

## Legacies<sup>i</sup>

Angeliki Balayannisii

"Reckoning with the past that we carry in our present involves crafting some way to inventory the ghosts in our bones"1

Legacies are material and political inheritances. They collapse the past, the present, and the future, stretching time and space. Unlike the concepts of history or temporality, legacies demand a material attunement to the residual.2 The legacies of industrial chemistry have particularly unruly residues; their materialities are elusive and uncertain, transgressing borders, boundaries, and bodies. But despite their everywhere-and-when-ness, the legacies of late industrialism always unfold unevenly - their violent effects are racialised, classed, and gendered. These shadow places are sites of dispossession and colonial geographies; toxic geographies.<sup>3</sup> Approaching legacies as residues of toxic infrastructures offers a generative form of critical analysis, but it presents limits for ethical intervention. How can the legacies of late industrialism be conceptualised in a way that makes detoxified futures possible? How can the legacy become a mode of action?

The signed, stamped, and scanned form overleaf is a legal document required for the transboundary movement of hazardous waste. It accompanied the shipment of a chemical stockpile in late 2012 – two hundred and twenty tonnes of banned and expired pesticides – from its dumpsite in Tanzania, to an incinerator in Southern Poland. Through universalised codes and categories the document marks the origins, destinations, carriers, and materialities of wastes. This is a lingering fragment of bureaucratic paper-work which enables hazardous waste to travel smoothly from one site of disposal to the next. The classifications transform messy and leaky shipments into contained and legible objects of management for globalised economies of disposal.4 However, classifications also perform erasures. The document is part of a vast corporate archive assembled to evidence the successful disposal of hazardous materials. Although this waste was incinerated, its material legacies linger in every site it has encountered: from its origins in Greece; to its dumpsite in Eastern Tanzania; to the air, soils, and water surrounding the incineration plant in Poland.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Shotwell, *Against Purity*, 23. <sup>2</sup> Boudia et al., "Residues."

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> Liboiron et al., "Toxic politics"; Murphy, "Alterlife."

<sup>4</sup> Balayannis, "Toxic sights."

1. Corresponding to notification No:	TZ 2012 03	2. Serial/total	number of shipments: O 1 100
Exporter - notifier Registration No: 101 -190 -145 ame: National Environment Management Council.		Importer - consignee Registration No: SR-II-6618/7/06/13/07     Name: SARPI DABROWA GÓRNICZA Sp. z o.o.	
idress: Regent Estate, Migombani, Plot No		Address: Koksownicza 1	6, 42-523 Dąbrowa Górnicza, Poland
r-es-Salaam, Tanzania		Carlant annual Korin	a Szafranek – Braś
ontact person: Mr. Bonaventure Baya et: 00255 22 277 4852 Fax: 00255 22 277 4901		Contact person: Karini Tel: 0048 (0) 639 50 ( E-mail: kbras@sarpi.pl	
mail: dg@nemc.or.tz Actual quantity: Tonnes (Mg):(1,240	hy m3: 16	, 6. Actual date of shipmen	: 02-10-2012
Packaging Type(s) (1): 1,5	Number of packages:		
out the same of th	Yes: No:     8.(b) 2 <sup>ad</sup> Carrier:	⊠	8.(c) Last Carrier:
(a) 1st Carrier (3): egistration No:	Registration No:		Registration No:
me: DRugu - ALLY	Name: MSCGQ	neva	Name: Address:
dress: UNAR-RS -SALAM	Tel: 0341 227	n3 5888	Tel: 1 de la la temp, de Majarinika
x:	Fax:	000	Fax: 100 mil 17 fb, to f0.81 021 by 1
nscu 6967781270 b	E-mail:		[E-mail: More than 3 carriers (2)
eans of transport (1): 10 ft Courtain	e completed by carrier's represent	SC ANAFI	Means of transport (1): R
te of transfer o 2-10-12	Date of transfer:	3.2012	Date of transfer: 23. 11. 2012v. Signature: Krouik
Waste generator(s) - producer(s) (4;5;6):		12. Designation and comp	osition of the waste (2):
gistration No: 101 -190 -145 me: National Environment Management		Obsolete Pesticides packe pesticides listed in Annex 2	d in various packaging and contaminate packaging with
dress: Regent Estate, Migombani, Plot No	. 29/30 P.O. Box 63154		
ar-es-Salaam, Tanzania ontact person: Mr. Bonaventure Baya ol: 00255 22 277 4852 Fax: 00255 22 277 4901		13.Physical characteristics	(1): 2 - Solid
mail: dg@nemc.or.tz		14.Waste identification (fill	
te of generation (2): African Stockpiles Programme - Tanzania  ), Disposal facility or recovery facility		(i) Basel Annex VIII (or IX if a (ii) OECD code (if different fr	.,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,
	overy facility	(iii) EC list of wastes:	020108*
gistration No: SR-II-6618/7/06/13/07 me: SARPI DĄBROWA GÓRNICZA Sp. z o.o. fress: Koksownicza 16, 42-523 Dąbrowa Górnicza, Poland		(iv) National code in country (v) National code in country	of export: Q3+Q13+Q14/D10/954+L4/iC25+C43+C34/H +H6,1+H12//A100
		(vi) Other (specify): (vii) Y-code: Y4, Y3	. VAE
ntact person: Karina Szafranek – Braś I: 0048 (0) 639 50 00 Fax:	0048 (0) 639 50 20		16,H8, H12
mail: kbras@sarpl.pl		(ix) UN class (1): 3,6.1	
tual site of disposal/recovery (2)  Disposal/recovery operation(s) – Incineration or	DABROWA GÓRNICZA Poland	(x) UN Number: See / (xi) UN Shipping name:	Annex 2 See Annex 2
code / R-code (1): D10	T COING	(xii) Customs code(s) (HS):	3808999000
Exporter's - notifier's / generator's - producer's entity that the above information is complete and co	react to my best knowledge. I also ce	ertify that legally enforceable w	ritten contractual obligations have been entered into, that any
plicable insurance or other financial guarantee is in e countries concerned.	force covering the transboundary m	ovement and that all necessar	y consents have been received from the competent authorities of
me: SMA CENTYS	Date: © 2- 18	9-20VZ	Signature:
For use by any person involved in the transbor	undary movement in case addition	nal information is required	
Shipment received by importer - consignee (if			Signature:
		SPOSAL / RECOVERY FACIL	
Shipment received at disposal facility	. 🗘	covery facility	<ol> <li>I certify that the disposal/recovery of the waste described above has been completed.</li> </ol>
te of reception: 2012 -12- 0 4 antity received: Tonnes (Mg): 12 60	Accepted:	Rejected*:	
proximate date of disposal/recovery: 10.112 July		competent authoriti	
posal/recovery operation (1): \$ 10		rowa Górnicza	Date.
Dadora		ną odpowiedzialnoscią	Signature ลิกิสาร์สิทิต Dabrowa Górnicza
le: 2012 -12- 0 4		nicija, ul. Kokgownicza 16	Spólka a ograniczona odpowiedzialność
te: 2012 -12- 0 4	tel. 032 639 50 0	(Vake 632 634 50020	1 42- 323 Hapidae By Tell III
	Regon 272 300 75	4, NIP 629-10-03-353	tel. 032 639 .i0 00, fax 132 639 50 2
See list of abbreviations and codes on the next page     Attach details if necessary     If more than 3 carriers, attach information as requi	age	90.00 mm 1.00 mm 1.00 mm	Regar Required by the Basel Convention 0-03-3 (5) Attach list if more than one (6) If required by national legislation

Figure 1. Scanned copy of hazardous waste movement document. 2012. Veolia digital archive, Wales

3

The lingering residues of this stockpile in seemingly distant and disconnected bodies are the legacies of 20th century industrial chemistry and the hubris of science. They are also legacies of toxic waste colonialism – biopolitical geographies which privilege some lives over others. Now, it is easy to stay with the violence and toxicity: researchers concerned with environmental injustices have an epistemological habit of telling stories of damage. But damage stories can compound the violence at contaminated sites by reducing places to their toxic capacities.5 How might this story be told differently? How can legacies become sites of repair? More specifically, what can this mundane waste movement document do aside from erase the violent afterlives of industrial chemicals? Geographers are demonstrating how such ordinary bureaucratic materials can be subverted to perform more critical work. This requires a shift in the understanding of legacies from toxic residues to situated practices of care.<sup>7</sup> A pivot from noun to verb – from name to action. From legacy to archive.

The legacy as archive has three primary objectives: first, to acknowledge the power of representations in the production and endurance of shadow places. Archives attend to pollutants beyond their molecular formations, incorporating the informational dimensions of chemical regulatory systems such as hazardous waste bureaucracies. Legacies as archives are therefore multiple and multi-sited; they are 'situations'8 or situational experiments,9 rather than territorially bounded sites. Second, archives demand ongoing maintenance and repair – more care-full modes of relating that assemble incommensurable data; are attentive to routine procedures and practices; and stretch the temporalities of ethical obligations. And third, archives can enable the messy interdisciplinary work that is necessary for making sense of, and intervening in, toxic situations. 10 Earth scientists indeed routinely invoke the archive as a spatiotemporal imaginary for telling stories of residues and traces.

Archives are of course also entangled in their own geographies of violence. Archival interventions require 'tidying things up'11 and run the risk of performing systematic erasures of memory – particularly in colonial archives.<sup>12</sup> The classifications central to the hazardous waste shipment document archived by Veolia, are indeed a key method through which (neo)colonialism takes form – a toxicity that is more than a matter of chemistry. The legacy as archive then, must be a decolonial intervention. This is not just a call to assemble subaltern stories of legacies. The starting point is an ontological and epistemological concern for the archive's 'compositional logics'; the conditions which enable something to become archivable.<sup>13</sup> To enable detoxified futures, the legacies of shadow places must ultimately extend beyond concerns around material inheritance, towards an ongoing and careful process of remembering.

<sup>5</sup> Murphy, Alterlife."

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> Balayannis, "Toxic sights"; Krupar, *Hot Spotter's Report*; Rosenfeld et al., "Hazardous Aesthetics."

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> see Beckett and Keeling, "Rethinking remediation."

<sup>8</sup> cf. Hinchliffe et al., "Biosecurity and the topologies of infected life."

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>9</sup> Balayannis & Garnett, "Chemical kinship."
<sup>10</sup> Fortun et al., "Experimental ethnography online."

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>11</sup> Houston, "Junk into urban heritage," 110.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>12</sup> Stoler, "Along the Archival Grain."

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>13</sup> Povinelli, *Geontologies*, 149.

## References

- Balayannis, Angeliki. "Toxic sights: the spectacle of hazardous waste removal." *Environment and Planning D: Society and Space* 38, no. 4 (2020): 772-790.
- Balayannis, Angeliki and Emma Garnett. "Chemical kinship: interdisciplinary experiments with pollution." *Catalyst: Feminism, Theory, Technoscience* 6, no. 1 (2020): 1-10.
- Beckett, Caitlynn and Arn Keeling. "Rethinking remediation: mine reclamation, environmental justice, and relations of care." *Local Environment* 24, no. 3 (2019): 216-230.
- Boudia, Soraya, Angela NH Creager, Scott Frickel, Emmanuel Henry, Nathalie Jas, Carsten Reinhardt and Jody Roberts. "Residues: Rethinking Chemical Environments." Engaging Science, Technology, and Society 4 (2018): 165-178.
- Fortun, Kim, Mike Fortun, Erik Bigras, Tahereh Saheb, Brandon Costelloe-Kuehn, Jerome Crowder, Daniel Price and Alison Kenner. "Experimental ethnography online: The asthma files." *Cultural Studies* 28, no. 4 (2014): 632-642.
- Hinchliffe, Steve, John Allen, Stephanie Lavau, Nick Bingham, and Simon Carter. "Biosecurity and the topologies of infected life: from borderlines to borderlands." *Transactions of the Institute of British Geographers* 38, no. 4 (2013): 531-543.
- Houston, Donna. "Junk into urban heritage: the Neon Boneyard, Las Vegas." *cultural geographies* 20, no. 1 (2013): 103–111.
- Krupar, Shiloh R. *Hot Spotter's Report: Military Fables of Toxic Waste.* Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 2013.
- Liboiron, Max, Manuel Tironi and Nerea Calvillo. "Toxic politics: Acting in a permanently polluted world." *Social Studies of Science* 48, no. 3 (2018): 331-349.
- Murphy, Michelle. "Alterlife and decolonial chemical relations." *Cultural Anthropology* 32, no. 4 (2017): 494-503.
- Povinelli, Elizabeth A. *Geontologies: A Requiem to Late Liberalism*. Durham and London: Duke University Press, 2016.
- Rosenfeld, Heather, Sarah Moore, Eric Nost, Robert E. Roth and Kristen Vincent. "Hazardous Aesthetics: A "Merely Interesting" Toxic Tour of Waste Management Data." *GeoHumanities* 4, no. 1 (2018): 262-281.
- Shotwell. Alexis. *Against Purity: Living Ethically in Compromised Times*. Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 2016.
- Stoler, Ann Laura. *Along the Archival Grain: Epistemic Anxieties and Colonial Common Sense*. Princeton: Princeton University Press, 2010.

An A to Z of Shadow Places Concepts				

© 2020 Angeliki Balayannis

This work is licensed under a <u>Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-NoDerivatives</u> 4.0 International License



<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>i</sup> Balayannis, Angeliki. "Legacies." *An A to Z of Shadow Places Concepts* (2020). https://www.shadowplaces.net/concepts

<sup>ii</sup> Angeliki Balayannis is a Lecturer in Human Geography in the Department of Geography at University of Exeter, United Kingdom <a.a.balayannis@exeter.ac.uk>