

**AN INVESTIGATION OF THREE GREEK
MATHEMATICS TEACHERS' CONCEPTIONS
OF THE ASSESSMENT OF PUPIL ATTAINMENT
IN MATHEMATICS
AND ITS SOCIO-POLITICAL DIMENSION**

Submitted by Aristides Mouzakitis to the University of Exeter

as a thesis for the degree of

Doctor of Education in Mathematics Education

October 2009

This *thesis* is available for Library use on the understanding that it is copyright material and that no quotation from the thesis may be published without proper acknowledgement.

I certify that all material in this *thesis* which is not my own work has been identified and that no material has previously been submitted and approved for the award of a degree by this or any other University.



.....

..... (signature)

ABSTRACT

The present study is located within a broader problematic of how inequality is generated and legitimated within schools. It has as its centre of focus three Greek mathematics teachers who are seen as mediating forces between state curricular intentions and the learners. Having social justice as my primary motive for conducting this thesis research, I use the critical theoretic research paradigm as a guiding framework in order to investigate the teachers' conceptions of the socio-political dimension of the assessment of pupil attainment in mathematics. Through an analysis of the socio-political role of educational assessment I argue that the investigated issue may be considered as a privileged window that can provide a broad perspective from which I can observe how the participants of this study are positioned with respect to the role of mathematics education in the reproduction of unequal class relations.

To obtain answers to my assessment-related research questions, through a series of interviews I examine the teachers' theoretical positions but in addition to that I observe their classroom cultures in the formation of which they play a protagonistic role. Through the teachers' discourses and their annotated actions, I try to uncover the ways they respond to the contradictions and the dilemmas that might be posed to them by the given educational reality, as well as the tensions they might experience whenever they perceive the incompatibility of what they espouse and what they can achieve.

Moving beyond the cognitive and psychological approaches that characterise most of research literature on teacher beliefs into the realm of ideology critique, I use Fairclough's critical discourse analysis to depict teacher discourses as parts of social practices that are conditioned by social-historical factors and try to show what reproductive effects these discourses can have on social structures, sustaining them or contributing to their transformation.

DEDICATION

To my mother

For her self-sacrificial devotion to my well being

To the memory of my father

From whom I inherited the musical talent, to whom I owe my confidence in my mathematics ability, and who laid the foundations for the growth of my democratic sensitivities and of a critical consciousness

To my wife Alexandra

Who encouraged me to undertake this research project and provided the indispensable emotional environment through our relationship without which it would have been impossible for me to be in a creative mood

To my beloved daughter Helen

Whom I deprived of my active presence in a time very crucial for her development

To all the people who have helped me and stood by me

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I would like to express my deepest appreciation and gratitude to my supervisor Professor Paul Ernest for all the assistance and guidance he has provided to me over the years. In the course of our communications throughout the programme, I have profited immensely from his superb supervision and expertise and I have learned what it means to be a scientific researcher. My thanks also go to my supervisor Professor Nigel Skinner who encouraged me in the final phase of writing the report and played a major role in the final organisation of the thesis.

Four distinguished mathematics educators whose research interests were akin to the topic I was investigating kindly offered to provide a critical analysis of a pilot study that preceded the thesis research. Peter Gates gave particularly encomiastic comments that encouraged me to conduct my thesis research with confidence. Peter Appelbaum also gave encouraging laudatory remarks and provided extensive suggestions on how to conduct my research from a critical point of view. Paul Andrews provided crucial critical remarks of methodological nature that had decisive influence on the favourable outcome of this research project. Finally, Giorgos Philippou, who is knowledgeable of the Greek education system, was also very helpful in bringing up issues of methodological nature for me to consider. I thank them all and I am grateful for their kindly offered assistance. I would also like to thank Elias Daskalakis especially for his valuable insights in our discussions on the ideological part of my analysis and interpretations.

My final thanks are addressed to the teachers who kindly accepted to participate in this study and exposed themselves to the inquisitive eyes and ears of an outsider. Without their willingness to receive me in their classrooms, something unheard of in the local educational contest, and to devote some of their precious time in order to answer my research questions this study would not have been possible.

TABLE OF CONTENTS	Page
ABSTRACT	2
DEDICATION	3
ACKNOWLEDGMENTS	4
CHAPTER ONE – INTRODUCTION	11
1.1 The topic	11
1.2 The setting – The Greek education system and mathematics curriculum	12
1.3 My motivation for conducting the study	15
1.4 An overview of the thesis	20
CHAPTER TWO – LITERATURE REVIEW	22
2.1 Introduction	22
2.2 Discourses on Assessment – The Role and Function of Assessment	22
2.3 Teachers’ beliefs	33
2.4 Review of research literature on teachers’ conceptions of assessment and assessment practices	37
2.4.1 Formative assessment approaches	38
2.4.2 Formative vs. summative assessment	40
2.4.3 High stakes testing	43
2.4.4 Grading	45
2.4.5 Grade retention	48
2.4.6 Views of assessment described in Ernest’s model of educational ideologies	49
2.4.7 Overview of the review – Orientation of the present study	51
CHAPTER THREE – RESEARCH METHODOLOGY	53
3.1 Introduction	53
3.2 The purpose of the study	53
3.2.1 The broad purpose of the study	53

3.2.2 Theoretical framework that informs the research questions - Schools as sites of social and cultural reproduction	54
3.2.3 The research questions	60
3.3 The choice of research paradigm	63
3.4 The case study approach	67
3.5 Data collection methods	68
3.5.1 Interviews	69
3.5.2 Classroom observation	71
3.6 Data collection process	74
3.7 Data analysis	77
3.8 Presentation of the case studies	91
CHAPTER FOUR – CASE STUDY ONE: NIKOS	92
4.1 A few words about Nikos (pseudonym)	92
4.2 Nikos’ view of the mathematics curriculum	92
4.3 Nikos’ conception of tests and high stakes testing	95
4.4 Nikos’ conception of the role and meaning of grades and his criteria for assigning grades	97
4.5 Nikos’ view of grade retention and social promotion	97
4.6 Nikos’ teaching practice and its underlying rationale	100
4.7 The critical interview	106
4.8 A critical analysis of Nikos’ views	107
CHAPTER FIVE – CASE STUDY TWO: ANTONIS	118
5.1 A few words about Antonis (pseudonym)	118
5.2 Antonis’ view of the mathematics curriculum	118
5.3 Antonis’ conception of testing and high stakes testing	119
5.4 Antonis’ conception of the role and meaning of grades and his criteria for	

assigning grades	121
5.5 Antonis' view of grade retention and social promotion	122
5.6 Antonis' teaching practice and its underlying rationale	123
5.7 The critical interview	129
5.8 A critical analysis of Antonis' views	131
CHAPTER SIX – CASE STUDY THREE: GIORGOS	137
6.1 A few words about Giorgos (pseudonym)	137
6.2 Giorgos' view of the mathematics curriculum	137
6.3 Giorgos' view conception of testing and high stakes testing	138
6.4 Giorgos' view conception of the role and meaning of grades and his criteria for assigning grades	140
6.5 Giorgos' view of grade retention and social promotion	140
6.6 Giorgos' teaching practice and rationale	141
6.7 The critical interview	147
6.8 A critical analysis of Giorgos' view	148
CHAPTER SEVEN - SUMMARY OF FINDINGS – TEACHERS' IDEOLOGICAL PROFILES AND FURTHER REFLECTIONS ON THE TEACHERS' IDEOLOGICAL STANDPOINTS	157
7.1 Introduction	157
7.2 Summary of findings and significance in light of literature review	157
7.2.1 Views of mathematics curriculum	157
7.2.2 Purposes and consequences of tests and high stakes testing	158
7.2.3 Meaning and purpose of grades	159
7.2.4 Purposes and consequences of grade retention	159
7.2.5 Teachers' (formative) assessment practices and their underlying rationale	160
7.2.6 Teachers' evaluations of the degree to which they are satisfied with	

the picture they form of their pupils' knowledge of mathematics and their reflections on the results of this evaluation	162
7.2.7 Teachers' evaluations of the action they take to provide differentiated, individualised learning within their classrooms	163
7.3 The teachers' ideological profiles and further reflections on the teachers' ideological standpoints	165
7.3.1 Nikos	165
7.3.1.1 Nikos' ideological profile	165
7.3.1.2 Further reflections on Nikos' ideological standpoint	166
7.3.2 Antonis	170
7.3.2.1 Antonis' ideological profile	170
7.3.2.2 Further reflections on Antonis' ideological standpoint	170
7.3.3 Giorgos	173
7.3.3.1 Nikos' ideological profile	173
7.3.3.2 Further reflections on Nikos' ideological standpoint	173
7.4 A cross sectional analysis of the teachers' ideological perspectives – Similarities and differences	175
CHAPTER EIGHT – FINAL REFLECTIONS ON THE STUDY	181
8.1 Introduction	181
8.2 The trustworthiness of the study	181
8.3 Limitations and weaknesses of the study	185
8.4 Reflections on the study – personal, professional and methodological gains	188
8.5 Suggestions for further research	190
8.6 Concluding remarks	192
APPENDICES	194
BIBLIOGRAPHY	222

LIST OF FIGURES

Figure 1: Problem solved by a pupil on the board without Nikos' intervention	101
Figure 2: Textbook's proof of the angle bisector theorem	103
Figure 3: Example of Giorgos' dialogical style of teaching	142
Figure 4: Example of a problem solving question posed by Giorgos	144
Figure 5: Figure and enunciation of the angle bisector theorem	206
Figure 6: Textbook's proof of the midpoints theorem	208
Figure 7: Example of Antonis' review of old content	209
Figure 8: Antonis – An example of letting a pupil provide correct answer	214
Figure 9: An example of how Giorgos reviews old content	215
Figure 10: An example of Giorgos' finding analogies feedback	218
Figure 11: Giorgos' response to a pupil's irrelevant answer	220

LIST OF TABLES

Table 1: Corfu results in the national mathematics examinations for the academic year 2002-2003 – 11 th Grade	111
Table 2: Overview of the five educational ideologies	197

APPENDICES

Appendix 1: A reference to the Cockcroft report and the Pedagogical Institute's Instructions	194
Appendix 2: Overview of the five educational ideologies	197
Appendix 3: Interview questionnaires	198
Appendix 4: Fairclough's Framework	199
Appendix 5: Thompson's modes of ideology operation	201
Appendix 6: Explanation of codes used in the references to the teachers' texts	204
Appendix 7: Nikos' introduction of new content non geometry examples	205
Appendix 8 Examples of Nikos' questions	206

Appendix 9: Examples of Nikos' feedback	207
Appendix 10: Example of Antonis' review of old content	209
Appendix 1: Examples of Antonis' questions	212
Appendix 12: Examples of Antonis' feedback	213
Appendix 13: An example of how Giorgos reviews old content	215
Appendix 14: Examples of Giorgos' questions	217
Appendix 15: Examples of Giorgos' feedback	219
Appendix 16: Pupil's irrelevant answer	220