FUTURE SECONDARY SCHOOLS FOR DIVERSITY: WHERE ARE WE NOW, AND WHERE COULD WE BE?

A “futures thinking” approach to planning for diversity and inclusion, informed by an investigation of the current over-representation of secondary aged students in special schools in England.

Submitted by Alison Elizabeth Black to the University of Exeter as a thesis for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy in Education in December 2012

This thesis is available for Library use on the understanding that it is copyright material and that no quotation from the thesis may be published without proper acknowledgement.

I certify that all material in this thesis which is not my own work has been identified and that no material has previously been submitted and approved for the award of a degree by this or any other University.

Signature: ..........................................................
Abstract

In 2011, 65% of the 76,900 pupils aged between 5 and 16 in special schools in England were of secondary age. When this population is broken down further, a constant rise in pupil numbers is seen; from just under 3,500 pupils at age 5, to more than 10,000 at age 15, with a large leap in numbers between the ages 10 and 11. This thesis views these patterns as demonstrations of disproportionality and as indications that inclusion in mainstream secondary schools is not being achieved.

The thesis fills a gap in the literature exemplified by the paucity of studies on this phenomenon. It is distinctive in not only exploring a problem and then suggesting ways of overcoming it, it also tests these suggestions. The thesis is in two parts, the first is a standard empirical enquiry, using a survey methodology, the second uses futures studies methodologies and evaluation techniques to create and develop a vignette of a future school that successfully includes those children currently placed in special schools.

A critical realist perspective is adopted, acknowledging that explanations are contingent and influenced by personal experience and bias (at the level of researcher and participants). Hence a range of stakeholder views are sought, along with the involvement of groups of practitioners and experts in the refinement of a vignette of a future school. The thesis employs a mixed methods approach, in order to base findings on as many sources as possible. It also involves a futures thinking aspect, in the design of a preferable, transforming, normative image of a future education system.

In part one explanations about why the phenomenon of over-representation occur are sought through a literature review, then a questionnaire of key stakeholders (those involved in school placement decisions). Factors that are commented on most frequently are school level factors and within child factors. These findings point to limitations of current models used to understand disability and special educational needs, the thesis posits that an extended multi-dimensional model is needed, and suggests a number of existing models that could be developed.

In part two a vignette of a future school is created by considering how problems and issues raised in part one of the study could be circumvented. This vignette is evaluated by experts who have experiential and theoretical knowledge of the field of special educational needs and inclusion. The evaluation contributes to the further refinement of the vignette.

This thesis highlights the unexplored phenomenon of secondary over-representation in special schools in England and presents an in-depth analysis of the reasons that stakeholders give to explain this over-representation. Uniquely, this analysis is then translated into an imaginary design of a possible future inclusive school, the evaluation of which in turn highlights some of the persistent issues about the purposes and design of schools in a diverse society.
## List of Contents

**Chapter 1.** Introduction.................................................................................................................. 12

**Chapter 2.** Review of the Literature.............................................................................................. 20

  **Section 2.01** Introduction............................................................................................................. 20

  **Section 2.02** The concepts of diversity and inclusion ................................................................. 21

    2.02(a) Diversity of student population ......................................................................................... 21

    2.02(b) Inclusion as a response to diversity ................................................................................. 23

    2.02(c) Problems of inclusion ...................................................................................................... 29

  **Section 2.03** The over-representation of certain groups in segregated settings .................... 32

    2.03(a) Disproportionality of age in special schools ................................................................. 33

    2.03(b) Possible causes .................................................................................................................. 36

  **Section 2.04** Summary of part one of the literature review ..................................................... 40

  **Section 2.05** Introduction............................................................................................................. 41

  **Section 2.06** The study of the future ........................................................................................... 42

  **Section 2.07** Futures in Education ............................................................................................... 46

    2.07(a) National and international “futures of education” projects ............................................ 48

    2.07(b) The policy led approach to futures thinking ................................................................. 57

    2.07(c) The philosophical approach to futures thinking ............................................................ 57

  **Section 2.08** Futures of inclusion ................................................................................................. 62

    2.08(a) Key aims, questions and methods used ............................................................................ 63

    2.08(b) An “inclusive school” ......................................................................................................... 67

  **Section 2.09** Futures in Special Education .................................................................................. 82

    2.09(a) Process, methods and outcomes ....................................................................................... 82

    2.09(b) A future for special schools ............................................................................................... 83

  **Section 2.10** Critique of futures studies ..................................................................................... 85

  **Section 2.11** Summary of part two of the literature review ..................................................... 86

  **Section 2.12** Chapter summary .................................................................................................. 87

**Chapter 3.** Methodology to explore the over-representation of secondary aged children in special schools........................................................................................................... 89

  **Section 3.01** Introduction.............................................................................................................. 89

  **Section 3.02** Philosophical location of the study ........................................................................ 89

  **Section 3.03** Research aims and questions .................................................................................. 93

    3.03(a) Explaining the phenomenon of over-representation – the place of theory ............ 94

  **Section 3.04** Methods and tools used .......................................................................................... 96

  **Section 3.05** Data collection .......................................................................................................... 99

    3.05(a) Expert interviews – the pilot study ..................................................................................... 99
Chapter 4

Presentation and analysis of findings: Why does the situation exist as it does?

Section 4.01 Introduction

Section 4.02 Research Question 1

4.02(a) School level factors

4.02(b) Within child factors

4.02(c) Resources

4.02(d) Voice/choice

4.02(e) Process

4.02(f) Parental preference

4.02(g) Relationships

4.02(h) Exosystem

4.02(i) Chronosystem

4.02(j) Peers

4.02(k) Outcomes of mainstream

4.02(l) Appropriateness

4.02(m) Safety

Section 4.03 Research question 2

4.03(a) School level factors

4.03(b) Within child factors

4.03(c) Resources

4.03(d) Voice/choice

4.03(e) Parental preference

4.03(f) Processes

4.03(g) Relationships

4.03(h) Exosystem
Chapter 6. The creation, development and evaluation of the future school vignette. .. 231
   6.01(a) Introduction .................................................. 231
   Section 6.02 The methodology of futures studies .................. 232
   Section 6.03 Categorising this study ................................ 233
      6.03(a) Location of the study in the “5 p’s and a q” typology .... 234
      6.03(b) Use of the term “scenario” .................................. 234
      6.03(c) Types of alternative futures ................................. 236
Section 8.03  “Measuring” inclusion........................................................................................................... 272
8.03(a)  Achieving the presence and participation of all students......................................................... 272
8.03(b)  Achieving change at the level of society ................................................................................. 276
8.03(c)  Inclusion as a process................................................................................................................. 277
8.03(d)  Can inclusion be measured? ....................................................................................................... 277
Section 8.04  Theoretical aspects arising from the evaluation............................................................... 279
8.04(a)  “Idealistic and utopian” ............................................................................................................... 279
8.04(b)  Tensions, dilemmas and conundrums.......................................................................................... 283
Section 8.05  Summary ............................................................................................................................ 286
Chapter 9.  Conclusion ............................................................................................................................. 287
Section 9.01  Introduction.......................................................................................................................... 287
Section 9.02  An unexplored phenomenon .............................................................................................. 287
Section 9.03  “The big picture” – a holistic account ............................................................................ 287
Section 9.04  The contribution to knowledge ......................................................................................... 288
  9.04(a)  Contribution to theoretical knowledge....................................................................................... 288
  9.04(b)  Contribution to methodological knowledge.............................................................................. 289
Section 9.05  The implications of the findings ......................................................................................... 290
  9.05(a)  Implications for policy and practice.......................................................................................... 290
  9.05(b)  Implications for future research............................................................................................... 293
  9.05(c)  Concluding thoughts ................................................................................................................ 295
List of Appendices

Appendix 1  Additional investigation: are population patterns the same for each type of primary need? ................................................................. 312-315
Appendix 2  Consent form for expert interviews ......................................................... 316
Appendix 3  Invitation email .................................................................................. 317
Appendix 4  Briefing email prior to face to face interview ........................................ 317
Appendix 5  Semi-structured interview schedule (and additional questions posed) .... 318-319
Appendix 6  Emailed interview schedule .................................................................. 320-322
Appendix 7  Sampling frame process ........................................................................ 323
Appendix 8  Invitation to questionnaire ..................................................................... 324
Appendix 9  Non-response request email ................................................................. 324
Appendix 10 The questionnaire .................................................................................. 325-336
Appendix 11 Ethical approval for part 1 ................................................................. 337-342
Appendix 12 Generating initial codes ....................................................................... 343
Appendix 13 Table showing descriptive statistics................................................... 345
Appendix 14 Table showing cross-tabulations .......................................................... 346-352
Appendix 15 Comparison of proportion of total codes made by each stakeholder group ........................................................................... 353
Appendix 16 Abstracts as appeared in conference booklets ..................................... 354-355
Appendix 17 Invitation letter to the SEN Policy Options Steering Group .............. 357-359
Appendix 18 Examples demonstrating the creation of the vignette ....................... 359-360
Appendix 19 Ensuring traceability and transparency of the vignette ..................... 361-364
Appendix 20 Focus group “ground rules” ................................................................. 365
Appendix 21 Ethical approval for Part 2 ................................................................. 366-370
Appendix 22 Strengths, Weaknesses, Opportunities and Threats framework .......... 371-372
Appendix 23 Thematic analysis of focus group discussions ................................... 373-375
Appendix 24 Iterations of future school vignette .................................................... 376-389
Appendix 25 The final future school vignette .......................................................... 390-393
Appendix 26 Exploration of themes raised in analysis of focus group discussions ..... 394-405
List of Figures:

Figure 1.1: A comparison of the percentage of pupils of primary and secondary age in special schools in England, 2006 – 2011 (Based on data from Department for Education, 2010, 2011a) ................................................................. 13

Figure 1.2: Pupil numbers by age in special schools in England 2011 (Based on data from Department for Education, 2011a) ........................................................................................................ 14

Figure 1.3: Pupil numbers by age in special schools, longitudinal sample (pupils aged 15, August 2010) (Based on data from Department for Children Schools and Families, 2007, 2008, 2009a; Department for Education, 2010, 2011a; Department for Education and Skills, 2003b, 2004a, 2005, 2006b) .................................................................................................................. 14

Figure 2.1: Visual representation of part one of literature review ......................................................... 21

Figure 2.2: Visual representation of part two of literature review ......................................................... 41

Figure 2.3: The spectrum of futures studies adapted from Hicks (1998) and Slaughter (1993) 44

Figure 2.4: Stages of scenario creation and headings of vision statements (Norwich, 2007, p. 75) .................................................................................................................................................. 65

Figure 3.1: Spectrum of inquiry paradigms (Moon, Dillon and Sprenkle, 1991, p. 173) ....................... 89

Figure 3.2: Abductive reasoning (Wheeldon & Ahlberg, 2011, p. 117) ............................................... 95

Figure 3.3 Stages of study ....................................................................................................................... 98

Figure 4.1: Total themes when sources are combined (Source 1: case study questions, source 2, 4 reasons question) ................................................................................................................................. 121

Figure 4.2: A breakdown of the subthemes and factors of the “School level factors” theme. 122

Figure 4.3: A breakdown of the subthemes and factors of the “within child factors” theme. 134

Figure 4.4: A breakdown of the subthemes and factors of the “resources” theme .............................. 142

Figure 4.5: A breakdown of the subthemes and factors of the “voice/choice factors” theme 147

Figure 4.6: 100% stacked bar chart comparing role and level of explanation selected ........... 181

Figure 4.7: 100% stacked bar chart comparing role and level of explanation selected ........... 182

Figure 4.8: 100% stacked bar chart comparing role and level of explanation selected ........... 183

Figure 4.9: 100% stacked bar chart comparing role and level of explanation selected ........... 183

Figure 4.10: 100% stacked bar chart comparing role and level of explanation selected ........... 184

Figure 4.11: 100% stacked bar chart comparing role and level of explanation selected ........... 185

Figure 4.12: 100% stacked bar chart comparing role and level of explanation selected ........... 186

Figure 4.13: 100% stacked bar chart comparing role and level of explanation selected ........... 187

Figure 4.14: 100% stacked bar chart comparing role and level of explanation selected ........... 189

Figure 4.15: 100% stacked bar chart comparing role and level of explanation selected ........... 190

Figure 4.16: 100% stacked bar chart comparing role and level of explanation selected ........... 191

Figure 4.17: 100% stacked bar chart comparing role and level of explanation selected ........... 192

Figure 4.18: 100% stacked bar chart comparing role and level of explanation selected ........... 193

Figure 4.19: 100% stacked bar chart comparing role and level of explanation selected ........... 194

Figure 4.20: 100% stacked bar chart comparing role and level of explanation selected ........... 195

Figure 4.21: 100% stacked bar chart comparing role and level of explanation selected ........... 196

Figure 5.1: Bronfenbrenner: ecological theory of child development (Santrock, 2007, p. 51) 216

Figure 6.1: Scenario typology (Börjeson et al., 2006) ..................................................................... 236
List of Tables:

Table 1.1 Thesis layout, showing separate parts .......................................................... 18
Table 2.1: Six areas that explain ethnic disproportionality in special education (Lindsay et al., 2006) ............................................................... 37
Table 2.2: Details of “futures of education” projects examined in this review ............ 48
Table 3.1 Qualitative and quantitative aspects of the research questions. .................... 97
Table 3.2 Data gathering and sample size .................................................................. 99
Table 3.3 Phases of thematic analysis (based on Braun and Clarke, (2006, p. 87)) .... 108
Table 3.4: Purpose of mixed methods research, their use in this thesis (adapted from Bryman, 2008). ................................................................................. 112
Table 4.1: abbreviations used .................................................................................. 118
Table 4.2: themes arising from coding of two sources, in order of number of times coded ... 120
Table 5.1: Percentage of comments related to themes emerging from analysis .......... 201
Table 5.2: Responses to questionnaire that discuss barriers to secondary schools and incentives to special schools ........................................................................... 218
Table 6.1: Marien’s (2002) 6 categories of futures thinking, supplemented with other commentators’ definitions ................................................................. 233
Table 6.2: “Future school for diversity” vignette, development and evaluation .......... 239
Table 6.3: Adapted from Kosow and Gaßner (2008) ...................................................... 241
Table 7.1: Section headings for summary of emerging themes ..................................... 248
Table 7.2: Excerpt from vignette, showing aspects relevant to role of parents, and modifications made................................................................. 249
Table 7.3: Excerpt from vignette, showing aspects relevant to curriculum content and pedagogy, and modifications made ................................................. 251
Table 7.4: Excerpt from vignette, showing aspects relevant to the location of learning, and modifications made................................................................. 253
Table 7.5: Excerpt from vignette, showing aspects relevant to school size. ............... 254
Table 7.6: Excerpt from vignette, showing aspects relevant to who attend this school, and modifications made................................................................. 255
Table 7.7: Excerpt from vignette, showing aspects relevant to funding, and modifications made............................................................................................... 257
Table 7.8: Excerpt from vignette, showing aspects relevant to staff training, and modifications made.................................................................................. 258
Table 7.9: Excerpt from vignette, showing aspects relevant to school leadership, and modifications made................................................................. 259
Table 7.10: Excerpt from vignette, showing aspects relevant to the location of specialist support, and modifications made ........................................................................... 261
Table 8.1: Traditionalists’ depictions of supporters of inclusion (from Brantlinger 1997, p. 437) ...................................................................................... 280