

Low-Mass Stars and Brown Dwarfs

Optical/Infrared Photometry and Spectroscopy of Low-Mass Stars and Brown Dwarfs in the Field and Young Clusters

Robert R. King

Submitted by Robert R. King to the University of Exeter as a thesis for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy in Physics, September 2009.

This thesis is available for Library use on the understanding that it is copyright material and that no quotation from the thesis may be published without proper acknowledgement.

I certify that all material in this thesis which is not my own work has been identified and that no material has previously been submitted and approved for the award of a degree by this or any other University.

Signed:
Robert R. King

Date:

Abstract

In this thesis I will present optical and near-infrared photometric and spectroscopic observations of an evolved field brown dwarf binary pair and of populations of low-mass stars in high-mass young stellar clusters and will compare them to stellar and substellar theoretical model predictions.

ϵ Indi Ba, and Bb are the closest known brown dwarfs to the Earth, and, as such, make possible a concerted observational campaign to obtain a complete characterisation of two intermediate-age T dwarfs. Although some recent observations suggest substellar atmospheric and evolutionary models may be inconsistent with observations, there have been few conclusive tests to date. I will present high angular resolution optical, near-infrared, and thermal-infrared imaging and medium-resolution (up to $R \sim 5000$) spectroscopy of these two T dwarfs. Using these data I have derived luminosities of $\log L/L_{\odot} = -4.699 \pm 0.017$ and -5.232 ± 0.020 for ϵ Indi Ba, Bb, respectively, and I will show that the predictions of substellar evolutionary models using luminosity and mass constraints are inconsistent with the effective temperatures and surface gravities derived from fitting atmospheric models to observed spectra. Furthermore, I will show that, even where estimates of the effective temperature, surface gravity, and luminosity are available, estimates of the mass of cool brown dwarfs can be up to a factor of two lower than the measured dynamical mass. Considering the difficulty in assigning accurate ages to any system and the mass-luminosity-age degeneracy of brown dwarfs, I would caution against the over-analysis of predicted brown dwarf masses at this time.

I have also used *Chandra* X-ray observations to identify near-complete and relatively unbiased samples of pre-main-sequence stars in the young stellar clusters NGC 2244 and Trumpler 14. Using optical photometric and spectroscopic observations, I will characterise the apparent age spreads seen in the cluster pre-main-sequences. Mass estimates will then be derived for their stellar populations and used to construct the initial mass function for each cluster. It is found that NGC 2244 appears to have a Salpeter-like IMF for stars in the mass range $0.5\text{--}2.0 M_{\odot}$ if a likely age of 2 Myr is adopted, while Tr 14 may have a top-heavy IMF at a similar age. However, I will show that because the observed slopes of the cluster pre-main-sequences are not well-matched by the predicted slope in colour-magnitude space, such determinations are heavily dependent on the assumed age of the cluster and complicated due to the large spreads in isochronal ages.

Contents

1	Introduction To Low-Mass Stars and Brown Dwarfs	12
1.1	Formation	13
1.1.1	A Little History	13
1.1.2	A Simple Formation Model	14
1.1.3	Brown Dwarfs	17
1.1.4	The Stellar Initial Mass Function	18
1.1.5	Formation Environments	21
1.2	Spectral Classification	23
1.2.1	Modern Spectral Classification	26
1.2.2	The L and T dwarfs	27
1.3	Derivation of Physical Properties	30
1.3.1	Cluster Membership	31
1.3.2	Atmospheric and Evolutionary Models	33
I	Constraining Theoretical Models of Brown Dwarfs	37
2	ϵ Indi Ba, Bb - Observations and Analysis Techniques	38
2.1	Motivation	38
2.2	Observations and Reduction	41
2.2.1	Optical Photometry	41
2.2.2	Near- and Thermal-IR Photometry	41
2.2.3	Image Fitting - PSF Profiles	44
2.2.4	Photometric Variability	47
2.2.5	AO Deep Companion Search	48
2.2.6	Optical Spectroscopy	49
2.2.7	Near-IR Spectroscopy	49
2.2.8	Thermal-IR Spectroscopy	50
2.2.9	Spectral Fitting Routine	51
2.2.10	Photometric Calibration	55
2.3	Spectral Classification	61
2.3.1	Near-IR Spectral Classification	61
2.3.2	Optical Spectral Classification	64

3	ε Indi Ba, Bb - Comparison to Evolutionary and Atmospheric Models	69
3.1	Constraints from ε Indi A	69
3.2	Luminosity Determination	70
3.3	Dynamical Masses	70
3.4	Evolutionary Model Comparisons	71
3.4.1	Photometry	71
3.4.2	Physical Properties	75
3.4.3	Age of the ε Indi System	75
3.5	Atmospheric Model Comparison	77
3.5.1	Effective Temperature Effects	78
3.5.2	Metallicity and Surface Gravity Effects	79
3.5.3	Unidentified Feature at 1.35–1.40 μm	82
3.5.4	Alkali Depletion	84
3.5.5	Lithium	85
3.5.6	Chemical Equilibrium Departures	87
3.6	Mass limits on further system members	89
3.7	Comparison of Model Predictions	89
3.7.1	Previous Determinations	89
3.7.2	Our model predictions	91
3.8	Discussion and Further Work on ε Indi Ba, Bb	92
3.8.1	Conclusions	92
3.8.2	Further work	93
II	Determining Properties of Low-Mass Stars in Clusters	95
4	Observations of Two Young Stellar Clusters	96
4.1	Motivation	96
4.2	Cluster Selection	97
4.2.1	The Carina Nebula - Trumpler 14	97
4.2.2	The Rosette Nebula - NGC 2244	102
4.3	Imaging Observations	104
4.3.1	Photometric Calibration	107
4.4	Cluster Membership	110
4.4.1	X-ray Selection	110
4.4.2	Colour-Magnitude Selection	111
4.5	Multi-Object Spectroscopy	114
4.5.1	Observations	114
4.5.2	Reduction	116
4.6	Spectral Classification	119
4.6.1	The Hammer	121
4.6.2	SPTCLASS	123

4.6.3	Derived Spectral Types	127
5	Initial Mass Functions and	
	Apparent Age Spreads	130
5.1	Removing Extinction Effects	130
5.1.1	Intrinsic Colours	130
5.1.2	Extinctions	131
5.1.3	Extinction-Corrected CMDs	134
5.2	Sample Biases	134
5.2.1	Photometric Completeness	134
5.2.2	X-ray Sample	136
5.3	Theoretical Models	139
5.4	Physical Properties	140
5.4.1	Influence of Age Spreads	140
5.4.2	Apparent Age Spreads in NGC 2244 and Tr 14	143
5.4.3	Stellar Masses	144
5.4.4	Mass Function Estimates	147
5.5	Discussion and Further Work on YSCs	148
5.5.1	Discussion	148
5.5.2	Further Work on Young Stellar Clusters	152
6	Conclusions	155
A	Derived Spectral Types and Photometry	170
B	Full Resolution Spectra of ϵ Indi Ba, Bb	188

List of Figures

1.1	Schematic evolution of a protostar	15
1.2	Schematic of the SFRs in the solar neighbourhood	22
1.3	H α map showing the large-scale structure of local star-forming regions	24
1.4	Optical stellar spectra of O to M class stars	25
1.5	Optical stellar spectra of M class stars	25
1.6	Optical to near-IR spectra of ultracool dwarfs with spectral types L0–T6	28
1.7	Schematic of the local solar neighbourhood	29
2.1	FORS2 <i>VRIz</i> and ISAAC <i>JHKLM</i> images of ϵ Indi Ba, Bb	42
2.2	ISAAC <i>J</i> -band image of the ϵ Indi Ba, Bb and residuals of the fitted profiles	46
2.3	The full 0.6–5.1 μm spectrum of ϵ Indi Ba and Bb	51
2.4	0.6–5.1 μm spectrum of ϵ Indi Ba and Bb with logarithmic flux	51
2.5	Gaussian and Moffat profile fits of an example spectral region	52
2.6	Residuals of the Gaussian and Moffat profile fits to an example spectral region	53
2.7	Our ϵ Indi Ba <i>JHK</i> spectra compared to that of Kasper et al. 2008	53
2.8	Our ϵ Indi Bb <i>JHK</i> spectra compared to that of Kasper et al. 2008	54
2.9	Our ϵ Indi Ba, Bb <i>JHK</i> spectra compared to that of Kasper et al. 2008	56
2.10	Comparison of ISAAC and MKO near-IR filter sets	57
2.11	Direct spectra comparison of ϵ Indi Ba with T spectral standards	62
2.12	Direct spectra comparison of ϵ Indi Bb with T spectral standards	62
2.13	Optical spectra of ϵ Indi Ba and the early T standard spectra	64
2.14	Optical spectra of ϵ Indi Bb and the late T standard spectra	65
2.15	Full resolution 0.63–1.3 μm spectra of ϵ Indi Ba and Bb	66
2.16	Full resolution 1.3–2.0 μm spectra of ϵ Indi Ba and Bb	67
2.17	Full resolution 2.0–5.1 μm spectra of ϵ Indi Ba and Bb	68
3.1	$M_K-(J - K)$ colour-magnitude diagram of T dwarfs	71
3.2	$M_K-(K - L')$ colour-magnitude diagram of T dwarfs	72
3.3	$M_J-(I - J)$ colour-magnitude diagram of T dwarfs	72
3.4	Variation of mass with age at constant luminosity for the COND03 models	76
3.5	Near-IR spectra of ϵ Indi Ba and models with varying metallicity and T_{eff}	77
3.6	Variation of K I lines in ϵ Indi Ba as a function of T_{eff}	78
3.7	Near-IR spectra of ϵ Indi Bb and models with varying metallicity and T_{eff}	79

3.8	Variation of K I lines in ε Indi Bb as a function of T_{eff}	80
3.9	Near-IR spectra of ε Indi Ba and models with varying $\log g$, metallicity and T_{eff}	81
3.10	Near-IR spectra of ε Indi Bb and models with varying $\log g$, metallicity and T_{eff}	82
3.11	Optical to thermal-IR spectra of ε Indi Ba and the best fit model	83
3.12	Optical to thermal-IR spectra of ε Indi Bb and the best fit model	83
3.13	Comparison of observations and models around Li I 6707Å	86
3.14	The 2.27–2.35 μm spectrum of ε Indi Ba showing the CO 2-0 overtone	87
3.15	The L-band spectrum of ε Indi Ba and different chemistry model	89
4.1	Optical mosaic of the Carina Nebula	98
4.2	An $H\alpha$ mosaic of the Rosette Nebula from IPHAS	103
4.3	I -(R - I) colour-magnitudes diagram of NGC 2244	106
4.4	Photometric uncertainty as a function of magnitude for NGC 2244	106
4.5	I -(R - I) colour-magnitudes diagram of Tr 14	107
4.6	Photometric uncertainty as a function of magnitude for Tr 14	108
4.7	Histogram of matches to X-ray positions for NGC 2244	109
4.8	Histogram of matches to X-ray positions for Tr 14	110
4.9	Optical image of NGC 2244 overlaid with the Chandra ACIS-I X-ray image	112
4.10	Optical and Chandra ACIS-I X-ray images of Trumpler 14	112
4.11	$ugriz$ colour-magnitude diagrams for NGC 2244	113
4.12	X-ray objects in the NGC 2244 and Tr 14 CMDs	114
4.13	Photometric selection of X-ray objects in the NGC 2244 and Tr 14	114
4.14	An image of the spectra observed with one Tr 14 slit mask	116
4.15	The measured gradient in the sky background in our VIMOS slit spectroscopy	117
4.16	Optical spectra of a range of spectral types from our sample	118
4.17	The fitted spectral type using The Hammer for full resolution and smoothed spectra	120
4.18	The fitted spectral type using The Hammer for spectra reddened by $A_V=1, 5$	120
4.19	The fitted spectral type using The Hammer SDSS spectra	122
4.20	The fitted spectral type using The Hammer for SDSS spectra reddened by $A_V=1, 5$	122
4.21	The fitted spectral type using SPTCLASS-LATE for full res. and smoothed spectra	124
4.22	The fitted spectral type using SPTCLASS-LATE for reddened spectra	124
4.23	The fitted spectral type using SPTCLASS-LATE for SDSS spectra with $A_V=0, 5$	125
4.24	The fitted spectral type using SPTCLASS-GTYPE for full res. and smoothed spectra	126
4.25	The fitted spectral type from SPTCLASS-GTYPE for reddened spectra	126
4.26	The fitted spectral type using SPTCLASS-HAEBE for full res. and smoothed spectra	127
4.27	The fitted spectral type using SPTCLASS-HAEBE for reddened spectra	128
4.28	The median known spectral type for each derived spectral type	128
5.1	The intrinsic SDSS ($r - i$) colour for different spectral types	131
5.2	The intrinsic Cousins ($R - I$) colour for different spectral type	132
5.3	The extinction distribution observed in NGC 2244 and Tr 14	133
5.4	The extinction as a function of derived spectral type in NGC 2244 and Tr 14	134

5.5	CMDs of Tr 14 and NGC 2244 with MOS objects dereddened	135
5.6	CMDs of Tr 14 and NGC 2244 with all objects dereddened	135
5.7	The number of detected sources as a function of magnitude in NGC 2244	137
5.8	PMS completeness limits as a function of <i>I</i> -band magnitude	138
5.9	CMD of NGC 2244 with dereddened objects and isochrones	140
5.10	CMD of Tr 14 with dereddened objects and isochrones	141
5.11	<i>I</i> -band luminosity functions of NGC 2244 and Tr 14	145
5.12	Relation between mass and the <i>I</i> -band magnitude	146
5.13	The mass function of NGC 2244 derived from a 2 Myr and a 5 Myr isochrone	149
5.14	The mass function of Tr 14 derived from a 2 Myr and a 5 Myr isochrone	150
B.1	The full resolution ε Indi Ba, Bb spectra from 0.63–0.85 μm	189
B.2	The full resolution ε Indi Ba, Bb spectra from 0.63–0.85 μm	190
B.3	The full resolution ε Indi Ba, Bb spectra from 0.80–1.00 μm	191
B.4	The full resolution ε Indi Ba, Bb spectra from 1.00–1.165 μm	192
B.5	The full resolution ε Indi Ba, Bb spectra from 1.15–1.31 μm	193
B.6	The full resolution ε Indi Ba, Bb spectra from 1.30–1.465 μm	194
B.7	The full resolution ε Indi Ba, Bb spectra from 1.45–1.615 μm	195
B.8	The full resolution ε Indi Ba, Bb spectra from 1.60–1.765 μm	196
B.9	The full resolution ε Indi Ba, Bb spectra from 1.75–1.925 μm	197
B.10	The full resolution ε Indi Ba, Bb spectra from 1.95–2.065 μm	198
B.11	The full resolution ε Indi Ba, Bb spectra from 2.05–2.205 μm	199
B.12	The full resolution ε Indi Ba, Bb spectra from 2.20–2.36 μm	200
B.13	The full resolution ε Indi Ba, Bb spectra from 2.80–4.20 μm	201
B.14	The full resolution ε Indi Ba, Bb spectra from 4.5–5.1 μm	202

List of Tables

2.1	The flux ratio (Ba/Bb) of ε Indi Ba, Bb in the observed FORS2 and ISAAC filters	43
2.2	The derived apparent magnitudes of ε Indi Ba, Bb	43
2.3	The I -band magnitudes adopted for the combined ε Indi Ba, Bb system	47
2.4	2MASS magnitudes adopted for ε Indi Ba, Bb in different studies	48
2.5	Near-IR spectral indices and classifications for ε Indi Ba,	60
2.6	Optical spectral indices and classifications for ε Indi Ba, Bb	63
3.1	Derived physical parameters of ε Indi Ba, Bb at 1, 5, and 10 Gyr	74
3.2	Predicted physical parameters of ε Indi Ba and Bb at 3.6–4.2 Gyr	75
4.1	The distance, age, and R_V for Trumpler 14	101
4.2	Distance and age for NGC 2244	105
4.3	The fraction of false detections expected in our match to the X-ray positions	110
4.4	The mean true spectral type for each derived type from <i>The Hammer</i>	123
5.1	The derived mass function slope for NGC 2244 and Tr 14	148
A.1	The derived spectral types for each X-ray source in NGC 2244.	170
A.2	The derived spectral types for each X-ray source in Tr 14.	179

Declaration

Chapters 2 and 3 are drawn from a paper published in *Astronomy & Astrophysics* by King, R. R., McCaughrean, M. J., Homeier, D., Allard, F., Scholz, R.-D., and Lodieu, N (A&A 2010, 510, A99). The grid of atmospheric models against which we compared our observations was produced by Derek Homeier. The rest of the work presented is my own.

Chapters 4 and 5 contain work which will be published in the near future in collaboration with McCaughrean, M. J., Townsley, L., and Feigelson, E., but the work presented here is my own.

Acknowledgements

There are many people who deserve some thanks for helping me through the past four years and especially through this past year.

Firstly, Mark McCaughrean for four years of supervision and starting me out on two very interesting projects. Hopefully some of the L^AT_EX pedantry has rubbed off. If not, this may be a good place to stop reading. Thanks also go to Tim Naylor for statistical and photometry advice as well as a more interesting first observing run than intended. Cameron Bell and Tim have provided invaluable assistance and discussion on the various theoretical models of young stars.

I have made use of NSO/Kitt Peak FTS data, produced by NSF/NOAO, and the SpeX Prism Spectral Libraries, maintained by Adam Burgasser¹ and I would like to thank Adam Burgasser, Mark Marley, Davy Kirkpatrick, and Sandy Leggett for useful discussion and Isabelle Baraffe for supplying the grid of brown dwarf evolutionary models.

Eric Saunders and Nathan Mayne deserve special thanks for general advice, distracting conversations, communal moaning, and reasonable gibberish. I wish to specifically recall Eric's advice that 'you can either worry about things, or not, but they tend to get done either way' - I have not always agreed. My family have helped me a lot even though I live far away in a foreign land. Finally and most importantly, thanks to Jen for enjoying the ups with me and helping me through the downs.

RRK
Exeter, U.K.
September 2009

¹<http://www.browndwarfs.org/spexprism>