polish migrants for the first time) to chart that postulated as a lacuna (Burrell 2009); a study of the ways in which post-accession Polish identity is played out in rural areas. Wanting to focus on life in rural England as a whole rather than one specific strand, this thesis is by necessity broad, incorporating a number of strands of enquiry; the media migrant worker moral panic, community relations, Polish focussed service responses to Polish migration, and schemes delivered to the rural host population which aim to improve their encounters with migrant populations. What binds these themes together is the notion of hospitality, considering whether it is being extended or withheld, the reasons upon which such acts are predicated and the outcome upon those involved.

The thesis concludes that this grand wave of migration has rendered rural areas a thirdspace of possibility in both a physical (via service imprinting on the landscape) and social (via the forging of transnational friendships and in some instances, both Polish and migrant, hybridised identities) sense. It is postulated that the psychogeographies upon which relations are predicated – of which there are many, subtly nuanced and dependent upon the experiences of the individual - are in a state of flux and subject to revision with the passing of time, as are processes of hospitality extension (or indeed withholding). It is my belief that in detailing moments of hopeful engagement alongside moments of deep despair and reflecting upon their impacts upon identity, this thesis has heeded Askins (2005:53) call to embrace transrurality – a conceptualisation “that *both* encapsulates the specificities of place *and* is open to mobility and desire in order to displace rural England as only an exclusionary white space” and reposition it within transitional social imaginaries.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

Thank you to the University of Exeter and ESRC for their funding of this project and to my supervisors Professor Paul Cloke and Professor Jo Little for their much valued help and guidance. Thank you to my participants for giving their time so freely and fully. Thanks also to my car 'Eamo' and First Great Western for always getting me 'there and back' in time (loosely speaking with regards to the latter).

This process has been long and arduous and I offer special thanks to all that kept me going; my beloved Exeter City F.C. (2011/2012 squad NOT included) for giving me something else to stress about, my football family (especially Marge for singing to Rohan Ricketts in the car park at Tranmere), Eamonn Dolan for being my hero and reminding me to always "keep the faith", my four-legged (and indeed two-legged) friends at Town Barton Farm, and last but by no means least, my family without whom I would never have reached this point. I offer particular thanks to my Mum for her love, encouragement, 'sayings' and for simply putting up with me and my often miserable demeanour!

Thank you to my Geography teachers at Queen Elizabeth's Community College, particularly Martin Wilmott who was quite simply the best teacher I ever had. He inspired and nurtured my love of Geography and much of my reaching this point is down to him.

I dedicate this thesis to the friends and heroes who passed away over the course of this process; Colin, Kelly, Adam, Dom and Colonel. Much loved, much missed, always remembered. Rest in peace.

CONTENTS

<u>Preface</u>	12
<hr/>	
<u>Chapter 1 – Poles Apart: Situating the Post-Accession Wave of Polish Migration</u>	22
1.1 Introduction	22
1.2 Rurality and Ethnicity	22
1.2.1 The Traditional Focus – Black and Ethnic Minority Groups	22
1.2.2 The Post-Millennial Focus – Minority White Groups	26
1.3 The Accession of Poland to the European Union	30
1.3.1 Migration Waves– The Constitutive Cohorts of the UK Polish Population	30
1.3.2 Quantifying Post-Accession Migration	33
1.3.3 The Geographical Distribution of Post-Accession Polish Migrants	34
1.3.4 The Demographic Profile of Post-Accession Polish Migrants	35
1.3.5 Employment Trends	37
1.4 Research Aim and Research Questions	40
1.5 Conclusion	41
<u>Chapter 2 – The ‘Polish Migrant’: Theorising Encounter</u>	43
2.1 Introduction	43
2.2 Hospitality	44
2.2.1 Hospitality: A Governmental Framework	44
2.2.2 Defining Hospitable Relations	49

2.3 Theorising Negative Responses to Polish Migrants by Indigenous Residents	53
2.3.1 Psychoanalysis, ‘Others’ and Boundaries	53
2.3.2 Theorising Contestation: Zizek, the ‘thing’ and the ‘fantasy of racism’	57
2.4 Progressive Rural Relations?	60
2.5 Deconstructing Polish Responses to Polish Migrants	62
2.5.1 Inter-Cohort Contestation	62
2.5.2 Intra-Cohort Contestation	65
2.5.3 Normalised Polish Positioning?	68
2.6 Conclusion	72
<u>Chapter 3 - Research Methodology</u>	<u>74</u>
3.1 Introduction	74
3.2 Epistemological Foundations	78
3.3 Research Methods	81
3.3.1 Interview	81
3.3.2 Ethnography	84
3.3.3 Discourse Analysis	86
3.3.3.1 Migrant Worker Myth Buster Leaflet	88
3.3.3.2 Mass Media	89
3.4 Research Design	90
3.4.1 Pilot Study	90
3.4.2 Participant Recruitment	92
3.4.3 Qualitative Sampling	96

3.4.4 Data Analysis	99
3.5 Situating Myself within the Project	100
3.5.1 Me: White ‘Other’	101
3.5.2 Fear of Research as Exploitation for Personal Gain	102
3.5.3 Problems of Disclosure	104
3.6 Conclusion	106
<u>Chapter 4 – Communities of Difference (1) Attitudes and Encounters</u>	<u>107</u>
4.1 Introduction	107
4.2 Positive Attitudes and Encounters	108
4.2.1 Positive Attitudes towards People	108
4.2.1.1 English Attitudes towards Polish migrants	108
4.2.1.2 Polish Attitudes towards English residents	110
4.2.2 Positive Attitudes towards Rural Place	111
4.2.2.1 English Attitudes Regarding the Impact of Polish Migration	111
4.2.2.2 Polish Attitudes Regarding their Experience of Place	113
4.2.3 Identity Hybridisation	118
4.2.3.1 Separation	119
4.2.3.2 Collaboration	121
4.2.3.3 Renouncement	122
4.3 Negative Attitudes and Encounters	128
4.3.1 Negative Attitudes towards People	128
4.3.1.1 English Attitudes towards Polish Migrants	128

4.3.1.2 Post-War Polish Migrant Attitudes towards Post-Accession Polish Migrants	133
4.3.1.3 Polish Attitudes towards English Residents	136
4.3.2 Negative Attitudes towards Rural Place	145
4.3.2.1 English Attitudes Regarding the Impact of Polish Migration upon Place	145
4.3.2.2 Polish Attitudes Regarding their Experience of Rural Place	154
4.4 Indifference	159
4.5 Conclusion	160
<u>Chapter 5: Communities of Difference (2) Responsive Polish Focussed Services</u>	<u>164</u>
5.1 Introduction	164
5.2 Statutory Responses	165
5.3 Voluntary/Third Sector Responses	175
5.4 Entrepreneurism	183
5.5 Response Spaces as ‘Thirdspace’	189
5.5.1 Positive Responses to Thirdspace	192
5.5.2 Negative Responses to Thirdspace	194
5.6 Conclusion	197

<u>Chapter 6: Communities of Difference (3) Improving Host Population Attitudes via the Migrant Worker Myth Buster Leaflet</u>	<u>201</u>
6.1 Introduction	201
6.2 Media responses to Polish migration: The renewed age of the moral panic?	202
6.2.1 Introduction	202
6.2.2 Theme 1 - ‘British workers for British jobs’	204
6.2.3 Theme 2 – Negative Discourses about Polish Migrants	208
6.2.4 Theme 3 – Negative Discourses Enacted Against Polish Migrants	213
6.2.5 Theme 4 - Return Migration	215
6.2.6 Reflections	218
6.3 Migrant Worker Myth Buster Leaflet	222
6.3.1 Introduction	222
6.3.2 The Migrant Worker Myth Buster Leaflet	226
6.3.3 Migrant Worker Myth Buster Leaflet as Psychogeography?	230
6.3.4 Staged Motive?	236
6.4 Conclusion	238
<u>Chapter 7: Communities of Difference (3) Improving Host Population Attitudes via the ‘I packed this myself’ Participatory Art Project</u>	<u>240</u>
7.1 Introduction	240
7.2 Aesthetic Introductions	240
7.3 ‘I packed this myself’: Motives and Mechanisms	245
7.3.1 Postsecular Partnership	245
7.3.2 Children and Citizenship Education	248

7.4 Engaging With the Participatory Art Project	252
7.5 Evaluating “I packed this myself”	256
7.6 Conclusion	260
7.7 Reflections upon the ‘Improving Host Population Attitudes’ chapters	262
<u>Chapter 8 – Conclusions</u>	<u>267</u>
8.1 Key Findings	267
8.2 Methodological Reflections	269
8.3 Key Thematic Areas	272
8.3.1 The Thirdspace of Rural Communities	272
8.3.2 Psychogeographies and Boundaries	275
8.3.3 Cultivating Hospitality	280
8.4 Future Research	282
8.5 Conclusion	284
Appendix – List of formal interviewees	288
Bibliography	297

LIST OF ILLUSTRATIONS AND TABLES

Table 2.1	South West Migrant Worker Action Plan 2010-2012: Priorities	46
Table 3.1	Research methods	74
Table 3.2	The breakdown of interviews by research area	82
Table 3.3	Ethnography case studies	85
Table 3.4	Pilot study evaluation of research methods	91
Figure 4.1	Piotr's pictorial representation of Fordstone and its inhabitants	139
Figure 4.2	Anti-Polish graffiti in Tidbury	146
Figure 4.3	Tom's Facebook group	150
Figure 5.1	Devon EAL and Polish EMAS referral numbers by academic year	168
Figure 5.2	Map of Tidbury detailing 'The Polish Quarter'	185
Figure 5.3	The Polish 'section'	186
Figure 5.4	Courting encounter on street shop signage	188
Figure 6.1	The Daily Star campaign poster	206
Figure 6.2	'Swan Bake'	209
Figure 6.3	Luton Angling Club's "the swans are not for eating" sign	210
Figure 6.4	Anti-Polish actions media reporting	214
Figure 6.5	Reporting return migration	216
Figure 6.6	Migrant worker myth buster leaflet (Eden LSP)	224
Figure 6.7	Myth presentation (Coventry)	227
Figure 6.8	Question posing (Arun)	228
Figure 7.1	Map boxes	254
Figure 7.2	Migrant facts	254

Figure 7.3 Maisie's painting

255