Into the Mouths of Babes: Hyperactivity, Food Additives and the History of the Feingold Diet [volume 1 of 2 volumes]

Submitted by Matthew Phillip Campbell Smith, to the University of Exeter as a thesis for the degree of DOCTOR OF PHILOSOPHY in HISTORY, June 2009.
This thesis is available for Library use on the understanding that it is copyright material and that no quotation from the thesis may be published without proper acknowledgement.
I certify that all material in this thesis which is not my own work has been identified and that no material has previously been submitted and approved for the award of a degree by this or any other University.
(signature)

Abstract

In 1974 Random House published a popular and controversial book entitled *Why Your Child is Hyperactive*. The author, San Francisco allergist Ben F. Feingold, claimed that hyperactivity was caused by food additives and was best prevented andtreated with a diet, subsequently dubbed the 'Feingold diet', free of such substances. Reaction to the idea was swift. The media and parents found Feingold's environmentally-based theory intriguing, as it provided an aetiological explanation for hyperactivity that was both sensible and topical. The medical community, in contrast, was suspicious and designed double-blind trials to test his theory. The dominant perception emerging out of these tests was that Feingold's hypothesis was incorrect and, soon after Feingold's death in 1982, medical and media attention faded away.

Drawing on unpublished archival material, medical literature, popular media sources and oral history interviews, this thesis explores the rise and fall of the Feingold diet. It examines the origins of Feingold's idea, the manner in which his theory was disseminated to the medical community and the broader public, and analyses how physicians and patients evaluated whether or not Feingold's hypothesis was correct. Aiming to contribute to the histories of allergy, psychiatry and nutrition, the thesis contends that social factors, rather than scientific testing, were largely responsible for the fate of the Feingold diet. Some of these factors include Feingold's methods and approach to describing and promoting his diet, the professional and economic interests of medical practitioners and the food, chemical and pharmaceutical industries, and the difficulties inherent in following the diet. From a broader historiographical perspective, the history of the Feingold diet suggests that in order to understand how medical controversies are resolved it is essential to analyse the historical context within which they emerge.

Table of Contents

Volume 1

Title Page	1
Abstract	2
Table of Contents	3
Abbreviations 5	
Acknowledgements	7
Chapter 1 Introduction	8
Part I The Origins of the Feingold Diet	50
Chapter 2 The First Hyperactive Children	51
Chapter 3 The Origins of the Feingold Diet According to Dr. Ben F. Feingold	95
Chapter 4 Food Allergy: Witchcraft, Fad or Racket?	130
Part II The Dissemination of the Feingold Diet	163
Chapter 5 From <i>JAMA</i> to the <i>National Inquirer</i> : The Popularisation of the Feingold Diet	164
Chapter 6 Debate, Division and Dissatisfaction: Medical and Popular Responses to Hyperactivity	190
Chapter 7 Concerns about Chemicals: 'Food just isn't what it used to be'	223

Volume 2

Title Page	252
Part III The Reception of the Feingold Diet	253
Chapter 8 The Feingold Diet in the Media	254
Chapter 9 Testing the Feingold Diet	293
Chapter 10 Feingold Families	326
Chapter 11 Conclusion	363
Bibliography Archival Sources	387
Interviews	388
Published Primary Sources	390
Secondary Sources	440

Abbreviations

AAA American Academy of Allergy

AAAAI American Academy of Allergy, Asthma and Immunology

AAP American Academy of Pediatrics

AASA American Association for the Study of Allergy

ACA American College of Allergists

ACSH American Council on Science and Health

ADD Attention-Deficit Disorder

ADHD Attention-Deficit/Hyperactivity Disorder

ADI Allowable Daily Intake

AJP American Journal of Psychiatry

AMA American Medical Association

APA American Psychiatric Association

BBC British Broadcasting Corporation

BHA Butylated Hydroxyanisole

BHT Butylated Hydroxytoluene

BMJ British Medical Journal

BSE British Bovine Spongiform Encephalopathy

CBC Canadian Broadcasting Corporation

CHADD Children and Adults with Attention Deficit/Hyperactivity Disorder

CJD Creutzfeldt-Jakob Disease

CMA California Medical Association

CNN Cable News Network

CSPI Center for Science in the Public Interest

DES Diethylstilbestrol

DSM Diagnostic and Statistical Manual of Disorders

EEG Electroencephalogram

FAUS Feingold Association of the United States

FDA Food and Drug Administration (United States)

FSA Foods Standards Agency (United Kingdom)

IgE Immunoglobulin E

IJSP International Journal of Social Psychiatry

IUD Intrauterine Device

JAACP Journal of the American Academy of Child Psychiatry

JAMA Journal of the American Medical Association

K-P Kaiser-Permanente

LSD Lysergic Acid Diethylamide

MBD Minimal Brain Damage

MBD Minimal Brain Dysfunction

MCS Multiple Chemical Sensitivity

MMR Measles, Mumps and Rubella Vaccine

MSG Monosodium Glutamate

NACHFA National Advisory Committee on Hyperkinesis and Food Additives

NDEA National Defense Education Act

NIH National Institutes of Health

PTA Parent-Teacher Association

PTSD Post Traumatic Stress Disorder

SSAAC Society for the Study of Asthma and Allied Conditions

USDA United States Department of Agriculture

Acknowledgements

As with novel medical hypotheses, the success of a PhD thesis is often directly proportional to the number of debts accrued during its development. This project

would not have been possible without the financial support of the Wellcome Trust and the Social Sciences and Humanities Council of Canada. The Wellcome Trust has also provided me with indispensible training, including its PhD workshops and, especially, its oral history course. I am also grateful for the prizes awarded to me by the Society for the Social History of Medicine and the British Society for the History of Paediatrics and Child Health. Oral history has been a crucial component in myproject and I would like to warmly thank all of my interviewees, as well as the Feingold Association of the United States for connecting me with families who had employed the Feingold did. The staff at the Francis A. Countway Library of Medicine (Harvard University), the Howard Gotlieb Archival Research Center (Boston University), the Archives of the Academy of Allergy, Asthma and Immunology (University of Wisconsin-Milwaukee), the Wellcome Library and the British Library were all helpful and also deserve a great deal of thanks.

I am grateful for the suggestions and advice provided by Gregg Mitman, Rima Apple, Jo Melling and Kate Fisher, all of whom graciously read chapters of my thesis, and I am thankful for the fulsome support of the Centre for Medical History, the Department of History and all of my friends and colleagues at the University of Exeter. I am also most appreciative of Rima Apple and Matthias Reiss for agreeing to form my examination committee. Most of all, Mark Jackson deserves enormous credit forhis encouragement, attention to detail, sharp analytical skills, diligence and humour. I could not imagine a better supervisor.

Finally, I would like to thank my family and friends for giving me the confidence to go back to school one more time. I am forever grateful to Michelle, Mom, Dad, Liz, Jeremy, Addison, Kellan, the Burkes and, of course, Alice. This is for my dad, who taught me about taking risks.