

## **Filming female desire: Queering the gaze of pop music videos**

### **Abstract**

This paper examines the queer gaze within pop music videos. It contends that the contemporary US musician Hayley Kiyoko can be seen as a queer music video *auteur* who has transformed what the 'gaze' can mean in mainstream pop music through directing her own videos. The paper asserts that through her performance within and, arguably even more significantly, via her direction of videos, Kiyoko has produced a new and complex portrayal of how female sexual desire is represented even when, on the surface, it may not necessarily appear to disrupt normativity. Reaction videos made by Kiyoko's fans have also queered the gaze whereby the 'watcher' becomes the 'watched'. The paper concludes that online spaces and digital technologies are radically reshaping understandings of queer sexuality in music videos.

Abstract word count: 127

**Keywords:** Music Videos; Gaze Theory; Queer; Lesbian; Sexuality; Hayley Kiyoko

Total word count: 12165

Word count without abstract/references: 10,162

## **Introduction**

Music videos are an arena where ideas about gender and sexuality have long been represented, contested, and fostered. As LGBTQ desire has become increasingly normalized in Western culture it has been represented on screen in increasingly diverse ways. Since their inception in the mid 1970s, music videos have been problematic with regard to their portrayal (and lack of portrayal) of lesbian sexuality. However, in recent years, representations have become more diverse and representative. One of the key drivers of this is the increase in out LGBTQ musicians and music video directors. This has shifted who is in control of the music video gaze. This paper will introduce the US-based Japanese-American musician Hayley Kiyoko as a performer and director who has been able to generate a queer gaze through her music videos. Bestowed the moniker ‘Lesbian Jesus’ by her fans, Kiyoko is an openly gay performer who uses her platform to increase the visibility of LGBTQ relationships and women of colour. It will also consider audience responses to her gaze and how digital space has been queered through reaction videos whereby those watching the music videos become the watched objects of entertainment.

## ***Music Videos***

Popular culture has been described as ‘a site where meanings are contested and where dominant ideologies can be disturbed’ (Gamman & Marshment 1998, p. 1), significantly, it also provides a vibrant and accessible space within which struggles over meaning are played out (Barrett 1982). Music videos cemented themselves as a key part of popular culture when MTV began showing back-to-back videos in 1981 and have been since hailed as ‘pioneering’, ‘powerful, if playful, postmodern art’ (Aufderheide 1986, p. 77) and as a ‘laboratory’ (Manovich 2000). With a principally youthful viewership and themes of love, sex, and relationships dominant (Ward *et al.* 2005), fears over what is deemed to be appropriate content for music video have

abounded. Studies have found that music videos are linked to body dissatisfaction (Bell *et al.* 2007), attitudes towards sex and gender (Zhang *et al.* 2008) and how ‘proper behaviour’ is communicated (Seidman 1992). While in the mid-1990s music videos appeared to be facing an inescapable demise, the Internet has prompted a resurgence in music videos. There they can be shared quickly and easily and have flourished on sites such as, in the first instance, MySpace in the early 2000s and then, subsequently, YouTube and other similar services, such as Vimeo (Edmond 2014, Vernallis 2013). Since the 2000s, music videos ‘have reemerged as a key driver of popular culture’ (Vernallis 2013, p. 207). For these reasons, exploring what gets represented in music videos, and how audiences respond to them, are crucial aspects of understanding contemporary culture.

### ***Lesbian Sexuality and Popular Music***

Lesbian sexuality in popular culture has often been used to pander to the heterosexual male spectator (Jenkins 2005). It is certainly not new in music videos but its history is problematic. On the one hand lesbian imagery has been used to titillate straight male viewers (such as t.A.T.u.’s *All The Things She Said* (2002)) while queer female artists have been de-erotized with music videos instead focussing on the musical performance or a narrative storyline not showing the performer with a love interest. This can be seen in the music videos of artists including k.d. lang, Tracy Chapman, and Melissa Ethridge in the late 1980s and 1990s. While homosexuality has existed as a ‘shadow presence’ in music videos (Austerlitz 2007, p. 108), homosexual imagery is more vulnerable to censorship and rejection from mainstream playlists (Vernallis 2004). Due to their length, music videos rely on shortcuts and stereotypes to get the narrative across clearly (Ward *et al.* 2005), and the effect of this has been a lack of nuance of sexuality in general, and, in particular, in the representation of lesbian and queer sexuality.

In recent years an increasing number of LGBTQ artists have been portrayed in non-heterosexual romantic situations in their videos and a growing number of videos are being made by LGBTQ directors, producers, and crews. Audiences can now find queer content in music videos from out artists including Halsey, Troye Sivan, Dodie, Shura, and Years & Years. As such, LGBTQ artists and filmmakers are beginning to expand the types of representation we are seeing. As Dhaenens (2016, p. 543) has established through his study of ‘gay music videos’, artists, regardless of their sexuality, are moving away from ‘banality and normality as main tropes within their gay music videos and instead participate in a queer politics that looks beyond the scripts of gender and sexuality close at hand’. Hayley Kiyoko, as a queer woman who has developed a body of queer work, has been able to show a diverse range of queer desire in her music videos. As a woman of colour she has also added much needed diversity to the overly white mainstream LGBTQ music culture. This paper will draw on Laura Mulvey’s gaze theory to argue that Kiyoko’s music videos have successfully been able to portray female sexuality and to queer music videos *to an extent* but have not always participated in a queer politics that disrupts normativity. Given the unprecedented control Kiyoko has over her music videos and her distinctive style, I explore how she could be considered an *auteur*. Through interviews with Kiyoko fans who produce audience reaction videos I will also argue that these creative fan videos have queered the normative binary of watched/watcher and producer/consumer.

My work follows the vein of queer film and media studies including work by Doty (2000) on how we understand the film canon as queer, Lang (2002) who applied a queer lens to Hollywood films, and Rich (2013) on the politics of queerness. This strand of queer theory is heavily informed by Judith Butler (1990) and Eve Kosofsky Sedgwick (1990) who have questioned the idea of normalcy, naturalness, and the supposed fixity of sexuality and gender. A queer reading of visual media means to interrogate how these ideas are (re)produced or

challenged. I am interested in how sexual desire between women is represented in popular culture and how it is received by queer audiences.

As non-straight desire becomes more common in mainstream popular culture it is important to examine who is made visible, who gets to control the gaze, and what these representations are saying. This is particularly key given that the subject of this paper, Hayley Kiyoko, is a person of colour. As Barnard (1999) has argued, race and sexuality are not distinct categories, they inescapably define one another. A 'queer of color critique' (Ferguson 2004) allows for a framework that explores the messy intersection of identity categories, and largely emerges from activists such as the Combahee River Collective (1997) who advanced understanding of how multiple oppressions interlock. Therefore, an intersectional understanding of the 'interlocking systems of gender, sexual orientation, racial, class, and other, more local categories of sexual stratification' (de Lauretis 1988, p. 148) is essential. This paper takes the identities of performers and audiences not as discrete, overlaying categories but as inherently intertwined and inextricable.

Queer theory deals with issues beyond just sexuality and gender to consider resistance and anti-normativity more broadly. It is in this way that I include music videos as an anti-elitist art form and incorporate the technology of audience reaction videos as a way to queer the relationship between watched/watcher and producer/consumer. Throughout this paper I will be using the terms 'lesbian' and 'queer' but this does not mean they are synonymous. 'Lesbian' will be used to denote sexuality and desire between women whereas 'queer' will be used to refer to sexuality and desire that challenges binary categories of sexuality and gender and pushes against the normative. I will use 'lesbian' more when I am referring to literature that has used that term while my own analysis focuses more on the anti-normativity of queerness.

This paper will first discuss the potential for a queer gaze in music videos by examining literature on gaze theory. This will be followed by an explanation of the methods and analyses

used in this research. I will then introduce Hayley Kiyoko as a musician and music video director and assess her potential as an *auteur* and an artist who has been able to represent her own queer gaze. The final section will explore what the queer gaze has meant for her fandom and the online community that has been established surrounding her music videos, particularly through audience reaction videos. The paper will conclude that the music video gaze has been queered but so too has the online mediascape.

### **The Queer Female Gaze**

Gaze theory emanates from Laura Mulvey's (1975) influential paper 'Visual pleasure and narrative cinema'. In this paper Mulvey argues that pleasure in mainstream Hollywood film is bound by and maintains a structure of men who look and women who are looked at. This reproduces patriarchal gender relations and means that the audience can only take the 'male gaze' through looking at the objectified woman. Mulvey outlined three 'looks' that structure the gaze for the viewer. The first is the look of the camera, the second is the look of the characters in the film, and the third is the look of the spectator. Mulvey argued that these have all been primarily male in narrative cinema with the male-dominated industries of cinematography and direction, the positioning of male characters as active and more likely to do the looking, and the way in which the viewer, regardless of their own position, is being directed by these first two looks. She argued that a feminist cinema cannot exist until this definition of visual pleasure, as structured by men looking at women, is disrupted. This has led to work conceptualising the idea of the female gaze.

From the 1970s feminist filmmakers explicitly began trying to bring a female gaze into being by filming from a female point of view. Women's filmmaking has been seen as the only way, within a filmic context, to subvert patriarchal assumptions around gender and to introduce a female gaze into society (Dirse 2013). The female gaze entails women 'learning to see clearly

for themselves, thus reconstructing traditional male images of women' (Bowers 1990, p. 218). Some scholars and filmmakers have disagreed with Mulvey that the male gaze is dominant. For example, Gamman and Marshment (1998), in their edited collection on the female gaze, question the validity of Mulvey's framework by asking whether the gaze actually is always male. They argue that too often questions about gender and sexuality are forced to fit Mulvey's model, rather than to interrogate it. Yet, to date, no alternative model has convincingly been put forward. According to Pilcher (2012, p. 534) 'we do not have a vocabulary for articulating what a female gaze, or an active female sexual subjectivity, would constitute'. Many decades after the publication of Mulvey's paper, the subject of what a female gaze might look like, indeed whether it can exist at all, and how it would be theorized all remain contested and in a state of considerable flux.

Mulvey's work has certainly provoked discussion and prompted other scholars to expand gaze theory to other visual media and considerations of the gaze beyond male or female. The 'normative gaze' refers to a 'white, male, heterosexual, able-bodied cinematic gaze' (Cheu 2009, p. 483), that cannot adequately deal with the diversity of viewing positions and media that exist. For Mulvey, women who watch mainstream Hollywood movies are in one of two positions: the active 'male gaze', or the passive female object of that gaze. What happens when this gets queered?

The lesbian, gay, or queer gaze has been considered by academics seeking to expand gaze theory (Drukman 2005, Cefai 2014). Studies of lesbian representation in the media have often been focussed on to what extent a 'desiring and/or identificatory 'lesbian gaze' is possible within (mainstream) cinema' (Lindner 2013, p. 277). For Garrity (2001), Mulvey's framework leaves 'little space... to conceptualize active lesbian relations of looking' and so theories have often had to go beyond Mulvey. Evans and Gamman (1995) have stressed that this cannot be an 'add on' approach, simply changing the spectator to gay or lesbian, nor can we equate the

lesbian gaze with the heterosexual male gaze. They argue that these approaches fail to problematize rigid identity categories. This means that theorising a lesbian gaze needs to move away from the idea of a 'single lesbian gaze' that would be overly essentialist. Waterhouse (1993, p. 117-118) has stated that there cannot be a 'pure' or 'monolithic' lesbian gaze, there can only be 'a constantly shifting, kaleidoscopic one'. Like the female gaze, the idea of the lesbian or queer gaze remains contested. In this paper I will use the term 'queer gaze' in both a theoretical anti-normative sense as well as a non-heterosexual sexual identity sense when referring to sexual desire between women.

While I agree with Gamman and Marshment (1998) that not all questions about the gaze should be forced to fit into Mulvey's framework, there is still validity in going back to her work on gender when working on sexuality. In this paper I consider Mulvey's three 'looks' and the impact the Internet and digital technologies have had on queering them. I examine how digital spaces have allowed for a queering of the gaze in music videos. This is firstly through the democratisation of music video production and sharing with more queer artists producing queer content and secondly through audience reaction videos, which have queered the relations of watching. Mulvey argues that narrative cinema denies and attempts to invisibilize two of the three 'looks' associated with film (the look of the camera as it films and the audience as it watches) which leaves just the look of the characters at each other. This denial occurs in order 'to eliminate intrusive camera presence and prevent a distancing awareness in the audience' (Mulvey 1975, p. 17-18). I argue that with the rise of digital platforms and a shift that can include a focus on how the camera looks and how the audience looks, these two looks are not denied in popular music videos.



## **Methodology**

This paper is based on visual analysis of videos, social media analysis, and thirteen interviews. This mixed methods approach was undertaken in order to understand what is being represented in Kiyoko's videos and to interrogate how fans interpret the content of the videos. This multi-dimensional analysis does not ignore my own positionality (with the understanding that my own gender, sexuality, age and so on shape my analysis of visual materials and social media) but it does allow me to include other people's experiences and analysis to build up a richer understanding of how queerness is represented and why this is important. These mixed forms of analysis allow me to take into account to a greater extent the 'larger social text' beyond the music videos themselves (Johnson 1997, p. 465).

Visual analysis entailed close reading of Kiyoko's self-directed and self-starring videos (*Gravel to Tempo, Cliffs Edge, Sleepover, Feelings, Curious, What I Need, I Wish*) as well as watching her self-directed videos that she does not star in and queer-themed videos by other queer artists who do not self-direct their videos. The lyrics are less important here as it was the visual, technical, and stylistic techniques that were of interest. A social semiotic approach was employed to examine the codes and signifiers that convey meaning (Jewitt & Oyama 2001), and the purpose of such analysis was to understand *how* queer desire is represented in music videos. Contextual background from other sources can aid the visual analysis (Collier 2001), so video and written interviews were also compiled to gather information about how Kiyoko herself describes her music videos and her process of making them.

Social media analysis was conducted to get an understanding of the audience reception of Kiyoko's music videos. I collected comments, primarily through the 'comment' functionality below music videos on YouTube. Qualitative analysis of YouTube comments remains scarce and only a tiny minority of video viewers ever post a comment but there is scope for serious analysis of the debates and discussion that occur on YouTube (Thelwall *et*

al. 2012), and other social media. It was this analysis that introduced me to the audience reaction videos made in response to Kiyoko's music videos. These consist of fans filming themselves watching music videos, and then uploading this reaction.

In order to understand the motivations for making audience reaction videos in greater depth I conducted thirteen interviews with women who 'react' to Hayley Kiyoko's music videos. I recruited them through the contact details that they provide with their reaction videos and invited them to participate. I contacted the 28 people who had made Kiyoko reaction videos at the time and who had publicly accessible contact details. Thirteen responded willing to participate. This fairly strong success rate is consistent with others who have found it relatively easy to engage people on the topic of their fandom due to their engagement with fan culture and emotional connection to the subject (Stevenson 2009, Bird 2011). While there were a small number of men who had made Kiyoko reaction videos, all participants who responded identify as women. Of the thirteen, ten self-identify as lesbian, bisexual, pansexual, or queer. They are from diverse racial/ethnic backgrounds and are based in North America, Europe, Asia, and Australasia. The interviews took place between July and September 2018 and due to this geographical spread were conducted online. The participants were all asked about their motivations for making the videos and what they thought of Kiyoko's videos and her fan community. Their responses were then coded into themes that form part of this paper. All participants could choose whether or not to have their real names used and gave their consent.

### **Kiyoko as a queer music video auteur**

Music videos are increasingly showing queer relationships. One artist producing such videos is Hayley Kiyoko. Kiyoko is a former Disney star who grew up in Los Angeles to a Japanese-Canadian mother and American father of European descent. She describes herself as a 'gay woman' and describes herself as an 'extreme minority' as a queer woman of colour in the

entertainment industry (Horowitz 2018). However, in interviews she tends to focus more on her sexuality than her race. She sometimes speaks about these aspects of her identity together, for example saying, ‘[f]or me to be on the radio and to have a hit and to be, I don’t know, popular and to be myself, and to be a woman, and to be half Japanese, and like girls, it means more — so much more’ (Bendix 2018). Kiyoko is therefore acutely aware of how these intersect. Much more rarely she has spoken about being Japanese and White; ‘[n]aturally being biracial shapes you as a person because you experience different things. As an actress for example, I’m constantly going out for Asian American roles and ‘I’m not Asian enough.’ They will flat out say that. Then, I’ll go out for open ethnicity roles and they will go ‘you’re not white enough’’ (Green 2017). Kiyoko has also spoken about her desire to connect more with her Japanese heritage; she visited Japan as an adult and has said she would like to learn the Japanese language. While Kiyoko does not speak explicitly about being *hāfu* (born to one ethnic Japanese and one non-Japanese parent), she is included on *hāfu* fansites and her fans celebrate having an artist of colour to look up to. This liminality then, between being Japanese and White, is perhaps why she tends to speak less about her race and more about her sexuality, the aspect of her identity that she has a less complex relationship with.

Kiyoko found a successful career in youth-focussed film and television as a child, likely aided by her father’s career as an actor and mother’s career as an Emmy award-winning figure skater and choreographer. While not leaving acting completely, Kiyoko turned to pop music as part of the girl group The Stunners and then increasingly began to write more explicitly queer songs as a solo artist and to direct her own videos to accompany them. Given this All-American celebrity beginning, Kiyoko’s proud sexuality marks her as a trailblazer in mainstream pop music (Hunt 2018). Kiyoko now stars in all of her videos, incorporating dance routines with representations of a variety of queer relationships. By starring in and directing videos with a

distinctive style and type of content, which I will go on to describe, Kiyoko can be understood as a queer music video *auteur*.

When MTV began showing music videos, the importance of the director was all but erased from what was shown to viewers. It wasn't until the beginning of the 1990s that they added the director's name to the information that is shown when a video starts or ends. This marks a stage when we can begin to think about music video auteur studies and when directors with personal styles such as Michel Gondry, Chris Cunningham, and Spike Jonze became well-known. Through clearly displaying the director's name and celebrating good direction, music video took a step closer to being, and being acknowledged as, an auteurist medium (Beebe 2007).

Solidified in the 1950s by French film critics, particularly in the pages of *Cahiers du Cinéma*, auteur theory examines the fingerprint that a director places on their work. Film theorist Andrew Sarris (1962) argued that classifying a director as an auteur depends on three factors: technical competence, a distinguishable style, and a thread of interior meaning through the director's work. Auteurism has been criticised for attempting to draw a line between 'good' art and 'bad' art and for ignoring the inescapable collaboration of filmmaking. It has been dismissed by some as passé and too oblivious to the context in which visual media is created (Rich 2013). Auteur theory relies on boundary policing and my inclusion of Kiyoko therefore challenges traditional conceptions of auteur theory, which has championed white male directors from the Global North. As Sarris noted, auteur theory is constantly evolving and I argue that it needs to evolve to better incorporate women, queer voices, and people of colour and previously overlooked mediums. Janet Staiger (2003, p. 29) argues that postulations of the death of the author (and auteur) came strategically just as marginalised groups were becoming more visible; '[d]epriving us of our voices just as we are speaking more loudly seems like a

plot'. Yet she insists that authorship still matters and that is why I argue here for an auteur theory that is more inclusive of both author and form.

Music video studies is ripe for auteur criticism, and yet it lacks the canon that exists in film studies (Vernallis 2013). Vernallis argues that all of the central tenets of auteur theory can be applied to music videos from technical approaches to themes, styles to philosophy. In fact, she argues, it makes more sense to have an auteur theory of music videos than of film due to the greater extent of control that music video directors have as they are more likely to be involved in more stages of production, editing, set-design, and casting. In spite of this opportunity, Vernallis (2013) questions how possible this is in reality as issues revolving around dealing with the song or the artist, not to mention very tight budgetary restrictions and severe time limits would very likely constrain the director and limit their creative freedom. For Roberts (1994), auteur theory does not apply to music videos because they are 'multi-voiced' cultural products made with the input of the performer and the director and no-one has full control of all meaning. But, importantly, and very rarely, in the case of Hayley Kiyoko, as the writer and performer of the songs but also the director and star of the videos, she has ultimate control over the production and direction of her videos. She is highly specific in her choices concerning the colours used, shooting styles, storylines and actors cast in her videos. This means that her work is consistent with Sarris' (1962) contention that being deemed an auteur depends on the three factors of technical competence, style, and interior meaning. It is for these reasons that Kiyoko can be considered to be a music video auteur.

This is important because only through an *oeuvre* can the complexity of queer desire be adequately portrayed in music videos. With occasional music videos showing same-sex sexuality, tropes and stereotypes are used as shorthand. However, when a queer artist is able to produce a *body* of queer content, more diverse representations can exist. Especially when gay identities and culture have been 'whitewashed' (Sender 2003), the presence of queer artists of

colour is significant. Kiyoko is able to cover themes such as break-ups, flirting with a stranger, and being in love with someone who is unavailable; tropes that are commonplace in straight videos, but much rarer in queer ones. It is challenging to create visual media that can adequately represent the complexity of lesbian lives (Siesing 2000) but striving to do so has critical political implications. For Dhaenens (2016, p. 533) it is ‘the expression of same-sex intimacy [that] can be a disruptive act that challenges the hegemony of heteronormativity’. In order to be queer, therefore, representation cannot just show queer people, but queer intimacy. Through showing queer desire in a variety of scenarios, Kiyoko’s music videos are disrupting heteronormativity.

Kiyoko has a clear stylistic vision for her music videos. She describes herself as a ‘very narrative based director’ who is ‘inspired by colour’ and claims not to be inspired by other music videos, but by film (Urban Outfitters Television 2018). In one interview she said ‘[The 2012 crime drama] *The Place Beyond the Pines* is one of my favorite movies. I like films that feel long and comforting and dark. When you watch a really good film that feels satisfying -- I try to implement that feeling in my music videos’ (Crowley 2018). Kiyoko talks about making mood boards for her videos and using stylistic techniques to achieve the vision she has for them. The colour palette and style of her videos is remarkably consistent and they all have a narrative arc in a much more overt way than the average music video. She has managed to develop a unique aesthetic style in a relatively small body of work and her fans note that the Kiyoko style is distinctive. This aesthetic directorial vision is consistent with an auteurist approach, but auteurism also invariably includes the director’s distinctive themes and politics (or interior meaning to follow Sarris (1962)), which are also clear in Kiyoko’s videos.

Kiyoko’s earliest music videos portrayed her with a male love interest, such as in *This Side of Paradise* (2014), or featured her as the performer but not as part of the narrative of the video, as in *Rich Youth* (2014). It was Kiyoko’s 2015 directorial debut, *Girls Like Girls*, that

launched her as a queer music video auteur. The video tells the story of two young female friends who discover their feelings for each other but who, on the verge of their first kiss, are discovered and then physically attacked by the boyfriend of one of them. This video has been enormously popular, receiving 114 million views to date on the video sharing platform YouTube. Kiyoko has explained in interviews that while she had been nervous to produce such explicitly queer content, the success of this video validated her desire to portray same-sex desire in her videos and encouraged her to produce more.

Since the success of *Girls Like Girls*, Kiyoko has directed all of her music videos and now appears in all of them as the romantic protagonist. Through continuing with this style, Kiyoko is developing an *oeuvre* that can show a broad range of representations of queer sexuality. This includes: a lesbian relationship and break-up in *Cliffs Edge* (2015); Kiyoko fantasising about being with a platonic female friend in *Sleepover* (2017); Kiyoko's relationship with a female ex-lover who is now in a relationship with a man in *Curious* (2018); and Kiyoko trying to get over a girl in *I Wish* (2019). Kiyoko tells queer-specific stories that resonate with her LGBTQ fans and are relatable and 'authentic' for them in a way that mainstream heterosexual pop music videos rarely are. The breadth of stories she tells through her body of work gives a richness to the representation of queer female desire not previously evident in the music video canon. Through determinedly telling these queer stories, diversifying music videos, and working within a clear stylistic vision, Kiyoko is a queer music video auteur. Yet these videos come from a particular place of her being a queer musician, performer, and director. The following section will explore Kiyoko's queer gaze and how this auteurist vision is predominantly formed by it.

### **Kiyoko's queer gaze**

As a queer woman, Kiyoko is imparting both consciously and unconsciously her specific queer gaze when she directs the 'looks' of her music videos. She explicitly includes queer narratives in her videos in order to advance (in terms of quality and quantity) better queer representation. She aims to 'help people love themselves sooner' (Horowitz 2018), and explains that she loves 'being open and sharing my stories because it inspires other kids to hopefully be more comfortable with themselves at a younger age' (Kaplan 2017). Kiyoko says that she 'didn't have that hope growing up [that her feelings for women were valid], so I get emotional and inspired (or encouraged) every time I meet a fan who looks at me that way' (Kiyoko 2016). She hopes that this will inspire the younger generation as 'we all just like need to see someone do it to prove that it's possible' (MTV 2018). In August 2018 Kiyoko was awarded Push Artist of the Year, chosen from MTV's monthly featured 'push artists'. In her acceptance speech she said, '[t]his validates any queer woman of color, that you can follow your dreams'. Her videos therefore, as well as the statements she makes in support of them, have a clear political purpose.

Kiyoko creates queer content for better representation for queer communities, specifically queer women of colour, but also for herself. Before Kiyoko was in control of her music videos she struggled with having her own vision of the song clash with the director's vision. In one interview she said '[w]hen I wasn't directing my own videos -- I had written the music and had a vision for the videos, so it was hard for me to see someone else's vision' (Crowley 2018). But starring in her own music videos also allows her to live a queer utopia in what she calls 'self-starring fanfiction' (Heaney 2018). She describes them as 'a very therapeutic thing for me' and her videos also have this personal drive with her own motivations beyond her fans (Crowley 2018). By showing sexual pleasure, and power in being sexual, Kiyoko is given agency in her sexuality as a queer woman of colour, something that has been



particularly denied for Asian/American women (Shimizu 2007). While there cannot be a monolithic 'queer gaze', Kiyoko presents her own queer gaze for her fans and for herself.

To return to Mulvey's gaze theory, I want to use her three 'looks' to consider whether they have been queered by music videos. Mulvey argued that the three looks (the look of the camera, the look of the characters in the film, and the look of the spectator) were all predominantly male. Mulvey's gaze theory has been criticized for leaving little room for queer perspectives but that was not the aim of her work. Her work was on Hollywood narrative cinema, which is vastly different from popular music videos that are chiefly circulated on the Internet in the twenty-first century. Moreover, I argue that there *is* room for queer perspectives. Mulvey's male gaze has been seen as too reductive and not allowing for other scenarios (Gamman & Marshment 1988). But if we take her gaze theory out of the constraints of its inception and instead use it as an inspiration not a prescription, gaze theory can be applied to other scenarios.

In Kiyoko's videos the look of the camera is directed by a queer woman for a queer audience with political queer intentions. The look of the characters within the videos are queer with Kiyoko, a queer woman, playing queer female characters having sexual and romantic encounters with other women. These videos are then watched by a diverse audience but with a strong fanbase of queer women whose look is directed by the first two looks. Due to the control Kiyoko has over the camera and content of the music videos she is able to queer all three of these 'looks'. Cynthia Fuchs (1992, p. 38) remarked that '[a]lthough feminist film theory has recently undertaken the project of finding a place for women to look from (that is, the theorization of the female spectator), it has opened little space on screen for the female body as self-representative'. Kiyoko's music videos have allowed her to create a space for queer female bodies to be self-representative. By considering Mulvey's 'looks' away from the constraining framework of Hollywood narrative film it is possible to see that music video, the

democratisation of video production, and the dissemination possibilities via the Internet have opened up how gaze theory can be applied.

Kiyoko is aware of creating videos that show the same-sex version of heterosexual narratives. For instance, her 2017 video *Feelings* shows Kiyoko flirting with a woman at a gas station while on a night out with friends and then following her down the street. This video importantly has Kiyoko as the pursuer, imitating Michael Jackson's *The Way You Make Me Feel* (1987) video. Kiyoko said in an interview that '[a]ll these male pop artists have followed women down streets in videos — it's kind of the classic thing. And I was like, there is no video of a girl following a girl down the street. I need to do this at some point in my life' (Heaney 2018). Kiyoko stressed the need for the video to be fun and consensual, countering a criticism at the male centred videos that can suggest stalking and aggression. She is playing with gender here, to follow Butler (1990), by flipping the gender of the assumed flirtatious pursuer. Re-gendering previously heterosexual media queers it by destabilising fixed categories of gender and sex and creating ambiguous relationships of sexual identity (Drummond 2003). The tropes we see Kiyoko play with are ones that have been common in straight music videos for decades.

Through playing with Mulvey's 'looks' and flipping the gender assumptions of heterosexual tropes Kiyoko has queered the gaze of music videos somewhat, but the extent of this queerness can be examined. There is a discord between showing queerness as a sexual/gender identity and being theoretically queer in disrupting patriarchal, heteronormative societal norms. The extent to which Kiyoko's videos are the latter can be questioned.

Male leads in music videos are typically depicted as dominant, adventurous, and in the pursuit of women (Ward *et al.* 2005). This is precisely how Kiyoko situates herself in her videos. Visual analysis shows Kiyoko to be a confident, assertive character in her videos, renowned for her 'swagger'. Her behaviour, attitude, and style are curated to let the 'in-the-know' queer audience that Kiyoko is dominant, a 'top', even though in interviews Kiyoko has

admitted that she plays a fantasy version of the lesbian she dreams of being. Kiyoko's placing of herself in the typical 'male role' may not necessarily disrupt the power relationship between the dominant pursuer and their female love interest that has been present in earlier videos. The non-performing characters in music videos tend to be passive and mute with the performer taking the active role (Vernallis 2004). This is also true in Kiyoko's videos. This privileges the gaze of Kiyoko who, due to her control of the video, is able to centre the narrative on her desires. The female love interests remain passive, there, to use Mulvey's (1975) phrase, for their 'to-be-looked-at-ness'. The viewer is invited to share Kiyoko's gaze, watching and pursuing her romantic interests. Yet the significance of seeing a queer Asian/American woman playing a sexually powerful persona when such identities are invilibilized in mainstream media cannot be ignored (Alimahomed 2010). Kiyoko is able to subvert assumptions of Asian/American women's pliable and racialized bodies (Lee 2004), and the fact that the dominant/passive relationship is playing out between two women abstracts it from patriarchal conventions.

The actors in Kiyoko's videos are cast by her. Part of why she wanted to direct her own videos was to achieve more diverse casting. Speaking of the difficulty of casting diverse actors Kiyoko has said, '[y]ou end up going into the pool of the Hollywood world of trying to cast your actresses, and it's difficult... There isn't a lot of diversity. I had a specific vision in mind, and then you get a list that's only half a page. You end up having to dig deep to search for the right people' (Karlan 2017). But while Kiyoko's videos show some racial diversity, the women cast are young, feminine, the women of colour are all light-skinned, and they are all conventionally attractive. She speaks openly about casting her love interests through the photo and video-sharing social networking service Instagram and in a video where Kiyoko is asked to create a 'mood board' for her music video feelings, she cuts out and sticks on a photograph of a woman saying, 'I should probably add a hot girl in the video because that's really important

in my life' (Urban Outfitters Television 2018, Fuse 2017). The result is that the actors cast do not portray a diverse range of queer identities.

This was even more true until her most recent music video, *I Wish*, released in July 2019. This was the first time that Kiyoko cast a plus-sized love interest, the model Bree Kish. This was received rapturously with fan comments including 'I just love how Hayley has ethnically diverse background dancers! And her love interest was curvy!' and '[s]o is no one going to point out the fact that she chose an actress who isn't your typical skinny girl as her ex lover. This is so important!' on YouTube. Moreover, on her social media account Instagram Kiyoko asked her followers 'what was your favorite part in I WISH???' which resulted in responses such as 'The plus sized love interest', 'your chubby love interest (cuz I'm chubby and wow we are never the love interests)', 'the plus size girl representation. Its so rare to see plus size lgbt rep so u made my heart so so happy', and 'representation of non white plus size women'. Interestingly, while most videos show Kiyoko kissing and or dancing with her love interests, Kiyoko and Kish do not even appear in the same frame together. Notably, this video came 14 months after her previous video in a climate that is increasingly vocal about diversity and Kiyoko had been critiqued by fans for using 'skinny models'.

While Kiyoko's videos show same-sex female desire, they still conform to norms of what *type* of lesbian sex sells. Kiyoko's love interests are fully consistent with the 'acceptable lesbian' of mainstream media. This lesbian is 'attractive and sexy within heterosexual norms (slim, pretty, curvaceous), she is "hot"' (Jackson & Gilbertson 2009, p. 199). Kiyoko's most recent love interest may be plus-sized but she's also an international model. There are clear distinctions between the favoured chic lesbian versus the un-chic, dowdy lesbian who is certainly not included for sex appeal (McKenna 2002). The media promotes the image of the 'luscious lesbian' while the butch lesbian has been invisibilized (Ciasullo 2001). Ciasullo argues that such feminized representations 'de-lesbianize' lesbians and make them palatable

(or more than palatable) for heterosexual audiences. Kiyoko is signed to the record labels Empire and Atlantic and sponsored by Beats by Dre, which is likely to have an impact on how palatable Kiyoko's lesbian representation needs to be. Even lesbian media such as *The L Word* caters to expectations of conventional attractiveness (Dove-Viebahn 2007), and Kiyoko's videos similarly meet such expectations.

This lack of diversity in Kiyoko's videos is not representative of how lesbian sexuality is being represented in music videos more broadly. Other videos have shown alternative queer female gazes, including more masculine women. Artists such as Kehlani and Ria Mae portray masculine-of-centre women with their female love interests (see their videos for *Honey* (2017) and *Gold* (2016) respectively). Mary Lambert purposively wanted a music video with a queer storyline; in a blog post she described how she was looking for lesbian music videos on the Internet but couldn't find any because '[i]t doesn't exist. THERE ISN'T EVEN ONE DAMN MUSIC VIDEO WITH TWO CUTE GIRLS IN LOVE' (Lambert 2013). Her video for *She Keeps Me Warm* (2013) therefore showed herself, a queer fat activist, with a gender non-conforming love interest and used an all-queer female crew. Music videos are also being queered with Janelle Monae's celebration of black bisexuality in *Make Me Feel* (2018) and, queerest of all, King Princess's video for *Talia* (2018) where she rolls around in bed with a female sex doll. However, there is a key difference.

These other examples were not directed by the artists themselves and so while Kiyoko's videos may not necessarily be disrupting norms like these other videos do, they are able to richly convey her gaze as a queer woman. Kiyoko has been able to queer the music video gaze *to an extent*. By showing same-sex female desire she is presenting a non-heteronormative vision. Yet, because Kiyoko still remains within boundaries of conventional attractiveness and mainstream acceptability, she has twisted rather than completely disrupted social norms and practices. This does not mean that her videos have any less of an impact in queer communities.

Popular culture does not need to adhere to queer theory's principles in order to have political resonance. Kiyoko's fans assemble around her queer gaze and as the following section will argue, this has queered the nature of fandom viewing.

### **Queer online communities**

The Internet provides a platform for sexual minorities to forge a sense of identity and community, to share information, and to meet one another whether for friendship or sexual encounters (Miles 2018). It has created a new space of desire, as well as helping to normalize queer desire. It is a space that allows queer media to be shared and accessed with some level of security and anonymity. This has been particularly important for people in communities that may be less accepting of LGBTQ people and themes. Explicitly queer content is prohibited or censored in much of the world but the Internet can be a way for LGBTQ people to explore their sexual identities more safely (Hollier & Harrison 2007). While fandom surrounding lesbian artists previously had to be carefully navigated both by the artists and her fans for fear of being 'out' in the wrong environment (Valentine 1995), the Internet offers greater opportunities to be 'out'.

For fans of Hayley Kiyoko (or *Kiyokians*) the Internet is a space to access her music and videos, to see her photos, watch video interviews with her, interact with her, and to engage with other fans. This fandom is worthy of study because '[i]f the cultures of stars and celebrities are about the visibility of certain individuals, then it is important to try and understand some of the people who are doing the looking' (Stevenson 2006, p. 5). This looking by fans can often be likened to a form of worship. Just as Kiyoko received her 'Lesbian Jesus' title, musicians are often described in religious terms. Stevenson (2006), for example, found David Bowie to have a religious significance for fans who will bestow upon him titles such as 'Pope of Pop', a 'god', an 'icon', and will speak of him with a 'sense of devotion'. Kiyoko has been described

by one artist profile as ‘a present-day quadruple threat, at least — she sings, acts, plays multiple instruments, and directs her own music videos, each of them received like sacraments by the huge, devoted following she [has] amassed’ (Heaney 2018). Such worship and devotion proliferates on the Internet.

A key space of Hayley Kiyoko fandom has been YouTube and the fan videos that have been shared on the site. Kiyoko’s YouTube artist page, her fans’ YouTube accounts and numerous other fan sites dedicated to her on, for example, Tumblr, Instagram and Facebook creates and curates collective fandom in digital space. These are spaces for sharing experiences and creating community and the digital arena of music videos has created a space for dialogue and conversation (Edmond 2014). YouTube has a ‘communal, egalitarian feel’ (Vernallis 2013, p. 150) that encourages users to take an active creation role on the platform, stimulating participation rather than passivity (Morreale 2014). The music videos of Hayley Kiyoko have certainly created a queer, transnational community space but as the following section shows, audience reaction videos have gone beyond that to queer the nature of the gaze itself.

### **Making Reaction Videos**

Reaction videos are visual content produced when someone records themselves watching other media content (Kim 2015). They tend to be amateur (filmed on webcams), ordinary, natural, and filmed in the video makers own home. They therefore have an intimate feel, often as if you are watching the video of a friend. They have become their own ‘independent attention economy’ that have their ‘own circuits of production and consumption between reactors as providers and YouTube audiences as consumers’ (Kim 2015, p. 335).

These reaction videos are also queering the very nature of the gaze and of digital fandom. We are seeing an additional layer being added to the consumption of music videos that blurs the distinction between producer and consumer. The portmanteau ‘prosumer’ was coined by Alvin Toffler in 1980 but has been extended by others to argue that prosumption is

profoundly changing our culture, economy, society, and democracy (Bruns 2008). While ‘prosumption’ has always existed in some form, it has boomed with the growth of the Internet and social networking (Ritzer *et al.* 2012). This is because whereas in Web 1.0 content was generated by the producer, Web 2.0 has made it harder to distinguish between producers and consumers. Scholars have argued that this has significant implications for the nature of capitalism (Fuchs 2010, Ritzer & Jurgenson 2010), but I am interested here in what the ‘prosumption’ of reaction videos means for the nature of the gaze.

When we watch a reaction video we are watching the viewer view. Reaction videos destabilize the presupposed binaries of active producing and passive watching; of production and consumption; of being a voyeur and of being the subject of voyeurism. Reaction videos allow us to glimpse scopophilia, looking as a form of pleasure itself (Mulvey 1975), while simultaneously experiencing scopophilia ourselves either as the watcher of the music video in the reaction video or the reaction video alone. There is pleasure in voyeurism here. Reaction videos are made by those who purposely want to be watched as they engage in their own visual pleasure. It is through this destabilization of watcher/watched that audience videos are queering the gaze. This theoretical queering of the gaze is not, however, at the forefront of the minds of those who make reaction videos. It is instead the queerness of Kiyoko’s videos in a sexual identity sense and the sexual identities of those who make the videos that is most prominent.

My interviews with Kiyoko fans who have made reaction videos to her music videos showed how important queerness was to their decision to make their videos. Ten of my thirteen interviewees self-identify as non-heterosexual and my analysis draws primarily from their experiences. My findings are threefold: that they were attracted to the relatability of queer sexuality in Kiyoko’s videos and appreciated seeing queer representation; they believed that Kiyoko’s queer gaze and the control she can wield as the director was an important part of the relatability of the videos; and they are aware of and usually part of the queer fan community



that has emerged around the videos. The queerness of the interviewees and Kiyoko were bound together to create a mutual queer gaze where the look of the camera, the look of the character, and the look of the viewer are all queered. This results in both desire and identification and reflects what Lewis (1997) calls the ambivalence of the lesbian gaze, where the viewer both desires to be and to have the woman they are viewing. The following sections explore why Kiyoko fans are drawn to make reaction videos to Kiyoko's videos.

Firstly, for my LGBTQ interviewees, Kiyoko's representations of queer sexuality offer relatability and self-identification. The word 'relatable' was prominent with Keana saying that 'as a lesbian, there's a level of relatability in Hayley's videos that I can't find in most other videos. Hayley tells stories that I've also experienced which results in me having a more emotional reaction to her music videos'. Liv stated that Kiyoko's videos tell 'a relatable story that a lot of us LGBTQ people face' while Megan said that 'all of Hayley Kiyoko's music and music videos are super relatable as part of the LGBT community'. It is therefore explicitly acknowledged how much queer women appreciate seeing their sexuality represented on screen. As Lindsey told me, 'I see two girls in love in her videos, and it makes it perfect for me because it's based off my life. The gayer the better for me'. Fans therefore seek out content that is relevant to their own lives. Lesbians have often had to read 'against the grain' to re-interpret heterosexual media as queer with the dearth of explicitly queer content (Dobinson & Young 2000). Yet Kiyoko is purposefully creating queer media to rectify its absence in the music video industry and provide relatable content for her fans.

This queer content is seen as a key reason for fans wanting to engage with Kiyoko's music videos through reaction videos. As Carter Marie explained, 'I love her music videos even more than other artists because it is not the typical straight couple narrative' and Lindsey chose to make reaction videos to Kiyoko videos because 'they are the first music videos that resonate with me personally, a lesbian woman'. Self-identification is key with Kayley saying

that ‘as a woman in love with a woman, seeing that relationship in popular media like music videos, is incredibly special. It’s a representation that is so rarely seen, even today. Queer women so rarely have a chance to be out and proud, so Hayley’s videos are very special to me and my partner’. Liv explains that ‘having an artist like Hayley Kiyoko who makes music about being gay has helped me accept myself and be more comfortable with who I am’. Kiyoko’s fans feel that she is producing content specifically for the LGBTQ community with Emily-Anne clarifying that ‘I think her music videos affect me, and other members of the LGBT community much more than they do non-members. I think Hayley makes music for the LGBT community, as so little is actually catered specifically for us’. While we cannot assume that viewers define their sexuality as the primary marker in their viewing position, for these interviewees both their sexuality and Kiyoko’s formed a significant part of their viewing pleasure and impetus to create reaction videos.

Secondly, my interviewees unanimously pointed out how important it is that Kiyoko directs her own music videos. Often this is about Kiyoko being able to portray her own gaze, or ‘vision’. For Carter Marie, ‘she doesn’t have to listen to another director, and listen to their vision... I just love that she is not afraid to show her true self’ and for Liv, ‘by directing her own videos she is able to give us her exact vision of her songs’. Kiyoko is able to be in control of the narrative and this makes her videos different. Keana states that ‘by directing her videos herself, we get to see them from a point of view that’s not commonly seen in mainstream media’ and Talaina states that directing them herself ‘does make it different from other videos because she’s the one behind the camera and no one else is telling her to do this or that’. This is important because my interviewees think that it allows Kiyoko to represent queer sexuality ‘accurately’; Lindsey believes that Kiyoko directing her own music videos ‘shows her vision and that she wants it to be as authentic to her as possible. She wants what we all want, more

representation, she just has the voice and platform to do it'. It is Kiyoko's control of her vision that leads to greater 'authenticity'.

For Megan, Kiyoko's videos feel 'more personal and real' and for Kayley they feel more 'honest' because 'when she has the creative control for the videos, she can fully convey what she was feeling while writing the lyrics. It also adds to the confidence and empowerment that is conveyed within them, knowing she had such control'. For Emily-Anne, 'the fact that she directs her own music videos makes them more rooted in the reality of the lyrics of her music and the intentions behind the songs. They're very genuine and real, because she spends time making sure they accurately reflect the purpose of the song that she wrote'. Kiyoko's vision, from the idea for the song to the execution of the video is therefore within Kiyoko's control and the result is more 'real', 'genuine' queer content. Kiyoko fans are conscious of the impact that Kiyoko's direction has on her music videos and this affects how sexual desire is represented in them.

Thirdly and finally, the Hayley Kiyoko fandom has been important for fans to meet likeminded people and share their love for the pop star. Reaction videos form an independent sub-community that bring fans together. The fandom is described by Talaina as 'loving' and 'empowering' and for Keana it is a safe space; 'a large part of [Kiyoko's] fan base is also a part of the LGBTQ community so I also know that I can feel safe being open about my own sexuality'. The Internet is part of what fosters this safety with Lindsey saying that 'seeking out fans online is important for me because I can find people who I relate to. In some areas across the world, LGBT+ people are not accepted, the online universe gives us joy'. The fandom allows people to share their experiences with others which is why Liv tries 'to interact with a lot of Hayley's fans online because most of them have the same story I have. It's nice to connect with people who are similar to you'. These interviewees identified the fandom as a positive experience in their lives. There have been debates about the extent to which fandom can be

equated with community (Pearson 2010), but for these interviewees at least, being part of this online network does provide a community-like support structure.

The online community is not always for the benefit of the individual but also for others. My interviewees were creating and sharing their reaction videos for a purpose beyond just entertainment. As Adrienne says, ‘I hope that, by sharing my reaction, other queer people will not feel so alone in their feelings’. Reaction videos enable ‘fans to confirm that they are not lone consumers of the particular contents and, thus, constructing a collective fan identity in the digital era’ (Kim 2015, p. 333). The fandom includes the reaction videos but also exists in different spaces for different fans with some such as Adrienne experiencing an online fandom, saying that being part of the Hayley Kiyoko fandom ‘means mostly “screaming” with my friends online and also making reaction videos’. Others experience the fandom both online and offline such as Keana who says ‘I meet Hayley fans online through the reaction videos that I upload and I meet them offline at Hayley’s concerts’. These online and offline worlds are not separate, instead they have a symbiotic relationship, and how people behave in one ‘world’ impacts the other (Holloway and Valentine 2003). While Web 2.0 has ushered in new ways of consuming and producing media content, we need to remain aware of how this online world intersects with the offline world (Bird 2011). The Kiyoko fandom exists across digital and ‘real world’ spaces and is a critical way for individuals to feel less alone, more empowered in their sexuality, and to support others.

Kiyoko’s queerness has led to a dedicated group of (predominantly) queer female fans creating queer space both online and offline where female sexuality and the queer gaze can be celebrated. It is notable that although the interviewees spanned a range of ethnic identities, they all focused on the importance of Kiyoko’s sexuality, not her ethnicity. For them, it is queerness in a political and sexual identity sense that motivates them to create and engage with reaction videos. Yet through their reaction videos they are at once the viewer *and* the viewed and this

form of 'prosumption' has queered the creation, dissemination, and viewing pleasure associated with music videos. For Whiteley (2010, p. 188), '[q]ueering... has challenged cultural and social norms, subverting the gendered heterosexual bias in popular music by invoking a different way of listening, a queer sensibility'. These interviews show the real impacts the queering of media has had on LGBTQ fans and how they are invoking their own queer sensibilities.

## **Conclusion**

As LGBTQ sexuality has become increasingly accepted in Western media, expressions of lesbian sexuality in music videos have become more commonplace. While the earliest manifestations of these expressions were often problematic, we are now seeing queer artists taking control of how their gender and sexual identities are represented. While there cannot be a singular queer gaze, the music video gaze has been queered by artists such as Hayley Kiyoko. As an auteur, Kiyoko has control of how sexuality is portrayed in her videos through the way in which the 'look' of the camera is directed and how queer sexual desire is being represented on screen. The result is that increasingly diverse representations exist, and they are seen as more 'real' and 'authentic' by viewers. Particularly as a queer Asian/American performer, Kiyoko has challenged mainstream hegemonic assumptions of queerness and ethnicity (Alimahomed 2010). While Kiyoko's videos have not always participated in a queer politics that disrupts normativity, as she conforms to certain societal norms rather than dismantling them, her videos have still managed to queer the gaze to an extent. In order to be queer, representation must show queer intimacy (Dhaenens 2016), and it is in this way that Kiyoko's videos, through her rich and complex *oeuvre*, have troubled heteronormativity.

The gaze has not only been queered by artists such as Kiyoko, the gaze has also been queered by their audiences. The online mediascape has been queered through 'prosumption'

with viewers not only watching queer music videos but creating their own queer content as they react to the videos. This queers the presupposed binaries of viewed/viewer when a fan watches the artist but is also watched in this watching. Such ‘prosumers’ of Kiyoko reaction videos have explicit reasons for wanting to make such videos, and this is bound up with their own queer gaze, and the recognized queer gaze of Kiyoko. This research highlights how audiences are not passive receptacles of whatever is presented in media but instead have nuanced understandings of how and why queerness has been represented and wish to actively shape and produce queer media themselves.

Laura Mulvey argued that narrative cinema denies two of the three ‘looks’ associated with film (the look of the camera as it films and the audience as it watches) which leaves just the look of the characters at each other. This paper has shown that with the rise of digital technologies and the Internet, these looks are not denied in popular music videos. Kiyoko overtly celebrates the look of the camera through discussing her role and desires as a music video director, and reaction videos have shone a spotlight on how audiences react to her videos. These looks can be far more democratic with the accessibility of the Internet. When these two looks are absent, Mulvey (1975, p. 18) claims that ‘fictional drama cannot achieve reality, obviousness and truth’. So, if the queering of the production and consumption spaces of music videos has indeed rectified these absences, perhaps we are, finally, witnessing the onset of a new reality of representation of queer sexuality in music videos. We are seeing representations become increasingly nuanced and Kiyoko’s ability to centre a queer, female, of colour, sexualized narrative is emblematic of this. Kiyoko has successfully been able to reshape representations of desire in music videos and thus creates the potential for more non-normative, radically queer representations in the future.

## References

- Alimahomed, S., 2010. Thinking outside the rainbow: Women of color redefining queer politics and identity. *Social Identities*, 16 (2), 151–168.
- Aufderheide, P., 1986. Music videos: The look of the sound. *Journal of Communication*, 36 (1), 57–78.
- Austerlitz, S., 2007. *Money for nothing: A history of the music video, from the Beatles to the White Stripes*. London: Continuum International Publishing Group.
- Barnard, I., 1999. Queer race. *Social Semiotics*, 9 (2), 199–212.
- Barrett, M., 1982. Feminism and the definition of cultural politics. In: C. Rowan and R. Brunt, eds. *Feminism, Culture and Politics*. London: Lawrence & Wishart, 37–58.
- Beebe, R., 2007. Paradoxes of pastiche: Spike Jonze, Hype Williams, and the race of the postmodern auteur. In: R. Beebe and J. Middleton, eds. *Medium Cool: Music Videos from Soundies to Cellphones*. Durham: Duke University Press, 303–327
- Bell, B.T., Lawton, R., and Dittmar, H., 2007. The impact of thin models in music videos on adolescent girls' body dissatisfaction. *Body image*, 4 (2), 137–145.
- Bendix, T., 2018. Hayley Kiyoko Wants To Be The Lesbian Pop Star to Win At The VMAs and Then Take Over Top 40 [Online]. Available from: <https://www.intomore.com/culture/hayley-kiyoko-wants-to-be-the-lesbian-pop-star-to-win-at-the-vm-as-and-then-take-over-top-40> [Accessed 2 August 2019].
- Bird, S.E., 2011. Are we all producers now? Convergence and media audience practices. *Cultural studies*, 25 (4-5), 502–516.
- Bowers, S.R., 1990. Medusa and the female gaze. *National Women's Studies Association Journal*, 2 (2), 217–235.
- Bruns, A., 2008. *Blogs, Wikipedia, Second Life and Beyond: From Production to Prodisage*. New York: Peter Lang.
- Butler, J., 1990. *Gender trouble: Feminism and the subversion of identity*. New York: Routledge.

- Cefai, S., 2014. Feeling and the production of lesbian space in *The L Word*. *Gender, Place & Culture*, 21 (5), 650–665.
- Cheu, J., 2009. Seeing blindness on screen: The cinematic gaze of blind female protagonists. *The Journal of Popular Culture*, 42 (3), 480–496.
- Ciasullo, A.M., 2001. Making her (in)visible: Cultural representations of lesbianism and the lesbian body in the 1990s. *Feminist Studies*, 27 (3), 577–608.
- Collier, M., 2001. Approaches to analysis in visual anthropology. In: T. Van Leeuwen and C. Jewitt, eds. *The handbook of visual analysis*. London: Sage, 35–60.
- The Combahee River Collective, 1997. A Black feminist statement. In: L. Nicholson, ed. *The second wave: a reader in feminist theory*. New York: Routledge, 63–70.
- Crowley, P., 2018. *Hayley Kiyoko Talks Self-Directing Music Videos & First-Ever VMA Nominations: 'I'm Finally Invited to the Popular Table'* [Online]. Available from <https://www.billboard.com/articles/news/pride/8467216/hayley-kiyoko-directing-music-videos-vma-nomination> [Accessed 28 August 2018].
- De Lauretis, T., 1988. Sexual indifference and lesbian representation. *Theatre Journal*, 40 (2), 155–177.
- Dhaenens, F., 2016. Reading gay music videos: An inquiry into the representation of sexual diversity in contemporary popular music videos. *Popular Music and Society*, 39 (5), 532–546.
- Dirse, Z., 2013. Gender in Cinematography: Female Gaze (Eye) behind the Camera. *Journal of Research in Gender Studies*, 3 (1), 15–29.
- Dobinson, C. and Young, K., 2000. Popular cinema and lesbian interpretive strategies. *Journal of homosexuality*, 40 (2), 97–122.
- Doty, A., 2000. *Flaming Classics*. New York: Routledge.



- Dove-Viebahn, A., 2007. Fashionably femme: Lesbian visibility, style, and politics in The L Word. In: T. Peele, ed. *Queer Popular Culture*. New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 71–83
- Drukman, S., 2005. The gay gaze, or why I want my MTV. In: P. Burston and C. Richardson, eds. *A Queer Romance: Lesbians, gay men, and popular culture*. London: Routledge, 100–116.
- Drummond, K.G., 2003. The queering of Swan Lake: A new male gaze for the performance of sexual desire. *Journal of homosexuality*, 45 (2-4), 235–255.
- Edmond, M., 2014. Here we go again: Music videos after YouTube. *Television & New Media*, 15 (4), 305–320.
- Evans, C. and Gamman, L., 1995. The gaze revisited, or reviewing queer viewing. P. Burston and C. Richardson, eds. *A Queer Romance: Lesbians, gay men, and popular culture*. London: Routledge, 13–56.
- Ferguson, R.A., 2004. *Aberrations in black: Toward a queer of color critique*. Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press.
- Fuchs, C., 1992. Desperately seeking a subject: postmodern sexuality, Seideman, and Madonna. In: R. Dotterer and S. Bowers, eds. *Sexuality, the Female Gaze, and the Arts*. Selinsgrove: Susquehanna University Press, 37–52.
- Fuchs, C., 2010. Class, knowledge and new media. *Media, Culture & Society*, 32 (1), 141–150.
- Fuse, 2017. *Hayley Kiyoko Draws A Mood Board For Feelings* [Video File]. Available from: <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=PWKi69LHmQw> [Accessed 3 July 2018].
- Gamman, L. and Marshment, M., 1988. Introduction. In: L. Gamman and M. Marshment, eds. *The Female Gaze: Women as viewers of popular culture*. London: The Women's Press, 1–7.

- Garrity, J., 2001. Mediating the taboo: The straight lesbian gaze. *In*: J.O. Aimone and C.A. MacGillivray, eds. *Straight with a twist: Queer theory and the subject of heterosexuality*. Urbana: University of Illinois Press, 191–231.
- Green, P., 2017. SXSXW 2017 Interview, Hayley Kiyoko Reveals the One Thing You Don't Know About her [Online]. Available from: <https://www.mandatory.com/culture/1233399-sxsw-2017-interview-hayley-kiyoko-reveals-one-thing-dont-know> [Accessed 2 August 2019].
- Heaney, K., 2018. *Hayley Kiyoko Is Living Her Queer Teenage Dream* [Online]. Available from: <https://www.buzzfeednews.com/article/katieheaney/hayley-kiyokos-great-gay-pop-music-takeover#.vyjZnVyNLA> [Accessed 11 July 2018].
- Hillier, L. and Harrison, L., 2007. Building realities less limited than their own: Young people practising same-sex attraction on the internet. *Sexualities*, 10 (1), 82–100.
- Holloway, S.L. and Valentine, G., 2003. *Cyberkids: Children in the Information Age*. London: Routledge Falmer.
- Horowitz, S., 2018. *Hayley Kiyoko on Her Debut Album 'Expectations' and Being a Queer Pop Star: 'It's Important For People to Lead By Example'* [Online]. Available from: <https://www.billboard.com/articles/columns/pop/8235955/hayley-kiyoko-interview-expectations-sexuality> [Accessed 28 August 2018].
- Hunt, E., 2018. *On Hayley Kiyoko, Queerness and Mainstream Pop* [Online]. Available from: [https://noisy.vice.com/en\\_uk/article/435yvm/hayley-kiyoko-queerness-mainstream-american-pop-2018](https://noisy.vice.com/en_uk/article/435yvm/hayley-kiyoko-queerness-mainstream-american-pop-2018) [Accessed 12 July 2018].
- Jackson, S. and Gilbertson, T., 2009. 'Hot lesbians': Young people's talk about representations of lesbianism. *Sexualities*, 12 (2), 199–224.

- Jenkins, T., 2005. "Potential Lesbians at Two O'Clock": The Heterosexualization of Lesbianism in the Recent Teen Film. *The Journal of Popular Culture*, 38 (3), 491–504.
- Jewitt, C. and Oyama, R., 2001. Visual meaning: A social semiotic approach. In: T. Van Leeuwen, and C. Jewitt, eds. *The Handbook of Visual Analysis*. London: Sage, 134–156.
- Johnson, R., 1997. Reinventing cultural studies: remembering for the best version. In: E. Long, ed. *From Sociology to Cultural Studies: New Perspectives*. Malden, MA: Blackwell, 452–488.
- Kaplan, I., 2017. *Hayley Kiyoko on Being Open With Her Fans, Her Impact on the LGBT Community* [Online]. Available from: <https://www.billboard.com/articles/news/7832880/hayley-kiyoko-new-album-impact-lgbt-community> [Accessed 4 September 2018]
- Karlan, S., 2017. *If You've Ever Had A Crush, You're Going To Have Some Feelings About Hayley Kiyoko's New Single* [Online]. Available from: [https://www.buzzfeed.com/skarlan/hayley-kiyokos-new-video-is-for-all-the-girls-out-there?utm\\_term=.asr275rMq6#.oigLlq6m4g](https://www.buzzfeed.com/skarlan/hayley-kiyokos-new-video-is-for-all-the-girls-out-there?utm_term=.asr275rMq6#.oigLlq6m4g) [Accessed 28 August 2018]
- Kim, Y., 2015. Globalization of the privatized self-image: The reaction video and its attention economy on YouTube. In: L. Hjorth and O. Khoo, eds. *Routledge Handbook of New Media in Asia*. London: Routledge, 333–342.
- Kiyoko, H., 2016. *Hayley Kiyoko Finds Her Voice* [Online]. Available from: <http://www.papermag.com/hailey-kiyoko-outspoken-2143268093.html> [Accessed 20 July 2018]

- Lambert, M., 2013. *WE JUST SHOT A GAY MUSIC VIDEO* [Online]. Available from: <http://marylambertsings.com/we-just-shot-a-gay-music-video/> [Accessed 7 September 2018]
- Lang, R., 2002. *Masculine Interests: Homoerotics in Hollywood Film*. New York: Columbia University Press.
- Lee, R.C., 2004. "Where's My Parade?": Margaret Cho and the Asian American Body in Space. *The Drama Review*, 48 (2), 108–132.
- Lewis, R., 1997. Looking good: The lesbian gaze and fashion imagery. *Feminist Review*, 55 (1), 92–109.
- Lindner, K., 2013. 'InTouch' with the Female Body Cinema, Sport, and Lesbian Representability. In: K. Ross, ed. *The Handbook of Gender, Sex and Media*. Oxford: Wiley Blackwell, 277–293.
- Manovich, L., 2000. What Is Digital Cinema? In: P. Lunenfeld, eds. *The Digital Dialectic: New Essays on New Media*. Cambridge, MA: MIT Press, 172–92.
- McKenna, S.E., 2002. The queer insistence of Ally McBeal: Lesbian chic, postfeminism, and lesbian reception. *The Communication Review*, 5 (4), 285–314.
- Miles, S., 2018. Still getting it on online: Thirty years of queer male spaces brokered through digital technologies. *Geography Compass*, 12 (11), e12407.
- Morreale, J., 2014. From homemade to store bought: Annoying Orange and the professionalization of YouTube. *Journal of Consumer Culture*, 14 (1), 113–128.
- MTV. 2018. *Hayley Kiyoko Reacts to a Cover of Her Song 'Sleepover'* [Video File]. Available from: <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=1hHtDcW2TwE> [Accessed 3 July 2018]
- Mulvey, L., 1975. Visual pleasure and narrative cinema. *Screen*, 16 (3), 6–18.
- Pearson, R., 2010. Fandom in the digital era. *Popular Communication*, 8 (1), 84–95.

- Pilcher, K., 2012. Dancing for women: Subverting heteronormativity in a lesbian erotic dance space? *Sexualities*, 15 (5-6), 521–537.
- Rich, B. R., 2013. *New Queer Cinema: The Director's Cut*. Durham, NC: Duke University Press.
- Ritzer, G. and Jurgenson, N., 2010. Production, consumption, prosumption: The nature of capitalism in the age of the digital 'prosumer'. *Journal of Consumer Culture*, 10 (1), 13–36.
- Ritzer, G. Dean, P. and Jurgenson, N. 2012. The coming of age of the prosumer. *American Behavioral Scientist*, 56 (4), 379–398.
- Roberts, R., 1994. "Ladies first": Queen Latifah's Afrocentric feminist music video. *African American Review*, 28 (2), 245–257.
- Sarris, A., 1962. Notes on the Auteur Theory in 1962. *Film Culture*, 27, 1–8.
- Sedgwick, E. K., 1990. *Epistemology of the Closet*. London: Penguin.
- Seidman, S.A., 1992. An investigation of sex-role stereotyping in music videos. *Journal of Broadcasting & Electronic Media*, 36, 209–216.
- Sender, K., 2003. Sex sells: Sex, taste, and class in commercial gay and lesbian media. *GLQ: A Journal of Lesbian and Gay Studies*, 9 (3), 331–365.
- Shimizu, C.P., 2007. *The Hypersexuality of Race: Performing Asian/American Women on Screen and Scene*. Durham: Duke University Press.
- Siesing, G.M., 2000. Video. In: B. Zimmerman, ed. *Lesbian Histories and Cultures: An Encyclopedia*. London: Taylor & Francis, 793–795.
- Staiger, J., 2003. Authorship Approaches. In: D.A. Gerstner and J. Staiger, eds. *Authorship and Film*. New York: Routledge, 49–52.
- Stevenson, N., 2006. *David Bowie: Fame, Sound and Vision*. Cambridge: Polity Press.

- Stevenson, N., 2009. Talking to Bowie fans: Masculinity, ambivalence and cultural citizenship. *European Journal of Cultural Studies*, 12 (1), 79–98.
- Thelwall, M. Sud, P. and Vis, F., 2012. Commenting on YouTube videos: From Guatemalan rock to el big bang. *Journal of the American Society for Information Science and Technology*, 63 (3), 616–629.
- Urban Outfitters Television, 2018. *Open Up w/ Hayley Kiyoko — Urban Outfitter* [Video File] Available from: <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=YYNNNQKkXXk> [Accessed 8 August 2018].
- Valentine, G., 1995. Creating transgressive space: the music of kd lang. *Transactions of the Institute of British Geographers*, 20 (4), 474–485.
- Vernallis, C., 2004. *Experiencing music video: aesthetics and cultural context*. New York: Columbia University Press.
- Vernallis, C., 2013. *Unruly Media: YouTube, music video, and the new digital cinema*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Ward, L.M. Hansbrough, E. and Walker, E., 2005. Contributions of music video exposure to black adolescents' gender and sexual schemas. *Journal of Adolescent Research*, 20 (2), 143–166.
- Waterhouse, R., 1993. The inverted gaze. In: S. Scott and D. Morgan, eds. *Body Matters: Essays on the Sociology of the Body*. London: Falmer Press, 105–21.
- Whiteley, S., 2010. Who Are You? Research Strategies of the Unruly Feminine. In: D.B. Scott, ed. *The Ashgate Research Companion to Popular Musicology*. Abingdon: Routledge, 186–198.
- Zhang, Y. Miller, L. E. and Harrison, K., 2008. The relationship between exposure to sexual music videos and young adults' sexual attitudes. *Journal of Broadcasting & Electronic Media*, 52 (3), 368–386.