CANDIDATE GENDER AND ELECTORAL SUCCESS IN PARTY LIST PROPORTIONAL REPRESENTATION (PR LIST) SYSTEMS

Submitted by Maarja Luhiste to the University of Exeter as a thesis for the degree of

Doctor of Philosophy in Politics

In November 2012

This thesis is available for Library use on the understanding that it is copyright material and that no quotations from the thesis may be published without proper acknowledgement.

I certify that all material in this thesis which is not my own work has been identified and that no material has previously been submitted and approved for the award of a degree by this or any other University.

Maarja Luhiste

Signature: ..........................
ABSTRACT

This thesis studies women politicians’ journey along the path from candidates to elected representatives in party list proportional representation (PR list) systems. While past literature provides sufficient evidence that more women are elected in proportional electoral systems than in majority / plurality systems, there is limited research explaining the differences in women’s representation across varying types of PR list systems. This thesis aims to fill that gap, by focusing primarily on the election of women across preferential (open and ordered list systems) and non-preferential (closed list systems) PR list voting systems. Moreover, unlike the vast majority of previous research, which has relied on aggregate level data only, this research investigates the election of women at the individual candidate level. Such an approach allows the present thesis to consider, next to traditional aggregate level predictors, how party gatekeepers and the news media may either support or hinder women in progressing from candidates to elected representatives. Since the focus is set on the 2009 European Parliament elections, this thesis investigates the process of electing women cross-nationally. The results show that female candidates have a higher likelihood of being elected in non-preferential closed list voting systems than in preferential ordered list voting systems. The results suggest that this is the case because, first, party gatekeepers in ordered list systems place women in less viable electoral list positions than party gatekeepers in closed list systems; second, media cover female candidates less in ordered list systems compared to closed list systems; and finally, female candidates in ordered list systems fail to make up their less competitive starting position with preference votes because preference votes in ordered list systems do not significantly alter the initial party list rankings.
Title page.

Abstract.

Table of contents.

List of Tables.

List of Figures.

Acknowledgements.
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

## PART I - INTRODUCTION

1 INTRODUCTION ............................................................................................................. 18

1.1 Limitations of previous work .................................................................................. 19
1.2 The argument in brief .............................................................................................. 21
1.3 Case selection: Why European Parliamentary elections? ....................................... 24
1.4 Thesis overview ...................................................................................................... 25

## PART II - THEORY

2 WOMEN’S DESCRIPTIVE REPRESENTATION UNDER VARYING
INSTITUTIONAL AND CONTEXTUAL SETTINGS .................................................. 29

2.1 Representation ....................................................................................................... 30

2.1.1 The concept of representation .......................................................................... 30
2.1.2 Why women’s representation matters .............................................................. 31
2.1.3 Who should represent women? The link between descriptive and substantive
representation ............................................................................................................. 33

2.2 Predictors of women’s descriptive representation .................................................. 38

2.3 What affects women candidates’ chances for electoral success? .......................... 44

2.3.1 First, it takes a candidate .................................................................................. 45
2.3.2 Second, it takes the support of the party gatekeepers ...................................... 47
2.3.3 Third, it takes the support of the news media .................................................. 51
2.3.4 How institutional and contextual settings condition individual, party, and media effects.............................................................................................................. 54

2.3.5 Summary of previous findings ................................................................................................................................. 64

2.4 Approach and central expectation of the thesis .......................................................................................................... 65

2.4.1. Central expectations of the thesis ......................................................................................................................... 69

PART III - RESEARCH DESIGN

3 RESEARCH DESIGN......................................................................................................................................................... 78

3.1 Central concepts of the thesis ................................................................................................................................. 79

3.2 European Parliamentary Elections ....................................................................................................................... 81

3.3 Levels of analysis ..................................................................................................................................................... 84

3.4 Data........................................................................................................................................................................ 86

3.4.1 Aggregate level data ....................................................................................................................................... 86

3.4.2 Survey Data ..................................................................................................................................................... 87

3.4.3 Media Content Data...................................................................................................................................... 89

3.4.4 Linking Media Content Data and Candidate Survey Data ............................................................................. 90

3.5 Method................................................................................................................................................................. 94

3.6 Measurement of central variables ......................................................................................................................... 96

PART IV - EXPLAINING THE ELECTION OF WOMEN AT THE AGGREGATE LEVEL

4 WOMEN CANDIDATES’ PRESENCE AT THE 2004 AND 2009 EUROPEAN PARLIAMENT ELECTIONS...................................................................................................................... 104
4.1 Expectations and hypotheses ................................................................. 106
4.2 Data and Measurement ........................................................................... 112
4.3 Variations in women’s candidacy, news media visibility, descriptive representation, and electoral success rate ................................................................. 113
4.4 Explaining women’s candidacy, news media visibility, descriptive representation, and electoral success rates ................................................................. 118
4.5 Final comments ....................................................................................... 131

PART V - EXPLAINING THE ELECTION OF WOMEN AT THE INDIVIDUAL LEVEL

Chapter 5 WOMEN’S LIKELIHOOD OF VIABLE CANDIDACY .................. 136

5.1 Expectations and hypotheses ................................................................... 141
  5.1.1 Individual characteristics that the selectors are looking for ................... 142
  5.1.2 Parties’ candidate selection rules ......................................................... 144
  5.1.3 The structure of opportunities: institutional setting ............................ 145
  5.1.4 The structure of opportunities: contextual setting ............................... 148
5.2 Data, measurement, and methods ............................................................ 150
  5.2.1 The 2009 European Election Study Candidate Survey data ................ 150
  5.2.2 Dependent variable and method ......................................................... 152
  5.2.3 Operationalisation of independent variables ....................................... 155
5.3 Results and discussion ............................................................................. 158
5.4 Final comments ....................................................................................... 180

Chapter 6 WOMEN CANDIDATES’ NEWS MEDIA VISIBILITY ............... 182
6.1 Candidate gender and news media coverage ........................................ 185

6.1.1 Why does news media coverage matter? ........................................ 186

6.1.2 Gender bias in the news media coverage: evidence from the literature ........ 187

6.2 Expectations and hypotheses ................................................................. 190

6.3 Data and measurement ........................................................................ 198

6.4 Results .................................................................................................. 205

6.4.1 Results of Candidate-Level Analysis .............................................. 208

6.5 Final comments ..................................................................................... 220

Chapter 7 CANDIDATE GENDER AND ELECTORAL SUCCESS ............... 223

7.1 Expectations and hypotheses ................................................................. 225

7.1.1 Electoral rules, women’s party-determined viability, and the election of women ................................................................. 226

7.1.2 Overall gender equality and the election of women .......................... 231

7.1.3 Candidates’ news media coverage and the election of women ............ 232

7.1.4 Candidate quotas and the election of women ..................................... 233

7.1.5 Other variables predicting women’s likelihood of winning an elected seat .... 234

7.2 Data and measurement ......................................................................... 235

7.2.1 Measurement ..................................................................................... 237

7.3 Results .................................................................................................. 239

7.4 Final comments ..................................................................................... 253

Chapter 8 CONCLUSIONS ....................................................................... 256
8.1 Practical implications: the proposals for the electoral reform at the European Parliament level and the results of this thesis ................................................................. 263

8.2 Paths for future research ......................................................................................... 264

Bibliography ....................................................................................................................... 290

Appendices .......................................................................................................................... 268

Appendix 1: Measurement and descriptive statistics of dependent variables .......... 269

Chapter 4 ............................................................................................................................... 269

Chapter 5 ............................................................................................................................... 270

Chapter 6 ............................................................................................................................... 272

Chapter 7 ............................................................................................................................... 272

Appendix 2: Measurement and descriptive statistics of independent variables .......... 274

Country level independent and control variables ............................................................. 274

Party level independent and control variables ................................................................. 281

Individual level independent and control variables ....................................................... 286