### **Financial Market Evaluation of Firms Greenhouse Gas Emissions**

Submitted by Shan Hua to the University of Exeter as a thesis for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy in Finance in February 2013
This thesis is available for Library use on the understanding that it is copyright material and that no quotation from the thesis may be published without proper acknowledgement.
I certify that all material in this thesis which is not my own work has been

identified and that no material has previously been submitted and approved for

the award of a degree by this or any other University.

### **ABSTRACT**

Climate change has been influenced more by human activities now than previously. These influences are largely attributed to industries, whose activities can potentially produce enormous amounts of carbon dioxide and other greenhouse gases, and exacerbate the speed of climate change.

This thesis examines how the financial markets evaluate corporations' greenhouse gas emission performance. We consider various emission criteria, and distinguish between the better and worse performers in different emission policy regimes, including the US, the UK and the rest of the EU. The investigations have been conducted at three stages, presented in chapter 3, 4 and 5.

Firstly, in chapter 3 we examine the carbon effects at the portfolio-level, where total return indices are our main concern. By adopting the long-short strategy, we report that investors in the UK and EU markets, can make an arbitrage profit at the lower cut-off levels, when applying various carbon screening policies and forming equally-weighted portfolios. However, no such profit opportunities can be achieved in the US market. We further consider the reason for such arbitrage opportunities, which is the link between corporate governance/management efficiency and different levels of carbon constraint.

Secondly, in chapter 4, the carbon effects are investigated at firm-level, where firms' financial market values act as the dependent variable. Our regression models are based on the Ohlson framework, which considers firms' financial market value in relation to its accounting performance, and the 'other information', which in our case is the carbon emission performance. We find a significant relationship between the US firms' values and their carbon emission performances; however, this relationship has been weakened for UK companies, and in fact becomes even unreliable for EU companies. Further, in order to explore the reason for this relationship, we have focused on energy efficiency and firms' reputation that are associated with carbon reduction activities. The scale effects have also been discussed in this chapter, as the various deflators are adopted.

Finally, in chapter 5, again at firm-level, cash flow expectation and cost of capital have been considered to possibly be the source that drives firms' value.

Cash flow expectation is measured at the short-, medium- and long- term, by profitability, earnings growth, and residual income growth rate, respectively. Two portfolios for each target parameters are constructed according to different carbon screening criteria at different cut-off levels, the differences between each pair of portfolios are then calculated and tested for significance. A subsample regression, which is based on the observations available from analysts' earnings forecast, has been conducted for each of the three regimes. After matching the portfolio and regression results, we report that the implied cost of equity is only reduced for the less carbon emission firms, in regimes where more stringent carbon constraints are applied; whereas in regimes where less stringent carbon constraints exist, the less carbon emission firms have not gained any advantage through their implied cost of equity. Also, cash flow expectations indicate diverse outcomes for different time horizon and regimes.

Furthermore, various market participants, such as governments, investors, distributors and clients etc, who could possibly influence firms' carbon behaviour, have also been considered in association with their roles in reducing greenhouse gas emissions. Our work contributes to the existing literature through a wide ranging examination of major financial evaluation methods relating to emerging carbon emission issues.

**Keyword:** Greenhouse gases (GHGs), Carbon emissions, Climate change, Firm valuations, Portfolio analysis, Cost of capital

### **ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS**

It would not have been possible to write this doctoral thesis without the help and support of the kind people around me, to only some of whom it is possible to give particular mention here.

First of all, I wish to express my sincere thanks to my supervisors; foremost among them is Prof. Alan Gregory. I have benefited not only from his invaluable guidance, suggestions, comments and references, but also from his encouragement and trust. I wish to thank my supervisors Julie Whittaker and Rajesh Tharyan, whose advice has always been enlightening. I have appreciated enormously their enthusiasm directed towards this research. I want to place on record my gratitude also to Paul Cox for his help in the early stages of this work.

I am grateful to the Trucost Company, provider of the emission data, for untiring commitment to this research and whose staffs' practical advice has always been invaluable throughout.

I would like to acknowledge the financial, academic and technical support of the School of Business, University of Exeter, from its staff, in providing me with all the necessary facilities over the last four years, to help ensure the completion of this work.

I owe a huge gratitude to my proofreaders Joseph Harvey and Dr Vivian Trewin, for their exceptional service in proofreading my manuscript and their constant encouragement.

I am indebted to my parents for their great understanding and kind consideration at a very challenging time in my career. Last but not least, I should not fall to express my immense thanks to all my friends for their ingenuity and unselfish contribution to this work and the continued motivation they have provided.

## **Contents**

ABSTRACT	2
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS	4
Chapter 1 Theoretical Concepts	17
1.1 Development of corporate social responsibility	17
1.2 Measurement of corporate environmental performance and corporate	
performance	
1.3 Structure	
Chapter 2 Motivations	
2.1 International Climate Change Policy	
2.2 Governments' Response	
2.2.1 EU Emission Trading Scheme (ETS)	
2.2.2 USEPA and Chicago Climate Exchange (CCX)	
2.2.3 UK Climate Change Levy (CCL)	
2.3 Influences on Corporations	
2.3.1 Abatement Costs	
2.3.2 Potential Benefits	33
2.4 Stakeholder vs Shareholder	36
References	40
Chapter 3 Portfolio Based Financial Market Evaluation	48
3.1 Introduction	48
3.2 Evidence of SRI performance	52
3.2.1 US SRI Performance	52
3.2.2 EU excluding UK SRI Performance	57
3.2.3 UK SRI Performance	60
3.2.4 Implication of Climate Changing Policy at Portfolio-Level	63
3.3 General Methodology Review	65
3.3.1 Jensen's alphas, Sharpe ratio and Treynor ratio	65
3.3.2 Capital Asset Pricing Model (CAPM) Framework	68
3.3.3 Fama-French Three Factors Model (FF3F) Framework	69
3.3.4 Carhart Four Factors Model (CH4F) Framework	69
3.4 Data and Methodology Description	71
3.4.1 Methodology	71
3.4.2 Corporate Environmental Data	75
3.4.3 Corporate Financial Data	77
3.4.4 Diversification and screening policy	78

	3.4.5 Construction of Portfolios	80
	3.5 Empirical Implementation	83
	3.5.1 US	84
	3.5.2 UK	90
	3.5.3 EU excluding UK	96
	3.6 Conclusion	. 100
	3.7 Discussion	. 102
Re	eferences	. 104
Cr	apter 4 Firm- Level Financial Market Evaluations	. 209
	4.1 Introduction	. 209
	4.2 Theoretical Background	. 213
	4.2.1 Accounting-Based Earnings' Performance Measures	. 214
	4.2.2 Market-Based Performance Measures	. 216
	4.2.3 Ohlson model	. 219
	4.3 Data description	. 220
	4.3.1 Corporate Financial Performance Data	. 220
	4.3.2 Corporate Environmental Performance Data	. 221
	4.4 Methodology	. 223
	4.4.1 Ohlson Framework	. 223
	4.4.2 Scale Effects	. 238
	4.4.3 Various Tests	. 242
	4.4.4 Summary	. 246
	4.5 Empirical Implementation	. 246
	4.5.1 US	. 247
	4.5.2 UK	. 252
	4.5.3 EU excluding UK	. 258
	4.5.4 EU including UK	. 265
	4.6 Conclusion	. 265
	4.7 Discussion	. 267
Re	eferences	. 270
Cr	apter 5 Implied Cost of Equity (ICC) and Cash Flow Expectation	. 392
	5.1 Introduction	. 392
	5.2 Literature Review	. 394
	5.2.1 Implied Cost of Capital	. 395
	5.2.2 Implied Long-Run Growth Rate	. 400

	5.3 Methodology	401
	5.3.1 Residual Income Model and its Variants	402
	5.3.2 Portfolio Analysis	408
	5.3.3 Regression Analysis	409
	5.4 Data description	410
	5.4.1 Corporate Financial Performance Data	410
	5.4.2 Corporate Environmental Performance Data	413
	5.4.3 Data Used in Subsample Regressions	414
	5.5 Empirical Implementation	414
	5.5.1 Empirical Test for the US	415
	5.5.2 Empirical Test for the UK	420
	5.5.3 Empirical Test for the EU excluding UK	425
	5.6 Discussion and Conclusion	429
R	References	434
С	hapter 6 Carbon Prospects	486
	6.1 The Conclusion	486
	6.2 The Role of Different Market Participants	487
	6.3 Carbon Future	488
R	References	491
Α	PPENDICES	493
	Appendix 1 DataStream Level 3 industry classification code (INDM3)	493
	Appendix 2 Kenneth R. French 17-industry classification based on SIC code (SICCLASS)	494
	Appendix 3 DataStream Variables Definition	495
	Appendix 4 COMPUSTAT Variables Definition	496
	Appendix 5 Derived procedure of the weighted average Ohlson model	500
	Appendix 6 Share Number Definitions	501
	Appendix 7 Carbon Disclosure Project (CDP)	502
	Appendix 8 Trucost Methodology for Supply Chain Estimation	503
	Appendix 9 Environmentally Extended Input output (EEIO) Modelling	504
	Appendix 10 Trucost Products and Applications	505
	Appendix 11 Other Environmental Databases	506
	Appendix 12 Greenhouse Gas Protocol (GHGP)	507
	Appendix 13 Example of All GHGs Category	509
	Appendix 14 Example of Four Criteria Calculation	510

Appendix 15 (	Chichago Climate Exchange (Dec 2003 to Dec 2010)	512
Appendix 16	Supporting arguments for not using Tobin's Q	512
GLOSSARY		513

# List of Figures

Figure 2-1Relationship between each party reacting to climate changing policy	25
Figure 2-2 schematic presentation of this neoclassical view of the firm in society	37
Figure 2-3 schematic presentation of this socio-economic view of the firm in society	/ 37
List of Chapter 3 Tables	
Table 3-1-1 Summary Number of Companies for Each Market	109
Table 3-1-2 Summary Correlation between Environment/Carbon Information, US	109
Table 3-1-3 Summary Correlation between Environment/Carbon Information, UK	109
Table 3-1-4 Summary Correlation between Environment/Carbon Information, EU	110
Table 3-2-1 Summary Environment/Carbon Information, US	110
Table 3-2-2 Summary Environment/Carbon Information, UK	111
Table 3-2-3 Summary Environment/Carbon Information, EU	111
Table 3-3-1 Portfolio Return Regressions on US IP, 10% cut-off	112
Table 3-3-2 Portfolio Return Regressions on US IP, 20% cut-off	114
Table 3-3-3 Portfolio Return Regressions on US IP, 30% cut-off	116
Table 3-3-4 Portfolio Return Regressions on US IP, 50% cut-off	118
Table 3-3-5 Portfolio Return Regressions on US FF, 10% cut-off	120
Table 3-3-6 Portfolio Return Regressions on US FF, 20% cut-off	122
Table 3-3-7 Portfolio Return Regressions on US FF, 30% cut-off	124
Table 3-3-8 Portfolio Return Regressions on US FF, 50% cut-off	126
Table 3-3-9 Portfolio Return Regressions on US DF, 10% cut-off	128
Table 3-3-10 Portfolio Return Regressions on US DF, 20% cut-off	130
Table 3-3-11 Portfolio Return Regressions on US DF, 30% cut-off	132
Table 3-3-12 Portfolio Return Regressions on US DF, 50% cut-off	134
Table 3-3-13 Portfolio Return Regressions on US CF, 10% cut-off	136
Table 3-3-14 Portfolio Return Regressions on US CF, 20% cut-off	138
Table 3-3-15 Portfolio Return Regressions on US CF, 30% cut-off	140
Table 3-3-16 Portfolio Return Regressions on US CF, 50% cut-off	142

Table 3-4-1 Portfolio Return Regressions on UK IP, 10% cut-off1	L45
Table 3-4-2 Portfolio Return Regressions on UK IP, 20% cut-off1	L <b>47</b>
Table 3-4-3 Portfolio Return Regressions on UK IP, 30% cut-off1	L49
Table 3-4-4 Portfolio Return Regressions on UK IP, 50% cut-off1	l <b>51</b>
Table 3-4-5 Portfolio Return Regressions on UK FF, 10% cut-off	L53
Table 3-4-6 Portfolio Return Regressions on UK FF, 20% cut-off1	L <b>5</b> 5
Table 3-4-7 Portfolio Return Regressions on UK FF, 30% cut-off1	L <b>57</b>
Table 3-4-8 Portfolio Return Regressions on UK FF, 50% cut-off1	L <b>5</b> 9
Table 3-4-9 Portfolio Return Regressions on UK DF, 10% cut-off	l <b>61</b>
Table 3-4-10 Portfolio Return Regressions on UK DF, 20% cut-off1	L <b>63</b>
Table 3-4-11 Portfolio Return Regressions on UK DF, 30% cut-off1	L <b>65</b>
Table 3-4-12 Portfolio Return Regressions on UK DF, 50% cut-off1	L <b>67</b>
Table 3-4-13 Portfolio Return Regressions on UK CF, 10% cut-off1	L <b>69</b>
Table 3-4-14 Portfolio Return Regressions on UK CF, 20% cut-off1	L <b>71</b>
Table 3-4-15 Portfolio Return Regressions on UK CF, 30% cut-off1	L <b>73</b>
Table 3-4-16 Portfolio Return Regressions on UK CF, 50% cut-off1	L <b>7</b> 5
Table 3-5-1 Portfolio Return Regressions on EX IP, 10% cut-off	L77
Table 3-5-2 Portfolio Return Regressions on EX IP, 20% cut-off1	L <b>7</b> 9
Table 3-5-3 Portfolio Return Regressions on EX IP, 30% cut-off1	181
Table 3-5-4 Portfolio Return Regressions on EX IP, 50% cut-off1	183
Table 3-5-5 Portfolio Return Regressions on EX FF, 10% cut-off1	185
Table 3-5-6 Portfolio Return Regressions on EX FF, 20% cut-off1	L87
Table 3-5-7 Portfolio Return Regressions on EX FF, 30% cut-off1	189
Table 3-5-8 Portfolio Return Regressions on EX FF, 50% cut-off	191
Table 3-5-9 Portfolio Return Regressions on EX DF, 10% cut-off	193
Table 3-5-10 Portfolio Return Regressions on EX DF, 20% cut-off1	ا95
Table 3-5-11 Portfolio Return Regressions on EX DF, 30% cut-off	197
Table 3-5-12 Portfolio Return Regressions on EX DF, 50% cut-off	199
Table 3-5-13 Portfolio Return Regressions on EX CF, 10% cut-off2	201
Table 3-5-14 Portfolio Return Regressions on EX CF, 20% cut-off	
	203
Table 3-5-15 Portfolio Return Regressions on EX CF, 30% cut-off2	

## **List of Chapter 4 Tables**

Table 4-1-1 Summary Environment and Carbon Performance for Each US Industry. 281
Table 4-1-2 Summary Financial Statistics for the US282
Table 4-1-3 Correlation between each two share-number-deflated variables for the US
Table 4-1-4 Regression of Share Price on Environment/Carbon and Financial Variables
from Ohlson (1995) Model for the US284
Table 4-1-5 Regression of Share Price on Environment/Carbon and Financial Variables
from Barth et al. (1998) Model for the US285
Table 4-1-6 Regression of Share Price on Environment/Carbon and Financial Variables
from Collins et al. (1999) Model for the US
Table 4-1-7 Regression of Share Price on Environment/Carbon and Financial Variables
from Rees (1997) Model for the US287
Table 4-1-8 Regression of Share Price on Environment/Carbon and Financial Variables
from Hands & Landsman (2005) for the US289
Table 4-1-9 Regression of Share Price on Environment/Carbon and Financial Variables
from Composite Model 1 for the US
Table 4-1-10 Regression of Share Price on Environment/Carbon and Financial
Variables from Composite Model 2 for the US292
Table 4-1-11 Regression of Share Price on Environment/Carbon and Financial
Variables from Composite Model 3 for the US293
Table 4-1-12 Correlation between each two sales-deflated variables for the US 295
Table 4-1-13 Regression of Share Price on Environment/Carbon and Financial
Variables, Composite Model with sales deflated for US296
Table 4-1-14 Regression of Share Price on Environment/Carbon and Financial
Variables from H&L (2005) for Profit Firms for the US298
Table 4-1-15 Regression of Share Price on Environment/Carbon and Financial
Variables from H & L (2005) for Loss Firms for the US
Table 4-1-16 Regression of share price from composite model for Profit Firms for the US
Table 4-1-17 Regression of share price from composite model for Loss Firms for the
US

Table 4-2-1 Summary Environment and Carbon Performance for Each UK Industry. 306
Table 4-2-2 Summary Financial Statistics for the UK308
Table 4-2-3 Correlation between each two share-number-deflated variables for the UK
Table 4-2-4 Regression of Share Price on Environment/Carbon and Financial Variables
from Ohlson (1995) Model for the UK
Table 4-2-5 Regression of Share Price on Environment/Carbon and Financial Variables
from Barth et al. (1998) Model for the UK312
Table 4-2-6 Regression of Share Price on Environment/Carbon and Financial Variables
from Collins et al. (1999) Model for the UK
Table 4-2-7 Regression of Share Price on Environment/Carbon and Financial Variables
from Rees (1997) Model for the UK
Table 4-2-8 Regression of Share Price on Environment/Carbon and Financial Variables
from Hands & Landsman (2005) for the UK
Table 4-2-9 Regression of Share Price on Environment/Carbon and Financial Variables
from Composite Model 1 for the UK
Table 4-2-10 Regression of Share Price on Environment/Carbon and Financial
Variables from Composite Model 2 for the UK
Table 4-2-11 Correlation between each two sales-deflated variables for the UK 321
Table 4-2-12 Regression of Share Price on Environment/Carbon and Financial
Variables from Composite Model with sales deflated322
Table 4-2-13 Regression of Share Price on Environment/Carbon and Financial
Variables from H&L (2005) for Profit Firms for the UK
Table 4-2-14 Regression of Share Price on Environment/Carbon and Financial
Variables from H & L (2005) for Loss Firms for the UK326
Table 4-2-15 Regression of share price from composite model for Profit Firms for the
UK
Table 4-2-16 Regression of share price from composite model for Loss Firms for the
UK330
Table 4-2-17 Regression of Share Price (pre-ETS period) on Environment/Carbon and
Financial Variables, Composite Model 1 for UK332
Table 4-2-18 Regression of Share Price (ETS phase I) on Environment/Carbon and
Financial Variables, Composite Model 1 for UK333
Table 4-2-19 Regression of Share Price (ETS phase II, 2008) on Environment/Carbon
and Financial Variables. Composite Model1 for UK

Table 4-3-1 Summary Environment and Carbon Performance for Each EU exclude	UK
(EX) Industry	. 336
Table 4-3-2 Summary Financial Statistics for the EX	. 338
Table 4-3-3 Correlation between each two share-number-deflated variables for the	
Table 4-3-4 Regression of Share Price on Environment/Carbon and Financial Varial	
from Ohlson (1995) Model for the EX	. 340
Table 4-3-5 Regression of Share Price on Environment/Carbon and Financial Varial	bles
from Barth et al. (1998) Model for the EX	. 342
Table 4-3-6 Regression of Share Price on Environment/Carbon and Financial Varial	bles
from Collins et al. (1999) Model for the EX	. 343
Table 4-3-7 Regression of Share Price on Environment/Carbon and Financial Varial	bles
from Rees (1997) Model for the EX	. 344
Table 4-3-8 Regression of Share Price on Environment/Carbon and Financial Varial	bles
from Hands & Landsman (2005) for the EX	. 346
Table 4-3-9 Regression of Share Price on Environment/Carbon and Financial Varial	bles
from Composite Model 1 for the EX	. 348
Table 4-3-10 Regression of Share Price on Environment/Carbon and Financial	
Variables from Composite Model 2 for the EX	. 349
Table 4-3-11 Correlation between each two sales-deflated variables for the EX	. 351
Table 4-3-12 Regression of Share Price on Environment/Carbon and Financial	
Variables, Composite Model with sales deflated for the EX	. 352
Table 4-3-13 Regression of Share Price on Environment/Carbon and Financial	
Variables from H&L (2005) for Profit Firms for the EX	.354
Table 4-3-14 Regression of Share Price on Environment/Carbon and Financial	
Variables from H & L (2005) for Loss Firms for the EX	. 356
Table 4-3-15 Regression of share price from composite model for Profit Firms for the	е
EX	. 358
Table 4-3-16 Regression of share price from composite model for Loss Firms for the	Э
EX	. 360
Table 4-3-17 Regression of Share Price (pre-ETS period) on Environment/Carbon a	and
Financial Variables, Composite Model 1 for EX	. 362
Table 4-3-18 Regression of Share Price (ETS phase I) on Environment/Carbon and	
Financial Variables, Composite Model 1 for the EX	. 363

Table 4-3-19 Regression of Share Price (ETS phase II, 2008) on Environment/Carbon

# **List of Chapter 5 Tables**

Table 5-1-1 Estimation of Implied Cost of Capital for the US	. 438
Table 5-1-2 Estimation of Implied Growth Rate for the US I	. 439
Table 5-1-3 Estimation of Implied Growth Rate for the US II	. 440
Table 5-1-4 Estimation of Implied Growth Rate for the US III	. 441
Table 5-1-5 Analysts' Medium Term (Yr3-5) Earnings Growth Estimates for the US.	. 442
Table 5-1-6 Analysts' Short Term Return on Equity Forecasts for the US I	. 443
Table 5-1-7 Analysts' Short Term Return on Equity Forecasts for the US II	. 444
Table 5-1-8 Subsample Financial Statistics Summary for the US	. 445
Table 5-1-9 Subsample Regression of Share Price on Environment/Carbon and	
Financial Variables from Ohlson (1995) Model for the US	. 446
Table 5-1-10 Subsample Regression of Share Price on Environment/Carbon and	
Financial Variables from H&L (2005) for the US	. 448
Table 5-1-11 Subsample Regression of Price on Environment/Carbon and Financia	ıl
Variables, Ohlson Model with sales deflated for US	. 450
Table 5-1-12 Subsample Regression of Share Price on Environment/Carbon and	
Financial Variables, HL Model with sales deflated, US	. 452
Table 5-2-1 Estimation of Implied Cost of Capital for the UK	454
Table 5-2-2 Estimation of Implied Growth Rate for the UK I	
Table 5-2-3 Estimation of Implied Growth Rate for the UK II	
Table 5-2-4 Estimation of Implied Growth Rate for the UK III	
Table 5-2-5 Analysts' Medium Term (Yr3-5) Earnings Growth Estimates for the UK.	
Table 5-2-6 Analysts' Short Term Return on Equity Forecasts for the UK I	
Table 5-2-7 Analysts' Short Term Return on Equity Forecasts for the UK II	
Table 5-2-8 Subsample Financial Statistics Summary for the UK	
·	. 401
Table 5-2-9 Subsample Regression of Share Price on Environment/Carbon and Financial Variables from Ohlson (1995) Model for the UK	463
· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	. 402
Table 5-2-10 Subsample Regression of Share Price on Environment/Carbon and Financial Variables from H&L (2005) for the UK	161
Table 5-2-11 Subsample Regression of Price on Environment/Carbon and Financia Variables, Ohlson Model with sales deflated, UK	
Table 5-2-12 Subsample Regression of Share Price on Environment/Carbon and	. 400
Financial Variables, HL Model with sales deflated, UK	169
T IT GOLDIGO VALIGOROS. TIE IVIOOGI WILLI SGIGS UGUGUGU. UN	. <del>+</del> UC

Table 5-3-1 Estimation of Implied Cost of Capital for the EX	. 470
Table 5-3-2 Estimation of Implied Growth Rate for the EX I	. 471
Table 5-3-3 Estimation of Implied Growth Rate for the EX II	. 472
Table 5-3-4 Estimation of Implied Growth Rate for the EX III	. 473
Table 5-3-5 Analysts' Medium Term (Yr3-5) Earnings Growth Estimates for the EX	. 474
Table 5-3-6 Analysts' Short Term Return on Equity Forecasts for the EX I	. 475
Table 5-3-7 Analysts' Short Term Return on Equity Forecasts for the EX II	476
Table 5-3-8 Subsample Financial Statistics Summary for the EX	. 477
Table 5-3-9 Subsample Regression of Share Price on Environment/Carbon and	
Financial Variables from Ohlson (1995) Model for the EX	. 478
Table 5-3-10 Subsample Regression of Share Price on Environment/Carbon and	
Financial Variables from H&L (2005) for the EX	. 480
Table 5-3-11 Subsample Regression of Price on Environment/Carbon and Financial	I
Variables, Ohlson Model with sales deflated, EX	. 482
Table 5-3-12 Subsample Regression of Share Price on Environment/Carbon and	
Financial Variables, HL Model with sales deflated, EX	. 484