Employing Cornish Cultures for Community Resilience.

Submitted by Neil Patrick Martyn Kennedy to the University of Exeter as a thesis for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy in Cornish Studies.

Submitted in February 2013.

Abstract.

<u>Employing Cornish Cultures for Community Resilience.</u>

Can cultural distinctiveness be used to strengthen community bonds, boost morale and equip and motivate people socially and economically? Using the witness of people in Cornwall and comparative experiences, this discussion combines a review of how cultures are commodified and portrayed with reflections on well-being and 'emotional prosperity'.[1]

Cornwall is a relatively poor European region with a cultural identity that inspires an established ethno-cultural movement and is the symbolic basis of community awareness and aspiration, as well as the subject of contested identities and representations. At the heart of this is an array of cultures that is identified as Cornish, including a distinct post-industrial inheritance, the Cornish Language and Celtic Revivalism. Cultural difference has long been a resource for cultural industries and tourism and discussion of using culture for regeneration has accordingly concentrated almost exclusively on these sectors but an emergent 'regional distinctiveness agenda' is beginning to present Cornish cultures as an asset for use in branding and marketing other sectors. All of these uses ultimately involve commodification but culture potentially has a far wider role to play in fostering economic, social, cultural and environmental resilience. This research therefore uses multidisciplinary approaches to broaden the discussion to include culture's primary emotional and social uses. It explores the possibility that enhancing these uses could help to tackle economic and social disadvantage and to build more cohesive communities. The discussion centres on four linked themes:

---

[1] Simon Charlesworth (2000), *A Phenomenology of Working Class Experience*, Cambridge University Press: Cambridge.

multiple forms of capital;[2] discourse, narrative and myth; human need, emotion and well-being; representation and intervention.

Cultural, social, symbolic and human capital are related to collective status and well-being through consideration of cultural practices, repertoires and knowledge. These are explored with discussion of accompanying representations and discourses and their social, emotional and economic implications so as to allow tentative suggestions for intervention in policy and representation. A key conclusion is that culture may be used proactively to increase 'emotional capital'.[3]

[2] Pierre Bourdieu, 'Les trois états du capital culturel', in *Actes de la recherch en sciences sociales,* vol. 30, (November 1979), L'Institution Scolaire, pp. 3-6;
[3] Diane Reay (2004), 'Gendering Bourdieu's concept of capitals?: Emotional Capital, Women and Social Class', in L. Adkins and B. Skeggs (eds.). *Feminism after Bourdieu,* London: Blackwell.

Key words.

belongingness, branding, cultural capital, Celticity, commodification, Cornish language, Cornishness, cultural hygiene, cultural tourism, deprivation, difference, disadvantage, discourse, emotional capital, ethnicity, exchange-value, habitus, hegemony, hyper-reality, local knowledge, motivation, myth, mythology, narrative, networking, otherness, regeneration, representation, resilience, social capital, sustainability, symbolic capital, usable culture, use-value, useable culture, well-being.

Unite and unite and let us all unite,

for summer is acome unto day,

and whither we are going we will all unite,

in the merry morning of May.[4]

Acknowledgements.

Table of Contents.

Chapter One

An Introduction to Useable Culture.

The working proposition or pro-position adopted here is that 'distinctive Cornish cultures', including the Cornish language, may be deployed usefully in efforts to create sustainable communities or in current parlance, to build social and economic 'resilience', including the strength to adapt and respond to events.[5] This complements the stated ambition of the Objective One Programme for Cornwall and Scilly which links 'distinctiveness' to inclusiveness and prosperity:

> To achieve a step change in the prosperity of Cornwall and Scilly, making it a place where people and communities have equal access to opportunities and to a quality of life which arise from the sustainable development of its economy and its environment and the enhancement of its distinctiveness.[6]

Accordingly, this thesis elaborates a particular interpretation of 'regional distinctiveness' (the fifth of five Objective One priorities) by embracing the idea that a definably Cornish cultural tradition may be employed inclusively and constructively to strengthen communities that have been socially weakened by economic and demographic changes which are discussed. A questionable opening premise is that the ever-changing relations between heterogeneous communities and their cultures are crucial to how they work socially and therefore to how they function economically. The subjective view is also taken that local cultures and languages have worth as part of the collective stock of human experience and knowledge. Indeed, maintaining them features

---

[5] 'Distinctiveness', 'sustainability' and 'resilience' are current buzz-words in local government.
[6] 'Objective One Programme for Cornwall and the Isles of Scilly - Single Programming Document', (December 2005).

in the aims of government and international sustainability agendas and they are part of what diverse critics and activists around the world wish to retain under the homogenizing conditions of globalization and consumer capitalism.[7] Analogies are sometimes made between biodiversity as necessary to a healthy planet and cultural diversity as life-enriching and necessary to 'a healthy cultural world'[8] and geographically rooted cultures may even be viewed from such perspectives as 'bioregionalism' as bringing people together and binding them to their environment, locality and economy with benefits for each.[9] In much the same spirit it is proposed that Cornish cultures, like others, include local knowledge and useful resources that may be employed in addressing and setting sustainability objectives in such diverse areas as economic initiative, education, housing, land management and environmental planning.[10] Serendipitously, a piece of unusual graffiti on the site of the planned Cornish History Centre reads, 'Never underestimate the power of local knowledge.' (23rd November 2012) and in recent economic and community strategies for Cornwall both the 'knowledge-based economy' and 'regional distinctiveness' are seen, in the banal jargon of committees, as underlying 'sustainable economic development'.[11] Even so, few attempts have yet been made to genuinely link these elements or coherently explore what they could mean. The nearest institutional attempts are perhaps those implicit in campaigns for Cornwall to become a 'European Region of Culture' where the belief that local culture may be enabling and bonding is one of the motives for a Cornwall Council-led community initiative that emphasizes the social benefits of active, grass-roots participation, - often on a small and intimate scale, - rather than the passive

---

[7] cf. Sustainability agenda's of the E.U., Council of Europe, U.K. Government, Cornwall Council, U.N., Welsh Assembly, Scottish Executive.

[8] Wilhelm Meya in *The Financial Times* 2006, cited in Luisa Maffi and Ellen Woodley (2010), p.9., cf. UNESCO uses of 'linguistic / cultural diversity'.

[9] See, Michael McGinnis, (ed.) (1998), *Bioregionalism*, New York: Routledge.

[10] cf. Jean Olivero (2010) on planning in Brittany.

[11] e.g. Cornwall Council's 'Sustainable Community Strategy' and 'New Agenda' for planning. Comments by Cllr. Carolyn Rule on the Tremough Innovation Centre, 12th January 2011.

consumption of professional performances and production by audiences.[12] There is recognition within this that the worth of culture does not reside in its saleable value alone, despite widespread acceptance of commodification as a simple, direct way to mobilize culture for profit. This meshes with arguments based on cultural difference and the symbolic presence of the Cornish language that have helped to justify Cornwall and Scilly's[13] recently acquired status as a 'European economic region', distinguished from the larger and on average, more affluent 'South-West Region'. The latter lacks a unifying cultural identity, partly because it includes Cornwall and cannot therefore build upon the idea of Wessex, but Cornish campaigners have been able to combine cultural and historical arguments with economic ones to achieve Objective One. As part of this the 'existence of Cornish as an emblem of regional distinctiveness' is credited with having been, 'an important factor in Cornwall being awarded Objective 1 status.'[14] More generally, cultural difference has provided identity-based motivations for multiple economic, social and political projects and campaigns and has supported insistence on maintaining Cornwall's administrative integrity since attempts to create a Greater Plymouth or 'Tamarside' authority and alter its boundaries in the 1940s and 1960s:[15]

> Cornwall County Council has long used the rhetoric of 'difference' […] most notably in the submission to the Local Government Commission in 1994. Cultural aims grounded in regional distinctiveness are built into Objective 1 documentation…'[16]

---

[12] 'Cornwall, European Region of Culture', led by Cornwall Council. Discussed with Julie Seyler, project leader;
http://www.cornwall.gov.uk/default.aspx?page=22907 (Accessed, 2nd May 2011.)
[13] Cornish was spoken in Scilly until c.1670.
[14] http://www.magakernow.org.uk, (Accessed 24th June 2011.)
[15] J. Paton Watson and Patrick Abercrombie (1943), 'A Plan for Plymouth', Plymouth: Underhill (Plymouth) Ltd.; The Redcliffe-Maud Report (Cmnd. 4040), The Royal Commission on Local Government in England 1966-69; See discussion in Philip Payton (1992), *The Making of Modern Cornwall: Historical Experience and the Persistence of 'Difference'*, Redruth: Dyllansow Truran, pp. 211-115.
[16] Malcolm Williams (2002), 'The New Cornish Social Science', in P.J. Payton (ed.), *Cornish Studies*, no. 10, pp. 44-66, pp. 55.

The mobilization of identity for campaigns as diverse as regional status and opposition to hospital closures flags up non-commercial and social and symbolic uses of culture and points to a need for discussion of the less apparent ways in which geographically rooted cultures are valuable. A hunch, based on observations in Brittany, Galicia and other European regions, is that local cultures may strengthen slippery, abstract ingredients for community resilience, such as solidarity, motivation, aspiration and morale. An intention in this discussion is therefore to take the step from historical description of cultures and discussions of identity (vital foundational themes in the 'New Cornish Studies')[17] towards considering how particular assemblages of Cornish cultures may contribute to long-term community 'resilience', the term recently preferred to 'sustainability' in local government circles. This particular search for usefulness, whether futile or achievable, involves focusing on the collective status of the Cornish community and of disadvantaged fractions within it, drawing upon theory in the human sciences and recent perspectives and discussions in economic and cultural policy.

The following discussion also disambiguates the potentially euphemistic term 'regional distinctiveness' as meaning 'Cornishness' and explores what that means and could mean in the future. To return to the context of the Objective One regional aid programme, a review of 'creative industries' in 2007 noted that whilst, 'Cornishness [...] was the backbone of Priority 5 and is still important to Cornwall's future in terms of identity and aspirations', there had been insufficient progress in meeting related cultural needs.[18] In accordance with such concerns, Cornwall Council's 'White Paper for Culture' states that, 'Protecting and

---

[17] See, Philip Payton (ed.), *Cornish Studies*, 2nd series, vols. 1-20, University of Exeter Press.
[18] Julia Twomlow and Kevin Brownridge (2007), 'Counting on Creativity - An assessment of the impact of Objective One funding on Creative Industries enterprises in Cornwall, 2000-2006.', Newlyn: Perfect Moment.

nurturing indigenous/ distinctive Cornish culture is important'.[19] Despite such assertions of Cornishness, Cornwall Council's emergent regional distinctiveness agenda has compartmentalized the issue, so far failing to develop 'joined-up' policies that link culture and identity to social and economic issues. The following discussion takes this into account so that the objective of social cohesiveness is pursued with attention to the roles culture plays in the relationships that are the basis of functioning communities, constructed identities and a sense of *communitas*.[20] The intention is also to make the linkages between culture and the emotional and social underpinnings of regeneration explicit and reflect upon the general hypothesis that distinct Cornish cultures provide vital ingredients for community well-being. A linked hypothesis is that culture can strengthen the feelings associated with belonging to a community and even engender a will to strive, invest and contribute to it beyond selfish interest. This, it is suggested, is an economic and social asset that sometimes leads to forms of motivation, desire and vocation that by being based on sentiment and non-economic aspirations, defy what some might think of as rational economic actions. In other words culture can support unselfish investments in the community that compare to other non-profit-motivated economic behaviours such as those that are influenced by social consciousness, religious conviction, patriotism, environmentalism and other personal loyalties and affiliations.

Culture may potentially be used for many different things and these sometimes produce conflicts of interest in which there are winners and losers but an indispensible part of genuine regeneration is improving the conditions of the worst-off and addressing inequalities. This means taking partial views on the ends to which culture should be put rather than just finding uses for it irrespective of whether the disadvantaged benefit. This partiality is supported by democratic, inclusive

---

[19] Cllr. Joan Symons in, 'White Paper for Culture', Truro: Cornwall Council, (October 2012), *Foreword.*
[20] *Communitas*: Used here to mean a strong community feeling of togetherness.

presumptions within sustainability agendas that implicitly exclude unsustainable greed and which purportedly address poverty comprehensively and with due attention to material, cultural and psychological factors (even if these aims are subverted in order to 'greenwash' socially exclusive developments).[21] Some agendas adopt ethical, even moralistic, standpoints that oppose exploitative and environmentally damaging modes of production and actions that create poverty and social division. The focus is shifted from making money in the short-term towards long-term, viable ways of life for everyone, providing an emphasis that fits the aim of finding useful things to do with Cornish cultures that benefit all sections of society without imposing morally legitimate prescriptions.

Primary uses, human need and well-being.

Inherent in this approach is the idea that culture has uses, a point of view that will almost certainly raise the objection that culture need not be useful at all, - that art forms or languages or traditions, for example, transcend functional considerations; but such reactions rely upon limited, everyday notions of use, notably the idea that it implies something material or economic. Whilst culture may indeed have commercial or obviously practical applications, some of which will be examined, its engagement of the senses and the emotions may also be considered to involve other kinds of use in areas of psychological, emotional, spiritual and aesthetic need. These may be thought of as primary uses so that, in Marx's terms, cultural practices may be said to have 'use-values', a notion explored later. Culture, in the comprehensive sense common to anthropology and cultural studies, is furthermore the basis of social relationships and therefore society. Indeed some non-material uses, outside the logic of economic exchange, are as old as

---

[21] Accusations heard in discussion with opponents of planned 'eco-villages' in Mid Cornwall.

humanity and they address perceived human needs which include having relationships with others and belonging to a community. In theoretical accounts which are derived and elaborated from Abraham Maslow's hierarchy of need, these involve interpersonal human requirements and relate to friendship, love and related feelings.[22] They concern 'belongingness' or the psychological need to be part of a group.[23] In hierarchical presentations of need, these are commonly ranked just above physiological requirements and the need for physical security and safety and are said to support a further level of psychological need in the area of esteem, which includes confidence, self-esteem and respect of and by others. The point is that culture is involved in meeting (and sometimes not meeting) these needs and is therefore connected to what Maslow (and much of present-day psychology) calls 'self-actualization', whereby individuals realize their inbuilt potential once all of their needs have been fulfilled. Maslow argues that self-actualization rarely happens in practice and that because most people's needs are not fully met, they operate on lower levels. Another way of putting this is to say that their psychological potential is not optimized, limiting their personal expectations, desires and ambitions as well as their ability to function socially (and therefore economically). As discussed later in relation to Cornwall, some of the things that can go wrong in the areas of esteem and self-actualization relate to culture. Importantly for this discussion, cultural 'distinctions'[24] are the arbitrary and subjective basis of identities and belongingness, and they play a role, through the workings of hegemony, in determining social status. They may thus be involved in undesirable and disabling psychological effects such as an inferiority complex, depression, stress

---

[22] Abraham Maslow, 'A Theory of Human Motivation', in *Psychological Review*, 50, (1943), pp. 370-396. http://psychclassics.yorku.ca/Maslow/motivation.htm (Accessed 16th September 2012.); cf. Maslow (1954), *Motivation and Personality*, Harper and Row Publishers.

[23] See, N. Kunc (2011), *The Need to Belong: Rediscovering Maslow's Hierarchy of Needs,* Paul H. Brookes Publishers; S.T. Fiske (2009), *Social beings: A Core Motives Approach to Social Psychology*; R.F. Baumeister and M.R. Leary, (1995), 'The Need to Belong: Desire for Interpersonal Attachments as a Fundamental Human Motivation', *Psychological Bulletin, 117*, 497-529.

[24] Pierre Bourdieu's notion explored later: Pierre Bourdieu (1979), *La Distinction, Critique sociale du jugement*, Le Sens Commun (coll.), Paris: Minuit.

and a personal sense of incapacity, all of which are commonly recognized as stemming from the non-fulfilment of human needs. All of these effects are sometimes discussed in relation to Cornish identities, even if this has yet to generate much in the way of published work,[25] and they are recurring themes in work on disadvantage and marginalization where the term 'deprivation' often encompasses, not just relative material poverty, but also social exclusion and a range of social problems.[26] In related public discussions the obviously subjective and relative terms of reference, 'well-being' and 'quality of life' are also common and are used variously.[27] For the sake of this discussion, though, they may be taken to have something to do with the fulfilment of psychological as well as material needs and as such they stand as catch-all designations for 'non-deprivation'. This connects with a thread within public debates, including those around David Cameron's 'Big Society',[28] which maintains that not all of the ingredients for happiness and well-being are economic and that affluence and consumerism are not enough to produce contentment. Our sense of leading worthwhile, fulfilling lives, our physical and mental health and our state of mind, may not be neatly correlated to measurements of wealth but may have much to do with culture.

The idea that psychological needs like self-esteem have implications for well-being and health is established, often from studies of diverse situations where a lack of esteem is linked to pathological effects such

---

[25] An exception is, Allan Ivey and Philip Payton, 'Towards a Cornish Identity Theory', in *Cornish Studies,* no. 2, (1994), pp. 151-163.

[26] e.g. The Local Government Improvement and Development website: http://www.idea.gov.uk/idk/search/system-search.do?k=deprivation&x=23&y=11 (Accessed 2nd November 2011.)

[27] Louis Tay and Ed Diener (2011), 'Needs and Subjective Well-Being around the World,' *Journal of Personality and Social Psychology,* vol. 101 (2), pp. 354–365. http://www.apa.org/pubs/journals/releases/psp-101-2-354.pdf. (Accessed 16th September, 2012); G. Hofstede (1984), 'The Cultural Relativity of the Quality of Life Concept', *Academy of Management Review,* vol. 9 (3), pp. 389–398, http://www.nyegaards.com/yansafiles/Geert%20Hofstede%20cultural%20attitudes.pdf (Accessed 6th May 2010)

[28] A theme in public discussion, e.g. http://www.youngfoundation.org/publications/books/the-state-happiness-january-2010 (Accessed, January 2011).

as domestic violence, alcoholism, suicide and self-harm.[29] The low status of some cultures has been recognized as contributing to such affects and cultural valorization and enrichment have sometimes been the basis of projects to address them.[30] In fact, embedded language revitalization has been presented as helping to reduce social pathologies and enable communities, most notably in North America and Australia where indigenous languages have become the basis of wider, validating projects that are expected to reduce a range of problems.[31] Producing psychological benefits may therefore be one of the main ways in which culture and language revitalization might contribute to well-being. To be clear, there is no suggestion that Cornish society is particularly marked by social pathologies but there are, nevertheless, higher than average levels of alcohol misuse amongst young adults, as well as pockets of certain kinds of drug abuse and of suicide.[32] There is, however, no readily available information on the proportion of indigenous Cornish people in the statistics and the overall proportion of problem drug users is lower than the average for England. What is suggested though, on the basis of observation, is that sections of Cornish society suffer from reduced morale as a result of low status and marginalization linked to economic, social and economic circumstances. This can appear in ways that do not lend themselves to statistical measurement or classification as pathologies and consequently it receives little attention. The role of culture's primary uses in morale is also largely ignored or poorly understood in economic projects and strategies that are by-and-large undertaken and imposed from outside the community by professionals

---

[29] See, M. Shaw, G. Dorling, G. Davey (1999), *The Widening Gap*, Bristol: Policy Press.

[30] cf. Jean Olivero (2010), pp. 153-155, re. suicide and cultural status in Brittany; T. Blakely and K. Dew (2004), re. Maoris; For suicide in Cornwall see, S.A. Hill, C. Pritchard, R. Laugharne, D. Gunnell, 'Changing patterns of suicide in a poor, rural county over the 20th century: A comparison with national trends.' In *Social Psychiatry and Psychiatric Epidemiology*, vol. 40 (8) (2005), pp. 601-604.; cf. 'Health and Wellbeing - Focus on healthy adults,' Cornwall Council, Community Intelligence Team, 2009.

[31] e.g. Ojibwe, http://www.tpt.org/?a=productions&id=3, (Accessed 29th November 2012) and communication from Anthon Treuer, Bemidji State University.

[32] Cornwall Council, 'Preventing suicide: a strategy for action in Cornwall and Isles of Scilly - 2008-2013'; Communications from Dr. Rohit Shankar, Peninsula Medical and Dental School; Cornwall and Isles of Scilly Drug and Alcohol Action Team, 'Alcohol Needs Assessment', (2010-11) and 'Adult Drug Treatment Needs Assessment' (2010-11) (also cites Home Office research estimates)

who have no direct emotional engagement as cultural 'insiders' and who usually lack comparable experiences and feelings produced by economic disadvantage and cultural marginalization.

Culture always serves a purpose then, whether we are aware of it or not and the uses to which it is put may be beneficial or detrimental to people's well-being. Using culture beneficially to address morale can be related to what Diane Reay calls 'emotional capital',[33] encapsulating a sense of individual and collective worth which need not correspond to economic standing or material measures. The idea of primary use and related intervention leads to an idea of *usable culture* which connects with the notion of 'useable history',[34] and which reminds us that cultures, like histories and correspondingly 'imagined identities',[35] have often been the basis of political and social projects, for better or worse. Here the interest is in progressive community regeneration as actively engaged practice and the notion of 'usable culture' for this purpose underpins all of the forthcoming chapters. Asking how culture might be used to these ends replies to the frequently-asked, rhetorical questions (from the assumptions of modernism) posed to the supporters of 'regional and minority' cultures and languages, of the type, 'What use is it?'. It also attempts to go beyond the contrary polemic of minority politics which inhibits reflection on whether there is a useful point to these cultures by claiming and asserting their intrinsic value defensively and without question.

---

[33] See, Diane Reay (2004), 'Gendering Bourdieu's concept of capitals?: Emotional Capital, Women and Social Class', in L. Adkins and B. Skeggs (eds.). *Feminism after Bourdieu,* London: Blackwell.

[34] For discussion see, Michael Keating (2001), 'Rethinking the Region. Culture, Institutions and Economic Development in Catalonia and Galicia'. *European Urban and Regional Studies*, vol. 8 (3), pp. 217-234.

[35] Benedict Anderson (1991), *Imagined Communities: Reflections on the Origin and Spread of Nationalism*, 2nd edition, London and New York: Verso.

Narratives and representation.

The Cornish cultural project leader and performer, Will Coleman, connects community narratives to all areas of life, suggesting that, 'Stories have been at the heart of all cultures and can heal, inspire, delight, enrage but, can ultimately change our view of ourselves, other people and the world around us.'[36] Indeed, culture and identity may be thought of as being constructed through stories and their performance. Here, this is taken to include the practices of daily life where even banal acts convey ideas discursively. Culture, history and heritage are inextricably connected and come together as the material of narratives and representations. What is more, this is a multidirectional set of relationships in which cultures, histories and heritage are in turn shaped discursively by narratives which may be generated within the community or received from outside. Culturally mediated stories may be used (beneficially) or misused (harmfully) by 'insiders' in representing and imagining their own communities and by 'outsiders' in constructing external representations and imaginings. Cultures thus serve in relaying narratives that connect to the primary uses already introduced. These stories include the histories of continuity and tradition that underpin all ethno-cultural communities, as well as those which valorize or de-valorize the group and inform or undermine agency. Through the performance of culture insiders represent themselves to each other and recreate and disseminate the ideas they have of themselves. This is presumably why a recent report by the think-tank DEMOS argues that, 'If people are going to have an active role in Cornwall as a region of Culture, then the use of different kinds of narrative will be important.'[37]

In practice, 'insiders' do not create narratives that are immune from outside versions and they do not always produce stories about

---

[36] Will Coleman, *The Western Morning News*, 26th June 2007.

[37] Charlie Tims and Shelagh Wright, 'Bidding for a competition that doesn't exist! - How Cornwall imagined a Region of Culture and found a future', DEMOS, 2006.

themselves that are enabling and beneficial or rooted in valedictory histories. Both 'insider' and 'outsider' narratives (as crude, often inseparable categories) can be disabling, negatively stereotypical or harmful in other ways. It is not usual for people to engage in representation consciously, wisely and with sophistication so the tendency is for prevalent, 'legitimate' discourses to be reproduced in matter-of-fact ways. In Cornwall, the intensity of mainly external, tourism-inspired representation makes it especially hard for insiders to develop and maintain useful narratives that stand a chance of competing, even amongst sceptical insiders. This also means that when it comes to representing Cornwall, commercially, administratively, politically and artistically, dissenting insider voices are drowned by the sheer volume of contradictory messages that furthermore gain credibility and legitimacy from their closeness to the 'centre' and their correspondence to received wisdom. Strong discourses (i.e. those which have a legitimate genealogy and often a degree of financial backing) favour one-size-fits-all agendas for regeneration and sustainability that are applied as totalizing solutions to local circumstances but which contain problematic assumptions about Cornwall that ignore local knowledge and therefore fail to address needs and aspirations. In response to this core problem, much of the analysis and discussion that follows is aimed towards considering strategies for maintaining useful narratives in the face of this and of how to intervene effectively and intelligently in the field of representation. Intervention involves the even more controversial need to think about which narratives could be useful and which cultural selections might support them, - a theme that will be explored. Cultural leaders and innovators, as individuals and groups, already intervene and make choices to project and relay images that they prefer but the intention here is not to offer an over-arching prescription as the 'right way' to do things. Instead community networks are considered as a means to facilitate yet unspecified initiatives and strategies to produce and disseminate 'useful' stories.

Commodifying Cornish difference.

An added reason for attending to the primary uses of culture is a new and still developing emphasis on selling Cornish culture that is informed by what happens in other places. Cornwall Council revealingly has a single 'Portfolio for Tourism and Culture' and its cultural strategy carries the tagline, 'Economic opportunity with cultural excellence.'[38] Quite simply, aspects of culture may be commodified profitably, cultural identity may be used to brand and market Cornwall, its products and its tourist destinations and people may work in cultural industries that exploit difference. Throughout Europe, cultural heritage underpins programmes and diverse marketing strategies where attention to regional distinctiveness as an 'asset' associates culture and the economy. In the 'Europe of the Regions' (part of the rhetoric of ethno-regionalist movements) cultures are converted into profit as consumers are willing to pay for difference, authenticity and local flavour, which in the case of produce is increasingly guaranteed by labels of 'approved origin'. This is another manifestation of expanding commodification, not just of culture *per se* but of connected place, identity and life generally. In some discussions, the Cornish language and Cornish cultures are seen, first and foremost, as saleable and marketable and this is one of the ways, - often the only way, - in which professional performers, cultural entrepreneurs and local government officers in Cornwall suggest that cultural identity might be useful.[39] The conversion of cultural difference into economic value has been established since the early twentieth-century marketing of the 'Cornish Riviera'[40] as a holiday destination but now, 'a greater acknowledgment within Cornwall of the marketability of cultural 'difference' has also influenced what kind of tourism initiatives are promoted.'[41] In other words, cultural difference is

---

[38] 'White Paper for Culture', Cornwall Council, October 2012, op. cit.

[39] e.g. Projects Consultancy - Cornwall Enterprise, 'Commercial Use of Cornish', (August 2008).

[40] See, Chris Thomas, 'See your own country first: Geography of a railway landscape' in E. Westland (ed.) (1997), pp. 107-128.

[41] Amy Hale, 'Representing the Cornish - Contesting heritage interpretation in Cornwall', in *Tourist Studies*, vol.1 (2), (November 2001), pp. 185-196, London: Sage, p.185.

more explicitly and intensely used in targeting niche markets, recalling expanding demands for cultural tourism in all guises from the banal to anthropo-tourism.[42]

High on the shopping list of saleable items are the consumable spectacles of cultural practices and symbols and icons of Cornishness which until very recently were associated unambiguously with Cornish nationalism and shunned by public bodies. An everyday example is *'Baner Peran'*, the Flag of St. Piran, revived from sparse historical references and re-imagined by Helena Charles and Richard Gendall (early members of Mebyon Kernow) after the Second World War as a symbol of nationhood and the desire for political autonomy.

> Baner Peran, gwidn ha du, yta va a euhon...
> Brossa oathom beska ve. Deen warbar Curnowion...[43]
> (St. Piran's flag, white and black, behold it above us...
> There's never been a greater need. Unite Cornish people...)

In the intervening years it has gradually been adopted as a ubiquitous, all-purpose symbol of Cornwall by Cornish people in general, almost inevitably appearing at public events and often on public buildings. In a very significant gesture during the Queen's Diamond Jubilee pageant of 2012, it was even flown with the flags of the constituent nations of Britain on the royal barge, 'Gloriana'. As recently as the 1980s, though, the flag was controversial and threatening enough to be banned from many public places, including town halls, schools and harbours.[44] Indeed there are anecdotes from the 1970s of education officials warning teachers not to fly it and of the police removing it from a town hall.[45] Now, despite its continuing oppositional uses, it is also part of

---

[42] See, Simon Coleman and Mike Crang (2002), *Tourism, Between Place and Performance*, New York, Oxford: Berghahn Books.

[43] 'Baner Peran', a song by R.R.M. Gendall. Unpublished learning resource, c. 1990.

[44] e.g. The Town Hall and Prince of Wales Pier, Falmouth c. 1979. Communications from Ted Chapman (d. 2010).

[45] Anecdotes.

the mundane iconography of product branding and regional promotion, safe enough to appear on supermarket shelves and so successful that neighbouring Devon and Dorset have developed derived flags for these uses. Selected imagery from consciously 'Celtic' Cornish cultures is incorporated into an increasingly commodified, leisure-orientated Cornwall with apparent ease, perhaps because much of it is folkloric and picturesque, sharing some of its genealogy with the established imagery of tourism. It may thus be read in ways that correspond to the 'three Rs' in prevalent portrayals of Cornwall: *romantic, rural* and *remote.*

A recent trend is the increasing reinterpretation and incorporation of nationalist-inspired items, alongside cultural elements that have long been used by tourism (pasties and piskies, cream teas and legends etc.), to provide visual supports for the phenomenon that Bernard Deacon calls, 'Lifestyle Cornwall'.[46] This is a version that is branded as 'upmarket' and 'exclusive' by tourism promoters, estate agents, property speculators and more controversially still, by the institutions of regional regeneration. It is thus a further development of prevailing images of unchallenging regional difference and leisure, and it foregrounds recreational lifestyles, obscuring seemingly incompatible representations of modernity, work, social challenges and deprivation as well as contradicting the possibility of native dynamism. Lifestyle Cornwall as a 'brand' or image is thus at the heart of conflicts of interest between different economic sectors and between various sections of the population. In the last decade and a half, approximately, tourism, expanding heritage industries and attendant development pressures have come together to multiply the volume of media representations that offer a fashionable set of Cornish experiences. Like the touristic imagery that preceded it, the discursive formation of Lifestyle Cornwall stands accused of carrying assumptions about

---

[46] Bernard Deacon (2007), *A Concise History of Cornwall,* Cardiff: University of Wales Press, p.227.

Cornish people that influence decision-makers unfavourably so that, '...Cornwall is poor because policy is based on what some people expect it to be rather than what the overall experience of life in Cornwall is.'[47] Bernard Deacon describes it as, 'feeding in on Cornwall's image as being a slightly green, a bit of a mini California, sort of 'do-a-bit-of-surfing-dude''.[48] It is an assemblage that involves 'iconic' landscapes and sites, 'high end facilities', quality restaurants and 'excellent local produce'[49] and it is now central to notions of what Cornwall's 'brand' should be in local government and tourism. Even Newquay, Cornwall's main resort, associated in recent decades with Ibiza-style clubbing, binge drinking and crime, is rebranded as 'The British California' in advertizing campaigns that visually associate surfing and designer beachwear with a stress-free lifestyle of jogging and harbour-side meals.[50]

Discussions of sustainability sometimes use 'capital' as a synonym for 'resources', so plants, animals and habitats are 'environmental capital' and the accumulated 'cultural riches' of groups and territories, or of humanity and the world, are described as 'cultural capital'[51] (a very different use of the term to that employed in the following chapters). Such usages of 'capital' and 'riches' lend themselves to commodification and commerce,[52] a perspective explored by Graham Busby in examining how places in Cornwall are constructed as tourist destinations with 'resources' that may be used in 'the construction of tourism potential'.[53]

---

[47] Joanie Willet (2010), p.5.

[48] Bernard Deacon, interviewed by Cornish National Cinema, http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=LbMaI0XaqNE (Accessed 5th January 2012).

[49] e.g. Uses by Visit Cornwall; cf. www.cornishcottageholidays.com (Accessed 24th November 2012).

[50] Newquay's 'official ' promotion film, launched in July 2011: http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=2ZnaxtR9ki8

[51] For an example see, www.mla.gov.uk/news_and_views/press/releases/2010/~/media/Files/pdf/2010/news/Cultural_Capital_Manifesto (Accessed June 2011.).

[52] Marx wrote that value in relation to capital "necessarily implies exchanges, riches do not". Marx, 1997:177.

[53] Graham Busby, 'Cultural Capital in Cornwall: Heritage and the Visitor', in P.J. Payton (ed.), *Cornish Studies,* No. 16, (2008), pp. 146-166 (149). Busby Busby refers to Aluza *et al.* (1998).

In this context, 'cultural capital' presents economic opportunities and, 'the potential economic value which may be derived from the inventory of cultural 'assets' at a given destination.'[54]

The assumption that local cultures may be (and should be) rendered economically profitable[55] extends to regeneration agendas and in Cornwall a new wisdom in tourism planning is that cultural difference may be used in 'regional branding' to promote the region as an all-year-round recreational destination with corresponding 'quality products' that generate income. This is apparent in statements from some Cornwall Council officers who suggest, for example, that 'you have to support what makes you different' in the market and identify 'how you stand out'.[56] The argument is that things that 'make Cornwall different' have economic value, a point understood, even by people with only the vaguest idea of what Cornwall's cultural difference might consist off. Even some of those who are suspicious of commodifying culture and identity see it, with resignation, as inevitable and think local people 'might as well' be the merchandisers and economic beneficiaries.[57] This was made apparent early in this inquiry when a prominent cultural practitioner and campaigner commented that, 'It's going to happen. Let's face it. People *will* sell it, even if we don't, so it might as well be us getting the money, not them.' There is a concern for job creation and income within these perspectives that echoes the deliberations of an earlier generation of Cornish community leaders who, faced with economic hardships at the end of the nineteenth century, resigned themselves to tourism as a means to address emigration and poverty, despite having misgivings and regrets:

---

[54] Graham Busby, op cit. p.149.

[55] cf. Michael Keating (2001), op. cit.

[56] Comments by Malcolm Bell of *Visit Cornwall* at the Bewnans Kernow conference, 'Cornwall means Business', 12th February 2011; Accounts of Cornwall Council Creative Services meeting, 17th February 2010.

[57] Contributions to the conference, 'Cornwall means Business', op. cit. note 53.; Discussion with Colin Roberts of Gorsedh Kernow.

[O]ne is bound, if he cares for his countrymen, to consider any cure thoughtfully suggested.[58]

The language of the market-place, even in critical approaches, raises questions about what the objectives of some current and proposed cultural initiatives are and which assumptions inform them. What, for instance, is meant and understood in such claims as, 'the culture of Cornwall is a collaborative brand'[59] or the suggestion that Cornish culture is 'good for business'[60] and what might the embrace of different kinds of cultural commodification mean for various sections of the population, including those who do not stand to gain financially?

Whilst commercial heritage discourses view culture as a commodity, others resist the idea and instead view culture and the linked notion of 'heritage', as too precious to be dealt with commercially, belonging to a domain that is outside that logic in much the same way as biodiversity. Commercializing culture produces opponents whose concerns about authenticity, quality and undesirable side-effects are, in themselves, evidence that people value (and wish to control) culture in non-economic ways. These conflicting ideas spill over into discussions of sustainability and development in more complicated ways than as simple oppositions and one of the reasons is that those who are concerned with the maintenance and vigour of culture and the 'preservation' of heritage for its own sake have to deal with financial constraints that pressure them to generate income from culture in order to fund their projects and justify them within a prevalent commercial rationale. Cornish cultural activists, concerned with the assertion of identity, have likewise collaborated with tourism, often despite themselves, and they have recently sought to package cultural

---

[58] Sir Arthur Quiller-Couch, *The Cornish Magazine*, vol.1, (1895), p. 236.
[59] C. Tims and S. Wright, DEMOS Report (2006), op. cit. note 34.
[60] e.g. Matthew Clarke, 'Cornish Culture in Business', http://www.businesscornwall.co.uk/blogs/guest-blog-cornish-culture-in-business-123, (Accessed 13th April 2012.)

products, including the Cornish Language, despite having motives that are usually nothing to do with financial profit. Cornwall Council's tourism office, *Visit Cornwall*, has undertaken 'visitor response surveys with questions on Cornish' and the Cornish Language Partnership, *Maga*, has run stalls at events strongly attended by tourists. This is part of a global phenomenon, where some people seek to make money from their local cultures, either to earn a livelihood or to finance the cultures themselves. In Cornwall the readiness of some practitioners to go down this route is also linked to a (childlike) desire for the 'recognition' of difference from the (parental) 'centre' and a wish to bring the existence of Cornish identity to the attention of others for a range of associated political aims, including the establishment of a Cornish Assembly and the creation of Cornwall-only institutions. This is a further example of something we can see in the other European regions chosen for comparison. Much as in Cornwall, the campaigns of ethno-regionalist and nationalist movements also furnish ready-made, contained identities that, complete with visual imagery and other cultural ingredients, are available as commercial resources.

A dilemma though is that the benefits that campaigners wish for may be accompanied by (mis)representation, misappropriation and economic forces that are damaging in areas material, psychological and social need. For example, they may confirm cultural (and indeed ethnic and social) inferiority through portrayals of selectively picturesque otherness and they may reinforce the realities of economic inferiority by encouraging migration trends that increase the demand for jobs and raise house prices. These are amongst the most pressing issues to address in Cornwall where established commodification of geographical and cultural identity in tourism has been the motor for demographic and social changes that produce marginalization and make it hard to address employment and housing issues. Cornwall is often cited as an extreme case of an attractive area with house prices that are unaffordable to people with typical local incomes and levels of holiday-

home ownership that have even produced a recent decline in the permanent population of some coastal areas.[61] Thus the financial exclusion of people from the housing market[62] and the strong competition that they face for jobs in some sectors may be linked directly to the selling of 'regional distictiveness'. These are such important and pressing issues that any discussion of further cultural commodification becomes nonsensical without reference to them. If existing ways of commodifying Cornwall's cultural and geographical differences are the cause of effects that result in expensive housing for everybody and unaffordable housing for many, then it would seem wise to think about whether proposals to commodify culture further might add to this and other problems. In short, selling culture or using it to sell other things (holidays, houses, regional produce) may profit some people whilst producing unforeseen collateral damage for others. Genuinely addressing regeneration therefore means looking at the whole picture, not just generating income now without thought for who gains, who loses and what happens next.

In many institutional discussions these risks are simply not dealt with and expressions of caution may also be ignored by Cornish activists when seeking enhanced status for cultural practitioners and job creation in the cultural sector.[63] Put simply, they may be so thrilled by the immediate opportunities for promotion and publicity and so preoccupied by displays of identity that they disregard anything that might inconveniently complicate an apparently straightforward proposition to combine profit with cultural development. Such limited approaches may, of course, fulfil institutional objectives, allowing regeneration institutions to demonstrate an expansion of business statistically and cite this as evidence of their effectiveness. In simple terms though, it is sometimes possible for people from outside a

---

[61] 'Cornwall 2011, Demographic Evidence Base', Cornwall Council.
[62] For media coverage see, http//www.thisiscornwall.co.uk/House-prices-seaside-locations-doubled-10-years/story-16062673-detail/story.html (Accessed 26th November 2012.)
[63] Discussions with managers of the *Celtic Link* at *Lowender Peran*, 2010.

community, or disadvantaged sections of it, to expand the cultural sector and commodify aspects of indigenous cultural heritage without consulting, employing or otherwise benefiting insiders. A commercial uptake of Cornish culture could easily happen without addressing disadvantage, regenerating communities or strengthening resilience. We have only to consider the experience of the 1980s and 90s, when a relatively low proportion of tourism-related businesses were in Cornish ownership,[64] even though, in order to attract visitors, the industry itself depended upon differences that were culturally produced by the Cornish.

As will be discussed later, these issues concern current efforts to 'promote' the Cornish language and the future development of a neo-Cornish music scene where emergent projects, linked to branding, tourism and the direct commodification of cultural production are now on the agenda. Viewing culture as saleable, even if the motives are not wholly commercial, also raises issues of ownership. Although cultural products (artifacts, performances and so on) may be marketed and sold, either by their generators or others, cultures themselves are perceived as belonging to groups. They involve intangible components such as memory, story, myth and symbol that are sometimes supported by the very practices and objects that are available for commercial exploitation. A potential consequence of commodification is that some elements of culture are no longer viewed as the exclusive property of the communities that produced them and may therefore become less useful in marking out and communicating identity and belonging. Yet in other instances, the fact that they have worth for higher status outsiders may lead insiders to take pride in their cultures and therefore in themselves and each other. Practically speaking then, commodification is neither all-good nor all-bad and a challenge, if it to be pursued at a policy level, is to find ways of using symbolic elements of culture without losing this

---

[64] Gareth Shaw and Allan Williams, 'Tourism and employment: reflections on a pilot study of Looe, Cornwall', (Department of Geography, University of Exeter) in *Area*, vol. 20 (1), (1988), pp. 23-24.

useful sense of ownership or reproducing harmful stereotypes that negative affect the wider economy and self-image.

Cultural items or a whole culture?

There might be two approaches to assessing the usefulness of Cornish cultures: an itemized or piecemeal approach, whereby component practices or elements are considered in their own right and a holistic one, where all of the constituents of culture are evaluated together as a single, multidimensional construction. Using the first approach, we could take individual elements and consider how they are valued by different sections of the community. We could take the various music and dance forms that are labelled 'Cornish' and inquire into participation and public perceptions, for example, or we could ask how much worth is attached to the Cornish language by a diverse public.[65] Indeed these are the obvious examples that would be identified by most researchers who are guided by Cornish nationalist and Revivalist and paradigms. For those concerned with commodification, the selection of individual artefacts, customs and practices as marketable items also suggests itself as an obvious route, but such a compartmentalized approach has shortcomings. It risks forgetting that cultural identities are whole, polymorphous, constructions where elements are embedded in contexts that are social, economic, historical and geographical with dimensions of gender, ethnicity, generation and class. Within these contexts, items have specific meanings, resonances and something of an 'aura', akin to the notion Walter Benjamin applied to works of art.[66] The seemingly woolly concept of 'aura' allows us to recognize that practices and artefacts, as items in context, can produce tacit and emotional responses and have primary uses for human need, thus serving a purpose before economic exchange is even considered. From a

---

[65] cf. Maga, http://www.magakernow.org.uk/default.aspx?page=404, (Accessed, 26.04.11.)

[66] Walter Benjamin, 'The Work of Art in the Age of Mechanical Reproduction', trans. Harry Zohn, in Benjamin, Illuminations, London: Jonathan Cape, 1970, pp. 219-53.

semiological perspective cultural practices and artefacts are polysemous signs which may be attributed different meanings by different people or, for that matter, by the same people according to the time and situation. Broadly though, customary meanings are partially 'anchored and relayed'[67] within socially-mediated meaning systems. Individuals relate to collective and customary maps of meaning that are constantly drawn and redrawn within the group and informed from the outside. Once elements are removed from this context they are ascribed new meanings so that their use and value has little bearing on how the culture as a whole is perceived.[68] Thus, whilst a piecemeal approach allows us to evaluate some uses for specific items, commercially and artistically for example, it does not get at the value attached to whole identities and that is important for the life-chances and well-being of cultural insiders.

Just as socio-cultural spheres have been seen as having relative autonomy (partly through discourse and hegemony) from economic and material circumstances so cultural components may be independent of one another and of social structure. It is possible to take elements from a culture, - one or several artefacts and practices or items of cuisine for instance, - and attribute worth to them whilst holding contradictory views that devalue the whole culture. Identities are 'elected and ascribed'[69] with reference to whole categories, not isolated elements, so whilst 'outsiders' may pick out bits they fancy, this need does not involve attributing worth to the cultural group. People may eat chicken tikka masala and listen to rap whilst holding essentialist, reductive or openly racist, views of the groups and cultures they are drawn from. By the same token, it would be simplistic to assume that somebody (even an 'insider') who likes pasties or some variety of Cornish music has

---

[67] cf. Roland Barthes (1993 [1957]), 'The Rhetoric of the Image', in *Mythologies*, Vintage, London.
[68] cf. Bernard Deacon and Philip Payton, 'Re-inventing Cornwall: Culture Change on the European Periphery', in *Cornish Studies,* no. 1, pp. 62-79 (63).
[69] Stuart Hall's terms, cf. Hall (1980 [1973]), 'Encoding/decoding', in Centre for Contemporary Cultural Studies (ed.): *Culture, Media, Language: Working Papers in Cultural Studies,* 1972-79, London: Hutchinson, pp. 128-38, cf. Stuart Hall and Paul du Gay (eds.) (1996), *Questions of Cultural Identity*, London: Sage.

wholly positive views of Cornish people and their cultural attributes. A few examples will illustrate this. At Bolster Day in St. Agnes (a carnival and theatre event based on the legend of a giant) a couple of middle-aged musicians who had learnt a repertoire of neo-traditional Cornish dance tunes and who enthused about 'Celtic festivals', told me that the 'locals' (people who had always lived there) were boring and that 'We don't have that much to do with them.' The impression was of somewhat Bohemian incomers creating a new community and drawing upon local elements, much as American sub-cultures appropriate Native American elements like sweat-lodges, powwows and 'ethnic' clothing. In another experience, participants in a race between former Falmouth oyster boats, teased the only man with a Cornish accent, going into Long John Silver-style imitations and making indecent quips about incest, the inference being that local people were inbred yokels. Although the distinctive fishing boats are appreciated they are being incorporated into a yachting scene that is becoming socially uncomfortable for people who share the boats' Cornish origins. Selected arrays of elements from another culture may be imbued with Otherness and appeal to the senses and the imagination but the very features that attract may simultaneously be held inferior, in opposition to the person's own culture (incidentally showing motivations for uptake of culture other than Althusser's ideological interpellation). The meanings attributed to cultural items will not be those understood in their original context; Sacred African chants acquire new meanings as World Music, as do opera excerpts as popular classics. In such situations, typical of postmodern eclecticism or *bricolage*, it is not possible to extrapolate from the worth attributed to one element, or a range of elements and assume more about how value is attributed to a whole culture and group. An observation-based contention, therefore, is that mixed processes of leisure-motivated appropriation and commodification sometimes lift items of Cornish culture from their embedded social contexts and inadvertently divorce them from traditional meanings and from primary social and emotional uses. They may be valued in new situations whilst broader constructions of

31

Cornishness are devalued. If we accept the notion of cultural ownership, this involves misappropriation and sometimes empties elements of symbolism and customary meaning so that they become unavailable as symbolic resources for their originators and expected inheritors. For example, the Cornish 'knit-frock', a distinctive fisherman's jumper, enjoyed renewed interest in the 1980s, thanks in part to a well-researched book,[70] but it was soon taken up as middle-class leisure wear and was commercialized so effectively that derivatives may now be bought in London and Paris. As a signifier, the knit-frock is now unlikely to be read as a local symbol but might well suggest that the wearer is, as some locals put it, a 'yachty' or 'salt water imposter' because it fits the image of nautically-themed leisure-wear promoted by *Armor Lux* in Brittany or *Sea Salt* in Cornwall.

Some items are more amenable to a piecemeal approach than others because they do not depend upon an established, deep context for their existence and are therefore more transferable as detachable parts which can acquire new meanings. For some edible examples, *'le fish and chips'* has recently enjoyed success in Paris restaurants where appreciation does not infer admiration for the dish's working-class, Yorkshire origins. Similarly, Cornish pasty shops have sprung up outside Cornwall, in places like Bath and Wells, and in London's Oxford Street and Tottenham Court Road, where they may be associated with holidays but hardly with former mining communities and Cornish 'food-ways'. To summarize, the apparent success of cultural items is not automatically of benefit for community status and well-being so we need to consider the whole picture in order to evaluate implications for the status of the Cornish as a group and their culture as a whole assemblage. This also requires us to think about how a multi-dimensional, heterogeneous set of cultures within Cornishness is nevertheless constituted and perceived as a single identity.

---

[70] Mary Wright (1979, 2008), *Cornish Guernsey's and Knit-frocks*, Polperro: Polperro Heritage Press.

Critically considering commodification and primary uses together allows a search for appropriate public policies and strategies where the desirability and implications of economic uses for culture's wider roles in relationships, feelings, emotions, - and even our psychological health, is taken into account. In this way the generation of profit does not become an end in itself but is approached as a possible means to creating lasting and resourceful communities. One way forward may be to avoid polarized, for-or-against arguments, of the kind that formerly characterized debates on Cornish tourism. The broad purpose in this thesis is therefore to discuss culture's potential usefulness and worth as a contributor to meeting a range of needs and to specifically consider it as an ingredient which affects the ability of communities to build sustainable futures and enjoy levels of solidarity and harmony that are conducive to well-being and to their capacity to adapt to change and exercise agency. This is a first-things-first approach that neither shuns commodification for profit nor embraces it as an unassailable logic. It aims to highlight primary emotional and social uses of culture and ensure that they are not ignored because of assumptions that commercial uses are straightforwardly beneficial and are the only use for Cornish cultures.

Chapter Two

Methodologies for Taking Part and Taking Sides.

This inquiry involves questions about cultural use that have to do with feelings and emotions that are slippery and largely unquantifiable. For example, how do you measure the emotional responses to a community narrative or the indirect impact on people's actions when collective memory is stirred by an everyday cultural performance, like drinking tea without sugar, eating a saffron bun, using a Cornish shovel or singing 'Goin' up Camborne Hill'?.[71] In this discussion such matters are related to cultural, social and symbolic capital which furthermore have no fixed values and are similarly hard to measure, let alone equate to a given amount of economic wealth or human well-being. These are subjective phenomena, all of which may be dismissed or ignored, yet they are nevertheless vital ingredients of community life that must be grappled with if the primary uses of culture are to be appreciated and brought to the fore.

Because of the desire to gather information on narrative, representation and emotional responses, linked to the primary uses already outlined, predominantly quantitative methods of analysis have been rejected. Although there is no special reason to reject statistical sampling of witnesses in these areas, the type of responses sought are of a nature that defies meaningful quantitative analysis and are better treated using interpretive methods of discourse analysis and semiological approaches that are introduced individually within the following chapters.

---

[71] Traditionally drinking tea without sugar is attributed to Methodist-led anti-slavery campaigns. The long-handled Cornish shovel recalls mining and working the land and symbolizes everyday difference. *Camborne Hill* is a song about Richard Trevithick's invention of the steam locomotive.

Some of the quantitative methods initially considered included probability-based sampling for questioning and the statistical analysis of questionnaires and levels of participation in activities but these were found wanting. Firstly, when examining research in other areas, I noted return rates of questionnaires that left considerable doubt over the subsequent findings. There must be suspicion that something is missing even when over eighty per cent of people in a sample respond but I accessed public consultations and academic research that constructed confident-sounding arguments based on return rates that were below fifty per cent, offering arrays of pie charts and bar graphs in support. There were several reasons for believing that it would not be possible to achieve more statistically valid results myself, beyond those of resources and time. The main issue is that even using face-to-face interviews to achieve a full response would not overcome the statistical problems of sampling that this case presents. When considering a small sampling frame,[72] such as participants in most specifically Cornish cultural activities, it can be impractical to achieve a representative sample with statistical reliability. I noted that the Cornish Language Partnership puts the number of 'fluent Cornish speakers' at somewhere in the order of three-hundred and I concluded that it would be nearly impossible to sample them representatively or to question all of them and achieve a one hundred per cent response. It was clear that many other areas of Cornish culture present similar difficulties. Where questionnaires have been used in this research, they have therefore been aimed at small groups (e.g. the Cornish Signage Panel) and have sought qualitative data using open questions.

This inquiry furthermore takes a specific interest in disadvantaged sections of the population that are often unheard in public debate and less likely to respond to questionnaires or to voluntarily voice their

---

[72] For discussion, see Alice Bloch in C. Seale (ed.) (2004), *Researching Society and Culture,* 2nd Edition, London: Sage, pp. 173-177.

opinions, for reasons of confidence and morale. These people are less likely to appear on the membership lists of cultural organizations and committees and are therefore likely to be missed, even when snowball or network sampling is used. I noted several pieces of work on the Cornish language that had overlooked specific sets of learners and speakers whose networks did not mesh with those generated from the starting points of the snowball sampling techniques chosen. Even when successfully included in the sample, individuals with low confidence and verbal competency may yield less data when presented with questionnaires or subjected to structured interviews. In order to overcome these challenges, I have selected a range of appropriate qualitative approaches whilst not abandoning the notion of a representative sample. This chapter sets out those methods and relates them to the research context and my subject position.

Participant Ethnography and Action Research.

At the planning stage, I identified participant ethnography as a broad empirical methodology and more specifically, I selected 'participant observation'.[73] This is essentially taking part, paying attention and asking pertinent questions.[74] I read about possible roles as, 'complete participant, complete observer, participant observer, observer as participant',[75] and expected to find myself shifting between them according to circumstances. I also read Sarah Thornton's description of the closeness of participant ethnography to everyday cultural life[76] and concluded that the information I was seeking could best be accessed by taking part so as to maximize the opportunities for watching and questioning. This was also a stragegy that I expected to provide some of the impressionistic and tacitly-guaged information about morale that

---

[73] Clive Seale (ed.) (2004), *Researching Society and Culture*, 2nd Edition, London: Sage, pp. 38, 226, 508.
[74] cf. Martin Hamersley and Paul Atkinson (1983), *Ethnography: Principles and Practice*, London: Tavistock Books.
[75] B. Junker's (1960), discussed in Seale, op.cit.
[76] Sarah Thornton, in K. Gelder and S. Thornton (1997), *The Subcultures Reader* (1997), London and New York: Routledge, pp. 213-216.

can come from observing demeanor and body-language and from hearing the tone of people's voices, - qualitative signs that we rely upon in everyday life but often exclude from research. I heeded Paul Willis' discussion of qualitative methodology:

> So to maintain the richness and authenticity of social phenomena it is necessary, certainly in the early stages of research, to receive data in the raw, experimental and relatively untheorized manner.[77]

On getting started, I quickly realized that participation had to be refined and supplemented. There was more to it than, 'scooting about having a geek at stuff', as a musician suggested to me. I took fuller account of issues of heterogeneity and subjectivity and selected more targeted methods of participation and sampling.

The purpose of addressing disadvantage led me to use a kind of 'action research',[78] similar to participatory approaches that have been used by teachers as 'reflective practitioners' and employed by organizations to improve working practice and efficiency. Stephen Tyler emphasizes this as cooperative and beneficial:

> A post-modern ethnography is a cooperatively evolved text consisting of fragments of discourse intended to evoke in the minds of both reader and writer an emergent fantasy of a possible work of commonsense reality, and thus to provoke an aesthetic integration that will have a therapeutic effect.[79]

Action research has several applicable features. Firstly, the research is initiated following the recognition of a need to change and the purpose

---

[77] Paul E. Willis, 'Theoretical Confessions and Reflexive Method, [1976], in K. Gelder and S. Thornton (eds.), (1997), op. cit., p. 246.
[78] See, Peter Reason and Hilary Bradbury (2007), *Handbook of Action Research*, 2nd Edition. London: Sage.
[79] Stephen A. Tyler [1986], 'Post-modern Ethnography', in K. Gelder and S. Thornton (1997), op. cit., pp. 254-267 (254).

is to find out how to improve. This is exactly what is involved here where the circumstances of the 'New Cornwall', discussed in the next chapter, are identified as creating needs that Cornish cultures might be used to meet and improvements are considered to the practice of participants and decision-makers. Secondly, action research acknowledges the possibility of being 'rigorously interested' whilst being 'fair and reasonable'[80] so that it is possible to be involved in communities of practice and have a personal stake whilst carrying out reflective research to inform actions. In this context, Cornish cultural practitioners, whether they are amateurs or professionals, represent interconnected communities of practice, bound by networks. This fits my vocational participation as a Cornish language teacher and offers a methodology of reflective practice. Research in a community of practice that ultimately merges with a community in the everyday sense is complicated, especially when activities are conceived as expressions of Cornish identity as a whole. Individual communities of practitioners (Cornish language teachers, musicians and dancers, film-makers, actors and so on) certainly have boundaries but they are often indistinct and centre on activities that diffuse into the culture of everyday life. This makes action research even more fitting because it allows researchers to reflect upon whatever they and others are doing, wherever and whenever it happens.

A challenge to participating in Cornish cultures is that ethno-cultural politics are present even in seemingly banal acts,[81] so that researchers, whether 'insiders' or 'outsiders', can easily slip unreflectively into ready-made nationalist and ethnic paradigms. The twin dangers of research in Cornwall are of either ignoring ethnicity, - a lack in some non-participant analyses, - or of privileging it over other components of identity (gender, culture, class, religion, politics, affective affiliations etc.) to the point of ignoring them and imagining a homogenized, one-

---

[80] University of Plymouth, Research Handbook [no date.].
[81] cf. Michael Billig (1995), *Banal Nationalism,* London: Sage.

dimensional group. The former approach has hitherto been associated with outside academics and government reports whilst the later has been employed by 'insiders' who are influenced by the discourses of the Cornish Movement, introduced in the next chapter. Discounting ethnicity has resulted in, 'the relative invisibility of Cornwall and the Cornish as a territory and a people in the British national historiography'.[82] Since ethnicity is assumed not to exist, it has been hard to address alleged issues of structural discrimination and disadvantage: 'We do not consider the Cornish to constitute a 'national minority''.[83]

Ignoring ethno-cultural claims is also an obstacle to considering Cornwall separately for administrative purposes and for many years it blocked European regional aid by allowing statistics on poverty to be submerged in those of the far more prosperous South-West Region. On the other hand, an overemphasis on ethnicity in some Cornish accounts has made it hard to address complexity, heterogeneity and the uncertainties of cultural hybridity and indeterminacy. More belligerent assertions of ethnicity have, for example, been accompanied by objections to studying local differences within Cornwall and to exploring the overlap between Cornish and English identities. These two extremes are linked by their opposition, each provoking reaction to the other. The casual dismissal of Cornish ethnicity and nationality claims by Establishment academics and civil servants gives rise to over-compensation and polemic from Cornish commentators, eager to assert a denied identity. This in turn touches sensibilities, generating the feeling that Englishness is under attack and raising worries that ethnic claims must have racist motivations. Faced with established views, ridicule and self-righteous moral indignation, Cornish academics and cultural and political leaders are often somewhat circumspect and

---

[82] Philip Payton, 'A Duchy in every respect un-English': discourses of identity in late-modern Cornwall', in Lancaster et al., (2007), *An Agenda for Regional History*, Newcastle upon Tyne, p. 319.
[83] The 'U.K. Report on the Council of Europe Framework Convention for the Protection of National Minorities', The Home Office, (1999).

reticent in their approaches to ethno-cultural identity, often choosing not to deal with it directly and openly, even when it is crucial to understanding and explaining context.

The Cornish Movement's ethnic paradigms share much with post-colonialism and minority politics elsewhere and just as hegemonic discourses homogenize the subaltern Other,[84] so oppositional discourses homogenize the dominant group as oppressive and the colonized as victim. It does not matter whether we take Cornwall's historical experience to have been that of an 'internal colony'[85] or conversely dismiss the idea as silly exaggeration, - because like it or not, the Cornish Movement operates from such a standpoint and bathes in Celtic nationalisms and British multi-culturalisms. The resulting imagining of the tribe as homogenous and downtrodden therefore colours and motivates cultural practice so that many practitioners work within simple, binary oppositions of 'us and them', imagining Cornishness in alterity to Englishness without reference to the complications and contradictions that are involved.[86] Although this supports discourses that favour solidarity and collective initiative, it is also reductionist, producing oversimplifications that overlook fractions within the 'imagined community'[87] which is then thought to have common needs and unified purpose, despite internal divisions, conflicts of interest and heterogeneity. As in other 'minority' campaigns, there may be such an overwhelming emphasis on ethnicity that, for example, the specific interests of working-class women or the rural elderly or those of poorly or well qualified young people are subsumed.

---

[84] See Ania Loomba, (1998), *Colonialism/Postcolonialism*, London and New York: Routledge.

[85] Bernard Deacon, 'Is Cornwall an Internal Colony?' in C. Ó Luain (ed.) (1983) *For a Celtic Future*, Dublin: The Celtic League.

[86] An objective discussed by Mervyn Davey at the CAVA conference, Perran Porth, October 2010.

[87] Benedict Anderson (1991), op. cit.

Cornish ethnicity has to be at the core of research into useable culture and needs to be considered in strategies for regeneration and sustainability, but it should not obscure other aspects of identity or become a single-issue obsession. Cornwall's 'new circumstances', discussed in the next chapter, make the multi-cultural dimensions of communities an important factor in how we try to employ culture for cohesiveness and resilience. The 2011 census shows that Cornwall's population includes people from all parts of Britain and Ireland and many from further afield so it is unavoidable that deprivation does not just concern Cornish people. English in-migrants to Cornwall furthermore have varied socio-economic and regional backgrounds and individually negotiated relationships with Cornishness. Awareness of heterogeneity and complexity, as well as acknowledgement of an ethic factor, has informed how and where I have participated, observed and sampled witnesses.

Subjectivity.

The point of ethnography is usually to produce what the anthropologist Clifford Geertz calls 'thick descriptions' of cultural structures,[88] but that is not the principle aim here where the real purpose is to reflect upon the uses of culture and lay some foundations for practical actions as intervention to achieve community resilience. Clive Seale cites Howard Becker's foundational, 'Whose side are we on?', which he says should be what ethnographers ask before beginning and he refers to the Chicago School's involved ethnography which, 'produced a politics sympathetic to social and cultural relativism and to the less privileged, allying itself with the disempowered in society.'[89] Accordingly this inquiry also takes sides, following the line that the cause of the disadvantaged and marginalized is a legitimate research aim that should inform policy. It notes, for example, that 19% of children (16,650) in Cornwall live in

---

[88] C. Geertz, (1973), *The Interpretation of Cultures*, New York: Basic Books.
[89] Seale (2004) op. cit. p. 39; Howard Becker, 'Whose side are we on?', *Social Problems*, 14 (Winter 1967), pp. 239-48.

poverty according to U.K. Government definitions and that inequalities result in local variations between 2% and 58%.[90]

For me as a researcher, the heterogeneity and indeterminacy of Cornishness means that belonging to the imagined ethno-cultural community is not the same as sharing the experiences of everybody within it. Notably, I am not an inside participant when it comes to wholly or largely female activities. I have tried to compensate by consulting female witnesses but doing so is hardly on a level with my easy participation in traditionally male domains, including the manual occupations that I have direct experience of (landscaping, building and fishing). The principle extends to all sections of society that I do not personally belong to and that means that more effort has to be made to seek out their experiences. From an over-simplified ethnic perspective though, I am a confirmed 'insider'. Generations of my family worked in seafaring, fishing, shipbuilding, farming and mining, a decidedly clichéd background that strengthens their awareness of being Cornish. I furthermore encountered the Cornish language in childhood and have spoken it for the whole of my adult life, participating actively in teaching, promotion and research. All of this and much more gives me a particular relationship with Cornishness and necessarily shapes my approach, presenting challenges and opportunities.

Objectivity is never possible, whether researchers are insiders or outsiders and in identifying my subjectivity, I hope to get away from any such pretence. For better or worse, my subject position is what it is and informs my opening proposition or 'pro-position' that Cornish cultures and the Cornish language are worthy of being sustained and are important to community resilience; yet I have also acquired a margin of distance, providing a reminder that 'insider' and 'outsider' are relative and ambiguous terms. In 2002 I moved to Brittany where my home

---

[90] Report: 'Deprivation and Child Poverty', Truro: Cornwall Council, 2011.

language is French and where Breton has been one of my working languages. Since Brittany and Wales are reflex references for Cornish speakers, this might be thought of as allowing me to look at Cornwall from a discreet distance.

Research guides invariably discuss the issues around the researcher being an insider or an outsider, a member of the group or a stranger, and cultural closeness or distance is identified as having advantages and disadvantages.[91] An argument (more current in the past) is that:

> *Members* living inside the culture of their group treat it as simply how the world *is* and do not reflect upon the presuppositions on which it is based or the knowledge which it entails. [and]
>
> The stranger knows that other ways of life are possible.[92]

Maybe so, but the generalized claim that, 'a stranger creates an attitude of objectivity', must be wishful thinking based on the delusion of impartiality summed up by Stéphane Olivesi:

> [L]e chercheur occuperait une position d'observateur étranger à l'objet scruté. Cette extériorité suffirait à en faire un témoin relativement impartial.[93]

Researchers from prevalent cultures might unreflectively apply their own norms as neutral and bring received assumptions that lead them to miss things. So, if there are challenges for the insider, there are also advantages and subaltern insiders may understand that there are other ways of being because of daily encounters with prevalent, legitimate cultures. Schutz suggests that the stranger 'can become a member of

---

[91] E.g. Clive Seale (ed.) (2004) op. cit. p. 226.
[92] Schutz (1964) (his italics), cited in Seale (2004) op. cit., p. 226.
[93] Stéphane Olivesi, 'Le terrain. Une mythologie scientifique?', Questions de communication, PUN, (2005), no. 7, pp. 161-183. (165).

the group through participation, becoming transformed into an insider, inhabiting it in the same taken-for-granted ways...'[94] This seems far-fetched because strangers will normally be identifiable and carry their cultural dispositions and attitudes with them. They may not get everything that is going on and although that must also apply to insiders, outsiders have some catching up to do and may only find out what insiders already know. Having been observed and interviewed by researchers myself, I can vouch for the frequency with which they do not quite understand. If outsiders sometimes have detachment, insiders sometimes have access and empathy and pick up non-verbal communication, shared inside knowledge, intragroup stories, humour, irony and so on.

From a Cornish oral history perspective, Garry Tregidga and Lucy Ellis cite Branlaw Malinowski's view that ethnography should grasp 'the native's point of view'.[95] Being of the same background is said to potentially create a 'common bond' which may help the 'insider researcher' gather narrative data and compare their stories with those of participants as a kind of 'auto-ethnography'.[96] Tregidga and Ellis cite an Irish woman who could only tell her story to another Irish person, relating this to 'interpersonal dynamics'.[97] Similarly, ground-breaking ethnographic work by Fañch Elégöet in Brittany worked because his insider status gave access to the world of rural Breton-speakers.[98] A personal experience is that of interviewing retired fishermen for radio in the 1990s[99] when my in-group knowledge and accent encouraged interviewees to speak 'normally' (without code-switching) and relate anecdotes.

---

[94] Ibid – check page.
[95] Garry Tregidga and Lucy Ellis, 'Talking Identity: Understanding Cornwall's Oral Culture Though Group Dialogue,' in P.J. Payton (ed.) *Cornish Studies,* vol. 12, (2004), pp. 88-105 (91).
[96] Ibid.
[97] Tregidga and Ellis, op. cit. p. 92. (Gender is possibly a factor, not discussed.)
[98] Fañch Elégöet was instrumental in founding *Tud ha Bro, Association de Recherche sur la Société Bretonne* (1978).
[99] 'Over the Rolling Sea', A series of six programmes edited by Chris Blount for BBC Radio Cornwall.

Participatory research requires critical reflection as a safeguard. Sarah Thornton recognizes that for insiders and involved outsiders, 'the site is by definition *unprofessional*' and that 'the *naturalism* of the method makes it difficult to draw boundaries of emotional, moral and political involvement.'[100] There is a tension between taking part adequately and maintaining critical faculties because, on the one hand, 'distant observation' does not 'get inside the perspective of the participants' and on the other hand, 'staunch participation' presents the danger of 'being an uncritical celebrant'.[101] I have taken account of Tregidga and Ellis' advice that:

> [I]f the fieldworker is also 'the native' then a set of fascinating practical and theoretical questions arise... Being of the culture and observing it at the same time demands a compartmentalization of the mind and set of strategies to cope with the 'closeness'.[102]

Sampling.

Choosing what to examine and who to talk to produces a research field. Stéphane Olivesi discusses the field (*le terrain*) with reference to the Chicago School, where it became an 'essential element in the sociological project'[103] and relates this to grand theories and myths of impartiality where the assumption is that the researcher will not misrepresent the field, consciously or unconsciously:

> L'observation du terrain présuppose donc un observateur qui ne pâtit d'aucune détermiation de nature à fausser sa vision des choses.[104]

---

[100] Sarah Thornton, op. cit. p. 213 (her italics).
[101] Sarah Thornton, op. cit. p. 214.
[102] Tregidga and Ellis, op. cit., p. 92.
[103] Olivesi, op. cit. p. 164, translated, N. Kennedy; cf. Seale op. cit. p39.
[104] Ibid.

References to the field and empirical data thus contribute to an impression of rigour:

> [L]e terrain se définit comme un mythe de l'objectivité au sens où il présuppose que, par l'investigation empirique, on parvienne à une connaissance rigoureuse de la réalité telle qu'elle est en elle-même.[105]

For Olivesi, such references by academics, politicians and journalists, exercise myths of objectivity and scientific neutrality and try to justify claims with a guaranteed foundation in reality.[106] These warnings are important. The field of 'Cornish cultures' may appear obvious but given the heterogeneity involved, the routes taken within it will determine what is seen and define boundaries. I have therefore picked careful paths to compensate for my individual perspective and avoid an overly distorted view.

There have been several distinct stages to this research. After a preliminary literature search and review, I spoke with around forty people who I identified and targeted as key informants with something articulate and considered to say about sustaining Cornishness that would help me define further inquiry. I included some who I expected to be sceptical about the usefulness of Cornish cultures and I set out to speak to:

Cultural activists and participants,

Cornish speakers, teachers, activists, learners,

Business people, marketers, managers,

Arts professionals and amateurs,

Elected councillors,

---

[105] Olivesi, op. cit. p. 183.
[106] Olivesi, op. cit. p. 165.

Academics and researchers,

Policy and decision-makers (gatekeepers).

This proved informative but inevitably my selections of 'key suspects' and their referrals determined the views and information received. Cultural innovators, entrepreneurs and decision-makers got me started but, although some of them felt marginalized and disadvantaged as Cornish people, they were mainly secondary witnesses as far as economic and social deprivation was concerned. There was a further risk of relying upon verbal and oral competence and disproportionately gathering information from articulate, motivated people and middle-class professionals who were at ease and influenced by cultural, political, business or institutional agendas. Few of these informants were under thirty-five and I wanted to hear more from young adults and from disadvantaged people themselves.

As a generational outsider (I am over fifty.) I needed to know about different kinds of young adults and find ways of overcoming differences of age that can be a barrier to gathering information. For example, there were those who were involved in Cornish Revivalist cultures. How did they see the usually non-Revivalist cultures of parents and contemporaries? Did they, for example, see themselves as being part of a sub-cultural scene or as guardians of tradition and community activists? Then there were graduates, students and, central to a consideration of disadvantage, the poorly qualified and *a priori* unskilled. What did any of them think about being Cornish and the possibility of a future in Cornwall? And then there was everybody else, people of all ages and backgrounds. How would I get to hear from all of the following, overlapping sub-sections?:

The economically and educationally disadvantaged,

The qualified and soon-to-be qualified,

Cultural activists and participants,

Participants in Revivalist cultures (language, music, dance etc.) and

Participants in traditional Cornish cultural practices.

At this point, a few months into the research period, I mapped out my sampling methods. It had dawned upon me that taking part in community life, - going shopping, popping into cafes and taking the bus, - was giving me the most useful insights but I needed to make sure that I encountered groups actively, rather than relying on the hazard of my own habits and preferences. To do this, I identified situations and events which provided opportunities for conversation and observation within the sections of society that I needed to hear from and I ensured that I spent time in all parts of Cornwall, not just my main bases in Redruth, Falmouth and Polperro. Examples of some of the situations identified include:

Student events and rest areas at F.E. colleges and H.E. institutions,

Musically varied gigs, concerts and festivals,

Sports events (rugby, rowing, football, sailing, surfing),

Car boot sales and markets at Par and Pool,

Cattle markets at Liskeard and Truro,

Stithians Agricultural Show and the Royal Cornwall Show,

Village fetes, carnivals and community celebrations, including Bodmin Riding, Golowan, Murdoch Day, Trevithick Day, St. Just Feast and Bugle Band Festival.

Women's Institute, church and charity coffee mornings and sales,

A rally of motorbike enthusiasts,

A dinner and fund-raising event for Mabe Twinning Association,

Varied music practice sessions (Indie, rock, neo-traditional, brass bands, choirs, youth jazz groups etc.).

Cornish language lessons and events,

Social events at several community centres and churches,

Chosen cafes, bars, pubs, cafeterias and shopping centres.

I incorporated an aspect of snowball sampling, making sure that I accompanied individuals I met so as to benefit from further introductions and reach more people. For example, to meet various categories of young musicians and their followings, I asked for introductions from their older and trusted collaborators and was later invited to practice sessions and events. Similarly, I accompanied a biker in order to meet his friends, later meeting some of them in other contexts. Although a measure of personal code-switching allowed me to intervene, I was an outsider in such situations and concentrated on listening to conversations and observing.

Participation in internet discussions has been essential. E-mail, social media, such as *Facebook* and *Twitter*, blogs, online forums and *Skype* conversations, now provide the main ways in which people who are concerned with Cornish issues network and engage in cultural and political activism and the internet also provides ways to communicate in the Cornish language. It is an everyday means by which large numbers of people keep in touch with other. These technologies have allowed Cornish people outside Cornwall to remain socially and culturally involved and they are enabling new affective alliances and renewed contacts with the 'Cornish Diaspora' in such far-flung places as Moonta, South Australia, Real del Monte, Mexico, Mineral Point,

Wisconsin and Grass Valley, California, all of which stage Cornish festivals. Another advantage has been the possibility of really being a fly-on-the-wall observer without issues of age, gender and social background being factors. Where ethically appropriate, I have been able to stimulate discussion, - sometimes using my great-grandmother's name as a disguise, - and to tap into cross-generational networks.

I considered using 'grounded theory'. This methodology uses constant comparison and data sampling to keep theories, 'grounded in observation [...] rather than generated in the abstract', but can only be used when data are collected, 'in episodes punctuated by periods of data analysis'.[107] This informs subsequent theorizing and research, putting empirical information first and using a kind of feed-back to direct the inquiry where the 'participant observer [...] cycles between episodes of data collection and data analysis, the one informing the other, so that the eventual research report is very likely to exhibit good concept-indicator links.'[108] The claim is that this produces a good match between concepts, data and a continual process of validation, potentially favouring local hypotheses and 'creating new concepts and ideas [...] from observations of social settings.'[109] This belief has been criticized as being founded on modernist assumptions because in seeking to justify qualitative methods it may rely upon the scientific rationale of research-generated theory and lose sight of 'small stories'.[110] To try to resolve this, Glaser and Strauss distinguish between 'substantive theory', which relates to 'immediate phenomena' and 'formal theory' which is seen as having more general applications.[111] Grounded theory needs, 'persistent observation and triangulation exercises.'[112] Triangulation means comparing data from diverse sources and considering several hypotheses. Theoretical

---

[107] Clive Seale, op. cit. pp. 507, 241.
[108] Clive Seale, op. cit., p. 240.
[109] Clive Seale, op. cit., p. 77.
[110] Clive Seale, op. cit. p. 77; Paul E. Willis, op. cit. p. 247.
[111] Clive Seale, op. cit., p.243.
[112] Clive Seale, op. cit. p. 77.

saturation comes about when no new theories are generated by further sampling. Researchers often claim to have used grounded theory when they have not really done this[113] so it is important to stress that whilst my approach has been influenced by grounded theory, I have not used it as such. Instead I have derived practices from it. For instance, I compared data from different sources and noted which groups were providing no new data (saturation) and which kinds of information and types of informant were missing. This meant changing the participants and activities I sought out, thus widening the sample. I paused, came up with new hypotheses in response to incoming data and changed where and how I collected data to ensure coverage. In a study of regional product-branding in France, Delphine Dion and colleagues have similarly constructed a sample of informants progressively so as to reach saturation:

> L'échantillon a été constitué de façon progressive afin d'attendre une représentativité qualitative. La taille de l'échantillon n'a donc pas été déterminée *a priori* comme cela se fait traditionnalement dans les recherches quantitatives mais *a prosteriori* en fonction des résultats de l'étude. Le processus de sélection de nouveaux participants s'est arrêté lorsqu'on a atteint le seuil de saturation de l'information.[114]

In this study, the sample has also been constructed progressively and consciously according to the information received and with the aim of avoiding a predetermined sample.

Listening and talking.

I have used various methods for collecting information orally, not adopting one model but preferring to remain flexible. I used some semi-

---

[113] Clive Seale, op. cit. p. 77.
[114] Delphine Dion, Eric Rémy, Lionel Sitz, Pascale Ezan, 'Comment exploiter les cultures régionales en marketing?', (2008) p.13. http://leg.u-bourgogne.fr/CERMAB/z-outils/documents/actesJRMB/JRMB13-2008/Dion%20Remy%20Sitz%20Ezan.pdf (Accessed, 6th June 2011.)

structured interviews where the interviewees' curiosity often produced spontaneous discussion that was interactive and flexible enough to draw out their experience, knowledge and aspirations. Such distinct interviews were reserved for key informants, mainly in the first stage of research. Other interviews took the form of less directed conversations that often led into unexpected areas. I noted Tregidga and Ellis' discussion of how interviews are co-created and 'interpreted through the prism of the interviewer's presence'[115] and realised that that less directed techniques may yield more information. In Brittany, Ronan Le Coadic has used semi-directed interviews to avoid either rigidly determining the agenda or leaving the interviewee to drift off course. Giving the interviewee some slack may be informative, as Le Coadic underlines by observing that if a fisherman wants to talk about the price of crabs instead of Breton identity it is a sign that the latter is not his preoccupation.[116] Non-directed interviews, closer to normal conversation, may allow access to sensitive areas such as taboo, passion, traumatism and trouble that cannot be dealt with as a set interrogation. There may be a relationship between the freedom of the interview and the depth of the information so that direct questions deal with immediately accessible, superficial and stereotyped areas and produce responses that may be limited to what the questioner appears to want or to what seems acceptable. I have thus sought conducive settings that make it easier to tease out considerations of morale, emotional prosperity, well-being and motivation.

One way to move further from interrogation is to use focus groups, sometimes using images, exercises or topic guides to generate discussion. Ken MacKinnon's work on Cornish used focus groups where, instead of a rigid schedule of questions, participants had room to develop thoughts and arguments, being given prompts or open

---

[115] Tregidga and Ellis, op. cit. p. 90.
[116] Ronan le Coadic (1998), *L'Identité bretonne*, Deuxième édition, Rennes: Terre de Brume - Presse Universitaires de Rennes, p. 22-23.

questions.[117] This allows differing perspectives to be studied as socially produced responses and may widen participation in the discussion and allow participants' own questions and priorities to be heard. Appropriately, these methods may also be used to evaluate networks. I have incorporated several associated aspects. Firstly, I organized a small number of specific focus groups. One of these was held in Mabe where I drew together a dozen people to discuss the future of the community and note of their feelings and desires and another was held in Truro to take stock of Cornish language use. To support my comparisons in Brittany, I led three themed discussions in Breton and I also attended general conversation groups where I raised issues. To encourage participants to be less conscious of the content and more forthcoming about feelings, I have otherwise found it useful to take advantage of existing groups and events (e.g. Music workshops, informal gatherings, work-related social situations, student events, festivals, a community dinner and singing sessions.) to introduce questions and themes. This provides representative groups of participants and avoiding the risk that focus groups will not include less engaged and confident individuals. People were willing to participate in impromptu discussions once informed that it was for research on 'how to use Cornish cultures' or 'how to strengthen the community'.

In 2010-2012, I held social gatherings for Cornish speakers in a house in Redruth using the title 'Te ha Tesednow' (Tea and Cakes) and published e-mailed messages that continued themes. As we drank from the best china and chatted, the conversation ranged over all of the topics of this inquiry, into areas of feeling. As an experiment in network building and finding a socially useful role for Cornish, Te ha Tesednow enabled me to contact speakers that I did not know. My participation in Cornish language activities was extensive during the research period

---

[117] Ken MacKinnon (2000) , *An Independent Academic Study on Cornish*, EKOS Ltd. & SGÙD for the Government Office of the South West, Plymouth.

and in addition to taking part socially, I served on six committees and working parties of the Cornish Language Partnership (The Translation Service, The Corpus Panel, The Dictionary Group, The Spelling Review Board, The Cornish Signage Panel, The Management Board) and took part in the Cornish Language Council, giving me access to ready-made focus groups in which discussion ranges beyond language to cover wider Cornish issues.

Narrative inquiry.

In evaluating insiders' experience through testimony, the understanding of what constitutes narrative may be extended to non-verbal elements so as to avoid over-reliance on articulate speech. Thus, 'The narrative inquirer may note stories but more often records actions, doing, and happenings, all of which are narrative experiences.'[118] Narratives may be understood as part of ways of thinking and making meaning that deal with the whole of human experience. They are involved in how we construct our lives and make sense of experiences and some are part of community narratives that may constitute usable knowledge. Any narrative is a selective fiction, as much about forgetting as remembering and there are analogies with folk-tales and reminiscence, - both important themes in Cornish culture. This also connects with the 'redundant conversations' that are sometimes said to characterize Cornish social exchanges.

Narrative, including autobiography, may reveal experiences and understanding. Fañch Elégoët (one of few major researchers to pioneer narrative inquiry in France) uses autobiographies and biography to approach issues that are not openly spoken about, exploring for instance how low status has led rural people to abandon cultural practices and the Breton language. This gets at individual and collective

---

[118] D.J. Clandinin and F.M. Connelly, 'Stories of Experience and Narrative Inquiry', in *Education Researcher*, Vol.19 (5), (June-July, 1990), pp. 2-14.

experiences as part of a dynamic cultural field where the future is under construction:

> La biographie projette un éclairage particulier sur le social. Elle sort la parole des lieux de silence ; elle explore le vécu et la subjectivité collective – de son histoire et de son présent – entend s'inscrire sur le terrain de l'action culturelle bretonne, champ vivace où se construit une part de notre devenir[119]

Such 'narrative inquiry' has provided insights into all areas of this study and allowed me to identify discourses around culture and past and present events and to touch upon feelings related to social standing. It has also revealed motives and responses within communities of practice, - a reminder that it is used in teacher education where there are parallels with cultural vocations. Intervention in conversation, or priming, may be tailored to suit informants, some of whom talk freely whilst others need *'Tell me about...'* type prompts. As a generalization, cultural innovators and activists have tended towards the free-talking end of the spectrum whilst more interactive conversations have been needed for the less proactively engaged.

Knowing the questions implies knowing the answers beforehand and having preconceptions which is why less primed and pre-defined conversations have been preferred, allowing questions and responses to emerge.[120] Listening to what people volunteer has raised issues, leading to further inquiry and new, unexpected directions and has helped get at what people do not know they know. Tregidga and Ellis cite Treve Crago's work in Cornwall and the possibility that challenging or 'antagonistic' interview techniques can be appropriate to draw out, 'less easily accessible layers of personal knowledge, belief and experience'.[121]

---

[119] Fañch Elégoët in *L'homme et la mer*, Tud ha Bro, *Sociétés Bretonne*s, vol.1 1979 cited in Le Coadic, op. cit.
[120] cf. Tregidga and Ellis, op. cit. p. 95.
[121] Tregidga and Ellis, op. cit., p. 90-93.

This has proved to be the case in probing cultural practitioners and getting beyond immediately acceptable statements. Some heated conversations have been fruitful and more generally, dynamic interactions have involved a degree of collaboration in which informants have proactively offered information as co-researchers. Listening to people recount their lives and practice to each other has led to a kind of sharing, - a positive practice for constructing community networks based on 'useable culture'. Margaret Olson writes that 'where the story leads' influences 'how field texts are gathered and interpreted'[122] and in this study verbal and non-verbal testimony has led me to subsequently follow certain courses. Stories may be understood to have 'narrative trajectories'[123] with a poststructuralist emphasis on processes that come from places and have pasts and potential futures.

The majority of researchers I have found in internet searches for 'narrative inquiry', are women, often in educational settings where recovering unvoiced experiences challenges imposed paradigms and where sharing them as stories sometimes gives insights. Although experiences may not be applicable generally, listening to each other may spark ideas or help see clearly.[124] This is applicable to Cornish cultural practitioners, where regardless of whether it produces conclusions, the process may help and inform. Alexandra Georgakopoulou writes of 'thinking big with small stories' and observes that narrative research involves autobiographical, non-shared, personal experience.[125] These 'small stories' include, 'a gamut of under-represented narrative activities, such as tellings of ongoing events, future or hypothetical events, shared (known) events [...] tellings, deferrals of tellings, and refusals to tell.'[126] This is what gets missed when fully-formed, main-

---

[122] Margaret Olson, 'Where the Story Leads: A Response to Cheryl Craig', in *The Canadian Journal of Education/ Revue Canadienne de l'éducation,* vol. 25 (4), (2000), pp. 349-352. www.jstor.org/stable/1585856 (Accessed 11th May 2010.
[123] D.J. Clandinin and F.M. Connelly, op. cit.
[124] cf. Olson, op. cit. p. 350.
[125] Alexandra Georgakopoulou, *'Thinking big with small stories in narrative and identity analysis' in Narrative Inquiry,* vol. 16 (1), (2006), pp. 122-130.
[126] ibid, p.122.

stream stories are privileged and reclaiming them may be part of a postmodernist suspicion of metanarratives. The danger where ethno-cultural politics are concerned, though, is of fusing them into new metanarratives so I have resisted a totalizing account. Stuart Hall gives attention to biographies as the 'careers' of 'particular individuals' which are related to, 'structures and cultures - the means by which individual identities and life-histories are constructed out of collective experiences.'[127] I have tried to keep sight of individual tales whilst recognizing that they only make sense when related to the structural and cultural contexts in which subjectivity is constructed. Clandinin and Connelly write about, 'walking into the midst of stories',[128] where the stories are already going on and they refer to context as, 'landscapes in the broadest sense'. This is another way in which a participant may understand what is happening much as a regular soap-opera follower grasps what an individual episode is about from context.

To summarize, I have used complementary qualitative methods, adapting them to suit the circumstances and applying them within the broad framework of participant ethnography. A disciplined process of reflection and elements drawn from grounded theory has been used to avoid prejudicial approaches and the data have been interpreted using methods of semiological and discourse analysis.

The representation of outcomes should be loyal to the narratives and not misrepresenting them is a matter of trust that means relating and analyzing evidence without fancy or embellishment. In writing up research though, we choose examples to illustrate accounts and arguments and there is a desire to construct convincing arguments and coherent stories which may mislead.[129] I have therefore tried to avoid selecting information that confirms my expectations and excluding

---

[127] John Clarke, Stuart Hall, Tony Jefferson and Brian Roberts [1975], in K. Gelder and S. Thornton pp. 100-111 (100).
[128] Clandinin and Connelly, op. cit.
[129] Discussed in Johnson & Golobmbek 2002: 9-10

views that I find inconvenient and in doing so I have often been surpised and forced to re-think my own attitudes.

A Note on Comparative cases.

I have referred to comparative cases which, like Cornwall, are part of the Atlantic Arc and have 'minority' languages. Considering the uses of Cornish culture also requires openness to comparisons from English regions which share similar post-industrial circumstances and related research has been usefully targeted. Part of my time was spent in Brittany and I have visited Galicia and the Basque Country. Brittany has been the most important case, chosen not because it provides a close match to Cornwall's circumstances, - it does not, - but because it has been the traditional, reflex reference for influential strands within Cornish cultural activism. These emulate Breton models and operate within discourses of shared culture that recall comments by William Scawen who led efforts to save the Cornish language c.1680:

> ...Armorica, near unto us, by friendship, by cognition, by interest, by correspondence. Cornwall has received princes from thence, and they from us. We had therefore mutual interchange, of private families...[130]

Breton is the nearest language to Cornish, although only slightly closer than Welsh, and in the wider Pan-Celtic context that David Harvey calls 'cultural commonalities',[131] this has underpinned more than a century of cross-Channel solidarity and collaboration amongst language revivalists that increasingly spills into popular contexts. Most towns

---

[130] William Scawen, c.1680, 'Observations on an Ancient Manuscript entitled Passio Christi, written in the Cornish Language, and now preserved in the Bodleian Library; with an account of the Language, Manners and Customs of the People of Cornwall.'
[131] David Harvey in Harvey et al. (2001), *Celtic Geographies – Old Culture, New Times,* London: Routledge, p.1.

and many villages in Cornwall are twinned with Breton counterparts and their twinning charters are often in Breton and Cornish, symbolically underlining a shared heritage. Exchanges ensure that some of Cornwall's most influential cultural innovators make regular visits to places like Lorient and Douarnenez whilst rarely visiting London. In Cornish nationalist discourses the severing of cross-Channel links with Brittany after the 1549 'Prayer-Book Rebellion'[132] is identified with the decline of Cornish whilst renewed contact is associated with resurgence. Brittany offers negative as well as positive lessons, though, and over-enthusiasm for 'Armorican betterment'[133] presents the danger of importing ill-fitting solutions which to some extent compete with other models that have inspired Cornish identity narratives in the past, including those based on kinship with Wales. For all of these reasons, it has been important to consider Brittany's prominence in Cornish discourses and re-emerging identification with Wales and the Welsh. My networks, as a former Breton-medium teacher, have helped me observe Brittany's cultural circumstances and discover some of the most highly developed economic appeals to cultural identity of any European region. For all of their differences of circumstances, it remains in keeping with the pro-position of this inquiry to at least partially privilege the affective Pan-Celtic paradigm offered by Geoffrey of Monmouth:

> The mountains of Armorica shall erupt and Armorica itself shall be crowned with Brutus' diadem. Kambria shall be filled with joy and the Cornish oaks shall flourish.[134]

---

[132] See Philip Payton (1992), *The Making of Modern Cornwall: Historical Experience and the Persistence of 'Difference'*, Redruth: Dyllansow Truran, p.60.
[133] Alan M. Kent (2002), *Love and Seaweed*, St.Austell: Lyonesse Press, p.53.
[134] Geoffrey of Monmouth, 'The Prophecies of Merlin', in *The History of the Kings of Britain*, c. 1136.

Chapter Three

The New Cornwall and The Cornish Movement.

The suggestion that Cornish cultures should be employed to strengthen communities and intervene in representation is motivated by major changes, some of which have already been introduced. A set of new realities calls for a rethinking of approaches to Cornish cultural tradition and constitutes a seismic change of circumstances, altering the contextual frame within which culture is performed and understood so thoroughly that any evaluation of culture's usefulness and value in community development needs to take account of it. These new circumstances involve material and economic disadvantage, produce social and cultural inequalities and have implications for primary social and emotional uses of culture. They influence morale which, as an emotional or psychological factor in community life, affects well-being. Morale is also an economic factor, although not one that is normally considered in hard-headed analysis of human capital, technical knowledge and infrastructure. Emotional responses to these conditions also motivate consciously Cornish cultural and political activities which are here indentified as manifestations of a diverse 'Cornish Movement' and related to community resilience.

The greatest changes are demographic. Rapid inward and outward migration has changed the make-up of the population so that, for the first time, a majority of residents does not have a long Cornish family tradition. To put this in a longer, historical context, Cornwall's strong demography in the nineteenth century supported the maintenance and strengthening of a, 'Cornish sense of ethnic solidarity and territoriality'.[135] Instead of experiencing in-migration of the kind often

---

[135] Philip Payton (2007), 'A Duchy in Every Respect Un-English', op. cit., p. 323.

associated with industrialization, Cornwall had strong internal movements of its mining population and major emigrations and patterns of overseas working. Relative homogeneity, combined with the dimension of 'transnationality' and global industrial prowess, meant that an already strong and distinct Cornish identity was perpetuated with a sense of quasi-nationhood that might not have survived and developed had Cornwall been integrated demographically with other British industrial regions. Yet, whereas nineteenth and early twentieth-century Cornwall had one of the highest proportions of locally-born inhabitants in Britain,[136] data from multiple sources now show that about a third of the population is Cornish, a proportion that varies somewhat according to whether self-definition, birth or parentage is the criterion.[137] It also varies according to locality so that coastal areas have lower proportions and former industrial districts with lower property prices have higher proportions. There are, however, no areas with an overwhelmingly Cornish population. For clarity in this discussion, 'indigenous' is applied to people who consider themselves Cornish and have a degree of family continuity in Cornwall, however tenuous, and 'native' refers literally to people born in Cornwall or Plymouth (since the maternity hospital that serves East Cornwall is in Plymouth) regardless of identifications and background. As will become apparent, these are problematic definitions and are central to questions of identity and cohesion that invite comparison with other 'distinctive' European regions that have experienced large scale in-migration but which retain ethno-cultural identities (e.g. The Basque Country and Corsica experienced major in-migration as a result of Francoist policy and the Algerian War of Independence respectively.).

---

[136] ibid; Census data: 1891, 1901, 1911.

[137] In Cornwall Council's 'Quality of Life Survey' (2007), 25.9% of respondents self-identified as Cornish; Kerryn Husk (2012) gives 25%; In the CAPITA EMS Pulse School Census for the Dept. of Education, 41% of pupils self-identified; Other sources: Carrick District Council, 'Private Sector House Condition Survey', (1996); Peter Wills (1999), 'Information from the Parish Housing Surveys and Household Survey Reports of Cornwall Rural Community Council', CoSERG; Ron Perry *et al.* (1986), 44% were 'indigenous'; Discussions: Cornwall Council website (20th October 2011); Ian Saltern, 'Cornish National Minorities Report 2', (2011); Joanie Willett (2008), 'Why is Cornwall so Poor? Narrative, Perception and Identity', Ph.D. thesis, University of Exeter.

These demographic changes are a side-effect of tourism, 'on a seemingly cataclysmic scale'.[138] Five million tourists visit Cornwall each year and the industry represents around eleven percent of the economy.[139] As well as having both positive and negative economic impacts, tourism changes representations and perceptions of Cornwall and Cornish people with consequences for consideration in this discussion. At the same time, traditional industries (metal mining, China-clay extraction, quarrying, farming, fishing, engineering, ship repair) that formed the basis of occupational cultures and identities have all but gone, producing a set of experiences that is shared with much of industrial, maritime and agricultural Britain. This involves the loss of the material and symbolic foundations of community and produces multiple crises of identity (including those of gender roles, linked to work) and morale. Cornwall has simultaneously experienced similar social trends to the rest of North-Western Europe, including transformations in social structures and patterns of consumption, as well as local experiences of globalization.

Since the mid 1960s, there has been a trend away from administration and decision-making in Cornwall towards institutions based either on the 'South-West Region' or 'Devon and Cornwall' (part of a wave of centralization in the United Kingdom.). This applies to everything from public utilities and the police to the civil service, government offices and quangos, - including those bodies responsible for regional development and arts funding.[140] As institutions have expanded, creating thousands of middle-class jobs and decision-making roles, Cornwall has lost out to centres in Bristol, Exeter, Plymouth and Swindon, so much so that when Cornwall was afforded Objective One status, it became the only

---

[138] Alan Kent, (2000), *The Literature of Cornwall, Continuity, Identity, Difference 1000-2000,* Bristol: Redcliffe Press, p.12.
[139] ONS figure for 2011.
[140] An early example was Devon and Cornwall Constabulary, 1967; See CoSERG Report: 'South West Regional Strategy 2006-2026 "Wrong Region, wrong assumptions, wrong strategy"' http://www.cornwallcoserg.org.uk/ (Accessed 19th May 2011.)

such region in Europe where the funds were administered externally. Indeed, central government has continued to transfer civil service jobs out of Cornwall even whilst the region receives European Union aid for job creation. All of this means that regional aid 'funds jobs in Bristol' and that many important decisions are 'not taken in Cornwall by people who understand what is needed'.[141] Critics see this form of centralization as leading, not just to job losses, but to bad governance and cultural impoverishment[142] as it depletes Cornwall of an articulate, home-grown body of people with local knowledge, loyalty and motivation, - the 'organic intellectuals' who might contribute to all domains.[143] The Mebyon Kernow leader and Cornwall councillor, Dick Cole, describes Cornwall as, 'always tucked away in some unelected, unaccountable South-West body that wouldn't know Talskiddy from Tolvaddon.',[144] and the prominent independent councillor, Bert Biscoe remarks that, "Regional arrangements', such as 'west country', be they cultural, administrative, economic or political, are designed to solve other people's problems, but not Cornwall's.'[145]

For many Cornish people, not just declared nationalists, the inclusion of Cornwall in larger administrative areas is furthermore anathema because it ignores Cornwall's identity claims and historical integrity. This was evident is discussions of the proposal in 2010-11 to create a Cornwall and Scilly Local Enterprise Partnership to replace the South-West Regional Development Agency. It was also the theme of the campaign against new electoral boundaries that would have included parts of Cornwall and Devon in the same parliamentary constituencies for the first time. At the 'Keep Cornwall Whole' rally (10th October 2010),

---

[141] Complaints from councillors Neil Plummer and Loveday Jenkin; See, John Angarrack (2008), *Scat t'Larrups. Resist and Survive*, Padstow: Independent Academic Press, p. 82.

[142] cf. Joanie Willet (2008), 'Why is Cornwall so Poor? Narrative, Perception and Identity', op. cit.

[143] Antonio Gramsci's term; See B. Deacon, 'And Shall Trelawny Die? The Cornish Identity.' (1993) in P.J. Payton (ed.) (1993), *Cornwall Since the War: The Contemporary History of a European Region*, Redruth: Dyllansow Truran and Institute of Cornish Studies, p.215.

[144] Dick Cole, recorded B.B.C. Radio Cornwall (12th December 2008).

[145] Bert Biscoe, letter to *An Baner Kernewek*, no. 73, August 1993.

hosted by Saltash Town Council, speakers, including members of parliament, town mayors and community figures, linked the issue to the *de facto* creation of an administrative 'Devonwall' (the derogatory term used by critics) and a raft of economic and 'distinctive' cultural issues that 'need Cornish solutions' and 'a Cornish voice'. Symbolic references were made to the circumstances surrounding Athelstan's confirmation of the Tamar boundary in 936 A.D., just nine years after he had, 'cleansed the city [Exeter] of its defilement by wiping out that filthy [Cornish] race'.[146]

These combined demographic, economic, administrative and institutional circumstances have weakened traditional elements of culture but heightened a defensive awareness of identity and produced a tangible sense of marginalization, exclusion and embattlement that seeps unavoidably into the conversations and banal acts of everyday life and the themes of social media discussions and blogs. In keeping with this widespread, popular discourse Bert Biscoe writes:

> The reluctance of central institutions to acknowledge the distinctiveness of Cornwall and her people...is probably the greatest single contribution to the present social and economic malaise of Britain's poorest region...[147]

Little analysis of the continuities and discontinuities that the new circumstances produce has been undertaken and still less consideration given to how new residents engage with Cornish cultures or could do so in the future but these are important areas to grapple with if Cornwall is to have a sustainably inclusive society. What is clear though, is that there has been a sea change, justifying the name 'New

---

[146] William of Malmesbury, *Gesta Regum Anglorum*, 1125, cited in Susan Pearce, *The Kingdom of Dumnonia*, Padstow: Lodenek Press.
[147] Bert Biscoe in S.Parker (ed.)(1998), p. 150; cf. Bernard Deacon (2000), *The Cornish and the Council of Europe Framework Convention for the Protection of National Minorities.*

Cornwall' which one or two analysts have appropriated from earlier uses.[148]

'An Movyans Kernowek.' The Cornish Movement.

The name 'New Cornwall' is intended here to describe a multifaceted situation of which assertions of 'difference' amongst the indigenous Cornish are a major component. These expressions are motivated by the recent demographic and economic transformations and may be seen as a 'response to the everyday deluge of Anglicisation',[149] but they also build upon Pan-Celtic discourses that emerged in the nineteenth century and upon much older identity narratives of a non-English origin. Commentators present these expressions as having maintained Cornish identity and ensured that, 'Cornwall and its people, despite the fears of observers in the 1970s, became more 'Celtic' as the millennium reached its end.'[150]

An array of forms, referred to with religious echoes, as the 'Cornish Revival' (*An Dasserghyans Kernowek*),[151] or simply the 'Revival', imagines the re-invigoration of a flagging culture and the 'resurrection' of real and supposed past elements in projects of cultural retrieval similar to those of post-colonial situations.[152] This 'Revivalism' is one of several aspects of a much larger 'Cornish Movement' (*An Movyans Kernowek*), a misleadingly unitary title for what has become a plural,

---

[148] e.g., Bernard Deacon (2007) , *Cornwall: A Concise History*, Cardiff: University of Wales Press; Applied by R.M. Nance to an imagined future (1925, 1949), inspiring the magazine *New Cornwall,* launched by Richard Gendall (1952), eds. Helena Charles, then Ann and Richard Jenkin.

[149] Bernard Deacon with Sharron Schwartz and David Holman (2004), *The Cornish Family: the roots of our future,* Fowey: Cornwall Editions.

[150] ibid.

[151] Charles Thomas, 'An Dasserghyans Kernewek', at the Celtic Congress, 16-20th April, 1963.

[152] See Ania Loomba (1998), *Colonialism/Postcolonialism,* London and New York: Routledge; For quasi-religious symbolism, see Pol Hodge's poem, 'Agan taves ni' (Our Language).

heterogeneous and highly fragmented constellation of cultural and political activities, united only by an overarching Cornish sentiment.[153] Multiple, inter-connected 'Cornish scenes' concern themselves with differing cultural, social and political activities.[154]

In this discussion a terminological distinction is made between 'The Revival', - which includes language revitalization, cultural retrieval and reconstruction, - and the wider 'Cornish Movement' which also embraces manifestations of group awareness and feelings that put less emphasis on reviving past cultures (language and 'Celtic' customs) and more upon socio-economic issues and maintaining present practices. Revivalism represents a large part of the Cornish Movement, in other words, but not all adherents of the Movement are motivated by cultural revival or particularly involved in it. Unlike 'Revival', which suggests a narrower focus on Celticism and connotes a quasi-spiritual quest, the more secular-sounding 'Movement' encapsulates a broader range of responses to new and changing circumstances, including symbolic, political uses of culture for socio-economic ends.

Despite their plurality, it is useful to think of these phenomena as a single movement because collectively they constitute a current that favours a sense of difference, having the sense of a collective voyage, even if the precise course is disputed and uncharted. In using the label 'movement', - as in applications from the arts, - there is a suggestion of innovation, creativity and radicalism, all of which have long co-existed with preservationist, conservative and atavistic motivations for interest in Cornish ethno-cultural identities. The impossibilities of delimitation compare to other uses of 'movement' where people combine in actions that produce affective identifications beyond organized membership, -

---

[153] 'Cornish Movement' was perhaps coined by F. Cargeeg c.1930 as 'an Mevyans Kernewek'; For discussion see, Caroline Vink "Be Forever Cornish!' Some Observations on the Ethnoregional Movement in Contemporary Cornwall', in P.J. Payton (ed.), *Cornish Studies*, no. 1, (1993), pp. 109-119 (112).
[154] Inspiring the magazine *Cornish Scene*, Sarah Foot (ed.) in the 1980s-90s.

as in the 'Labour Movement', the 'Feminist Movement', the 'Environmental Movement' and so on, all of which are plural, nebulous and diffuse whilst being thought of as entities.

The Cornish Movement has been categorized as an 'ethnoregional movement',[155] as an 'ethnic revitalization movement'[156] and as 'ethnonationalism',[157] underlining similarities with counterparts in other European regions, such as the Breton *Emsav*,[158] where cultural identity and cultural production influence commerce, public policy and politics. The historian Charles Thomas has called it, 'a Cornish national-consciousness movement', noting that:

> [I]t may well be another century before most native Cornish cease to think, subconsciously and automatically, in terms of 'Cornwall' and 'England', an Us-and-Them syndrome...[159]

The post-war Cornish Movement has been motivated by economic inequalities, in-migration and anti-metropolitanism and includes forms of political and cultural nationalism that have been partly framed by Welsh and Scottish models.[160] It's origins are often traced uniquely to the Celto-Cornish Revival that emerged from antiquarianism in the late nineteenth century but in reality the movement has multiple origins, not just in Celticism but in the development of 'Cornish Associations' (overseas and in London) and Cornish institutions during the nineteenth century and in distinctive political and religious experiences

---

[155] Caroline Vink, op. cit. (note 151); Michael Hechter and Margaret Levi, 'The comparative analysis of ethnoregional movements', in *Ethnic and Racial Studies*, vol. 2, no. 3, July 1979.

[156] Jane Smith Korey (1992), *As we belong to be: The ethnic movement in Cornwall, England*, Ph.D. Thesis, Brandeis University.

[157] Amy Hale (2001) 'Representing the Cornish - Contesting heritage interpretation in Cornwall', in *Tourist Studies*, vol. 1 (2), pp. 185-196, (2001), London: Sage, p. 185-196.

[158] See Jean Olivero (2010), op. cit.; Ronan Le Coadic (1998), op. cit.

[159] Charles Thomas (1986), *Celtic Britain*, London: Thames and Hudson.

[160] See Bernard Deacon, Dick Cole and Garry Tregidga (2003), *Mebyon Kernow and Cornish Nationalim*, Cardiff: Welsh Academic Press, pp. 18-22.See B. Deacon *et al.* (2003) op. cit.

that coupled Methodism with radicalism. None of the labels proposed adequately describes a phenomenon that spans the left-right political spectrum, manifests itself in social movements and economic initiatives, increasingly incorporates environmentalism and multiculturalism and inspires the arts and popular culture. Whilst sharing a sense of Cornwall and attributing symbolic roles to the Cornish language, the Movement's manifold manifestations are sites where ideas about what it is to be Cornish and what kind of place Cornwall should be are argued over. They are places where 'ascribed and elective identities'[161] meet untidily so that, firstly, it is unrealistic to distinguish between clear insider and outsider versions and secondly, composite imaginings are struggled over to produce differing representations. As such, differing performances of identity both inform (help) and misinform (hinder) efforts to develop cultural strategies, such as those of Cornwall Council and the Cornish Language Partnership, and are at the heart of discussions about 'regional distinctiveness', branding and cultural tourism.[162]

The effects of the Cornish Movement extend far beyond overtly Revivalist or nationalist circles, influencing the main political parties and the character of civil society.[163] For example, all of Cornwall's members of Parliament are currently learning Cornish and several have a track record of pursuing devolved government.[164] In recent years the Movement's discourses have underpinned bids for Objective One regional assistance, the 'Combined Universities Campus' and recognition for the Cornish Language from the Council of Europe and

---

[161] Stuart Hall's terms (1973), cf. S. Hall and Paul du Gay (eds.) (1996), *Questions of Cultural Identity*, London:Sage.

[162] e.g. Cornwall Council's 'White Paper for Culture', Truro: Cornwall Council, (October 2012) and earlier 'green paper'.

[163] Philip Payton (1996), *Cornwall,* Fowey: Alexander Associates, p. 290; B. Deacon *et al.* (2003), op. cit. (note 158).

[164] See, 'Dydh da – M.P.s to learn Cornish', http://www.thisiscornwall.co.uk/Dydh-da-ndash-MPs-learn-Cornish/story-17546252-detail/story.html (Accessed, 12th December 2012.); Communications from Andrew George, M.P.

the United Kingdom government.[165] Indeed these bids are inter-connected since individuals and groups from the Movement took the initiatives, firstly arguing that Cornwall should be disentangled statistically from Devon and the South-West for economic reasons and then making cultural and historical arguments for the recognition of Cornwall as one of Europe's historic regions. In fact, the symbolic existence of the Cornish language proved decisive, whilst the existence of the Cornish Movement itself demonstrated that the identity existed in the present tense. The Movement's influences pervade much of everyday life and have had a major impact on 'Cornwall since the war'[166] yet there has been no critical assessment of its socio-economic impact or potential contribution. Many concerned with the exercise of promoting Cornish culture and debating multiple interpretations see it as straightforwardly positive without giving further thought to which versions of Cornwall are foregrounded and which intra-group stories are relayed. This is (or should be) a controversial area because it has inevitable consequences for the image of Cornwall and could influence decision-making. It also affects how 'people in Cornwall' (an expression used in public discourse to discretely include Cornish and non-Cornish residents) feel about themselves and their communities, with knock-on effects in material areas such as employment and in non-material areas such as self-esteem.

In-migration.

Since the late 1960s, which were an abrupt tipping point, the imagery of tourism and alternative lifestyles has fuelled counter-urbanization and speculative housing booms, attracting thousands of new residents, mainly from urban parts of England who, contrary to common assumptions, are in the majority of working age and in fact more likely

---

[165] Testimony from councillors; Discussion in J. Willet, *Why is Cornwall so Poor? Narrative, Perception and Identity*, (2010), op. cit.
[166] Philip Payton (ed.) (1993), *Cornwall Since the War*, op. cit.

to be so than the indigenous Cornish.[167] Chronic poverty and unemployment have simultaneously led many people to leave yet the population rose from around 342, 300 in 1961 to 532, 300 in 2011, an average rise in the order of ten percent per decade, making Cornwall's population fifty-eight percent higher than in the mid twentieth century.[168] Neighbouring Devon has experienced similar trends but its population has increased by a much lower thirty-seven percent. At the same time, the indigenous Cornish population is thought to have fallen from around 260, 000 to below 180, 000.[169] To put these figures in perspective, Cornwall's growth rate since 1961 has been more than three times that of England, more than four times that of Wales and approximately seventy-three times that of Scotland. This growth is on an exceptional scale in Britain where only six or seven counties (all closely connected to London) have similar rates[170] and its causes and consequences have attracted interest from social scientists.[171] They are also unusual because they have not been fuelled by labour shortages and economic growth but have, 'always outstripped the creation of jobs, thus embedding chronic unemployment and driving wage levels down',[172] so whilst Cornwall has experienced impressive periods of job-creation, these have not been the motor for population growth nor enough to satisfy growing demand. It is only, in fact, since around 2005 that Cornwall's relative employment and income figures have shown a marked improvement, coincidentally corresponding to a slowing down of in-migration.[173] Population growth is set to continue though, because

---

[167] See, Malcolm Williams and Eric Harrison (1995), 'Movers and Stayers: A comparison of migratory and non-migratory groups in Cornwall, 1981-91', in P.J. Payton (ed.), *Cornish Studies*, no. 3, (1995), pp 176-193; Bernard Deacon, Andrew George and Ron Perry, (1987), *Cornwall at the Crossroads*, CoSERG: Redruth.

[168] Total from the 2011 Census. The last decade shows a 6.7% rise.

[169] Estimates in Jane Howells, 'Preliminary report on the Cornwall Council Core Strategy preferred approach equality impact assessment', Cornwall: Bewnans Kernow, (23rd February, 2012).

[170] Bernard Deacon, 'Population change in Cornwall 1951-2001', http://eric.ex.ac.uk/exeter/bitstream/10036/199s6/1/PopulationchangeinCornwall1951-2001.pdf, (Accessed 10th November 2010.)

[171] e.g. Ronald Perry, Ken Dean and Bryan Brown (eds.) (1986), *Counterurbanisation: case studies of urban to rural movement*, Geo Books, Norwich; Mary Buck, Lyn Bryant and Malcolm Williams (1993), 'Housing and Households in Cornwall: A pilot study of Cornish families', Plymouth: University of Plymouth.

[172] Bernard Deacon (2007), *Cornwall: A Concise History,* op. cit., p. 213.

[173] NOMIS Labour Force Statistics; Information from Cornwall Community Intelligence

far from opposing it, Cornwall Council's draft Core Strategy controversially plans for an increase of 92, 000 people and 48, 000 to 54,500 houses (proposed in 2011)[174] whilst opponents are campaigning for a revised figure of 29,000 houses using a rational based on the 2011 census. Indeed critics point out that the number of houses planned corresponds to a population growth of nearer 111,000, in excess of the 97,000 which the Office of National Statistics (ONS) predicts by extrapolating from recent decades. This caters for, and indeed encourages, rates of development and migration greater than those of the last decade and exceeds local needs estimated by CoSERG and the campaigning group, 'It's our Cornwall', to be 12, 500 houses based on analysis of the housing waiting list and internal trends.[175] Indeed it is argued that only five percent of the proposed housing is aimed at local need and that, in the words of Andrew George M.P., 'Our housing stock has more than doubled but our housing problems have got worse.', whilst 'Allowing Cornwall to carry on being a developers' paradise will do nothing to help the deep seated housing problems of locals.'[176] Cornwall's internal demographics point to zero growth or a slight decline but the proposed rates of in-migration mean that the population will be around 637,400 by 2031 and could even reach a staggering 1,263, 000 by 2111.[177] That is, of course, only if opposition fails and economic trends continue.

Another effect of tourism and speculative housing development is the growth in the number of second homes which is believed to have a strong effect on house prices and upon community life. The Office of

---

Team.

[174] See, http://www.facebook.com/pages/Its-Our-Cornwall/274653485930072 (Accessed 2nd October 2012); http://www.cornwall.gov.uk/default.aspx?page=22887 (Accessed June 2012); https://www.facebook.com/pages/Cornwall-beyond-the-Crossroads-Bib-the-Core-Strategy/2746534859300722 (Accessed July 2012); http://coserginfor.wordpress.com (Accessed July 2012).

[175] See, http://www.cornwallcoserg.org.uk/ and http://www.thisiscornwall.co.uk/Campaigners-say-Cornwall-growth/story-16623925-detail/story.html, (Accessed, 1st August 2012)

[176] Andrew George M.P., http://www.thisiscornwall.co.uk/Nimbys-blame-affordable-housing-shortage/story-11486176-detail/story.html

[177] Estimates cited by Jane Howells (2012), op. cit.

National Statistics reports that 10,169 people in England or Wales own a second home in Cornwall, higher numbers than any county. In total there are estimated to be more than 14,000 such homes, with concentrations in coastal villages such as Padstow (29,3%) and St. Minver Lowlands (42,9%).[178] In nearby Polzeath and Trebetherick the Council Tax list shows that more than half of houses are either second homes or empty.[179] The issue came to a head in 2010-11 when it was revealed that an unknown number of owners had been voting in marginal seats and had probably changed the outcomes of elections, notably in the case of George Eustice, Conservative M.P. for Camborne and Reduth who had won by a margin of just 66 votes (20th April 2010). Cornwall Council stepped in with 'a strict interpretation of the law' to reduce this phenomenon and in November 2012 also proposed using new powers to end council tax discounts.[180] In an overheard conversation at Polperro, a concerned visitor asked 'Where do all the locals live?' only to be told kindly that, 'There aren't that many in the old part of the village now.'[181] Widespread concerns are summed up by one of many media reports which described Mousehole as having been, 'left empty by [the] scourge of second homes', quoting a seventy-three year-old man, Leon Pezzack, who talked of 'a disintegration of our society'.[182] It is a side-effect of tourism that is not lost on Malcolm Bell of Visit Cornwall. He talks of needing to, 'mitigate the negatives and build on the positives' and 'dovetail' tourism with, 'improving the quality of life for Cornish people' and he suggests using planning to tackle the, 'unacceptable burden on the local community' whereby 'local people can't afford housing'.[183]

---

[178] Andrew Wallis, Cornwall Councillor, has provided a breakdown by parish, http://www.cllrandrewwallis.co.uk/the-full-list-of-second-homes-by-parish-in-cornwall/ (Accessed 15th January 2013.)

[179] http://ourcornwall.org/?cat=21 (Accessed 15th January 2013.)

[180] See, http://www.telegraph.co.uk/news/politics/8750278/Second-home-owners-banned-from-voting-in-Cornwall-elections.html (Accessed 9th September 2011.)

[181] Conversation in an artist's shop, 26th November 2012.

[182] Leon Pezzack cited by Simon Parker, http://www.thisiscornwall.co.uk (17th November 2012.)

[183] Malcolm Bell in A film by John Howe and Richard Stevens, Digital Media students at UCF, 2010. http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=KPIGqCJWXpk

The demographic and housing situation is the proverbial 'elephant in the room' of discussions about 'regional distinctiveness' and regeneration. Quite simply, Cornwall is distinctive because the indigenous Cornish make it so, yet if recent trends are allowed to continue they will be no more than 20 to 30 percent of the population by 2031. Ethnicity and in-migration are difficult matters to talk about, though. They touch sensibilities about racism and further reticence is created in the Cornish case because ethno-cultural claims tend to be met, not just with indignation and lack of sympathy, but with ridicule and dismissal of the idea that a distinct ethnicity even exists. Furthermore, the in-migrants and second-home owners in question are white, English and predominantly middle-class, just like most regional decision-makers, meaning that the latter may feel targeted when concerns are raised. For many Cornish people, the issue is emotionally-charged and produces both polemic and quiet, gloom-laden fatalism. Against this background it is understandable that when making the case for the Cornish language and cultural activities participants are inclined to avoid reference to these circumstances and the potential for political controversy; Yet, as previously noted, practices and artefacts that are labelled 'Cornish' only make sense if they are embedded in indigenous culture and society:

> If the Cornish people are not there underpinning it [Cornish identity], then all the talk about 'Cornish culture' or 'the Cornish heritage' will be just idle talk. We will have an empty culture with a disjointed identity. Cornwall will be populated by ghosts of its past – it will no longer be Cornwall in any real sense of the word but merely another spot on the map.[184]

Despite reticence about raising the issue in institutional settings, demographic trends pre-occupy cultural practitioners and community activists. Some are intensely aware that the commodification of cultural distinctiveness may continue apace without actions to ensure the

---

[184] CoSERG (1987) *Cornwall at the Crossroads.*

material conditions necessary for the continued presence of the Cornish themselves and the transmission of their living cultures. The organization, Bewnans Kernow, is a partnership of sixty-five diverse bodies concerned with a broad span of 'indigenous culture' which has responded to proposals for further population growth with a report that expresses genuine alarm and claims that, 'In-migration to Cornwall has had a strong adverse influence on the ability of the indigenous Cornish people to maintain a sustained population.'[185] The report touches upon the uses of culture, stating that, 'Cornish culture and Cornish distinctiveness powerfully strengthen community cohesion and are key drivers in Cornwall.',[186] and suggesting that these 'drivers' will be compromised if the Cornish are further marginalized:

> Marginalisation will affect the political, social, cultural and economic spheres, and will increasingly limit the ability of a diminishing indigenous population to influence these spheres.[187]

Marginalization and a Last of the Mohecans psychosis.

These demographic transformations and future projections have intensified fears that Cornwall's distinctiveness will be eroded and even that, 'the whole essence of Cornishness could be lost within a generation'.[188] Because of narratives of a Cornish national and ethnic identity, this disquiet goes beyond concerns about the countryside, rural deprivation or even localism, having much in common with rural Wales. In both cases worries about housing, employment and the physical and cultural landscape are joined by anxieties around the maintenance of culture as a way of life and the survival of the group as

---

[185] Jane Howells (2012), op. cit. p. 16.
[186] ibid.
[187] ibid.
[188] Loveday Trevenen Jenkin (2011) http://www.bbc.co.uk/news/uk-england-cornwall-12995737; cf. Charles Thomas, *The Importance of being Cornish, in Cornwall*, Institute of Cornish Studies, Redruth, 1973; CoSERG (1988), op. cit.; B. Deacon (2012), The The Unimportance of being Cornish in Cornwall, Address to the Institute of Cornish Studies, CUC Campus, Tremough, 24th November 2012.

a Celtic nation. In Cornwall, this gives rise to a widespread feeling that the 'imagined community'[189] and identity are in imminent danger and although this produces militancy and resistance it also leads to pessimistic acceptance and what has been called an 'end of Cornwall rhetoric':[190]

> What and how people feel is one of the most important things about culture and identity, and many of the Cornish [...] feel a sense of being 'wiped out'. This is reflected in the reality of a diminishing ratio of Cornish people to other people in Cornwall.[191]

To varying degrees, many members of the community see the erosion of their way of life, culture and community as inevitable and irreversible, reflecting feelings of powerlessness and the impression that developments are irresistible and beyond democratic control. Repeatedly, conversations return without prompting to these themes and are punctuated with remarks such as, 'Can't do anything about it?' and 'There's nothing we can do now.' The impression is of, 'disabling feelings of despair, defeatist acceptance and grief',[192] and forms of resignation that are detrimental to well-being. This favours a lack of confidence, dynamism and creativity that can be misperceived as apathy. It encourages the kinds of self-deprecation and rejection of personal background that accompany assimilation into the prevalent culture of in-migrants. A need, identified by cultural practitioners who are aware of this, is to actively move beyond cultural manifestations of a self-fulfilling 'cult of loss'.[193] Prominent themes of loss and defeat, increasingly joined by narratives of historic victimhood, are suspected of producing cultures and identities that are becoming closed, moribund

---

[189] Benedict Anderson (1991), op. cit.; See Alan Kent (2000), op. cit., p.12, for discussion of 'perceived... extinction'.
[190] Bernard Deacon (2007), op. cit. p. 215; cf. Daphne du Maurier (1967), *Vanishing Cornwall: The spirit and history of Cornwall*, Harmondworth: Penguin.
[191] Jane Howells, op. cit.
[192] Neil Kennedy (1995), 'Racial equality in Cornwall', in Commission for Racial Equality, 'Challenging Racism in the South-West: report of a one day seminar for Cornwall', Truro, pp. 18-211.
[193] Alan Kent (2000), *The Literature of Cornwall, Continuity, Identity, Difference 1000-2000,* p. 283.

and nostalgic or of producing a 'Last of the Mohicans' psychosis[194] of the kind expressed by the writer Roy Phillips:

> This book is dedicated to the likes of [list of names]. They represent the last of the Cornish, who are following their beautiful language into oblivion.[195]

There are claims that sections of Cornish society are marginalized politically and economically, as well as culturally. Jane Howells, for example, refers to a process of 'disenfranchisement' and warns that as the Cornish become a smaller proportion of the population, 'this is likely to have a knock on effect on the ability to access resources and opportunities.'[196] With regard to current planning, she notes that, 'consultation of representative Cornish organisations has not only been inadequate but non-existent.' This means that the impact of policy upon the indigenous community and its cultures has been ignored, thus flouting Cornwall Council's recognition in 2007 (reaffirmed in 2011) that 'The Framework Convention for the Protection of National Minorities' applies to the Cornish and the commitment that, 'All parties shall refrain from measures which alter the proportions of the population in areas inhabited by persons belonging to national minorities.'[197]

Howell's comments are characteristic of a new set of Cornish discourses, drawn from British multi-culturalism and minority politics, which has largely superseded the 'Cornwall for the Cornish' rhetoric of the 1960s and 70s. Thus, the tendency now is towards using the terms 'ethnic group', 'minority' and 'indigenous' and towards speaking about 'rights' and 'equality', often with reference to international legislation and charters.[198] Accompanying arguments began to filter into official

---

[194] The Mohicans are still with us in Oklahoma and Wisconsin.
[195] N.Roy Phillips (1987),*The Saffron Eaters*, Devon Books.
[196] Jane Howells, op. cit.
[197] Jane Howells, op. cit.
[198] See Bernard Deacon, 'The Cornish and the Council of Europe Framework Convention for the Protection of National Minorities', Redruth (1999); John Angarrack

channels in the early 1990s and featured in conferences and reports of the Commission for Racial Equality:

> [T]here is a substantial number of indigenous Cornish people who feel themselves disadvantaged, compared with 'incomers', in relation to class, income, housing, employment and various other aspects of daily living.[199]

These discourses have strengthened and are articulated with growing confidence and demands for, 'special care and responsibility for maintaining the homeland of this ethnic group in a sustainable fashion.'[200]

An aspect of Cornwall's new demographic circumstances is what Bernard Deacon has called, 'an ethnic division of labour' and 'a superimposition of cultural divisions on class divisions',[201] noting that it results partially from wider geographical labour markets for middle-class jobs and higher rates of middle-class migration. Greater numbers of outside candidates apply for jobs and are encouraged by the message that Cornwall is, 'a place where people are delighted to settle.'[202] Cornish candidates therefore face inflated competition and are said to suffer from indirect discrimination because of assumptions that they must be un-dynamic and un-ambitious if they stay in Cornwall. Deacon's analysis agrees with work by the geographer, Ron Perry, who undertook the first detailed studies of counter-urbanization in the 1980s, noting that it produced a socio-economic demarcation between

---

(1999), *Breaking the Chains: Propaganda, censorship, deception and the manipulation of public opinion in Cornwall*, Camborne: Cornish Stannary Publications.

[199] An anonymous council officer cited in, Eric Jay, 'Keep them in Birmingham: Challenging Racism in South-West England, (1992), Bristol: Commission for Racial Equality; Neil Kennedy (1995), op. cit.

[200] Jane Howells, op. cit., p. 15.

[201] Bernard Deacon (2007), op. cit. p. 215; See B. Deacon in *Cornwall, The Cultural Construction of Place*, Chapter 1, Patten Press & Institute of Cornish Studies, Penzance: University of Exeter.

[202] See, http://www.investincornwall.com/living-in-cornwall/ (Accessed, 16th November 2012.)

the Cornish, who then constituted much of the working-class, and immigrants who made up most of the middle-classes:

> [T]he picture that emerges from our study is of a Cornwall swamped by a flood of middle-class, middle-aged, middle-browed city dwellers who effectively imposed their standards upon local society.[203]

Growing public concern, from the 1970s onwards, centred on the impact this had on access to housing as estate agents marketed houses as 'cottages' in London and further stimulated an insatiable demand. It was apparent that the Cornish were being displaced in housing and financially confined to less attractive areas. CoSERG described them as having been, 'shunted onto windswept council house reservations on the outskirts of our coastal villages', where they had, 'seen their communities disintegrate in front of their own eyes within just one generation.'[204] David Penhaligon, M.P., popularly identified as a Cornish champion, stated that, 'If you want to find the Cornish go to the council estates.',[205] and the issue of Cornish marginalization led the mild-mannered Conservative, David Mudd, M.P., to warn of unrest on the lines of riots in Toxteth and Brixton.[206] In dramatic, Biblical tones, Paul Laity, Q.C. claimed that the Cornish were, 'hewers of wood and carriers of water', increasingly confined to jobs that serviced the better-off.[207] To address the absence of detailed information and overcoming resistance to monitoring the Cornish as an ethnic category, Cornwall Rural Community Council, housing departments and academics undertook studies which sought data on Cornish identity but by the 1980s the linkage between Cornishness and low socio-economic status had, in any case, been established in public discourse, even finding its way into jokes, such as, 'What do you call a Cornishman in a three-bedroom

---

[203] Ronald Perry, Ken Dean and Bryan Brown (1986), *Counterurbanization: International Case Studies of Socio-Economic Change in Rural Areas*, Norwich.
[204] B. Deacon, A. George and R. Perry (1988), *Cornwall at the Crossroads*, op. cit.
[205] David Penhaligon M.P., 21/6/1978 in Parliament (Hansard).
[206] Comments in *The West Briton* shortly after the Toxteth riots in Liverpool.
[207] Paul Laity Q.C. at the Cowethas Flamank conference, Perranporth - 1992.

house?: A burglar.'[208] Cornish nationalists could ratchet up the rhetoric and portray council housing and low-standard private housing estates as, 'the Cornish equivalent of American ghettos or South African shanty towns, places where low paid locals are shut away out of sight.'[209] External perceptions of Cornwall contradict the reality for a large section of its population, so that prevalent representations masked the problems:

> For outsiders, Cornwall is peace and tranquillity, a haven to which one might retire from the mad rush of modern life; for insiders Cornwall is often poverty and poor housing and a struggle to make ends meet in a low-wage economy.[210]

Of course, deprivation and poverty do not really respect ethnic boundaries and the worst-off Cornish people have material needs in common with disadvantaged in-migrants that they do not share with better-off Cornish people. This said, there are, nevertheless, correlations between socio-economic circumstances and Cornishness that are an essential part of the context for considering whether Cornish cultures can be useful for resilience and cohesiveness. Given the scale of change, recent decades may have produced greater cultural and generational fault-lines than those of language change (from Cornish to English) in the seventeenth and eighteenth centuries[211] or industrial decline and mass emigration in the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries.[212] Whilst the former produced a linguistic rift and loss of associated cultural items and the later undermined collective economic purpose and esteem, the recent changes may have interrupted the inter-generational transmission of identity, culture and knowledge more profoundly, producing a rupture at the level of family and community.

---

[208] Allegedly printed in Cornwall College Rag Mag., c. 1985.
[209] John Angarrack (1999), op. cit.
[210] Philip Payton (1996), op. cit.
[211] See Nicholas Williams (2006), *Cornish Today,* (Third edition), Westport: Evertype; Brian Murdoch (1993), *Cornish Literature,* Cambridge; Philip Payton (1992), op. cit. p.92.
[212] See, Philip Payton (2005), *The Cornish Overseas: The Epic Story of the 'Great Migration',* Fowey: Cornwall Editions Ltd.

This is because the scale and speed of demographic changes means that most people (notably the young) are not as immersed in the banal, everyday narratives of community identity as previous generations. The fact that a far lower proportion of people have Cornish families means that Cornishness (as 'distinctions', as daily narratives, as dispositions and attitudes etc.) is not a ubiquitous feature of life and is sometimes absent in the work place, public spaces and social settings.

In-migration and centralization combine against the maintenance and expansion of a native middle-class, producing breaks in transmission and cultural (re)creation on a scale that does not happen in communities with confident, empowered elites and intelligentsias. There is a resulting failure to develop definably Cornish institutions and networks to replace the work-based and (mainly Methodist) religious institutions that formerly served as spaces and channels of cultural transmission. In Althusser's analysis, institutions form part of the 'Ideological State Apparatus'[213] by which cultural mœurs and norms are transmitted but, as we see across Europe, institutions may also be regional, local and counter-hegemonic, serving to create and disseminate geographically and culturally specific knowledge and discourses. In Cornwall, the common view within the Cornish Movement is that useful knowledge is not adequately transmitted institutionally because there are few spaces in the media and education that are defined by Cornish people. Students from Truro College raised this in a discussion about their career prospects and a staff member at Camborne School of Mines complained that there are no channels to communicate industrial tradition. In this context it is suggested that the Cornish Movement is the main means by which narratives of Cornish identity are transmitted outside the family and that it might be regarded as a counter-hegemonic institutional apparatus and as a regional apparatus in waiting.

---

[213] Louis Althusser (1971), 'On Ideology and Ideological State Apparatuses', in *Lenin and Philosophy and Other Essays*, New York: Monthly Review Press.

<u>Taking Stock.</u>

In the 1980s and 90s, political opposition to the above trends stagnated, as campaigners began to see their efforts as futile[214] but multiple critiques emerged nevertheless and fused environmentalism, Cornish nationalism and socio-economic demands in an oppositional groundswell. With their concern for the disadvantaged in housing and jobs, these critiques largely avoided nimbyism but attracted accusations of parochialism that still beset opponents of unsustainable development. In terms that call to mind some sustainability agendas, the independent Cornish Social and Economic Research Group (CoSERG) argued in 1987 that Cornwall was 'at the crossroads' and faced its 'greatest ever challenge'.[215] Communities needed 'a breathing space'[216] to allow job creation and infrastructure to catch up with population growth, to protect the environment and avoid cultural and socio-economic destabilization. Without this the problems of local people would worsen and Cornish identity would weaken to the detriment of community cohesion. Uncontrolled, market forces and bad governance were allegedly threatening the very existence of a distinct Cornwall and a change in direction was urgently needed, one that would prioritize 'local housing needs' and build on 'regional strengths' such as Cornwall's prime maritime position,[217] local knowledge and identity, - much as is being successfully achieved by strong regional elites in Brittany.[218] A pause in the 'speculative house-building spree' would let in-migrants 'put down roots'. The polemic and the arguments had some influence on oppositional discourses in Cornwall but were unheeded by external decision-makers and as the 'Core Strategy' demonstrates, they have had no lasting effect on Cornwall Council planners. From the critics' perspective, Cornwall has been frog-marched beyond CoSERG's crossroads and taken down an unsustainable route.

---

[214] Information from witnesses; See Philip Payton (1992), pp. 200-201; Bernard Deacon (2007) op. cit.
[215] B. Deacon, A. George and R. Perry, (1987), *Cornwall at the Crossroads*, op. cit.
[216] ibid (p.47, p.157).
[217] Peter Wills, (1992), *Water, Water Everywhere*, Camborne: CoSERG.
[218] Discussions at the Institut de Locarn and observations; cf. Jean Olivro (2010), *Project Bretagne,* Rennes: Editions Apogée.

Since Cornwall didn't get the breathing space they thought indispensable, have their gloom-laden predictions come true? Some of them obviously have but the purpose here is to take stock of the situation, acknowledge that it is new and seek constructive ways forward that identify opportunities in its various continuities and discontinuities.

One of the most important aspects of the new circumstances is that they produce oppositional responses and the politically active promulgation of local knowledge as those concerned with maintaining Cornish identity claim spaces within existing institutions and create alternative scenes that they define as Cornish. I observed this in numerous settings: - within the networks of a handful of Cornwall Council officers, amongst academics and students across all higher and further education institutions, amongst the organizers of community events and in the use of the internet to disseminate information and create alternatives to the mainstream media. These are of course examples of network generation based on identity-led social capital, but they are also marginal. A primary school teacher described this kind of networking as, 'lurking in the cracks' and 'getting together with likeminded people',[219] comments that reveal the felt absence of Cornish-owned institutions and awareness of trying to make-do.

Widespread concern for the erosion of communities and tradition has not yet translated itself into sufficient research into socio-cultural discontinuities despite academic attention to economic and demographic change and to individual areas of culture. It might nevertheless be concluded that Cornwall is poised at the beginning of a post-Cornish moment where disappearing cultural components have not been replaced with anything lasting or embedded, yet some analysts draw attention to a vigorous performance of Cornishness that recalls

---

[219] A teacher called Sammy at The Krowji, Redruth, August 2011.

observations of the 'stubborn refusal of Cornish identity to go away' and its conscious maintenance as 'a passion to exist'.[220] In these accounts, the new circumstances have driven a 're-definition and re-assertion' of identity,[221] paradoxically strengthening awareness of it whilst undermining the material and observable realities of difference at the same time.

Some insiders represent the challenges of the new circumstances as the latest in a long history of endurance and struggle, creating a discourse that owes much to eighteenth-century narratives of an ancient history of resistance to Saxon invaders[222] and later accounts of wearing economic hardship in mining. Corresponding cultural activities produce, 'the knowledge that Cornwall and the Cornish people are still very much alive and kicking even after 500 years of very mixed fortunes.'[223] In challenging the alleged extinction of Cornish ethnicity in the eighteenth century, Bernard Deacon has observed that, 'the way that people think about themselves and their identity does not just rest upon the 'facts' of history but on the way that history is remembered.'[224] This is to say that narratives of identity that are founded on the past produce histories which may have meaning even if they do not correspond to present, material realities. Thus, forty years ago, Charles Thomas observed that, 'the knowledge of the existence of a separate language, as distinct from a full knowledge of that language itself, is probably sufficient … to foster a sense of otherness'.[225] His view seems to have been borne out by a growth in symbolic references to Cornish

---

[220] Bert Biscoe op. cit.; B. Deacon (2007), op. cit. p. 216; A.M. Kent (2000), op. cit. pp. 11-12; Comments by Alison Davey at the CAVA conference, October 2011; Rob Burton, 'A Passion to Exist: Cultural Hegemony and the Roots of Cornish Identity', in P.J. Payton (ed.), *Cornish Studies*, no.5, (1997), pp. 151-163.

[221] Bernard Deacon and Philip Payton, 'Re-inventing Cornwall: Culture Change on the European Periphery', in *Cornish Studies,* no. 1, pp. 62-79 (63).

[222] e.g. William Borlase (1769), *Antiquities Historical and Monumental of the County of Cornwall*, Bowyer and Nichols, London, p. 40; Fortescue Hitchins and Samuel Drew (1824), *The History of Cornwall*, Helston: William Penaluna, p. 725.

[223] Loveday Jenkin & Peggy Morris in Simon Parker (ed.) (1998), *Cornwall Marches On!*, Keskerdh Kernow 500: Keskerdh Kernow Ltd.: Truro, p.3.

[224] Bernard Deacon *et al. (*2003), op. cit. p. 6.

[225] Charles Thomas, *The Importance of being Cornish, in Cornwall*, Institute of Cornish Studies, Redruth, (1973), p.10.

that is out of all proportion to the small number of people who speak it. Similarly, today's Cornish identities are partly maintained by what might be called 'remembered difference'. The tangible, observable things that make the Cornish recognizably distinctive as a group are far fewer but the idea of difference is nevertheless supported by faith in its existence and by collective memory and post-memory that is discursively constructed and transmitted. Thus, whilst the 'objective' cultural distinctions of a Cornish way of life have lessened, this does not stop in-group histories from continuing to assert difference. On the contrary, identity narratives are intensified and newly generated precisely because Cornishness seems to be under threat and this furnishes material for (both enabling and disabling) 'useable histories'[226] and useable culture. In brief, identity does not require difference to be a quantifiable and tangible reality or to take the form of obvious visible or linguistic distinctions. The extent to which Cornish ethno-cultural awareness has not only survived but translated itself into a more explicit, national identity was brought into sharp focus by a survey conducted by *The Guardian* in 2011.[227] Respondents were asked to state whether they considered themselves British, English, Irish, Northern Irish, Scottish or Other. When plotted on a map, the results show a sharp demarcation which, as *The Guardian* put it, 'closely follows the line of the Tamar River, the historic boundary between Cornwall and the rest of England'.[228] To the west of this line most respondents identified themselves as 'Other'. The result agrees with research by Joanie Willett that found that forty-one percent of people questioned felt either 'Cornish and not English' or 'more Cornish than English', a proportion that incidently suggests that some in-migrants, or their children, choose these identifications.[229]

---

[226] cf. Michael Keating, 'A regional history of modern Europe. Territorial management and the state.' in Bill Lancaster et al. (2007), op. cit. pp. 149-164.

[227] *The Guardian* 12th October 2011, http://m.guardian.co.uk/uk/2011/oct/12/uk-citizens-reject-british-survey?cat=uk&type=article (Accessed, 21st November 2012.)

[228] ibid.

[229] Joanie Willett, 'Cornish identity: vague notion or social fact?' in Philip Payton (ed.), *Cornish Studies,* no. 16, (2008), pp.183-205.

The New Cornish.

Those in-migrants who have 'put down roots' are not infrequently called the 'New Cornish' and some of them use this, or similar tags, to describe what Stuart Hall would call 'elective identities'.[230] This ambiguous naming, which may be read either as a distinction *from*, or an identification *with*, the 'Old Cornish', reveals differing personal encounters with perceived difference and negotiated relationships with it. The 2011 census did not include a tick-box to indicate Cornish ethnicity, despite a campaign since the 1980s, but a specific code was nonetheless allocated for analysis of 'write-in' responses.[231] Cornwall Council and the census officers delighted activists by intervening proactively with a publicity campaign to explain how people could register Cornish identity and have the figures recorded.[232] They suggested that, 'the Cornish National Identity question is inclusive of all of Cornwall's residents' as well as 'Cornish people living in major cities such as London, Plymouth and Bristol'. In the event more than 73, 218 people in Cornwall chose to actively write Cornish on their forms.[233] Some established in-migrants expressed their desire to identify as Cornish and were encouraged by 'born and bred' natives (at the Bewnans Kernow conference, 12th February 2011, for example and via social media). In an encounter at Mabe, a woman who had moved to the area more than thirty years previously had tears in her eyes when undisputedly Cornish friends told her, 'Of course you can put Cornish.'[234] This phenomenon of 'going native' and identifying with place and community seems perfectly normal and hardly worthy of

---

[230] Stuart Hall (1973), op. cit.
[231] Requested by Dan Rogerson M.P., for example.
[232] Calls for questions on Cornish identity were widely covered in *The Western Morning News* and the news site, *This is Cornwall*. The Census Office and Cornwall Council published information on how to register Cornish ethnicity: http://cornish-census2011.org/. See also: http://www.cornwall.gov.uk/default.aspx?page=26948; http://www.telegraph.co.uk/news/uknews/8395003/Census-2011-council-urges-residents-to-proclaim-Cornish-nationality.html; http://news.bbc.co.uk/2/hi/uk_news/politics/8389745.stm (All accessed in November 2012)
[233] ONS Census report KS202EW released, 11th December 2012.
[234] Conversation with the Mabe-Primelin Twinning Association, Mabe Community Hall, April, 2010.

comment, except that it does not always happen, either generally or in Cornwall. There are many cases around the world of higher status outsiders (colonizers and settlers amongst them) maintaining distinction from natives/locals. Cornwall has points in common with 'attractive' rural areas of England (The Cotswolds, The Lake District etc.) that have experienced 'gentrification'[235] whereby the 'superior' cultures of affluent in-migrants replaces those of locals who sometimes adjust culturally by, for example, changing the way they speak. In other words, hegemony is at work, but what is clear from identifications in Cornwall is that there are negotiable processes whereby individual in-comers elect or reject all or part of the local culture and natives variously reject or adopt the cultures of in-migrants. In 1988, CoSERG observed that:

> [I]t is not too difficult these days to find those who, despite being brought up or born in Cornwall, and even having traces of a Cornish accent, will fiercely deny they are Cornish, because their parents hail from Hemel Hempstead or some such place.[236]

Observing the extent to which local people were taking on the cultural attributes of in-migrants in the 1990s, Ron Perry and his colleagues concluded that, 'integration and assimilation' was 'a one way process of urbanisation rather than ruralisation.',[237] and it is indeed easy enough to find people who sound like they come from South-East England, even though they have always lived in Cornwall and have Cornish parents. Yet CoSERG noted that there were also people who adopted a Cornish identity and were thought of as Cornish by natives.[238] During this inquiry, I encountered a large number of such in-migrants who felt and to a marked degree seemed, credibly Cornish to insiders. In accordance with this observation, Mary McArthur predicts that, '[I]t is possible that the incomers of today will become (or produce) the Cornish of

---

[235] cf. Gary Bridge, 'Bourdieu, rational action and the time-space of gentrification', http://www.jstor.org/stable/3650668 (Accessed 8th February 2011.)
[236] B. Deacon, A. George and R. Perry, (1988), op. cit. p.156.
[237] Ron Perry et al. (1995), 'Movers and Stayers 1971-91', Department of Sociology, University of Plymouth.
[238] B. Deacon, A. George and R. Perry, (1988), op. cit.

tomorrow',[239] and in her work on housing and family structures, Mary Buck suggests 'a fairly high level of assimilation'.[240] Data provided by the CAPITA Schools Census have attracted media interest. Since 2005 it has been possible for pupils to select the category 'Cornish' in the question on ethnicity and in 2005, 27% of pupils opted for this. The surprise, though, is that the proportion has grown steadily to 41% (28, 584 pupils) in 2011, an increase of about 5,000 pupils since 2009.[241] The growth must reflect new confidence in making this choice, as it becomes established as normal and is less likely to attract ridicule, but the high proportion also suggests that an important number of the children of in-migrants consider themselves Cornish and that in turn hints at their parents communicating affective identifications. In a perspective that suggests connections between identity and social capital, Paul Masters of Cornwall Council's Chief Executive Office, has connected the pupils' responses to commitment to community, suggesting that it offers the hope that, 'people will be more interested in looking after the place for future generations and volunteering within their communities.'[242] The Cornish Language Officer, Jenefer Lowe, suggests that the findings show awareness of Cornwall's 'distinctiveness', including the language, and levels of personal identification which, 'can only be good for Cornwall and Cornish culture'.[243]

Actively wooing in-migrants has been a theme for discussion since the 1970s at least. At that time some Cornish nationalists, including the Mebyon Kernow campaigner, teacher and publisher, Len Truran, were arguing that they could integrate in-migrants and 'make them

---

[239] Mary McArthur, 'The Cornish: A Case Study in Ethnicity', unpublished M.Sc. dissertation, University of Bristol, 1988, p.97.
[240] Mary Buck *et al.*, *Housing and Households in Cornwall: A Pilot Study of Cornish Families*, University of Plymouth, (1991), p.51.
[241] The Cornwall Pupil Level Annual Schools Census (PLASC), See, http://www.thisiscornwall.co.uk/Children-Cornish-pride-latest-school-census/story-14334357-detail/story.html, (Accessed 26th April 12.)
[242] ibid.
[243] Communications from Jenefer Lowe, Cornish Language Development Officer.

Cornish'.[244] In Corsica and the Basque Country, which have experienced major population influxes,[245] many in-migrants and their descendents are strong champions of the Corsican and Basque languages and identities, giving credibility to the view that culture can contribute to integration and lead to assimilation. In analyzing responses to questionnaires from Cornwall, Joanie Willett discusses the theoretical view that, 'newcomers to a community can assimilate into the new identity through a process of learning'.[246] She contrasts this to views that, 'family may be critical for identity transmission' and prescriptive and essentialist ideas of Cornish identity that exclude the idea of recruitment. Some cultural practitioners claim that there has been a very recent change in the way in which Cornishness is valued by in-migrants so that more of them have positive attitudes and, as a young musician put it, 'not so many people rubbish it'. As evidence, they cite participation in Revivalist culture but encouraging though this sounds, the picture might be a little more complicated than suggested by appreciation of compartmentalized activities or by the adoption of Cornish house-names, flags and other visual signifiers. As already observed, these may mean different things to different people, so whilst there is certainly serious participation and symbolic display by in-migrants who sincerely identify with Cornishness, there are also superficial visual and recreational uses that have more to do with exhibiting counter-urban, leisure-orientated lifestyles to peers. This has been remarked by 'Cornish Oafs', an online comic act launched by two Cornish learners, Liam Thomas and Luke Stevens in 2012. In one of their film clips a fictional artist says, 'Well, I got fed up with the rat-race and moved down to Cornwall, aka Kernow. I've got the car sticker and everything.'[247]

---

[244] Information from Ted Chapman, former treasurer of Mebyon Kernow (d. 2010).
[245] For discussion of Basque identities see, Lieven de Winter, Margarita Gómez-Reno and Peter Lynch (eds.) (2006), *Autonomist Parties in Europe: ethnic politics and the revival of the territorial cleavage*, Barcelona: Institut de Ciències Polítiques i Socials.
[246] Joanie Willett, 'Cornish Identity: Vague Notion or Social Fact?', (2008), op. cit. p. 185.
[247] See, http://www.facebook.com/CornishOafs (Accessed 17th November 2012).

The light-heartedness of superficial participation can merge into mockery when individuals who have limited social contact with Cornish people put a Kernow sticker on their car or wear tee-shirts emblazoned with *People's Republic of Cornwall* (on sale at *Seasalt* in Falmouth). Identification by many in-migrants with something Cornish is attested in their involvement in cultural events and Cornish campaigns and community initiatives but not enough is known about the phenomenon to draw the conclusion that this generally indicates assimilation or a valuing of Cornishness as a whole. In brief, it is possible to take up an activity as an item without embracing an entire culture. It is also possible for somebody to feel part of a community or identify with it affectively without adopting its existing ways of life and culture for themselves. Cornish culture is heterogeneous or plural and we do not really know which strands appeal to which New Cornish participants and how they imagine and value their activities. Consequently, we cannot be sure whether the assimilation, tentatively identified by Mary Buck, involves general cultural acquisition (such as taking on new attitudes or local accents) or whether it is limited to social and structural adaptations, such as making friends or participating in networks which nevertheless benefit social capital and cohesiveness. It has been apparent throughout this inquiry that some in-migrants feel common cause and identification with the indigenous Cornish whilst others do not and sometimes feel a degree of antipathy towards them. It is also clear that cultural activities play a role in providing contexts for social relationships that work people into the community. For instance, a journalist who has learnt to speak Cornish expressed the sentiment of many, saying (in Cornish), 'I'm not Cornish but most of my friends are and everything I do now is Cornish, so I feel like I am.'[248]

In a discussion with seven people from Falmouth who had worked in shops or the Docks and were nearing retirement, the topics included

---

[248] Comments in Cornish by Matthew Clarke of Kernow-Pods, a well-known radio presenter and advocate of the Cornish language.

regret for recent changes in the town (the 'student takeover', loss of shops, a less close-knit community, difficulties at Falmouth Docks) and hopes for its future. The conversation was laced with local expressions and insider references (including Falmouth Christmas Harmony Choir, Falmouth Marine Band, Stithians Show cake competitions and picking daffodils) and 'speech acts' even though three of the people had moved to Cornwall as young adults.[249] This is a common enough experience which suggests that in working-class contexts at least, people can come to identify strongly with established communities and incorporate this into their personal identities. They may even take on outward distinctions of traditional Cornishness, - in this case accent, body language and shared references. The affirmative proposition here is to embrace the potential for progressive and inclusive community building suggested by the naming 'New Cornish' and examine what is happening so as to inform intervention.

'Those who were born here and those who were drawn here.'

Ten years ago, a well-known Revivalist, Howard Curnow, wrote that, 'The Cornish Movement' was:

> ...in a position to adopt a programme of mature, responsible action... [that] would embrace cultural achievements, political recognition, our economic future, and, most importantly, a popular acceptance ... of what it is to be Cornish AND/OR to be living in Cornwall.[250]

Questioning a new generation of the Cornish Movement's activists about what that could mean reveals promisingly inclusive views and actions that recognize the need for alliances of common interest between the

---

[249] The group included past and present employees from a pharmacy and the former Woolworth's closed in 2010. Two were originally from Lancashire and another from Teeside.
[250] Howard Curnow, in *An Baner Kernewek,* No. 69, August 1992.

indigenous Cornish and incomers. They refer to issues as diverse as the economy, housing, the environment, devolved government and public services, linking them to a sense of community. They also appear united in distinguishing between, 'those who are with us and those who are against us',[251] making it clear that the former are welcome in all areas of cultural and community life and recognizing that in-migrants are far from being a homogenous group and that neither are the Cornish. In signalling their wish to include the New Cornish, the Revivalist musicians, Dalla, use the phrase, 'those who were born here and those who were drawn here'. Comments like this show awareness of the risks of Anglophobia, presented as a moral dilemma in Marcus Tanner's pessimistically entitled, *The Last of the Celts*:

> How far can they [rural 'Celtic' communities] go, and how far will they be allowed to go, towards resisting the flow of English immigrants, second-home owners and pensioners without slipping into outright racism?[252]

This is a key issue in Cornwall's 'new circumstances' and it is hard to provide an easy answer. Ethno-cultural identity is part of what many Cornish people wish to sustain and the 'regional distinctiveness' that it produces has been identified as an asset, so how can Cornishness be carried forward and upheld so as to spread harmony and cohesiveness rather than discord and division? The obvious answer is that it cannot because there are conflicts of interests but in 'taking sides' the Cornish Movement can continue to construct projects that avoid conflating those conflicts with ethnic division. Cornwall's newly composed communities share some common interests and a physical space, so some of the responses to these questions surely lie in exploring place-centred culture and using it to cement new bonds. At this point though, we should understand that geographically located culture is not necessarily the same thing as ethnic culture. As may be seen in

---

[251] Comments at the CAVA conference, Perran Porth, October 2010.
[252] Marcus Tanner (2006 [2004]), *The Last of the Celts,* Yale University Press.

Australia, North America and large cosmopolitan cities, the development of common cultural values and loyalties may involve civic identities which celebrate place but have little or no reference to a common ethno-cultural identity. Awareness of this takes the discussion into further areas of controversy and raises more questions about what place Cornish ethnicity and specifically Cornish cultures can have when the indigenous Cornish are a still-shrinking minority of the population. What workable strategies can be imagined for its survival and where do the New Cornish fit into it? In keeping with the attention to fragmentation in this inquiry, the leaders of the *Kernocopia* community arts project suggest that, '[O]ur communities are fragmented along multiple lines - 'incomers' and 'locals', 'Cornish' and 'furriners', 'hooded wannabee-gangstas' and 'old fogeys'...'[253] but they nevertheless believe that, 'art and cultural intervention *do* have the ability to change' and that, 'Through uncovering Cornwall's diverse and distinct stories, and bringing them to life through creative, participatory and immersive experiences, Kernocopia intends to make a tangible contribution to the health and well-being of our communities.'[254]

The various sections of Cornwall's population need to work together so a unifying identification is in everybody's interest. Some analysts have speculated about the emergence of a sort of 'civic Cornishness' that includes the New Cornish and they have observed the pragmatic embrace and encouragement of this notion by strands within the Cornish Movement.[255] From the Cornish Language Partnership to Mebyon Kernow, there have been clear statements, not only of inclusiveness, but of a civic idea of community that goes beyond ethnicity. Cornish civic identity, as an idea, is not a straightforward matter, though. It can be understood as usurping or replacing ethnicity, thus reducing a deeply tribal sense of Cornishness and complex cultural acquisitions to something relatively superficial that people can

---

[253] *Kernocopia,* project proposal for 2013-14.
[254] ibid.
[255] See Cole, Deacon and Tregidga (2003) op. cit.; See also, J. Willet, op. cit., p.200.

simply opt into or out of with the ease of changing address. As a result, something of a false opposition has emerged between ethnic identity and civic identity in discussions of identity politics. The prominent Cornish campaigner and polemicist, John Angarrack, has been vociferous in dismissing the 'civic nationalism' of Mebyon Kernow and reasserts the relevance of an ethnic nationalism that he nevertheless constructs as open and welcoming to the New Cornish.[256] Listening to his argument though, it very much sounds as though Angarrack is talking at cross purposes to advocates of civic nationalism and identity. The latter have not proposed abandoning ethic Cornishness and Angarrack has not suggested exclusivity so their differences appear more semantic than real. They have all apparently realized, tacitly at least, that there is a demographic reality that makes ethnic exclusivity strategically untenable. The indigenous Cornish can no longer make public policy decisions or even elect representatives without the support of friends and appeals to common interest with people who have moved to Cornwall.

The opposition between civic and ethnic nationalism depends upon theoretical and ideological assumptions that are rooted in dualistic Western thought of the kind criticised by post-structuralists as supporting hierarchies but excluding ambiguity and indeterminacy (Derrida's *undecidability*.).[257] As a dichotomy, it therefore compares to other binary simplifications in discussions of Cornishness (Insider/Outsider; Cornish/English; Celt/Saxon...) and to problematic constructions of Celticity in opposition to Engishness. The proposition therefore is to move beyond an 'either or' (*an eyl po y gila*) discussion to adopt an aspiration that combines ethnic and civic identities (*an eyl ha y gila*). Although 'the myth of the civic nation'[258] can be a smoke-screen

[256] e.g. John Angarrack (2008), *Scat t'Larrups. Resist and Survive*, Padstow: Independent Academic Press, pp. 82-86.

[257] e.g. Hélène Cixous, 'The New-Born Woman' ('La Jeune Née' [1975]), in Marks and Courtivron (1981), *New French Feminisms - An Anthology, Harvester Press*, Hemel Hempstead, p 37-8.

[258] Bernard Yack, 'The myth of the civic nation', in R. Beiner (ed.) (1999), *Theorizing Nationalism*, pp. 103-118.

for ethnic identities, many are multi-ethnic and multicultural, whilst ethnic identities themselves can be internally plural and indeterminately bounded. In fact, plurality is often the whole point of developing civic identity in the first place, because it allows different sections of a population to develop common purpose and to respect and like each other so that they can function as a single society and get things done. As was demonstrated in the opening ceremony of the London Olympics, ethnic and cultural heterogeneity may even be one of the unifying myths around which civic identity is constructed, so that it is celebrated with affection.

Certainly, there are pitfalls. The suggestion has already been made that items of Cornish culture are sometimes lifted from their embedded context and misappropriated for use in other people's lifestyles and commercial enterprises; but there are also opportunities for the strengthening of ethno-cultural identity. Cornish cultures can be an interface which favours recruitment into indigenous Cornish culture and society so that it defines Cornwall instead of becoming further sidelined. A civic identity that makes symbolic reference to an existing indigenous culture (as happens with Polynesian cultures in New Zealand and Hawaii) may produce benefits for the group and culture concerned, not just misappropriations. It can lead to them acquiring symbolic value so that they gain esteem and find the motivation and affective support for socio-cultural projects, including language revitalization. One of the related ideas explored in the next chapter is the possibility of using existing Cornish practices to enhance social capital across the whole of society, the suggestion being that this could allow civic identifications to be developed which have valorizing benefits for ethno-cultural identity.

Chapter Four

Cornish Culture and Capital.

To approach the wider social and emotional uses of culture whilst keeping an open mind towards commodification we may turn to a multidisciplinary framework based on plural notions of capital from sociology, cultural studies and economics. The closely intertwined terms *human, cultural, social* and *symbolic capital* (amongst others) are variously understood and applied within these fields but they all essentially imagine other forms of economy in parallel to that of money and goods. Some of these extensions are closely linked to considerations of economic capital, commercial exchange and the accounts of finance that all of us recognize from everyday understandings of 'capital', but others are only indirectly related to this and have more to do with the workings of society in general. Choosing capital as a focus at all, even as an analogy, implies staying within the logic of exchange and binding cultural life to economics by one route or another but the suggestion here is that capital might also be taken as a byword for communities' general stock of useful cultural practice and connected social behaviour. Thus, combining perspectives from a range of disciplines is in keeping with the wish to consider culture's primary uses at the same time as economic potential.

This chapter has two main starting points. The first is 'social capital', using work by two main theorists: James Coleman,[259] - who explores it in relation to human capital and economics, - and Robert D. Putnam

---

[259] James Coleman (1988),), 'Social Capital in the Creation of Human Capital', in *The American Journal of Sociology*, vol. 94, Supplement: 'Organizations and Institutions: Sociological and Economic Approaches to the Analysis of Social Structure', pp. S95-S120. http://www.jstor.org/ (Accessed 13th November 2010.)

who centres more closely on social solidarity and well-being.[260] The second starting point is the work of the influential sociologist Pierre Bourdieu[261] whose primary interest in social and economic inequalities and the connections between them has produced an elaborate analysis that emphasizes polymorphous forms of capital (including social capital) and moves away from simplistic, pyramidal ways of imagining social hierarchies.[262] Taken together, Bourdieu, Coleman and Putnam provide approaches, firstly to studying social networks and relationships and secondly to considering the relative status and value attached to individuals, groups and their cultures. The purpose of this chapter is therefore to present both of these themes as a detailed overview so as to inform the following discussion and establish their connections with well-being. Most importantly, these approaches let us widen the discussion around culture's primary uses and link them to the ability of communities to deal with all areas of life. Coleman's direct links between economic and social capital also point to culture having non-commercial uses that are nevertheless vital for the economy because of their enabling effects. These ideas may be expanded further to consider culture's contributions to psychological/emotional need through esteem and belongingness.

All of these theoretical frameworks, based on capital of one kind or another, have a Marxist genealogy, even if that is not always immediately obvious, so it is useful to begin by considering one or two of Marx's basic notions and how they might relate to the earlier proposition that culture has primary uses and the assumptions in favour of commodification in public discussions.[263] First though, it is

---

[260] Robert D. Putnam (1995), Robert D. Putnam, 'Tuning in, tuning out: the strange disappearance of social capital in America', *Political Science and Politics*, no. 28, (1995), pp. 664-83; Robert D. Putnam (2000), *Bowling Alone: The Collapse and Revival of American Community*, Simon and Shuster, New York.

[261] For discussion, J. Lechte (1994), *Fifty Key Cotemporary Thinkers - From Structuralism to Postmodernity*, London: Routledge, pp. 45-49.

[262] For discussion, Stéphane Chevallier and Christine Chauvre (2010), *Dictionnaire Bourdieu*, Paris: Ellipses, p.20.

[263] See 'capital' in the glossary.

worth remembering that some of the terms used in these discussions and in translations of Marx have widespread, common-sense meanings that relate to taken-for-granted truths in capitalist societies:

> That readers make any sense of Marx's terminology at all suggests that many of the relations he sees in reality correspond, more or less, to our commonsense view of the world [...] these relations [...] constitute the core meanings of most of his concepts.[264]

This explains some of the difficulty encountered when striving to extend discussion of cultural use beyond the common-sense understandings and 'truths' that underpin institutional attitudes and which are nearly all rooted in achieving further commodification.

One of the most important concepts in Marx's account, when it comes to reflecting upon the usefulness of culture, is that of 'use-value'. This is the value that something has when used to meet a human need, so that 'the usefulness of the thing makes it a use-value'.[265] Significantly for the consideration of culture's social benefits, Marx extends his understanding of human need beyond the material, allowing connections with the areas of emotional and psychological need:

> The nature of these needs, whether they arise, for example, from the stomach, or the imagination, makes no difference.[266]

Use-value may, in other words, relate to all of the areas of human need previously introduced,[267] not just the obvious physiological and security needs which might be easier to relate to the material profits of

---

[264] Bartell Ollman (2003), *Dance of the Dialectic: Steps in Marx's Method,* Urbana and Chicago: University of Illinois Press, p.36.

[265] Karl Marx (1990 [1867]), *Capital, Volume 1: A Critique of Political Economy*, translated by Ben Fowkes, London: Penguin, p. 126.

[266] Karl Marx, op. cit., p.125.

[267] cf. Abraham Maslow's 'Hierarchy of Needs' (1954), op. cit.

commodification. Remember that primary 'use-value' is not the same as 'value' or 'exchange-value'[268] but is instead the inherent property or content of 'a thing which through its qualities satisfies human needs of whatever kind'.[269] Put slightly differently, the value something has in meeting need is realized when it is used or consumed and this use-value need not have anything to do with trade. For a locally-inspired illustration, somebody may go mackerel fishing and grow potatoes. Both have use-value or utility as food and may be prepared and eaten at home by the person that caught the fish and grew the vegetables rather than being sold. In such cases, as in the commonly cited examples of hunter-gatherers or subsistence farmers, the things that people make or produce have use-value without this being converted into economic value through exchange. In much the same way cultural practices and artefacts may have primary uses which have worth in meeting the non-material needs already introduced and as has already been suggested, these uses give them something akin to use-value. In fact, it would not really be stretching Marx's definition to regard these primary uses quite straightforwardly as use-values. As already outlined, these intangible uses have to do with the relationships and feelings that underpin identity, community and society.

Marx identifies the commodity as the building-block of capitalism[270] and 'things' becomes commodities when produced in quantity for market exchange rather than for direct consumption by the producer. These commodities then have 'exchange-value' and may be traded or sold.[271] It is this process of 'commodification' that is involved when culture and heritage are turned into commercial cultural products

[268] cf. Yu Wujin, 'Thing, Value, Time, and Freedom: A Consideration of Some key Concepts in Marx's Philosophical System', translated by Jie Tang in *Frontiers of Philosophy in China*, vol.1 (1), (Jan., 2006), pp. 114-123, Springer, p. 117. http://www.jstor.org/stable/30209956 (Accessed, 22nd July 2010)
[269] Karl Marx, op. cit. p.125.
[270] Karl Marx, op. cit. p.949.
[271] *Exchange-value*: Describes the relative proportions in which different kinds of use-value can be exchanged. A single commodity may have many exchange values according to time and place.

(performances, spectacles, artefacts, representations, paid visits and experiences etc.), taken into the market place and exchanged for money; But although all commodities have use-value, not all products (material or not) have exchange-value, the point being that we may consider the primary uses of cultural elements independently of their commercial potential, just as we might for the use-values of other things. Singing a repertoire of Cornish songs amongst friends may correspond to emotional uses for example, and this has nothing to do with the potential for the same songs to be turned into a commercial performance and so acquire exchange-value.

Capitalist societies convert much of their production into exchangeable commodities as a taken-for-granted aspect of life and suggestions that more aspects of culture should be commodified are an extension of the corresponding logic and expectations that have strengthened under conditions of global, liberal capitalism.[272] Commercialization has intensified and extended much further into our lives, as has the acceptance that this should happen. Proposals to market culture and heritage and to use symbols of regional, national, local and ethnic identities to produce 'added value' (current in regional planning)[273] are an aspect of this trend and involve viewing culture and cultural identity from precisely this logic as one more form of commodity. Such expectations have been shaped by long-established forms of exchange and it is almost a hundred years since György Lukács' observed that all human relationships and practices had come to be treated as commodities.[274]

---

[272] For discussions, Arjun Appadurhi (1986) (1986), *The Social Life of Things. Commodities in Cultural Perspective*, Chicago: University of Chicago Press.

[273] e.g. http://www.objectiveone.com/client/cases/InvClusterPDFs/Plough2Plate.pdf

[274] In György Lukács, (1967[1923]), *History and Class Consciousness*, Merlin Press: http://www.marxists.org/archive/lukacs/works/history/index.htm (Accessed 5th May 2011).

Once commodification happens, cultural elements become consumable and they acquire exhange-value, whether or not they are concrete things. Commercial cultural production (including non-material aspects such as services, the provision of information and knowledge and performances), still involves primary uses, however, and whilst some aspects of culture can easily be turned to economic profit, others are not immediately amenable to this because they are insufficiently tangible or aesthetically marketable. One-dimensional discussions that reduce cultural elements to economic resources concentrate exclusively on profit without regard for other roles, thus arousing the suspicion that commercialization sometimes compromises or alters their primary uses and undermines well-being by lifting them from their social context.[275]

It is not assumed that commodification is always bad, though, nor that it involves a complete or permanent abandonment of other uses. On the contrary, the possibility that commercial uses sometimes benefit primary uses is also recognized. In practice, there may be a two-way process whereby cultural elements are de-commodified and retained in everyday life, or alternately commercialized and de-commercialized in specific contexts. Arjun Appadurhi describes how elements of culture may move back and forth between a 'commodity state' and simple use at different moments, effectively meaning that they do not have one-way trajectories or fixed meanings and uses.[276] Commercially disseminated elements may be incorporated into people's culture, enhancing identities and belongingness and fulfilling other uses. In Cornwall, for instance, this happens with elements from tourism, such as Cornish ice-cream and surfing. Both have been woven into everyday culture as a source of identification and pleasure because commodification led to people being exposed to them. This allows us to keep sight of the

---

[275] Wujin Yu (2006), op. cit., p.116. (Marx' dialectical materialism is only concerned with the material in so far as it plays a part in human relations and activities.)
[276] Arjun Appadurhi, op. cit.

possibility that commodified aspects of culture need not necessarily be stripped of their primary uses when they are commercialized.

In the following discussion, 'capital' is used in a variety of ways but we may foreground them by noting that early uses of the word in English[277] refer to merchants' stock and goods gained through marriage. In other words, capital has been understood as inseparable from ownership. Marx describes monetary wealth, merchants' capital and usurers' capital as having developed in the sixteenth century from 'world trade and the world market'[278] and although he did not give a potted definition, we may gather that he understands capital as value that is increased by a surplus-value, allowing profit to be made.[279] When it comes to thinking about how cultural commodification achieves profit, this is an underlying principle.

Sociologists and economists have extended the concept of capital in a number of ways. Of these, the most influential in regeneration discourses is without doubt 'human capital', a common notion from capitalist economics and vocational education which emphasizes the skills and knowledge available to business and industry. It considers what the people who make up a given population can do and how to enhance their ability so as to provide economic potential. Attention to the role of knowledge as a resource in the 'knowledge economy' or 'new economy' is but a recent manifestation of this which reflects changes in the nature of economic activity (the decline of primary production and heavy industry, the expansion of services and information technology etc.). Considering culture as a component of this knowledge remains within the logic of capital. As Coleman puts it:

---

[277] Latin *capitalis,* from c*aput* 'head', via French.

[278] Karl Marx, op. cit., p. 247.

[279] Karl Marx, op. cit., p. 247-251. In Marx' 'circuit of capital', M-C-M, the capitalist advances money (M) to buy commodities (C) and sells them again to realize a surplus-value, giving, M-C-M' where M' = M + m (profit). Money facilitates the exchange.

> Probably the most important and most original development in the economics of education in the past 30 years has been the idea that the concept of physical capital as embodied in tools, machines, and other productive equipment can be extended to include human capital as well.[280]

In this unambiguous wording, people are part of the economy's equipment, a perspective that connects with considering labour as a factor of production in neo-classical economics. It emphasizes the capacities of populations as an aspect of the availability of labour, often extending this to qualitative considerations such as attitudes or socio-cultural characteristics (conscientiousness, ambition, reliability, versatility etc.), rather than just measurable or qualification-based components. Whilst attention to people's work capacities is part of the common-sense 'real world' where production and job creation is the currently-available route to material comfort, it does not, on its own, take account of a range of human needs. Reductionist visions of human capital may even invert development priorities so that the economy, as something of an abstract idea, becomes the goal rather than the means to well-being. In public discussion, variations of 'the economy needs skilled workers' somehow make the human needs of the population secondary to the impersonal requirements of financial capital, and however sound the economic reasoning might be for this, the means do often seem to become the end. Some discussions even imply that those people who are available are not suited to the needs of the economy and that better ones are needed, perhaps from somewhere else. This is a bit like teachers complaining that their students are not good enough, instead of recognizing their specific learning needs and addressing them. Its inverted emphasis privileges capital's need for labour, rather than people's dependence on jobs and income as a means to meet their needs.

---

[280] James Coleman (1988), op. cit., p.100.

This has particular resonance in Cornwall because of a special set of institutional attitudes to human capital that has characterized discourses about the economy since at least the 1970s.[281] These are rooted in portrayals that stem from tourism and Cornwall's long history as a supposedly *remote* setting for romantic fictions and an *accessible* leisure area (an apparent contradiction). Despite Cornwall's long industrial experience and international connections, these present it as being far from modernity and industry and create corresponding expectations about its people as rustic, backward and insular. Established fictions connect with escapist and romantic images of which people are fond, making them hard to shake. In short, the realities of human capital are less influential in shaping what people believe or wish to be so as a result of exposure to discourses within representation. Consequently economic strategies and promotion since the 1980s has made frequent references to 'dynamic in-migrants' but almost none to dynamic and qualified people from Cornwall itself.[282] In the 1980s and 90s this prejudicial emphasis was compounded by informing would-be investors that wages were low and portraying Cornish workers as 'honest, reliable and productive' and not given to 'absenteeism' and 'industrial unrest',[283] - an overall image of honest country folk who were dependent workers but not decision-makers, innovators, entrepreneurs, managers, scientists and intellectuals. Things have improved with initiatives such as the graduate programme, 'Unlocking Cornish Potential' but these enduring discourses resurface in economic approaches which assume the desirability of attracting qualified people from outside, rather than initiatives based upon meeting local needs or building upon existing strengths. This informs attempts to attract external businesses with unsubstantiated claims about the nature of in-migration as a source of new human capital:

---

[281] For criticisms see, J. Willet (2009), op. cit.

[282] cf. B. Deacon, A. George and R. Perry (1987), *Cornwall at the Crossroads,* op. cit., pp. 29-30 and pp. 67-8.

[283] ibid. Cornwall County Council leaflet (1986) cited on p.29.

Over the past few years Cornwall has seen significant inward migration, particularly of young, innovative and highly skilled people.[284]

It is consequently hard to view some promotional work as having anything very much to do with addressing the needs of local communities at all and the prevailing discursive formations that inform them illustrate links between representations of the Cornish, their collective status and their access to jobs and housing. This has been a criticism of broadly functionalist applications of human capital theory which, for example, put gender-based or racial inequalities down to human capital without considering other influences, and it is a reminder that economic and social deprivation involves past as well as present factors. Human capital is often understood simplistically as being limited to obvious work-based skills and corresponding qualifications but relationships and behaviours are involved as well.[285] We may therefore extend our understanding of human capital to non-economic domains, where its components of knowledge, skills, feelings and behaviours might help communities build relationships and knowledge-based initiatives and networks. That brings us on to direct consideration of social capital and the part played by culture in its generation. Amongst Putnam's definitions of social capital are the following:

...features of social life - networks, norms, trust - that enable people to act together more effectively to pursue shared objectives.[286]

...connections among individuals - social networks and the norms of reciprocity and trustworthiness that arise from them.[287]

The constitutive norms of social capital are acted out within culture and

[284] http://www.investincornwall.com/living-in-cornwall/ (Accessed, 20th April 2012)

[285] Marx was also more concerned with social practice (*praxis*) and human relations than economics as such.

[286] Robert D. Putnam (1995), 'Tuning in, tuning out: the strange disappearance of social capital in America', *Political Science and Politics*, 28, pp. 664-83.

[287] Robert D. Putnam (2000), *Bowling Alone: The Collapse and Revival of American Community*, Simon and Shuster, New York, p. 19.

are linked to such components as beliefs and attitudes, imagination and both tacit and explicit knowledge. Putnam's view is that social capital is useful, not only for individuals but for society as a whole. It may establish behavioural norms such as honesty, trust, helpfulness and friendliness that rely upon mutual obligation and the need people have to be respected and accepted members of their societies and to be credible in their multiple roles. What this means for us is that social capital is closely interconnected with the primary uses of culture and well-being and also has something to do with capacity in areas that are important for the economy. There are various slants on this. Notably, Coleman[288] concentrates on the role of social capital in creating human capital and aims, 'to import the economists' principle of rational action for use in the analysis of social systems'.[289] An emphasis on rational actors still dominates economics, despite criticisms that it cannot always explain human behaviour. Coleman largely sticks with this, proposing, 'a theory of rational action in which each actor has control over certain resources and interests' [so that] 'social capital constitutes a particular kind of resource available to an actor.'[290]

This definition of social capital involves social structures and facilitates some actions by 'persons or corporate actors – within the structure'[291] so that it works productively to make ends possible. That means it is defined by function, becoming capital when it has exchange-value. Putnam develops complementary ideas, suggesting that societies with lots of social capital produce kinds of 'generalized reciprocity'[292] whereby useful behaviours become socially-produced norms, regardless of conscious personal interest. This sounds like, 'Do unto others as you would have them do unto you.',[293] but involves the promise of exchange in that people have the expectation that others will do things for them.

---

[288]James Coleman (1988), op. cit.
[289] James Coleman (1988), op. cit. p.97.
[290] James Coleman (1988), op. cit. p.98.
[291] ibid
[292] Robert D. Putnam (2000), op. cit. p. 21.
[293] The common paraphrase of Matthew 7:12.

Efficiency is produced by not having to 'balance exchanges instantly'.[294] Social capital thus spreads out unpredictably to increase well-being in the community, rather than working as a simple equation of individual investment and return. In Coleman's account, though, favours and gifts create obligation in the form of virtual 'credit slips', calling to mind the saying, 'One good turn deserves another' but offering a view that reduces generous and charitable acts such as helping a neighbour to self-interest. Coleman attributes the 'norm that one should forgo self-interest and act in the interests of the collectivity' to the family context or special, local circumstances, such as building 'young nations' or 'nascent social movements'[295] and even suggests that, 'Voluntary organizations are brought into being to aid some purpose of those who initiate them.'[296] Special circumstances of this kind could apply to the Cornish Movement and indigenous Cornish society as a whole, but Coleman's dismissal of the unselfish motives people might have for helping others is in any case questionable. He writes from a perspective he calls 'methodological individualism'[297] where a hard-headed emphasis on human capital and self-interest is expected, even (or perhaps especially) when it comes to proposals for shaping the next generation through education. He discusses this in relation to the family, the community and the school, yet allows that, 'the actor or actors who generate social capital ordinarily capture only a small part of its benefits, a fact that leads to underinvestment in social capital.'[298]

Culture becomes useful in this broad rationale when it contributes to the structure within which social capital works. In effect, belongingness (as a human need) may be essential to that structure and Coleman describes cases where actions are made possible by intra-group relationships and norms of behaviour and practice within communities create specific kinds of social capital. For example, the New York

---

[294] Robert D. Putnam (2000), p. 21.
[295] James Coleman (1988), op. cit., pp. 104-105.
[296] James Coleman (1988), p.108.
[297] James Coleman (1988), p.109.
[298] James Coleman (1988), p.119.

diamond market is founded on trustworthiness and generated by close ties within Brooklyn's Jewish community and shop owners in a Cairo market maximize their collective business by offering the services of friends and family through word-of-mouth networking.[299] Thus, although Coleman focuses on the interests of individual 'actors', there are also advantages for groups.[300] Social capital exists in relationships between people and although it may be presented as 'a resource for persons',[301] Coleman recognizes that organizations may be 'corporate actors', providing a principal that we can extended further to cohesive groups within society. Different kinds of community are distinguished, those where, 'people are always doing things for each other' and those where, 'individuals are more self-sufficient and depend on each other less'.[302] Essentially Coleman is talking about neighbourliness even if his language of social commerce turns this into a question of exchange where some communities have 'fewer...credit slips outstanding at any time'.[303]

Communities with better developed social networks may have a greater level of well-being as a consequence and just as social interactions may increase or diminish economic capacity through human capital, so they may be vital for the ability of communities to fulfil non-economic and non-material human needs. For instance, the 'social networks and the norms of reciprocity and trustworthiness'[304] that Putnam associates with social capital are needed for communities to perform a multitude of social functions and the simple experience of living in communities where these norms are evident is likely to be conducive to beneficial feelings in the area of esteem and thus to resilience and well-being. In effect, some of the same features may enable communities to perform both economic and social activities. An economic example is the success

---

[299] James Coleman (1988), p.100.
[300] Coleman's term 'actor' reflects his focus on 'rational', self-interested actions.
[301] James Coleman, (1988), p. 98.
[302] James Coleman (1988), op. cit., p.102.
[303] ibid.
[304] Robert D. Putnam (2000), p.19.

of the major co-operative company Mondragon[305] which has been partially attributed to strong, culturally-produced egalitarian attitudes in the Basque Country. These are said to enhance human capital by facilitating collaborative working practices and they also contribute independently to social and cultural projects and reduce social divisions. Basque solidarity, founded on cultural identity, may simultaneously increase belongingness and the collective motivation to succeed, contributing to human capital. This resonates with Cornwall's own egalitarian tradition and identity, and the idea that there are linkages between culture, social capital and capacity may be extended much further. In particular, strengthening community bonds, enhancing belongingness and fostering a positive sense of collective identity may produce both economic and non-economic outcomes. There are countless examples in European regions. The Auray district of Brittany has a cluster of successful, highly specialized plastic moulding companies whose location, far from customers or related industries probably defies some kind of economic sense. One unquantifiable factor, however, is the non-financial motivation of culture and identity. Some managers speak of their desire to create jobs in Brittany and insist that participating in Breton life is more important than pursuing a career elsewhere.[306] It also turns out that this commitment and identity is reinforced by personal networks that extend far beyond work to include family, community and leisure pursuits.

The role of culture in social capital might be said to make it a commodity[307] in the alternative and slightly archaic sense of the word where it refers to convenience and facility, often with applications to qualities like courtesy and thoughtfulness. These could be said to be cultural-generated, cost-free elements of happy, socially-cohesive communities, recalling the popular wisdom, 'politeness doesn't cost

---

[305] http://www.bbc.co.uk/news/world-europe-19213425 (Accessed 16th August 2012.)

[306] Comments by managers and engineers at *Culture Cours* in Auray (2010) and with the director, Chantal Mallet.

[307] Latin *commoditas,* via French *commodité.*

anything.' Coleman and Putnam both choose trustworthiness for discussion, - a quality that links trust with worth (i.e. value) in a single word. This is said to 'lubricate social life'[308] as an enabling characteristic, - an awareness that begins to shift attention from the 'rational actor' as an individualist to the collective community and its capacity. Thus 'a group within which there is extensive trustworthiness and extensive trust is able to accomplish much more than a comparable group without that trustworthiness and trust.'[309]

Unsurprisingly, social capital has interested a broad span of people (economists, sociologists, cultural analysts, health researchers) and has come to mean different things. Even though it was implicitly rejected in Margaret Thatcher's infamous 'There's no such thing as society', it is now a foundation for discussions of the Big Society and 'civic engagement'. Its economic role has been accepted at the head of global capitalism, by the World Bank[310] and neo-classical economists and it is a framework for analyzing the usefulness of social relations and their bearing on economic outcomes, even within U.S. 'political economics'. The diverse uses share an awareness of relationships and community networking in establishing behaviours that impact economically and socially and Coleman cites Granovetter's ideas of 'embeddedness' in relation to how these become social norms and produce parallel social structures that have, 'an independent effect on the functioning of economic systems'.[311]

To recap, cultural practices and attitudes are part of what makes societies work or malfunction and contribute through social capital to well-being, generating a sense of community, place and fulfilment. The

---

[308] Robert D. Putnam (2000), op. cit., p. 21.
[309] James Coleman (1988), op. cit., p.101.
[310] E.g. (Accessed 5th November 2012.):
http://web.worldbank.org/WBSITE/EXTERNAL/TOPICS/EXTSOCIALDEVELOPMENT/EXT
TSOCIALCAPITAL/0,,contentMDK:20193059~menuPK:418220~pagePK:148956~piPK:21661
8~theSitePK:401015,00.html
[311] James Coleman (1988), op. cit. pp.97-98.

linked ideas of friendship, camaraderie, imagined kinship, neighbourliness, belonging, solidarity and so on, accord with social capital and collective action, social engagement and initiative. Mutual aid, reciprocity, obligation, trust and word-of-mouth information-sharing are all related norms that favour certain expectations and behaviours, potentially enabling people in less affluent communities to live pleasant, satisfying lives despite economic hardship. It has, for example, been suggested that Cornwall's housing problems might have been mitigated by friendship and kinship networks, reducing homelessness.[312] Research on a European scale has even indicated that Cornwall has a high occurrence of an underlying, historic family structure that favours several generations living under one roof and collaborating and has speculated that this might have a Celtic origin.[313] If substantiated, this might be expected to favour social capital.

Discussion of norms recalls Foucault's accounts of (self)surveillance and anarchist emphasis on spontaneously-produced order.[314] Coleman discusses how, 'Effective norms that inhibit crime make it possible to walk freely outside at night in a city and enable old persons to leave their houses without fear for safety.'[315] Such norms, accompanied by social sanctions for non-compliance 'constitute a powerful form of social capital' which 'facilitates certain actions' but 'constrains others',[316] the downside being that norms which help some people may harm others. To illustrate this, Coleman cites educational expectations in the U.S.A. that facilitate school activity but divert good footballers from study, his point being that norms sometimes hinder and this may not be clear-cut because: 'Effective norms in an area can reduce innovativeness in

---

[312] Mary Buck, Malcolm Williams and Lyn Bryant, 'Housing the Cornish: Containing the Crisis', in P.J.Payton (ed.), Cornish Studies, no. 1, pp.97-108.
[313] Gilles Duranton, Andrés Rodríguez-Pose and Richard Sandall, 'Family Types and the Persistence of Regional Disparities in Europe', in *Economic Geography*, vol. 85, issue 1, (January 2009) pp. 23-14.
[314] Michel Foucault, (1991 [1975]), *Discipline and Punish: The Birth of the Prison*, Penguin Harmondsworth.
[315] James Coleman (1988), p.104.
[316] James Coleman (1988), p.105.

another area...'.[317] Normative expectations discourage the transgressions that sometimes bring benefits, in other words, and once established they may exclude non-compliance or pigeon-hole people, reducing their opportunities and marking status.

The above arguments all rely upon collectivities and social capital may be thought of as held by groups, rather than residing in individuals. Over-attention to individual advantage loses sight of the group, yet capital of any form only functions because of where it places people within multiple collectivities and hierarchies. Approaches to the diffusion of effects in society and to relationships and social action compensate. Coleman contrasts 'two broad intellectual streams', one that 'sees the actor as socialized and action as governed by social norms, rules, and obligations',[318] and another that 'sees the actor as having goals independently arrived at, as acting independently, and as wholly self-interested.'[319] He identifies the former stream with 'most sociologists' and the later with 'most economists' but there is a political, philosophical division in this dichotomy (a variation of the opposition between 'social determinism' and free will or agency), the former being more amenable to consideration of the common good and the second with selfishness.

Coleman suggests that self-interest provides 'a principle of action, that of maximizing utility'[320] and that the 'sociological stream' has no 'engine of action'[321] so that people are seen as shaped by the social environment, without purpose or direction, yet he criticizes economists for ignoring the 'empirical reality' that, 'persons' actions are shaped, redirected, constrained by the social context' [where] 'norms, interpersonal trust, social networks, and social organization are important in the functioning not only of the society but also of the

---

[317] ibid.
[318] James Coleman (1988), p.95.
[319] ibid.
[320] ibid.
[321] James Coleman (1988), p.96.

economy.'[322] This is where the cultural underpinning has economic potential but it is also an exit where we can get away from self-interest and bring in worthwhile, collective interests and relationships that need not involve exchange. People's awareness of belonging to a cultural group as an 'imagined community'[323] may motivate them to pursue its interests, whilst culture itself supports the relationships that constitute functioning communities and produce a sense of social cohesion.

To move further towards a social focus, we may to turn to Bourdieu and his analysis of how power is exercised, not through wealth alone, but through the exterior signs of status which may not equate neatly. Privilege is supported by verbal and visual discourses that allow members of the dominant group to 'impose' their status through, 'signes de richesse, destinés à être crus ou obéis.'[324] Thus Bourdieu does not imagine a simple class structure based on wealth or even occupation but outlines complex, multiple relationships where an individual's place and status is produced by many variables. The concept of capital is further extended from the traditional sense (linked to wealth) to include a range of personal resources, including cultural attributes and knowledge which influence social status. Coleman has neo-liberal presumptions whereas Bourdieu comes from a post-Marxist tradition, yet despite being couched differently their analyses broadly agree. Bourdieu emphasises the connected role of 'cultural capital' with which his name is synonymous and thus goes beyond the economic concerns of traditional Marxist perspectives, to consider how culture affects social status and life chances. He identifies four forms of capital:

• **economic capital** – in the common material sense of money, wealth, property, land, income and so on.

• **cultural capital** – knowledge and skills, notably acquired in early

---

[322] ibid.

[323] Benedict Anderson (1991), op. cit.

[324] Pierre Bourdieu (1982), *Ce que parler veut dire – L'économie des échanges linguistique*s, Editions Fayard.

socialization or education and traditionally signified by formal educational qualifications.

• **social capital** – resources that individuals get from social networks and contacts, i.e. relationships, which are important in exercising power.

• **symbolic capital** – capital that is represented, and/or understood symbolically, in knowledge-based relationships.[325]

Each form may be converted into one of the others, so that for example, cultural capital may lead to economic capital when it helps somebody get a well-paid job and social capital may provide the contacts and credibility needed for economic opportunities. Similarly, money may give access to education and circles where economically useful social capital is acquired. These conversions are not automatic or required, though and each form of capital may be involved in 'social struggles' independently of the others.[326]

Bourdieu's 'cultural capital' considers how in capitalist societies (and France in particular) differences of cultural practices, values, tastes, cultural knowledge and competence are involved in socio-economic inequalities and he emphasizes the means of access to cultural capital in an apparent parallel to Marxist attention to the 'means of production'.[327] Thus the elements of cultural capital have rarity value, - an echo of Marx's linkage between scarcity and value.[328] Whether acquired through upbringing and milieu or actively sought, it is linked to educational access:

> [T]ous les agents n'ont pas les moyens de prolonger les études de leurs

---

[325] Pierre Bourdieu, 'Les 3 états du capital culturel', in *Actes de la recherch en sciences sociales*, vol. 30, (November 1979), L'Institution Scolaire, pp. 3-6.
[326] cf. Mike Crang and Nigel Thrift (2000), *Thinking Space*, London: Routledge, p. 244.
[327] Karl Marx, op. cit., p. 983.
[328] Pierre Bourdieu (1979), *La Distinction, Critique sociale du jugement*, Le Sens Commun (coll.), Paris: Minuit, p.4.

enfants au-délà du minimum nécessaire à la reproduction de la force de travail la moins valorisée à un moment donné.[329]

Cultural capital was conceived as a hypothesis to explain inequalities in school performance through a broad analysis of society,[330] so it may help address economic and socio-cultural inequalities in Cornwall. It entails unequal distribution of the means to acquire cultural assets, physically through the body, materially as artefacts and products, educationally as knowledge and symbolically as legitimacy. Bourdieu questions the common-sense view that academic success and subsequent economic achievement are direct effects of natural ability and cites the unequal distribution of economic, social and cultural means. Status depends upon the acknowledged currency of cultural attributes which give individuals value and legitimacy. This includes cultural knowledge that signals membership of the dominant class and Bourdieu illustrates this with classical music and the academic canon (to which he has been added).[331] Cultural capital exists when knowledge is revealed by the display of cultural goods and the performance of cultural acts and acquisition requires access (through wealth) to the means. Thus (in an apparent relationship to Marx's 'labour time') it is hard to get by just buying social goods and acquisition involves work, time and money where 'the transformation of economic capital into cultural capital presupposes an expenditure of time that is made possible by economic capital.'[332]

Cultural capital becomes part of who someone *is*, not just what they have and its transfer is complex. Bourdieu considers it to exist in three

---

[329] Pierre Bourdieu (1979), 'Les trois états du capital culturel', op. cit. p. 3; 'Agent' is Bourdieu's favoured term.

[330] ibid.

[331] Pierre Bourdieu (1984,1988), *Homo Academicus*, trans. Peter Collier, Cambridge: Polity Press; Bourdieu (1979), *La Distinction,* op. cit.

[332] Pierre Bourdieu (1979), 'Les 3 états du capital culturel', op. cit., p.3 and 5. Translation, N. Kennedy.

forms or states,[333] the first of which is the 'embodied state' of 'lasting dispositions of mind and body'. This involves lasting ways of moving, behaving and presenting and constructing the body which interact with feelings. It can also be related to the discourses surrounding group identities that produce 'mythologies' in the sense employed by Barthes.[334]

> 'L'hexis corporel est la mythologie politique réalisée, incorporée, devenue disposition permanente, manière durable de se tenir, de parler, de marcher, et, par là, de sentir et de penser.'[335]

Much of cultural capital is thus embodied and is a visual means by which group membership may be supposed:

> 'La plupart des propriétés du capital culturel peuvent se déduire du fait que [...] il est lié au corps et suppose l'incorporation.' [336]

Some*body's* social place is inscribed in and on the body, - 'incorporated' or made flesh, so that body language, shape, size, weight, gestures, stance, bearing and complexion all connote status. Most people will be familiar with how one person may 'look like a builder' and another 'look posh' even when identically dressed. Although this looks natural, innate and hereditary, it is acquired through experience of the 'right kind' of activities and once embodied, it is hard to strip away, whatever the fortunes of the bearer. Life experiences are ingrained in the body as 'lasting attitudes' which may be as simple as a way of walking, having a relaxed or stiff demeanour, or smiling, sitting or eating in a particular way.[337] Embodied cultural capital demands physical and time

---

[333] Pierre Bourdieu, *Les 3 états du capital culturel*, 1979.
[334] Roland Barthes (1982 [1957]), *Mythologies*, Paris: Le Seuil, pp.199-210.
[335] Pierre Bourdieu (1980), *Le sens pratique,* (coll.) *Le sens commun*, Editions de Minuit, Paris, p. 117.
[336] Pierre Bourdieu (1979), 'Les 3 états du capital culturel', op. cit., p.3: 'Most properties of cultural capital may result from the fact that it is linked to the body and supposes embodiment', Translation, N. Kennedy.
[337] See Mike Featherstone, (1995), *Undoing Culture: Globalization, Postmodernism and Identity*, London and Newbury Park, California: Sage, pp. 22-23.

investment or 'work on oneself'[338] as self-improvement within norms so that, 'Celui qui le possède a « payé de sa personne », et de ce qu'il a de plus personnel, son temps.'[339]

The second form of Bourdieu's cultural capital is the 'objectified state'[340] where cultural goods, such as paintings, books, dictionaries, musical instruments, machines (his examples), are defined by relationships with legitimate knowledge and culture. These are the props (supports matériels) of cultural capital and relate to economic capital and exchange-value so that there is, 'une appropriation matérielle, qui suppose le capital économique, et d'une appropriation symbolique, qui suppose le capital culturel'.[341]

The third form of Bourdieu's cultural capital is the 'institutionalized state'. Academic qualifications, for example, confer and presume to guarantee it, holding an exchange-value like coins which is institutionally sanctioned and underwritten, showing the relationship between cultural and economic capital.[342] Cultural and social capital give people varying social weight or currency as a kind of credibility (in the popular sense of 'cred') which influences how seriously they are taken in particular contexts and this involves personal networks, mutual recognition, useful bonds and relationships (friendships, acquaintances, work contacts and obligations).[343] These require (unconscious or conscious) social investment[344] including participation in cultural practices that bring people with shared economic and social

---

[338] Pierre Bourdieu (1979), 'Les 3 états du capital culturel', op. cit., abstract, translated. N. Kennedy.
[339] Pierre Bourdieu (1979), 'Les 3 états du capital culturel', p.4.
[340] Pierre Bourdieu (1979), 'Les 3 états du capital culturel', p.5.
[341] ibid. 'a material appropriation which assumes economic capital and of a symbolic appropriation which assumes cultural capital', trans. N. Kennedy.
[342] http://www.persee.fr/web/revues/home/prescript/article/arss_0335-5322_1979_num_30_1_2654?_Prescripts_Search_tabs1=standard& (Accessed 7th April 2010.)
[343] Alain Accardo and Phillipe Corcuff (1989), *La Sociologie de Bourdieu*, Bordeaux: Le Mascaret, p.94.
[344] cf. Stéphane Chevallier and Christine Chauvre (2010), op. cit. p.19.

interests together, reinforce group membership and favour or disfavour the acquisition of capital in all forms.

'Symbolic capital' works by alterity and has been related to Hegel's master/slave dialectic.[345] As in Emmanuel Levinas' discussions of 'radical alterity', each component of symbolic capital depends upon differing from a specific Other[346] so that status is signified by visible or audible 'distinction'. This is Bourdieu's term for attributes that mark social differences and contribute to the phenomenon of *habitus* which is explored and related to Cornish ethnicity in the next chapter. For now, it is enough to understand habitus as a social construction within which members broadly share identifying attitudes and dispositions which connote status and without which symbolic capital has no currency, and to appreciate that all forms of capital may work symbolically:

> Toute espèce de capital (économique, culturel, social) tend (à des dégrés differents) à fonctionner comme capital symbolique (en sorte qu'il vaudrait peut-être mieux parler, en toute rigeur, d'effets symboliques du capital).[347]

Intervention for One and All.[348]

Symbolic capital only exists whilst others recognize and accept the currency of arbitrary markers which have no independent existence, so it is contestable and open to re-evaluation:

---

[345] cf. Chevallier and Chauviré, op. cit. Hegel's master creates the slave's identity but needs the slave's recognition in order to be master.

[346] cf. John Lechte (1994), op. cit. pp.115-119.

[347] Pierre Bourdieu (1997), *'Méditations pascaliennes',* coll. Liber, Paris: Editions du Seuil, p.285; cf. Bridget Fowler (1997), *Pierre Bourdieu and Cultural Theory - Critical Investigations*, Sage: London, p.20.

[348] 'One and All' is the Cornish motto.

> '[I]l n'existe en effet que dans et par l'estime, la reconnaissance, la croyance, le crédit, la confiance des autres, et il ne peut se perpétuer qu'aussi longtemps qu'il parvient à obtenir la croyance en son existence'.[349]

The notion of 'distinction' underpins binary oppositions in multiple representations of Cornish identities and relies upon binary logic which may be challenged. In this respect culture is part of the weaponry of social contestation and may be used to assert collective status.[350] Taking all of the above forms of capital together, there could are two broad areas that cultural intervention might address, i.e. social capital, with its implications for capacity, and cultural and symbolic capital with its relationships to status and self-worth. These are connected but we can consider them in turn.

The perceived decline of social capital[351] in developed societies produces public concern, such as complaints about inconsiderate behaviour, the isolation experienced when neighbours do not speak to each other and the difficulty of getting people involved in community activities. In France, where there have been moral panics about the elderly dying alone and 'non-assistance to persons in danger' (a crime in France), it underlies debates on the 'republican values' of solidarity and social cohesion and in Britain its enhancement is an objective of the Big Society. In Cornwall, whilst in-migrants, especially, cite high levels of social capital, it is also common for older natives to associate a perceived decline in friendliness and solidarity to the 'new circumstances' of weakened and displaced communities and this has been a recurrent conversational refrain during this inquiry.

---

[349] Pierre Bourdieu, (1997), *'Méditations pascaliennes'*, coll. Liber, Paris: Editions du Seuil, p. 200.
[350] ibid. 'engagé comme arme et comme enjeu dans les luttes dont les champs de production culturelle...'
[351] Robert D. Putnam, 'Tuning in, tuning out: the strange disappearance of social capital in America', *Political Science and Politics*, no. 28, (1995), pp. 664-83.

I don't know a living sole here I can ask to fetch me home a bit of
shopping.

People we got here now living would soon as knock you down as
look at you. Nobody speaks! Years ago we looked after each other
and you never had to worry.[352]

Yet, decline is not irreversible and we can envisage projects to 'restore
communities'.[353] An underlying theme here is therefore to speculate
about how 'useable culture' might nurture the ingredients of social
capital and produce better outcomes for communities and this is not
unconnected to trying to boost cultural and symbolic capital by
challenging harmful representations. Interdependencies and mutual
benefits need not extend to everyone so it is important to aim for
inclusiveness and 'take sides' even if it proves difficult. Putnam
discusses 'bridging social capital'[354] whereby networks 'link substantial
sectors of the community and span underlying social cleavages'[355] and
this may combine with the 'bonding social capital' or 'sociological
superglue'[356] of groups, reaching across fractions in society to unify
them as a cohesive community.

As suggested in relation to civic identity, we can envisage using Cornish
cultures to this end, spreading bonding and bridging functions across
class, gender, ethno-cultural and generational boundaries at the same
time as promoting Cornishness. Thus networks that already exist in
parts of the community might be nurtured and extended and new ones
developed around cultural activity. Social capital itself may be mobilized

---

[352] Typical remarks by elderly locals at the Prince of Wales Pier, Falmouth, 14th August
2011.
[353] R. Putnam and L. Fieldstein (2003), *Better Together: Restoring the American
Community*, Simon and Shuster: New York.
[354] Robert Putnam (2000), p. 23.
[355] Robert Putnam (1995)
[356] Robert Putnam (2000), p. 23.

in 'moving from individual protest to organized revolt'[357] and the Cornish Movement's collaborative contestations both require it and contribute to it in the form of networks and solidarity. A cursory reading of Bourdieu gives an impression of determinism[358] but in fact he highlights dangers in ignoring the scope for change and recognizes that rules may be broken. He discusses 'subversion' as requiring a, 'denunciation of [a] tacit subscription contract which defined the original doxa'. It thus 'presupposes a cognitive subversion, a conversion of world view.'[359] Symbolic and cultural capital is arbitrary and unstable so the status of cultures and groups can be re-negotiated. This points to spontaneity and creative anarchy as well as determined intervention and Bourdieu's perspectives have been fruitfully extended to studies of contestation in situations involving class, gender and ethnicity.

Flux and instability is a theme in Derek Wynne's work on social mobility and the 'new middle class' in Cheshire. This describes how undermining traditional hierarchies involves forms of capital in active struggles whereby social classes form their own distinguishing cultures and achieve legitimacy of their own. Wynne argues that this can change what is considered legitimate[360] and this is one of the things that parts of the Cornish Movement attempt by asserting the worth and geographically rooted legitimacy of Cornishness as 'indigenous' culture with worthwhile content. Still in North-West England, Beverley Skeggs[361] has applied ideas of cultural capital to women's attitudes to class, taste and constructions of femininity, - considering their identifications and dis-identifications with being working-class. Once more, this understands that cultural attributes, as arbitrary 'distinctions', operate within unstable hierarchies that can change.

---

[357] James Coleman, op. cit. p.101.
[358] cf. Richard Jenkins (1992), *Pierre Bourdieu*, London: Routledge.
[359] Pierre Bourdieu, (1982, 2001), *Langue et Pouvoir*, op. cit., pp.187-198, trans. N. Kennedy.
[360] Derek Wynne (1998), *Leisure, Lifestyle and the New Middle Class*, London: Routledge.
[361] Beverley Skeggs (1997), *Formations of Class and Gender*, London: Sage.

The idea of collectively-held capital is a long way from emphasis on individual acquisition of legitimate culture as a personal route to success within established hierarchies. Collective interventions that combine culture with affirmation challenge the structure and valorize cultures and groups, and there are enough high-profile examples to show that it is possible, - from feminisms, to gay rights and from anti-colonialisms to the 'black is beautiful' campaigns of 1960s America. In such cases culture is, 'the means by and through which various subordinate groups live and resist their subordination' [and] 'the terrain on which hegemony is struggled for and established.'[362]

Wynne's account suggests the generation of an alternative order of cultural and symbolic capital that is asserted by insiders, much like as happens within subcultures, sometimes coming to be accepted more widely. People make meaning as agents or actors (Bourdieu and Coleman's terms respectively) and may do so collectively to assert cultural capital within a contestable and unstable field of representation. This is, after all, what advertisers and publicists do all the time, often with demonstrable results. Post-structuralist semiotics views signs, such as Bourdieu's 'distinctions', as infinitely polysemous and consider how the 'order of signification'[363] may be subverted. People can use cultural signs and signifiers to change how they represent themselves and try to anchor 'preferred readings' of representations. This will be returned to so for the moment we can note that challenges require 'oppositional readings'[364] of intended or established meanings and that this involves 'heretical discourses' and the proposition seems far less unrealistic, 'if one knows the degree to which one may modify

---

[362] Tim O'Sullivan, J.Hartley, D.Saunders, M.Montomery, J.Fiske (1994), *Key Concepts in Communication and Cultural Studies*, 2nd Edition, London: Routledge, p.71.
[363] Roland Barthes (1982 [1957]), *Mythologies*, op. cit.
[364] See, Stuart Hall ([1973] 1980), 'Encoding/decoding', in Centre for Contemporary Cultural Studies (ed.), *Culture, Media, Language: Working Papers in Cultural Studies,* 1972-79, London: Hutchinson, pp. 128-38.

social reality by modifying the representation that agents make of it'.[365]

<u>Cornish myths and legends.</u>

One of the missing elements of Cornish resilience is an aspirational vision of society, rooted in community narratives of the kind I observed (amongst elites at least) in Brittany and Galicia. Essentially, this is about the cultural views that people have of their communities, place and the world in general and the involvement of cultural signifiers might be thought of in terms of Roland Barthes' 'mythology'. In Barthes' 'second order of signification', signs carry cultural meanings or 'myths' and operate through connotations and readings that depend upon context. These may come together in a 'third order of signification' where they are organized and interpreted as mythology and/or ideology. This presents two challenges: identifying useful myths and developing strategies to support them. Mythologies cannot be imposed but need to connect with existing myths in order to interpellate people, which is essentially why, in their absence quasi-governmental 'agencies' fail to mobilize identity. They are notable for lacking appeals to Cornish identity and even for reluctance to use the adjective 'Cornish' and ultimately their bureaucratic business-speak does not resonate with feeling or community aspiration.

Culture itself may be seen as being composed of networks of socially constructed realities as imaginings and practices, and according to the proposition/pro-position of this thesis, 'useable culture' may accompany 'useable histories' to convey useful mythologies through narrative discourse. Narratives may also be harmful, of course and some Cornish and 'Celtic' discourses (discussed in Chapter 5) partially

---

[365] Pierre Bourdieu, (1982, 2001) *Langage et Pouvoir Symbolique*, Editions Fayard et Editions de Seuil, p.188, translated, N. Kennedy.

accept and inadvertently reproduce ascribed representations, turning them into imaginings of identity that influence expectations and (in)actions. Some even support harmful presumptions about Cornish people of the kind that were earlier attributed to outside decision-makers who undervalue human capital. For example, the idea that 'Celtic temperament' prevents people from working collaboratively is willingly taken up and becomes an excuse for disorganization and failure. Sometimes the same ascribed characteristics are cited as both negative and positive. Being 'laid back' for instance and having a supposedly 'slower pace of life' is presented either as an agreeable aspect of life or as a symptom of being un-dynamic. For critics it is also a fiction projected onto the Cornish by in-migrants but it is so pervasive that DEMOS echo it in a claim that, 'Cornwall operates on a different time signature to the rest of the United Kingdom' and seeing this as an asset. Not wishing to confuse, 'time signature' (rhythms, cycles etc.) with 'time discipline', there is nevertheless a suggestion of a 'slower pace of life' in DEMOS' wording that recalls the received expectations that accompany tourism and counter-urbanization.[366]

If intervention is to be attempted collectively to promote an aspirational 'vision' (by Cornwall Council or through oppositional groups, for example), specifically Cornish knowledge needs to inform reflection to identify useable components which are actually available and feasible. Conflicts are likely because norms that serve one interest might have negative consequences for others and choices are limited by cultural realities so there is little to achieve by fostering unrealistic myths that are completely unfounded either in material reality or existing narratives. They would probably be doomed to failure as unbelievable but a possibility, nevertheless, is that myths do not need a 'real', factual or proven existence in order to play a role. Wrecking and piracy, for example, are prominent in tourism's representations of Cornwall despite having little, if any, grounding in history. Narratives about the

---

[366] C. Tims and S. Wright, DEMOS Report (2006), op. cit. note 34.

characteristics of communities only have to be credible and appealing in order to catch on and may influence people's ideas about their communities and cultures, how they behave and the realities they create.

To pick an example, Cornwall has subjective myths of egalitarianism and informality and it is often suggested that there are fewer hierarchies. The reality behind these myths could be questioned on the basis of measurable economic inequalities and observable social divisions but the myth works towards less divisive behaviours and an egalitarian ethos that becomes part of what people think of as Cornish and aspire to as a value. The point is that symbolically imagined norms may be useful discursively. In this case, for instance, the narrative myth may support a fairer, more democratic society by influencing behaviour. Thinking about what kinds of social capital Cornwall has already got, or rather what narratives exist, might be the best way to begin imagining a 'third level of signification' or mythology. In popular imaginings the following myths are sometimes claimed as positive features of Cornish society and culture:

> egalitarianism, inbuilt democracy, informality, friendliness, strong families, confident women, extended community networks, an ethnic Celtic identity, a strong work ethic, enterprise (high levels of self-employment), past industrial prowess, a love of novelty, innovation and inventiveness, cultural creativity, musicality, international networks (transnationality), a outward-looking world view, independence and self-sufficiency ('making do'), low levels of materialism, participatory cultural activities, high involvement in charitable and voluntary work.

This list certainly provides fertile ground for mythologies if not outright boastfulness, but there is a downside, including these alleged and ascribed myths:

124

insularity, hostility to outsiders, ignorance, backwardness, nostalgia and 'living in the past', lack of ambition, resistance to change, stubbornness, nimbyism, individualism, disorganization, division, defeatism, apathy, laziness, 'semi-retirement', inbreeding and incest, stupidity.

All of these concern capital in its various forms and occur in representation. They therefore inform the rest of the discussion.

Chapter Five

Cornish cultural hygienes and invented tradition.

In the cultural politics of the New Cornwall, the actors of the Cornish Movement, as campaigners, cultural innovators and performers, purport to represent and champion an imagined Cornish community and respond to its needs. This is the leitmotif of Revivalist musical scenes and the taken-for-granted motivation of Cornish language speakers and a multitude of engaged community advocates and political activists, but although most of these folk are Cornish, self-referencing discourses sometimes create distance from a public whose cultural lights differ. In this respect, these activists resemble counterparts from other movements and causes, from feminisms to trade unionism and minority rights, where having a more developed political awareness than most of the 'represented' need not negate campaigns and projects but should demand reflection. Coupled with political motivation is a marked tendency towards cultural prescriptivism and totalizing 'grand narratives' (Pan-Celticism, Cornish Nationalisms, Revivalism, Multi-Culturalism.) that influence approaches in all areas from language planning (a preoccupation of Cornish language revivalists) to selecting musical repertoires, engagement with visual representation and definitions of 'Cornish culture' itself.

In this discussion there is a danger of giving the impression that the Cornish Movement is homogenous, whereas it has already been revealed to be diverse. This chapter nevertheless concentrates on Celtic Revivalism as a definable strand, recognizing that many in the Cornish Movement do not subscribe to all aspects of it, and it also considers recent appropriations and departures from the Revivalist project. Distinctly Revivalist notions of cultural worth influence selections,

production and innovation and involve prescriptions that have implications for culture's 'primary uses', previously discussed, by people whose tastes and practices differ. This in turn affects the 'usefulness' (for the purposes earlier outlined) and uptake of Cornish language learning and Revivalist activities by some sections of the community.

The title of this chapter is inspired by Deborah Cameron's use of the term *Verbal Hygiene*[367] to discuss prescriptive approaches to language. Verbal hygiene encompasses, 'all the normative metalinguistic practices through which people attempt to improve language or regulate its use in accordance with particular values, for instance: authenticity, beauty, truth, efficiency, logic, clarity, correctness, stability.'[368]

Cameron discusses the supposed opposition between *descriptive* and *prescriptive* approaches to language and the turn away from judgmental notions of correct language towards relativist positions from which all forms are seen as valid. This change leads linguists to concern themselves with describing language as they find it rather than holding up idealized forms as 'correct' and better. This linguistic relativism involves taking a dim view of 'prescriptivism' and the term is widely used to describe conservative and elitist applications of arbitrarily defined 'correct' and 'legitimate' language. Thus, 'the term 'prescriptivism' has a particular value attached to it, a negative connotation that is almost impossible to avoid.'[369]

---

[367] Deborah Cameron (1995), *Verbal Hygiene*, London: Routledge.
[368] Deborah Cameron, 'The one, the many and the Other: representing mono/multiculturalism in post- 9/11 verbal hygiene', paper presented to 'Multilingual 2,0?' Conference at the University of Arizona, 14th April 2012.
[369] Deborah Cameron (1995), p.3.

Cameron's 'verbal hygiene' takes a more complex view and is therefore not a straightforward synonym for 'prescriptivism'. This is because her concept also embraces non-conservative, values and motives in attempts to control and shape language, including some that are anti-elitist, counter-hegemonic and innovative. In other words, verbal hygiene does not have to be 'bad' or elitist, although, of course, it can be. On the contrary, it can be positively 'good' and be involved in struggles against inequalities and injustices. To demonstrate non-conservative motivations, Cameron discusses feminist and anti-racist interventions ('political correctness') which have successfully altered the everyday norms of English. She also cites Plain English campaigns which seek inclusiveness, artificial languages like Esperanto which are inspired by universalism, and language revitalization projects which can involve aesthetic and counter-hegemonic motives. Cameron shows that normative practices of verbal hygiene are always present in apparently 'natural', common-sense forms that define and police the boundaries of acceptable language. This is in fact essential for maintaining the integrity of any language as a functioning code so that speakers remain mutually intelligible.

This is obviously applicable to Cornish language planning but the concept may be extended and developed as a framework for examining normative practices in Cornish culture as a whole. It is therefore proposed that 'cultural hygiene' be coined as short-hand for all of the ways in which people attempt to delimit, shape and present 'Cornish culture'. Understanding that normative practices can have all sorts of motives avoids seeing hegemony as a simple, one-way process and provides insights into the workings of cultural and symbolic capital which may inform intervention. We can approach Revivalism with the awareness that counter-hegemonic cultural hygienes can also involve inflexible metanarratives but need not.

Cultural hygiene can be related to Foucault's approaches to discourse,[370] central to which is the idea that discourses exist and circulate in combinations that are specific to time and place. These produce 'discursive formations'[371] which act as preconditions, largely shaping discursive practices (including those of verbal and cultural hygiene) which then contribute to how discourse evolves. Foucault plays down the role of subjects as authors or initiators and regards them as functioning within pre-existing discourses but nevertheless operating a kind of authorship function that contributes to further development. This applies to the ways in which participants in Cornish cultures (Revivalist or not) do not so much create discourses as sift through a stock of available versions from within Cornish repertoires and from outside them, variously reproducing, recombining and altering what they find. Cornish discursive formations do not form a closed or static system, in other words.

Every discourse has a past and a trajectory which may be scrutinized using Foucault's closely connected methods of 'archaeology' and 'genealogy', both of which are related to historiography, a central theme in Cornish Studies. Archaeology entails examining and describing the regularities, irregularities and changes in present discourses, rather than interpreting and judging them and it does so by delving into the general system and stock of discourses within which individual practices operate.[372] Genealogy takes this a step further and uses the knowledge gained strategically to address present difficulties, and it identifies discursive practices (acts, statements etc.) and ongoing processes.[373] This can reveal information about their roles and origins

---

[370] Michel Foucault (1972), *The Archaeology of Knowledge*, London: Tavistock; Michel Foucault (1970), *The Order of Discourse: An Archaeology of the Human Sciences*, Tavistock: London.
[371] Michel Foucault (1972), pp. 31-39 and pp. 126-131.
[372] Michel Foucault (1972), p.130, cited in Gavin Kendall and Gary Wickham (1999), *Using Foucault's Methods*, London: Sage, p.25.
[373] Gavin Kendall and Gary Wickham (1999), *Using Foucault's Methods*, London: Sage, p. 29-31; Foucault (1970, 1981), *The Order of Discourse*, in R. Young (ed.), *A Post-Structuralist Reader*, London: Routledge and Kegan Paul, pp.70-1.

which would not otherwise be uncovered, - as in Foucault's work on madness which exposes the uncomfortable origins of discourses in the mental health professions.[374] The purpose here is not historiographical though, nor is it to deconstruct myths for the sake of unsettling their adherents. The Revival has already received in depth academic attention from the perspectives of the 'New Cornish Historiography' so the next task is to use this work to develop a genealogical awareness of the Revivalist inheritance and grapple with its cultural hygienes and their outcomes.[375]

Cultural hygiene relates directly to Foucault's work on societies of surveillance in which he considers surveillance, self-surveillance and self-regulation in the maintenance of social norms.[376] This was mentioned earlier in respect to the behavioural norms of social capital but it also applies to how 'insiders' survey, police and regulate their cultures. This is central to cultural hygiene and since it happens in all social and cultural movements, from feminisms to anti-racism campaigns, it is unsurprising to find it within the Cornish Movement. Just as linguistic hygiene involves surveillance to maintain the integrity of language, so urges to control culture involve surveillance to delimit and maintain the integrity of ethno-cultural identities. Semiological approaches to cultural studies allow the systems of norms or rules that govern cultural identities to be likened to Saussure's *langue* and we can view surveillance and cultural hygiene as variously maintaining or challenging them. Cultural acts, whether consciously produced or not, then compare to the individual utterances that constitute Saussure's *parole*.[377]

---

[374] Michel Foucault (1971), Madness and Civilization, London: Tavistock.
[375] Philip Payton (ed.), *Cornish Studies*, 2nd Series, vols. 1-20, op. cit.
[376] Michel Foucault (1991 [1975]), op. cit.
[377] Ferdinand de Saussure (1967 [1915]), *Cours de Linguistique Générale*, Paris: Payot. Chapter 2.

Cameron observes that verbal hygiene involves analogies between the 'order of language and the larger social order'[378] where language may be a surrogate for other matters. In a discussion of new attitudes in Britain, she links a marked governmental turn against multilingualism and multiculturalism that following '7/7', fears about 'domestic terrorism' and the belief (amplified by the post-2008 financial crisis) that competing cultural loyalties fragment society. Like other cases of verbal hygiene this development involves aspiration, desire, yearning, fear, worry, anger and so on, and is mirrored in culture. As previously outlined, the Cornish Movement also responds emotionally to demographic, economic and social transformations and its cultural hygiene similarly makes culture a surrogate (if not a displacement activity) for concerns about community and the economy.

The interest of cultural hygiene for discussions of 'useable culture' is three-fold. Firstly, it is involved in omitting and excluding Cornish practices and in rendering Cornishness as a whole illegitimate in respect to prevalent, legitimate cultures. Thus many 'distinctions'[379] of Cornishness arbitrarily connote low individual and collective cultural and symbolic capital. Secondly, cultural hygiene operates within Cornishness when ideas of what Cornish culture *is* and *should be* are contested. A related contention is that some of the overseers of Revivalist cultures have oversights that devalue other versions of Cornish culture by their omission. Thus, cultural hygiene impacts upon the relative status of differing constructions within Cornishness and by association, the legitimacy or credibility of individuals as insiders. This, like the forms of cultural capital discussed by Bourdieu, involves arbitrary 'distinctions' that determine degrees of 'insideness' and might be suspected of influencing the extent to which individuals enjoy the benefits of 'belongingness' (one of Maslow's human needs). The third way in which cultural hygiene is relevant is as a required part of

---

[378] Deborah Cameron, 'The one, the many and the Other', op. cit.
[379] Pierre Bourdieu (1979), *La Distinction,* op. cit.

selecting elements for intervention and the dissemination of preferred 'myths', as previously discussed.[380]

Being Celts: A Revivalist Monopoly?

There is far more to Cornish culture than Revivalism so taking the proposition that the Revivalism has useful ingredients should not mean slipping into the trap of thinking that there is nothing else. This is a marked tendency amongst Revivalists and it has repercussions for wider views of what comprises 'Cornish Culture' and for perceptions of Revivalism itself. For example, Cornwall Council's 'Green Paper for Culture' (circulated as a consultation on policy in 2010-11) takes a fairly broad view of cultural activity but places Revivalism in a distinct category, giving the impression that it is detached from mainstream cultural life and quirky but nevertheless intimating that it comprises Cornish identity and suggesting a kind of Revivalist monopoly over definitions (This is partly rectified by the subsequent 'White Paper', 2012.). Attention to Revivalist innovations may be detrimental to more embedded practices that are overshadowed and overlooked and there is a further danger that Cornishness as a whole may appear to be a sideshow, colourfully ethnic but a redundant minority interest, devoid of legitimate cultural capital. Self-referencing Revivalist discourses spill over into academic work, notably from students who encounter the Revival's obvious displays of Otherness (music and dance, visual symbols, language) but miss the fuller complexity of Cornishness.

Although the current Revivalist assemblage is recent, this fact can be ignored and the word 'revival' taken at face value so that Revivalism is thought to be more genuine and ethnically distinctive than non-Revivalist Cornish cultures which are unremarked or unreported. There

---

[380] Roland Barthes (1982 [1957]), *Mythologies*, Paris: Le Seuil, pp.199-210.

are tendencies towards essentialism and purism whereby 'Celtic' neo-traditions are treated as more authentic, almost as though the Revival had stripped away an obscuring overburden to reveal the 'true' cultural rock underneath.

A normally unspoken project of the Cornish Movement is the amplification of difference between Cornwall and England in an assertion of ethnic claims and a defence against assimilation. This is a long-established motivation, already strong in the early twentieth-century, but the expansion and divergence of the Cornish Movement now encompasses popular responses to Cornwall's 'new circumstances' that have little in common with the antiquarianism of the Revival's founders. In reacting to social and economic changes, though, the most readily-available, off-the-shelf discourses and symbolic differences are those inherited from Revivalism and mediated through pervasive community networks. The discursive formation of Revivalism therefore fuses with grass-roots concerns to shape how the Movement's adherents frame their aspirations and, 'It colours all our perceptions of Cornwall's past, and for many people it is the destination as well as the starting point of all discussion.'[381]

This ready-made framework offers great unifying benefits but also poses problems that are best understood genealogically. The Revival's early architects participated in, and helped shape, the truths of Pan-Celticism whereby Cornwall was measured against an Irish model (Romantic Ireland)[382] that was created by the Gaelic Ireland Movement (c.1890-1930) and informed by imaginings of the Celts, both externally and internally. Although 'Celtic' and indeed, Cornish, individuals contributed to ideas of shared identity and origins, many of these imaginings came from without, notably from England, France and Germany

---

[381] Tim Saunders 'Cornish Symbol and Substance' in C. Ó Luain (ed.) (1983) For a Celtic Future, Dublin: The Celtic League. p.257.
[382] W.B. Yates' poem appeared in The Irish Times on the 8th September, 1913.

and they connected with wider manifestations of a quest for 'otherness' in Orientalism and Romanticism. Idealized versions of Celticity assembled Gaelic Irish, Breton, Welsh and Highland Scottish elements, favouring remote, rural imagery over modern progress and in England the invention of Celticity also constructed Englishness in alterity to it. This means that there are parallels between *Celticism* and Edward Said's accounts of *Orientalism.*[383] The Celts were homogenized and ascribed generic characteristics whereby earlier views of them as hostile barbarians gave way to softer versions that saw them as: free, imaginative, creative, fertile, passionate, spiritual, emotional, impulsive, unruly, natural and so on. As in Africa and Asia, the Other is feminized:

> In short, the typical Celt appears to manifest those characteristics and to voice those concerns which a 19th-century middle class Frenchman or Englishman would have considered appropriate in his wife.[384]

Whilst some of the ascribed attributes are attractive, they may be arrayed in binary opposition to a privileged set of supposed (male) English characteristics. This invites poststructuralist criticisms of Western oppositional thought, such as Hélène Cixous' deconstruction of how femininity is contained within culturally accepted confines of inequality. Within a binary or dualistic scheme, women are the construct of men, a principle that can be extended to the 'Celts' who are similarly opposed (variously) to English, French and German norms. Cixous relates binary oppositions to the couple, man/woman, and suggests that one side of each pair is always privileged, giving examples:

> Activity/Passivity
> Sun/Moon
> Culture/Nature
> Day/Night...[385]

---

[383] Edward Saïd (2003 [1978]), *Orientalism,* London: Penguin Books; Terence Brown (ed.) (1996), *Celticism,* Atlanta.
[384] Tim Saunders (1983), pp.255-6.
[385] e.g. Hélène Cixous (1981[1975]), op. cit. p 37-38.

Accordingly, Cornish Revivalists opperate to a large extent within dualistic schemes which leave Celticity in the same column as irrationality, nature and so on, despite being elected and negotiated. Thus all of the following occur commonly in Revivalist imaginings of Celticity but are opposed to potentially privileged alternatives:

wild, impulsive, natural, ancient, romantic, rural, imaginative, poetic, musical, mystical, spiritual, disorganized, spontaneous, disunited, colonized, oppressed.

In short, constructions of the Celts within Revivalism bring a great deal of baggage with them and in Cornwall they connect, via the representations of early tourism and artists' colonies, with some of the disabling ascribed identities found in the discourses of regional development today.[386] It has proved influential and lasting and is mirrored in Celtic Studies internationally, where Gaelic cultures occupy a privileged place at the peak of a hierarchy that relies on the requisite attributes of a generic Celticity which, although negotiable, is remarkably influential. An inherent difficulty that this high-profile prescription poses is that its commanding components are essentially pre-industrial and pre-modern, in marked contrast to Cornwall's formative modern, industrial history. Its nineteenth-century heritage simply does not fit the model and Cornish culture is found wanting in some prerequisites, - deficient in bagpipes, folk music, dance and traditional costume, all of which have been the subject of Revivalist projects to fill the lack. At the same time the Cornish language, as textually attested and communicated traditionally (in place-names and dialect words), is found to be embarrassingly Anglicized in vocabulary, pronunciation and spelling so that it needs to be purged and re-spelt. Unlike post-industrial, largely Anglophone South Wales, which shares

---

[386] Discussions, Malcolm Chapman (1992), *The Celts: The Construction of a Myth*, London: Macmillan; Amy Hale, 'Foot in the Mouth, or Foot in the Door? Evaluating Chapman's *The Celts*', in P.J. Payton (ed.), *Cornish Studies*, no. 4, (1996), pp. 158-170; Simon James, (1999), *The Atlantic Celts - Ancient People or Modern Invention?*, London: British Museum Press.

most of these perceived deficiencies, Cornwall is not part of a larger territory. There are no nearby areas of Celtic speech or further Llŷn Peninsula to conform more closely to the model, nor is Cornwall redeemed by national institutions and a critical mass of population. The Cornish are consequently slightly suspect, Cinderella Celts, ranked in fifth or sixth place.

None of this would matter in the normal run of things but because Cornwall is small (notwithstanding smaller independent states) and a *de facto* part of England politically, the perceived need to establish Celtic credentials assumes exaggerated importance and opting out becomes tantamount to denying a distinct, i.e. non-English, ethnicity. Insecurity about being Celtic has been a perpetual worry since Revivalists sought and achieved Cornwall's membership of the Celtic Congress in 1903.[387] The 'recognition of Cornwall as a Celtic nation' (common phrase amongst Revivalists)[388] is a longstanding desire which produces strenuous efforts to participate in inter-Celtic events on equal terms with Brittany, Wales, Ireland, The Isle of Man and Scotland, despite a lack of institutional backing, funding and population size.

The primacy of Celtic models can, of course, be rejected and there are those inside the Cornish Movement who do just that by negotiating distinctly Cornish ways to be Celtic, the image of the 'industrial Celt' being a prominent example that combines it with technological prowess.[389] In fact, Garry Tregidga identifies an alternative Cornu-Welsh model of Celticity in nineteenth-century Cornish identifications

---

[387] See, Sharon Lowenna, "Noscitur A Sociis': Jenner, Duncombe-Jewell and their Milieu', in P.J. Payton (ed.), *Cornish Studies*, no. 12, (2004), pp. 61-87; Amy Hale, 'Genesis of the Celto-Cornish Revival? L. C. Duncombe-Jewell and the Cowethas Kelto-Kernuak', in P.J. Payton (ed.), Cornish Studies, no. 5, (1997), pp. 100-111; Alan Kent (2000), *The Literature of Cornwall,* op. cit. pp. 2000.

[388] See, Derek R. Williams, 'A Cornish Voice in the Celtic Orchestra' Robert Morton Nance and the Celtic Congress of 1926, Cornish Studies no. 16, pp. 104-125.

[389] See Amy Hale, 'Representing the Cornish - Contesting heritage interpretation in Cornwall', op. cit.

that are rooted in industry, non-conformism and radical politics, and this continues as a current within the wider Cornish Movement today.[390] Yet, for all these other ways of negotiating Celtic Cornishness, there is a core strand within Revivalism that accepts and emulates so many aspects of ill-fitting prescriptions that dissonance sometimes emerges between Revivalism and the forms of popular Cornishness explored in the next chapter. This does not happen as a clear opposition but in a myriad of clashing practices that do not quite fit, or which contradict traditional identities. This is not a clear-cut matter, in other words, but we can begin by noting the inherent conflict between ascribed Celtic attributes and Cornish myths of technical, innovative and concrete achievement. The latter, far from celebrating pre-modernity as a virtue or emphasizing mystical dimensions and impulsive and argumentative characters, centre on matters that are modernizing, pragmatic, organized, 'workish' and down-to-earth, if not literally underground and cutting-edge.

Bourdieu, who incidentally spoke Béarnese Occitan with his parents, saw 'symbolic violence' in the discontinuities between the values of home and school and between legitimate and illegitimate culture; which from Revivalist perspectives can only apply to the reductionist opposition of Cornish (illegitimate, subaltern) and English (legitimate, dominant) cultures. What this overlooks is the possibility that certain Revivalist cultural hygienes risk further symbolic violence by contradicting traditional Cornish forms that are already weakened and marginalized by the 'new circumstances' previously described. Embrace and pursuit of discordant Celtic models could even be said to involve Revivalists in a kind of do-it-unto-thyself symbolic violence. Associated cultural hygiene foregrounds and constructs elements to comply to 'Celtic' norms even if these jar with the awkwardly ill-fitting cultural realities of the Revivalists' own Cornish backgrounds. In Foucauldian

---

[390] Garry Tregidga, 'Celtic comparisons: Brittany and the Cornish Revivalist Movement', conference paper at, 'Les rencontres, Bretagne/Monde Anglophone, Université de Bretagne Occidentale, Quimper, 29th June 2012.

terms, their selections are discursive practices that create, rather than discover, the truth and they include silences or omissions that are as important as what is included. Broadly speaking, non-folkloric, Cornu-English[391] and industrially modern aspects of culture are left out of the script and effectively hidden.

Romantic and exotic portrayals may interpellate insiders even, and perhaps especially, if they do not correspond to everyday reality. Invented traditions and enactments of Celticity can allow them to valorize themselves as imaginative, creative and picturesque (commonly ascribed and elected features of Celtitude), as well as hard-done-by and victimized with a ready-made excuse for failure but, paradoxically, they may simultaneously accept de-valorizing ideas about their home culture, internalizing the idea that its 'distinctions' are inferior both to prevalent non-Cornish cultures and to Revivalism. Indeed embracing neo-tradition can involve a negotiated personal Cornishness that partially accepts the social inferiority of a 'parental' background of upbringing and group and rejects it, which is why some Revivalists I encountered commented unfavourably on traditional practices. The rejected elements can conveniently be branded 'English', removing any awareness of contradiction, betrayal or hypocrisy. Taking up new Revivalist forms can involve dropping traditional ones in other words and amounts to a 'preferred' or 'negotiated reading' of Celtic prescriptions in Stuart Hall's sense of the terms.[392] Thus a neo-traditional musician and lapsed Cornish learner told me he was, 'fed up with pasties-and-cream, tea-and-bun culture', - an easily-understood male reaction to safe and cosy domestic Cornishness, except that he also disparaged local men as 'good old boys' and 'pards' (a form of address, similar to 'mate', introduced by miners returning from the American West), parodying their accents and disparaging their alleged attachment to 'boring old crap', which evidently meant everything that

---

[391] *Cornu-English*: Forms of English traditionally spoken in Cornwall, including archaisms and influences from Cornish.
[392] Stuart Hall (1980 [1973]), 'Encoding/decoding', op. cit.

constituted their established Cornishness, including how they behaved, spoke and viewed the world.

Robert Morton Nance's 'Cornish culture'.

Revivalist and nationalist discourses distinguish between 'culture in Cornwall' and 'Cornish culture', a differentiation made by the language revivalist, artist and nautical historian, Robert Morton Nance (1873-1959)[393] who, as the Movement's most influential twentieth-century figure, looked forward to a 'New Cornwall' where present-day tradition and recorded elements of cultures past would be fused with native creativity and imagination to build a reinvigorated culture with the Cornish language at its heart.[394] When Nance made this distinction he was essentially opposing a, 'continuous tradition of culture that is natively Cornish',[395] to 'English' cultures that enjoyed legitimacy and attention at its expense. He thus consolidated older discourses of Cornish nationality and laid down somewhat binary terms of reference by which Revivalism largely still operates.

Nance believed that Cornish national consciousness needed to be reawakened and acknowledge kinship with the rest of the Celtic world. 'Cornish culture' had to be rescued, championed and disseminated by, 'a movement to keep the Cornishness of Cornwall'.[396] In his keynote statement, 'What We Stand For.', Nance eschews anti-Englishness and cites 'snobbery' as the only enemy of Cornishness, revealing his wish to raise the self-worth and cultural capital of the Cornish as an affirmative action. Here was a democratic vision that envisaged 'Cornish for All'[397]

---

[393] Robert Morton Nance, 'Cornish Culture', in *The Cornish Review*, no.1, (April 1949), p.3; R.M. Nance, 'What we stand for.', in *Old Cornwall*, vol. 1, no. 1, (April 1925), pp. 3-6.

[394] cf. Peter W. Thomas and Derek R. Williams (eds.) (2007), *Setting Cornwall on its Feet: Robert Morton Nance, 1873-1959*, London: Francis Boutle Publishers, p.26.

[395] Robert Morton Nance (1925), op. cit.

[396] Robert Morton Nance (1925), op. cit.

[397] Robert Morton Nance (1958 [1929]), *Cornish for All: A Guide to Unified Cornish*, 3rd edition, Federation of Old Cornwall Societies.

and valued down-to-earth culture (stories, recipes, songs, work practices, crafts etc.), that were to be gathered from ordinary people who were the respected custodians of an oral tradition that was theirs. The role of recording and retrieving this knowledge was undertaken by a newly-established *Federation of Old Cornwall Societies* whose motto, *'Cuntelleugh an brewyon us gesys na vo kellys travyth'* (Gather up the fragments/ crumbs that are left that nothing be lost.) expressed the purpose of just-in-time safe-guarding of heritage.[398] This was not to be latter-day antiquarianism or top-down 'salvage ethnography' but had to 'appeal to all sections of...people' and include 'anything that brings Cornish people together'.[399] 'Gathering the crumbs'[400] was the task of everyone and local 'recorders' collated the information. Nance's Old Cornwall networks, his contacts amongst fishermen and his prolific production of songs, plays, stories and language resources are all testimony to his intended inclusiveness and the project did indeed attract support. Nance's artistic, proto-socialist outlook, close to the Arts and Crafts Movement,[401] led him to produce what Tim Saunder's terms the 'Nancian Synthesis',[402] a marriage between the Cornishness of everyday life and romantic Celticism, 'Between Henry Jenner's other-wordly vision, and the detailed recording of living conditions by A.K. Hamilton Jenkin'.[403]

As an interventionalist foundation for 'useable culture', Nance's project is notable for the way in which it envisages modern tradition (including much that was industrial) sitting comfortably alongside customs, folklore, language and the arts in a comprehensive expression of Celtic

---

[398] The first Old Cornwall Society was established in St. Ives in 1920 and the Federation in 1925.

[399] Robert Morton Nance, letter to the St. Ives Times, 30th January 1920, cited in Brian Coombes, 'Keeping Cornwall Cornish: Robert Morton Nance and the Federation of Old Cornwall Societies.' in P.W. Thomas and D.R. Williams (eds.) (2007), p. 226.

[400] Motto of the Old Cornwall Society *'Cuntelleugh an brewyon us gesys na vo kellys travyth'* (Gather up the fragments/crumbs that are left that nothing be lost).

[401] I am grateful to Sharon Lowena for discussions of Nance's milieu; See references to Walter Crane in, Peter W. Thomas and Derek R. Williams (eds.) (2007), op. cit., p. 40 p. 306.

[402] Tim Saunders (1983), op. cit.

[403] ibid. p. 257.

Cornishness. There is recognition of the need to connect with lived experience and be relevant and appealing to a wide public. Thus, in addition to reviving Cornish, the emergent movement would, 'include everybody [...] by means of Cornish dialect speech.'[404] Nance's synthesis was meant to inform a national project of cultural renewal and inspire 'conjectural restorations'[405] and creative inventions, and in admitting past, present and newly-created, components from multiple sources, Nance recognized Cornishness as an evolving construction that had absorbed external influences, - including English ones. In that respect his attitude was close to present-day constructivists and saw 'continuous tradition' as a work in progress with a future that could be shaped by conscious intervention to serve present needs. Cornishness could be reinvigorated and carried onwards with confidence.

The 'Wrong Turn'.

For all its democratic, forward-looking strengths, Nance's approach included contradictions and incoherencies which could explain why Revivalism has not been more successful. Despite statements that valorized living memory, he retained an interest in the ancient and the medieval and privileged folkloric Celticism, thus facilitating a lingering antiquarianism that hampered practical applications. Faced with the 'relics of a failed industrialism'[406] and presented with ready-made Celtic utopias, Nance and his associates reached into the pre-industrial past and overlooked much of the present. Not least of the problems was Nance's subscription to linguistic 'corruption' as a value judgment that prepared the way for corresponding discourses, still perpetuated in present-day language planning, where the shaping of Cornish more often than not adheres to the concept. Nance's linguistic hygiene meant

---

[404] Robert Morton Nance (1925), op. cit.

[405] See, Alan Kent in P.W. Thomas and D.R. Williams (eds.) (2007), pp. 96-152.

[406] Bernard Deacon, 'And shall Trelawney die? The Cornish identity', in P.J. Payton (ed.) (1993), *Cornwall Since the War* op. cit. p. 206.

that he 'withdraw into a remoter past for his standards of style and vocabulary',[407] a decision Bernard Deacon calls the 'Wrong Turn' because of its negative consequences upon the relevance of the language to the Cornish public:

> This [fifteenth-century styles] guarantees that the Cornish language remains just as obscure now to the bulk of the population as it was back in the 1940s when Morton Nance was practicing his elvish script on the back of invitations from his stockbrokers to purchase shares.[408]

Nance founded his standard, 'Unified Cornish' (*Kernewek Unys*) orthography and grammar on the fourteenth-century *Ordinalia* rather than later sources that would have clearly shown its connectedness to place-names, surnames and traditionally retained words and phrases (still common at the time). Ironically, given Nance's embrace of so much working-class tradition, he created discordance with these aspects of popular Cornish culture, a strange choice because he valued these continuities and understood that they symbolically bridged the gap between the Cornish-speaking past and the present-day revival. More strangely still, this was an active departure from the practical prose of Henry Jenner's *Handbook of the Cornish Language,*[409] which Nance had first learnt from and which had used later Cornish in the tradition of nineteenth-century philology. The damage was hardly offset by Nance's pronunciation system, based on Cornu-English tradition but completely at odds with his medieval spelling, so that, 'what is preserved is the sounds of Cornish in its last stages [...] whereas written Cornic is based on Middle Cornish.'[410]

---

[407] Tim Saunders (1983), op. cit. p.257.
[408] Bernard Deacon, 'The Unimportance of being Cornish in Cornwall', Address to the Institute of Cornish Studies, 24th November 2012.
[409] Henry Jenner, (1904), *Handbook of the Cornish Language, Chiefly in its latest stages with some account of its history and literature,* London: David Nutt.
[410] Glanville Price (1984), *The Languages of Britain*, London, p. 143.

Nance's choice meant that instead of immediately producing a popular revival, with benefits for community confidence, Cornish became an arcane symbol, dragged out on rare ceremonial occasions for set performances. It belonged to the 'experts', not to everybody. An opportunity had been lost to emulate the short-lived experiment in 'bottom-up' language revitalization by the Reverend Lach-Szyrma who had earlier collaborated with people in Paul and Mousehole who knew traditional words and phrases. Nance's medievalism fitted certain utopian ideals, allowing him to imagine the past as more Cornish and Celtic but it made it harder to associate the Revival with present-day Cornish people and rendered the language esoteric and impenetrable for all but the intellectually-inclined. The impressively fluent Cornish speaker, John Pengilly, a stone-mason and panel-beater, described Unified Cornish as:

> ...invented in the 1920s by middle-class hobbyists, it broke all links with genuine Cornish. [...] it was designed to look quaintly mediaeval on paper but it was utterly useless for learning the sounds [and] fits in with modern life about as well as would the mediaeval monks who wrote the plays on which it is based.[411]

Pengilly's remarks echo Saunders' criticism of 'pseudo-archaism'[412] and the claim that Unified Cornish, 'plays the part of an unrecoverable past through its own impenetrability.'[413] The damning allegation is that, 'Nance succeeded in paralysing Cornish for over forty years'.[414]

In 1985, after sixty years of Unified Cornish, the number of competent speakers was below fifty and most Cornish people had never heard it

---

[411] John Pengilly, (1987) correspondence in *Cornish Scene*, vol. 2, no. 4, p.24.
[412] Tim Saunders cited in Philip Payton, 'The Ideology of Language Revival in Modern Cornwall', in R. Black, W. Gillies & R. Ó Maolalaigh (eds.), *Celtic Connections: Proceedings of the Tenth International Congress of Celtic Studies,* vol.1, *Language, Literature, History, Culture*, Edinburgh, (1999), pp.395-424 (p.404).
[413] Tim Saunders (1983), op. cit. p. 257.
[414] ibid.

spoken. In effect, Nance's selections had stored up trouble for later, laying the foundations of 'The Spelling Wars' that have raged around revisions and rejections of Unified Cornish since the 1980s. It is not the purpose here to discuss the details of these arguments because they have been well-rehearsed but briefly, the disagreements involve several markedly different visions of the language and more-or-less corresponding discursive formations and differing ideas of cultural identity.[415] The corresponding linguistic hygienes concern orthography, pronunciation and vocabulary and potentially affect whether revitalization work accords or conflicts with the identifications of 'Proper Cornishness'. Disagreements arouse passions that take them far beyond the limits of heated academic debate and reasoned argument to produce personal attacks (*ad hominem*), acrimony and animosity. This undermines trust and friendship and weakens the bonds, networks and social capital needed to build a strong speech community. It would be an understatement to say that Cornish speakers have been diverted from learning and teaching, creativity and pressing areas of community concern and lasting divisions are a common reason given for not learning Cornish or for dropping out. The linguistic arguments spill over into other areas of Cornish cultural and political activity so that they too are beset by squabbles.

There is nevertheless much that is positive in this ferment. All of the challenges to Unified Cornish share the desire to render Cornish usable as a present-day language of choice for anybody who wishes to learn. They come from pent-up frustrations with its 'quaint and achaïc'[416] presentation and could only have emerged from a new generation of speakers that has successfully battled through obstructive presentations and started to build a speech community. Ken George's 'Common Cornish' (*Kernewek Kemmyn*) tries, with some success, to

---

[415] See, Philip Payton, 'The Ideology of Language Revival in Modern Cornwall', op. cit, note 405; Nicholas Williams (2006), *Writings on Revived Cornish*, Westport, Co. Mayo: Evertype.
[416] Nicholas Williams (1995), *Cornish Today: An Examination of the Revived Language*, Sutton Coldfiled: Kernewek dre Lyther, p.13.

make Cornish easier to learn and use by putting the practical function of orthography as a representation of pronunciation before non-functional, aesthetic form. Unfortunately though, its over-reliance on modernist rationality ignores the symbolic meanings that can be connotated by form, thus missing an opportunity to strengthen connections with popular Cornishness. Whilst it embraces modernity, 'Common Cornish' adheres to Nance's medieval base and is framed by inherited discourses of Celticity, applying an intensified Celtic purism that rejects the hybridity of historical Cornish and casts developments after c.1550 as 'corrupt'. The more visually restrained, 'Unified Cornish Revised' (*Kernowek Unys Amendys*), differs in adopting a sixteenth-century foundation and a descriptivist approach that accepts historic loan words, but it still does little to strengthen associations with popular tradition.

Although most speakers use standard varieties that are based on Middle Cornish, the desire to reverse the 'wrong turn' comprehensively motivated a small group in the mid 1980s to turn to the Cornish of the early modern period (c.1620-1780) and codify 'Revived Modern Cornish', usually called 'Late Cornish' by detractors and simply 'Kernûak' by speakers. Advocates argue that its closeness to place-names and survivals in Cornu-English make it easier to embed it in everyday culture and Richard Gendall, its main researcher, sees it as fitting the general tenure of Cornishness and reconnecting with tradition.[417] He proposes a 'warts-and-all' embrace of Cornish from the early modern period as, 'no make-believe, theoretical or nostalgic pseudo-Celtic reconstruction but Cornish as it really was, as it was used by Cornish farmers, miners and fishermen.'[418] The project effectively starts again as though the revival to date had not taken place and it creates competing linguistic hygienes that underline connections with popular Cornish tradition.

---

[417] e.g. Richard Gendall (1991), *A Students Grammar of Modern Cornish*, Menheniot: Cornish Language Council, Preface.
[418] Richard Gendall, in *Carn*, vol. 63, (1988), The Celtic League.

These differing perspectives come together in the fraught but constructive, 'Process to produce a Standard Written Form', which under the direction of Maga has engaged Cornish speakers of all persuasions and thrashed out a standard, issued in 2008, that is intended to be 'an orthography that is fit for the twenty-first century'.[419] This 'Standard Written Form' or SWF is currently the subject of a review (2013) and continuing controversy on combined linguistic and aesthetic grounds but has already facilitated new collaborations and allowed work in schools.[420] The fact is though, that it has been achieved only after several years of intense activity and effort, at the expense of limited resources and with the counsel and arbitration of a commission of outside linguists.[421]

All of this has been made necessary by fall-out from Nance's 'wrong turn' and even now the medieval preferences of earlier language revivalists prevail. The 'Wrong Turn' has meant that his worthy intentions of an inclusive cultural renaissance have only been partially realized. Positively speaking, Nance's broad vision, beyond language, embraced much of the everyday culture that the Cornish in the first half of the twentieth century would have considered their own and it has been developed by socially engaged strands within the Revival that have effectively widened participation and produced a diversified Cornish Movement with the pervasive effects described earlier. Nearly all of the means by which an increasingly embattled indigenous community attempts to valorize, mobilize and articulate itself ultimately descend genealogically from Nance's project to some degree.

---

[419] Communications between members of Maga Corpus Panel, online forum.
[420] I am a member of the Review Board.
[421] See, http://www.magakernow.org.uk/default.aspx?page=346 (Accessed 5th January 2012.)

Less positively, Nance's aesthetics have left the way open to others who are condescending about popular Cornishness, seemingly seeing core features as antithetical to their cherished Celtic dreams. These problems may be symbolized by the far-right Henry Jenner, often cast, with overstatement of his role, as a patriarchal founder of Revivalism. Jenner was aggressively hostile to the Methodist, egalitarian Cornishness he found on retiring to Cornwall, even suggesting in late life that continental fascism might be needed if 'King Labour' took root.[422] Although born at St. Columb where his father was an Anglican curate, Jenner did not have any Cornish family origins, only marrying the Cornish writer, Kitty Lee Rawlings, in later life. Before retiring to Hayle in 1909, he had worked in the Department of Ancient Manuscripts at the British Museum[423] and was a Tory, a Jacobite and staunch monarchist and a converted Tridentine Catholic who speculated about Celtic Christian rites and druidism. In short, he could hardly have been further removed from the everyday concerns and culture of most people (Cornish or not) or less in tune with Nance's inclusiveness. The point of mentioning this is not to infer that a correspondingly elitist and right-wing tradition took root; it did not, but Jenner's attitudes and those of close associates, nevertheless influenced the tone, taken-for-granted wisdoms and centres of interest of a strand within Revivalism (e.g. bardic ceremony, saints and archangels, and antiquities.) and have left a mark, if not a stain, on current discourses.[424] Some of these perpetuate a presumption against ill-fitting aspects of everyday Cornish culture and can lead to items being treated, without reflection or intent, as somehow not properly Cornish or more precisely, not Celtic enough.

---

[422] See Jenner's papers in The Courtney Library, Truro. Discussed with Sharon Lowenna. Jenner died in 1934.
[423] Derek R. Williams (2004), *Henry and Katharine Jenner: A Celebration of Cornwall's Culture, Language and Identity*. Francis Boutle Publishers.
[424] Sharon Lowenna, op. cit.

Invented tradition.

A feature of ethnic revitalization movements generally is that, like nation-building projects, they create new cultural forms and symbols which may endure as 'invented traditions'. Cornish Revivalism is no exception. Numerous new forms have been produced using combinations of old and new, indigenous and imported elements which are interpreted within the discursive formations of ethnic assertiveness, cultural restoration, Cornish nationalism and Pan-Celticism. Eric Hobsbawm has observed that, 'Where the old ways are alive, traditions need be neither revived nor invented.',[425] but the Cornish Revival has a further complication. Its inventiveness certainly responds to real loss of traditions and involves creative nostalgia, but in addition to losses that have a basis in fact, there is an imagined loss of elements that are lacking for full attainment of prescribed Celtic models. The productive imagination that Pan-Celticism engages inevitably leads to re-imagining a fictional cultural past and this in turn leads Revivalists to invent and even to believe in forms that have never previously existed, - at least not as imagined. Some, like the invented traditions famously discussed by Eric Hobsbawm, Terrence Ranger and company,[426] have become so firmly established that they give the impression of having always been there as part of an uninterrupted cultural continuum.

Consciously invented traditions can quickly seem timeless and spontaneous so that we overlook their origins and they usually serve an ideological purpose of one kind or another. Those of states convey 'national' myths, including the idea of the nation itself, and from a semiological viewpoint can connote multiple ideas which coalesce to form cohesive ideologies or mythologies.[427] Invented traditions, like those surrounding national sport, the British monarchy, democratic

---

[425] Eric Hobsbawm and Terence Ranger (eds.) (1983, 1989), *The Invention of Tradition*, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
[426] ibid.
[427] Roland Barthes (1957), *Mythologies*, Paris: Editions de Seuil.

government, work and military prowess, can also form part of Althusser's 'ideological state apparatus' (I.S.A.)[428] and contribute to ideologies that support hegemony. Earlier it was suggested that the Cornish Movement represents a counter-hegemonic, 'ideological state*less* apparatus' and accordingly, Cornish invented traditions contribute to it, maintaining and recreating mythologies that are contradicted by the I.S.A. and not otherwise mediated because of the dearth of Cornish institutions. As Michael Billig demonstrates, the communication of national identities may take the form of practices and representations that we do not normally notice but which contribute to discourses of 'banal nationalism'[429] and connote ideas that support national unity and purpose. Cornish invented traditions similarly serve ideological or discursive roles and contribute to mythologies and discursive formations by connoting ideas about the group. Thus they either support or contradict identity narratives and contribute to or detract from collective cultural capital and they are by definition a form of intervention.

Over time the inventions and revivals of ethnic revitalization movements can come to be seen as more important than the pre-existing culture that inspired them and this is what appears to be happening amongst Cornish Revivalists. The language revival and (re)invented traditions and symbols happened because there was already a deeply-rooted identity and cultural practices that were distinctively Cornish but now Revivalism itself has come to be seen as comprising the culture itself. Caroline Vink notes that, 'Invented tradition' is employed to enhance the claims of ethnic distinctiveness, and in time elements of that tradition (for example, language revival) are defended by activists as central and legitimate aspects of identity.[430] Less grounded invented

---

[428] Louis Althusser (1971), 'On Ideology and Ideological State Apparatuses', in *Lenin and Philosophy and Other Essays*, New York: Monthly Review Press.
[429] Michael Billig (1995), *Banal Nationalism,* London, Thousand Oaks, New Delhi: Sage.
[430] Caroline Vink, op.cit. p113.

Cornish traditions could be said to fit the derogatory designations, 'fakelore', and 'folklorismus' which were coined by the anthropologist and folklore specialist, Richard Dorson[431] to distinguish between 'genuine' traditions and 'ideologically driven' folkloric inventions. Such accusations have often been leveled at the easy target of Ernest Morton Nance's post-war invention of a 'Cornish National Tartan', a replacement for the black 'Cornish Kilt' invented by the eccentric Revivalist and occultist, Louis Duncombe-Jewell (1866-1947).[432] Like other inventions based on 'Celtic' themes, these have been branded kitch,[433] but for all their offence against prim taste and 'authenticity', widespread uses of Cornish tartanry show that instances of Kelto-kitch can provide some of the most useful symbols for communicating collective identification. The wearing of Cornish tartan at weddings and rugby matches and in ubiquitous, everyday displays on ties, scarves, skirts and assorted hats is proof that an invented item can be adopted and used symbolically within a fairly short time. What is more, individuals do not have to believe they are revivals in order for this to work, meaning that authenticity does not always affect symbolic 'usefulness'. At Murdoch Day in Redruth, I spoke with two brothers who wore kilts, heavy work boots and tee-shirts advertizing their scaffolding firm. They knew perfectly well that Cornish kilts were an invention but wore them playfully, and in doing so had found a way to display their Cornish sentiment. Such uses are close to Umberto Eco's discussions of 'authentic fakes'[434] which appeal to the senses and the emotions without requiring us to really believe that they are 'genuine' traditions. They are, to that extent, honest and can have symbolic uses. Whilst there is a qualitative difference between the conscious creations of motivated ethnic projects and the intergenerational transmission of age-

---

[431] Richard Dorson, 'Is Folklore a] Discipline?', in *Folklore*, vol. 84, no. 3, (Autumn, 1973), pp 177-205, Taylor and Francis: www.jstor.org/stable/1259723 (Accessed 15th December 2011); R. Dorson (1976), 'Folklore and Fakelore: Essays Toward a Discipline of Folk Studies', Cambridge, Mass: Harvard University Press.

[432] See, Sharon Lowenna (2004), op. cit.; Marion Löffler (2000), *A Book of Mad Celts: John Wickens and the Celtic Congress of Caernarfon 1904*, Llandysul: Gomer Press.

[433] See, Jonathan Howlett, 'Putting the Kitch into Kernow', in P.J. Payton (ed.), *Cornish Studies*, vol.12, (2004), pp. 30-60.

[434] See, Umberto Eco (1986), *Travels in Hyppereality*, New York: Harcourt Brace Jovanovich; (or) (1987), Faith in Fakes: *Travels in Hyppereality,* Picador.

old practices, the distinction between 'invented' and 'genuine' traditions is contestable and, in any case, items do not have to be old or traditional in order to be useable. So-called 'fakelore' can complement pre-existing cultures and be fully incorporated, but even if it is not it can provide social contexts and networks, just like new activities that are not labelled 'Cornish'. Sophisticated Revivalist innovators point out that all traditions are made-up and ask why there should be 'one rule for Cornish culture and another for English culture'.[435] The principle may even be extended to the invention of new vocabulary in Cornish language planning:

> [E]very modern language is "made-up" to some extent: whenever a new concept appears in the world, it is necessary to have a word or phrase to denote it. Why should this process be in order for English and not for Cornish?[436]

These are reasonable questions but there remains something worryingly suggestive of dishonesty and falsification in invented traditions where instead of being up-front about what they are doing some of those involved are not quite frank and deliberately cloudy the waters so we cannot distinguish tradition from invention. The intention may not be to hoodwink people but they may still be misled, as in this comment on the conjecturally reconstructed 'Cornish bagpipes':

> The pipes have likely been played in Kernow/Cornwall for at least 2000 years. I am sorry to disappoint anyone who believes incorrectly that they are a recent invention or have been 'made up'.[437]

Thus a cautionary answer that could be given to the above questions is that it is different for Cornish culture because associated ethno-cultural claims are subject to scepticism and derision, unlike national identities

---

[435] Comments by Merv Davy at the CAVA conference, Peran Porth, October 2010.

[436] Ken George (1986), *The Pronunciation and Spelling of Revived Cornish*, Torpoint: Cornish language Board, p.37.

[437] The Cornubian, http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=25MfD_2w3vk&feature=related, (Accessed 3rd January 2012.)

that most people recognize. That means that anything made-up or overly reconstructed is seized upon as evidence that Cornish ethnicity itself is spurious, or at least that Revivalist constructions of it are false. Even neo-Cornish, not strictly an invented tradition, can be assumed to be a complete fake: 'Made-up from Welsh by inbred hobbits.'[438] Hostile reactions of the type, 'You're just making it up to be different.', and 'What's wrong with being English?', are symptomatic of suspicions that there is something wilful and artificial about invented traditions that conceals the absence of a real ethno-cultural identity. Add the ingredient of commodification and invented traditions start to appear very much like Dorson's 'commercially driven' cases of fake-lore and can give rise to greater scepticism. Jane Korey in fact goes as far as to propose that present-day Revivalism as a whole is a post-modern exercise in consciously inventing an identity.[439]

The classic case of an invented tradition becoming central to an identity construction is *Gorsedh Kernow* – 'The Gorsedd of Cornwall', the main institution of the Revivalist project. Through its honours system of bardships, annually awarded for contributions to Cornish life, it assembles a large body of cultural practitioners and community figures. These comprise a high proportion of the Cornish Movement's leaders and innovators. Gorsedh Kernow is thus one of very few specifically Cornish cultural institutions with extensive community networks and any degree of gravitas. Despite criticisms from within the Movement, it automatically comes to mind when Revivalists are asked to think of bodies that represent Cornish identity and appears to be very much part of the 'stateless ideological apparatus' suggested earlier, relaying the idea of a Cornish nation:

---

[438] Comments by a shopkeeper in Lostwithiel, August 2011.
[439] Jane Korey (1992), op. cit.

> The Gorsedd is not political or anti-English, but we want to foster the self-respect of the Cornish people by making them regard themselves as one of the Celtic nations.[440]

Founded in 1928 to, 'promote the Cornish language' and 'uphold the Celtic traditions of Cornwall', the Gorsedh (with the Old Cornwall Societies) has given rise, directly or indirectly, to the plethora of cultural bodies that exist for these purposes today.[441] It has come to be viewed by many as a Celtic tradition in its own right, as important if not more so than those that originally justified its project to 'maintain the national Celtic spirit of Cornwall'. In consequence, the institution and its bardic ceremony become preoccupations. Cornwall's 'gorsedh' derives from Edward Williams' (alias, Iolo Morganwg) invention of the Welsh Gorsedd at the end of the eighteenth century[442] and its bards are clothed in robes inspired by imaginings of the druids and classical and orientalist imagery. Today's dress consequently combines a sky-blue Romano-Greek toga and Arab ghutra-style headdress adorned with the three-rayed *awen* symbol invented by Williams to represent inspiration. The neo-druidic and Arthurian repertoire is completed by beaten copper plastrons inspired by Bronze and Iron Age torcs, a throne-like bardic chair, a ceremonial sword representing Excalibur (*Calesvol*)[443], a 'Celtic' harp and a horn which summons the four cardinal points of the compass: 'Kernow an Howlsedhes, eus kres?' (West Cornwall, is there peace?). Robed bards stand in a circle, matching romantic portrayals of the druids and a 'Lady of Cornwall' in quasi-medieval garb bears the Grand Bard a bouquet.

---

[440] Robert Morton Nance, *The Western Morning News*, 21st September 1928.

[441] http://www.gorsethkernow.org.uk/english/about.htm; Described as 'the most important and the primary cultural organization in Cornwall' by Mick Paynter.

[442] See Prys Morgan, 'From a Death to a View: The Hunt for the Welsh Past in the Romantic Period', in Hobsbawm and Ranger (eds.) (1983, 1989), op. cit.

[443] So spelt in the play, *Bewnans Ke* (The Life of Kea.), c.1560. (NLW MS 23849D).

All of the visual imagery corresponds to the romantic period of Celtic revivalism and may connote mystical, natural, imaginative and creative Celticity. It thus supports the ascribed models which are identified as problematic and the possibilities for controversial readings do not stop there. The ceremony has often been taken to be neo-pagan, esoteric and in keeping with a magical, spiritual Cornwall traversed by lay-lines and the flight paths of witches and fairy folk. When a small Gorsedd was held at a Cornish gathering in the American Mid-West, bystanders reportedly connected it to the Klu-Klux Klan.[444] Some of the wording and musical content was created by Jenner's associates and reflects Anglo-Catholic preferences which, despite later modifications, produce the feeling of high church liturgy and this impression is reinforced by associated church services led by an Anglican chaplain. The ceremony appears strikingly at odds with Cornwall's predominantly Methodist religious heritage, pragmatic traditions and now largely secular society and it is an easy target for humour as, 'Gorse-bush Kernow', where 'pards' replace bards and cricket stumps stand in for the *awen*.[445]

Gorsedh Kernow's invented origins are well-known but there is still insistence on it being a revival:

> This tradition, following that of Wales, was revived in Cornwall in 1928 at a Gorsedd, or meeting of Bards, at Boscawen-un [sic].[446]

The 'revival' claim is founded on the Welsh Triads[447] reference to 'Beisgawen' in Dumnonia as the site of one of the *Gorsesddau* of Britain, and it permits statements that are sparing of recorded fact:

> In ancient Celtic times, Bards [...] had places of high honour at important assemblies regularly held at venerated sites throughout Britain, one of which was the stone circle at Boscawen-un...[448]

---

[444] Discussed with Amy Hale.
[445] Andrew Marshall (ed.), *Free Cornwall*, a magazine published during the 1990s.
[446] http://www.gorsethkernow.org.uk/english/history.htm (Accessed, 3rd Spetember 2012); The usual place-name spelling is Boscawen-Ûn.
[447] Rachel Bromwich (ed. Trans.) (2006), *Trioedd Ynys Prydein: The Welsh Triads,* 3rd Edition, Cardiff: University of Wales Press.

This emphasis on revival infers that there is something wrong with honest invention and recalls observations by the accomplished Cornish language writer, Peggy Pollard in 1947, that, 'There are those who pretend to take a poor view of the Cornish Gorseth because it was inaugurated in 1928 A.D. instead of B.C. [...] All things must have a beginning.'[449] As Hobsbawm and Ranger show, many successful traditions are consciously invented, so perhaps Charles Thomas was right fifty years ago when he argued that the Gorsedd served a useful purpose:

> The uninformed regard the entire Old Cornwall and Gorsedd movement as a waste of time, bogus to the core and simply an excuse for an annual escapist junket of picturesque appearance. [...] the business of the movement is to see that the uninformed become the informed...[450]

In other words, the benefits of having a body that promoted Cornish culture outweighed any negative visual connotations and certainly when Thomas made his remarks, all things seemed possible. After all, the Cornish project needed institutions and the Gorsedh could have risen to the occasion and developed its work in any number of useful directions. In the event, the Gorsedh has had an immeasurable effect on life in Cornwall but most of this has been indirect, resulting from its informal networks and affective feelings that spring from participation, rather than any concrete works that it has undertaken itself. Its visual imagery does, despite everything, manage to inspire a body of Cornish people and motivate them further, inviting the suggestion that all it really needs to increase its relevance and benefits to Cornish society as a whole is a sophisticated visual overhaul and a reflective deconstruction of its 'Jennerish' baggage.

---

[448] ibid.
[449] Peggy Pollard, *Cornwall*, 1947.
[450] Charles Thomas, 'An Dasserghyans Kernewek', at the Celtic Congress, 16-20th April, 1963, in *Old Cornwall*, vol. 6, no. 5.

Invented traditions may be treated as 'more Cornish than Cornish' (said of Cornish speakers by a Falmouth estate agent) thus belittling or discounting the cultures of most Cornish people. I witnessed a striking occurrence in a pub at Four Lanes near Redruth. A musician, irritated by the noisy indifference to his 'Celtic jazz fusion', snapped, 'I'm giving you your *** culture here'. In reality, it could not possibly have been their culture since they had never heard anything like it and were clearly not enthralled, so what the guitarist should have said is, 'I'm giving you what I think your culture ought to be'. I was also starkly aware of this when prominent language Revivalists discussed my observation that working-class Cornish learners from my former classes never went to 'Celtic' festivals. 'They should!' I was told, 'What's the point of being Cornish if they don't get into the culture?'[451] Ironically the people I had been talking about include accomplished Cornish speakers who are steeped in the everyday culture of their communities but these social and cultural contexts can be ignored.

Occasionally the Revival's players score revealing home goals in pursuit of cultural hygiene. For instance, the 'umbrella organization' of 'Cornish cultural organizations', *Bewnans Kernow*,[452] declined an application from representatives of Cornish rugby on the grounds that it is 'not indigenous culture', despite the sport being at the core of community life and popular ideas of what is Cornish.[453] What is more, 'Trelawny's Army', the Cornwall supporters' club makes assertive, symbolic uses of the Cornish language and Revivalist visual symbols and is about as clear a manifestation of the Cornish Movement as can be imagined.[454] In 1989, 1991 and 1992 the county finals at Twickenham produced the

---

[451] Discussions in the Krowji, Redruth.
[452] http://www.bewnanskernow.org (Accessed 12th December 2011).
[453] Minutes accessed at www.bewnanskernow.org, April, 2010; cf. Andy Seward, 'Cornish Rugby and Cultural Identity: A Socio-historical Perspective,' in P.J. Payton (ed.), *Cornish Studies*, no. 5, pp. 164-179; cf. Colin Gregory (1991), *Cornwall Rugby Champions*, London; David Williams, 'Rugby ew gon gwari nei', *An Garrak* (2010).
[454] See, http://www.trelawnys-army.org.uk/ta/tascf.html (Accessed 12th December 2011).

largest ever gatherings of Cornish people for any purpose, in what took on the proportions of an epic pilgrimage and briefly turned rugby into the main channel for an outpouring of pent-up Cornish sentiment, economic frustrations and solidarity ('I was there.'). As journalists observed, the supporters turned rugby into, 'a statement, if not of Celtic nationhood, then at least of their distinct identity.'[455] Rugby football was brought to Cornwall by returning public school boys c.1900 and was quickly transformed as the levelling sport of miners, farm labourers and the middle-classes alike, coming to embody egalitarianism as a core Cornish value.[456] For a prescriptive set of Revivalists, however, the fact that it was introduced disqualifies it from being 'indigenous' even whilst their own innovations and recent introductions from 'Celtic countries' are admitted without qualms. Whilst rejecting a central symbol of Cornishness, Bewnans Kernow enthusiastically embraces invented traditions that conform to generic Celticity but have far less basis in Cornish tradition than rugby. The failure to seize the opportunity to graft further Revivalist activities onto rugby is tactically baffling and demonstrates how the hold of ascribed Celtic models gets in the way of 'useable culture'. The fact is that Revivalism could use a hand from rugby but rugby needs no help from Revivalism.

The fact that Cornish tradition has long acquired elements from outside sources and re-defined them, is widely understood and has been actively communicated by academics and informed cultural practitioners who note the ongoing incorporation of new practices as a healthy sign of dynamism. New elements may, in other words, become embedded in an ongoing Cornish tradition which has long acquired and re-defined outside elements. Methodism, for example, both influenced culture and was shaped *in situ* by existing attitudes to become the main

---

[455] *The Independent*, 3 April 1989.
[456] See, Tom Salmon (1983), *The First Hundred Years - The Story of Rugby Football in Cornwall*, Illogan: Cornwall RFU; Kenneth Pelmear (1960), *Rugby in the Duchy, An Official History of the Game in Cornwall*, Falmouth: Cornwall RFU.

institutional vehicle for Cornish identity. The ongoing incorporation of new practices into working-class life was noted by Andrew George in the 1980s with the example of majorette bands in village carnivals, where the Cornishness (i.e. the 'distinctions') of the people involved and the social context ensured that the activities became part of their immediate Cornish culture.[457] We might speculate about whether the same can be said for the incorporation of samba bands in recent carnivals (Hayle, Looe, St. Agnes etc. 2011) but in principal there is really nothing to stop such seemingly exotic practices becoming re-defined as Cornish at some point. Revivalist innovators accordingly speak about eclecticism and point to examples as proof of growing confidence:

> A few years ago, people would never have done this but the young people have grown up with it [Cornish dancing] and they feel confident enough to interpret it.

> It's taken on a real life of its own [...] The new generation is taking it forward on its own terms.[458]

In practice, the picture is more complicated. Uninhibited eclecticism in parts of the Revival sits alongside a kind of narrow spectrum gathering of components in others. In the latter cases, the criteria for the admission of elements are shaped by enduring discourses that descend from early Revivalist prescriptions and, just as importantly, by the tastes of participants. What this means is that the activities serve as a selective filter for recruitment, attracting people who share a broad set of tastes that correspond to relatively stable aesthetics that further shape the discursive development of practice.

Constructivist arguments are advanced for the eclecticism of pioneering Revivalist researchers who have assembled an impressive canon of neo-Cornish dances and tunes by variously collecting, reconstructing and

---

[457] In B. Deacon, A. George and R. Perry (1987), op.cit., p. 153.
[458] Comments at Lowender Peran, 2010.

composing them. Some might not ultimately have originated in Cornwall, they acknowledge, but this does not mean they did not become Cornish and change in an embedded local context long ago. They cite examples from 'other Celtic counties', such as the transformation of French quadrilles into Kerry sets or of English step dancing into distinctly Irish dances, and the argument is extended to innovations and adoptions of new elements. This is all very open and permissive so it comes as a jolt when some of the same individuals exercise rigid prescriptivism on occasions, even falling out over the interpretation of dances that have been codified in the last thirty years (more recently under the auspices of the Cornish Dance Society) and objecting to innovations that have 'just gone too far'.[459] As observed in relation to Cameron's ideas on language, cultures as codes (*langue*) need to police individual expressions (*parole*) through cultural linguistic hygiene in order to maintain their integrity but problems can arise here because the dancers' variation on the Revivalist code is not the only version of Cornishness. It opposes deviant expressions, as *parole*, which may be 'useful' for different sections of the public.

Re-symbolization. A second wrong turn?

Certain Revivalist activities (e.g. new folkloric 'community celebrations' and revived customs) accord with overlapping counter-urban utopias, rural idylls and quests for alternative life-styles,[460] fitting new aesthetics and centres of interest associated with the Cultural Turn.[461] They are not wholly informed by 'insider' narratives and their appeal is not restricted to the indigenous Cornish. Consequently, they may be (mis)appropriated and rendered far more amenable to the new lifestyles of counter-urban in-migrants than to the lives of most Cornish people. Preferred aesthetics and narratives inside the Revival are enmeshed

---

[459] Comments directed at *Nos Lowen* dancing, discussed later.
[460] e.g. C. Tims and S. Wright, DEMOS Report (2006), op. cit. note 34.
[461] Frederick Jameson (1988), *The Cultural Turn : Selected Writings on the Postmodern 1983-1988*, London & New York: Version; cf. Peter Jackson, 'Mapping Culture', in Alisdair Rogers and Heather Viles (eds.) (2003), *The Student's Companion to Geography*, 2nd Edition, Oxford: Blackwell.

with those of variously interested 'outsiders' who imbue 'Celtic Cornwall' and the Cornish with qualities of Otherness and interact with them in shaping culture. Some of the most pronounced imaginings come from a myriad of English 'Celtophiles' for whom Cornwall is 'a place of pilgrimage'[462] and the antithesis of materialism and modernity. For some of them, 'Cornwall has come almost to represent a British Tibet; distinct, valued by others and threatened by an occupying territory...'[463]

Discourses of Otherness support questionable notions of traditionality, as though 'Celts', along with Native Americans and the Sami, cease to be authentic when they innovate or embrace mass culture and modernity. What, for example, can be made of the recently invented traditions of Allantide in St. Ives or the Montol Festival in Penzance? Both are conceived as community events and involve a similar mix of 'alternative', 'arty' in-comers and their Cornish counterparts who share a particularly theatrical and playful folkloric aesthetic that calls to (my) mind the masked procession in the 1973 film, *The Wicker Man.* At Allantide (Halloween, All Saints), a carnival troop of masked musicians in raggle-taggle, Oxfam-style fancy dress and hats, bedecked with greenery and ribbons, parades through St. Ives with an invented 'obby 'oss, Penglaz, topped with a horse's scull.[464] At Montol, similarly masked musicians process at night with lanterns, accompanied by 'guise dancers'[465] or mummers and a magnificently presented *Arluth Muskok* or 'Lord of Misrule'. Both events provide enjoyable experiences and as spectacles they also, no doubt, conform to expectations of a remote but accessible Cornwall with slightly pagan traditions and a carefree lifestyle, but this is where I suggest that problems may begin. First though, these are events that could not happen without

---

[462] Amy Hale, 'Selling Celtic Cornwall: Challenging Markets and Meanings?', in Kevin Meethan et al. (eds.) (2006), *Tourism, Consumption and Representation: Narratives of Place and Self,* Wallingford Oxon and Cambridge MA: C.A.B.I. International.
[463] John Lowerson cited in Amy Hale (2006), op. cit.
[464] http://vimeo.com/7377013 (Accessed, 29th November 2012).
[465] Alfred Kenneth Hamilton Jenkin (1934), *Cornish Homes and Customs,* London: J.M. Dent; William Botterell (1873), *Traditions and Hearthside Stories of West Cornwall,* Penzance.

imaginative recourse to items from Cornwall's cultural past and some of those items are genuine. Allantide is a recorded, eighteenth-century observance that involved gifts of apples, for instance. We know too that guise dancing, masks, decked hats and finery were all involved in Advent traditions, some of which were indeed 'like an Italian carnival'[466] so, to that degree, these events are faithful to the record. Even Montol, an attested Cornish word for the winter solstice, is probably not an unreasonable name for a new pre-Christmas festival. The notion of revival underpins the inventions whilst the obscuring practices of 'fake-lore' are in stark evidence. Thus, in 2012, I was asked to supply several translations for 'the revived solstice festival in Penzance, Montol', including one up-front request for 'a Cornish name to give [...] some false authenticity in Late Cornish?'[467]

But authenticity and invention are not the real concerns of finding 'useable culture' for resilience. What really matters is that, for the first time, events like these appear to be appropriating Revivalist production in a new, subcultural *bricolage*[468] that is not part of the Revivalist project to revitalize the cultural life of the Cornish and Nance's 'cultural tradition that is definably Cornish'. Despite the presence of Revivalist musicians with their processional dance tunes, the events do not convincingly connect with a wider Cornish community or contribute to the identity-based political and social project of the Cornish Movement.

What these two events illustrate is that Cornish people sometimes share counter-urban tastes and lifestyle aspirations, further complicating analysis and making it hard to differentiate between how undisputed insiders imagine and value cultural items and how outsiders do so. Once again, the point is that insider and outsider discourses are not separate from each other as tidily opposed categories but are entangled,

---

[466] A.K. Hamilton Jenkin – op cit., mentioned by individuals involved.
[467] Personal e-mail, 27th November 2012.
[468] cf. Dick Hebdidge (1979), *Subculture: The Meaning of Style*, London: Routledge.

interrelated and nuanced by gender, age, social class and individual experience. There are various ways in which to be an insider and there are degrees of insideness. Pick-and-mix innovations, as post-modern *bricolage* bring natives and in-migrants together constructively in creating leisure activities and lifestyles from multiple Cornish and Non-Cornish elements which may acquire new meanings and social uses. All of this said, there are, nevertheless, distinctly Cornish discursive formations that have hitherto defined Revivalist priorities and allowed deeply-felt Cornish sentiments, which are not always articulated verbally, to find emotional outlets in diverse activities. A suspicion, for further exploration, is that these discursive formations have been undergoing rapid transformations since the 1980s and that this results in the re-symbolization of Revivalist cultural elements. This may detract from their relevance, accessibility and social usefulness for some sections of society at the same time as making them appealing as pastimes for others. It is suggested that this re-symbolization is related to Cornwall's 'new circumstances' and the efforts of Revivalists to make activities appear safe, respectable and inclusive, rather than dangerous, extreme and exclusively Cornish. This has the side-effects of rendering activities more amenable to commodification and compromising a sense of Cornish ownership.

One of the things that appears to be happening is that activities that were created for nationalist motives in the second half of the twentieth century are being re-shaped by the 'alternative', counter-urban and leisure-orientated motives of the 'New Cornish' who constitute a growing proportion of participants. At the same time, the discourses of indigenous Cornish participants have changed so that they are less likely to relate activities symbolically to political nationalism or social concerns and more likely to emphasize the value of the activities themselves. A possibility for later discussion is that certain 'scenes' have become progressively distanced from typically Cornish 'structures of feeling' and that a 'Second Wrong Turn' is underway that it is even more important

than that of Nance and his contemporaries. Revivalism is, in effect, ceasing to be Revivalism in any meaningful sense and is becoming part of a superficial leisure pursuit that is subcultural rather than ethno-cultural. Revivalist activities that represented 'pastimes' for some Cornish people are (instead or as well) becoming 'past times' for other people who may or may not be Cornish and who are likely to be less concerned by the maintenance of a Cornish ethic community.[469]

At Maga's Cornish Language Conference in Lostwithiel, a woman confided that it had always been her dream to move to Cornwall and that learning Cornish helped her 'stay alert mentally', 'understand the place better' and 'meet people'. This perspective contrasts with those of learners from Mullion who spoke of 'getting our language back' and 'relearning' or of a woman from Tolvaddon who felt that learning was like 'remembering something we've forgotten.' In the Seiner's pub at Perran Porth, where musicians and singers meet for weekly 'Cornish music sessions' (traditional and neo-traditional songs and tunes), in-migrants outnumber Cornish people and conversations reveal that the activity is important to them, yet there is an indefinable quality to discussions of the material that are reminiscent of historical re-enactment groups. These are, as far as can be judged, part-time, subcultural hobbyists rather than fully immersed recruits to a wider Cornish culture and their activity can be easily compartmentalized like any other leisure pursuit.

At a St. Piran's Day event in *The Countryman* (formerly *The Pendarvis Arms* and a haunt of local choirs in the 1990s), a pub near Camborne, members of a recreational singing group met with others to share a repertoire of songs drawn from Revivalist selections of new and old folk songs and popular Cornish tradition (5th March 2011). These were circulated on song-sheets and the evening, organized by Revivalists, was

---

[469] Suggestions by Sharon Lowenna and Gus Williams.

billed as a 'shout', a term reportedly used for impromptu, close-harmony singing. A Methodist hymn ('Let the Lower Lights be Burning.') was included in an apparent nod to popular tradition. Strangely though, few of the participants were Cornish and the experience had the feel of an organized, English middle-class social gathering, lacking the complex behavioural and embodied 'distinctions' that insiders acquire through culturalization and the specific flavour of traditional Cornish singing. It seemed uncertain whether individuals from a Cornish choral tradition would really have been comfortable in such a setting, yet at least one new singer was delighted about 'getting involved in something Cornish'. Similarly, gig rowers at Fowey included a woman, recently arrived from Maidstone in Kent, who was thrilled to take part in, 'a sport that's been passed down the generations from rower to rower' and 'meet great local people and some real characters'.[470]

The suspicion must be that these activities fit the picturesque expectations that drive tourism and counter-urbanization, supplying folkloric traditions to support urban imaginings of 'country life'. Some offer safe, easily-acquired and superficial performances of Cornishness as a substitute for the deeper acquisitions of insiders. In this respect they contrast with the comprehensive cultural acquisitions that I encountered amongst working-class in-migrants who had engaged intimately and less self-consciously with Cornish people in their places of work and leisure. Surface-deep, subcultural acquisition does not embrace the 'inferior' cultural capital of traditional 'distinctions' with their potential to cast individuals as uneducated, rustic and working-class. Thus, 'wanna be Celts' can construct a social life around invented traditions without further engagement. In Brittany I heard the expression 'celtes de cœur'[471] and saw how people can dip into the demarcated activity of Breton dancing and traditional music without adapting further to the

---

[470] August 2011.
[471] cf., Marion Bowman, *'Cardiac Celts: images of the Celts in contemporary British paganism'*, in Graham Harvey and Charlotte Hardman (eds.), *Paganism Today*, London: Thorsons, pp. 242-251.

culture of the community. They have only to join a club in order to construct what one Breton critic calls, 'their own little world'.[472] To gain membership of Cornwall's burgeoning neo-traditional music scene, it similarly suffices to learn a few dances and songs and the navigational references are to festivals, in-scene figures, groups and (re)invented tunes and dances, - not inter-generational community stories and knowledge.

New activities may be defined by specific groups in their early stages, before they are embedded in community practice, thus establishing customary meanings that can restrict subsequent participation and social use. An example is *nos lowen* dancing (at first written, *noze looan*), created in the late 1990s by the dancer Karen Brown and Revivalist musicians from the groups Dalla and Sowena. Far from being fake-lore, the *nos lowen* ('happy night') was conceived as an innovative departure and was upfront about doing something new. Neo-traditional dancing had, until then, been exclusively presented in the *troyl* format, devised in the 1970s on the lines of the Scottish céilidh and Irish céilí. The inventors of the *nos lowen* braved criticisms and hostility from adherents to the self-referential norms and rules of 'Cornish dancing' which had become firmly established despite the scene itself being little more than twenty years old. Inspiration for the *nos lowen* was found in the creative fusions of traditional music with rock and jazz and other influences in Brittany. There, the similarly named *fest noz* is a widespread feature of cultural life that nearly everyone knows about and which in December 2012 was inscribed on UNESCO's list of 'Intangible Cultural Heritage'.[473] Thousands of people are involved and there are numerous professional musicians and television coverage. At a conference on urban planning that I attended in 2010, all of the key speakers (business leaders, public decision-makers and architects) and

---

[472] Comments by Catherine Le Blay.
[473] http://www.unesco.org/new/en/media-services/single-view/news/harnessing_the_power_of_living_heritage_for_a_more_peaceful_world/ (Accessed 22nd December 2012.)

most of the public were able to join in impromptu Breton dancing afterwards. The deliberate aim in Cornwall was to create a similarly accessible and socially pervasive activity and there was a desire to attract a youthful public, just as had been achieved by the Bretons. The architects hoped that it would be positively associated with non-Revivalist dynamics in Cornish culture such as surfing, gig rowing and mainstream popular dance cultures. By good fortune, *nos lowen* came in the wake of rave and trance dance cultures and coincided with a fashion for 'world music'. The Afro Celt Sound System had launched its first album (1996) fusing Irish and African music in electronic dance rhythms and Breton bands were averaging a C.D. release per week so the *nos lowen* concept was timely. Its music was punchy and rhythmically insistent and serpent-like dances with simple neo-traditional steps were devised for ease of learning. Poster designs reflected contemporary youth cultures, rather than the folkloric imagery and in next to no time the *nos lowen* had a regular following, had featured professionally at the Eden Project, no less, had teamed up with a global 'cyber-fest noz' and seemed set for success. So how successful has it become, some twelve or so years after its launch? That depends upon which criteria are applied. *Nosow lowen* now happen all over Cornwall and several new bands of predominantly young musicians have emerged. The name *nos lowen* has entered the vocabulary of Revivalists and some events are large and well attended, for example, those on the C.U.C. Tremough Campus. For all this success though, the *nos lowen* has not yet become embedded within the popular culture of the indigenous Cornish, young or otherwise, and remains part of a subcultural scene. A partial and controversial explanation is that most of its inventors did not come from strongly Cornish backgrounds and had social networks that did not reach far into the native working class. Consequently, the nos lowen began life with a small, enthusiastic following composed of friends and acquaintances who were disproportionately middle-aged, non-Cornish and 'arty'. A small teenage element was furnished by members of the dance group *Otta Nei 'Moaz* but there were few people between the ages of twenty and thirty-five.

Just as importantly, the proportion of indigenous Cornish people, regardless of any age, gender and social background, was far lower than in the general population. The 'feeling' produced reflected the dispositions and attitudes of participants who further shaped the scene visually and socially so that it had soon been defined, not as a cool space for the young Cornish, fresh from a day of surfing, but as part of the 'alternative', leisure-orientated lifestyle of an identifiable group of in-migrants.

The leading nos lowen group Dalla [publicity photo.].

These accounts appear to contradict the pro-position/proposition that conscious Cornish cultures may be 'employed for community resilience' but they relate to specific discursive formations, not the whole Cornish Movement. Targeting them is about reflecting upon practice with the understanding that it can change. With this disclaimer in mind, it is hypothesized that where the 'usefulness' of practice is reduced, this is sometimes the result of tenets and aesthetics that circulate discursively and produce discordant cultural hygiene. Where these clash with popular Cornishness, the frequently-stated Revivalist aim of 'promoting Cornish Culture' risks further devaluing identities that do not have reference to an ethno-cultural project or 'Celtic' models. The criteria of Celtic models can lead to innovations that are presented as 'the real thing' without having the embedded community context and

participation that would afford them the credibility of grass-roots endorsement. In fact, prescription can lead to reactions, such as those of a Cornish decorator in his forties who described some participants at the Golowan festival as 'Corn-wallies' or of a St. Just barman who complained that performers at Lafrowda Day were, 'play-actors who think they're more Cornish than everybody else'. The Indie Rock band, *Hanter Hir* ('Half long'), sometimes sings in Cornish and after a gig in Redruth a member expressed irritation at the assumed monopoly of 'Celtic' neo-tradition in definitions of Cornish music, saying, 'The folkies think they own it but we're Cornish so our music is just as Cornish as what they do'.

Prescriptions can be imposed as 'better-than-Cornish', underlining the perceived inferiority of Cornish cultures that, because the indigenous middle-class in reduced, are associated with the working-class. This risks creating a double illegitimacy whereby not only do working-class Cornish people have low cultural capital in respect to the prevalent/dominant culture (homogenized as 'English' in reductionist accounts), but in addition they are not properly Cornish because they have not learnt to act out the 'Celtic' script of cultural hygienes. This resembles experiences of supposed failure in other situations where ethno-cultural activism privileges and ascribes essentialist attributes, as in the African diaspora for example, where versions of Negritude, a close cousin of Celtitude,[474] are performed. For young adults involved in Revivalism, the back reference is not necessarily to the near, known culture of parents, - Nance's 'continuous tradition',[475] - but to uncritical, reductionist histories of a distant past as semi-fictional post-memory. Imagining identity is thus relatively unbound by inter-generational narratives that are anchored in the 'facts' (real or idealized) of the past, leaving a vacant stage upon which the supposed ethnic

---

[474] cf. Concept of 'négritude' in Aimé Césaire (2000 [1950]), *Discourse on Colonialism*, New York: Monthly Review Press; Frantz Fanon (1967), *Black Skin, White Masks*, translated by C.L. Markmann, New York: Grove Press.
[475] Robert Morton Nance (1925), op. cit.

culture of unknown predecessors may be acted out. Some of the resulting acts are unrecognizable to the inconvenient memory of elders but they are 'wishfully' and sincerely upheld as having had a previous existence. This compares, not only with the invented traditions[476] of 'indigenous European minorities' but also with the cultural expressions of young Black British people who have a similar cultural distance from West Indian grandparents and a like exposure to essentialist representations and the affective connections of a diasporic 'Black Atlantic'.[477] Attempts at collective valorization may lead to acting out ascribed identities (as primitive, rhythmic, physical, sexualized, aggressive etc.) in cultural forms which recreate inferiority through binary opposition to the dominant culture. Some Revivalist responses also do this, acting out identity as pre-modern, imaginative, intuitive, emotional, spiritual and disorganized.

This chapter began by insisting upon the heterogeneity of Revivalism(s) and some examples show that dismissive caricatures can miss instances of strong community engagement and usefulness. *Bagas Crowd* ('Fiddle Group') is a large group of people of mixed ages and backgrounds who gather at well-organized and attended (around 35 participants at any one time) fortnightly work-shops for fiddlers and other neo-traditional musicians. The leader and teacher, Frances Bennett, aims to spread music in the wider community and works hard to make this happen. The sessions are held in rooms at Threemilestone Methodist Church so that musicians rub shoulders with people at a regular community coffee morning. The 'New Cornish' by far outnumber natives and have a similar outward profile to the kind of musicians found in English folk clubs but this does not stop the Cornish present from viewing the activity as theirs. Just as importantly, the participants of all backgrounds take the music out into the community where it

---

[476]Eric Hobsbawm and Terence Ranger (eds.) (1983, 1989), op. cit.
[477] Paul Gilroy (1993), *The Black Atlantic*, London: Verso; Paul Gilroy (1997), 'Diaspora and the Detours of Identity', in K. Woodward (ed.), *Identity and Difference,* London: Sage.

supports a wide range of events that bring people together in friendship.[478]

The yearly Tom Bawcock's Eve (23rd December) in Mousehole is one such occasion. This 'community celebration' was elaborated during the 1980s and 90s from low-key festivities which had already been reshaped by early Revivalists. These had built upon a fading tradition[479] by recycling and adding elements, including an old wedding march with new Cornu-English words by Nance.[480] The more recent innovations have taken this further, creating a high-profile event. New elements sit comfortably alongside older ones. A lantern parade, in the style of the locally-based 'Kneehigh Theatre', has been created with processional music from multiple sources played in a folk style and traditional Cornish carols (*Hark the Glad Sound, Lo the Eastern Sages Rise, Hark what Music...*) and songs[481] are sung on the quay with the participation of local choirs and to the back-drop of Mousehole's celebrated Christmas Lights, a spectacular display depicting boats and seasonal themes that was started in 1963.[482] What had been a fading local story about a fisherman saving Mousehole from starvation has thus become assured as a participatory festival that supports collective memory and reinforces community. Alan Kent cites sceptical older locals who believe that the celebrations have been invented by 'incomers'[483] but in reality it involves the school, local choir members, the RNLI, clubs and a broad cross-section of the population, bringing natives and in-migrants together in a pre-Christmas bonding exercise. Its architects were mainly Cornish people, even if some were not from Mousehole, and their desire

---

[478] I attended in December 2011.
[479] Robert Morton Nance, *Old Cornwall,* (1927); http://www.cornishculture.co.uk/tom.htm (Accessed, 19th June 2012).
[480] Song published in Ralph Dunstan, *Cornish Dialect and Folk Songs*, (1932).
[481] Carols including, , (Participatory observation).
[482] http://www.mouseholelights.org.uk/ (Accessed 5th January 2013.)
[483] Alan Kent, 'From Ingraine to Callin' 'ome Mouzel: Two Paradigms of Memory, Language and Literature in Cornwall', (Prepublication copy: 2012); Discussion with Alan Kent (April, 2012)

was to reinvigorate community life.[484] Of course, various individuals and groups imagine the event differently and tourism cashes in on it to economic advantage,[485] but it contributes to solidarity and shows that innovation can enhance tradition and respond to change.

---

[484] Conversations participants.
[485] E.g. http://www.classic.co.uk/holiday-cottages-near-tom-bawcocks-eve-5.html (Accessed, 19th June 2012).

Chapter Six

'Proper Cornish': Revivalism and Residual Tradition.

It has been suggested that there is discordance between certain Revivalist cultural hygienes and traditional identity constructions that renders the latter doubly illegitimate, firstly in relation to prevalent/dominant cultures and secondly with regard to prescribed ideas of 'Cornish culture'. One purpose of this chapter is therefore to further explore this incongruence and consider whether it is possible to fuse Revivalist and non-Revivalist strands usefully. It has also been proposed that Revivalist cultures are undergoing re-symbolization as part of a subcultural, counter-urban lifestyle. The discussion accordingly has an eye to whether the 'wrong turn' of earlier Revivalists and the 'second wrong turn' identified here can be addressed so that the inclusive, grass-roots aspects of Nance's project may be salvaged and made more relevant and effective for the social and emotional uses discussed. The notion of *habitus* is proposed as a framework for relating the uses of culture to multiple forms of capital and to a multidimensional group identity.

Without an ethnographic foundation and a sense of history it is hard to elaborate discussion or consider practical intervention, so this chapter begins with a brief sketch of a non-Revivalist cultural continuum that, internal heterogeneity notwithstanding, has hitherto constituted widely recognized, popular ideas of Cornishness. Its past trajectory is described using perspectives from the 'new Cornish historiography' allowing tentative suggestions to be made about the present context.

This cultural continuum encompasses received and common sense notions of identity encountered during this inquiry and referred to variously as 'popular', 'grass-roots', 'proper', 'old-style', 'working-class', 'fitty',[486] 'genuine' and 'traditional' by 'insiders'. These names are problematic but all identify a changing, far from uniform culture that nevertheless carries with it a sense of continuity and unity with a long past. It is a construction that, for all its earlier origins and subsequent developments, 'was transformed in the crucible of industrialization',[487] so appropriately it is in describing the vigorous industrial society of the mid nineteenth century that Philip Payton coined the name 'Classic Cornishness'[488] to describe what he reasonably views as its historic zenith, - a period defined by confidence, innovation and the creation of institutions. Although it would be inaccurate to give precise dates for an evolving construction, it can be said to have provided a coherent, continuous and defined culture from c.1800 until the 1950s, despite the boom and bust of mining fortunes and the emergence of Celticism.[489] By the beginning of this period, a 'first wave' of what Bernard Deacon calls 'Methodist-mining culture' had taken shape in West Cornwall and this developed further in a 'second wave' of change from c.1870 to 1920s.[490] In the 1950s its features still marked the lives of most Cornish people in a form that we could reasonably call Late Classic Cornishness. Throughout this period it formed a cultural identity that was easily recognized by others (notably by visitors and in the overseas destinations of emigrants) as well as by the Cornish themselves and was described by commentators, even emerging in novels by native writers and Australian newspaper cartoons.[491] It

---

[486] Cornu-English *fitty, vitty* means, 'appropriate', 'fitting'.

[487] Bernard Deacon, '"The Hollow Jarring of the Distant Steam Engine": Images of Cornwall between West Barbary and Delectable Duchy', in E. Westland (ed.), *Cornwall, The Cultural Construction of Place*, Ch.1, Penzance: Patten Press & Institute of Cornish Studies (1997), p.10.

[488] Philip Payton (1992) op. cit.; cf. Bernard Deacon (2004), *The Cornish Family*, Fowey: Cornwall Editions Ltd., p.189.

[489] See, Bernard Deacon (1997) op. cit.

[490] Bernard Deacon (1993), 'And shall Trelawney die? The Cornish identity', in P.J. Payton (ed.), *Cornwall Since the War: The Contemporary History of a European Region*, Redruth: Dyllansow Truran and Institute of Cornish Studies, p. 205.

[491] See, Alan M. Kent, *Pulp Methodism: The Lives and Literature of Silas, Joseph and Salome Hocking, Three Cornish Novelists,* St. Austell: Cornish Hillside Publications,

retained much that was rural and agricultural and incorporated pre-existing elements, including those centuries-old traditions that appeal to 'Celtic' Revivalists, such as Cornish wrestling, saint's day parish feasts, crying the neck, trigging, hurling, hedge-building, festivals and survivals from Cornish;[492] but, for all that, it was modern and had technical progress and a strong work ethic at its core. Whilst distinctly Cornish, it was connected to a wider industrial culture and came to share features with other mining areas so that it was, 'by the 1900s closer in form to that in South Wales and parts of Northern England'.[493] This was the period in which rows of terraced houses, non-conformist chapels, industrial buildings (Cornish engine houses), working men's institutes, public reading rooms and acres of mineral waste (tailings) became ubiquitous features of the landscape of these areas and when respectable working-class activities included choirs, brass and silver bands, team sports and self-improvement through education.[494]

Although in its earliest phase this industrial culture was restricted to parts of West Cornwall, it came to define Cornishness everywhere. Most parishes, even the most rural, have had mines or quarries at one time or another in the last two hundred years and this along with the importance of the associated population and new institutions, meant that this 'classical popular Cornish culture'[495] spread throughout Cornwall to a greater or lesser extent. The particular combination of old and new elements and the narratives of an ethnic history accompanying it, gave it continuity with long-standing traditions of identity and it was further distinguished by the global dimension of Cornish mining,

---

(2002); Edward Bosenketh, *Tin*, (London, 1888); Cartoons by Oswald Pryor (1881-1971) appeared in Australian magazines and newspapers, http://adb.anu.edu.au/biography/pryor-oswald-8127 (Accessed 2nd January 2012.)

[492] *Cornish wrestling*: Popular until 1920s. Similar to Breton and Cumberland wrestling; *Crying the neck*: Former harvest custom; *Trigging*: Collecting shelf-fish at low tide; *Hurling*: Sport widely practiced in the 18th century but now confined as a 'custom' to St.Colomb and St.Ives.

[493] Bernard Deacon (1993), p. 205.

[494] Cornwall has a higher proportion of industrial wasteland than any English or Welsh county.

[495] B. Deacon, A. George and R. Perry (1987), op. cit., p. 152.

overseas working and migration. One result was that already democratic, egalitarian and self-sufficient attitudes and manners were reinforced by experience in North America. Tastes, attitudes and even cultural items were incorporated seamlessly so that some remain today and are thought of as thoroughly Cornish. What is more, there is still lingering awareness and memories of transnationality in the first half of the twentieth century. For example, a retired mining engineer, Alan Trevarthen, remembers returning miners and growing up with the idea that America was an extension of home, almost to the point of feeling American and this had predisposed him to his own international mining career.[496] A small illustration in local folklore is the nick-name 'Goss Moor Yanks' for people from the Clay District, still understood by middle aged locals as an affectionate reference to supposedly working-class American manners and tastes in an area with past traditions of working in the U.S.A.[497] So, to caricature Late Classic Cornishness for the uninitiated, it would be reasonable to say that it was semi-rural, shared certain practices and forms with the English coalfields and industrial South Wales and combined democratic manners, tastes and speech patterns that vaguely recalled the American Mid West. As renewed exchanges reveal, it is also with derivatives of Classic Cornishness that many in the Cornish diaspora identify and this is evidenced in the content of overseas Cornish festivals in Australia, The U.S.A. and Mexico and by the centres of interest of visiting 'cousin Jacks and Jennies'.[498] It therefore supports reinvigorated transnational networks that have:

> ...an important part to play in the on-going project to build a mature Cornish identity for the twenty-first century: outward-looking but secure and confident about its past; assured of its uniqueness, but with

---

[496] Conversations.

[497] Discussion with members of the St. Dennis Anti-Incinerator Group (November, 2011).

[498] Discussions in the Cornish Studies Library and with Philip Hosken of the Trevithick Society. See, Philip Hosken, 'The Cornish Overseas' in S. Parker (ed.), Cornwall Marches On!: Keskerth Kernow 500, Truro, (1998) pp. 129-136.

a capacity for inclusiveness; an historical European region, but one with real global associations.[499]

From Classic Cornishness to Proper Cornish.

Deacon and Payton have both charted the decline and fossilization of Classic Cornishness.[500] In his work on the collapse of mining and the 'Great Emigration' that accompanied it, Payton calls Cornwall's socio-cultural and economic predicament in the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries, 'The Great Paralysis',[501] and he considers that 'the effects upon Cornish society and its culture were 'inevitably traumatic'.[502] The Cornish could no longer think of themselves with (over)confidence and pick-wielding swagger as supplying a global elite of mining engineers and therefore sank into nostalgic uncertainty and inertia.[503] Deacon writes that, 'The classical popular Methodist culture began to weaken and the debris of a shattered economy became the site of a fossilised culture as the popular culture ceased to change and develop.'[504] These accounts describes a condition in which Cornish society lost its collective sense of purpose and worth, leading to a generalized stagnation in economic, cultural, social and political life and to a redefined form of peripherality that was to prove lasting.[505] Jane Korey adds that the symbols of fading occupational cultures no longer carried clear connotations, creating a 'semantic vacuum'[506] into which other signifiers, namely those of tourism and Revivalism, could come.

---

[499] Bernard Deacon with Sharron Schwartz and David Holman (2004), *The Cornish Family – The Roots of Our Future*, Cornwall Editions: Fowey, p.14
[500] Philip Payton (1992), p.119.
[501] Philip Payton (1992), p.119-138; Payton (1996), p.248.
[502] Philip Payton (1992), p.128.
[503] See, Philip Payton (1992), p. 128.
[504] Bernard Deacon, 'Cornish Culture or the Culture of the Cornish', *Cornish Banner*, November, 1986.
[505] See Philip Payton (1992), op. cit., Chapter Eight, pp.167-191.
[506] Jane Korey (1992), op. cit.

To qualify this story though, we may observe that although the paralysis was certainly 'great' and 'traumatic', it was far from complete and did not, after all, bring Classic Cornishness to a shuddering end or wholly erase its narratives. Certainly it lost its erstwhile dynamism and features became redundant or vulnerable but they did not disappear altogether. Cornish identity continued to be transmitted by a now moribund culture that provided sentimental motivations for the late twentieth-century expansion of language learning and invented traditions. A new generation of Revivalists felt passionately enough about Cornishness to respond culturally and politically when it was threatened and, more often than not, the innovators behind the more successful efforts to popularize the language, develop a Cornish dance scene and engage politically were close to Late Classic Cornishness, whether they embraced it unconditionally or sought to move on in a negotiated way.

Only twenty years ago Jane Korey observed that, 'all the elements people in Pendeen identify as typically "Cornish" - originated in its period of industrialization.'[507] Such a bold statement would be exaggeration today but it would not be entirely unfounded. Despite the loss of its industrial basis, many people still relate Cornishness to a low-profile, low-status popular culture that is derived in part from the 'Classic' construction and they think of it as 'Proper Cornish'. Even if they do not personally engage in its obvious practices or have close familiarity with its cultural forms, they symbolically refer to it, often obliquely, as representing a recent past that was more Cornish and a present-day range of features descends from Late Classic Cornishness genealogically. For this reason the familiar expression, 'Proper Cornish', is taken as a catch-all category and applied to the past, present and possible future trajectories of a loose assemblage of practices and identifications. This has the disadvantage of sounding and often being prescriptive but the advantage is that it is widely understood, so much

---

[507] Jane Korey (1991), op. cit.

so in fact that it names at least one business, occurs on tee-shirts and car stickers and crops up regularly in online social networks.[508]

Just mentioning 'Proper Cornish' to young adults is sometimes enough to elicit personal identifications with behaviours, attitudes and practices that partly derive from Classic Cornishness, even if that is not immediately obvious. This is interesting because there is an apparent paradox in the reality that young adults have fewer traditional markers of Cornishness (notably accent), whilst often voicing identities that are constructed in alterity to Englishness (by which they evidently refer to privileged versions rather than Englishness in general). A material factor might be that sufficient numbers believe they have experienced economic and social marginalization (conversational themes) but this cannot be the main reason. A more plausible explanation is that established identity narratives have been passed on within intimate, family and community-based networks despite breaks in the transmission of cultural form which depend more on external factors, like institutional presence and collective cultural capital. Today's young adults are the children of a consciously Cornish generation, influenced by Cornish nationalisms, Revivalism and community campaigns and this parental generation appears to have communicated attitudes and sentiments but few specific practices. Whilst outwardly and materially young adults are less 'distinctive' than previous generations, their identities are shaped by parental narratives and sharpened by direct experience. Thus, Nickie, a student at Falmouth University, attributes her Cornish sentiments to, 'growing up here and listening to my Mum and Dad and going round my Gran's on Sundays and just ordinary things really', but she is also annoyed by 'the way we get ripped off' and 'disrespected' and feels, 'more and more Cornish'.[509] Will Kendall,[510] a twenty-seven year-old Truro College student from Porthleven whose

---

[508] 'Proper Cornish' is the name of a food company, also featuring on tee-shirts: http://www.kernowclothing.com/ (Accessed 25th November 2012.)
[509] Converation in the Stannary Bar, Tremough. November 2010.
[510] Conversations.

brothers are fishermen, echoes historical egalitarianism, informality and non-subservience:

> Cornishness is a different mentality. / We are less serious about ourselves and less pompous. / Everybody is on the same level. / It's a more honest, - less to do with appearances. / People are disobedient and break the rules.[511]

His account reflects the 'new circumstances' in suggesting that 'Cornish is mainly working-class' and he relates attitudes to 'the influence of trades around you', citing work situations: - building, fishing, garages, shops and a clothes factory. His account and those of other young adults re-filters vestiges of Classic Cornishness, merging them with nuanced subcultural influences (local experiences of wider phenomena), Revivalism ('The language is vital.') and the alternative, leisure-orientated lifestyles of counter-urbanization. He has encountered the Cornish Movement's histories ('The 1497 Rebellion', 'what the miners achieved') and campaigns (The cross-Tamar constituencies, second-homes). An HND student, Liz Hicks, thinks that:

> It's partly about work, - finding some if you can, getting stuck in... Cornish people do all sorts to make a living and they have to work hard, no turning your nose up [...] We've always had to do that [...] the miners and the farmers in the old days...

She adds that Cornishness involves, 'not looking down on people because of what job they do and not looking up to them either [laughs]'. The young language revivalist, Elizabeth Stewart, also identifies traits associated with Proper Cornishness as 'strengths' (human and social capital) and alludes to traditions of work, endurance and making-do. Her contemporaries are, 'hardy and resourceful... survivors... adaptable and reliable' and far from enjoying a 'slower pace of life' some of them, 'get up at the crack of dawn - have two or three jobs - and are always

---

[511] Will Kendall, *Non verbatim.*

rushing about doing things.' In numerous conversations with young adults and in social media, long established narratives are detectable and merge with the Cornish Movement's discourses, despite the low profile of both in traditional media and mainstream education (the common complaint of activists concerning schools and the media).

Unsurprisingly, 'Proper Cornishness' shares cultural features with other post-industrial areas, as I was reminded by a Cornish steam enthusiast at Trevithick Day (28.4.11), and by a trade unionist, originally from near Sheffield, who described Camborne as 'home from home'. Cornish people are sometimes aware of this. A former civil servant from Stithians had supported Cornish holidays for Durham miners' children during the 1980s coal strike, - adding that her grandfather had been a tin miner and that she had grown up near a granite quarry. Yet even without these conscious identifications, which probably concern few people, it is clear that there are shared post-industrial features. One aspect is the continuance of recreational activities associated with industry. These result in exchanges of choirs, bands and rugby teams (core symbols) that probably involve more people than the expanding exchanges of Celtic Festivals. For instance, Cornwall International Male Voice Choir Festival (27th April to 2nd May, 2011) hosted choirs from former industrial areas and Cornwall Youth Brass Band attends festivals with musicians from similar areas. But these obvious activities are only part of the picture. Far more important are the qualitative aspects of post-industrial conditions, - the forms of social capital that they engender, the kinds of emotional responses they produce and enduring tastes.

At a meeting in St. Dennis Working Men's Club (November 2011), members of St. Dennis Anti-Incinerator Group were aware of having things in common with other areas. One person told me that, 'The Clay villages are a bit like the old coal fields, really.' and in an oblique

reference to social organization, another added, 'We've got a similar set-up'. An organizer was in contact with an anti-incinerator group in Hull and said, 'It's just like here in the Clay. They get dumped on, just the same'. Others from the area, including the writer, teacher and academic Alan Kent, confirm qualified recognition of similarities and supply anecdotal accounts of social organization and attitudes.

At first sight there is a problem with the argument that what people identify as 'Proper Cornishness' is significantly derived from Classic Cornishness. That is because the activities so far cited and the involvement of a minority of young people is not enough to constitute a general continuity between generations, even allowing for surprising levels of participation. Many practices that defined Cornish culture a generation ago have declined to the point that young adults have little direct experience or knowledge of them. Even middle-aged people who relate to them are likely to do so nostalgically and symbolically rather than as aspects of daily life and they sometimes do so through second-hand memories from parents and grand-parents. This moves them into the realm of remembered difference, if not even further into post-memory and a sense of collective experience that is founded on things that nobody can actually remember.

There are, however, less tangible ways in which present-day cultures have been shaped by Classic Cornishness and some continuities are qualitative and relate to its 'structures of feeling'[512] in a modified, post-industrial form. Thus passed on social norms, emotional responses and reflexes are the basis of 'Proper Cornishness'. Bourdieu describes 'tastes of necessity' whereby the characteristic preferences within social groups (and therefore cultural capital) are related to economic means.[513] In the Cornish case, enduring tastes and attitudes, shaped by past economic

---

[512] See, Raymond Williams (1988), *Keywords - A Vocabulary of Culture and Society*, London: Fontana.

[513] E.g. Pierre Bourdieu (1979), *La Distinction,* op. cit.

constraints, might be said to predispose people to the new cultural selections that they make and even to influence their preferences of diet, leisure pursuits, dress and music. In this way, Late Classic Cornishness has shaped the space into which new but not particularly distinctive aspects of mass culture are adopted. The result corresponds to a phenomenon that Alan Kent calls 'residual Cornishness'. Asked if residual Cornishness is viable, he answers, 'It has to be because it's all there is... We have to take it from where it is now.' In other words it is the appropriate place from which to innovate and create so as to valorize what Kent also connects to 'working-class Cornishness' and distances from contradictory aspects of Revivalism.[514] This suggests a people-centred approach (much like student-centred learning) and the view that 'residual Cornishness' is relevant is apparently shared by others who also represent it in their work.[515]

To sum up, it seems that there are still significant levels of continuity in the heterogeneous, identities of many young adults and that they have more to do with the slippery areas of taste, attitudes and human relationships than defined activities. The multi-generational aspects of this may be experienced at Trevithick Day in Camborne, one of Cornwall's largest community events, held each year at the end of April and conceived as a celebration of Cornishness, motivated by the Cornish Movement's concerns. Almost all of the main components are drawn from the post-industrial culture of the immediate area and relatively few come from Revivalism as such, despite prominent uses of its symbols and the presence of buskers playing neo-Cornish folk. A procession of steam engines is accompanied by the predominantly young Camborne Town Band and there are street performances by Male Voice Choirs. Musical performances and competitions, although eclectic in content (classical and operatic recitals, popular song, film music, jazz etc.), follow in a tradition of musicianship that stems from industrial

---

[514] Conversations and e-mails; Kent's novels also celebrate this continuity.
[515] E.g. In the work of film-makers associated with Awen and with Cornish National Cinema, seen, for example, at The Cornish Film Festival, 4-6th November 2011

culture and they take place in the chapels and halls that it created. The inclusion of rock cover bands, percussion groups, country and western dance, samba, disco, mime artists, stilt-walkers and assorted elements of wider, popular cultures simply emphasizes the extent to which the area's everyday culture is typically post-industrial. Mobile hamburger and hot-dog stands complete the picture.

An Dasserghyans.

It has been argued, convincingly, that the earlier Revival (*An Dasserghyans*) responded to paralysis and offered ways to move on, producing a dynamic 'resurgence' or 'cultural renaissance' that re-imagines identity and reaches back into a pre-modern past for inspiration.[516] It has also been suggested that Revivalism has developed in response to new circumstances and it certainly provides spaces in which Cornish interests (economic, social, cultural, environmental etc.) are discussed. Past members of a language group based on social activity recall that it gave them a place where they could 'be with other people that feel the same' and 'say what we really think' (recalling 1970s-80s 'women's groups'). One person had probably been motivated to become a school governor and parish councillor 'because of learning Cornish'.[517] Someone who attended dance practices in Carnon Downs said, 'It's the one time when I can talk about Cornish things and just gossip.' Such spaces contribute to the networks of the Cornish Movement and thus to community campaigns and initiatives and can also promote social cohesion. We nevertheless need to be cautious about positive assessments and consider whether there are problems in some of the relationships this 'renaissance' has with 'Proper Cornishness'. This means taking account of heterogeneity within Cornish society. Revivalist ideas inspire creativity but it is not sure how

---

[516] Bernard Deacon (2007), p.216; Philip Payton (1989), p.239.
[517] Comments by people who had attended a group at Murdoch House in Redruth.

much of this benefits or even reaches disadvantaged people whose families and communities bear the greatest inheritance of Payton's 'Great Paralysis'. What if some people have indeed embraced Revivalism and moved on but left others worse off than they would be otherwise? Conscious and symbolic Cornish expressions have certainly multiplied and spread and new activities have emerged, changing the cultural landscape, but it is not at all sure that Cornish culture as a whole has evolved as creatively and dynamically as sometimes claimed. The Revivalist repertoire may not adequately fill the further semantic vacuum left by the last round of industrial and agricultural job losses in the 1980s and 90s.

Another possibility for sections of the population is that described in the 1980s by David Penhaligon M.P. when he claimed that Cornwall had 'never recovered'[518] from the consequences of industrial decline. Instead parts of the community have arguably experienced a second-stage paralysis brought on by the socio-economic marginalization that results from tourism-led in-migration and a reduced native middle-class. Alongside the Revival's sites of creativity and popular uptake of its symbolic repertoire (flags, Cornish tartan, Cornish names, music...), there is a still a relatively stagnant, post-industrial culture where activities from Classic Cornishness continue with diminished energy, participation and achievement. It is this assemblage that has been left behind by the Revival's pursuit of Celtic models and undermined by the material and demographic realities of the New Cornwall. The consequences are that, with notably exceptions, it has not developed imaginatively and creatively to give relevant, contemporary forms. That would be all right if communities had really moved on to embrace new practices and found a source of esteem within them but there are sections of society that have limited access to core Revivalism and few benefits from any cultural capital it accrues. The fact that they neither participate nor gain status by indirect association suggests that

---

[518] David Penhaligon, M.P. Speech in Camborne, September 1986.

Revivalist innovations have not always been grafted onto 'Proper Cornishness' accessibly, despite Nance's attempted synthesis, previously discussed. Some of the Revival's middle-class and 'arty' developments are somewhat removed from typical 'tastes of necessity'[519] and cultures of 'making do' (a feature of present-day culture with late 19th century foundations)[520] that are naturalized within the worst-off fractions of Cornish society.

Cornishness is not socially homogenous despite egalitarian myths and an often remarked lack of class demarcation. In practice, there are constellations of middle-class taste and attitudes that many Cornish people share with people throughout Britain and these shape Revivalist cultural hygienes disproportionately. A difficulty is that activities framed by these tastes can render them, not so much inaccessible but unappealing and uncomfortable to large sections of society and they do not, on the face of it, valorize forms of Cornishness that are closely associated with the working-class, despite being imagined as more legitimately Cornish. For example, after an all too typical Cornish language event that included fiddle and accordion music, neo-traditional dance and lengthy discussions of comparative Celtic linguistics, two 'down-to-earth' Cornish learners who I had talked into coming described it as 'a bit of a weird night'. This, their first experience of a social event in Cornish, had been one of mild culture shock and bewilderment. Cornish appealed to them and they were already learning in a friend's home but had this specific 'scene' been their first encounter they might not have started. A week later though, one of them told me it had been his first taste of 'full-on Cornish music'. He had not liked it but assumed it must represent something more Cornish that he was not part of.

---

[519] Bourdieu's term, e.g. Pierre Bourdieu (1979), *La Distinction,* op. cit.
[520] See, Bernard Deacon, (1993), p. 205.

Frequent clashes between pretty performances of Celticity and non-Revivalist Cornishness could explain why some scenes do not attract more working-class people, yet for Revivalism to produce optimum benefits for community resilience and well-being it needs to provide symbolic identifications for people in less advantaged sections of society whether they take part or not. The issue was neatly identified by a student film-maker at a screening in Falmouth Polytechnic who whispered, 'What would they make of this crap up Pengegon?', a reference to one of Britain's poorest districts where fifty-eight percent of children live in poverty.[521]

If Cornishness is narrowly and prescriptively taken to be the 'Proper Cornish' spectrum, then there may be a paradoxical anti-Cornishness within some strands of Revivalism. Cath Camps has noted, for instance, that emphasis on the Cornish language is coupled with disrespect for Cornu-English that renders the latter more illegitimate and stigmatizing than it might be otherwise.[522] Certainly, it has been used for humour and short stories but there has been no assertive revaluing of accent and dialect of the kind seen in Yorkshire, Durham and Northumberland.[523] I pointedly asked Revivalists about Cornish accents and whilst I heard many positive affirmations, there were also comments of the type: 'We don't speak like that anymore.' and 'It makes us sound like yokels.' Some were glad that other people had accents but despite their own very Cornish origins, had little trace of local speech themselves. Strangely, for people who are resurrecting a language, several Cornish enthusiasts were dismissive. A woman at a 'Yeth an Werin' conversation group said that she missed hearing dialect but could not envisage using it and thought it was, 're dhiwedhes ha heb poynt' (too late and pointless), to try saving it. Far better, she thought,

---

[521] 'Deprivation and Child Poverty', Cornwall Council (2011).
[522] Cath Camps, Silencing the voice of the Cornish, unpublished Cert.Ed. assignment for Cornwall College [n.d.].
[523] Although maintained in Gorsedh Kernow competitions, http://www.gorsethkernow.org.uk

to concentrate on, 'agan tavas gwir, yn le rannyeth Sowsnek' (our true language, instead of an English dialect.).

A strand within Revivalism ignores or romantically reinvents the post-industrial present and community memory of industrial triumphs, twisting them to fit prevailing 'Celtic' models. The 'Cornish Culture' website illustrates this. It opens with a 'Cornish Calendar' of exclusively folkloric events and a search of the site reveals almost nothing from the 'Proper Cornish' spectrum. Choirs and bands merit four lines of text in contrast to twenty lines about the 'Cornish bagpipes', - 're-invented' from church images. We are informed that, 'Where the first generation of revivalists took the scraps of a dying Celtic Culture and re-grouped we are proud to able to provide a complete vibrant, Cornish culture partially revived, partially already there!'.[524] Unfortunately the suggestion that early twentieth-century Revivalists saved and restored the remnants of an authentic Celtic culture ignores the fact that the Cornish of their day already had a distinctive culture, - that of Late Classic Cornishness, - which had resulted, not from a failure to be conservatively pre-modern and Celtic but from the successful and adventurous embrace of modernity and innovation.

The complicated reality is that this website is well-intentioned and aims to serve a 'grass-roots movement' and 'encourage as many people as possible to take part in the exiting Cornish Culture if they be Cornish, Cornish residents, Cornish expats, lovers of Cornwall, or anyone else who feels they want to be involved.'[525] This and similar examples point to the possibility that even activities that overlook the Classic Cornish inheritance may be motivated by the sentiments that 'Proper Cornishness' generates. In this regard, the full picture of Revivalism is complex and varied but what seems to be happening is an internal

---

[524] A private, voluntary site. http://www.cornishculture.co.uk (Accessed, 24th June and 16th October, 2012)
[525] ibid.

struggle for meaning and ownership of which few protagonists are aware. 'Proper Cornish' motivations and meanings compete with the forms of re-symbolization previously described and there are re-negotiations of Revivalist prescriptions. If Revivalism were wholly inaccessible and disconnected from working-class lives there would be little point in looking to it as 'useable culture' for current purposes but aspects of it have been enthusiastically adopted and incorporated into ongoing constructions of 'Proper Cornishness', - a trend noted by Deacon who observed of the uptake of Revivalist symbols in the 1990s that, 'At last, the gulf between popular and Revivalist culture seemed to have been bridged with this co-mingling of cultural symbols. Popular culture, Celticity and history were merging.'[526] This sounds as though the 'Nancian Synthesis' has started to come about but even if that is so, Revivalism is some way from connecting effectively with a wider public. It produces ways to champion, re-invent and perpetuate 'Proper Cornishness' as well as scenes which undermine it, and all sorts of permutations and negotiated relationships exist, as two examples will illustrate:

Holman-Climax Male Voice Choir was established in 1940 at the Climax Rock-Drill and Engineering Works that manufactured mining and industrial equipment until the 1990s.[527] The factory was the focus of community struggles and demonstrations[528] in the 1980s and the choir, now a focus of nostalgia,[529] remains emblematic of fading industrial memory and economic woes. Nearly everybody in the choir has a Cornish accent and only a few members are under sixty years of age. Although exclusively male it involves extensive family and community networks. The visual presentation (blazers and ties...) and style of singing has not changed greatly in decades. Attending social events with

[526] Bernard Deacon (1993), op. cit., p. 207.
[527] The final closure was in 2003. Camborne developed as a sizeable town as a result of these engineering works.
[528] Notably in September 1986 when tens of thousands of people attended a rally.
[529] Seen in 2010-11 when screenings of archive film were over-subscribed. Information from Phil Hosken of The Trevithick Society. See also, http://www.cornwallinformation.co.uk/news/?p=2140 (Accessed, 20th June, 2012).

the choir, I nevertheless noted Revivalist influences and a desire to transmit singing to the young. At an informal party (8.6.12) some members sang Cornish translations of the popular songs, 'The White Rose' and 'Going up Camborne Hill'[530] and two younger members shouted 'Kernow bys vykken!' (Cornwall for ever!) at the end of the patriotic songs 'Trelawny' and 'Hail to the Homeland', - itself a Revivalist-inspired anthem by the late Carharrack composer, Kenneth Pelmear. Others wore Revivalist symbols, including a base-ball cap with the bilingual slogan 'Ober da – Proper Job' and a St.Piran's flag.[531] At least two singers have been made bards of the Cornish Gorseth for 'services to Cornish culture'[532] and have taken part in festivals alongside neo-Cornish musicians and dancers, including some in America. Members and their families talk about maintaining communities and economic issues using the language of Cornish activists and occasionally mentioning some of them by name.[533] A couple called Polglase spoke about work to adapt the repertoire and involve younger people, switching subject to talk about the financial exclusion of Cornish people from St. Ives. At a performance in Brittany the choir took trouble to explain identity issues in French and emphasize links with 'our Breton cousins'.[534] All considered, the choir is now an expression of the Cornish Movement but has little Revivalist content. This is a case of an activity from Late Classic Cornishness absorbing useable symbolic elements and discourses which help to articulate identity through the familiar.

The situation is somewhat different in the unambiguously Revivalist activity of 'Cornish dancing' which has origins in 1970s Pan-Celtic exchanges and which might be expected to follow ascribed Celtic models

---

[530] 'The White Rose' was made popular by miners returning from America and was translated into Cornish by Julyan Holmes. 'Going up Camborne Hill' recounts Richard Trevithick's invention of a steam-driven road vehicle.
[531] Worn by Michael Gilks.
[532] Information from Peter Williams, choir member and bard.
[533] Conversations with Jim Geach, Janet Geach, David Oates, Peter Williams and others.
[534] David Oates.

closely. It is not that straightforward though and Cornish dancing seems to exemplify struggles for meaning. The urge to create the scene certainly included a perceived lack with regard to 'the other Celtic countries' but that is not the only motive. Recent developments have emphasized a specific Cornish context and consciously incorporated elements from the mining history, including versions of the dress worn by bal-maidens (female surface workers). Methodist tea treat tunes[535] and popular dances are re-arranged and there is even a dance which mimics the rhythmic sound of 'tin stamps', - the machines that formerly crushed ore.[536] These items celebrate the same industrial heritage that produced the previous example but whereas the choir is unambiguously embedded in a popular social and cultural context by virtue of its beginnings, trajectory and insider participation, Cornish dance is effectively 'up for grabs' as far as its associations, meanings and participation are concerned. Everything involved, from the music to the dances and to the costumes and styles of presentation is polysemous and largely unanchored by customary meanings. Thus the example of using nineteenth-century dress may be part of re-telling important community narratives as one facet of a scene that also explores innovation and presents dance in modern dress. Alternatively the costumes may be read as folkloric equivalents of the elaborate, Breton costumes encountered at Pan-Celtic festivals, a point not lost on sceptics:

> ...but Cornwall's no Brittany.
>
> *Coiffes* are no Gooks, Perranporth's no Lorient,
>
> the Hurlers are no Carnac...[537]

---

[535] Discussions with Frances Bennett, Hilary Coleman-Davy, Neil Coleman-Davy.
[536] Performed, for example, at Goldsithney Charter Fayre, 2011, at Mazey Day, Penzance, 2011. Discussed with Karen Brown, dance teacher.
[537] Alan M. Kent, 'Cross-Channel Envy' in, *Love and Seaweed*, St.Austell: Lyonesse Press, 2002 p.53.

Any number of possibilities is available to Cornish dancing. It may be grafted onto 'Proper Cornishness' as a new poetic and sentimental expression and visually recast as a popular culture, as happens in Brittany, but it may also be isolated as a prescriptive scene. If it continues to be re-symbolized it may also be stripped of its political connotations so that it becomes a cosy local equivalent of country dancing, suitable for folk festivals and village fetes but not for asserting Cornishness. In just over thirty years of existence Cornish dancing has expanded and diversified impressively and it is arguably the most dynamic area of Revivalist culture. In growing, its following has changed and now includes high proportions of 'New Cornish' residents and proportionately fewer Cornish nationalists and language revivalists. There are cases of it being fully integrated in community life as well as interpretations that uncomprehendingly fail to engage with 'Proper Cornishness'. As with other activities, this variation reflects the differing interests, tastes, behaviours and imagined identities of participants, rather than any intrinsic aspect of the dances themselves.

A Common Cornish Habitus.

'Proper Cornishness' is a basis of identity for a large section of the population so its stagnation and low status may psychologically hamper regeneration and cultural renewal. It was sustained symbolically by late twentieth-century industries but even these are fading into the recent past leaving related identifications even more prone to redundancy. Proper Cornishness appears to be in stasis (rather than paralysis), now a durable, liminal state[538] with a naturalized air of permanence. The old-fashioned, out-of-date feel of associated activities has taken on the air of being an essential ingredient of being Cornish, often perceived as

---

[538] cf. Bjørn Thomassen, *'The Uses and Meanings of Liminality'* in *International Political Anthropology*, no.3, (2010).
http://www.politicalanthropology.org/component/search/?searchword=liminality&ordering=&searchphrase=all (Accessed 5th May 2011.)

something comfortingly familiar and rooted to come home to but hardly dynamic or exciting. As a whole its cultural forms are widely seen as 'stuck in a groove,' 'fossilized,' 'old-fashioned' and are written off as doomed and few people see them as a tradition to reinvigorate and diversify.[539] Its musical tradition is failing to translate itself into dynamic forms like those sometimes produced in other former mining areas and has given way, not so much to Revivalist creativity, but to generalized popular cultures, albeit with local nuances. By association Proper Cornishness, as a way of being and an individual persona, is something to abandon and move on from.

For the purposes of approaching Proper Cornishness in this wider sense, - beyond attachment to cultural form, - it is useful to turn to Bourdieu's elaboration of *habitus*[540] which is central to social, cultural and symbolic capital and thus to group status. Bourdieu used this concept to analyze inequalities, mainly in respect to class, but whilst class requires habitus, habitus does not require class as such (since social divisions do not automatically lead to class formation) and may be applied more broadly and related to ethnicity, gender, geography and other variables. It allows us to get beyond a limited focus on either ethnicity or social class, without abandoning either and since it is close to notions of culture as 'a whole way of life' and to Raymond Williams' 'structures of feeling',[541] it is a ready framework for thinking about cultural usefulness and how groups and their cultures are perceived and valued.

So what is habitus? Firstly, it is not a synonym for socialization or the 'ensemble of everyday routines' as sometimes imagined and it is not

---

[539] Vocabulary from conversations.

[540] Bourdieu elaborated the idea over time, notably in *An Outline of a Theory of Practice* (1972) and *Le sens pratique* (1980); cf. John Lechte (1994), p.48; John Thompson in P. Bourdieu (2001), p.26.

[541] See Raymond Williams, 'The Analysis of Culture' in J. Storey (ed.) (2006), *Cultural Theory and Popular Culture, A Reader*, London: Pearson, p. 37.

social class either.[542] It is rather the whole set of acquired tastes, behaviours, practices, values and ways of thinking, doing and being that locate individuals within social structures and practices. A habitus comes about through collective experience and it is the socio-cultural space within which individuals learn lasting, common-sense ideas, truths and systems of values that are broadly common to others of the same *habitus.* It is where they make sense of the world and develop in-group tastes, preferences and lifestyles. It is where members acquire their world views:

> Les conditionnements associés à une classe particulière de conditions d'existence produisent des *habitus*, systèmes de *dispositions* durables et transposables foncionnant comme principes générateurs et organisations de pratiques et de represéentations...[543]

Habitus involves 'dispositions' (with a convenient echo of 'position'), a term that conveys the idea that individuals acquire attitudes, aptitudes and predispositions towards certain behaviours (i.e. actions/deeds) which typify the social group. Agents (Bourdieu's usual term) operate within prevalent 'schemas of perception' (*schémas de perceptions*)[544] so that they respond to events, including unexpected and novel ones, according to principles, values and ways of doing things that are internalized and ingrained as reasonable and self-evident. Unlike ethics, these may be unconscious and banal, not requiring conscious aim in order to attain particular ends.[545] Without agents having to be aware the adaptable, 'principes générateurs et organisations de pratiques et de represéntations',[546] of habitus produce an apparent regularity which is, 'collectivement orchestrées sans être le produit de l'action organisatrice

---

[542] See John Lechte (1994), p.47; Mike Featherstone (1995), pp.31-32. Critics include Richard Jenkins (1992) op. cit.
[543] Pierre Bourdieu (1980), *Le Sens Pratique*, op. cit. pp.88-89.
[544] Pierre Bourdieu (1984), p.171; Stéphane Chevallier & Christiane Chauviré (2010) pp.132-137.
[545] see 'Le Sens Pratique', coll. *Le sens commun*, Editions de Minuit, Paris, 1980 p88-89). P. Bourdieu, 1980:88-89 op. cit. His 'ethos' = 'principes et valeurs à l'état practique' which may be 'non-conciente', thus differing from ethics.
[546] ibid. Translation N. Kennedy: 'practices which generate and organize practices and representations.'

d'un chef d'orchestre.'[547] These 'practices and representations' play a part in constituting group belonging and are involved in where we position ourselves and are placed by other people (Stuart Hall's 'ascribed' and 'elected' identities). Individual but more-or-less typical group attributes work semiotically as 'distinctions' to produce cultural capital.

The role of acquired tastes in the construction of 'Proper Cornishness' has already been mentioned and their arbitrary construction is an aspect of habitus:

> ...particular constellations of taste, consumption preferences and lifestyle practices are associated with specific occupation and class fractions, making it possible to map the universe of taste and lifestyles with all its structured oppositions and finely graded distinctions...[548]

Identifying, judging and revealing taste to others, as seemingly natural 'distinction', produces cultural capital. Thus cultural consumption, participation and production act out status and group membership. Bourdieu calls the choices involved 'discrimination', recalling multiple uses of the word to mean either 'good judgement' or 'unequal treatment'. There is, in other words a connection between identifying taste and values and the determination of what and who is legitimate. Passing on tastes to the next generation is one way in which the habitus is reproduced and it thus determines membership of both high and low status groups. We may all be able to think of people who are simply 'too posh' to be accepted by colleagues or neighbours, or of others who have moved from one local culture to another, never fully acquiring typical insider behaviours and attitudes.

---

[547] Pierre Bourdieu (1980), *Le Sens Pratique,* op. cit., pp. 88-89: 'collectively orchestrated without being produced by a conductor.', Translation, N. Kennedy.
[548] Mike Featherstone (1995), p.22.

Bourdieu stresses that the habitus is reproduced and transmitted as lasting dispositions which (individuality notwithstanding) are shared by people who have had same conditioning and experienced the same material conditions.[549] Some relate to embodied cultural capital through what Bourdieu calls the bodily hexis (*hexis corporelle*) and this provides some of the non-verbal means by which people are identified. Bodily postures, gestures, ways of moving, mannerisms and physical dispositions produce, 'the non-verbal cues and sign-reading operations that are significant in personal encounters in which people discern the relative social significance and position of individuals.'[550] Both 'distinctions', as group markers, and systems of dispositions are amplified when ethnicity is a feature of a habitus. Furthermore, ethnic groups, in so far as they are constructs and cultural creations, involve conditioning and members are identified by distinctions, much as happens with habitus and class. Indeed tacit awareness of distinctions feeds essentialist imaginings of ethnic identities because they seem to have existed for ever and be immutable or even congenital. Thus, although ethnicity and habitus are flexible and potentially changeable, this may not seem possible.

It is proposed that 'Proper Cornishness' is connected to a 'Common Cornish Habitus' which is characterized by dispositions, attitudes, shared knowledge and tacit understandings that come together as 'structures of feeling'.[551] Habitus may outlast cultural changes and remain quite stable even when 'objective' and material aspects of a culture disappear or change. So, rather than thinking of 'Proper Cornishness' as an array of activities, it may be better (instead or as well) to think of it as comprising the ways of being summed up in the Cornu-English expression, 'as we belong to be', which conveys both a

---

[549] Pierre Bourdieu (2000 [1972]) p.282.
[550] Simon Charlesworth (2005), 'Understanding Social Suffering: A Phenomenological Investigation of the Experience of Inequality', Journal of Community and Applied Social Psychology, no. 15 (2005) pp. 296-312 (p.300).
[551] Raymond Williams (1988) op. cit.

sense of what is customary and of what is appropriate and legitimate for insiders (in order to belong).[552] In effect the items associated with Cornish culture, like structuralist *parole*, may be regarded as ephemeral signifiers of lasting dispositions which compose a code, somewhat like structuralist *langue*.[553] They may come and go whilst habitus and the atmosphere it generates remains, even surviving language shift, migration or economic transformations. This is missed when concern with practices themselves (e.g. dance, cuisine, sports, festivals, ceremonies) disregards social relationships and who takes part. At Bolster Day in St. Agnes, a participant complained that there was 'no Cornish vibe', revealing tacit awareness of dispositions and attitudes that locate performance socially.[554] An event that is labelled 'Cornish' may not feel 'Proper Cornish' if these ingredients are absent whilst an activity that is common outside Cornwall may feel very Cornish if they are present. Thus the practice sessions of the Revivalist dance group *Ros Keltek* (established in 1980) have been a context in which features of the habitus are clearly perceptible because of who takes part but where some of the dances come from 'the other Celtic countries'. Exactly the same activities involving some other groups do not seem Cornish because the typical dispositions and attitudes of the habitus are absent. Even more strikingly, the locally reputed 'Smokey Joe's Cafe' (near Redruth), something of cross between a British transport café and an American diner, is identified as a 'proper Cornish' space within which the democratic, informal behaviours and attitudes of the habitus are tangible but where no specifically Cornish activity is identifiable.

---

[552] In Cornu-English 'We belong to...' means 'We usually...', 'We habitually...' but may also mean 'We ought to...'.
[553] Ferdinand de Saussure (1967 [1915]), *Cours de Linguistique Générale,* Paris: Payot. Chapter 2.
[554] At Bolster Day, St.Agnes, 2nd May 2011.

Smokey Joe's Cafe, near Redruth.

Habitus helps understand why practices do not have to spring from conscious constructions of Cornishness or be traditional in order to be drawn into the Cornish Movement's diffused discourses of identity. Everything from flower-arranging to motor-bike scrambling and from gardening to tattooing may be defined by the feelings of habitus and serve as an occasion to express Cornish sentiment.[555] This was apparent at two gigs where a metal band called *Kernuyck* played to largely Cornish pub audiences. None of the songs referred to Cornwall but the event felt Cornish because the public made it so and this was not lost either on the band or their 'posse' of supporters, - an impression reinforced by Revivalist symbols (a flag, badges, tattoos, tee-shirts) and the band's name which is based on Kernûack/Kernowek (Cornish). At Wadebridge another band played standard indie rock music and covers but one song touched on affording somewhere to live and 'staying put' and the band dedicated it to 'everyone who keeps St. Piran's flag flying on the North Coast'. Locals said the evening was really Cornish because of 'the atmosphere' and 'people who turn up from miles around', 'a regular Cornish crew.' It is the character of habitus that creates a Cornish feeling in these examples whilst the Cornish Movement and Revivalism disseminate underpinning discourses and symbols that help articulate it as an identity.

---

[555] Examples of Cornish expressions at St.Just-in-Roseland Church (August 2011) and Scorrier respectively.

Habitus concerns slippery, indefinable aspect of identity that insiders struggle to describe but know tacitly.[556] They allow them to recognize one another and be identified, often unconsciously or without quite realizing how. In Yorkshire, Simon Charlesworth mentions students who recognize others by means of what one person called 'posh-radar'[557] or unconscious 'scoping'. Similarly, in answer to the question, 'How do you know somebody is Cornish?' insiders often speak vaguely of 'being able to tell' and 'just knowing'. Some who are more conscious of Cornish identity dare to cite humour, mannerisms, body language and so on, - things which they cannot describe precisely but recognize.[558] Thus, speaking about prominent people who return after careers 'away', a middle-aged woman commented that the opera singer Benjamin Luxon was 'just as Cornish as he's always been', obliquely citing distinctions that I was expected to recognize. In the same vein, a teacher who had met the writer Don Thomas assured me that, 'You pick up he's Cornish straight away.' Most respondents had given little previous thought to how they recognized insiders but their tacit awareness of non-verbal cues emerged and was emphasized as much as accent:

> 'It's easier to understand each other and it's more relaxed.'
> 'We go about things a bit differently.'
> 'It's instinctive... You can pick up on it.'
> 'I suppose it's little things, like how you laugh or whatever.'[559]

A lecturer said she adjusted instinctively, choosing between her intragroup and intergroup personas in a chameleon-like exercise of 'code switching' that involves both verbal (accent, shared references) and non-verbal cues. At an academic seminar, the proceedings started stiffly with everybody using standard, RP-influenced English but once

---

[556] cf. Michael Polyani (1966), *The Tacit Dimension*, New York: Doubleday & Company.
[557] Simon Charlesworth (2000), *A Phenomenology of Working Class Experience*, Cambridge: Cambride University Press.
[558] See a brief discussion in B. Deacon, A. George and R. Perry (1987), op.cit., p. 153.
[559] Several conversations.

all were aware (consciously or not) that almost everyone was Cornish their accents strengthened, they relaxed and insider references punctuated the discussion.

The suggestion is not that all Cornish people are positioned within a uniform habitus, though. It is rather that customary notions of what it is to be 'Proper Cornish' refer to a more or less common range of distinctions, even though the reality is more complex and contradictory. Many Cornish people, for one reason or another, do not operate within the norms of this habitus but when they do not and when they have no corresponding cultural markers, they are sometimes said to be 'not very Cornish' (overheard, for example, in conversation between Cornish people in a Truro supermarket). The sub-text is that they are 'Cornish but you would hardly think so' and that 'being Cornish is not good enough for them'. For example, a well-known television presenter who reported on St. Piran's day was said to be 'ashamed to be Cornish' and 'about as Cornish as Phil off Eastenders'.[560] Combinations of prescription and scepticism are common in (minority) identities and in this case conflate habitus, class and ethnicity to exclude distinctions that contradict 'Proper Cornishness'. At the same time a person who has the distinctions of habitus will be considered an insider regardless of economic status and occupation and usually irrespective of parentage and ethnicity.[561] This means that there are degrees of 'insideness' according to the extent to which individuals conform to typical attitudes and manners. In the New Cornwall, there is interaction between the multiple cultures of Cornish people and in-migrants and there is assimilation and adaptation in all directions, rendering distinctions complex and consequential for status and belonging.

---

[560] Conversations at MacSalvor's store, Pool, 6th March 2011.
[561] See a brief discussion in B. Deacon, A. George and R. Perry (1987), op. cit., p.154.

Assertions of ethnicity that use binary opposition ignore composite and untidy realities so it is useful to note that native participants in any given activity, - be it gymnastics, film-making, rock music, car maintenance or knitting, - may have more in common with in-migrants who share their interests, (sub)cultural references and social backgrounds (class, gender, age, occupation...) than with fellow Cornish people who do not. To summarize, habitus is multi-dimensional and overlapping, involving distinctions that have arbitrary and negotiable currency. The contention, nevertheless, is that an identifiable Cornish habitus spans socio-economic differences within an indigenous, self-identifying community and that for historic reasons this traditional feature is linked to social capital through norms of egalitarianism, informality, self-dependency, social cohesiveness and other attitudes. In keeping with egalitarianism, the distinctions that mark internal inequalities are not very pronounced and are less important symbolically than overarching group markers. Bourdieu's notion deals with inequalities of cultural, symbolic and social capital and distinctions between habituses, so if this Common Cornish Habitus includes attitudes and dispositions that are common to people of differing socio-economic circumstances, is this a habitus at all? The temptation might be to see it as a set of local or ethnic traits but it distinguishes itself as habitus within the greater, British hierarchy of class, with its complex, fluctuating nuances of gender, ethnicity and regionality. Much of the 'regional distinctiveness' of daily life then reveals itself as 'distinction' (in Bourdieu's sense) and Cornishness, like other regional, national, class and ethnic identities, is homogenized. It works as a single, multi-dimensional and low-profile habitus (rarely present in the media and regional decision-making for example).

Emotional Capital.

Habitus has been applied in research that concerns emotional well-being in other post-industrial areas. Diane Reay has explored the indeterminacies of social status and developed an approach through 'emotional capital', turning to habitus during her analysis because using cultural capital alone was not enough to 'capture the complexities' of people's lives.[562] Reay discusses the physiological consequences of inferiority and the 'biology of chronic stress' that occurs as 'human beings are confronted feelingly by the meanings to which [...they are] submitted from the first' and she cites Bourdieu in seeing this as 'inert violence' that inferiors deal with everyday.[563] The amount of honour and esteem they feel influences their quality of life and involves collective and individual prestige. This fits with the proposition that the collective status of the Cornish is important for morale and that intervention may combat feelings of inferiority and marginalization by recourse to culture's 'primary uses'. Simon Charlesworth takes habitus as a 'distinct way of being' and 'the socially constituted principle of perception and appreciation of the social world we acquire in a particular context'[564] and has applied it in his hometown of Rotherham[565] which shares (post)industrial experiences and cultural influences with parts of Cornwall.[566] This informs consideration of how major economic changes (deindustrialization) have eroded 'traditional forms of solidarity' leading directly to 'disturbance' (in a broad psychological sense) amongst disadvantaged sections of South Yorkshire's working-class. Charlesworth examines low individual and collective worth and confidence as felt emotionally and he develops an idea of 'emotional prosperity' that is akin to Reay's 'emotional

---

[562] Diane Reay, 'Gendering Bourdieu's concept of capitals? Emotional capital, women and social class', in Lisa Adkins and Beverley Skeggs (eds.), *Feminism after Bourdieu, The Sociological Review*, vol. 52, Issue Supplement, (October 2004), pp. 57-74; See, http://www.educ.cam.ac.uk/people/staff/reay/ (Accessed 6th July 2011.)
[563] ibid.
[564] Simon Charlesworth (2000), 'A Phenomenology of Working-Class Experience', Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, p.29.
[565] Simon Charlesworth (2000), op. cit; S.J. Charlesworth (2005) op. cit.
[566] The strong South Yorkshire culture compares to that of Cornwall's China Clay District and the former metal mining areas.

capital'. He argues that accounts of class 'give no sense of what it is like to be working class; how it feels or what it means' because they ignore the 'experience of subordinates'.[567] Testimony is therefore used to examine the 'constitution of social space' and explore how status is felt personally within the 'social-psychological framework' that emerges in conversation as largely 'unreflective experience'.[568] Feelings of inferiority and powerlessness, as sources of dissatisfaction and stress, are related to social standing. Charlesworth cites Bourdieu's, 'the truly metaphysical wretchedness of men and women who have no social reason for being, who are abandoned to insignificance'.[569]

This can entail having to regularly defer to social superiors, for instance, or feeling excluded and Charlesworth argues that a 'sense of injustice' and 'worthlessness' may lead to angst and feelings that undermine people's well-being and relate to 'social pathologies' which involve, 'the physiologically consequential effects of being dispossessed of the very grounds of self-respect and self-authority; of the capacity to be perceived and perceive oneself as competent and of worth'[570] There are several potential contributors to such feelings in Cornwall. Firstly, ethnicity and social class are popularly conflated in seeing the Cornish as necessarily working-class so that Cornish 'distinctions' are associated with low status and low cultural capital. This correlation between Cornishness and class reflects the nature of in-migration which is said to have brought about, 'a cultural division of labour whereby the Cornish are under-represented in high status and over-represented in low status jobs'.[571]

---

[567] Simon Charlesworth (2005), p. 297.
[568] Simon Charlesworth (2005), p.299, p.297.
[569] Pierre Bourdieu (2000), cited in Charlesworth (2005) p.240.
[570] Simon Charlesworth (2005), p. 301.
[571] See, Bernard Deacon (1999), *The Cornish and the Council of Europe Framework Convention for the Protection of National Minorities*, Rowntree Reform Trust, p.21

The recent phase of deindustrialization has also sapped (self-)esteem and morale. Occupationally-linked attributes that formerly engendered pride may be devalued, even stigmatized, so that they mark social inferiority without being redeemed by suggesting capability in work. Connected feelings of inferiority are translated consensually into the acceptance and assumption of disentitlement. In Bourdieu's accounts, people are not barred from doing things but they may nevertheless be impossible materially and psychologically. Actions may seem, or really be, unachievable or so unlikely that it is not worth investing energy and time to pursue them. Charlesworth relates this to the difficulties 'subordinates' have in mustering enough determination and confidence to achieve some goals and he mentions a person who felt unable to be a justice of the peace because it meant mixing with 'posh' people. This recalls a Falmouth councillor, who gave similar reasons when she decided not to seek re-election and it accords with complaints that Cornish people exclude themselves because of their own felt lack of entitlement.

Expectations are linked to agency and choice within, 'limits set by the historically and socially situated conditions of the habitus',[572] and since habitus is normative and likely to produce sanctions for irregular behaviours, it, 'tends to exclude all 'extravagances' ('not for the likes of us') [...that are...] incompatible with the objective conditions'.[573] These limits and norms may lower or raise aspirations/ambition, open or close doors to opportunities and increase or reduce all forms of capital as people restrict their options to fit lowered expectations. The status and norms of habitus have the potential to shape lives by affecting whether individuals are taken seriously and take themselves seriously, - and this can be an economic factor.

---

[572] Pierre Bourdieu (1990) p.55.
[573] Pierre Bourdieu (1990) p. 55-56.

Redeeming Nance's Project.

Much of the Cornish Revival's energy is devoted to maintaining traditions, customs and innovations as objective culture but this particular discussion is about how 'useable culture' can address community needs. This places more emphasis on the whole culture as *langue* and less upon individual practices as *parole.*[574] Instead of simply being evaluated for their own sake, cultural items are therefore considered for usefulness to community well-being and continuity. Habitus is the most stable part of Cornwall's cultural continuity and is identified as the main context for any interventions to increase 'emotional prosperity' by raising cultural, social and symbolic capital.

The Revival's heterogeneity and the struggles for meaning within it might be said to offer a 'mixed bag of tricks', some of which point the way forward confidently whilst others are out of kilter with the tenure of Cornish habitus. Awareness of this allows us to understand that who takes part is more important to the continuity of Cornishness and collective well-being than the form and content of practices. The suggestion of a Common Cornish Habitus, once qualified by complexity, helps to recognize that how practices are framed socially and aesthetically may either connect them with 'insiders' or unwittingly raise barriers so that they fail to contribute beyond circles of enthusiasts. An impression is that habitus largely explains why some Revivalists are upbeat about Cornish culture making progress whilst others subscribe to despondent 'end of Cornwall narratives'. The former appear to include more people from outside or on the fringes of the habitus who conflate Revivalism with Cornishness whilst the latter are more often 'insiders' who are closer to weakening practices and less likely to identify with contexts which do not 'feel' Cornish. Thus

---

[574] Ferdinand de Saussure (1967 [1915]), op. cit.

enactments of ascribed identities may prosper in detached scenes even whilst identities that are bound to ethnically-nuanced habitus decline.

A semiological, post-structuralist awareness of polysemy is indispensible because it encourages us to think of cultural items as signifiers which do not have a fixed, intrinsic meaning. This means that there is no in-built discordance between any Revivalist activity and either the habitus or cultural practices of 'Proper Cornishness'; and where there are clashes this does not necessarily stop activities from being Cornish or having potential for future use. Intervention therefore involves trying to anchor 'preferred readings'[575] and consider the likely connotations of practices. Achieving compatibility could depend upon whose dispositions, attitudes and tastes define activities and the discursive formations within which they are performed. As there is nothing inherently incompatible or compatible in most activities, - for example, speaking Cornish or dancing at a *troyl*, preferred meanings that accord with 'Proper Cornishness' may be actively sought. This offers a way to redeem activities so that instead of dismissing them as irredeemably irrelevant (to 'the young', to 'the working-class' and so on), they may be reinvented and reinterpreted to achieve compatibility.

Encouragingly, there is an emerging turn against received ideas that detract from 'Proper Cornishness' and it is noticeable in the changing rhetoric of Revivalists and in initiatives to build upon traditional foundations. In Cornish language spheres, popular strands have existed for decades but now there are renewed efforts to graft Cornish onto rugby, gig-racing, popular music and a range of pursuits that defy prescriptive cultural hygiene and perhaps come close to the spirit of Nance's project. Neo-Cornish musicians and dancers are starting to develop close-harmony singing in new contexts and are working with rock musicians and brass and silver bands. The 'Horners' project, for

---

[575] cf. Stuart Hall ([1973] 1980) op. cit.

example, aims to 'build up a whole network of brass, reed and percussion players across Cornwall' and takes, 'the Celtic music of Cornwall, combined it with the popularity of brass instruments [and] some wild percussion', to produce 'brash and uplifting music'.

The Horners draws the brass band tradition into Revivalism.
[photo courtesy of the Horners.]

In another collaboration, Richard Trethewey's Revivalist-inspired folk C.D., 'Dig where you stand', features Camborne Youth Band.[576] Likewise, Picrous night in Luxulyan, billed as combining 'twiddly Cornish music' and 'proper Cornish carol singing', is a successful initiative to bring revivals and invented traditions into an accessible community context:

> It is not about 'performance' it's about 'participation' – no-one is in charge or sets any agenda, it's just about using Cornish cultural elements as a tool-kit for celebration.[577]

A valorizing, renegotiation of the relationships between Revivalism and 'Proper Cornishness' could be getting underway and that might offer socially useful initiatives, yet this is arguably compromised by the counter-urban re-symbolization of Revivalism, previous mentioned. Achieving compatibility with popular Cornishness is absolutely

---

[576] http://www.brightyoungfolk.com/gigs/dig-where-you-stand-richard-trethewey/record-detail.aspx (Accessed, 6th January, 2012).
[577] Comments by Will Coleman, 10th December 2012.

necessary whether the aim is to find social usefulness or to promote activities for their own sake. If the Cornish language is not bound to widespread identifications, for instance, and if its social activity does not reflect 'ways of being' that make Cornish people feel at home, it will not serve a useful purpose beyond small groups and will not recruit and prosper. Much the same might be said for any activities of course, but what makes Revivalist practices different from say, roller-skating or samba dancing, is that they are labelled 'Cornish' and designed as deliberate representations that are meant to articulate the ethno-cultural identity of a whole community. They offer people who already have cultural identities an interpretation of what their culture could or *should* be so it is vital that they support and do not undermine them.

Chapter Seven

Cornish Linguistic Landscape.

The Cornish language is the basis of claims to an ethno-cultural and specifically Celtic identity and most people first encounter it through place-names. Cornish has already been referred to as a symbolic cultural component of identity and belonging and as a resource for representing and branding. It is with these uses in mind that this chapter begins to evaluate and contextualize striking new ways in which it is being employed on signs by public bodies, businesses and individuals who have varied affective, political and commercial motives. These provide examples for discussion of the themes already linked to 'useable culture'. The observations are informed by participation in Cornwall Council's signage programme and in the Cornish Language Partnership's translation service but the expansion of visual displays is such a recent phenomenon that this tentative analysis has to be speculative and inconclusive. The peculiarity of Cornish as a revived language with few speakers requires caution in applying experience from other places but much may be learnt from the varied situations referred to here.

A key concept from studies elsewhere[578] is that of 'linguistic landscape'. This has been developed in respect to territories where a 'minority' or 'regional' (subaltern) language co-exists with a 'majority' or 'national' (prevalent) language or where languages vie for physical and social space, - and it has also been applied to situations where the boundaries

---

[578] Notably, Canada, Belgium, The Basque Country, Friesland, Palestine-Israel and Scotland.

of groups and their languages are contestable.[579] The basic idea is that written language in the environment forms a textual landscape and is part of the visual setting within which languages are spoken, heard and seen. Consequently, it is related to social, cultural, political and economic concerns and contributes to how a language is viewed, literally and figuratively. The arguable premise is that when a language is widely displayed in public, private and commercial settings it is likely to be taken seriously so that people consider it viable and fit for multiple uses. Signage is thus a strategy for mitigating stigmas[580] associated with subaltern languages and combating resignation to the inevitability of language loss. It is thus an intervention in cultural and symbolic capital, the thinking being that displaying a language, particularly in official settings, can raise its value and status (cultural capital). These perspectives emerged primarily in work on French as a subaltern language in Canada where:

> The language of public road signs, advertizing billboards, street names, place names, commercial shop signs, and public signs on government buildings combines to form the linguistic landscape of a given territory, region, or urban agglomeration.[581]

The attention of sociolinguists and 'language planners' to 'the visibility and salience of languages on public and commercial signs in a given territory or region'[582] also lends itself to perspectives from cultural geography and cultural studies. These make language a further facet of the conventionally-defined landscape and connect it in yet more ways to the discussion of how representation and multiple gazes affect multiple

---

[579] e.g. R. Bourhis and R. Landry, 'Linguistic Landscape and Ethnolinguistic Vitality: An Empirical Study,' *Journal of Linguistic & Social Psychology*, vol. 16 (1), pp. 23-49, (Santa Barbara, California, 1997); J. Cenoz and D. Gorter, 'Linguistic Landscape and Minority Languages', *International Journal of Multilingualism*, vol. 3 (1), pp. 67-80, (London, 2006); D. Gorter and J. Cenoz, 'Knowledge about Language and Linguistic Landscape', in *The Encyclopedia of Language and Education,* Springer, 2nd Edition, Vol. 6, pp. 343-355, (2007).

[580] Stigmas associated with Cornish are essentially to do with it being 'a dead language' that is imagined as pre-modern and incapable.

[581] Landry and Bourhis, op.cit., (1975), p.25.

[582] A. Jaworski and C. Thurlow, *Semiotic Landscapes: Language, Image, Space,* (2010), p.10.

forms of capital and views of Cornwall and Cornish people by themselves and others.

Commodification.

Linking language with landscape and displaying it prominently increases its potential for branding and marketing in the cultural, heritage and tourism industries. It consequently becomes involved in wider Revivalist campaigns that fall back on commerce and exchange-value as the arguments most likely to convince decision-makers that 'difference' is worth maintaining in a consumer society. Without recourse to the prevalent logic of commodification, it is hard to frame schemes to support culture. Although it is negotiated and combined with other factors, commerce has therefore ousted social and nationalist arguments. Revivalists employ this logic strategically or subscribe to it and Mebyon Kernow councillor, Dick Cole, argues that:

> Cornwall's uniqueness is its Celtic heritage and we have to promote that as a brand to attract more overseas visitors. These sorts of things are vitally important when trying to make an area stand out from the rest.[583]

The point that Cole ignores is that signage primarily attracts English visitors so that embracing commercial arguments for displaying 'otherness' is one of the ways in which Revivalists willingly or unwittingly ally themselves to tourism and the previously described construction of 'Lifestyle Cornwall'. Campaigners for minority languages elsewhere (e.g. Brittany, Catalonia, Scotland and Wales.) have also claimed that bilingual signage increases the attractiveness of their territories to visitors. In the Isle of Man, fostering 'national identity' is

---

[583] Dick Cole in *This is Cornwall*, http://www.thisiscornwall.co.uk, (12th November 2009.)

'linked with commercial development and marketing the island as a distinct (and distinctive) entity' and 'the linguistic landscape of the island is configured with not only its permanent population, but also visitors, in mind.'[584] This appears to be happening in Cornwall, as Graham Busby observes in Penwith (the far west of Cornwall) where he compares the appeal of Welsh road-signs to tourists.[585] The Revivalist writer and place-name specialist, Craig Weatherhill, writes that:

> In a tourist-orientated place as Cornwall, the language is a positive asset; an additional source of fascination which strengthens that feeling of being in a different place, and there are thousands of signposts constantly reminding us that the language never really went away.[586]

It follows that, 'In purely economic terms [...] Cornish is a vital element, too valuable to be cast aside.',[587] and Maga, The Cornish Language Partnership, accordingly connects it to the 'regional distinctiveness agenda', proposing that future uses of Cornish, 'could include signage or closer links between tourism and the language to encourage the sense of Cornwall being 'different".[588] Maga has run stalls at events attended by tourists and Visit Cornwall has investigated the language's potential by including questions on Cornish in its 'visitor response surveys', finding that a majority of visitors are aware of the language and intrigued by it, sometimes to the point of wanting to learn some.[589] Visit Cornwall adopts and relays elements of the Revivalist message to inform potential visitors that, 'On exploration of Cornwall you will come across many unusual and distinctively Cornish place names which allude to our native language.'[590] What is not known is whether visitor

[584] Mark Sebba, 'Discourses in Transit', in *Semiotic Landscapes: Language, Image, Space*, (London, 2010), p. 63Ibid. p.66.
[585] Graham Busby, 'Cultural Capital in Cornwall: Heritage and the Visitor', in P.J. Payton (ed.), *Cornish Studies*, no. 16, (2008), p.150.
[586] Craig Weatherhill (1995), *Cornish Place Names and Language*, Wilmslow, Cheshire: Sigma Leisure, Preface.
[587] ibid.
[588] http://www.magakernow.org.uk, (Accessed 24th June 2011.)
[589] Comments by Malcolm Bell of Visit Cornwall; Unpublished visitor surveys 2010-11.
[590] http://www.visitcornwall.com/site/explore-cornwall/towns-and-villages, (Accessed 12 September 2011.)

approval is straightforwardly good news or whether it has a down-side. These favourable attitudes are consistent with an evolving 'tourist gaze'[591] that combines the appeal of safe Otherness with the problematic presumptions about people and place already discussed; so far from raising collective cultural capital, for example, the colourfully attractive characteristics and associations attributed to Cornish could resemble prevalent imaginings of Cornwall that lead to presumptions against capacity (human capital) and modern economic activity. Since the language interests visitors, it may be becoming one more (however minor) element in the construction of counter-urban utopias and might join other aspects of 'difference' to inflate house prices and fuel population growth, irrespective of benefits. Visit Cornwall's message certainly sounds like a sales pitch for developers and estate agents, as likely to appeal to one-off movers-and-stayers as to visitors:

> [T]he proliferation of the Cornish language adds yet another dimension to this exclusive haven beyond the border of the River Tamar.[592]

Safely ethnic-looking signs could contribute to the fashionable experience of Lifestyle Cornwall and be part of re-symbolizing Cornish as part of a leisure and quality package which reduces 'regional difference' to an 'added value premium'. They might thus contribute landscape furniture for 'selling Cornwall as a gigantic theme-park'[593] or 'hyper-real Kernowland'.[594] These inherent dangers have not dawned on Revivalists who are understandably pleased by the awareness and approval of visitors and focused on the immediate and apparent gains for the visibility of Cornish. Those most closely involved need to justify the public funding of Cornish projects as a whole and may point to signage as something concrete and visible.

---

[591] John Urry (1990), *The Tourist Gaze*, Sage.
[592] Visit Cornwall, http://www.visitcornwall.com, op. cit.
[593] Anonymous responses to a questionnaire.
[594] Neil Kennedy and Nigel Kingcome, 'Disneyfication of Cornwall - Developing a Poldark Heritage Complex', in the *International Journal of Heritage Studies*, vol. 4, no. 1, (1998), Exeter.

Tir ha Tavaz (Land and language).

Linguistic landscape concerns all of the forms of capital under discussion, not just economic capital, and it is involved in the primary uses of culture that address non-material human needs for belonging and esteem. Careless handling might therefore be detrimental to symbolic uses within the Cornish community and undermine identity-based motives for learning Cornish. This is because most of Cornwall's traditional place-names are already in Cornish[595] and they feature prominently in identity narratives, collective memory and identifications with place.[596]

Traditional place-names used to name 1950s council housing in Helston.

This first layer of linguistic landscape exists because Cornish survived as a community language until early modern times and it is indisputably 'authentic' in so far as it is traditional. Uses of it are therefore at the heart of the wider discussion connecting useful culture to belonging, well-being and community resilience. Place-names and derived surnames (on shop signs etc.) were the only Cornish element of the linguistic landscape in the nineteenth and twentieth centuries and they are the language 'which is to be seen all around us on the sign-posts',[597] making the landscape the main interface with Cornish. Had this repertoire not survived language shift the Cornish would

---

[595] See Ken MacKinnon, *An Independent Academic Study on Cornish,* Plymouth, (2000), p. 28.
[596] cf. Simon Schama (2004), *Landscape and Memory*, London.
[597] Richard Gendall, *Carn*, 63, op. cit.

undoubtedly have forgotten that their ancestors had ever spoken another language, Cornishness would probably not have an ethnic dimension, the Revival would never have happened and Cornwall would be very different, culturally, politically and socially. There would not even be the ethno-cultural motivations and justifications that achieved Objective One and funding for the CUC Campus. Take away language and suddenly Cornwall's other cultural distinctions appear no more marked than those of Yorkshire, Northumberland or the West Midlands, for example, where there are no ethno-cultural or nationalist movements, regionalism notwithstanding. Without its toponymy, therefore, Cornwall's relationship to the 'Celtic periphery' would be similar to that of Cumbria where British speech survived until the thirteenth century or West Devon were it remained until the ninth. Cornishness would be unambiguously 'nested within Englishness'[598] as a strong regional identity. In the event, reference to place-names has been a springboard for the Revival and Cornish nationalism as well as the basis for popular identifications with group and territory. When UNESCO classed Cornish as extinct in their *Atlas of the World's Languages in Danger* (2009),[599] objectors cited place-names and philological and antiquarian study as comprising continuity with the revived language[600] and successfully achieved its reclassification as a 'language undergoing revitalization'. Place-names also furnish Neo-Cornish with otherwise unattested words, filling 'lexical gaps'[601] and providing 'a language repository'[602] which further establishes the bond between land and language which is apparent in the naming of the organizations: *Tyr ha Tavas, Tir ha Tavaz* (land and language).

A second layer, this time in Neo-Cornish (the revived language), is under construction, mainly in the form of street-name signage and ostensibly

---

[598] Bernard Deacon, 'Cornishness and Englishness: Nested Identities or Incompatible Ideologies?', (2010). Pre-publication copy.
[599] http://news.bbc.co.uk/2/hi/uk_news/england/cornwall/7900972.stm.(Accessed 12th September 2011.)
[600] See, MacKinnon (2000), op. cit., p.7.
[601] e.g. Oliver J. Padel (1985), *Cornish Place-Name Elements*, Nottingham.
[602] Alistair Quinnell, MAGA conference, Lostwithiel, 1st October 2011.

aimed at furthering language revival and identity claims despite commercial arguments. Leaving recent signage projects apart though, the main visible use of Cornish hitherto has been for house naming. A walk around six nineteenth-century streets in Redruth reveals that a sixth of the named houses have Cornish names whilst in three recent developments of 'affordable homes' in St. Austell, Polperro and Illogan, the proportion is nearer a quarter. The names fall into categories that correspond to the two layers of linguistic landscape, - traditional and Neo-Cornish. In the first category are place-names such as, Mithian, Polzeath, Godolphin and Penrose which do not use Neo-Cornish spellings and which are normally chosen for sentimental associations with places, connotations of Cornishness and allusions to local knowledge, not for their linguistic meanings.[603] Some second-home owners and in-migrants also pick them, presumably to recall holidays or out of affective support for Cornishness.[604] In 2010, two visitors called Samantha and David Cameron even chose the place-name Endellion for their daughter.[605] The second category comprises Neo-Cornish house-names, given with awareness of linguistic meaning. These have become widespread since the 1970s and several guides to naming have been published.[606] A street in Devoran has Delabole slate signs for *Chy an Revador* (The Rower's House), *Ancarva* (Anchorage) and *Lowarth Howlek* (Sunny Garden). Another in Redruth has *Chy Kensa* (First House), *Lowena* (Happiness) and *Gwel a'n Mor* (Sea View). These names increase the presence of Cornish (irrespective of grammatical mistakes in do-it-yourself translations).

Linguistic landscape may be taken to include movable or 'unfixed' text which contributes to the impression of being in a particular linguistic

---

[603] Names from Trelawny Road and adjoining streets in St. Agnes.

[604] In Devoran, a resident (A. Ferris) pointed out examples.

[605] Florence Rose Endellion, born at Truro 24th August 2010. St. Endellion is in North Cornwall.

[606] E.g. Crysten Fudge, *Cornish Names for Cornish Houses* (1977, 1988); *House-Names in Cornish*, Kesva an Taves Kernewek [n.d.]; Julian Holmes (1983), *1000 Cornish Place-Names Explained*. Redruth: Dyllansow Truran and (1989) Hyperion.

territory. In the Isle of Man, Mark Sebba even cites Manx wording on tee-shirts[607] and bank notes as widely-read examples of 'mobile bits of text'[608] but he refers especially to symbolic displays on fire service and post-office vehicles (which recall and must imitate Welsh on Royal Mail, police and British Telecom vehicles, etc.). Although vehicles move they are landscape features, much like other mobile elements, such as grazing cattle or people and we have only to think of red London buses or yellow New York taxis to appreciate their contribution to a sense of place. In Cornwall there are various uses of Cornish on vehicles. Firstly there are Cornish surnames that connect with the first layer of linguistic landscape. As I found in talking to self-employed people (two electricians, a decorator, an ice-cream manufacturer, a carpet fitter, a builder and others) there is awareness that these names connote Cornishness and allow positive discrimination by customers and mutual recognition.

Surnames derived from place-names contribute to linguistic landscape.

The commonest displays simply use Kernow (Cornwall), often in association with St. Piran's Flag. Kernow car stickers are a widespread, banal expression (19% of cars at Tesco's in Camborne displayed one,

[607] For Cornish examples: http://www.hagervor.co.uk/our_story (Accessed 27th July 2011.)
[608] Mark Sebba, (2010) op. cit. p.60; cf. Durk Gorter (2006), Linguistic landscape: A New Approach to Multilingualism', *International Journal of Multilingualism*, vol. 3(1), pp. 1-6, p.3.

20th February 2011) and more than fifty business names of the type, 'Kernow Cleaning', 'Kernow Coatings', 'Kernow Fabrications', 'Kernow Property Maintenance' 'Kernow Sausage Company.' etc. are are listed in the telephone directory (and there are others). There have been minor displays of Cornish on public vehicles since the 1990s. Cornwall Council vehicles bear its bilingual motto, 'One and All - Onen hag Oll' and those of Carrick Housing Ltd. have the wording 'Trevow Konteth Karrek' (Carrick County Homes).[609] Cornish is often used to name boats, - already iconic landscape/seascape features in representations of Cornwall as maritime and picturesque. Fishing boats include *Trevas* (Harvest), *Palores* (Chough) and *Mordros* (Sea Sound) and Cornish pilot gigs include *Kensa* (First), *Morlader* (Pirate), *Morvoren* (Mermaid), *Sowenna* (Prosperity) and *Taran* (Thunder).[610]

Despite these widespread, mainly private uses, the greatest additions to the 'second layer' now come from street signage result from Cornwall Council's language policy (2009) which includes plans to, 'implement a system of bilingual signage with regard to street and place names for new and replacement signs'.[611] Cornwall Council was not the first body to introduce bilingual signs though. In the 1980s when the then 'Cornwall County Council' would not provide bilingual 'Cornwall-Kernow' signs on roads into Cornwall, the Cornish Gorsedd paid for them itself and individual towns put up welcome signs in the 1980s and 90s, - including Liskeard and Camborne, where spelling controversies were brought to the attention of the public. One or two councils, notably Newquay, had even put up such signs in the 1960s and 70s but it was not until 1996 that Penwith District Council launched the first co-ordinated project to introduce them at the entrances to villages and towns (in collaboration with Craig Weatherhill). The first phase of this was intended to be ready for the prestigious Celtic Film and Television Festival, held in St. Ives in April 1997 and justifications centred on

---

[609] http://www.carrickhousing.org.uk (Accessed March 2010.)
[610] Pilot gigs are six-oared rowing boats and racing them is a popular sporting activity.
[611] http://www.magakernow.org.uk, (Accessed 14th September 2011.)

tourism and heritage.[612] Signs went up at Hayle, Lelant, Carbis Bay, St. Ives, St. Buryan and Mousehole and the scheme would have extended to most of Penwith had the Cornish Language Board not objected to using historically attested spellings rather than their preferred standard, 'Common Cornish' (Kernewek Kemmyn). The 'Cornish Sub-Committee of the European Bureau of Lesser-Used Languages' intervened to resolve the ensuing row but did not produce the agreement and rapid response needed to stop the project being cancelled. The Bureau nevertheless developed a policy which was endorsed by Cornwall's district councils (though not Scilly) and in 2006 Kerrier District Council announced ambitious plans to make 'new and replacement street signs' bilingual with 'no significant additional costs'. This was extended to Carrick District and informs the current Cornwall-wide policy.[613]

As a unitary authority (Cornwall no longer has district councils), Cornwall Council is now the sole body responsible for street-signs and their initiative coincides with a major programme of signage renewal, irrespective of bilingualism. Signs are only put up to replace damaged, worn-out, missing ones or where there are new developments but the work begun in 2010 is being undertaken with such energy, enthusiasm and speed (at an average of 22 per month between January 2010 and April 2012) that a high proportion of signs should be bilingual within a few years. Some 1,300 or more street-signs had been translated by the 30th April 2012, amounting to a tenth of the total. In addition, many of the 3,630 translations so far (by 20th October 2012) provided by Maga are for private signs and more translations are provided by organizations and individuals.[614] To avoid added costs, Cornwall Council's project uses the voluntary translators of a Cornish Signage

---

[612] Information from Craig Weatherhill and Ray Chubb.
[613] http://www.magakernow.org.uk, (Accessed 25th June 2011.)
[614] Maga had been provided about 630 streets-sign translations by 30th April 2012. 648 had previously been erected by Kerrier District Council and an unspecified number by Carrick District Council. Jenefer Lowe estimates the total to be at least 1,300. Nev Meeks puts this at 10% of street signs (personal communications).

Panel (of which I was a member in 2011) and signs have the same dimensions as monolingual ones. Although the Cornish appears in much smaller text below the English (The subtitles of a hierarchical linguistic landscape.) those involved consider that 'We've made a good start.',[615] and the signs go beyond the previous expectations of language revivalists who have been accustomed to ridicule, dismissal and even hostility.[616] Thus people at organized language events in St. Ives, Redruth and Portreath told of their amazement and joy at finding bilingual signs near their homes and one woman had a photograph on her mobile phone.[617] We might expect these projects to have already made Neo-Cornish obvious to residents and visitors but not everybody takes notice. Revivalists are very aware of signs but some other people I spoke to had not thought about them at all, let alone identified them as a new phenomenon. A large section of the public is aware of them though, even if they do not give them conscious attention and they read them in a wide variety of ways, not all of which view Cornish as valuable and alive. This needs more investigation and discussion to inform policy.

Despite recent projects, traditional place-name signs, rather than Neo-Cornish ones, are still the main Cornish component of linguistic landscape. Cornish names the intimate details of the landscape (and seascape) such as rocks, fields, springs, woods, former mills and mines, not just settlements. It describes topography, vegetation and past activity and its names conjure up familiar places and call to mind experiences and stories, even without linguistic meaning. Place-names are not routinely discussed in work on linguistic landscape so it may be significant that a Cornish-speaking researcher, Davyth Hicks, should consider them as an important 'occurrence of text'[618] in his discussion

---

[615] Rod Lyon, personal communication.
[616] Comments by experienced promoters and teachers.
[617] Comments included, 'Skant ny brederen gweles an jedh ma' (I never thought I'd see the day), 'meur a varth bras ha lowena' (great surprise and joy), 'a real result'.
[618] Davyth Hicks, 'Scotland's Linguistic Landscape: The Lack of Policy and Planning with Scotland's Place-names and Signage', (Edinburgh, 2002), also cited in G. Puzey,

of signage in Scotland. Hicks identifies narrative functions, showing how names may prompt story-telling, connect with folklore and mythology and give rise to 'folk etymologies' but this may go deeper still to connect with the inter-generational stories that reproduce collective identities. Such narrative uses are explored by the poet Séamus Heaney who writes from a specific landscape and subjective standpoint as a Northern Irish Catholic. He is renowned for a strong sense of place and counter-hegemonic championing of Irishness in a synthesis with landscape[619] and his perspectives resemble those of Cornish Revivalists and uses in Anglo-Cornish literature.[620] Heaney's landscape is 'sacramental'[621] and connected to learning Irish as 'the dialect of the tribe'. Place-names evoke collective experience (events, famine, struggle, childhood, joy, suffering...), feeding the creative imagination and supporting collective memory, history, culture and language. Place-names thus relate intertextually to topography and narratives to recall the shared 'insider' references upon which group identity depends.[622]

In Cornwall enough people pay attention to place-names for them to be important and feature in seemingly redundant conversations that locate individuals within the group. In a recent controversy surrounding Duchy of Cornwall mineral rights, objectors quickly made humorous use of the apocryphal and well-known 'Talskiddy Treacle Mine', putting up signs.[623] At Truro Cattle Market (August 2011), five farmers immediately understood the question 'What about the names of farms?' and without prompting, linked them to being Cornish, the survival of their industry and the importance of passing on knowledge and tradition. In fact, their responses were more emphatic, articulate and emotionally-charged than those of neo-traditional musicians and

---

(2007), op. cit. p.10.

[619] See, Michael Parker (1993), *Séamus Heaney - The Making of the Poet*, Iowa City: University of Iowa, p.8.

[620] For discussions see, Alan M. Kent, (2010), op. cit.

[621] Michael Parker (1993), op. cit., p.8.

[622] For intertexuality see, Julia Kristeva: *Séméiôtiké: recherches pour une sémanalyse,* (Paris, 1969)

[623] http://www.bbc.co.uk/news/uk-england-cornwall-16962119, (Accessed 5 April 2012.)

carried a sense of beleaguerment and stubborn resistance. For people with topographical family names (and their relations and neighbours) obvious connections with place are sometimes a further factor in geographical belonging, as seen in attention to locating names in family history research. At the Cornish Studies Library I met a Tregonning who had visited Tregonning Hill and somebody who had traced her mother's surname to Spargo near Penryn. A Mr. Woon wondered which place-name containing 'woon' (down) might explain his family origins, and in Truro Tourist Information Office I met a Rosevear from Melbourne who wanted directions to Rosevear.

Signage, whether for place-names or otherwise, is a discursive, signifying practice and associates language with other visual signs in landscapes that are laden with signs in other forms, - the built environment, managed land-use and topographic features being obvious examples. Language operates and interacts with other elements of this 'semiotic landscape'[624] to making meaning. Linguistic landscape as 'public text'[625] is furthermore visible and audible so that spoken and heard language contributes to a related 'sound-scape'. The written word may be read aloud and heard, as has long been recognized in claims that by saying place-names, 'everybody in Cornwall uses Cornish words everyday'.[626] Echoing Cornish writers, Jenner observed that:

> The spoken language may be dead, but its ghost still haunts its old dwelling, the speech of West Cornish country folk is full of it and no one can talk about the country and its inhabitants in any sort of topographical detail without using a wealth of Cornish words.[627]

---

[624] See for example, A. Jaworski and C. Thurlow (2010), op. cit.
[625] Mark Sebba, op. cit.
[626] Converations with Clive Baker, Dee Brotherton, Ray Chubb and others.
[627] Henry Jenner, 'Cornish Place-Names', in JRIC, vol. 18, part 1, (Truro, 1910-11), cited in Peter Berresford Ellis (1974), *The Cornish Language and its Literature*, op. cit., p.156.

Road signs, shop signs and so on are also signs in the semiological sense[628] so we may apply Barthes' understanding that such signs work through a 'second order of signification',[629] where multiple connotations and understandings produce the cultural views that people have of their communities, place and the world at large. In Barthes 'third order of signification', the various elements of culture are organized and interpreted as mythology and ideology and in accordance it appears that place-names carry some of the cultural meanings or 'myths' that were earlier related to culture's 'primary uses'. Mythologies, by interaction with social, cultural and symbolic capital potentially affect emotional and economic prosperity. Precisely how is a matter for further inquiry but we may expect signage to connote yet unknown meanings and produce effects. Semiological perspectives help relate language-based culture to landscape through practices where the landscape is the imaginative arena and backdrop for the everyday (re)presentations and performances of identity. An accessible metaphor for Revivalists is that of the *plen an gwary*, the open-air theatre or 'playing place' of Cornish language drama that was 'pervasive in the Cornish cultural landscape'[630] until the seventeenth century. *Plen an gwary* sites throughout Mid and West Cornwall symbolize a vibrant, Celtophone past[631] and the image allows us the see linguistic landscape as part of a script where landscape is the stage. This fits with Alan Kent's claim for an especially close Cornish relationship between 'ritual, landscape and community' with connections to the performance and creation of aspirations and identity.[632]

---

[628] See, Mark Sebba (2010), p.60; c.v. Scollon and Wong Scollon (2003).

[629] Roland Barthes (1982 [1957]), *Mythologies*, Paris: Le Seuil, pp.199-210; Roland Barthes (1964), *Éléments de sémiologie*, Communications 4, Paris: Le Seuil.

[630] Communication from Ken Mac Kinnon.

[631] See Rodney Trevelyan Lyon, 'Cornwall's Playing Places', Nancegollan, 2001; Alan Kent, *The Literature of Cornwall, Continuity, Identity, Difference 1000-2000,* (2010); Robert Longsworth (1967), *The Cornish Ordinalia, Religion and Dramaturgy*, Harvard; Brian Murdoch (1993), *Cornish Literature*, Cambridge.

[632] e.g. A.M. Kent (2010), op. cit., pp.52-60.

Motivations.

Two connected beliefs underpin the Cornish language revival. Firstly, Cornish is held to be 'an outward and visible sign of nationality',[633] fundamental to aspiring to 'recognition' as a Celtic Nation and achieving political and administrative accommodation (e.g. The Cornish Assembly Petition, The Keep Cornwall Whole Campaign, achievement of European regional status.). Secondly, Cornish is represented as belonging to Cornwall and culturally and geographically inseparable from the land. The leading Revivalist, Ernest Retallack Hooper (1906-1998) wrote that, 'Language is the audible and visible sign of a nationality and Cornish is an interesting language in itself; its range of expression is great. It belongs to Cornwall and nowhere else.'[634]

Overlapping and competing romanticisms look both to the future and to the past with the risk of losing sight of the present. Revivalists often incorporate Cornish into the problematic constructions of Celticity, earlier referred to and link it imaginatively to ancient sites such as Boscawen Ûn and Tintagel (respectively associated with the Gorsedd of the bards of Britain and King Arthur), rugged coastal and moorland scenery, folklore and invented traditions. Others reject much of this vision and imagine Cornish as formerly spoken around the hearth and in the fields, harbours and mines, - a suitably down-to-earth language to be a symbolic vehicle of popular protest.[635] These romantic imaginings all bind Cornish to landscape and continue a long-established emphasis on place-names which:

> ...are music still,
>
> In our dear living land,
>
> Which never can be void or desolate,
>
> While here on every hand,

---

[633] *Old Cornwall*, vol.2, no. 5, (1933), p.29.

[634] Ernest G. Retallack Hooper, in A.S.D. Smith, *Lessons in Spoken Cornish*, [n.d.].

[635] See, Richard Gendall, *Carn,* 57, (1987) and *Carn* 63, (1988).

Is still the record of our fathers' lives...[636]

Of course, most groups have sentimental reference to toponymy but what makes it especially poignant in Cornwall is that Cornish remains inscribed in the landscape, despite not being spoken outside Revivalist scenes and being widely considered dead. Thus, for Nance, 'As long as the place-names last, Cornwall will continue to speak to its inhabitants in the old language...'[637] The landscape 'speaks in another language'[638] and as the most prominent feature of a Celtic heritage, place-names are venerated as living testimony of a continuous, if tenuous, linguistic tradition. Holding on to it has been a priority and the Old Cornwall Societies have 'recorders' charged with, 'The collecting, recording and using of place-names, especially those of fields, lanes, earthworks, streams, pools, cliffs, rocks, fishing grounds, etc., with the old pronunciations.'[639] Weatherhill considers place-names to be, 'historical monuments of equal importance to Cornish heritage as the stone circles, quoits and hill-forts.'[640]

This compares with situations where retreating languages are spoken by small sections of populations in reduced areas but where place-names reveal past linguistic borders.[641] In Brittany language shift is on-going but people may identify the former range of Breton from place-names and are sometimes motivated to learn it. The difference in Cornwall though is that place-names and surnames have hitherto been the only generally visible and audible proof of the language's existence and have long been symbolically charged, informing constructions of an ethnic identity since (at least) the mid eighteenth century when the

---

[636] Katherine Lee Jenner, 'The Old Names', in Muriel Hawkey (ed.)(1948), A Cornish Chorus, A Collection of Prose and Verse, London: Westaway Books, pp. 81-82.
[637] Robert Morton Nance, 'Hints for Place-Name Study', in *Old Cornwall*, vol. 3, no. 6, (Winter 1939).
[638] Claude Berry (1949), *Cornwall,* London: Robert Hale, p.95.

[639] http://recorders.oldcornwall.org/, (Accessed 5th October 2011.
[640] Responses to a questionnaire.
[641] Davyth Hicks, (2002) op. cit., para. 20.

spoken language was no longer available. This explains established street-names, such as nearly a hundred examples in Falmouth which include Cornish elements, like the recognizable and symbolic *tre* and *pen*.[642] Current discourses have a genealogy in antiquarianism where:

> [T]he study which was intriguing Cornishmen, which was directly connected with the language, was the study of place names. With the death of the language [...] Cornwall was left with a countless number of place names which, in the eyes of most people, were merely gibberish.[643]

Recording place-names became part of, 'a kind of duty in us Cornishmen to gather together the remains of our departed language',[644] and their sounds could not, 'fail to affect a Cornish heart with that peculiar sort of pleasing melancholy which is excited by the portrait of a dear departed friend'.[645] Even those who were happy to see the language's demise could use it symbolically, as in Davies Gilbert's arrangement of place-names as verse:

> Velandrukya Cracka Cudna,
>
> Truzemenhall,
>
> Chûn Crowzanwrah,
>
> Bans Burnnhal Brane Bosfrancan,
>
> Treeve Trewhidden Try Trembah...[646] jjjj

The Revival increased access to Cornish as, 'a visible sign of expressing Cornish nationhood',[647] and made combined aesthetic and nostalgic

---

[642] cf. 'By Tre, Pol and Pen, You shall know the Cornishmen.' Richard Carew (1602).

[643] Peter Berresford Ellis (1974), op. cit. p.140

[644] William Borlase, (1748/49) cited in Peter Pool, 'William Borlase', RIC, (Truro, 1986), p.118.

[645] *The Cornish Magazine*, anon. (1828) cited in B. Deacon, *A Concise History of Cornwall*, (Cardiff, 2007), p.14.

[646] Davis Gilbert (b.1767, d.1839), in M. Hawkey (ed.) (1948), op. cit. p.89.

[647] Peter Berresford Ellis (1974), op. cit., p.196.

appeals to place-names in doing so. They were said to 'stir the memory'[648] of Cornish which, 'so recently [...] was in use, that for Cornish people it is in a very real sense the language of our forefathers.'[649]

As I found in teaching and observing classes, learners are often motivated by place-names:

> Question: *Why are you learning Cornish?*
>
> 'Because I want to know what the place-names mean'
>
> 'I want to understand Cornish names and speak my own language.'
>
> 'It's all around us and we can't speak it.'
>
> 'We're like strangers in our own country. We don't even get what place-names mean.'[650]

This has changed little since Revivalist appeals in the immediate post-war years: 'More than once I have half-resolved to learn Cornish, so as to meet place-names with true native politeness and understanding ...'[651] It is such a common reason for learning that it sometimes conflicts with teachers' agendas to produce fluent, everyday speakers: 'Nyns yw dhe les dyski Kernowek dhe gonvedhes nebes henwyn-tyller.' ('It isn't interesting to learn Cornish to learn a few place-names.')[652]

Contestation.

Linguistic landscape sometimes a site of contestation where speech communities compete, often for wider social and economic concerns

---

[648] Claude Berry (1949), op. cit., p.95

[649] Richard Gendall (2000), *Tavaz a Ragadazow*, Menheniot: Tir ha Tavaz.

[650] In classes, 14 out of 46 learners gave this as reason.

[651] Claude Berry (London, 1949), op. cit., p.75.

[652] Comments by Matthew Clarke, Maga conference, Lostwithiel, 1st October 2011.

such as housing, access to jobs, political change and claims to territory. This came to the fore in the build up to the 2012 Olympics when the Land's End complex removed a prominent sign reading 'Land's End – Penn an Wlas' just before the Olympic flame was due to arrive there. Maga described the move as disappointing and retrograde and members of parliament expressed concerns.[653] Although the management insisted that this was an independent decision, Cornish activists were unconvinced and connected it to the forced removal of a Cornish flag from an Olympic torch bearer, the choice of a route that avoided Camborne and Redruth, police visits to members of the Celtic League and a ban on Cornish flags (subsequently lifted) at the Olympics.[654]

The extent to which languages appear and the ways in which they do so is said to indicate 'ethno-linguistic vitality'[655] and may relate to the vibrancy of the speech community and its status. The immediate difficulty in applying this is that the nascent neo-Cornish speech community is tiny, producing a mismatch between the ambition and scale of signage projects and linguistic realities. This belies the view that signs are for Cornish speakers and since increasing use of Cornish on signs is not matched by a widespread use of spoken Cornish it cannot be a straightforward indication of vitality. This kind of situation has been referred to by Bourhis and Landry[656] who note that visible uses may be largely symbolic and may exaggerate or under-represent vitality producing 'discordance'. Language display may even involve deliberate falsification, motivated politically, commercially and by strategies for language revitalization.[657] Thus signs may 'manipulate an individual's assessment of the status of languages and […] affect that

---

[653] See http://vimeo.com/42544690, (Accessed 20th October 2012.);
http://www.bbc.co.uk/news/uk-england-cornwall-18156334 (Accessed 26th May 2012.)
[654] http://www.thisiscornwall.co.uk/apology-torch-flag-grab/story-16227356-detail/story.html, (Accessed, 6th June 2012.)
[655] R. Landry and R. Bourhis, (1997), op cit.
[656] R. Bourhis and R. Landry, 'La loi 101 et l'aménagement du paysage linguistic au Québec, in *Revue d'Aménagement Linguistique*', pp. 107-131, Quebec, Autumn 2002.
[657] For discussion of 'language display' see, Carol Eastman and Roberta Stein 'Language Display: Authenticated Claims to Social Identity' in *Journal of Multilingual and Multicultural Development,* Vol 14: 3 1993 pp 187-202.

individual's linguistic behaviour'.[658] This reveals the two-way relationship between visible use and socio-linguistic context[659] but ultimately signage in a language that is not spoken amounts to a simulacrum of linguistic vitality, leading to scepticism and undermining credibility. There is a hint of this happening in comments like, 'Nobody hardly speaks it so what's the point [of signage]. It's make-believe [...] They're just kidding us.'[660] Revivalists have sought inspiration from territories with traditional speech communities such as Wales and Ireland but the incongruity of these models has been criticized as 'self-deception'.[661] Awareness has led Maga to turn to the Channel Islands and the Isle of Man for closer models; but what critics miss is that language display may be a means to uphold group status regardless of language vitality. All this needs is widespread symbolic identification with the language or even its toponymy in isolation and that appears to be the case in Cornwall.

Edward Said describes his feelings on seeing Arabic names in Palestine/Israel represented in the U.S. Press with Hebrew instead of Arabic spellings that obscure their meanings and imply that they are not Arabic.[662] He asks 'How much trivial malice can we bear?'.[663] This sense of erasure and cumulative small injuries is felt and voiced by some Cornish people, albeit in far less dramatic circumstances, and it extends to complaints about the English naming of housing developments (permitted despite a Cornwall Council policy in favour of Cornish) which are said to be unimaginative and insensitive:

---

[658] Guy Puzey, 'Planning the Linguistic Landscape, A Comparative Survey of the uses of Minority languages in the Road Signage of Norway, Scotland and Italy', (Edinburgh, 2007).
http://www.era.lib.ed.ac.uk/bitstream/1842/2118/1/2007PuzeyGDissertationMSc.pdf, (Accessed 5th April 2012
[659] See, Cernoz and Gorter (2006), op.cit., pp 67-68.
[660] Remarks in the Trefusis Arms, Redruth.
[661] Responses to a questionnaire from researchers.

[662] Spellings used when these languages are represented in English texts.
[663] Edward Said, *After the Last Sky – Palestinian Lives,* (New York, 1999), pp.133-136.

> Instead of introducing a little creativity by using traditional Cornish names, developers, unimpeded by the authorities, make the simple choice of plumping for culturally intrusive, but safe and easy, Home County type names. In time, unless a stand is made, Cornish place-name diversity will die out and the Cornish will be able to recall nothing of their heritage.[664]

The worry that place-names and their pronunciation will be lost results in complaints about radio and television presenters whose mispronunciation is said to show disrespect and arrogance. The issue regularly intrudes into the business of meetings for other purposes. Thus, at a discussion in the Royal Institution of Cornwall, a participant referred to the 'Lost Pronunciation of Heligan', a reference to the mispronunciation of Heligan that has accompanied its new fame as 'The Lost Gardens of Heligan'. Similar complaints occur in everyday settings, - at a workshop in Cornwall College, from teenage mothers in a cafe at Redruth, in the waiting-room of Devoran Surgery and at a reunion of lifeboat crew and auxiliary coastguards, and at Fowey Harbour Commissioners' car-park my place-name pronunciation earned me a free ticket. There are concerns that distinctiveness is being erased as names are left off sign-posts and maps, misrepresented or lost to a weakened oral tradition and the issue serves as a proxy for wider anxieties about the erosion of Cornishness. Cultural activists cite, amongst others, the iconic names, Tol-Pedn-Penwith and Landewednack, both of which have disappeared from O.S. Maps. A senior Revivalist figure mentioned the misspelling of Colwyn as Coldwind and said, 'My blood boils every time I drive past it'. Another saw this as wilful 'Anglo-centric thinking' where decision-makers 'slowly and quietly switch to 'English-sounding names, hoping nobody will notice.'[665] Specialists cite numerous minor place-names that have been replaced in recent decades. Weatherhill mentions, 'Ventonegga, which

---

[664] John Angarrack, (2002), op. cit., p.59.
[665] Remarks made during discussions of spelling.

bore that name for centuries, before it vanished to be replaced by Brook Cottage'.[666] During preparations for the Daphne du Maurier Festival in Fowey (renamed Fowey Festival of Words and Music), the relationship of landscape and toponymy was discussed and Jan Lobb, secretary of the Cornish Language Council, noted that the Boundary Commission was going to abolish the electoral ward of Moresk. Councillor Bert Biscoe noted that this menaced a place-name associated with the Forest of Morrois in *Tristan and Isolde* but saw the private replanting of a hundred acres of woodland as helping to 're-establish the forest of Moresk' and keep the name alive. Institutions are seen as 'removing centuries-old place-names' and there are sometimes claims from within such bodies that Cornish names are hard to say and remember.[667] The Exeter-based Highways Agency is thus criticized for giving, 'bland English names like Highgate Cross and Boxheater Junction',[668] to junctions and roundabouts and Weatherhill describes them as, 'happily introducing meaningless English names all over the place', mentioning 'Stopgate and Maiden Green'.[669] Locals refer to 'Treliske Hospital', rejecting its renaming as The Royal Cornwall Hospital, and objections to the omission of Tremough from the CUC Campus address are said by staff to explain new signs (2011) showing Tremough in large lettering. Similarly the Heartlands project at Pool has been criticized despite its use of Cornish to name buildings: 'How, in the name of Trevithick, does the title 'Heartlands' promote Cornwall and our language?'[670]

---

[666] Personal email.
[667] E.g. In discussions of naming buildings at the Tremough CUC Campus and facilities at City Hospital.
[668] ibid.
[669] Craig Weatherhil, responses to questions, 5th September 2011.
[670] http://breselyerkeltic.com/the-anglicisation-of-kernow/english-changes-of-celtic-cornish-names/ (Accessed 3rd August 2012.)

New signs at the Combined Universities Campus emphasize the name Tremough.

These worries also give rise to the wish to revitalize the linguistic landscape with new and recovered names. Motives for Neo-Cornish signage thus have something akin to those of graffiti artists tagging their neighbourhoods, staking out territory and proclaiming their presence. We might think of signage as 'bounding a claim'[671] to Cornwall and attempting to (re)claim physical and cultural territory, with or without the re-installation of the language.[672] The greater the perception of losing ground, the more the iconography of identity is paraded and the more cultural retrieval and historiography are undertaken consciously and politically. In this context, Neo-Cornish signs are an assertion of Cornishness, much like other interventions in the landscape, such as using vernacular architecture, building Cornish hedges and flying St. Piran's flag.[673] All of these are oppositional exercises of power, intended to defend Cornishness against homogenizing trends that nationalists cast as 'Anglicization' and which Celticists see as affecting, 'the 'traditional' place-based sense of Celticness'.[674]

---

[671] A reference to Cornish mining practice.
[672] Responses to questionnaires.
[673] Comments by members of the Guild of Cornish Hedgers support this interpretation.
[674] David Harvey *et al.* (2001), *Celtic Geographies – Old Culture, New Times*, London.

Anthony Smith defines an ethnic group as one with a name and, 'common ancestry myths and shared historical memories, elements of a shared culture, a link with a historic territory, and some measure of solidarity, at least among the elites'.[675] Cornish signage relates to all of these elements and is another response to Cornwall's 'new circumstances' where competing identities and their perceived status are expressed within a 'dialectical landscape'.[676] Different ideals of physical landscape are acted out with conscious or unconscious reference to other landscapes, demonstrating that territory is not just a surface area delimited by borders but also qualitatively conceived as familiar landscape upon which intragroup stories are written. Cornish identity narratives oppose supposedly untamed 'Celtic' and industrial landscapes to ordered pastoral and urban Southern England and oppose Celtic place-names to English ones. Cross-references are made to clichés of the West of Ireland whose windswept disorder and Celtic place-names recall West Penwith, the epitome of Celtic Cornwall for Revivalists. Tiny Iron Age fields, prominent granite carns, 'Celtic' crosses and associated place-names like Crows an Wra, Carn Kenidjack and Towednack, exemplify an ideal. The post-industrial, uplands of the 'Great Flat Lode' and Hensbarrow (the China Clay district) are also opposed to the prettiness and order of selected English landscapes and objections to English names are coupled with concerns about marginalization and tidying up the landscape:

> Move down and move in and tidy it up,
>
> Spare us a sip from your heritage cup.
>
> Roosting in ruins and all holding hands,
>
> Encircled by scrap yards eight miles inland.[677]

---

[675] Anthony Smith (1998), *Nationalism and Modernism*, London, p.159-65.

[676] cf. Don Mitchell, 'Cultural landscapes: the dialectical landscape - recent landscape research in human geography', in *Progress in Human Geography,* vol. 26 (3), (2002), pp. 381-389.

[677] 'United Downs', A song by the group Dalla.

David Lowenthal observes that, 'The place of the past in any landscape is as much the product of present interest as of past history' and 'the survival of the past depends on our memory'.[678] Keeping names alive in the landscape is part of such a 'present interest' and in Cornish narratives their persistence symbolizes the language's 'struggle for survival'[679] and the endurance and tenacity of the Cornish themselves. Place-names connect people to land and to bygone generations in a strikingly tribal set of narratives which has strengthened and evolved with the emergence of the 'new Cornish nativism'[680] which presents an embattled indigenous community in language reminiscent of accounts of Native Americans.[681] From these positions, signage is not cosy heritage but visible evidence that 'the language is fighting back'.[682] As in straightforwardly colonial situations, recovering names is a way to re-appropriate space, a reversal of the naming and mapping that exercise power under colonialism. Revivalists imagine signage as reversing an experience similar to the Anglicization and erasure of place-name in Ireland[683] and can liken it to the Irish signage undertaken both before and after independence. John Angarrack draws analogies with Africa and India, discussing post-colonial re-naming as a process of de-Anglicization and citing 'moves to change Calcutta back to the Bengali Kalikata'. Cornwall is said to suffer a 'cultural blight' which it is 'failing to resist'.[684]

Contested naming and policies in very different circumstances may be informative. In Québec/Quebec concerted efforts have markedly

---

[678] David Lowenthal, 'Past Time, Present Place: Landscape and Memory', in *The Geographical Review,* vol. 65, no.1, New York, (January 1975), pp. 1-36. http://www.jstor.org/stable/213831, (Accessed 25th January 2011).
[679] Rod Lyon (2001), *Cornish: The struggle for survival,* Nancegollan.
[680] See, Bernard Deacon, 'Cornishness and Englishness: nested identities or compatible ideologies?', *International Journal of Regional and Local Studies,* vol.5 (2), (2009), pp. 9-29.
[681] e.g. J. Angarrack, *Breaking the chains,* (Camborne, 1999) and (2008), *Scat t'Larrups. Resist and Survive,* Padstow.
[682] Remarks by Pol Hodge, poet and Cornish education officer
[683] The theme of Brian Friel's *Translations*, London, 1981.
[684] John Angarrack (2002), *Our Future is History. Identity, Law and the Cornish Question*, Padstow, p.55-59.

increased the number of displayed French place-names and a 'Commission de toponymie' links them to maintaining the language.[685] Linguistic landscape may be transformed dramatically, as I saw in Galicia where Galician (banned under the dictatorship) has re-emerged with the establishment of autonomous government and language policies (1987, 2007) that assure public use.[686] A largely Galician linguistic landscape has been achieved with the hope that Galician will become 'a factor of social cohesion'.[687] In Scotland, Gaelic and Scots signs are similarly seen as reclaiming lost ground where:

> Naming a place is an act of ownership and possession. By reviving, using and even re-creating Gaelic and Scots names for places in Scotland we take back ownership of our country, we define it for ourselves.[688]

Within the Signage Panel, Ken George, considers that Neo-Cornish signs serve, 'To show that Cornwall is a Celtic country distinct from England.' and Julyan Holmes describes them as, 'an immediate and unavoidable reminder of Cornwall's unique distinctiveness from English counties.' Similarly, Deacon argues that their main purpose should be, 'to alert residents and visitors, Cornish and English, to the existence of the Cornish language and to the fact that Cornish is/was a separate language from English.'[689] Signage can involve a, 'hardening of space, a reinforcement of boundaries and distinctions, and the fortification of property, place or nation',[690] and Cornish signs are accordingly used to over-sharpen indistinct edges and obscure the markedly different linguistic past of distinct areas within Cornwall.[691] Thus the practice of

---

[685] Charte de la langue française (1977); Information from L'Office québécoise de la langue française. French place-names make up around 80.5% of the whole.
[686] Xunta de Galiza: http://www.xunta.es/portada, (accessed 12th August 2011.); http://www.observatoriodalinguagalega.com, (Accessed 12th August 2011); Information from Carlos Vidal.
[687] Comments by Alberto Núñez Feijóo, president of the Xunta de Galiza, 25th July 2011.
[688] Paul Kavanagh, newsnetscotland.com, (Accessed 3rd September 2011).
[689] Ken George, Julyan Holmes, Bernard Deacon: Responses to questionnaires.
[690] Don Mitchell (2002), op. cit., p.1.
[691] e.g. Work on surnames and place-names which reveals a long-established divide

translating early English names in East Cornwall reveals desires to wish away, reverse or conceal their contribution to the area's naming whilst imposing uniform Neo-Cornish names throughout Cornwall rejects the internal heterogeneity created by a complex past of multilingualism, language shift.[692] It suggests that the Cornish Movement's elites might resemble counterparts in Wales where it is alleged that:

> most Welsh intellectuals (not only nationalists) have been reluctant to face up to the implications of Wales' 'fuzzy borders' and its long experience of multicultural experiences, if not multiculturalism.[693]

The Tamar, ever-present in Cornish imaginations, is repeatedly presented as a sharp frontier or 'near perfect linguistic boundary':[694]

> ...the utter strangeness of the place names which assail the visitor to Cornwall from the moment the River Tamar is crossed and the familiar world of English place names is left behind.[695]

Accentuated by place-names, the Tamar is not just a historical border but also a metaphor for ways of thinking about Cornishness (a 'Tamar in the head' syndrome) and worries about 'border-blurring' stand in for uncertainties in demarcating Cornishness.[696] All identities need imagined boundaries but rejecting inconvenient uncertainties and hybridity can be detrimental to inclusive cultural dynamism. As Chris Williams observes in Wales, 'the fully unified, completed, secure and coherent identity is a fantasy',[697] but clearly defined boundaries are comfortingly reassuring. They avoid the need to grapple with ambiguities (such as Cornish influences on Plymouth and Tavistock) but might also involve discourses that make it harder to imaginatively

---

along the Camel and Fowey valleys. See, Bernard Deacon (2004), *The Cornish Family*, Fowey.

[692] Criticisms received from the researchers Oliver Padel and Bernard Deacon.

[693] Chris Williams discusses post-nationalism and borders, in J. Aaron and C. Williams (eds.) (2005), *Postcolonial Wales*, Cardiff, p.15-17.

[694] Graham Sandercock and Wella Brown, *'The Formation of Cornish Place Names'*, The Cornish Language Board, 1996.

[695] Craig Weatherhill (1996), op. cit. p.1.

[696] Discussed, for example, at a Mebyon Kernow conference in Bodmin, 2011.

[697] Chris Williams in J. Aaron and C. Williams (eds.) (2005), op. cit. p.14.

negotiate the fragmented, indeterminate Cornish identities of the New Cornwall.

Disagreement and Opposition.

Cornish speakers do not all view place-names in the same way. On the contrary, they are at the centre of controversies about spelling, preferred historic periods and differing views of Cornishness that make developing signage a burdensome task.[698] Jenefer Lowe, refers diplomatically to, 'distinct schools of thought around whether to update or whether to leave [names] in an historical form', pointing out that, 'Non-speakers, speakers, historians all have an interest and come from different perspectives, making for an area of constant debate.'.[699] This does not quite tell us that Neo-Cornish speakers remain deeply divided by questions of linguistic hygiene and that the Signage Panel experienced five resignations linked to these issues in 2010 and 2011. Signage brings the further potential to unite or divide, which is why some supporters are frustrated that linguistic debates are continuing and suggest that the 'vast majority of Cornish learners just want to get on with it', regardless of spelling.[700] A retired teacher commented that 'It's just good to have something [on the signs] at last, however they spell it. It shows we'm still knackin' fore.' (Humorous use of Cornu-English.).

Increasing the Cornish component of linguistic landscape is an attempt to recreate the imagined lost space of an authentic Cornwall and differing Revivalist discourses refer to various cultural periods as

---

[698] See, Philip Payton, 'The Ideology of Language revival in Modern Cornwall', in R. Black et al. (eds.), *Celtic Connections: Proceedings of the Tenth International Congress of Celtic Studies,* vol. 1, *Language, Literature, History, Culture,* pp.395-424, Edinburgh, (1999); P.J. Payton and B. Deacon, 'The Ideology of Language Revival' in P.J. Payton (ed.) (1993), *Cornwall Since the War,* op. cit.

[699] Jenefer Lowe, responses to a questionnaire.

[700] Personal e-mail from Polin Pris, an experienced Cornish teacher.

cultural Utopias. These have a bearing on the discordance between imaginings that centre on pre-modern Celtity and those that privilege nineteenth-century 'Classic Cornishness', raising the question, 'When was Cornwall?'.[701] The language revival has primarily been founded on medieval Cornish and cultural references and *mœurs* have been influenced by Romantic Celticism's emphasis on folklore.[702] Like Unified Cornish (*Kernewek Unys*) and Common Cornish (*Kernewek Kemmyn*), the 'Standard Written Form' of new street-signs favours Conservative Middle Cornish[703] which is further emphasized by choices of correspondingly early place-name forms (often respelt) rather than later ones which Revivalist decision-makers look upon as 'corrupt' and 'Anglicized'. This could have repercussions because it distances Neo-Cornish from the traditional layer of place-names with which all Cornish people are familiar, and in doing so appears to correct and criticise them, giving the impression that they are wrong. Some names have indeed been deformed in the process of language shift or by careless cartography but more often they simply do not conform to the criteria of linguistic hygienes. Deacon refers to, 'the presumption that old is best'[704] and points out inconsistencies and biased selections of evidence which aim for 'standardization at all costs'. He suggests that new signage extends, 'the wrong turn adopted by inter-war revivalists'[705] by which he means that their Middle Cornish and medieval interests distanced the Revival from contemporary Cornish identities and failed to interpellate the public. Instead of communicating with living tradition, recent signage 'loses all relationship to the historic Cornish of the landscape',[706] and is said to have, 'ripped Cornish out of its historic territorial setting and made it much more difficult for people

---

[701] Observations by Sharon Lowenna, cf. See, Gwyn A. Williams (1985), *When was Wales?: A History of the Welsh*, London: Pelican.
[702] For medievalism, see: A.S.D. Smith (1947), *The Story of the Cornish Language: Its Extinction and Revival*, Camborne.
[703] Conservative Middle Cornish is the name applied to the fourteenth century language by Maga's Dictionary Panel.
[704] Remarks a meeting of the Cornish Language Council, Truro, December 2011.
[705] Bernard Deacon, responses to a questionnaire.
[706] ibid.

to relate the language to their heritage'.[707] Speakers of 'Revived Modern Cornish' like Deacon have little influence on signage but insist that the historical untidiness of toponymy should be respected, and to the irritation of the Signage Panel, Gendall has addressed written complaints about the quality and accuracy of signs to Cornwall Council.[708]

Not all of the Cornish users who make these points advocate Modern Cornish though. Donald Rawe, a well-known figure in the Cornish Movement, writes that:

> Those who insist on tinkering with Cornish language spellings really ought to leave place names alone; to respell them merely leads to outlandish versions which are unhistorical, unpoetic and likely to alienate large sections of the reading public.[709]

The fact that signage is happening at all reflects changes in attitudes towards diversity which may be linked to the Cultural Turn and the experience of multiculturalism, and it comes in the wake of Welsh and Scottish Gaelic signs;[710] but Cornish still faces everyday opposition and although this is more muted than twenty or so years ago, it is still commonplace for individual decision-makers to reject it, sometimes with vehemence. Cornish speakers testify to what the news site, *This is Cornwall*, calls 'constant sniping at Cornish' from a 'mealy-mouthed and aggressive [...] anti-Cornish brigade'.[711] Indeed some off-the-record

---

[707] ibid.
[708] Richard. Gendall, copied letters.
[709] Donald R. Rawe, review of *Berdh Arnowyth Kernewek: Modern Cornish Poets*, An *Baner Kernewek*, no. 83, February 1996.
[710] Decisions to extend Welsh signage were taken c.1970; cf. Roger Hutchinson (2005), *A Waxing Moon*, Edinburgh: Mainstream; Guy Puzey, 'Planning the Linguistic Landscape: A Comparative Survey of the Use of Minority Languages in the Road Signage of Norway, Scotland and Italy', MSc Dissertation, (University of Edinburgh, 2007). http://www.era.lib.ed.ac.uk/bitstream/1842/2118/1/2007PuzeyGDissertationMSc.pdf (Accessed 3rd August 2011.)
[711] http://www.thisiscornwall.co.uk/Keeping-Cornish-language-alive-enriches/story-17072234-detail/story.html, (12th October 2012.)

remarks heard during this inquiry recall a 2007 press article which claims that, 'the Cornish language...sounds like someone speaking Urdu with a mouth full of nails'.[712]

Objections to signage also come from Cornish people, including Councillor Morwenna Williams whose strikingly Cornish name lends her comments force: 'Some people in Cornwall will find this ridiculous and unnecessary.'[713] Similarly, the former director of the Institute of Cornish Studies (1971-91), Professor Charles Thomas, has criticized neo-Cornish signage from the perspective of a native academic whose interest in place-names is affective and concerned with the historical information they bear. Deconstructing some linguistically questionable new names around Camborne (his place of birth) Thomas writes of, 'the widespread creation of new, even unreal, place-names in Revived or Modern Cornish' and continues, 'What a waste of waste of public money, and what a shame to mislead passers-by in this fashion. How long before we see pseudo-Cornish equivalents of MERGE IN TURN and CAUTION: SOFT VERGES?'[714]

Whereas external attacks (such as those by Glanville Price)[715] rally Revivalists against common foes, criticisms by informed Cornish people are more challenging and suggest that signage and orthography standardization have not yet taken enough interests into account and that feelings involved in belonging to a place and community have been ignored. For all the justifications based on commodification and identity, the uses of signs by Cornish speakers are privileged and there must be a suspicion that not building on local identifications with

---

[712] *The Western Daily Press*, 28th November 2007.
[713] *This is Cornwall*, 3 July 2011
[714] Charles Thomas, in *Old Cornwall*, Vol. XIV, No.5, pp. 67-71, Federation of Old Cornwall Societies, Autumn 2011, p. 68.
[715] Glanville Price (1984), *The Languages of Britain*, London.

place-name will be detrimental to language revival and its potential as 'useable culture'.

Landry and Bourhis suggest that the value attributed to a language will determine the extent of its appearance and that, conversely, visibility influences its value, 'signs written in the in-group language might have acted as a stimulus [...] in a broad range of domains.'[716] Of course, Cornish is not the in-group language in a vernacular sense but it could be symbolically. Signs have both informative and symbolic functions and could work symbolically to increase spoken Cornish, thus giving rise to contexts for signs with informational functions. Displaying functional information may contribute to this so when a supermarket[717] put up signs, Revivalists thought them more significant than bilingual names at historic sites, such as Pendennis and Restormel Castles, where Cornish is associated with heritage as a redundant relic. Informational signs do not have these connotations but neither do they have any real informational function, given that few people speak Cornish. The symbolic message that might convey is that Cornish is here to stay and important, - a message that may be read as saying the same about Cornish people. More often signs are said to stimulate interest and, 'create a positive change, increasing the perceived relevance of the language', and producing, 'a marked increase in the numbers of people wishing to learn Cornish'.[718]

Signs are expected to precede an expanded speech community and act as 'a huge visual aid' for learning.[719] Weatherhill cites people around Pendeen who asked about the derivations of names on bilingual signs.[720] Not all signs imply status or provide the same stimulus to

---

[716] Landry and Bourhis, (1997) op. cit., p.45
[717] Signs at ASDA in Penryn have been removed but occasional product signs appear in Tesco stores.
[718] Craig Weatherhill, responses to a questionnaire.
[719] Remarks by members of the Signage Panel.
[720] Personal e-mail.

learning so where and how a language is displayed can be as important as the quantity and proportion of signage, working at the semiological level of connotation. This is where informed language campaigners may intervene in struggles for meaning. For example, the relative position of the subaltern language on bilingual signs and styles of presentation (e.g. Colour, lettering and images.) discursively connote ideas and associations.[721] 'Regional and minority languages' are often subject to what Ken Mac Kinnon[722] calls 'symbolic subordination' whereby they are displayed in ways that mark inferiority, - appearing below the dominant language or in antique and subordinate fonts. Connotation may be ignored in seeking visibility, though. As in the adage 'no publicity is bad publicity', campaigners may consider any signs desirable, disregarding unhelpful connotations and the irrelevance implied by tokenism. Displays that connote quaintness or quirkiness could contribute to economically problematic images so this matters, not just for language revitalization, but for how Cornwall and the Cornish are thought of. Brittany and the Isle of Man offer comparisons. Until recently, Breton signage in the *département* of Morbihan was restricted to occasional name signs at the entry to villages and heritage interpretation boards, confirming it as defunct, folkloric and unfit for present-day use. Supposedly 'Celtic' lettering often underlined this picturesque but moribund image, ideal for cultural tourism but unhelpful for language revitalization and the esteem of speakers. Tourist information offices still display *Ti an Douristed* in twee lettering but recent projects supported by *Ofis ar Brezhoneg*[723] affirm Breton as modern and seek out practical settings like supermarkets and take-away drive-ins.[724] Since 2004 the *Conseil Régionale de Bretagne* has extended road signage to Morbihan[725] and although the Breton text

---

[721] See Roland Barthes, 'The Rhetoric of the Image' [1944], in N. Morzoeff (ed.) (1998), *The Visual Culture Reader*, London: Routledge.
[722] Discussion.
[723] www.ofis-bzh.org/upload/ouvrage/fichier/350fichier.pdf, (Accessed 5th March 2012.)
[724] e.g. The *Quick* fastfood chains and some branches of the supermarket *Super-U*.
[725] Information from Yannig Madeg of Offis ar Brezhoneg. See also, Y. Madeg in *An Dasson*, Kerlenn Sten Kidna, Auray, 2011, p.5.

appears under the French in italics, it looks modern and functional and has majority public support.[726]

Recent bilingual road signs in Morbihan, Brittany.

The long-term consequences are uncertain. Signage almost certainly stimulates the steady increase of Breton-medium classes in schools and courses for adults and it joins other elements as a source of ethnic identification and economic motivation. What is not known is whether, like other Breton clichés (*festoù noz, bagadoù,* traditional costumes, pancakes, seafood, maritime imagery…),[727] signage also stimulates tourism. The Isle of Man may offer closer parallels because of its small size and population (80,000 inhabitants)[728] and because Manx, like Cornish, has been described as a 'dead language' and as 'undergoing revitalization'.[729] Place-names have a similar role to those in Cornwall and around 1,689 people claimed to speak Manx in the Island's census (2006), almost half of them under twenty years old.[730] This is in the same order as the number of Cornish learners even if the young age profile and higher proportion of the population bear less resemblance.[731] Promoters relate signage to 'status planning'[732] but

---

[726] Fañch Broudic (2009), *Parler breton au XXIe siècle: Le nouveau sondage de TMO-Régions*, Brest: Emgleo Breiz.
[727] *festoù noz,* Breton dance events*, bagadoù,* Breton pipe-bands.
[728] http://www.gov.im/treasury/economic/census/2006/ (Accessed 10th August 2012.)
[729] Both languages have been re-categorized by UNESCO as 'undergoing revitalization'; The last Manx 'native speaker' died in 1974 but there was transmission to learners.
[730] Mark Sebba (2010), op. cit.
[731] The figure commonly given for Cornish is anywhere between 1, 000 and 3, 500 (cf.

Manx is often represented as a heritage language with arguments related to tourism rather than as a vernacular. Sebba describes it as being so constructed by the size and style of lettering and the positioning of the text:

> [T]he Manx is marked as 'other' by use of a traditional Celtic font' [which] 'arguably constructs the text as 'ornamental' or 'decorative' rather than authoritative.[733]

In Cornwall, justifications based on tourism are also used but this does not stop members of the Signage Panel from sharing the community concerns and political motives of the Cornish Movement and being sceptical about tourism. Their intentions are to champion the Cornish community in broader ways than just language revival and their comments touch upon social and emotional capital.[734] Pol Hodge, whose Cornish poetry often tackles related themes, suggests that signs may, 'give a bit of pride to people who live here' and Julyan Holmes discusses the benefits for the community where people may benefit from, 'knowledge of their own unique and valuable heritage' [and] 'help to strengthen communal solidarity and bolster the confidence of those who are fed an image of themselves as a backward and inferior version of English.'[735] This is a clear call for intervention to valorize the language and the community by boosting cultural, symbolic and social capital.[736] Nev Meeks connects well-being unambiguously to belongingness:

> [Y]ou can be more confident about yourself if you know who you are, where you have come from and that you are part of a culture that is

MacKinnon, 2000) with 300 considered 'fluent'; The age difference results from education. A Manx-medium primary school (Bunscoill Gaelagh), opened in 2001: www.gov.im, (Accessed, 24th April 2011.)

[732] www.manxheritage.org/language/english/language_policy.html, (Accessed 9th September 2011)

[733] Mark Sebba (2010), p.68.

[734] Diana Reay (2004), op. cit.; Simon Charlesworth (2000)(2005), op. cit.

[735] Pol Hodge and Julyan Holmes, Responses to a questionnaire.

[736] Pierre Bourdieu (1979), 'Les 3 états du capital culturel', op. cit.

real and respected. Connecting, history, culture, language, people and place is important for social cohesion.[737]

He sees 'raising the status of the Cornish language' as 'one of the building blocks that allows us to do all of the rest'[738] and by 'the rest' he means education and awareness-raising. The clear inference in these comments is that increasing the language's currency as cultural capital is an important way to raise the status and well-being of the Cornish community by association.

Landry and Bourhis propose that, 'the experience of the linguistic landscape by members of a language group may contribute to social psychological aspects of bilingual development'[739] and this may be extended to speculate about how linguistic landscape might also affect the emotional prosperity of Cornish people who are associated with the language despite being non-speakers. We might hypothesize that where group members associate themselves with a traditional language symbolically, they might also experience social, emotional and psychological benefits from seeing it in prestigious settings, even if they do not speak it. For this to happen they would need to identify with Cornish, but although relationships with place-names are clear enough, less is known about sentiments regarding the language, beyond the 557 people who gave Cornish as their main home language in the 2012 census. There may, however, be a clue in the scale of the petition for a 'Cornish Assembly - Senedh Kernow' which in 2000-2001 achieved 50,000 signatures, more than 10 percent of the adult population.[740] Wanting an assembly need not indicate support for the language but the demand stems from the discursive context of the Cornish Movement and the campaign has a bilingual title and explicit references to

---

[737] Responses to a questionnaire. Nev Meeks chairs the Signage Panel.
[738] Remarks by Nev Meeks, chair of the Cornish Signage Panel, Maga conference, Lostwithiel, 1st October 2011.
[739] R. Landry and R. Bourhis (1997), op. cit., p.23
[740] http://www.cornishassembly.org/, (Accessed 8th September 2011.

Cornwall's 'unique culture, language and history'.[741] Much the same might be inferred from the 83,000 people who took the trouble to write 'Cornish' as their nationality on the 2012 census despite there being tick-boxes for such default options as 'White British'. Indications also come from small-scale studies and anecdotes. In a piece of action research by Robert Reynolds at the Livewire Youth Project in Saltash,[742] 92 percent of 'young people' (ages not given) were aware of Cornish, 44 percent even knew 'a word or two' and 78 percent favoured learning, - figures that compare favourably with Brittany where 49 percent of 15-19 year-olds think it worth promoting Breton.[743] At Cornwall College (April 2011), a group of eighteen students told me they knew there were Cornish speakers. Although some had not noticed bilingual signs, most were pleased when attention was drawn to them and expressed pride in Cornwall having 'its own language'. Only a few thought signs were 'a waste of money' or 'for tourists'. A dozen or so retired people at an event in Camborne all recognized Cornish as having some, however vague, connection to them but also affirmed that they did not understand a word, despite one of them saying 'Kernow bys vykken' (Cornwall for ever) and another telling me Chynoweth meant 'new house'. One woman said, 'It's something we got, they [not specified] haven't got.', and another that, 'We should keep hold of it and not leave it go again.' Only one person thought Cornish was 'all a long time ago' and that 'there's more important things to spend money on these days'. In Bodmin, St. Austell, Falmouth and Penzance, I asked customers about signs in a chain of café-restaurants. Locals, including two staff members expressed pride in the language and several visitors thought the signs were interesting ('really good', 'cool', 'fascinating', 'different', 'like going to Wales'). A local couple had heard of spelling disagreements and wondered if the wording was 'proper Cornish' or 'made-up' but even this did not prevent them from approving. Few customers disagreed, saying the signs were 'a gimmick' and 'a waste of time'. Similar reports come

---

[741] ibid.
[742] Robert Reynolds, 'Young, Proud and Cornish': Action Research, (2007), http://www.magakernow.org.uk/Default.aspx?page=378, (Accessed 27th April 2012.)
[743] Fañch Broudic (2009), op. cit., p.152.

from Maga and the impression that the language is being incorporated in casting the Cornish as an ethnic minority at grass-roots level.

Neo-Cornish signage is a conscious intervention in representation but it is too early to say what effects it will have. Toponymy is a foundation of Cornish identity so it could contribute to belongingness, reinforce connections between people and place and support community narratives but this needs policies to be informed by wider considerations than those of language revitalization. This is not because reviving Cornish is unimportant but, on the contrary, because it can enhance other aspects of life. In the emerging formations of the New Cornwall, linguistic landscape has ramifications that are too important for visual uses of Cornish to be framed narrowly and great care needs to be taken to avoid reinforcing prescriptions that are suspected of contradicting and undermining 'Proper Cornishness'. Place-names and a connected language could help new generations to constantly connect and reconnect with an idea of community and maintain indigenous Cornishness through related narratives. These could be strong enough to appeal to Cornwall's diverse population through unifying references to a shared names and a common geography. The worrying alternative is that signage could become part of re-symbolizing Cornish cultures to brand an empty simulacrum of 'regional distinctiveness'. Signage looks like an unproblematic act of identity but its symbolic benefits could be compromised by incorporating it into a rush to brand 'regional distinctiveness' that paradoxically hastens the erosion of cultural difference. New official contexts for Cornish offer legitimacy but also lead to a quest for respectability and to funding processes that demand demonstrable exchange-value. Cornish is undergoing a transformation from being the 'dangerous' and 'extremist' symbol of an oppositional Cornish Movement to being a cosily depoliticized ingredient of marketable difference and whilst this facilitates public projects, it negates the oppositional currency that has often motivated learners.

Cornish signs:

A traditional street name at St. Ives.

Use of Cornish 'Happy Christmas' with other languages in a shop window.

Boesti, Cornish for 'restaurant'.

Chapter Eight

Cool Cornubia - Branding Celtic Cornwall.

During this inquiry, as I broached the subject of 'useable culture', most people assumed that I must be talking about branding. They discussed cultural tourism and packaging in the food and drink sector where using the Cornish language and cultural symbolism was thought to offer 'added value' in the form of regional distinctiveness. For a few Cornwall Council officers and councillors,[744] however, using culture in branding is understood to be a potential part of wider strategies, yet undeveloped, to 'brand the region' and 'put Cornwall on the map', with implications for inward investment and external decision-making. Accordingly, some people within the Cornish Movement argue that Cornishness itself is a commercial asset and 'powerful marketing tool',[745] and they use this to support the case for the language:

> If you're looking at Cornwall's distinctiveness, its brand in the future world of trade and so forth, having something that distinguishes and defies our brand like a living language is very important.[746]

Yet even these perspectives are limited and risk missing the possible roles that cultural branding could have as intervention to boost all of the forms of capital discussed and to help shape and assure the mythologies of Cornish identity which are important for emotional and economic prosperity. Branding can be directly related to these questions using Barthes 'three orders of signification', previously introduced. Thus, defining a desirable and useful 'vision' of Cornwall and Cornishness is about selecting a 'third level' message as a useable

---

[744] Discussions, e-mails and private conversations.
[745] Comments by Colin Roberts of Bewnans Kernow.
[746] Bert Biscoe in 'Fears for Cornish Language Partnership', BBC News, 13 April 2011, http://www.bbc.co.uk/news/uk-england-cornwall-13059389

'mythology' and effectively communicating it through Barthes' second, connotative level of signification. In accordance with the discussion so far, this needs to connect with traditional identity narratives and with the attitudes and dispositions of the 'Common Cornish habitus'. Branding, as image-making, contributes to the wider field of representation, whether it seeks to promote a territory (region, country...) or simply one of its products, businesses or sectors. Some of the 'myths' (in Barthes' sense) that could be socially and economically beneficial to community resilience in Cornwall are currently overwhelmed and subverted by the volume of contradictory, disabling and prejudicial messages so this discussion argues that a coordinated public approach is essential and should 'take sides'[747] in the conflicts of interest that concern emotional and economic prosperity and the survival of a Cornish tradition. In other words, an overall public 'vision' is needed to replace piecemeal, contradictory branding exercises for specific economic sectors. The vision focused upon as a proposition here updates the established 'mythology' of the Cornish as 'Industrial Celts',[748] - considering how to make this into a valorizing economic brand with a corresponding set of social and cultural aspirations.

Although branding is usually discussed purely from the perspective of marketing products, services and destinations, it has further consequences for how a territory and its inhabitants are looked upon, not only by outsiders but also by insiders. Indeed it can be forgotten that residents are an internal market and captive audience that may be susceptible to branding based on ethno-cultural identity. They are more exposed to brand images of themselves than outsiders and may also generate them. Branding therefore involves the production and consumption of elected, negotiated and ascribed identities,[749] in much the same way as the Revivalist representations previously considered.

---

[747] See chapter 1.
[748] Amy Hale, 'Representing the Cornish - Contesting heritage interpretation in Cornwall', (2001), op. cit.
[749] Stuart Hall ([1973] 1980), op. cit.

The policy advisor Simon Anholt, something of an international guru on branding nations and regions, observes that, 'although the usual context of brand theory may be buying and selling and promoting consumer goods, this is a thin layer that covers some of the hardest philosophic questions...'[750] Amongst these he lists, 'the mysteries of national identity, leadership, culture and social cohesion.' In other words, it is of paramount importance to all of the areas in this discussion and once non-commercial impacts are taken into account, it becomes misleading to define the point at which intervention in representation become branding as such.[751] In principle, branding is image-making for commercial motives but in practice it becomes impossible to separate this from the production of community narratives. For instance, the bid for Cornwall to become a European Region of Culture[752] could be called branding in so far as it aims to raise Cornwall's profile and contribute to its image, but it departs from usual understandings because community morale is foremost in the architects' minds. As DEMOS recognized in reviewing the bid, it has potential to develop narratives of purpose and ambition for communities and their policy-makers.[753] In short, branding in the strict commercial sense may affect community myths and esteem whilst interventions in culture may influence regional and national brands. Despite having ostensibly profit-based justifications, branding practices are thus interwoven with geographical belonging and national, regional, ethnic and civic identities.

Branding and advertizing are commercially and often institutionally driven and funded so their messages may be widely disseminated, and in Cornwall tourism and the heritage industries ensure extremely high

[750] Simon Anholt (2007), *Competitive Identity: the new brand management for nations, cities and regions,* Palgrave Macmillan, p.xii.

[751] cf. Simon Anholt (2010), 'Definitions of place branding: Working towards a resolution', in Place Branding and Public Diplomacy, Palgrave. https://secure.palgrave-journals.com/pb/journal/v6/n1/full/pb20103a.html (Accessed, 12th June 2011.)

[752] Cornwall, European Region of Culture', led by Cornwall Council; http://www.cornwall.gov.uk/default.aspx?page=22907 (Accessed, 2nd May 2011.)

[753] C. Tims and S. Wright (2006), DEMOS Report, op. cit. note 34.

levels of public exposure to corresponding images. Several successive generations have negotiated and constructed their identities against the background of intensifying promotion by tourism but if this works commercially to increase visitor numbers and change buying habits, it may also affect other behaviour, influence inside and outside views of Cornwall and its inhabitants and join with other representations to produce attitudes that are conducive or unfavourable to given economic and social activities. It may thus interact with who Cornwall's residents think they are, what they imagine they are like, what they think they are capable of and what they aspire to. In addition to direct commercial impacts through promotion, marketing and sales, branding can thus indirectly influence the economy, for better or worse, by conveying narratives and myths that underpin or undermine human and social capital, self-image, motivation and expectation. This makes branding too important to leave to chance because it can affect how insiders see their past, present and future and what, if anything, they do about it. Put slightly differently, portrayals in branding may colour residents' perceptions of which activities may reasonably be undertaken and their commitment to Cornwall. These matters are arguably more important than what outside target audiences think and they make branding another practice that draws upon culture and contributes to the stories communities tell about themselves and have told about them.

Representing countries and regions is not like branding companies because they have complex, embedded identities with cultural, ethnic and historical dimensions. Whilst corporate identities may be commercially engineered, national and regional identities have insider versions that are lasting and emotionally charged. Anholt observes that, 'although nations and cities do have brand image, they can't usually be branded: at least not in the way that products, services or companies can',[754] yet the belief that they can, leads to, 'a naïve and superficial

---

[754] Simon Anholt (2007), op. cit., p.5., cf. S. Anholt, Keynote Speech to the European Commission, 2011: http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=baxr9Ie0zqg (Accessed 25th

interpretation [...] that is nothing more than standard product promotion, public relations and corporate identity, where the product just happens to be a country rather than a bank or a running shoe.'[755]

In the branding exercises of 'imposed' institutions, such superficial and corporate approaches, devoid of connections with ethno-cultural identity, contrast strikingly with regional branding in the other regions in the Atlantic Arc which have ethno-cultural claims. In Wales, for example, there are ongoing public discussions with multidisciplinary input that consider culture and language as economic factors and consider how identities and stereotypes relate to brand image.[756] A component of the Welsh Assembly's 'Wales Brand', is the, 'Wales Nation brand, which represents Wales as a whole', and 'brings to life all the characteristics of the people, place and culture that make us, us.'[757] Instead of marketing Wales without reference to culture or community strengths, this vision presents it as 'special' because of, 'the people, the culture and the place' and 'original ideas' that are related to them.[758] Distinct qualities are said to, 'affect everything we do or say, because those values are who we are', and far from being a matter for insiders alone, Welsh identity is said to, 'affect the way we tell people about tourism, business, studying and regions in Wales.'[759] *Cymru Greadigol* (Creative Wales) also acknowledges that for cultural tourism and culturally related businesses to mean anything there has to be, 'living culture not just heritage'.[760]

Although regions and countries have long had external images and promoted themselves, globalization has made branding a worldwide phenomenon and produced the tendency to regard image as an

November 2011.)

[755] Simon Anholt (2007), op. cit., p.xii.

[756] e.g. 4th - 6th March 2010, http://kaleidoscopicfest.org/programme/adapting-brand-wales/ (Accessed 15th February 2010.)

[757] http://www.walesthebrand.com/Default.aspx (Accessed March 2011.)

[758] ibid

[759] ibid

[760] Remarks by Julie Russel at the Bewnans Kernow conference, op. cit.

essentially commercial brand and market profile. This has come about in an age of heightened visual awareness and overload, neo-liberalism, consumerism and strong market competition, where people are confronted by a bewildering array of products and choices of holiday destination and where regions vie for inward investment. Identity, image and brand are thus conflated and become the subject of intensified activity and institutional intervention. The branding of countries, regions, areas and cities and the development of geographically placed brands for produce have become such common practices that they are widely thought of as expected roles for national governments and regional administrations and spawn all manner of quasi-governmental bodies, advertizing agencies and consultants. This is so at all levels from multi-state collaborations like the European Union and African Union to national, regional and more local projects, - concerning for example, individual cities and towns, tourist destinations and the production areas of foods and drinks. In order to reflect upon Cornwall's options we may turn to numerous European 'regions'[761] that have prominent brands and profiles. Schemes have been developed to raise the profile of territories and give them particular associations and many such regions have distinct historic languages, ethno-cultural identities and constitutional aspirations which are mobilized for economic ends.

Successful national and regional brands rely upon cultural elements as ingredients. Thus language, music, dance and customs feature alongside legends, cuisine and the human landscape, its architecture and monuments. Even stereotypes of temperament and physical appearance may be incorporated in addressing would-be tourists, customers and investors. The results are often shallowly clichéd and serve an immediate commercial end whilst reflecting less favourably on other economic interests and collective status. To start thinking about how two dimensional clichés work, we have only to contemplate

---

[761] Here 'region' and 'regional' are used irrespectively of claims to nationhood.

everyday advertizing that presents Germany and Japan as technological and efficient, but reserved and humourless, or Italy as classical, stylish and passionate but by implication, unreliable and volatile. Travel agents and tourist boards invite us to come to 'laid-back' Jamaica and soak up the reggae, visit 'passionate' Andalucía and experience real flamenco or drink stout in authentic Irish pubs with jigs, reels and fun-loving locals who have 'music in their voices'.[762] As these examples recall, branding may draw upon and contribute to stereotypical constructions of identities as 'Other' with the corollary that it may simultaneously construct them as inferior in opposition to the identity of the target audience.

The things in some brands that are interesting, charming, picturesque and marketable thus seem incompatible with having the capacities to perform certain activities, so much so that they carry messages of incapability along with their appeal and attraction. They contribute to the identity of the territory, increasing perceptions of difference for example, without necessarily serving the wider economic interests of the population or enhancing its status. Furthermore, the romanticism of incapacitating portrayals may appeal to insiders who then live them out, as has been suggested in respect to certain Revivalist performances of Celticity. This arouses the suspicion that, in Cornwall, representations from tourism and commercialized culture confirm and reinforce constructions of inferiority and produce their own truths discursively. The flip side to representing Cornwall as remote, rural and timeless and its people as traditional is that modernity, dynamism, innovation, intellect, science and technology are excluded.[763] Moya Kneafsley makes similar points about the 'type-casting of people as traditional' in other Celtic territories where representations belie realities such as the fact that, 'Brittany has one of the most productivist, tightly manicured and regulated agricultural landscapes in

[762] Marketing of West Cork. http://vimeo.com/18624408 (Accessed December 2011.)
[763] See, Amy Hale, 'Representing the Cornish - Contesting heritage interpretation in Cornwall', in *Tourist Studies*, Vol. 1 (2), pp. 185-196, (2001), London: Sage.

Europe' whilst being portrayed as untamed and pre-modern.[764] Branding Cornwall as a, 'land of Celtic myths and legends' or 'exclusive haven',[765] thus benefits tourism and property speculation but must hamper the knowledge economy and technological sectors by emphasizing leisure and pre-modernity.

The discursive effects of prevalent tourism-orientated representations extend to empowered institutional decision-makers who incorporate aspects into their work unreflectively.[766] To generalize, their social and cultural interaction with the indigenous Cornish is negligible and some have next to no exposure to grass-roots counter-discourses or identity narratives, only knowing Cornwall's more deprived communities through remote professional contexts. This is hardly surprising and does not imply that they are not concerned by disadvantage but it does result in work reproducing and entrenching matter-of-fact presumptions in favour of certain courses of actions and against others. Crudely speaking, it is as though tourists have been asked to decide policy. Shifting the accompanying discourses at an institutional level is one of the hardest obstacles to overcome and it blocks intervention in branding and policy generally.

What is left out of discourse can be as important as what is included. For example, current discursive formations omit supposedly unsightly and outmoded industrial representations that clash aesthetically with the marketing imagery of leisure and counter-urban lifestyles. This renders certain economic activities inconceivable, unrealistic and contrary to common sense and it steers Cornwall further towards tourism dependence and the vagaries of a service economy. Cornwall Council's Core Strategy (2012) has notably been criticized for further emphasis on 'high end' tourism and speculative housing with little

---

[764] Moya Kneafsey in David Harvey *et al.*, (2002), op. cit., p.131.
[765] Visit Cornwall website (Accessed August 2011.)
[766] cf. Joanie Willett (2009), op.cit.

attention to traditional industries and agriculture.[767]

During the term of Objective One, the institutions of regeneration have apparently applied a narrow interpretation of 'knowledge economy' that complements counter-urban lifestyles and tourism, keenly supporting infrastructure that is compatible with clean and tidy activities but largely ignoring the development of maritime facilities such as Falmouth Docks and the cargo-handling port of Par which is instead due to close and be replaced by leisure-based activities, including a marina. Mining and quarrying have been anathema. The reopening of South Crofty Mine was fiercely opposed by the recently abolished R.D.A. which preferred to put retail chains, business units (some still unoccupied) and housing on land which it partly obtained by a High Court battle to obtain a Compulsory Purchase Order (October 2006). Decision-makers revealed crass disregard for the central symbolism of mining and ignored the view that facilitating reopening and ancillary activities would boost local morale and economic motivation. Thus it is despite regeneration agencies, rather than thanks to their help, that Crofty is reopening.[768] Service-orientated discourses view mining as part of a doomed industrial economy, rather than as contributing to a diversified knowledge economy and branding Cornwall as technological.

---

[767] e.g. http://coserginfo.wordpress.com/2012/01/20/falmouth-responses-to-core-strategy/; http://www.facebook.com/pages/Cornwall-beyond-the-Crossroads-Bin-the-Core-Strategy/274653485930072; (Accessed, 12th October 2012.

[768] Big Step Forward for South Crofty, http://www.businesscornwall.co.uk/news-by-industry/manufacturing-in-cornwall/big-step-forward-for-south-crofty-123 (Accessed May, 2012).

Crofty Mine and nineteenth-century terraced houses.

The conflicts of interest involved in the options for image-making might come down to a contest between marketed leisure lifestyles and services on the one hand, and community continuity and economic diversity on the other. Of course this is an over-simplification but in the last decade and a half, approximately, tourism, the cultural and heritage industries and attendant development pressures have coalesced to produce the phenomenon previously introduced as 'Lifestyle Cornwall', a significant change in Cornwall's evolving image.[769] As a coalition of interests, it brings together diverse actors in shaping a commercial brand that is firmly associated with up-market leisure and lifestyle choices. This 'lifestyle brand' reflects and largely defines a changing tourist gaze,[770] manufacturing desire for a new array of leisure options and potted difference that has acquired fashionable status. Its elements feature prominently in glossy magazines and travel programmes, producing an intensification of representation that supports Visit Cornwall's claim that, 'In the last decade Cornwall has emerged as one of the World's iconic destinations.'[771] Indeed this 'destination' is one that fashion-conscious visitors now wish to be seen to have experienced. Modestly well-heeled tourists can now combine the established attractions of, 'the dramatic coastline with its captivating fishing harbours, the spectacular

---

[769] Bernard Deacon (2007), *Cornwall: A Concise History,* op. cit. p.227.
[770] John Urry (1990), *The Tourist Gaze*, Sage.
[771] http://www.visitcornwall.com/about-cornwall (Accessed, 10.07.12).

beaches and the pounding surf',[772] with visits to prestigious galleries, museums, heritage sites and gardens. As *Invest in Cornwall* (a body ostensibly concerned with inward investment) reminds us, they can also indulge in 'gastro-tourism',[773] sampling the menus of celebrity chefs and shopping for 'excellent local produce' and 'a fine range of locally-brewed beers'. In destinations like Padstow, Fowey and Truro these will be found alongside shops selling craft objects and quality leisure wear that correspond to the 'good taste' of middle-brow and middle-class visitors and residents (many of whom are former visitors). They may also attend Rock Oyster Festival and watch polo on Watergate beach[774] and in Falmouth, they may choose from Seasalt's[775] well-fashioned nautical-style clothing and 'Artists and Potters Collection', buy formulaic paintings of Cornish harbours and eat at Rick Stein's Seafood Bar, choosing from, 'a sort of seafood tapas menu, with such things as Scallops with Guindillo Peppers and Chorizo, Creamed Leeks and Smoked Haddock on Toast and a Cornish Fish Stew'.[776]

The Lifestyle Cornwall brand is significantly removed from the image of classic seaside holidays that have typified Cornish tourism hitherto, or the family-based attractions and theme-parks of the 1980s and 90s.[777] These are now disparaged as 'bucket and spade' and 'fish and chip' tourism and there is an assumption that a turn to 'high-end' facilities will generate more income, even though visitor surveys show that popular family holidays are still a staple and involve higher unit

---

[772] http://www.visitcornwall.com/about-cornwall (Accessed, 10.07.12). Such descriptions abound, e.g. http://www.dailymail.co.uk/news/article-1373450/British-seaside-resort-St-Ives-Cornwall-beats-Spain-European-beach.html; http://www.cornwall-online.co.uk/restormel/newquay/newquay-beachguide.htm

[773] http://www.investincornwall.com/key-business-sectors/food-drink/ (Accessed 10.07.12)

[774] http://www.visitcornwall.com/whats-on/rock-oyster-festival; http://www.visitcornwall.com/whats-on/north-cornwall/newquay/polo-on-beach (Accessed 6th January 2012.)

[775] http://www.seasaltcornwall.co.uk/ (Accessed 10th July 2012). Shops visited in Falmouth and Fowey.

[776] http://www.rickstein.com/Rick-Stein%E2%80%99s-Seafood-Bar,-Falmouth.html (Accessed 10th July 2012).

[777] e.g. Flambards, Paradise Park, Poldark Mine, Land's End, Dairy Land.

spending.[778] The suspicion is aroused that championing 'quality tourism' and supporting proposals for related developments has more to do with cultural sensibilities and snobbery than economic rationale. Decision-makers reveal legitimate taste in associating 'cultural tourism' with the consumption of a 'dynamic art scene'[779] comprising an array of artistic activities (from the innovative to the banal) that is mainly, but not exclusively, produced for and by in-migrants. They cite galleries, art studios, theatre, ceramics, music and literary festivals and historic gardens, demonstrating middle-brow understandings of 'cultural distinctiveness' that are far removed from the Revivalist notion of 'indigenous Cornish culture' and even further from 'Proper Cornishness'.

The implicit presumption in favour of socially selected tourists and corresponding lifestyle promotion might in practice be expected to maximize tourism's side effects, disproportionately attracting people who have the means to acquire 'an exclusive range of local properties',[780] as second homes and full-time residences. The brand thus promotes relocation, with all its attendant problems, not just holidays. As Malcolm Bell puts it: 'Cornwall is such a great tourism product that people want to buy into it'.[781]

Lifestyle Cornwall has coincided with Objective One which, whilst not responsible for the trend, has nonetheless helped to fund 'flagship attractions' that reinforce it. In fact they are so central to the Lifestyle brand that it has been deemed appropriate to support some of them when they are loss-making.[782] Major attractions that have received

---

[778] Discussions of 'Cornwall Visitor Survey, 2010' and 'Cornwall Visitor Survey, 2008-9', The South West Research Company for Visit Cornwall.

[779] http://www.visitcornwall.com/about-cornwall; http://www.visitcornwall.com/videos, (Accessed 11th July 2012.)

[780] Estate agent's publicity.

[781] Malcolm Bell head of Visit Cornwall in a film by John Howe and Richard Stevens, Digital Media students at UCF, 2010. http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=KPIGqCJWXpk

[782] e.g. The Eden Project's 2 million pound losses in 2011 were written off by Cornwall Council; See http://www.thisiscornwall.co.uk/Jobs-Eden-Project-makes-loss-pound-1-8-million/story-15352193-detail/story.htmlref (Accessed 29th February 2012).

public funding include: The Tate St. Ives, The Eden Project, The National Maritime Museum, The Lost Gardens of Heligan, the Cornish Mining World Heritage Site and Heartlands.[783] Of these, the Eden Project has received the most media attention, even earning a knighthood for its founder,[784] and both enthusiasts and detractors identify it as emblematic of recent transformations. On opening it quickly became Cornwall's answer to the London Eye, - a 'must-see' attraction that was soon better known than most Cornish towns, including, 'St. Austell near the Eden Project'. It joins historic sites in a litany of, 'iconic attractions such as St Michael's Mount, the Minack Theatre, Land's End, King Arthur's castle and the Eden Project.'[785]

Eden's construction in a former clay pit marks the ongoing demise of the kaolin industry and the ascendency of a new form of gentrification that (if plans come to fruition) will see leisure developments at nearby Crinnis (or Carlyon Bay), the construction of a marina at Par and the construction of five thousand houses at 'eco-villages' in what will be a post-industrial landscape.[786] For critics, these are unsustainable trends in a part of Cornwall that saw 16 percent population growth between 2001 and 2011 and 21 percent growth in the 1990s[787] and they place powerful interests in conflict with maintaining Cornish communities and diversifying industry. Cornwall Council planners have nevertheless backed plans for eco-villages and the former R.D.A. wrote off loans of 1.8 million pounds to the Eden Project that 'opened up the whole of the derelict Clay Country for an eco-town'.[788]

---

[783] See, http://www.cornish-mining.org.uk/ (Accessed 10th July 2012.); http://www.heartlandscornwall.com/ (Accessed 26th July 2012.)
[784] *The Western Morning News*, 14th December 2012.
[785] http://www.visitcornwall.com/things-to-do (Accessed 11th July 2012). 'Iconic' is a favoured word in current tourism promotion.
[786] See, http://www.eco-bos.com/ (Accessed 9th January 2013.)
[787] http://ourcornwall.org/?p=159 (Accessed 5th January 2013.)
[788] http://www.thisiscornwall.co.uk/Council-s-pound-1-8m-loan-Eden-Project-written/story-16238734-detail/story.html (Accessed 11th June 2012.)

For supporters, Eden is emblematic of a confident, forward-looking Cornwall and this is a reminder that regional or national branding, like other forms of representation, is an activity onto which people project preferred ideas of identity so as to feel good about themselves. Commercial interests are able to generate consent by association with the collective vanities of pride, patriotism and a desire to be liked and admired, and cities, regions and counties are moved to spend large sums on institutions, compete for sporting events (e.g. The London Olympics.) and accolades, host festivals and support prestigious developments, despite the absence of proven financial gain. An example is the privately promoted 'Cornish Stadium' project, priced at around fifteen million pounds and underwritten by Cornwall Council.[789] Promoters argue that it will raise Cornwall's standing and they use St. Piran's flag, the Cornish name *Sportva Kernow* (The Cornwall Stadium) and references to sporting achievements in an appeal which has mobilized support from within the Cornish Movement, even though it means building 1,500 houses on farmland,[790] is proposed by an Exeter-based company and has been the centre of planning controversies. The rhetoric resembles that of the *Kernocopia* project which profited from the London Olympics to create, 'a sporting-cultural partnership that will give Cornwall a high profile during 2012' and 'really connect people here to the amazing opportunity presented by 2012' so as to 'put Cornish sporting treasures on a World Stage'.[791] The high profile attractions of Lifestyle Cornwall similarly win high levels of public consent by appealing to pride and the thrill of novelty creating the risk of ignoring the wider social and economic outcomes.

Institutionally-driven projects to promote and brand Cornwall mesh so closely with the Lifestyle vision that the name 'Lifestyle Cornwall' might

---

[789] http://www.stadiumforcornwall.org/ and
http://www.cornwall.gov.uk/index.aspx?page=27288 (Accessed 15th July 2012.)
[790] See, for discussion. http://cornishzetetics.blogspot.com/ (23rd Februrary 2012.)
[791] Will Coleman, Press Release, 9th January 2012.

be taken to embrace them. Notably the particularity of Cornish cultural and linguistic heritage that was employed to justify Cornwall's regional status with the European Union and Council of Europe is subverted so that references to 'Cornwall's distinctive way of life' are reinterpreted as meaning counter-urban lifestyles rather than anything to do with Cornish tradition. Joanie Willet also identifies, 'the notion that Cornwall is a lifestyle choice' and observes that 'the cultural distinctiveness used by policy neglects Cornish ethnicity and with it the helpful nature of local narrative based on cultural memory.'[792] In a message intended to attract businesses, the 'Invest in Cornwall' website emphasizes leisure pursuits, prominent attractions and environmental assets that are said to define, 'the Cornish way of life' [and] 'make the county a place where people are delighted to settle'.[793] Not even a fleeting reference to indigenous cultural difference and community purpose is made, nor is there any inference that investment and initiative might come from within. Instead the emphasis is on lifestyle-led in-migration as a source of improving human capital:

> 'our highly regarded quality of life attracts high calibre people'
>
> [and there has been] 'over 30 years of high inward migration.'[794]

A page aimed at 'business investors' is similarly dominated by holiday brochure spin:

> ...by being surrounded by some of Europe's most beautiful landscapes and beaches, having a variety of leisure activities to chose from, and attending some of the UK's most stimulating cultural venues, Cornwall is a continuous reminder of what is really important in life.[795]

The text reads like an appeal to lotus-eating satisficers who might care to 'down-size' and run a small beachside café, rather than dynamic

---

[792] Joanie Willet (2009), p.6-7.
[793] http://www.investincornwall.com/living-in-cornwall/ (Accessed, 20th April 2012)
[794] ibid
[795] http://www.investincornwall.co.uk/relocate-to-cornwall/lifestyle.htm (Accessed 28.7.12)

entrepreneurs. What is not mentioned is the improved retention of qualified young people from Cornwall, an encouraging feature of the last decade, but that would mean dispensing with assumptions of incapacity. The first statement contradicts studies of in-migration which indicate that the educational profile of young and middle-aged immigrants resembles that of out-migrants.[796]

A groundswell of criticism, informed by the Cornish Movement, is making connections between intensified building pressures and the Lifestyle brand, alleging that developers are 'carving up Cornwall' and that institutions have a service-based vision that is just a new manifestation of tourism dependence.[797] Planners are accused of helping to drive the agenda and of 'collaborating with developers' to unlock funding for their departments,[798] and a spoof Cornwall Council Twitter account even depicts them playing at covering Cornwall with Lego houses and devising absurd scams to build theme parks, displace St. Michael's Mount and convert Truro Cathedral into luxury apartments.[799] The independent film-maker, Mark Jenkin observes that tourism in its new guise has reached the point where it excludes all other activities and representations. It is a vision that is, 'driven by the outward appearance we give in an attempt to attract more people', and which suggests that, 'we … now live off tourism but in the past we were blood-thirsty savages'. It thus manufactures an enthralling fiction that obscures reality: 'What could be more attractive to a holiday-maker? Possibly truth but maybe not.'[800]

---

[796] M. Williams, B. Cheal, P. Mitchell, L. Bryant, 'Movers and Stayers; Population and Social Change in Cornwall', 1971 – 1991, Plymouth: Department of Sociology, University of Plymouth, 1995; See also, R. Perry et al. (1986), op. cit.

[797] Typical of numerous *tweets* and on-line comments; cf. http://ourcornwall.org/?p=224; http://coserginfo.wordpress.com/2013/01/24/cornwall-a-soft-touch-for-developers/ (23rd January 2012.)

[798] Comments at a 'Save Truro' protest, August 2012; See also, http://www.savetruro.co.uk/

[799] https://twitter.com/CornwallCouncil (Accessed 5th January 2013.)

[800] Mark Jenkin (CNC film).

The dominance of the lifestyle brand creates a need to counter 'what we get bombarded with and how we're portrayed',[801] a point reinforced by Denzil Monk of *Awen Productions* who speaks of being obliged to make films about Cornish circumstances and themes, 'as a response to the rubbish we get fed', and as, 'a way of making sure we don't end up accepting it.'[802] In articulating counter-discourses, 'our culture and the language' are 'what we've got available so we can stand up to it'.[803] An example of this is the short film, Porth Emmett which uses snippets of Cornish and humorous stereotypes in depicting friction between locals and visitors.[804] Despite continuing opposition though, a striking impression is of widespread resignation to the inevitability of current trends which are simultaneously accepted, resented and regretted:

'That's the way Cornwall's gone, like it or not. They' got the cash.'

'There's plenty of money but who's got it? Nobody I know.'[805]

'It was better when the place was less trendy but felt like home.'[806]

Complaints reveal dilemmas and contradictions and respond to developments without identifying Lifestyle Cornwall a whole phenomenon. Enthusiasm and pride in prestigious attractions and associations with quality combines with hostility to the accompanying social exclusivity and cost of living. Specific effects are discussed as though they are isolated. A councillor noted that St. Ives had become so expensive that, 'none of us go out anymore and all the locals live in Carbis Bay', and another referred to parking places that sold for fifty thousand pounds each.[807] Others mentioned the expensive exclusivity

---

[801] Ibid.

[802] Remarks by the film-maker, Denzil Monk at the Krowji.

[803] ibid.

[804] Porth Emmett, Fylmys Glawlen Gwer, http://vimeo.com/53210135 (Accessed 3rd January 2012.)

[805] Comments in a Falmouth optician's.

[806] Remarks by a community nurse at Constantine. Non verbatim.

[807] http://www.guardian.co.uk/money/2012/nov/28/st-ives-parking-spaces-auction (Accessed 29th November 2012.)

of Padstow, associating it with publicity surrounding the celebrity chef Rick Stein, the television series *Doc Martin* and 'posh' and 'Hooray Henry' tourism in nearby Port Isaac, Rock and Constantine.[808]

The Cornish language and Revivalism have complex relationships with the lifestyle brand because they provide means for opposition at the same time as supplying elements that may be re-symbolized and commodified for its promotion. A possibility already suggested is that Revivalists are unwittingly aiding and abetting harmful development trends by facilitating the use of these elements to brand Lifestyle Cornwall. Despite opposition to Lifestyle Cornwall from large sections of the Cornish Movement, certain Revivalists are remarkably ambivalent towards it. Associating quality with culture, appeals to practitioners who aspire to professional status and respect. A musician mentioned that he has long hoped for Cornish music to 'take off' so that visitors would, 'come down, listen to us perform and we'd get paid for it and promote the identity at the same time'.[809] In the same vein, promoters of Cornish welcome questionnaires that show some visitors would like to learn about the language and see this as justifying funding and perhaps offering earned income.[810]

These responses are not far from the thinking behind the Lifestyle Cornwall brand and similarly imagine enlightened visitors sampling culture as cultivated consumers of 'regional distinctiveness' (however defined) and of Cornish residents being paid to supply services. Agendas to commodify culture thus involve certain Revivalists and nationalists in loose, unstated alliances with tourism where legitimizing and asserting Celtic nationhood seems to go hand-in-hand with commercial branding that uses Cornish culture as a source. Branding

---

[808] See *The Telegraph*, 23rd June 2007:
http://www.telegraph.co.uk/property/3358656/Rock-on.html
[809] Neil Davey, a founder of the neo-Cornish music scene, at a performance in The Star and Garter, Falmouth, November, 2011.
[810] Discussions with members of the Cornish Language Partnership, 2011.

draws from imagery and language favoured and created by Revivalists whilst Cornish speakers and activists provide willing and usually unpaid, translators and consultants.[811] They are often convinced that by collaborating they are helping to represent the Cornish as a Celtic nation. This recalls the cooperation of Revivalists with early tourism operators such as the G.W.R., where both shared an interest in portraying Cornwall as different, the former in order to assert Celtic credentials and the latter to attract visitors with a measured dose of exoticism.[812] As seen in Cornish signage work, Revivalists use arguments that appeal to heritage and tourism so as to achieve outside 'recognition' and raise the profile of Revivalist cultures. Tourism and heritage offer opportunities to present Revivalist messages to the outside world, as well as to the Cornish themselves. For example, volunteers who ran a work-shop at Trereife Country Fair were 'quite cheered' after presenting the Cornish language and some 'genuine Cornish culture' to 'English holidaymakers' who were, 'greatly interested and very supportive'.[813]

Symbiotic collaboration between ethno-cultural activists and tourism is common elsewhere and the principal of using tourism as a communication channel is the same whether it happens on a Native American reservation or a Scottish island. In Wales, Susan Pitchford has examined how 'ethnic tourism' may 'serve as a medium' for Welsh nationalists in presenting the Welsh as 'both victims of injustice and as bearers of a distinctive culture'.[814] It allows the messages of nationalists and language activists to be presented to the Welsh themselves as well as to visitors and the outside world. Using tourism as a channel need not involve collaboration through. In Spain's 'autonomous

---

[811] Personal participation as a translator and advisor for Maga.
[812] See, Chris Thomas, 'See Your Own Country First: The Geography of a Railway Landscape, in Ella Westland (ed.), *Cornwall, the Cultural Construction of Place*, Penzance: Patten Press with the Institute of Cornish Studies.
[813] Craig Weatherhill e-mail, 27th August 2011.
[814] Susan Pitchford, 'Ethnic tourism and nationalism in Wales', in *Annals of Tourism Research*, vol. 22 (1), (1995), pp. 35-52.

communities', for example, I observed political messages that simply take advantage of tourists being there. Galician activists at *Día de Patria Galega* handed out leaflets in English, French and Italian, explaining demands for further support for the Galician language and in the Basque Country large banners across buildings and motorway bridges proclaimed: 'Welcome to the Basque Country', 'You are not in France. You are not in Spain' and 'Here we speak Basque.'[815] The English slogans target outsiders, especially the Spanish and French whose languages are shunned, but they also address Basques and have the unintended effect of potentially interesting visitors who enjoy exoticism and the militant thrill associated with political struggle.[816] The point is that in Cornwall, there might be unexpected ways of profiting from tourism and culture that neither the Cornish Movement nor public bodies have yet engaged with but which involve affective appeals.

The economic *potential* of culture was discussed at Bewnans Kernow's well-attended conference, 'Cornish Identity – Good for Business' (12.2.11 at Lys Kernow).[817] Practitioners and campaigners from the Cornish Movement were brought together with representatives of business, local government officers and councillors to:[818]

> ...explore how competitive advantage can be gained by understanding and using Cornwall's inherent characteristics and how Cornish culture and identity and Cornish business can co-operate further in order to develop and maximize both economic potential and cultural distinctiveness.[819]

---

[815] I visited the region in August 2010 and July 2011.

[816] A suggestion made to me by a teacher was that Basque identity is intriguingly exotic for Northern European visitors but not for the Spanish who associate it with terrorism.

[817] See, http://www.businesscornwall.co.uk/news-categories/cornish-economy-news-categories/cornish-identity-good-for-business-123 (Accessed 6.5.12)

[818] Including Cornwall Council's chief executive Kevin Lavery, Visit Cornwall's Malcolm Bell, Cornwall - European Region of Culture's Julie Seyler, Jenefer Lowe of Maga and Stephen Gilbert M.P.

[819] Colin Roberts, conference organizer, Press Release, February 2011.

Achieving prosperity and respect for the whole community was a clear motive and discussions revealed intense awareness of Cornwall's 'new circumstances' and the heightened concerns with the community and ethno-cultural identity that accompany them. Some participants voiced these concerns strongly and emotionally, revealing frustration and alienation from institutions that were accused of being 'part of the problem' and 'making things worse'. The objective of generating work to 'let our young people stay here'[820] and allow 'the Cornish way of life to carry on and prosper' was linked to hopes for the 'Cornish language and culture' and issues around Cornwall's image and self-respect. Using the language of the Cornish Movement, Stephen Gilbert M.P., spoke of Cornish identity and suggested ambitiously that the challenge was to, 'get the best out of that identity, to make sure that we are able to promote Cornwall's culture and position ourselves as one of the twenty-first century's leading nations'.

The range of issues covered supported Anholt's observation that branding exercises involve multiple motives, not just the immediate and *a priori* rational interests of commerce and profit. Unremarkably though, the main themes were cultural distinctiveness in branding and marketing for tourism, products and services and there was agreement on the commercial need to 'stand out from the rest' and 'present a strong, distinct identity that everybody recognizes'. Malcolm Bell of Visit Cornwall related this to 'competitive identity', observing that:

> The last decade has seen an explosion of the use of the words [Cornwall and Cornish] to sell products and services [...] associating Cornwall and Cornish with the positive.

Others mentioned an increase in business names that include 'Kernow'. The 'Cornish culture' that most speakers wanted to validate was evidently the particular subset of Revivalist expressions, - including

---

[820] A remark by Richard Angove.

neo-traditional music and dance and the Cornish language, - previously discussed. Several contributors focused on professionalizing and marketing cultural practice to allow people to make a direct living and spoke of struggling to get access to venues, funding and media exposure. There were claims that raising the status of practitioners could bring economic benefits and there was reference to experiences of cultural production in 'the other Celtic countries' (a common expression amongst Revivalists), including Brittany where a strong Breton cultural sector employs thousands of people.[821] The impression, once again, is of intense struggles for meaning within a Cornish Movement that cannot quite define its position on Lifestyle Cornwall, variously torn between frank opposition to its accompanying woes, fatalistic acquiescence and short-term opportunism.

The conference was not limited to commodifying culture, though. Instead, several business chiefs emphasized sentiment and belonging, and considered that Cornish cultural identity contributed to their motivation and gave their business a distinct and advantageous profile. Mike Jordan, who has developed the internationally successful company, Cornish Stairways,[822] from beginnings as a Penryn blacksmith's forge, described how Cornishness informed his work and how customers in London and abroad associated him and his company positively with Cornwall: 'It's geographically placed me. Architects don't forget me and they've often been to Cornwall.' John Dudding, managing director of Hirst Magnetic Instruments, added that coming from Cornwall raised curiosity and helped develop relationships which he later likened to his positive perception of business contacts from Wales.[823] Peter Ugalde of the food company, *Proper Cornish,* furthermore related Cornishness to how he sought to do business, making oblique references to social capital and Cornwall's image.[824] These might be more fruitful areas for Revivalists to explore than commodification. For

---

[821] Managers at Co-op Breizh estimated this to be in the tens of thousands.
[822] http://www.cornishstairways.com/ (Accessed 2nd May 2011.)
[823] Discussion at Threemilestone, December 2011.
[824] The company sponsors *The Celtic Link*: http://www.thecelticlink.com/sponsors/

example, they could develop the potential for performers to be informal ambassadors for the whole economy, not just tourism. This is lost on public bodies (Cornwall Council included) and there is failure to grasp that the audiences of Cornish performances abroad include possible business collaborators and supporters in all domains.

At *Brest 2012*,[825] Europe's largest maritime festival and an important showcase for maritime industries, just over a hundred miles away, Cornwall was almost the only Atlantic Arc region without a stall to promote trade and industry and publically sponsored performances and exhibitions. Similarly at the Lorient Interceltic Festival, 2012, the Cornish Language Partnership ran a small stand, staffed by volunteers whilst funded performers from Asturias, Australia, Galicia, Ireland, the Isle of Man, New Brunswick, Scotland and Wales accompanied professionally mounted exhibitions.[826] In just one day I met dozens of business people, public representatives and journalists who wanted to know about Cornwall, including Paul Molac,[827] since elected to the French parliament, and sales representatives of the yacht company Beneteau.[828] What they all shared was Pan-Celtic identifications that produce an affective predisposition to work with Cornish people.

In particular, Cornwall appears to be missing a trick in not using culture and heritage to make explicit links between its industrial past and the technological present and future. This could boost morale by allowing the identity myths of the globe-trotting, 'Industrial Celt' to be set in the here and now, and it could support a realistic brand built around innovation, skill and the credibility that accrues from a demonstrable engineering pedigree. This connection is not made by regeneration bodies but the ingredients of industrial heritage and an industrially-motivated diaspora could be used to brand Cornwall

---

[825] I attended. http://www.lestonnerresdebrest2012.fr/fr/ (Accessed 2nd January 2013.)
[826] http://festival-interceltique.com/ (Accessed 2nd January 2013.)
[827] http://www.udb-bzh.net/index.php/fr/les-elections/1014-paul-molac-est-elu-2;
[828] http://www.beneteau.fr/Beneteau/Savoir-faire

differently whilst simultaneously binding Revivalism to 'Proper Cornishness'. As discussed earlier, Cornwall has falteringly-transmitted narratives and myths that are well suited to branding for technology. Requisites such as dynamism, innovation, enterprise, imagination, efficiency, 'workishness' and reliability may be claimed and asserted as aspects of an industrial attitude to combat Lifestyle Cornwall's 'longed-for Cornish laid-back feel'.[829]

Cornish Studies students may recognize these attributes as resembling those ascribed to Cornish people in the late nineteenth century when such flattering adjectives as: fearless, enterprising, indomitable, industrious and independent, peppered accounts.[830] Joined-up institutional interventions might use heritage and culture strategically to tell a story of cultural and technological continuity that foregrounds industry, invention, connectedness and maritime potential. This would update narratives of past industrial prowess so that working in engineering developments and cutting-edge technologies and developing international connections is presented as a 'natural' succession. It might therefore be possible to support a community 'mythology' that accords with a brand message that includes something like this:

'Cornwall's culture of engineering, mining and ship-building is being transformed into innovation in cutting-edge technologies and internationally connected businesses by a generation that is inspired by Cornwall's history as a centre of world mining and invention.'

UNESCO's designation of a Mining World Heritage Site (2006)[831] is opportune. It represents, 'a significant but slightly mysterious sea

---

[829] http://www.visitcornwall.com/whats-on/rock-oyster-festival (Accessed, 7th January 2013.)

[830] cf. Philip Payton (1992), p.110; P. J. Payton (1996), p.210-211.

[831] http://www.cornish-mining.org.uk/ (Accessed 7th November 2012.)

change in the ways in which Cornwall's industrial heritage is viewed'[832] and could therefore be used for the kind of brand proposed above; but as some people involved acknowledge, it has, 'to date, been almost wholly linked to bolstering and diversifying [Cornwall's] leisure industry.'[833] An important element is 'Heartlands' in the middle of the Camborne-Redruth conurbation, - a £30 million, Cornwall Council-led project close to South Crofty where a re-launch of metal mining is underway. Heartlands is promoted as 'A Brave New World Heritage Site' a 'Cultural Playground' and '19 acres of eclectic fun'[834] whilst sceptics criticize it as a sanitized theme-part that cleanses the industrial landscape and supports the lifestyle brand. It is probably all of these things but it is also an opportunity to communicate a different message, there being nothing inherent in the idea of a heritage site that precludes using it to brand non-leisure activities. On the contrary, public education is a traditional justification but a complaint is that at present heritage commodification for tourism pushes industry further into the past.[835] Similarly, former miners disliked the statue of a nineteenth-century miner in Redruth, wondering why he could not have been from the late twentieth century and have a hydraulic rock drill, instead of being perched on a slab of Chinese granite in a vaguely comic stance.[836] When raised with a heritage site manager, he thought that such an image would be 'too recent', revealing an assumption that picturesque pastness is appropriate. Changing this would be one way to challenge the norm for decision-makers to ignore the recent scale of extractive industry, a residual skills base and cultural predispositions towards corresponding types of employment in sections of the community. In the mid to late 1980s more than 2,000 people worked directly in tin mining, around 9,000 in China clay and hundreds more in granite and slate quarrying, not to mention related industries. Even today, China Clay

---

[832] E-mail exchanges with Adam Sharp of the Mining World Heritage Site.
[833] ibid.
[834] http://www.heartlandscornwall.com/ (Accessed 26th July 12.)
[835] Heard at Camborne School of Mines.
[836] Conversations with David Richards, Richard Ormond, Gus Williams and a man recently returned from mining in Zambia.

employs around 1,800 people.[837] Little over twenty years ago these industries combined as one of the most important sectors of the economy, yet decision-makers and heritage managers overlook this:

> Given the period of time which has elapsed since Cornwall's industrial sites were substantial contributors to its economic base, and also a major employer, a process of re-interpretation and re-evaluation will inevitably take place.[838]

Industrial heritage, regardless of commodification and preservation, provide important symbolic reference for Cornish people so raising its profile, valuing it and relating it to the promise of a dynamic future could contribute to emotional capital. In response to this suggestion, heritage management professional agreed with varying degrees of conviction but interestingly one person thought that the benefits would apply most to the indigenous Cornish and 'economically-deprived parts of the county'.[839] It was recognized that heritage could raise the confidence and aspirations of young people through appeals to, 'Cornish identity and an awareness that there is ample evidence that Cornwall could again play a larger role on the national and international stage if it had the opportunity...'[840] This is precisely where the World Heritage Site's contribution to 'raising Cornwall's national and international profile' could be linked to, 'the next stage - building a vibrant and innovative local economy'.[841]

The traces of industry could put Cornwall in the same category as other areas where new technologies are actively encouraged to replace old industries and build upon residual skills and attitudes. Even a degree of industrial grime and dereliction may suggest a serious setting for work, and visiting engineers and scientists are interested by past industrial technology:

---

[837] Information from Imerys.
[838] E-mail exchanges with Adam Sharp of the World Heritage Site.
[839] Ibid.
[840] Ibid.
[841] Ibid.

Guess what, engineers like engineering and if they're into biomass or turbines or oil exploration or whatever, they get off on beam engines... When they come here to work, they're gob-smacked.[842]

A long engineering tradition would therefore seem to be the perfect background for promoting Cornwall's emerging sectors (offshore exploration, renewable energy, marine engineering...) so as to profit from connections. This has been recognized by the former head of Camborne School of Mines:

...mining engineering and minerals processing education in particular are excellent backgrounds for a diverse range of careers and businesses [...] it is wonderful to have on our doorstep modern, high technology companies who are likely to employ our graduates.[843]

In the same vein, a cluster of businesses at Wheal Jane (a former mine) that build upon mining skills have been related to the knowledge economy:

[T]he technologies deployed in these businesses have evolved from the mining sciences which put Cornwall at the forefront of the industrial age and today these emerging businesses use cutting-edge technologies in environmental services and dot com applications to add value to our knowledge-based economy.[844]

The transferability of skills is also understood by students:

When I finish my degree, I don't know. I'll try and get a mine surveying job somewhere in the U.K. or go abroad for a bit but I could just as easily work in civil engineering or something else that uses the skills.[845]

---

[842] Conversation with Ian Richards, Pool, August 2011.

[843] Keith Atkinson, Cornwall Provost University of Exeter and previously Chair of the Combined Universities in Cornwall Executive, former Head of Camborne School of Mines.

[844] Carleen Kelemen, director of the Objective One Partnership, 14th June 2007, 'Cutting rock to cutting edge' (unlocated document received).

[845] A student at the C.S.M. Test Mine, November 2011.

A public project that grasps some of these issues is the 'Cornwall Brand',[846] which is 'primarily aimed at businesses which operate in the knowledge economy sectors'. These are defined rather narrowly as, 'environmental technology, aerospace, medical and I.T. sectors'[847] but Cornwall Brand's website includes a rare instance of the leisure image being identified as a problem:

> Many still see Cornwall as just a beautiful holiday destination - a great place to relax, but not one that they associate with dynamic companies delivering state-of-the-art products and services that can compete with the best in the world.[848]

The website combats this 'one-dimensional perception'[849] with technological images, vocabulary and news in order to, 'Promote Cornwall's entrepreneurial expertise' and 'represent a dynamic Cornwall'. Absurdly though, Cornwall Brand is associated with Cornwall Development Company and funded by Objective One Convergence and Cornwall Council, meaning that it is institutionally and financially linked to bodies that send contradictory messages. In the absence of a global Council policy on managing Cornwall's image, closely related organizations offer competing messages that are financed by the same public sources.

If conflicts of interest between a leisure-lifestyle brand and other options should seem insurmountable, we only have to think for a while to come up with countries and regions whose prevalent images impress us with their capacity in multiple economic, social and cultural fields whilst also being aesthetically and affectively appealing. Britons might think of New Zealand, Australia and Canada in this way, for instance and many Europeans think of the Catalan capital, Barcelona as

---

[846] http://www.cornwallbrand.co.uk/ (Accessed July 2012.)
[847] ibid
[848] ibid
[849] ibid

economically and socially dynamic, culturally rich and blessed with a top football club. The point is that geographical locations can have positive, valorizing images which are relatively diverse and which do not carry too many negative caveats so it might be possible to displace Cornwall's one-dimensional lifestyle brand with something less distorting.

It is not enough to be liked because a brand that is based wholly on the attractiveness of scenery and lifestyles, or even upon cultural difference and likability, will not have ingredients for industry and business. Having a high profile that works for one economic sector is not the same thing as having the best brand. When it comes to building a strong, diverse economy, perceptions of capacity may be more important than media prominence, so a territory that is seldom in the news may nevertheless have a brand that is suited to its needs. Cornwall's high-profile brand currently favours a small number of sectors and development interests at the expense of large swathes of the population so a public brand needs to ensure that leisure imagery does not exclude other sectors, including those which already contribute more economically.[850]

Anholt suggests that trying to, 'contradict or erase long-standing negative perceptions that are deeply rooted in other countries',[851] can be counterproductive because, 'Public opinion often remains strongly attached to negative perceptions about countries, just because they are deeply rooted and picturesque, and will resist even quite categorical proof against such views.'[852] The foundations of Lifestyle Cornwall come into this category and include problematic images that have emerged from tourism, the arts and romantic novels (e.g. Daphe du Maurier, Winston Graham and E.V. Thompson) over the last two hundred years.

---

[850] ONS figures in 2011 show leisure-related industries represent 11% of the economy.
[851] Simon Anholt (2010), *Places, Identity, Image and Reputation,* Basingstoke and New York: Palgrave Macmillan, p.144.
[852] ibid, p.146.

As Anholt remarks, 'people will never voluntarily 'trade down' from an exciting and negative but incorrect perception to a boring and positive but correct one',[853] and those of Lifestyle Cornwall are so closely bound to escapist fictions and holidays that they would be hard to tackle head on with hope of success. Anholt's advice is sobering but not defeatist and founded on the principle that it is easier to 'direct a moving perception' than stable ideas. As a starting point he advocates concentrating on aspects of image that are easier to influence and suggests making links with opinion trends on wider issues (e.g. climate change, the global economic situation...).[854] Cornwall has the advantage of public and media attention and an image that is already on the move, albeit in the direction of leisure service dependency, so it might be feasible to step in and steer a preferred course, adopting Anholt's strategy of identifying ideas that people are happy to drop or adopt. In Cornwall's case, they may cling stubbornly to picturesque and romantic notions, for instance, whilst willingly abandoning the idea that Cornwall is unconnected, behind the times and problem-free. Lifestyle Cornwall rearranges established ideas, adding new elements to create a still developing image that, for all its problems, is dynamic and shifting, opening people's minds enough to offer an entry point for intervention. Cornwall could therefore seize the opportunity of being en vogue[855] to build a viable brand for the whole economy.

Tourism presents the opportunity to address 4.5 to 5 million visitors each year so a joined-up strategy could take advantage of this to present a multidimensional image. Visitors include people from all walks of life, including prime ministers,[856] business leaders, journalists and civil servants so there is ample scope for altering outside perceptions and influencing decision-making. For example, Cornish

---

[853] ibid.

[854] Simon Anholt, 'Is this about me? – The critical issue of relevance', in *Place Branding and Public Diplomacy* (2009) 5, 253–259.

[855] So described by Will Hawkes in an article on beers and small breweries: http://blogs.independent.co.uk/2012/01/27/beer-cornwall-is-now-en-vogue/ (Accessed 10th July 2012.)

[856] Regulars have included David Cameron, Margaret Thatcher and Harold Wilson.

cultural performance could inform visitors about Cornwall's international connections, highlight aspirations and spread awareness of social, economic and cultural issues. Interesting technological and business innovations could be show-cased and associated with mining heritage. Already, Visit Cornwall report that, '80% of visitors know we've got industrial history',[857] so this is really just a matter of continuing the story into the present. It is apparent that visitors are interested, rather than repelled, by encounters with working life. In Falmouth they stop to photograph dry docks and cranes and at Wheal Martyn China Clay Museum they view a working clay pit. This could mean creating relationships with visitors and providing multi-faceted images of Cornwall. Commercially it could develop the affective phenomenon remarked upon at the Bewnans Kernow conference, leading former holiday-makers to buy Cornish produce and do business with Cornish firms.

The potential for building upon the visitor experiences is also suggested by strategies from Brittany where cultural identity is used in both domestic and external marketing.[858] The label 'Produit en Bretagne' brings together hundreds of companies and several thousand products, representing hundreds of thousands of jobs and it consciously valorizes the Breton language and culture, extending a label that began with the food and drink sector to include everything from construction firms and companies that manufacture car parts and beds to geothermal energy and accountancy services.[859] It builds upon partnerships between universities, cultural bodies and industry and it works because non-commercial uses of culture generate group solidarity amongst insiders that can be communicated to outsiders.[860] Commercial uses thus depend upon Breton motivations, extending loyalty solidarity to external

---

[857] Comments by Malcolm Bell of *Visit Cornwall* at the Bewnans Kernow conference, 'Cornwall means Business', 12th February 2011.

[858] e.g. Presentation by Jean Ollivro, Université Populaire Bretonne, Chambre de Commerce de Lorient, 12th August 2010.)

[859] http://www.produitenbretagne.com/La-Maison--2803-0-0-0.html (Accessed 20th August 2012.)

[860] Communications from Pierre Colin and Jacques Jaouen.

markets as a kind of friendship.[861] A publicity campaign for 'Produit en Bretagne' combines images of the Breton flag at the head of a demonstration with the caption '*Génération Solidaire!*' and the slogan '*L'achat solidaire pour l'emploi.*', and another advertisement uses the Breton phrase '*Plijadur penn da benn*' (Pleasure from beginning to end.). The latter appears in advertizing throughout France (in the Paris Metro, at the Stade de France and the Cannes Film Festival) where it appeals to people who are well-disposed towards Brittany, including many thousands who appreciate Breton music. Once again culture benefits the economy indirectly instead of just being a commercial commodity itself and performers act as ambassadors.[862] Breizh, the Breton name for Brittany, and its abreviation 'BZH' is becoming well-known to French people and is used to name everything from small businesses (Breizh Pizza) to estate agents (Breizh Immobilier) and the highly successful Breizh Cola which has largely ousted Coca Cola in many bars and supermarkets.[863]

Private branding exercises usually ignore wider social, economic and cultural considerations and they do so for good commercial reasons. A brewery that produces local beers, for example, does not have to think about how the imagery it chooses contributes to perceptions of a region or country and doing so might even compromise its profit margin. It just has to sell beer and may exploit stereotypes or clichés to do so; but although private branding is a matter for individual enterprises, it is reasonable to expect public institutions to consider the overall interests of the populations they represent. Such an approach would be expected to lead all levels of government and their agencies to agree objectives and preferred images and to coordinate strategies before intervening in representation. Even if this cannot be extended to external bodies,

---

[861] Discussed with Jakez Bernard, President of Produit en Bretagne; cf. Television discussion, 'Terres et mers de Bretagne', France 3, 26th December 2010.

[862] e.g. http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=AuG8ypSXjWE; http://www.dna.fr/actualite/2012/08/08/alan-stivell-defend-la-culture-celtique-et-nolwenn-leroy (Accessed 27th October 2012.)

[863] http://www.breizhcola.fr/ (Accessed 26th October 2012.)

Cornwall Council might rise to the challenge on its own and develop a clear collective strategy on representation which it is prepared to respect in its own work and assert in dealings with agencies, quangos, central government and business.

This cannot be separated from strategic planning because it is bound up with desires for the future, questions of identity, economic controversies and political debates. At present though, officers and councillors confirm that there is no coordinated approach or policy, despite consideration at senior levels.[864] There is, however, a degree of frustration which bodes well for future initiatives: 'There is a lot of good work going on in Cornwall, within and without the council, yet to read the local press you would hardly know it.'[865] Some at Lys Kernow wish to, 'work with partners to develop more of a "campaigning" style, for Cornwall, rather than any sectional interests.',[866] but are thwarted by certain limitations. Isolated efforts are dissipated for wont of coordination and political direction and relevant policies that are voted upon by councillors are not then translated into a purposeful strategy on Cornwall's image. For example, 'supporting regional distinctiveness' is a policy intention but it is commonly subverted or ignored. Like similar policies on 'sustainability', it has funding implications that can be reduced to box-ticking exercises and an occasional nod to indigenous Cornish cultures, thus adding ethnic 'Kernow-wash' to the 'green-wash' of fake environmentalism.

The first stage in any coherent branding exercise is identifying aims and objectives, so it is proposed that Cornwall's institutions should unambiguously take sides in conflicts of interest and develop an image that supports community resilience, addresses disadvantage and maintains an ethno-cultural continuity. Although it would be naïve to

---

[864] Communications from the Chief Executive's Department (1st to 5th March 2012.)
[865] ibid.
[866] ibid.

suppose that it is possible to implement a strategy with full success, the fact is that public bodies already intervene massively and expensively in image-making for multiple ends, such as attracting visitors, wooing new businesses and promoting themselves as institutions. An example was the commissioning of a Cornwall Council logo in 2008 at a cost of £476,000. The exercise failed to appreciate widespread attachment to the former Cornwall 'County' Council's arms and their references to identity narratives so had to be abandoned in the face of protests about the cost and the design.

The proposed logo, rejected after public protests.

The point is that this is just one example of matter-of-fact public branding and image-making being undertaken disjointedly without an overarching strategy, local knowledge or convincing consultation. Public bodies with differing agendas present Cornwall in conflicting ways and spend large sums doing so. If public promotion is to continue, its compartmentalized activities should be replaced with a cohesive policy with aims and objectives. Ironically, given the massive scale of public financing for selective images and sectors, Council officers say that it is conflicts of interest and political differences that make a coherent strategy difficult to achieve.[867] Without a clear political will, a worry is that proactive policy-making would leave officers open to charges of 'spin doctoring' and favouring certain interests,[868] yet this is precisely what happens already. These supposed limitations do not hinder piecemeal branding and publicity by individual departments, nor do they inhibit non-elected agencies. In practice some kinds of branding

---

[867] Communications from Chief Executive's Office, Cornwall Council, 1st March 2012.
[868] ibid.

and promotion, and particularly those connected to tourism, are rendered banal, unremarkable and almost unquestionable by strong neo-liberal discourses. Thus their economic discrimination passes unnoticed. The departmental organization of regional government reinforces disconnected and contradictory approaches which are further fragmented by the practice of creating companies and agencies for specific tasks. Departments and officers charged uniquely with specific roles, such as attracting businesses, marketing heritage sites or boosting visitor numbers, have nothing to gain professionally by compromising them in the wider interest.

The need for common purpose is basic wisdom in the hard-headed world of branding and Anholt observes that regions and countries 'will only get where they're going if they all agree what they want and who they are.'[869] He makes some analogies with corporate culture and discusses 'brand purpose' using such vocabulary as: - 'shared values', 'spirit' and 'common purpose'.[870] This can be related to the above mentioned idea of connecting image and brand management to the strengthening and shaping of a 'mythology' that agrees with Cornish narratives and aspirations. Branding messages work best if accepted, relayed and lived out by the communities concerned so to be useful the Cornwall's public brand needs to connect convincingly to imagined identities and to a desirable future that interpellates local people.[871] Imposed brands that fail to do this give rise to scepticism and may be rumbled as cynically motivated fictions, so although it is the role of

---

[869] Simon Anholt, Keynote speech to the E.U. (2011), http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=baxr9Ie0zqg (Accessed, May 2011.); cf. S. Anholt, 'Place branding: Is it marketing or isn't it?', in Place Branding and Diplomacy (2008) 4, 1-6. Palgrave Macmillan. https://secure.palgrave-journals.com/pb/journal/v4/n1/full/6000088a.html (Accessed 12th June 2012.)

[870] Simon Anholt (2007), p.5.

[871] cf. Simon Anholt, 'Is this about me? – The critical issue of relevance', in *Place Branding and Public Diplomacy* (2009) 5, 253–259. https://secure.palgrave-journals.com/pb/journal/v5/n4/full/pb200917a.html (Accessed 12th June 2012.)

administrations to take a lead, a top-down policy cannot really work without incorporating bottom-up narratives.

Chapter Nine

Kernow or Kernowland?

This thesis began by taking the subjective pro-position that Cornish cultures are worth maintaining and it has explored some ways in which they could be employed in working towards more resilient and inclusive communities in the wake of economic and demographic transformations that could be said to have changed everything and shaken the foundations of local identities. During the course of the discussion, though, this proposition has been shown to be far from straightforward. Some circumstances have been exposed which render certain strategies untenable and have implications for how Cornish cultural practitioners and language revivalists undertake their work, as well as for future policy and image-management to influence public perceptions. This chapter therefore includes some warnings and recommendations to the Cornish Movement and indicates ways in which change could be brought about.

The term 'Cornish Movement', normally applied to the organized activities of Celtic Revivalism and political nationalism, has been extended to a broader, more diffuse spectrum of cultural and political phenomena that result from the pervasive effects of Cornish ethnic and nationalist discourses. These have been linked to everyday responses to Cornwall's 'new circumstances' and to administrative, economic and demographic trends that threaten the material and social foundations of a distinctly Cornish community. Although this has highlighted the oneness of the Cornish Movement as an assertion of group identity and solidarity, it has also revealed its heterogeneity as a nebulous assemblage of responses that encompasses widely differing ideas about what constitutes Cornish culture, how that culture might best be maintained and transmitted and which purposes it should serve.

Recognizing an underpinning unity has allowed the Movement to be considered as a focus for community organization and networking whilst considering its heterogeneity and that of Cornish society has made it possible to begin fleshing out the complexity of issues that are sometimes reduced to binary oppositions and an exclusive focus on ethnicity. Accordingly, the Cornish Movement has been identified, firstly as a set of discursive formations that challenge imposed representations and decisions, and secondly as a site of conflicting internal imaginings and cultural hygienes. It brings together agents who collectively offer the prospect of beneficial change but also risks being diverted and missing that vital opportunity.

The point has been made that in reacting to ascribed representations and challenging them, Cornish responses are themselves influenced by external discourses so that it is hard and ultimately misleading to clearly differentiate 'insider' and 'outsider' versions. Thus, although the Cornish Movement provides most of the discursive and symbolic means by which indigenous Cornish people (and affective allies) perceive and defend their collective interests and perpetuate group identity, it also allows for unhelpful outside imaginings of Cornishness to be elected by 'insiders' and incorporated into conscious identity performances. Revivalist cultures are therefore at the centre of new struggles for meaning that mirror the material conflicts between a 'Lifestyle Cornwall' of 'exclusive' residential developments and leisure services that bypasses Cornish people and inhibits the creation of a diverse economy and socially inclusive community regeneration.

Some activities, created for militantly Revivalist, nationalist or simple community-strengthening purposes, appear to be undergoing re-signification for the creation of various counter-urban lifestyles that all depend upon imagining Cornwall, in one way or another, as an accessible, lightly 'green-washed' rural escape with beaches, good

schools, safe streets, middle-class cultural attributes and corresponding recreational facilities. At the same time, Cornish symbols are being safely imported into the marketing of Cornwall as a consumable experience. In other words, a revamped Revivalist package risks becoming part of the upgraded lifestyle offer that, for example, Cornwall Council makes in assuming that candidates for key posts will be long-stay visitors with a hankering for outdoor pursuits:

> Have you considered working for an organisation that consistently offers its lawyers an incredible variety of interesting and demanding legal work? If you have, then why not do it in a place with outstanding natural beauty, where you are surrounded by surf, sand and spectacular moorland.[872]

These dangers were brought starkly into focus by poorly-spelt but insightful comments on the news site, *This is Cornwall* where individuals allied to the Cornish Movement clash in discussions with free-market opponents on an almost daily basis:

> It is a source of great irritation for [name] and his handfull (*sic.*) of extremist fellow nationalists that the point of difference they worked so hard to manufacture, i.e. a seperate (*sic.*) identity, is the very thing that works against their miserable end goal. Whilst Team Kernow carries on his lost battle the rest of us are getting rich on the marketing tool he thought was his alone. It must really get up his nose.....lol.[873]

The correspondent's goading reveals something that Revivalists prefer not to acknowledge, namely that picturesque, invented and 'revived' traditions are tailor-made for branding Cornwall as a counter-urban destination for visitors and one-off movers, perhaps fuelling the developments that threaten the future of Cornishness itself, even whilst they

---

[872] Advertisment by Cornwall Council, 17th December 2012.
[873] http://www.thisiscornwall.co.uk/Devon-Cornwall-communities-left-scourge-second/story-17361766-detail/story.html, (Accessed, 20th November 2012.)

paradoxically offer the means to resist them. They may contribute to the Lifestyle Cornwall brand that 'manufactures desire'[874] for repeat holidays (fueling second-home purchases) and also sells Cornwall as a single purchase, - a place to move to and enjoy the blissful promise of working less, playing more and having a slower pace of life. It appears that Revivalist imagery is beginning to contribute to the construction of a safe and heavily commodified simulation of Cornishness that, may exist independently of any lived, ethno-cultural reality and with disregard for socio-economic conditions. Like those ersatz commercial performances of Hawaiiana that continue in the near absence of indigenous Hawaiians, Cornish simulations need have no reference to local people.

To explore this further it is useful to turn to general discussions of how heritage and culture are commodified as signs in consumer society and under postmodern conditions. In Frederic Jameson's identification of 'Late Capitalism'[875] or Jean Baudrillard's 'hyper-reality',[876] culture takes the form of representation and cultural performance in the broadest sense and it is consumed in the form of products which may be material or non-material. Under these conditions, Mike Featherstone observes that distinctions between art, culture and commerce have become increasingly unclear and that the whole of everyday life is aesthetic and subject to the all-pervasive reach of commodification.[877] The consumption of signs as exchange-value may thus be considered to be what drives consumer capitalism and it is a situation which leads us away from direct lived experience towards a consumption of signs.[878]

---

[874] See Arthur Asa Berger (2008 [1996]), *Manufacturing Desire: Media, Popular Culture, and Everyday Life*, New Brunswick and London: Transaction Publishers.

[875] Frederic Jameson, 'Postmodernism or the Cultural Logic of Late Capitalism', *New Left Left Review*, No. 46, (1984).

[876] Jean Baudrillard (1983 [in French, 1981]), *Simulacra and Simulation*s, translated by Foss, New York: Semiotext(e).

[877] Mike Featherstone (1991), *Consumer Culture and Postmodernism,* London and Newbury Park, California: Sage.

[878] See Madan Sarup (1993), *An introductory Guide to Post-Structuralism and Postmodernism*, 2nd edition, Harvester Wheatsheaf, p.162.

In Baudrillard's terms, this 'seduction' involves us being 'bombarded' by images and 'saturated' by representation to the point that 'authentic', first-hand cultural experience cannot be distinguished from those aspects that are packaged and consumed. Baudrillard identifies four orders of simulation which are progressively removed from reality. In the first order, 'faithful copies' or images are generally believed whilst, in the second order, unfaithful copies distort reality but nevertheless refer to it. Then, in the third order of simulation, arbitrarily proposed images may obscure the absence of a deep reality and masquerade as faithful copies, despite there being no original. Finally, in the fourth order of simulation, symbols and signs replace reality as *'simulacra'* that have either lost any reference to an original or which were never connected to reality in the first place. Cultural products need no longer even pretend to be real because consumers' cultural lives are largely 'artificial' and what matters most is the exchange-value of signs and their currency as cultural and symbolic capital. Instead of mediating or concealing reality then, fourth order simulacra hide the extent to which reality has become irrelevant to how we make sense of society and everyday life, - or at least that is what Baudrillard maintains and bemoans.

Simulacra, as copies without originals, construct perceived realities with the implication that cultural identities are also consumed as 'simulacra'[879] in the same crowded and competitive market-place that has been discussed in relation to branding. If we adopt this perspective, the magnitude and intensity of representations of Cornwall and the Cornish make this an extreme case[880] of an identity that is 'bombarded' with commercially or romantically preferred themes and their composition and volume have been altered and amplified significantly by a still evolving 'lifestyle brand'. This effectively leaves oppositional

---

[879] Jean Baudrillard (1983), op. cit.
[880] cf. Neil Kennedy and Nigel Kingcome (1998), op. cit.

voices hoarsely shouting and gesturing against a semiological wall of sight and sound.

Baking a Cornish Pastiche.

Lifestyle Cornwall is itself a stark example of the commodification of culture in the form of consumable signs, including simulacra which have little or no reference to any 'real' aspect of Cornishness. Some of them might be said to be bringing about the circumstances in which the distinction between a Cornish reality and its representation is disappearing for insiders and is unperceivable and irrelevant for many visitors and in-migrants. Much of what Lifestyle Cornwall serves up could be described by the inevitable pun, 'Cornish pastiche'[881] and related to Jameson's identification of pastiche as an important aspect of postmodern cultural production.[882] Basically, pastiche involves re-using existing cultural elements and may combine them with other characteristics of postmodern culture, - namely eclecticism, fusion and *bricolage*, as well as reflecting current attitudes of relativism, scepticism and commercial cynicism. These characteristics manifest themselves to varying degrees within the phenomena that contribute to Lifestyle Cornwall but it is notable that appropriations of Cornish 'distinctiveness' as saleable heritage, as marketable imagery and as the recyclable material of cultural production, often takes the form of pastiche. Commodification cannibalizes items from various cultural pasts and presents them in recycled, disembedded and sometimes distorted forms. Although there is usually no intended parody, neither is there any serious intent beyond exchange-value and the consumption of signs as ephemeral commodities.

---

[881] ibid.
[882] Frederic Jameson (1991), op. cit.

The commercial display of Cornish history and the production of commercial art forms very often combine appeals to the past with shallow imitations or simulations that correspond to Jameson's characterization of pastiche as 'blank parody'.[883] Pastiche and simulation also extend to the cultural industries where much of the arbitrarily 'tasteful' production aimed at discerning, middle-class consumers reworks elements from a specifically Cornish heritage and from earlier art forms. This is evidenced, for example, in numerous galleries that sell paintings that reuse elements from the original work of the St. Ives modernists and the naïve artists, Alfred Wallis and Bryan Pearce.[884] These phenomena have not just happened overnight but have been present in the commodification of Cornwall's culture since the days of the 1960s plastic pisky, fisherman's smock and Cornish cream tea. Now though, they have intensified and extended into all aspects of culture.

In Cornwall's burgeoning heritage industries, all of the above forms of simulations and pastiche occur and in practice it is impossible to distinguish clearly between the different registers of visitor 'attraction' or theme-park, and serious, educational 'site'. Most notably, the heritage industries present fragments of history or consumable images as 'bombardments of "perpetual" presents'[885] and recombine cultural elements in much the same ways as sound-bites are reassembled to produce an entertaining, but not necessarily informative, radio programme. Sanitized presentations entrench a presumption against industry and in favour of leisure, creating further consumable experiences that are detached from working reality: 'The paradox of the

---

[883] ibid.

[884] e.g., http://www.beside-the-wave.co.uk/index2.htm;
http://www.cornwallartgalleries.com/galleries/gallery-thirty-one-falmouth;
http://searches.falmouth.co.uk/home/shops-and-businesses/demelzas-gallery-p1113413
(Accessed 14th July 2012).

[885] Frederic Jameson (1988), *Post-Modernism and Consumer Society*, in A. Gray and J.McGuigan (eds.) (1997), Studies in Culture: An Introductory Reader London: Arnold, pp. 192-205.

industrial museum movement is that it is ultimately anti-industrial…'[886] Thus instead of being used, as earlier suggested, to present Cornwall as a place where technology and innovation can happen, industrial heritage sites are stripped of any connection to a working present and incorporated into the Lifestyle brand. This is one of the points at which the received discourses and reflex practices within regional governance and regeneration (as Bourdieu's *doxa*, Barthes' *myth* and Foucault's *technique*)[887] may be exposed as having their origins in fictions and simulations of Cornwall that are removed from basic realities. Just as present heritage industries misrepresent an industrial past, so earlier tourism-linked simulations of Cornwall have overwritten modernity, achievement, geographical connections and technology to produce a palimpsest which obscures them.

Kernowland a'gas dynnargh.[888]

It is also in the areas of pastiche and simulation that Lifestyle Cornwall interacts most with the practices of the Cornish Revival. Firstly, Revivalism includes strands of strong political opposition to the economic and social trends that contribute to Lifestyle Cornwall but it is an opposition that is increasingly compromised by unwitting contributions to the lifestyle brand itself. Whereas this sometimes involves intentional acts, promotion of the lifestyle phenomenon is unintentional and inadvertent. Revivalists furnish visual material for commercially motivated pastiche by others in tourism, leisure and related branding and they also engage in pastiche themselves. Their cultural production resembles other postmodern practices in its intertextual recycling and recombination of elements and in the ways it

---

[886] Robert Hewison (1987), *The Heritage Industry: Britain in a climate of decline*, London: Methuen, p. 104.
[887] Approaches to 'common-sense' application of discursively-produced 'truths'. cf, Chevallier and Chauviré (2010), op. cit. p.56; Gavin Kendall and Gary Wickham (1999), op. cit.; Barthes (1957), op. cit.
[888] 'Welcome to Cornwall - Kernow a'gas dynnargh' is the wording on current signs.

re-imagines cultural pasts and tries to define the present and future. 'Revivals', re-inventions and invented traditions rake through the ashes of the cultural past and are shaped discursively by cultural hygienes to produce new practices and forms as simulacra of Celtic Cornwall which also incorporate simulations of Celtiticity from elsewhere. These practices simulate imagined ideals and attach meanings to them as signs and symbols, and in symbolically emphasizing ethnic identity, many of them appeal to variously sentimental, romantic, kitsch[889] and picturesque aesthetics. Much of this visual repertoire is a gift for marketing. It can be used to brand products for insiders, connecting with and being part of the oppositional rallying calls of the Cornish Movement and it can also serve to sell Cornwall as a recreational experience for outsiders. The same polysemous elements may therefore be used for naming and branding everything from beer and free-range eggs to goat's cheese and holiday cottages. The ongoing re-signification of Revivalist items that has already been noted and the collaboration of some practitioners with cultural commodification therefore raises the possibility that Lifestyle Cornwall is being complemented by a parallel 'Kernowland'[890] that departs from the socially engaged and embedded project imagined by Nance and some of his politicized successors.

Kernowland shares characteristics of hyper-reality with Baudrillard's analysis of Disneyland where, 'all the tangled orders of simulation' come together[891] and may be related to visitors' consumption of the 'authenticity' of places, populations and cultures as commodities. Visitors bring expectations with them that have been shaped by what they have already seen and heard whilst, as the object of their interest (and consumers of representations themselves), local people sometimes modify their behaviour and culture, either acting out ascribed roles with cynicism or genuinely believing in them. In much the same way as

---

[889] e.g. Jonathan Howelett, 'Putting the Kitsch into Kernow', in P.J.Payton (ed.), *Cornish Studies,* no. 12, pp. 30-60.
[890] Neil Kennedy and Nigel Kingcome (1998), op. cit.
[891] Jean Baudrillard (1983), op. cit., pp. 1-13 and 23-49.

described by John Urry in *'The Tourist Gaze',*[892] it involves evolving and multiple gazes, including those that uphold Cornwall as authentically Other. The latter have been found to get some Revivalists unduly exited and hopeful that Cornish identity is being recognized. At last, they suggest, there is 'awareness' that Cornwall has 'its own language and culture', yet just as cinema-goers do not have to believe in Tolkein's elves in order to watch the film of *The Hobbit* (2012), visitors do not actually have to believe in Cornish 'difference' in order to gaze upon it. The Cornish language may arouse interest but not enjoy much more credibility than those tongues invented by Tolkein (with a dose of Welsh and Finnish).

If we apply Baudrillard's analysis, the *simulacrum* is removed from authenticity but may nevertheless be consumed as a sign of the real in a willing suspension of disbelief that need not be lasting or deep. Featherstone expands upon this, suggesting that the quest for authenticity may be abandoned by visitors who consume performances of identity as spectacle and as sensual experience, entering into the spirit of the simulation without having to believe in a 'pre-simulational reality' or being bothered by whether such a reality exists. Just like viewers of *The Hobbit* or *Avatar*, they enjoy what he calls, 'the play of the real',[893] and 'have no time for authenticity and revel in the constructed simulational nature of tourism which they know is only a game.'[894] The Kernowland phenomenon may offer such an experience of Cornish simulacra, something to enjoy playfully, even humorously, but not an identity to believe in seriously once the performance is over. Examples of this may occur in the expanding use of Revivalist imagery and Cornish wording to label and name an impressively large range of quality beers. Some of these combine parodies of culture with comic, naughty postcard-style cartoon imagery that recalls the work of Donald McGill. Cornish consumers may read them in a variety of ways that

---

[892] John Urry (1990), *The Tourist Gaze*, Sage.
[893] Mike Featherstone (1991), op. cit. p.60.
[894] Mike Featherstone (1991), op. cit. p.102.

bring together a sense of fun with a liquid refreshment of identity but one of the possibilities for visitors and locals alike is that they also connote a spurious, holiday playground Cornishness. Thus drinking culturally branded 'real ale' does not always mean swallowing a real identity, even if sometimes it does. Whilst simulacra, pastiche and parody may all support insiders' feelings of difference and contribute to strong identities, they do not lead automatically to everybody having the conviction that it is really out there in people's homes and work places.

In keeping with the idea of Kernowland as a Disneyesque simulation, some suggestions for professionally developed indigenous performances resemble those theme-park experiences that attract attention in heritage studies, or of those choreographed Massai dancers who entertain visitors to Kenya. They recall the objectified roles of ex-miners as guides at their former places of work and of actors dressed as well-known cartoon characters at Disneyland. Of course, this already happens, at the former Geevor Mine for instance, in the ways that boatmen adopt the roles of old salts for visitors and in general interactions with tourists, but recent propositions from Revivalists raise the spectre of Cornish performers acting out hyper-real versions of a folkloric culture based on invented tradition with varying degrees of similitude as far as a pre-simulational culture is concerned. Thus, like those Peruvian pan-pipe players who sell mass-produced Native American paraphernalia and C.D.s in towns and cities across Europe (including Falmouth and Truro), they could peddle ephemeral Celtic performances and ersatz wares that audiences enjoy momentarily but do not really believe in. In other words, whilst it might be possible for embedded performances to communicate credible political messages about culture and identity, simulacra are just as likely to reinforce scepticism.

Performances of Cornishness have increased as the Cornish have diminished as a proportion of the population and felt the need to assert themelves. In a similar way, it seems likely that some commercial uses of Revivalist imagery and the Cornish language have only become feasible as Cornish people have become less visible and audible. Thus both insider awareness and commercial appropriations may occur in inverse proportion to the quantitative strength of the indigenous Cornish. The suggestion is not that the Cornish can be written off or consigned to the status of irrelevant minority but they could have dipped below an indefinable level that allows hyper-real simulations to be relatively unconstrained by being confronted with contradictory realities. For all the displays of flags, car stickers and bilingual street-names, Cornish people's cultural distinctions have less impact on the everyday experiences of non-Cornish residents and visitors and must surely seem less connected to real people. Cornishness becomes unthreatening, in marked contrast to Welsh or Catalan equivalents where 'outsiders' may be perturbed by the audible presence of different languages, the imminent possibility of greater autonomy and encounters with imagined or real hostility to the English and Spanish respectively. By contrast the Cornish working class may seem hardly more real and present than the spriggans, piskies and giants of legends.[895]

Even without the contributions of Revivalism, Lifestyle Cornwall includes stark examples of the commodification of culture as simulacra and might therefore be thought of as the triumph of processes that critics of tourism dependence and its side-effects identified as 'theme-park Cornwall' in the late 1980s.[896] This was criticized as a low-wage economy of non-Cornish-owned businesses where instead of simply having attractions within it, Cornwall as a whole was fast becoming a

---

[895] Margaret Courtney (1890), Cornish Feasts and Folklore; Craig Weatherhill and Paul Devereux (1994), Myths and Legends of Cornwall, Wilmslow: Sigma Leisure.
[896] Andrew George, 'The Natives are revolting down in the Cornwall Theme-Park', Cornish Scene, (1986) Vol.2.2, p.3.

single, giant playground and developments like those at Land's End were 'The First and Last Straw'.[897] Its acquired image was said to reflect a 'guide-book culture'[898] which was, 'a heady concoction of Celtic Remains, Merlin's Magic Land, tales of smugglers and wreckers, ruined tin mines, pasties, pixies and cream.'[899] In other words, theme-park Cornwall largely fed upon parody, pastiche and simulation of indigenous Cornish culture and in doing so it laid the foundation for Lifestyle Cornwall as its social-climbing successor.

Throughout the 1980s and 90s tourism operators sought to move from seasonally limited business towards 'all-year-round facilities' (an expression, still used in discussions) that would maintain their incomes and create employment. A wide range of attractions was supported by public marketing strategies and new businesses catered to niche markets, targeting specific interests, hobbies and activities. This was also the period in which emphasis was placed on 'making the most of heritage'[900] financially and publicly-owned heritage sites were packaged and marketed with attention to profit-driven imperatives, often resorting to pastiche as 'faction' or 'edutainment'[901] as a substitute for more rigorous public information. Cornish nationalists clashed with interpretations of history at sites managed by English Heritage, publically removing signs and picketing events and a new charity, 'Cornish Heritage', was created to keep other sites open to all and free from commercialization. The commodification and 'interpretation' of heritage sites further added to the density of a tourist map of Cornwall which, like Baudrillard's references to maps of the Gulf War,[902] figured more prominently in the imagination than the 'real' physical territory and represented a Cornwall that increasingly appealed to the social

---

[897] Andrew Lanyon (1985), *The First and Last Straw*, [s.l.]: [s.n.]
[898] B. Deacon, A. George and R. Perry, (1987), *Cornwall at the Crossroads*, op. cit. p.105-116.
[899] ibid, p.106.
[900] 'Tourism'87, Making the most of Heritage', Department of Employment (1987).
[901] i.e. combinations of 'fact' and 'fiction' and of 'education' and 'entertainment'.
[902] Jean Baudrillard (1991), *La Guerre du Golfe n'a pas eu lieu*, Paris: Galilée.

groups ABC1 that Perry found to comprise a majority of in-migrants and which Visit Cornwall reveals to be a majority of tourists today.[903] The density of attractions was reflected in ubiquitous brown road-signs for attractions, complete with the red Tudor rose of English tourism (which provoked a long paint-daubing campaign and their replacement with a Cornish flag logo, c.1999).

As part of the project to transform Cornwall from seasonal holiday destination to year-round 'leisure zone', some bodies turned to the explicit marketing of culture[904] but instead of the culture of 'the present-day Cornish'[905] this was that of the decision-makers and tourism operators themselves, the same middle-brow and metropolitan-orientated assemblage that Perry noted as typifying the largest section of in-migrants.[906] Indeed these new residents made corresponding activities viable, leading to facilities such as the Sterts Theatre and Arts Centre near Liskeard,[907] as well as bodies like the Cornwall Arts Centre Trust in Truro and events like the Daphne du Maurier and Three Spires Festivals. Customer feedback shows that these developments mainly involve people who already live in Cornwall or West Devon, rather than tourists.[908] Against this background, Cornish Revivalists created their own festivals and events but in contrast to those events that benefited from legitimate cultural capital, they did so with only rare instances of funding.[909] The *Lowender Peran* festival of music and dance is the most clearly Revivalist of these and involves hundreds of participants from other Celtic countries, filling hotels and guest houses and including

---

[903] Visit Cornwall visitor survey, 2010, define these as the main social groups who visit.

[904] See, R. Perry *et al.* (1986), 'The Economic Influence of the Arts and Crafts in Cornwall', Exeter: (A study sponsored by South West Arts and Cornwall Planners.)

[905] B. Deacon, A. George and R. Perry, (1987), *Cornwall at the Crossroads*, op. cit., p.113.

[906] Ronald Perry *et al.* (1987), *Counterurbanization: International case studies of socio-economic change in the rural areas*, Norwich.

[907] See, http://www.sterts.co.uk/ (Accessed 10th November 2012.); http://www.artscouncil.org.uk/funding/browse-regularly-funded-organisations/npo/cornwall-arts-centre-trust-truro-ltd/ (Accessed 10th November 2012.)

[908] http://www.dumaurierfestival.co.uk/wp-content/uploads/2012/07/Customer-feedback-from-dMFS-Questionnaire-2012.pdf (Accessed 16th November 2012.)

[909] Communications from Merv Davey, a founder.

outreach activities in schools and public spaces, - all without significant support from the leaders of tourism or arts bodies. In the same way, working-class cultural heritage has hitherto received scant attention:

> In Cornwall, unlike Liverpool or London, very few, if any, examples of working-class heritage are interpreted for the public or promoted by a national organization. Clay-workers' houses or Non-conformist chapels, for instance...[910]

If some of these omissions are beginning to change, this is happening in a context that does not necessarily support the 'primary uses' of culture which have been linked in this discussion to narratives that underpin emotional prosperity and social and human capital. The qualitative transformation of 'Theme-park Cornwall' into 'Lifestyle Cornwall' involves an evolution in the tourist gaze and corresponding changes in the aesthetics and emphasis of tourism that reflect numerous changes in British cultures and lifestyles, including for instance, the heavily accessorized expansion of outdoor, 'designer' sports as signifiers of social standing and the 'foody' trends of television cooking programmes, world cuisines and 'artisan' bakeries.

When Revivalists contribute to aspects of Lifestyle Cornwall they implicitly resign themselves to assumptions about the general direction of development. Some of them have shown that they are unwilling to challenge these assumptions unambiguously and have instead seized upon opportunities to get Cornish elements included and to suggest often tokenistic modifications to projects that others in the Cornish Movement oppose. Gaining acceptance for symbols of national identity and ethnic distinctiveness has been a concern since the early days of the Revival and promoting examples like St. Piran's flag and bilingual signs through commercial projects sometimes leads today's Revivalists to overlook their material impact. For example, an 'exclusive' and

---

[910] Amy Hale, 'Representing the Cornish...' (2001), op. cit., p.191.

controversial development of 3,750 houses by the Duchy of Cornwall near Newquay is to be called Nansledan (broad valley) and have Cornish-only street names, kindly provided by the unpaid Cornish Signage Panel, but the housing itself generates and caters to external demand, adding to the process that CoSERG, Bewnans Kernow and others criticise as destabilizing communities.

Some Revivalists are so confirmed in the idea that English people (homogenized and *en masse*) are dualistically opposed to them that they cannot quite bring themselves to acknowledge that Cornish names could be a pull factor for well-intentioned in-migrants who, like the tourists questioned by Visit Cornwall, find it interesting and attractive. The growth of invented traditions as leisure activities and social outlets also means that some participants do not necessarily look beyond the context of the practices themselves to the notion of an embedded, multidimensional Cornish culture, let alone to the agendas of the Cornish nationalisms and social campaigns that inspired their creation. This is evidenced by the awkwardness that I met from some Revivalists when controversies around development and identity were raised in discussion. Whereas they would once have invariably provoked lively comment and vociferous expressions of anger and often still do, these issues now sometimes meet embarrassment and evasion or clear suggestions that the language, music and dance should be disconnected from nationalist associations.

Revivalists commonly speak of 'promoting' Cornish and Cornish culture, a choice of words that avoids defensive, preservationist vocabulary. Verbs such as 'save', 'defend' and 'preserve' are thought to unhelpfully underline fragility and imply conservatism. It follows that they are self-fulfilling and settle for the un-ambitious aim of standing still and not giving ground. Promotional language is, on the other hand, thought to convey confidence, creative development and a presumption in favour of

recruitment where the Cornish language is 'set to grow exponentially' and Revivalist music and dance have, 'the makings of a vibrant youth culture'. Discussions in Cornish customarily employ the verb *avonsya* (to advance, progress, promote)[911] and Maga and Cornwall Council use the horticultural-sounding buzz-word 'grow'. New strategies aim to, 'grow indigenous Cornish culture' and 'grow the language' with 'professionalization of delivery'.[912] These usages are accompanied by unrelentingly upbeat accounts of dynamic expansion and the active communication of entitlement aimed at countering historic disentitlement and exclusion.

Assertively 'talking up' Cornish cultures like this can improve their image and morale. Just doing it with conviction may raise morale and self-esteem,[913] convince others and produce the factor of 'congeniality'[914] that recruits and retains participants.[915] Like some business practices, it is a puffer-fish strategy of bluff where, by feigning strength and self-confidence, Revivalists hope to be taken at face-value like successful gatecrashers: 'If we don't seem confident they'll [funding bodies] think we're losers and we will be. We should just act like we expect some of our own taxes and money to come back to us.'[916] It is a sound strategy but some instances appropriate the prevalent language of marketing ('promotion', 'grow', 'brand', 'publicity', 'exposure', 'sell') and in doing so they could facilitate a blurring of objectives in policy. The advancement of culture and language is conflated with successful commodification as commercialized difference which is then seized upon as an argument for institutional support.

---

[911] Thus glossed in the draft SWF dictionary, 2012.

[912] Comments at MAGA conference, Lostwithiel, 1st October 2011.

[913] Recalling Mauss' bodily technique. Marcel Mauss (1934), 'Les Techniques du corps', in *Journal de Psychologie,* no. 32 (3-4), Paris: http://classiques.uqac.ca/classiques/mauss_marcel/socio_et_anthropo/6_Techniques_corps/techniques_corps.pdf (Accessed 3rd June 2011.)

[914] Jane Korey (1992), op. cit. suggests that congeniality this is the most important factor for the success of Cornish cultures.

[915] cf. Bourdieu on bluff in relation to individuals and families, (1980), *Le sens pratique,* op. cit.

[916] non-verbatim.

An overall impression is that the assumptions and values of consumer culture now shape and limit the strategies that Revivalist practitioners consider whilst a 'grants culture' means that project leaders apply the imposed criteria of funding bodies when designing their work. The greatest change, already noted, is that parts of the Cornish Movement are now arguing for commercial routes that contribute to the Kernowland phenomenon. This is seen in approaches to performance, heritage, cultural tourism, signage and branding, and although it offers opportunities it also leads to potential problems. Firstly, the primary uses of culture, likened earlier to use-value, are overlooked in a quest for profit through exchange-value that is motivated by a desire for higher status and the frustrations of 'unpaid amateurs' and 'struggling professionals'.[917] Activists argue for creative practices which are good enough to take the cultural high ground and, 'dare to challenge in the interests of excellence' on the 'world stage of regional cultures'.[918] This is expected to reverse the abandonment of Cornish practices which suffer from perceptions of 'low value'.[919] Amateur and professional performers alike share the reasonable belief that value will accrue to practices if they appear in prestigious settings and venues but the extent to which activities are embedded in Cornish community cultures can be ignored.

Avoiding a Second Wrong Turn.

The emergence of a Revivalist inspired, Kernowland dimension is obviously ironic given the longstanding opposition of the Cornish Movement to exploitative forms of tourism and misrepresentation by the heritage industries.[920] At the moment, though, the re-signification of

---

[917] Conversations with musicians and promoters of the website *The Celtic Link*.
[918] Remarks by Bert Biscoe, 12th February 2011.
[919] cf. Ron Perry *et al.* (1986), op. cit. p.86.
[920] cf. Amy Hale, 'Representing the Cornish...' (2001), op. cit., Abstract.

Revivalist items is in its early stages and may be contested if participants become aware of what is happening. As for the current trends observed, there are several possible outcomes. Positively, they could be part of the means by which some of Cornwall's new residents identify with their surroundings and communities and recognize a kind of cultural value in something Cornish, even if that is a simulation. At the same time, though, it could also be part of the means by which they act out superficially anti-consumerist and neo-rural styles, playing at being 'green' country folk. Without those involved being aware, such a scenario could co-opt and distort the Cornish Movement's discourses of difference so as to support the idea of Cornwall as a counter-urban refuge from the realities of twenty-first century urban life, rather than as a forward-looking community with a national or ethno-cultural dimension. The suspicion, from observation of very recent developments within music and dance scenes especially, must be that this is already underway and it fits misappropriations of nationalist discourses in tourism's marketing of 'an exclusive haven beyond the border of the Tamar'[921] and in the branding of 'Cornwall's distinctive lifestyle'.

In the British countryside wealth works to sanitize gentrified enclaves by pricing poorer people out of housing and enabling affluent populations to oppose things that devalue their properties, including economic activities. In parts of Cornwall, relatively inoffensive activities are already opposed whilst almost all unsightly or noisy activities, like refuse dumps, recycling centres and the proposed St. Dennis waste incinerator are imposed upon a small number of relatively disadvantaged areas like United Downs and Goss Moor. Current trends, perhaps best symbolized by planned 'eco-villages',[922] could be an extension of this phenomenon to Cornwall as a whole, whereby the Tamar is transformed from historical ethnic border to the perimeter of simulational Kernowland that is one step away from a gated

---

[921] Visit Cornwall, http://www.visitcornwall.com, op. cit.
[922] See, http://www.eco-bos.com/ (Accessed 9th January 2013.)

community. Some embraces of cultural activity and symbolism by others may not be what they seem to traditional Cornish Revivalists, in other words, but may instead be another form of hyper-real playfulness where the participants have taken up full-time residence in the theme-park and embraced a do-it-yourself subculture which involves 'fourth order simulation' and does not refer to the 'actual' local cultures of the Cornish. The Kernowland phenomenon could therefore worsen the illegitimizing effects of dissonance on 'Proper Cornishness' and hamper efforts to embed Revivalist creativity in the context of 'Common Cornish Habitus' previously discussed. In the worse scenario it could mark the end of Nance's project to create a future culture for everybody as an imaginative synthesis of past and present.

The re-signification of Revivalist elements through commodification, branding and marketing was identified earlier as beginning to serve interests that are driving speculative housing developments and unsustainable migration trends. It is proposed, therefore, that the Cornish Movement has arrived at a crucial turning point (somewhere on the wrong side of CoSERG's 'crossroads'), where its adherents need to develop sophisticated practices of reflection, consciousness-raising (similar to the focus of 1970s feminisms) and strategies that take account of these dangers. By this, I mean that, in so far as it is possible, the movers and shakers within language revitalization and cultural projects need to become aware of polysemy and the ease with which the meanings that they attribute to cultural items may be intentionally or unintentionally subverted. In post-structuralist terms, every aspect of culture, cultural landscape and language is open to diverse and unstable interpretations. Engaging actively with the proliferation of meanings and striving to anchor readings that accord with the social, economic and essentially political project of the Cornish Movement is therefore a prerequisite for employing them to strengthen communities. It is vital to not simply give in to simulation or sell out to short-term gains for individual activities as though revived items and

invented traditions were the end rather than the means to cultural resurgence.

Alongside the orders of simulation that Baudrillard identifies it is possible to 'keep it real' and maintain a degree of pre-simulational reality and 'primary use' in areas of human need and if they so wish, cultural practitioners can also sift through simulacra, picking out those which can be employed to carry useful myths. Doing this does not have to mean rejecting all commercial uses of culture in other words, nor does it mean taking a po-faced authenticist attitude to simulation in principle, but it does require wariness and selection. Care needs to be taken to avoid simply slipping into the logic that commodification is good and that implies that Revivalists need to rely less upon the corresponding use of promotional, marketing-speak and of exchange-value as a justification. They might wish instead to talk up 'primary uses' and couch more of their work in the language of community participation, referring more often to feelings, belonging, community ownership, embededness, fostering, nurturing, encouraging, enabling, communicating and sharing. Determining such an overarching vocabulary might in fact be essential to maintaining 'ownership' of projects.

Signification is an unstable area of unpredictability and dilemma rather than of straightforward choice but the broad issue is of how to avoid collaborating in representations that fuel the very processes that the Cornish Movement has hitherto existed to oppose. Indeed, if the Cornish language and Revivalist activities are to be part of maintaining an indigenous tradition and contributing fully to the emotional capital and social networks of Cornish communities, their practitioners will have to engage unambiguously, tooth-and-nail to fight those processes on all fronts from representation to economic decision-making and politics. There are debatable and hard choices to make about how to

304

present Cornish cultures and what to use them for and there are commercial traps and temptations that offer the temporary illusion of progress for language revitalization and Revivalism. Making the wrong choices could compromise the scope for using the Cornish language, neo-traditional music and dance and (re)invented traditions and symbols to engage in constructive community building for 'one and all' and to present effective, oppositional challenges.

Revivalists have attempted to present their activities and the language as respectable, safe and unthreatening, as well as compatible with the prevailing logic of commodification and presumptions that favour Lifestyle Cornwall. This could turn out to be a short-sighted expedient because if Revivalists facilitate and contribute to the cooption of conscious cultures by the processes that marginalize much of the community, they could produce scepticism. This would detract from their transgressive potential and diminish their usefulness as an oppositional rallying point. Part of their appeal and usefulness involves what might be called 'militant capital'. By this I mean a symbolic potential that conveys an alternative currency of cultural worth to that of legitimate cultural capital and allows for the connotation of solidarity and stoicism in the face of hardship and resistance to outside pressures. Where Cornish has been taken up effectively at a grass-roots level, the motives are plainly oppositional and several *Kernowegoryon* (Cornish speakers) suggest that this is why advances were made during the 1980s and 90s when perceptions of exclusion and alienation fuelled learning and vernacular use.

When it came to carving out an institutional place for Cornish, it was its symbolic associations with community concerns and the whole context of marginalization that counted, - not meek collusion with lifestyle branding or the prospect of cultural tourism. The creation of Maga, the Cornish Language Partnership and its unfolding public projects in

education and awareness-raising are entirely a product of this, as is the U.K. Government's inclusion of Cornish under the terms of the Council of Europe's 'Charter for Regional for Minority Languages' in 2003.[923] When the Government adopted the charter in 2000-2001 it did not at first include Cornish and it was only after a seven-year campaign that this was achieved. This built upon strengthening support from councillors and officers, some of whom had attended Cornish classes and Cornwall Council produced a resolution:

> This Council sees the Cornish language as a vital part of contemporary culture and welcomes the work being done to promote its wider usage and status. This Council will, where appropriate, encourage the use of the language for the naming of streets.' (8th April 1997)

The campaign connected with a sense of marginalization and struggle within the Cornish Movement and the community at large and was led by people who also campaigned for jobs, notably and symbolically during the 'tin crisis' (1985-2000) and the *Keskerdh Kernow* march to London in 1997.[924] The issue united language revivalists across the divides of the spelling disputes that had hampered development, quickly gaining the participation of Andrew George, M.P. and Robin Teverson, M.E.P.. It also mobilized affective alliances between linguistic minorities, so that some of their politicians and civil servants argued Cornwall's case within British and European institutions,[925] much as happened during applications for European regional status and Objective One funding. As a result of unrelenting representations, the Government commissioned 'An Independent Academic Study of Cornish',[926] and

---

[923] Signature for Cornish, 11th March 2003, registered 18th March. Recognition as an official language of UK 11th June 2003 (Parliamentary answer in House of Lords.). cf. Ken Mac Kinnon, 'As Cornish as Possible' – 'Not an Outcast Anymore': Speakers' and Learners' Opinions on Cornish, in P.J.Payton 9ed.), *Cornish Studies*, no. 12, pp.249-267.

[924] Simon Parker (ed.) (1998), *Cornwall Marches On!*, Truro: Keskerdh Kernow 500.

[925] e.g. Dafydd Wigley M.P. (Plaid Cymru). Information from campaigners.

[926] Ken MacKinnon, *An Independent Academic Study on Cornish*, EKOS Ltd. & SGÙD for the Government Office of the South West, Plymouth, 2000.

subsequently included Cornish under Part II of the Charter. For its part, Cornwall Council created the Cornish Language Partnership in 2005 and obtained funding for staff. Understandably, the success of the campaign was felt as a hard-earned victory against Establishment opposition and left a sense of common purpose despite continuing arguments about orthography and language planning. Arguably then, the voyage has been more important than the destination, building precisely the kind of relationships, solidarity and morale that results in the capacity and will to get things done.

The Cornish language could become a key component of developing networks and strengthening communities. Some speakers have long recognized its symbolic and potentially unifying functions[927] and talked about them in terms that recall post-structuralist themes of 'symbolic subversion';[928] but there are barriers to this happening, including the cultural dissonance that has been related to social context and cultural hygienes. Some reactions to mentioning the language suggest that it can be perceived as part of an authentic Cornishness that 'ordinary people' do not have experience of but which they think makes speakers more Cornish:

> 'He speaks proper Cornish, not just the accent like we do.'[929]

> 'They speak Cornish, like real Kernewek. We can't because we lost it, but they're full-on Cornish Celts and they keep it going. [...] We haven't even got the proper accent like the old guys.'[930]

This could be good news for language revitalization in that it offers an incentive to learn but it is more likely to be barrier to identification and

---

[927] e.g. Tim Saunders, in Cathal Ó Luain (ed.) (1983), op. cit.; cf. Pierre Bourdieu (2001), *Langue et pouvoir symbolique*, op. cit.; P. Bourdieu (1980). *Ce que parler veut dire...,* op. cit.

[928] cf. Madan Sarup (1993), op. cit., pp. 123-124.

[929] A woman from St. Ives who knew the grand bard of the Cornish Gorsedd, Mick Paynter.

[930] A man, about 23 years old, at Liskeard Station, August 2011.

it supports the proposition there is a tendency for some people to feel that their everyday Cornishness is inferior to Revivalist simulations. Maga have found that 24.2 percent of Cornish speakers have a higher degree and that a further 38.4 percent have a degree or equivalent whilst a third of fluent speakers live outside Cornwall.[931] These categories may be overrepresented in responses to questionnaires but if correct, the figures show unambiguously that Cornish is less available to disadvantaged sections of society and that there remains much to do, not just in learning and teaching, but also in developing socially comfortable and relevant settings with connections to 'Proper Cornishness'. Efforts in these areas can succeed though and there are instances of teachers successfully working with representative groups of learners. Affirmative, grass-roots uses of Cornish words and phrases are increasing in everyday settings and in social media, showing that the language could be acquiring a useful symbolism for a growing number of people. For example, the comedian, 'Kernow King' *tweets*, 'Had a text earlier... Some of it was in Cornish and I replied a bit in Cornish! Sum proud!'[932] In the same vein, the comedy duo, 'Cornish Oafs' incite visitors to their Facebook page to, 'slip some Kernewek in too when you speak, to strengthen the language so it won't stay weak'.[933]

Some of the ways in which fragments of Cornish are used resemble the affirmative aspects of amazingly similar projects in North America where groups like the Wampanoag, Ojibwe and Yuchi are creating morale-boosting contexts for language revitalization that proclaim, 'We still live here'.[934] The value attributed to a language can have implications for all who belong to the group traditionally associated with it, not just its speakers. The status of people in the U.S.A. who have Hispanic origins

---

[931] S. Burley, 'A Report on the Cornish Language Survey Conducted by The Cornish Language Partnership', Truro: Maga, 2008.
[932] A tweet from Edward Rowe, aka Kernow King, 31st December 2012.
[933] See, http://www.facebook.com/CornishOafs (Accessed 7th January 2013.)
[934] A film about the Wampanoag language, http://itvs.org/films/we-still-live-here (Accessed 7th January 2013.)

and names is influenced by the value attributed to Spanish, even if they do not speak it and in Britain attitudes towards Welsh people, Welsh-speaking or not, is related to imaginings of Welshness which incorporate the language. Is the raised profile of Cornish producing an emergent tendency to associate Cornish people with Cornish? The ongoing re-valorization of Cornish in public projects could unlock this potential and speakers already say they are witnessing a new respect which is a far cry from the situation where they were more often ridiculed. [935] Demands for translation by non-Cornish businesses and individuals[936] indicates that they expect the Cornish public to be pleased and it hints at growing prestige. All of this supports the idea that Cornish may be essential for achieving and maintaining self-respect and gaining respect from outsiders.[937] Just as other groups have used 'otherness' to argue for respect for historical and sacred sites, for example, so the Cornish may be able to develop in-group confidence and acquire the kind of consideration for their cultural tradition that makes it harder to do things like moving the fifth-century Tristan Stone to make way for a housing development.[938]

Figuring out a way to keep ahold of militant social capital might be more important than achieving respectability. After all, in common parlance, being respectable or well-thought-of is not the same as achieving higher status or accruing cultural capital and its pursuit by Revivalists currently involves practices of collective censorship to avoid controversy. Employing and deploying Cornish and Revivalist cultures to strengthen communities and promote cohesiveness is at odds with presenting them as 'uncontroversial' assets for branding and marketing. This is not to suggest that such uses are not sometimes helpful but culture's primary uses in areas that affect 'emotional prosperity' and

---

[935] Comments by Cornish speakers.
[936] Information from MAGA.
[937] A suggestion from Sharon Lowenna.
[938] Widely covered in the press, e.g. http://www.dailymail.co.uk/news/article-2247020/Ancient-Tristan-Stone-moved-site-near-Fowey-Cornwalll-make-room-development.html (Accessed 14th December 2012.)

resourcefulness could be compromised if the price is avoiding engagement with social and economic conflicts. Collaborating with Lifestyle Cornwall makes Revivalism toothless rather than uncontroversial and it makes it more difficult to use it to communicate 'useful' myths effectively or build social capital.

Cornwall's 'new circumstances' involve physical and symbolic displacement that make promoting Cornish culture and identity more a question of taking sides to tackle inequalities and social divisions than creating an illusion of harmony. The latter is rather like not making waves and claiming that everyone is in the same boat when they are not. Consequently, the most important consideration might be how to place Cornish culture at the centre of articulate, mutually complementary agendas that mobilize cultural distinctiveness and a tribal sense of community as positive factors. This might involve building upon a kind of motivated social capital based on cultural identification so as to develop networks of engaged action, much as I found in Brittany where informal Breton circles and lobbies are evident in every sphere from education and culture to food processing, car manufacture and banking. Leaving aside Cornwall's weaknesses (lack of institutions, a reduced native elite, poor access to traditional media, lack of access to economic capital, strong development lobbies), there are strengths that could help produce common purpose. Cornwall's relatively small size, cultural identity and sense of marginalization all favour unity. They produce intimacies of scale and tendencies towards social informality which could be an advantage in building networks across administrative, governmental, academic and voluntary bodies.

A Cornish Standpoint.

The motive for this thesis has been a wish to find ways in which Cornishness can be transmitted meaningfully to future generations as a

rooted/routed ethno-cultural tradition at the same time as being used to address social divisions and integrate new residents. It has therefore started to make an argument for strategic interventions and has discussed the desirability of strengthening and privileging preferred intragroup narratives and employing 'useable cultures' to negotiate and support a preferred Cornish 'mythology' or vision. On first hearing them, these aspirations might sound inoffensively platitudinous, like the proverbial 'motherhood and apple pie' served with a large dollop of Cornish cream.[939] They recall the banal, tokenistic references to sustainability and regional distinctiveness in policy documents and mission statements that are currently subverted or ignored. What is proposed, though, is working to achieve a geographically and culturally grounded standpoint from which to explore, define and develop a coherent Cornish project that takes sides in conflicts of interest to address material and cultural inequalities and furthers the cause of an imagined Cornish community in all domains. Bernard Deacon has already suggested Cornish standpoints, similar to those developed by feminists, to advance the methodological development of 'critical Cornish studies' and the application of critical discourse analysis but the argument here is that the idea could be extended beyond academic circles.[940]

Feminist standpoint theories use women's experiences to construct perspectives from which to study and criticize a patriarchal order, sometimes extending this to challenge positivist notions of objectivity and truth.[941] They variously employ the notions of situated female imaginations and knowledge to argue for strategies that challenge androcentric knowledge by making use of the insights that come from women's respective positions. Cornish standpoints, imagined from

---

[939] For discussion of Brittany, see Jean Olivro (2010), *Projet Bretagne,* op. cit., p. 75.
[940] Bernard Deacon, 'From 'Cornish Studies' to 'Critical Cornish Studies': reflections on methodology'; *Cornish Studies,* no. 12, (2005). pp. 13–29.
[941] Sandra Harding (ed.) (2004), *The Feminist Standpoint Theory Reader: Intellectual and Political Controversies*, London: Routledge.

perspectives already available within the Cornish Movement, also offer a degree of off-centred subjectivity from which to critically consider institutionally and economically supported discourses that create the truths behind decision-making. This is not to suggest, naïvely and deterministically, that there is a 'proper Cornish' standpoint or that Cornish people can share a single outlook, let alone one that is dualistically opposed to an 'Establishment' view. The principle adopted is that subjects' knowledge, values, aspirations, cultural practices, political views and allegiances nevertheless have relationships to culture, social roles and habitus.

By building affirmatively upon insider knowledge and experience, such a standpoint (or in Cornish, *savla*) could be used to denaturalize and oust taken-for-granted discourses and alter cultural, social and material realities. This is very different from having a set agenda with the risk of inflexible prescriptions or grand narratives[942] and it allows an ongoing, responsive search for changing local solutions as a component of resilience. Cornishness has historically been articulated within the paradigms and discourses of the particular age and in this respect situated standpoints allow for continuous, critical sifting of discursive formations as they present themselves. Just like the propositions behind the Breton aspiration, 'Bretagne belle, prospère, solidaire et ouverte sur le monde',[943] this approach means going beyond slogans or symbolism to address the conceptual gaps that exist when Cornish knowledge is absent and solutions are imposed by career-mobile decision-makers without ties to locality, community or culture.[944] To compensate for a dearth of Cornish voices within governance, Cornwall needs to foster locally specific knowledge and translate it into action, a very different proposition to institutionally-

---

[942] See criticisms, in Jean-François Lyotard (1984 [1979]), *The Postmodern Condition: A Report on Knowledge,* Manchester: Manchester University Press.
[943] Jean Olivro (2010), op. cit., p. 75.
[944] cf. Jean Olivro (2010), p. 156 (on Breton knowledge).

driven interpretations of 'transforming knowledge' and developing a 'knowledge economy'.

Taking sides in the ways already proposed, involves exercising subaltern power according to Foucault's understanding of power, not as something people have, but as an exercise of relations which are rehearsed and re-established through discourses:[945] 'Discourse transmits and produces power; it reinforces it, but also undermines it and exposes it, renders it fragile and makes it possible to thwart it.'[946] Pierre Bourdieu makes the complementary point that subverting representation (e.g. visual discourses) can precede social changes: 'La subversion hérétique expoite la possibilité de changer le monde sociale en changeant la représentation de ce monde...'[947] These observations are pertinent to the idea that strategic interventions in practice and representation can influence cultural and symbolic capital and enhance primary uses that are important for well-being, and it supports the possibility of upsetting strong discourses from Cornish standpoints. It fits strategies suggested by Guy Debord and Gil Wolman's *détournement*[948] and Umberto Eco's 'semiological guerrilla warfare'[949] whereby agents engage tactically as 'cultural / semiological guerillas' (Eco employs both terms). This can find expression in many ways but the recent expansion of 'culture jamming' (notably to subvert neo-liberal and consumerist discourses in the media and advertizing) offers a useful model for concerted bottom-up interventions as a reflective practice of cultural hygiene. Intervention means venturing into the

---

[945] Michel Foucault (1977), *Language, Counter-Memory, Practice,* (translated), Ithica: Cornell University Press, pp. 184-192.
[946] Michel Foucault (1978), *The History of Sexuality: An Introduction, Vol.*1, Harmondsworth: Penguin, pp. 100-101 cited.
[947] cf. Pierre Bourdieu, (1982, 2001) *Langage et Pouvoir Symbolique*, Editions Fayard et Editions de Seuil, p.188: 'La subversion hérétique expoite la possibilité de changer le monde sociale en changeant la représentation de ce monde...'
[948] Guy Debord and Gil Wolman, 'Mode d'emploi du détournement' first published in *Les Lèvres Nues,* no.8 (May, 1956), in translation by Ken Knabb, 'A User's Guide to D*étournement' in The Situationalist International Anthology* (2006): http://www.bopsecrets.org/SI/detourn.htm (Accessed, 8th November 2012).
[949] Umberto Eco (1986), *Towards a Semiological Guerilla Warfare*, Harcourt Inc.; See also, Umberto Eco (1986), *Travels in Hyppereality*, New York: Harcourt Brace Jovanovich; (or) (1987), Faith in Fakes: *Travels in Hyppereality*, Picador.

semantic and discursive battlegrounds that public relations agencies and advertizers deal with routinely and where even the most cleverly constructed messages are open to multiple readings. People exposed to branding or other kinds of image-making need not accept the preferred reading and insiders may read portrayals of themselves oppositionally, sceptically or with negotiated acceptance, - the positive aspect being that representations can be resisted.[950] Like other signs, those of branding are polysemous and the intended or unintended audiences interpret and reinterpret them subjectively. Therefore, instead of there being a straightforward cause and effect between representation and the image in people's minds,[951] there is a less predictable range of possibilities. Malcolm Bell makes the sobering observation that, 'you can't police the brand' and that intended messages about Cornwall may drowned by those over which public bodies have no influence.[952] Simon Anholt takes the same line but stresses that whilst there may be no control over individual perceptions, it is possible to influence them by developing a 'brand identity' that is 'clearly and distinctively expressed' using selected language and imagery.[953] This is one of the most important areas for the Cornish Movement to engage with in proactively engaging with signification as a conscious practice.

Interpellation: An Galow.

The founders of the Cornish music organization, CUMPAS argue that, 'you can try persuading people but it's better to attract them by what you do'.[954] They are in effect issuing an open invitation to join in a dance that celebrates and expresses belonging, one that could be expressed by the final lines of the play, *Gwreans an Bes*:

---

[950] For *preferred* and *negotiatied* reading, see, Stuart Hall ([1973] 1980), 'Encoding/decoding…', op. cit.

[951] Simon Anholt (2007), distinguishes 'brand image' as the perception in the mind of the audience/consumer.

[952] Remarks by Malcolm Bell, op. cit.

[953] Simon Anholt (2007), op. cit. p.5.

[954] CUMPAS is a cooperative Cornish music project. Dalla is Cornwall's leading neo-traditional music group. This quotation is a *non verbatim* synthesis of comments.

Mynstrels growgh theny peba,

May hallan warbarthe downssya,

Del ew an vaner han geys.[955]

(Minstels pipe for us so that we may dance together as is the manner and the custom.)

This has been one of the themes in the previous chapters where the 'usefulness' of Revivalist activity has been linked to its ability to appeal and attract, not just anybody but a socially inclusive cross-section of the population where the Cornish are sufficiently well-represented to shape the 'structures of feeling' into which others are welcomed. Appealing, in the sense of 'calling out' to people, may be related to the etymologically connected notion of interpellation (< Latin, *appellare*). Briefly, Althusser's Lacanian-influenced concept, concerns how subjects' identities are constructed through the workings of institutions (from the scale of the family to that of the state) and discusses a process usually described in English as 'hailing'. Figuratively speaking, this involves a kind of naming whereby subjects are called out to during social interactions and may recognize the subject positioning that is proffered to them.[956] Althusser's theories have already been discussed in relation to hegemony and the 'Ideological State Apparatus' with the tentative suggestion that the Cornish Movement could be an 'ideological state*less* apparatus', effectively offering an alternative or 'counter' hegemony with re-evaluations of cultural and symbolic capital. From this perspective, the Movement also hails people, calling out Cornish subject positionings and influencing the construction of identities. The annual Cornish Gorsedd includes this call or *galow* to Cornwall:

Kernow a'n Howldrevel, clew galow an Orsedh!

Kernow a'n Barth Dyghow, clew galow an Orsedh!

---

[955] William Jordon, 'The Creacion of the World' (Gwreans an Bes*), 1611.
[956] Louis Althusser (1971), 'Ideology and ideological State Apparatus', op. cit.; L. Althusser (1970), *Essays on Ideology*, Version.

Kernow a'n Howlsedhas, clew galow an Orsedh!

Kernow a'n Barth Cleth, clew galow an Orsedh![957]

Calling out to Cornwall, hailing and inviting people to engage in furthering its cause, is essential to maximizing the 'usefulness' of consciously Cornish cultures. Poor awareness of social, discursive and semiological issues has been identified in this regard and advancing re-signification of Revivalism is worsening this. When it comes to interpellation, recruitment and creating something which working-class Cornish people (amongst others) might wish to take part in, the issues are similar to those of social context and expectation that are considered in widening participation in higher education. The usefulness of Revivalism has therefore been linked in this discussion to achieving accordance with popular identifications, aesthetic preferences and the dispositions and attitudes of habitus. We may also think of Cornishness itself as a set of discursive formations and hypothesise that language revitalization and other cultural activities may be conceived in ways that connect with existing discourses so as to achieve relevance to insiders and 'hail' them. For activities to communicate ideas of community they need to draw upon and articulate consciously or unconsciously felt needs to valorize Cornishness but this is not always what happens. This is paradoxical because Revivalist activities are supposed to be all about articulating Cornishness and yet we have seen how the versions that are championed vary and clash. Furthermore, questions of connotation, social context, disposition and attitude (*habitus*) have been identified as impacting upon whether activities appeal to different sections of the population and become embedded culturally. Interpellation and the effective communication of culture probably depend upon the ability of practitioners to make appeals which evoke the familiar whilst doing so in new and creative ways.

---

[957] A call to the four points of the compass. 'East Cornwall, hear the call of the Gorsedd...'.

Evoking the familiar in this context means calling forth what is already there so as to draw out knowledge and feelings that people are not aware of having and it is thus differentiated from invoking in the sense of calling upon things from without. Its etymology suggests calling out or giving voice from within. It can bring buried knowledge and desires to the surface and be part of developing effective standpoints and articulating 'myths' (in Barthes' sense of the term). Language revitalization, for example, already interpellates people through appeals to the familiar sounds of place-names and Cornu-English and this evokes memories, produces awareness and draws out knowledge, but this might be greatly enhanced by greater attention to the importance of tacit responses and feelings.[958] This is a long way from traditional appeals that present learning Cornish as a political duty to uphold identity claims and it is even further from commercial justifications. It starts from the creative, poetic and aesthetic imagination and engages the emotions with the potential for beneficial outcomes.

<u>Reconnecting</u>.

Cornwall's 'new circumstances' are nothing if not destabilizing and they emerge from a series of traumas or 'failed experiences'[959] which in varying degrees have left their mark. Industrial decline, chronic emigration, ongoing development trends, marginalization and deprivation and even a second language loss, that of Cornu-English, could be said to create a collective post-traumatic disorder (connected to earlier discussions of paralysis and stasis) that diminishes emotional prosperity. This could be sounding like 'Celtic whinge'[960] of the kind that reproduces victimhood but these experiences are the starting points of post-memory and

---

[958] Michael Polyani (1967), *The Tacit Dimension,* New York: Doubleday.
[959] Mieke Bal relates trauma to failed experience: Mieke Bal, Jonathan Crewe, Leo Spitzer (1999), *Acts of Memory, Cultural Recall in the Present,* Hanover New Hampshire: Dartmouth College.
[960] An expression directed at the SNP by Jeremy Paxman, reported by Scotland on Sunday 18th September 2011.

community narratives and as David Lowenthal remarks of Ireland and the West Indies, 'Many remember historical trauma as though past and present were contemporaneous.'[961] Amongst these experiences are the recent events that have produced fragmentation and displacement. Movements and exchanges of people and cultural transformations result in Cornish ethnicity and cultures having more uncertain boundaries and although the resulting ambiguities and hybridities can be sources of creativity there is anxiety and rootlessness that undermines the human need for belongingness. Desires for re-attachment to a firm sense of place and group seem symptomatic of this. Deacon cites a 'desire to patrol the ethnic boundaries' and connects it to 'the surge of interest among the Cornish in family history since the 1970s'.[962]

It is commonplace, especially for younger people, to have indeterminate relationships with Cornish tradition and those who have grown up entirely in Cornwall have experiences of Cornishness as marginal and low-status. For the first time in Cornwall's history, many people who reasonably identify themselves as indigenously Cornish have one Cornish parent or just one grandparent and are very likely to have spent part of their lives elsewhere or to have been 'born away' because of economic circumstances that have led their parents to move for work. I met many people amongst the Cornish Movement's activists and adherents who recounted interesting personal accounts of how despite quite important displacements they felt strongly Cornish. A Ph.D. student from the West Midlands whose mother is from St. Austell was learning Cornish, a Revivalist musician with one Cornish parent had spent his childhood in London and an academic from Devonport 'realised' she felt Cornish after becoming aware of the influence of her North Cornwall family.[963] A festival organizer had also grown up in Plymouth and become interested

---

[961] David Lowenthal (1975), '*Past Time, Present Place: Landscape and Memory', in The Geographical Review,* Vol. 65 (1), (January, 1975), pp. 1-36.(p.28), http://www.jstor.org/stable/213831, (Accessed, 25th January 2010.).

[962] Bernard Deacon (2012), 'The Unimportance of being Cornish in Cornwall', 24th November 2012, op. cit.

[963] Conversations with Pedyr Bennetto, Nigel Nethersole and Sharon Lowenna.

in his mother's Cornish background at university in Cardiff and a motivated language teacher from a farming and mining family had spent her early childhood in South Africa.[964]

Twenty-five years ago, Perry found that a fifth of Cornish people were return migrants (and his category would not include these last examples) and the proportion is likely to be higher now because of the more recent collapse of traditional industries.[965] In addition, the vast range of possibilities for in-migrants to become integrated or assimilated as 'New Cornish' has been discussed. A eucre evening in the Blue Anchor Inn at Fraddon illustrated how circumstances fuel desires for secure identities that are manifested in everyday life.[966] A woman wearing a black and gold 'Cornish by marriage' tee-shirt asked if I knew how to play eucre and her obviously local husband chipped in to say it was, 'our national card game [...] They do play it in Canada but nobody up country have heard of it'. Their son, a man of about thirty-five with a trace of his mother's Watford accent, talked about playing eucre online and added that 'We should keep on being Cornish'. At *Lowender Peran*, I chatted with seven musicians in their twenties, one of whom had been born elsewhere of Cornish parents and 'come back to Cornwall' as a child. Another had, left in her teens and a third had gone to a school which 'wasn't very Cornish'. One had left university in Leeds and found work there, saying that it was, 'until I can find a job back home' and two others who said they felt very Cornish were the locally-born children of in-migrants.

Revivalist scenes unsurprisingly appeal to people on the fringes of 'Proper Cornishness' who do not have some of its typical cultural acquisitions. The ranks are swelled by 'return migrants' (a common term in

---

[964] Discussion with Julie Tamblin.
[965] Ronald Perry, et al. (eds) (1986), *Counterurbanisation...,* op. cit., p. 84.
[966] Eucre is a card game.

Cornish Studies since its use by the geographer Ron Perry) and others who's ambiguous coding might be expected to make them feel, consciously or not, that their tribal qualifications are insecure. This was voiced plainly by a Cornish learner in Camborne: 'My mum is Cornish and my dad is English. I want to show I'm definitely Cornish.'[967] Acknowledgements like this are rare, obviously, but the phenomena of electing, achieving and negotiating personal Cornish identities are defining features of Cornish society that manifest themselves daily in small acts of disambiguation.

Whereas these variously unsettled personal circumstances might have been unusual a generation ago, they are now common and I often found that a majority of the Cornish participants in activities were concerned. In this context, Revivalist networks apparently provide some of the means by which individuals constantly reaffirm their belonging to a Cornish community and reconnect. In the 'new circumstance' this might be regarded as an indispensable part of maintaining the integrity of the group, constantly recreating it and at the same time increasing participants' resolve to make their lives in Cornwall. It means that instead of 'patrol[ing] the ethnic boundaries'[968] and presiding over a shrinking, defensive identity, the most viable strategy for the long-term is the active interpellation of people who are in the position of choosing whether to be Cornish or not. The importance of historical migration and transnationality and of the Cornish diaspora could provide themes that aid this process of physical and emotional (re)attachment. These include the ideas that it is Cornish to travel and mix with other people and that 'Cousin Jennies' and 'Cousin Jacks' can be born in distant places but still belong.[969] Although the indigenous Cornish are a minority within Cornwall, their cultural performances of identity could both maintain physical and emotional attachments and actively interpellate

[967] Remarks by John, a learner at a class taught by Matthew Clarke, October 2011.
[968] Bernard Deacon, 'The Unimportance of being Cornish in Cornwall', Address to the Institute of Cornish Studies, 24th November 2012.
[969] Traditional nick-names for the Cornish overseas.

the 'New Cornish'. Thus instead of inexorably declining, Cornishness could thrive and expand confidently.

A Cornish Project.

Bringing about the changes proposed here is a task that cannot be shirked or put off if Cornishness is to be maintained and disadvantage addressed, but without genuinely Cornish institutions how may that be undertaken and by whom? Despite the identified risks of cultural prescriptivism and a 'second wrong turn', the voluntary Cornish Movement has been identified as loosely bringing together agents for change from within the community and providing the only existing spaces and discursive formations from within which opposition to externally imposed policies and developments is organized. Throughout this thesis the Movement has been regarded as a loose cultural and political phenomenon with effects that permeate society and in that sense it is taken, by affective association, to include everyone who to some extent embraces varying sets of identity discourses that have been (re)shaped by Cornish nationalism and Celticism. It includes most of the people whose feelings of belonging and cultural attachment lead them to be concerned by the impact of economic and social trends on community and cultural continuity. To be blunt, that means that nobody else is going to address the combined cultural and material issues discussed if the initiatives do not first come from inside the Cornish Movement. Because of the Movement's fragmentary, plural and nebulous nature, there is, nevertheless, no single body that is ideally placed to take on the role of initiating change. Of course there are cultural organizations such as Bewnans Kernow and Gorsedh Kernow that may intervene in limited and specific ways but a comprehensive initiative that goes beyond any one body is indispensable to take discussion beyond Revivalist centres of interest and cultural hygienes and be convincingly connected to socio-economic matters and prioritize the interests of the disadvantaged.

In casting around for a way to make things happen, Cornwall Council stands out as the only body that is specifically answerable to the Cornish public and which has sufficient means to bring about concrete change. In fact, the outlook of some councillors and officers is already influenced to a marked degree by the Cornish Movement, as is evident in the emerging responses to cultural distinctiveness and identity issues that have been discussed. Cornwall is fortunate in having this democratically elected level of government that covers the whole of its territory.[970] Cornwall Council has also gained influence, power and responsibility through its role in the Objective One programme and in recent years has sought further powers and has from time-to-time lent support to the campaign for a fully-fledged Cornish Assembly.[971] It is therefore proposed that a feasible approach would be for the Council and elements within the Cornish Movement to work in complementary ways to deliver a distinct Cornish Project that links cultural identity to durable social and economic regeneration and fully explores the possibilities for appropriate decision-making strategic planning within Cornwall.

In the last chapter it was proposed that the Council and its various agencies and companies, should develop joined-up policies on how to represent Cornwall in branding and image-making in order to combat versions of Cornwall that sometimes hinder needed economic activities and favour harmful developments. These forms of representation were also linked to`strengthening useful and enabling identity narratives and emotional capital. Some of those narratives have been identified and related to the promotion of an image or brand that connects 'Proper Cornishness' to the possibility of economic strategies that build upon the mythologies of a technological heritage and a sense of international

---

[970] Although Scilly has its own Council of the Isles of Scilly.
[971] E.g. Contributions of Alec Robertson, former Council leader, at the Cornish Constitutional Convention, 24th July 2010 and continuing internet links to the Cornish Assembly campaign.

connectedness. This principle of a cohesive approach should extend to the whole of the Council's policy so that a resilient, socially-inclusive, Cornish future is clearly envisaged as an ambition to strive for in every aspect of its work. This would replace disjointed and contradictory practices with a coherent vision and long-term objective that recognizes connections between culture, economics and emotional well-being. Much as Welsh identity motivates the strategies of the Welsh Government, so this vision and the sentiments behind it would provide a course of action and target Cornish needs. As contradictory promotional efforts and unsustainable housing plans show, this is far from being the case now so there is a need to get beyond the understandable tendency for departments and agencies to take the easy paths offered by received wisdoms, directives and funding criteria. These result in them countering each other's efforts and often exclude local knowledge so instead, policy should be framed within a global strategy that connects culture and language to the social, economic and psychological factors that have been identified here as vital for community resilience and cohesiveness.

Supporting the primary uses of culture has implications for most areas of Council policy because factors such as access to housing, jobs, education and health-care support or undermine communities and their cultures and because people and their cultures exist in environmental contexts. In brief, cultures and languages may meet psychological needs but only exist because of particular communities of people who in turn have material and physical requirements. If the Council wishes to support specifically Cornish cultures, it therefore needs to take account of cultural impacts in such diverse areas as education, economic development, environmental management, housing and social services, not just in branding, tourism and support for cultural events. For example, an imaginative local needs housing strategy that proactively and militantly opposes speculative residential development and second home ownership is a necessity without which it is hard to imagine an indige-

nous Cornish cultural tradition in the long-term. Cornish people need access to homes in order to stay in Cornwall. This is understood by the Welsh Government and is explicit in its work on culture and language where providing 'affordable homes' is identified as 'a vital contribution to sustainable communities that can support the future of the Welsh language' and is therefore a legitimate concern for an action committee on 'The Culture and Heritage of Wales'.[972] Seeking further powers to intervene in the housing market would enable Cornwall Council to extend the principle that has recently led it to use planning law and taxation in trying to limit second homes. In the on-going debate about targets for housing development, informed arguments about local needs could be used to counter strong building lobbies and figures that are imposed by central government. Instead of meekly responding to ministerial instructions and calls for development, as appears to happen now, Cornwall Council sometimes needs to bare its teeth and present sound counter arguments. The purpose here is not to venture into the details of policies but rather to highlight the need to frame them within a broader strategy that prioritizes the interests of Cornwall's present population and its disadvantaged communities in particular. Once this is achieved, Cornwall Council should be forthright in demanding that other agencies, such as those concerned with economic regeneration, take note of its wishes as an elected body. The mobilization of public opinion would allow the Council to insist confidently upon informed alternatives and democratically supported policies. Thus, by challenging received wisdoms (e.g., those of neo-liberalism) and imposed policies that harm Cornish interests, a more articulate and purposeful Cornish Movement could help to produce an assertive Cornwall Council with strong enough public backing to oppose agencies and central government directives when they are identified as undermining a resilient Cornish community.

---

[972] 'The Culture and Heritage of Wales', Welsh Government, 2011, http://wales.gov.uk/docs/strategies/110929chap12en.pdf (Accessed January 2013

Since culture is related to most of the Council's responsibilities, its cultural strategy[973] should be expanded to recognize this and there should be a designated cabinet member and committee for these purposes. Instead of having a single portfolio holder for 'culture and tourism', - an association that privileges cultural tourism, - a committee with specific responsibilities for culture could develop a comprehensive approach where the main linkage is between culture and society. This is apparent in the work of the Welsh Government where, at an early stage, a cabinet post was created with responsibilities for Culture, Sport and the Welsh Language and where strategies have emphasized inclusiveness. In the 2002 strategy it was recognized that "culture can add to the value of other existing cross-cutting themes for the Welsh Assembly Government – for example as a bridge to social inclusion, equal opportunities and sustainable development."[974] Objectives included 'support bilingualism, multiculturalism and the equality of opportunity' and 'ensure that culture helps tackle social disadvantage'.[975] These themes have been developed further with an emphasis on access and participation and the pivotal place of culture is reflected in the fact that the ministers for Housing, Regeneration and Heritage, for Education and Skills and for Business, Enterprise, technology and Science share responsibilities for the delivery of the present cultural strategy.[976]

Producing appropriate policies and strategies is currently hampered by a democratic deficit in the relationships between the voting (and abstaining) public, councillors and civil servants so that democratic input is often minimal and indirect. In planning, for instance, 'public consultations' on regeneration, planning and cultural policy reach few people. Several informed witnesses celebrated the abolition of the Rural Development Agency and spoke about its consultation exercises on developments between Camborne and Redruth, which allegedly took no

---

[973] 'White Paper for Culture', Truro: Cornwall Council, (October 2012).
[974] 'A Culture Strategy for Wales', The Welsh Assembly Government, (January 2002), p.8.
[975] ibid. p.57.
[976] 'The Culture and Heritage of Wales', Welsh Government, 2011, op. cit.

real account of public opinion. Others mentioned the online consultation and public meetings organized to air Cornwall Council's 'Core Strategy'[977] and described a situation in which even the elected members of Council committees are sometimes taken aback by decisions.[978] Matters are made worse when policies are shaped by 'regional quangos', often outside Cornwall and (with rare exceptions), without the involvement of Cornish people as employees or consultants.[979] Consequently, networking does not extend meaningfully in the community and there is a feeling that the projects that accompany 'regeneration' are done *to* local people by others, irrespective of their interests, rather than *by* them in accordance with their wishes and needs. Academics and informed community campaigners (Gramsci's 'organic intellectuals') sometimes network informally with Cornwall Council officers but there are no developed channels and structures of the kind found in Brittany[980] or behind the Welsh Government's promotion of Wales, nor are there the intimate networks encountered in Galicia where I found that regional ministers and civil servants shared cultural affiliations with people from a range of social backgrounds and met them informally. To summarize, there are not enough democratic mechanisms to facilitate public engagement and this lack extends to the informed input that might come from organic intellectuals in the community. This results in an unclear public vision of Cornwall's preferred image and future direction that does not connect with popular identities and aspirations. This makes it urgent to ensure genuine public discussion that goes beyond unheeded and relatively ineffective consultation exercises such as those that accompanied the Core Strategy.

---

[977] Views expressed by members of It's Our Cornwall.

[978] Remarks by Councillor Dick Cole, member of Cornwall Council Planning Committee.

[979] For discussion of quangos see, C. Greve and M. Flinders, 'Quangos-Whats in a Name? Defining Quangos from a Comparative Perspective,' *Governance: An International Journal of Policy and Administration, No.* 12 (1999, 2) pp. 129-146.

[980] As I saw at the Locarn Institute in September 2011.

Councillors and officers may take a lead in improving decision-making and delivery but changing public discourse more widely is a prerequisite for the longer term success of a general strategy. The desired outcome is to produce prevailing discourses in favour of Cornish resilience and social inclusiveness to inform Cornwall Council's policy and motivate voluntary activity across the board. We might consider how this works in other European regions. For example, 'Catalanism' defines the tenure and general direction of public discourse in Catalonia, from the arts and football to politics and whilst this model might not fit Cornwall, it is possible to envisage conscious attention to an inclusive Cornishness informing social and economic policy as well as individual actions. The Cornish Movement has to make concerted intellectual, organizational and communicative efforts in this repect, striving to create a climate in which policy changes can happen and be translated into firm actions. It has to be clearly and unambiguous involved in the politics of decision-making, avoiding the trap of turning cultural pursuits into displacement activities that distract participants from social and economic engagement. Even before it can do this, though, the Movement must develop greater sophistication in analyzing the potential effects of particular courses of action so that its adherents avoid drifting into the ill-considered cultural and commercial actions of a 'second wrong turn'. Having a clear, confident sense of purpose and ambition will not be enough without self-critical examination of practices and attention to social relevance.

In the absence of well-placed native elites and institutions, there is a need to find 'bottom-up' strategies for developing an epistemic community where knowledge can be generated and applied. This is where the Cornish Movement and its cultures have traditionally provided life-support, creating spaces and networks where heretical valuations of culture and alternative symbolic repertoires prevail in a vocational spirit that allows it to challenge imposed decisions and answer back. Reinforcing and expanding these culturally facilitated networks with careful

attention to ownership and purpose may, in the short-term, be the only realistic way for local people to create spaces from which to gain democratic control of governance and policy-making. It is a strategy that uses culture to strengthen the solidarity (social capital) and knowledge needed to build a credible, thought-out alternative to the direction of present trends and it means striving for a participative democratic model and a shared project that makes tolerable development for local needs one of its principles. In other words, instead of embracing the oxymoronic 'sustainable development' or a preservationist presumption against any development at all, it would support developments that meet the needs of Cornwall's present population (including the poorest) without compromising the ability of future generations to meet theirs. This is inevitably controversial and political but it is necessary to overcome the situation in which many decisions are uninformed by public debate and local knowledge and largely removed from convincingly democratic processes. This could be encouraged through the establishment of a research group for Contemporary Cornish Studies with the specific agenda of developing a Cornish standpoint and engaging in networking. During this inquiry, academics, research students and councillors have voiced the concern that there is no such body to inform public policy and act as a consultancy. Indeed, a remarkable feature of the Cornish Movement is the maintenance of small, voluntary groups, such as the Cornish Social and Economic Research Group (CoSERG) and the periodic organization of ephemeral working parties. These frustrations now need to be translated into a credible initiative, preferably with the enabling support and cooperation of Cornwall Council, higher and further education institutions and funding bodies. Ideally, the European institutions and central governmental agencies and departments that have responsibilities for Cornwall should facilitate the process. This is made more urgent by the precarious status of the University of Exeter's Institute of Cornish Studies which was created with the collaboration of Cornwall Council. With its associate networks, it has since 1970 provided the only dedicated academic site for studying past and present Cornish society and has been a focal point for research. Since

2010 the Institute has been absorbed into the College of Humanities and is soon to have its academic staff reduced to one historian with competing responsibilities for non-Cornish Studies work.[981] It is important for Cornwall Council to continue supporting Cornish Studies, building upon the achievements of the Institute in the area of historiography and encouraging attention to contemporary issues. There is also a need to extend involvement beyond academia, sharing knowledge and establishing purpose and solidarity in the community at large. As part of its first programme of work, a research body could establish workshops, discussions and conferences similar to those organized by the lobby, Cowethas Flamank, in the 1980s and 90s. These targeted adherents of the wider Cornish Movement and had unifying and motivating effects at a time when political differences and schismatic divisions amongst language revivalists were producing disengagement. A sufficiently motivated research body with a strong online and community presence could act as a hub around which to build lasting networks of common interest within which organizations and individuals could operate and it could inform Cornwall Council and other public and private bodies.

To summarize, the Cornish Movement has the opportunity to challenge the systemic inertia of decision-making and help to bring about a collective will for a shared Cornish project, working through Cornwall Council to provide a new sense of purpose and popular endorsement. If it succeeds it will be possible to construct a Cornwall in which disadvantage is addressed and actively set about binding diverse communities into a cohesive whole where social capital is enhanced by culture. Stuart Hall describes identity as, 'an idea which cannot be thought in the old way, but without which certain key questions cannot be thought at all.'[982] Taking a similar view that rejects essentialism and an over-obsession

[981] See, http://humanities.exeter.ac.uk/history/research/centres/ics/ (Accessed 10th January 2013.) The I.C.S. had three members of staff until 2011.

[982] Stuart Hall, 'Who needs 'identity?'' in, *Questions of Cultural Identity*, in S. Hall and Paul du Gay (1996), London: Sage, p.2.

with ethnic boundaries, this discussion has sought to recognize the plural, multi-dimensional realities of Cornish identities and the mutability, not just of culture but of ethnicity itself. At the same time it recognizes that ethnicity is a deep construction that cannot just be invented and acted out as a lifestyle option. The lasting character of habitus has been stressed, as has the continuity of evolving tradition. The playwright, Nick Darke (1948-2005), who was regarded as indisputably Cornish whilst also being the child of in-migrants, insisted that, 'A community that loses its past is in danger of losing its way.',[983] and in the same spirit this discussion has attached importance to the ways in which communities construct their present and future through the stories they tell about themselves. Cornwall's communities have certainly been destabilized but this discussion has begun to consider new configurations for cultural practice that are compatible with 'new circumstances' in which many people are visibly striving to both maintain and achieve geographically rooted identities.[984] This neither pretends that the demographic transformations of the last fifty years have not happened, nor assumes continuity is unimportant. Instead it starts from where Cornwall is and looks to a future that is different, perhaps even unrecognizable to past generations, but nevertheless part of Nance's 'cultural tradition that is definably Cornish'.

50.1662°N, 5.1018°W

---

[983] Cited by Cornish National Cinema.
[984] For an example of achieved identity: Thomas K. Fitzgerald, 'The Maori University Graduate and the Sentiment System', *Anthropological Quarterly*, vol. 47, no.2 (April 1974), pp. 169-181, http://www.jstor.org/stable/3316578 (Accessed 20th August 2010.)

Bibliography.

A.

Jane Aaron and Chris Williams (eds.), (2005), *Postcolonial Wales*, Cardiff: University of Wales Press.

Hervé Abalain (1989), *Destin de langues celtiques*, Paris and Gap: Editions OPHRYS.

Patrick Abercrombie and J. Paton Watson (1943), *A Plan for Plymouth*, Underhill, (Plymouth). Ltd.

Alain Accardo and Phillipe Corcuff (1989), *La Sociologie de Bourdieu*, Bordeaux: Le Mascaret.

Philipa Aldous and Malcolm Wiliams, 'A Question of Ethnicity.' in P.J. Payton (ed.), *Cornish Studies, 2nd Series,* No. 9, (2001), pp.213-226.

Louis Althusser, in Karl Marx (1969 [1867]), *Le Capital,* trans. J. Roy, Paris: Garnier-Flammerion, p.585 (footnotes).

Louis Althusser (1971), 'On Ideology and Ideological State Apparatuses', in *Lenin and Philosophy and Other Essays*, New York: Monthly Review Press.

Sonya Andermahr, Terry Lovell, Carol Wolkowitz (1997), *A Concise Glossary of Feminist Theory*, London: Arnold.

Benedict Anderson (1996 [1983]), L'imaginaire national : réflexions sur l'origine et l'essor du nationalisme, La Découverte: Paris.

Benedict Anderson (1991), *Imagined Communities: Reflections on the Origin and Spread of Nationalism*, 2nd edition, London and New York: Verso.

John Angarrack (1999), *Breaking the Chains: Propaganda, censorship, deception and the manipulation of public opinion in Cornwall,* Camborne: Cornish Stannary Publications.

John Angarrack (2002), *Our Future is History. Identity, Law and the Cornish Question*, Padstow: Independent Academic Press.

John Angarrack (2008), *Scat t'Larrups. Resist and Survive*, Padstow: Independent Academic Press.

Simon Anholt (2010-01-23), *Places: Identity, Image and Reputation*, Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan.

Simon Anholt (2007-01-23), *Competitive Identity: the new brand management for nations, cities and regions*. Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan.

Simon Anholt (2003), *Brand New Justice: the upside of global branding*, Oxford: Butterworth-Heinemann.

Simon Anholt (January 2000), *Another One Bites the Grass: Making Sense of International Advertising*, New York: John Wiley and Sons.

Arjun Appadurai (1986), *The Social Life of Things. Commodities in Cultural Perspective*, Chicago: University of Chicago Press.

David E. Apter (1987), *Modernization, Dependency and Postmodern Politics*, London: Sage.

Gregory Ashworth and Peter Howard (1999), *European Heritage Planning and Management,* Exeter: Intellect.

B.

Roy F. Baumeister and Mark R. Leary, (1995), 'The Need to Belong: Desire for Interpersonal Attachments as a Fundamental Human Motivation', *Psychological Bulletin, 117*, 497-529.

Peter Backhaus (2006), 'Multilingualism in Tokyo: A look into the linguistic landscape', *International Journal of Multilingualism,* vol. 3 (1), pp. 52-66.

Peter Backhaus (2007), 'Linguistic Landscapes: a comparative study of urban multilingualism in Tokyo', Clevedon: Multilingual Matters.

Jane Bakere (1980), *The Cornish Ordinalia - A Critical Study,* Cardiff: University of Wales Press.

Mieke Bal, Jonathan Crewe, Leo Spitzer (1999), *Acts of Memory, Cultural Recall in the Present,* Hanover New Hampshire: Dartmouth College.

Martin J. Ball (2002 [1993]), *The Celtic Languages*, Abingdon Oxon. and New York: Routledge.

Ronan Barré (2007), *'Les langues celtiques, entre survivance populaire et renouveau élitiste?'*, Rennes: Presses Universitaires de Rennes.

Roland Barthes (1982 [1957]), *Mythologies*, Paris: Le Seuil.

Roland Barthes (1993), *Mythologies,* (English edition) translated by Lavaers, London: Vintage.

Roland Barthes (1964), *Éléments de sémiologie*, Communications 4, Paris: Le Seuil.

Jean Baudrillard, (1968), *Le système des objets*, Paris: Gallimard.

Jean Baudrillard (1983 [pub. in French, 1981]), *Simulacra and Simulation*s, translated by Foss, New York: Semiotext(e), pp.1-13 and 23-49.

Jean Baudrillard (1991) *La Guerre du Golfe n'a pas eu lieu*, Paris: Galilée.

Jean Baudrillard (1993), *Symbolic Exchange and Death*, London: Sage.

Gary Becker (1994[1964]), *Human Capital: A Theoretical and Empirical Analysis with Special Reference to Education,* Chicago: University of Chicago Press.

Howard Becker, 'Whose side are we on?', *Social Problems*, vol. 14, (Winter 1967), pp. 239-48.

Jill Sinclair Bell, 'Narrative Inquiry: More than Just Telling Stories', in Patricia Duff (ed.), *TESOL Quarterly*, vol. 36, No. 2, (Summer 2002).

Walter Benjamin (1970 [1933]), 'The Work of Art in the Age of Mechanical Reproduction', trans. Harry Zohn, in W. Benjamin, *Illuminations*, London: Jonathan Cape.

Elizer Ben-Rafael, Elana Shohamy, Muhammad Hasan Amara and Nira Trumer-Hecht (2004), *Linguistic Landscape and Multiculturalism: A Jewish-Arab Comparative Study,* Tel Aviv: Tami Steinmetz Center for Peace Research.

Elizer Ben-Rafael, Elana Shohamy, Muhammad Hasan Amara, and Nira Trumer-Hecht, 'Linguistic Landscape as Symbolic Construction of the Public Space: The Case of Israel', *International Journal of Multilingualism,* vol. 3 (1) (2006), pp. 7-30.

Peter Berresford Ellis (1974), *The Cornish Language and its Literature*, London: Routledge and Kegan Paul.

Claude Berry (1949), *Cornwall,* London: Robert Hale.

Homi Bhabha (1990), *Nation and Narration*, London: Routledge.

Michael Billig (1995), *Banal Nationalism,* London, Thousand Oaks, New Delhi: Sage.

Bert Biscoe, 'The Hungry Beast. A View of the Media', in Simon Parker (ed.) (1998), *Cornwall Marches On!, Keskerdh Kernow 500*, Truro: Keskerdh Kernow Ltd., pp. 149-161.

Bert Biscoe, letter to *An Baner Kernewek*, no. 73, August 1993.

Hywel Bishop, Nikolas Coupland and Peter Garret, 'Globalization, advertising and shifting values for Welsh and Welshness: The case of Y Drych', *Multilingua,* vol. 24 (2005), pp. 343-378.

Tony Blakely and Kevin Dew, 'Ethnicity, Acculturation and Health: Who's to judge?', *Journal of the New Zealand Medical Association,* (30th January 2004), vol.117 (1188).

Priscilla Boniface and Peter J. Fowler (1993), *Heritage and Tourism in 'the global village',* London: Routledge.

William Borlase (1769), *Antiquities Historical and Monumental of the County of Cornwall,* London: Bowyer and Nichols.

Edward Bosenketh (1888), *Tin,* London.

William Bottrell (1989 [1870,1873]), *Traditions and Hearthside Stories of West Cornwall,* Lampeter: Llanerch Publishers. (Originally published in three volumes Penzance.)

Pierre Bourdieu (1972), *An Outline of a Theory of Practice,* trans. Richard Nice, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Pierre Bourdieu (1979), *La Distinction, Critique sociale du jugement,* Le Sens Commun (coll.), Paris: Minuit.

Pierre Bourdieu (1979), 'Les 3 états du capital culturel', in *Actes de la recherch en sciences sociales,* Vol. 30, November 1979, L'Institution Scolaire, pp. 3-6.

Pierre Bourdieu (1980), *Le sens pratique,* (coll.) *Le sens commun,* Editions de Minuit, Paris.

Pierre Bourdieu (1980), 'L'identité et la représentation': Elements pour une réflexion critique sur l'idée de région', Actes de recherche en science sociale, no. 35, (novembre 1980), pp. 63-75.

Pierre Bourdieu (1982), *Ce que parler veut dire – L'économie des échanges linguistique*s, Paris: Editions Fayard.

Pierre Bourdieu, (1982, 2001) *Langage et Pouvoir Symbolique,* Editions Fayard et Editions de Seuil.

Pierre Bourdieu (1984,1988), *Homo Academicus,* translated by Peter Collier, Cambridge: Polity Press.

Pierre Bourdieu (1985), 'The Social Space and the Genesis of Groups', in *Theory and Society,* vol.14 (6), (November 1985), New York: Springer.

http://www.springerlink.com (Accessed 7th April 2010.)

Pierre Bourdieu (1990), *In Other Words: Essays Towards a Reflexive Sociology,* Cambridge: Polity Press.

Pierre Bourdieu, (1990), *Distinction: A Social Critique of the Judgement of Taste,* Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Pierre Bourdieu (1991), *Language and Symbolic Power*, Cambridge: Polity Press.

Pierre Bourdieu et Loïc J.D. Wacquant (1992), *Réponses pour une anthropologie reflexive,* Paris: Le Seuil.

Pierre Bourdieu, 'Identity and Representation: Elements for a Critical Reflection of the Idea of Region.' in Bourdieu (1991) op. cit. Part III, Ch. 10.

Pierre Bourdieu (1997), *'Méditations pascaliennes',* coll. Liber, Paris: Le Seuil.

Pierre Bourdieu (2000), *Les structures sociales de l'économie,* coll. Liber, Paris: Le Seuil.

Marion Bowman (1996), 'Cardiac Celts: images of the Celts in paganism', pp. 242-251 in G. Harvey and C. Hardman (eds.), *Paganism Today*, Thorsons: London.

Anthony Brewer (1984), *A Guide to Marx's Capital*, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Richard Bourhis and Rodrigue Landry (1997), 'Linguistic Landscape and Ethnolinguistic Vitality: An Empirical Study,' Journal of Linguistic and Social Psychology.

Richard Bourhis and Rodrigue Landry, 'La loi 101 et l'aménagement du paysage linguistic au Québec', in *Revue d'Aménagement Linguistique,* Hors Série, (Automne 2002), pp. 107-131.

http://www.oqlf.gouv.qc.ca/RESSOURCES/bibliotheque/ouvrages/amenagement_hs/ral01_charte_bourhis_vf_1.pdf, (Accessed 10th August 2112.)

Gary Bridge, 'Bourdieu, Rational Action and the Time-Space Strategy of Gentrification', Transactions of the Institute of British Geographers, vol. 26, no. 2: (2001), pp. 205-216.

Fañch Broudic (2009), *Parler breton au XXIe siècle: Le nouveau sondage de TMO-Régions*, Brest: Emgleo Breiz.

Gordon Brown, Foreword in Iain McLean (2006), *Adam Smith, Radical and Egalitarian*, Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press.

Terence Brown (ed.) (1996), *Celticism,* Amsterdam and Atlanta GA: Rodopi.

Wella Brown, Denise Chubb, Ray Chubb, Neil Kennedy, and Jane Ninnis (1991) *The Cornish Language,* joint publication of Cornish Language Board, Agan Tavas, Dalleth, Cossell an Tavaz Cornoack, An

Gressenn Kernewek, Kowethas an Yeth Kernewek.

Mary Buck, Lyn Bryant and Malcolm Williams (1993), 'Housing and Households in Cornwall: A pilot study of Cornish families', Plymouth: University of Plymouth.

Mary Buck, Malcolm Williams and Lyn Bryant, 'Housing the Cornish: Containing the Crisis', in P.J.Payton (ed.), Cornish Studies, no. 1, pp.97-108.

Sally Burley (2008), 'A Report on the Cornish Language Survey Conducted by The Cornish Language Partnership', Truro: Maga.

Rob Burton, 'A Passion to Exist: Cultural Hegemony and the Roots of Cornish Identity', in P.J. Payton (ed.), *Cornish Studies*, 2nd Series, no.5, (1997), pp. 151-163.

C.

Deborah Cameron (1995), *Verbal Hygiene*, London: Routledge.

Deborah Cameron (2007), 'Language Endagerment and Verbal Hygiene: History and Politics', in Duchêne and Heller (eds.), *Discourses of Endagerment*, London: Continuum Press.

Deborah Cameron, 'The one, the many and the Other: representing mono/multiculturalism in post- 9/11 verbal hygiene', paper presented to 'Multilingual 2,0?' Conference at the University of Arizona, (14th April 2012).

Cath Camps, 'Silencing the voice of the Cornish', unpublished Cert.Ed. assignment for Cornwall College [n.d.].

Philippe Carrer (1999, 2011), *Ethnopsychiatre en Bretagne et autres terres celtes*, Spezet: Coop Breizh.

Carrick District Council and PSEC Health and Housing Consultancy (1996), '*Private Sector House Condition Survey'*, Truro: Carrick District Council.

Kathy Carter (1993), 'The place of story in the study of teaching and teacher education', in *Educational Researcher*, vol. 22 (1), pp. 5-12. http://edr.sagepub.com/content/22/1/5.refs (Accessed 15th August 2011.)

Terrence Casey, 'Social Capital and Regional Economies in Britain', *Political Studies* 52 (2004), pp. 96-117.

Terrence Casey and Kevin Christ, 'Social Capital and Economic Performance in the American States', *Social Science Quaterly*, vol. 86 (April 2005), pp. 827-846.

L. Cathro, 'More than 'just stories': Narrative inquiry in Research', in *Education Research and Perspectives*, (1995), vol. 22 (1), pp. 53-63, Perth: University of Western Australia.

http://cat.inist.fr/?aModele=afficheN&cpsidt=2867230, (Accessed 11th May 2010)

Daniel Cefaï (ed.) (2003), *L'enquête de terrain*, Paris: La Découverte.

Jasone Cenoz and Durk Gorter (2006), 'Linguistic Landscape and Minority Languages', International Journal of Multilingualism, vol. 3 (1), pp. 67-80.

Michel de Certeau (1984), *The Practice of Everyday Life*, translated by Steven Rendell, Berkeley: University of Califoria Press. (First pub. as *L'invention du quotidian,* 1980.)

Aimé Césaire (1972 [1950]), *Discourse on Colonialism*, New York and London: Monthly Review Press.

Malcolm Chapman (1992), *The Celts: The Construction of a Myth*, London: Macmillan.

Simon J. Charlesworth (2000), *A Phenomenology of Working Class Experience*, Cambridge University Press: Cambridge.

Simon J. Charlesworth (2005), 'Understanding Social Suffering: A Phenomenological Investigation of the Experience of Inequality', Journal of Community and Applied Social Psychology, no. 15 (2005) pp. 296-312.

Kathy Charmaz (2006), *Constructing Grounded Theory: A practical guide through Qualitative Analysis*, Delhi: Sage Publications.

Stéphane Chevallier and Christine Chauvre (2010), *Dictionnaire Bourdieu*, Paris: Ellipses.

Ray Chubb and Craig Weatherhill, 'Recognizability of traditional Cornish place-names in Revived Cornish', in Michael Everson (ed.) (2007), *Form and Content in Revived Cornish* (below).

Hélène Cixous,*'The New-Born Woman'* (first publish as *La Jeune Née* 1975) Cixous Elaine Marks and Isabelle de Courtivron (1981), *New French Feminisms - An Anthology*, Harvester Press, Hemel Hempstead.

D. Jean Clandinin and F.M. Connelly, 'Stories of Experience and Narrative Inquiry', in *Education Researcher*, Vol.19 (5), (June-July, 1990), pp. 2-14.

Jerry Clarke and Terry Harry (1994), *Tales of Twickenham*, Harry and Clarke: Redruth.

John Clarke, Stuart Hall, Tony Jefferson and Brian Roberts, 'Subcultures, Cultures and Class,' [1975] in K. Gelder and S. Thornton (1997), *The Subcultures Reader*, London and New York: Routledge, pp. 100-111.

Matthew Clarke, 'Cornish Culture in Business', A Guest blog for Business Cornwall, http://www.businesscornwall.co.uk/blogs/guest-blog-cornish-culture-in-business-123, (Accessed 13th April 2012.)

Ronan le Coadic (1998), *L'Identité bretonne*, Deuxième édition, Rennes: Terre de Brume - Presse Universitaires de Rennes.

Saul B. Cohen and Nurit Kliot, 'Place-Names in Israel's Ideological Struggle over the Administered Territories, *Association of American Geographers* (2002).

James Coleman (1988), 'Social Capital in the Creation of Human Capital', in *The American Journal of Sociology*, Vol. 94, Supplement: Organizations and Institutions: Sociological and Economic Approaches to the Analysis of Social Structure, pp. S95-S120. http://www.jstor.org/ (Accessed 13th November 2010.)

Simon Coleman and Mike Crang (eds.) (2002), *Tourism, Between Place and Performance*, New York, Oxford: Berghahn Books.

Commission for Racial Equality (1997), *Ethnic Minorities in Britain*, London.

Commission for Racial Equality (1995), *Challenging Racism in the South-West: a one day seminar for Cornwall*, Truro.

Will Coleman, Letter to the editor, *The Western Morning News*, 26th June 2007.

Will Coleman, Unpublished document's concening the Kernocopia project, (2012).

Walker Connor (1994), *Ethnonationalism - The Quest for Understanding*, Princeton University Press.

Carola Conle, 'Narrative Inquiry: research tool and medium for professional development', in *European Journal of Teacher Education*, vol. 23 (1), (March 2000), pp. 49-63.

F. Michael Connelly and D. Jean Clandinin, 'Stories of Experience and Narrative Inquiry', in *Educational Researcher*, Vol. 19 (5) (1990), pp. 2-14.

Walker Connor (1993), *Ethnonationalism: The Quest for Understanding*, Princeton: Princeton University Press.

Jean Copans (2002), *L'enquête ethnologique de terrain*, Paris: Nathan.

Cornish Language Board-Kesva an Taves Kernewek [n.d.], *House-Names in Cornish*, Kesva an Taves Kernewek.

Cornish Language Partnership, 'Cornish Language Survey', (July 2008).

Cornwall and Isles of Scilly Drug and Alcohol Action Team, 'Alcohol Needs Assessment', (2010-11) and 'Adult Drug Treatment Needs Assessment' (2010-11).

Cornwall Arts Partnership and Arts Council England, 'Understanding the impact of cultural tourism', (June 2008).

Cornwall Council (2004), 'Strategy for the Cornish Language', Truro.

Cornwall Council (2007), 'West Cornwall Housing Requirements Study', Truro: Opinion Research Services (Swansea).

Cornwall Council, 'Preventing suicide: a strategy for action in Cornwall and Isles of Scilly - 2008-2013' [n.d.]

Cornwall Council (December 2007), 'Cornwall's Creative Industries Strategy, 2007-2012', Truro.

Cornwall Council (2010), 'Future Cornwall – 2010-2030: A joint strategy, vision and objectives', (Sustainable Community Strategy), Truro.

Cornwall Council (2010), 'The Cornwall Housing Market, Strategic Evidence Base 2010 Update: Executive Summary', Truro.

Cornwall Council (2011), 'Draft Core Strategy', Truro.

Cornwall Council (2011), 'Demographic Evidence Base', Truro.

Cornwall Council (2011), 'Deprivation and Child Poverty', Truro.

Cornwall Council (2012), 'White Paper for Culture', Truro.

Cornwall Council (2012), 'Planning Future Cornwall', Truro.

Cornwall Enterprise (2000), 'A Framework Strategy for Tourism in Cornwall: Delivering Distinctive Difference', Cornwall Enterprise: Truro.

Cornwall Enterprise (Projects Consultancy) (August 2008), 'Commercial Use of Cornish', Truro.

Cornwall Rural Community Council (1990s), Parish Housing Surveys.

Council of Europe, *The European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages*, Council of Europe, (1992).

Margaret A. Courtney, 'Cornish Feasts and "Feasten" Customs', *The Folk-Lore Journal,* vol. 4 (3), (1886), pp.221-249.

Treve Crago, '"The Myth of Non Interference": A Personal Reappraisal of the Role of the Interviewer in the Process of Oral History', in *Cornish History Network Newsletter*, (10th March 2001).

Cheryl L. Craig, 'A Response to Margaret Olson's "Curriculum as a Multistoried Process"' (www.jstor.org/stable/1585856 Accessed 110th May 2010.)

Mike Crang and Nigel Thrift (2000), *Thinking Space*, London: Routledge.

David Crouch (ed.) (1999), *Leisure/Tourism Geographies: Practices and Geographical Knowledge,* London: Routledge.

Howard Curnow, in *An Baner Kernewek,* no. 69, (August 1992).

D.

Merv Davey (1983), *Hengan: Traditional Folk Songs, Dances and Broadside Ballads Collected in Cornwall*, Redruth: Dyllansow Truran.

Merv, Alison and Jowdy Davey (2009), *Scoot Dances, Troyls, Furrys and Tea Treats- The Cornish Dance Tradition,* London: Francis Boutle Publishers.

Merv Davey, '"As is the manner and the custom"; folk tradition and identity in Cornwall', unpublished Ph.D thesis, University of Exeter.

Bernard Deacon, 'The Electoral Impact of Cornish Nationalalism' in Cathal Ó Luain (ed.) (1983), *For a Celtic Future*, (below).

Bernard Deacon, 'And shall Trelawney die? The Cornish identity', in P.J. Payton (ed.) (1993), *Cornwall Since the War* (below).

Bernard Deacon, 'A Forgotten Migration Stream: The Cornish Movement to England and Wales in the Nineteenth Century'; *Cornish Studies,* no. 6, (1998), pp. 96–117.

Bernard Deacon, (1996) 'Language Revival and Language Debate: Modernity and Postmodernity', in P.J. Payton (ed.), *Cornish Studies: Four* (2nd Series) (1996), pp. 88-106.

Bernard Deacon, '"The Hollow Jarring of the Distant Steam Engine": Images of C between West Barbary and Delectable Duchy', in E. Westland (ed.) (1997) (below), Ch.1,

Bernard Deacon, 'Language Revival and Language Debate: Modernity and Postmodernity', in P.J. Payton (ed.), *Cornish Studies*, no. 4, (1996), pp. 88-106.

Bernard Deacon (2000), *The Cornish and the Council of Europe Framework Convention for the Protection of National Minorities,* Truro:

Cornish National Minority Steering Group, supported by the Joseph Rowntree Reform Trust.

Bernard Deacon, 'Breaking the chains and forging new links', in P.J. Payton (ed.), *Cornish Studies*, no. 8, (2000) pp.231-234.

Bernard Deacon, 'In Search of the 'Missing Turn': The Spatial Dimension and Cornish Studies'; *Cornish Studies*, no. 8, (2000), pp.213–230.

Bernard Deacon, 'The New Cornish Studies: new discipline or rhetorically defined space?', in P.J. Payton (ed.), *Cornish Studies*, no. 10, (2002), pp.24–33.

Bernard Deacon (2004), 'Under Construction: culture and regional formation in south-west England', *European Urban and Regional Studies*, vol.11, (2004), pp. 213-25.

Bernard Deacon, 'From 'Cornish Studies' to 'Critical Cornish Studies': reflections on methodology'; *Cornish Studies,* no. 12, (2005). pp. 13–29.

Bernard Deacon, 'Cornish or Klingon?: The Standardization of the Cornish Language', in P.J. Payton (ed.), *Cornish Studies,* no. 14, (2006), pp 13–23.

Bernard Deacon, 'Population change in Cornwall 1951-2001', (June 2007).

http://eric.ex.ac.uk/exeter/bitstream/10036/1996/1/Populationchang einCornwall1951-2001.pdf

Bernard Deacon (2007), *Cornwall: A Concise History*, Cardiff: University of Wales Press.

Bernard Deacon, 'Cornishness and Englishness: nested identities or compatible ideologies?', *International Journal of Regional and Local Studies,* vol.5 (2), (2009), pp. 9-29.

Bernard Deacon (2010), *Cornwall and the Cornish,* Penzance: Alison Hodge.

Bernard Deacon, 'The Unimportance of Being Cornish in Cornwall', Paper presented to the Institute of Cornish Studies, 24th November 2012.

Bernard Deacon, 'D'une ethnie à une nation? Les trois moments de l'identité cornouaillaise moderne', translated by N. Kennedy, in *Le Bulletin d'Histoire Politique,* (forthcoming 2013).

Bernard Deacon, Dick Cole and Garry Tregidga (2003), *Mebyon Kernow and Cornish Nationalim*, Cardiff: Welsh Academic Press.

Bernard Deacon, Andrew George and Ron Perry (1987), *Cornwall at the Crossroads*, CoSERG: Redruth.

Bernard Deacon and Philip Payton, 'Re-inventing Cornwall: Culture Change on the European Periphery', in P.J. Payton *Cornish Studies,* no. One (1993), pp. 62–79.

Bernard Deacon and Philip Payton (1993), *'The Ideology of Language Revival',* Ch.12 in P.J. Payton (ed.) (1993), *Cornwall Since The War*, (below).

Bernard Deacon with Sharron Schwartz and David Holman (2004), *The Cornish Family: the roots of our future,* Fowey: Cornwall Editions.

Bernard Deacon and Sharron Swartz (2007), 'Cornish identities and migration: a multi-scalar approach', in *Global Networks*, vol. 7 (3), pp. 289-306, Blackwell Publishing. http://hdl.handle.net/10036/26432, (Accessed 10th March 2010.)

Bernard Deacon, 'Under Construction: Culture and Regional Formation in South-West England', in European Urban and Regional Studies, vol. 11 (3), pp. 213-225 (2004), London: Sage.

Guy Debord (1995, first pub. 1967), *The Society of the Spectacle*, Translated by Donald Nicholson-Smith, New York: Zone Books.

Gilles Deleuze and Félix Guattari (1987), *A Thousand Plateaus, Capitalism and Schizophrenia,* translated by Brian Massumi London: Continuum. (First pub. as *'Mille Plateaux'*, in *Capitalisme et Schizophrénie*, Vol, 2 (1980), Les Editions de Minuit, Paris.

DEMOS (2009), See Charlie Tims and Shelagh Wright.

Delphine Dion, Eric Rémy, Lionel Sitz, Pascal Ezan (2008), 'Comment exploiter les cultures régionales en marketing ?' www.u-bourgogne.fr (Accessed 4th May 2010.)

Richard Dorson, 'Is Folklore a] Discipline?', in *Folklore*, vol. 84, no. 3, (Autumn, 1973), pp 177-205, Taylor and Francis: www.jstor.org/stable/1259723 (Accessed 15th December 2011).

Richard Dorson (1976), 'Folklore and Fakelore: Essays Toward a Discipline of Folk Studies', Cambridge, Mass: Harvard University Press.

Samuel Drew (1824), *The History of Cornwall*, Helston: William Penaluna.

Paul Dunbar and Ken George (1997), *Kernewek Kemmyn: Cornish for the 21st Century*, Kesva an Taves Kernewek.

Gilles Duranton, Andrés Rodríguez-Pose and Richard Sandall, 'Family Types and the Persistence of Regional Disparities in Europe', in Economic Geography, vol. 85, issue 1, (January 2009) pp. 23-14.

Simon During (1999), *The Cultural Studies Reader*, 2nd Edition, London: Routledge.

E.

Umberto Eco (1986), 'Travels in Hyperreality' in *Faith in Fakes*, London: Seeker and Warburg.

Umberto Eco (1987), *Travels in Hyperreality*, London: Picador.

Fañch Elégoët (1978), "Nous ne savions que le breton et il fallait parler français' - Mémoires d'un paysan du Léon', La Baule: Breiz hor Bro.

Peter Beresford-Ellis (1974), *The Cornish Language and its Literature*, London: Routledge and Kegan Paul.

Jessica Evans and Stuart Hall (1999), *Visual Culture: The Reader*, London: Sage.

Michael Everson (ed.) (2007), *Form and Content in Revived Cornish*, Westport, Co. Mayo: Evertype.

Guus Extra and Durk Gorter (eds.) (2001), *The Other Languages of Europe*, Clevedon: Multilingual Matters Ltd.

Ron Ezley, 'In-migration to Newquay: Migrant's lifestyles and perspectives on environments', in P.J. Payton (ed.), *Cornish Studies*, no. 6, (1998), pp.127-142.

F.

Norman Fairclough (1989), *Language and Power*, Harlow Essex and New York: Longman.

Ghazi Falah (1996), 'The 1948 Israeli-Palestinian War and its Aftermath: The Transformation and De-Signification of Palestine's Cultural Landscape', *Annals of the Association of American Geographers*, Vol. 86, No. 2, pp. 256-285.

Frantz Fanon (1967), *Black Skin, White Masks*, translated by C.L. Markmann, New York: Grove Press.

Mike Featherstone (1991), *Consumer Culture and Postmodernism*, London and Newbury Park, California: Sage.

Mike Featherstone (1995), *Undoing Culture: Globalization, Postmodernism and Identity*, London and Newbury Park, California: Sage.

David M. Fetterman (1998), *Ethnography*, London: Sage.

Thierry Fillaut, *Le Suicide en Bretagne* (XIXe siècl-XXe siècle): *Contribution à une approche historique du phénomène*, Rennes: CHRISCO, vol. 5, (2002).

John Fiske (1987), 'British Cultural Studies and Television Criticism', pp. 254-90 in R. Allen (ed.), *Channels of Discourse: Television and Contemporary Criticism*, London: Methuen.

Susan T. Fiske (2009 [2004]), *Social beings: A Core Motives Approach to Social Psychology*, 2nd Edition, London: John Wiley and Sons.

Thomas K. Fitzgerald, 'The Maori University Graduate and the Sentiment System', *Anthropological Quarterly*, Vol. 47 (2), (April 1974), pp. 169-181. http://www.jstor.org/stable/3316578 (Accessed 4th September 2012.)

Sarah Foot, *Cornish Scene* (Magazine), 1987-1992.

Michel Foucault (1970), *The Order of Discourse: An Archaeology of the Human Sciences*, London: Tavistock.

Michel Foucault (1971), *Madess and Civilization*, London: Tavistock.

Michel Foucault (1972), *The Archaeology of Knowledge*, London: Tavistock.

Michel Foucault (1977), *Language, Counter-Memory, Practice,* Ithica: Cornell University Press.

Michel Foucault (1978 [1972]), *The History of Sexuality: An Introduction, vol.1*, Harmondsworth: Penguin.

Michel Foucault (1991 [1975]), *Discipline and Punish: The Birth of the Prison*, Penguin Harmondsworth.

Bridget Fowler (1997), *Pierre Bourdieu and Cultural Theory - Critical Investigations*, London: Sage.

Brian Friel (1981), *Translation,* London: Faber.

G.

Clifford Geertz (1973), *The Interpretation of Cultures*, London: Fontana (cited in Seale p. 227.).

Richard Gendall (2000), *Tavaz a Ragadazow*, Menheniot: Teer ha Tavaz.

Richard Gendall, 'Cornoack: Plansin e en e Deller Teithy,' in *Carn*, vol. 57 (16),(1987), The Celtic League.

Richard Gendall (1990) 'The Language of Cornish People', in *Old Cornwall*, vol. 10, no. 9.

Richard Gendall (1991), *The Pronunciation of Cornish*, Menheniot: Teer ha Tavaz; Richard Gendall (1994), *1000 Years of Cornish* (Second Edition), Menheniot: Teer ha Tavaz.

Richard Gendall (1991), *A Students' Grammar of Modern Cornish*, Menheniot: The Cornish Language Council.

Richard Gendall (2000), *'Tavaz a Ragadazow - The Language of my Forefathers'*, Menheniot: Teer ha Tavaz.

Alexandra Georgakopoulou, *'Thinking big with small stories in narrative and identity analysis' in Narrative Inquiry*, vol. 16 (1), (2006), pp. 122-130(9), Amsterdam: John Benjamins Publishing Company.

Paul Gilroy (1993), *The Black Atlantic*, London: Verso.

Paul Gilroy (1997), 'Diaspora and the Detours of Identity', in K. Woodward (ed.), *Identity and Difference*, London: Sage.

Colin Gordon (ed.) (1980), *Michel Foucault: Power/Knowledge: Selected Interviews and Other Writings 1972-1977*, Brighton: Harvester.

Durk Gorter (ed.) (2006), 'Linguistic landscape: A New Approach to Multilingualism', *International Journal of Multilingualism*, vol. 3(1), pp. 1-6.

Durk Gorter and Jasone Cenoz, 'Knowledge about Language and Linguistic Landscape', in *The Encyclopedia of Language and Education*, 2nd Edition, vol. 6: *Knowledge about Language*, New York: Springer (2007), pp. 343-355.

Durk Gorter, Heiko F. Marten and Luk Van Mensel (eds.) (2012), *Minority Languages in the Linguistic Landscape* (Palgrave Studies in Minority Languages and Communities.), Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan.

Antonio Gramsci (1998), *Selections from the Prison Notebooks and the Study of Philosophy*, in Q. Hoare and G. Nowell-Smith (eds.), London: Wishart.

Antonio Gramsci, *'Hegemony, Intellectuals and The State'*, in John Storey (ed,) (2006 [1994]) (below), pp. 215-221.

Roy Green (1980), *The National Question in Cornwall*, London: Communist Party History Group.

Liah Greenfeld (1992), *Nationalism - Five Roads to Modernity*, Harvard.

Andrew Griffiths (1989), *Change in the Countryside – The Cornish Perspective: A study of twelve rural parishes in Cornwall*, University of Exeter.

Colin Gregory (1991), *Cornwall Rugby Champions*, London: Western Morning News and Eveing Herald with Partridge Press.

Jacob Gruber, 'Ethnographic Salvage and the Shaping of Anthropology', *American Anthropologist, (New Series),* vol. 72 (6), (December 1970), pp. 1289–1299.

H.

Amy Hale, 'Foot in the Mouth, or Foot in the Door? Evaluating Chapman's *The Celts*,' in P.J. Payton (ed.), *Cornish Studies*, no. 4, (1996), pp. 158-170.

Amy Hale (1997), 'Genesis of the Celto-Cornish Revival? L.C. Duncombe-Jewell and the Cowethas Kelto-Kernuak', in P.J. Payton (ed.), *Cornish Studies*, no. 5, (1997), pp. 100-111.

Amy Hale, 'Representing the Cornish - Contesting heritage interpretation in Cornwall', in *Tourist Studies*, Vol. 1 (2), pp. 185-196, (2001), London: Sage.

Amy Hale, 'Whose Celtic Cornwall? The Ethnic Cornish Meet Celtic Spirituality', in David C. Harvey, Rhys Jones, Neil McInroy and Christine Milligan (eds.) (2002), *Celtic Geographies; Old Culture, New Times*, London.

Amy Hale, 'Selling Celtic Cornwall: Challenging Markets and Meanings?' in K. Meethan, A. Anderson and S. Miles (eds.) (2006), *Tourism, Consumption and Representation: Narratives of Place and Self,* Wallingford Oxon and Cambridge MA: C.A.B.I. International.

Amy Hale and Alan Kent (eds.) (2002), *Celtopop: Essays on Contemporary Celtic Cultures*, London: Francis Boutle Publishers.

Amy Hale and Philip Payton (eds.) (2000), *New Directions in Celtic Studies*, Exeter: University of Exeter Press.

Stuart Hall ([1973] 1980), 'Encoding/decoding', in Centre for Contemporary Cultural Studies (ed.): *Culture, Media, Language: Working Papers in Cultural Studies, 1972-79,* London: Hutchinson, pp. 128-38.

Stuart Hall, 'Culture, the Media and the 'Ideological Effect'', in James Curran, Michael Gurevitch and Janet Woollacott (eds.) (2000), *Mass Communications and Society*, London: Edward Arnold.

Stuart Hall (ed.) (2003 [1997]), *Representation, Cultural Representation and Signifying Practices*, London: Sage.

Stuart Hall (1996), 'Cultural Studies: Two Paradigms', in John Storey (ed.) (2006 [1994]) (below), pp. 31-48.

Martin Hamersley and Paul Atkinson (1983), *Ethnography: Principles and Practice*, London: Tavistock Books.

Sandra Harding (ed.) (2004), *The feminist standpoint theory reader: intellectual and political controversies*, London: Routledge.

David Harvey et al. (2001), *Celtic Geographies - Old Culture, New Times*, London: Routledge.

R. Harker and S. May (1993), 'Code and habitus: comparing the accounts of Bernstein and Bourdieu', *British Journal of Sociology of Education*, vol. 14, pp. 169-178.

Henry Rand Hatfield, 'The Earliest use in English of the Term Capital', in The Quarterly Journal of Economics, vol. 40, vol. 3, (May 1926), pp 547-548. www.jstor.org/stable/1885177 (Accessed 22nd July 2010.)

Séamus Heaney, interview with Laurence Pollard, BBC Radio 4, 16th January 2010.

Dick Hebdidge (1979), *Subculture: The Meaning of Style*, London: Routledge.

Michael Hechter (1975), *Internal Colonialism - The Celtic fringe in British national development, 1536-1966*, London: Routledge & Kegan Paul.

Michael Hechter and Margaret Levi, 'The comparative analysis of ethnoregional movements', in *Ethnic and Racial Studies*, vol. 2, no 3, (July 1979).

Marianne Heiberg (1989), *The Making of the Basque Nation*, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Robert Hewison, (1987), *The Heritage Industry: Britain in a Climate of Decline*, London: Methuen.

Simon A. Hill, Colin Pritchard, Richard Laugharne and David Gunnel, 'Changing Patterns of Suicide in a Poor, Rural County over the 20th Century: A comparison', in *Social Psychiatry and Psychiatric Epidemiology*, (September 2005).

Fortescue Hitchins and Samuel Drew (1824), *The History of Cornwall*, Helston: William Penaluna.

Eric Hobsbawm (1992), *Nations and Nationalism Since 1780 - Programme, Myth, Reality*, 2nd Edition, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Eric Hobsbawm and Terence Ranger (eds.) (1983, 1989), *The Invention of Tradition*, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Geert Hofstede (1984), 'The Cultural Relativity of the Quality of Life Concept', *Academy of Management Review,* vol. 9 (3), pp. 389–398, http://www.nyegaards.com/yansafiles/Geert%20Hofstede%20cultural%20attitudes.pdf (Accessed 4th May 2010.)

Julyan Holmes (1983), *1000 Cornish Place Names Explained*, Redruth: Dyllansow Truran (Revised and reprinted 1989 Hyperion).

Ernest G. Retallack Hooper, Introduction to A.S.D. Smith, *Lessons in Spoken Cornish*, [no date].

Philip Marrack Hosken (1998), 'The Cornish Overseas', in Simon Parker (ed.) (below).

Peter Howard (2003), *Heritage: Management, Interpretation, Identity*, London and New York: Continuum.

Robert Hoggart (1957), *The Uses of Literacy*, Harmondsworth: Penguin.

Graham Huggan (2001), *The Postcolonial Exotic: Marketing the Margins*, London: Routledge.

Jane Howells (2012), 'Preliminary report on the Cornwall Council Core Strategy preferred approach equality impact assessment, Cornwall: Bewnans Kernow.

Home Office (H.M. Government), 'The United Kingdom Report on the Council of Europe Framework Convention for the Protection of National Minorities', London: The Home Office, (1999).

Kerryn Husk, 'Ethnic group affiliation and social exclusion in Cornwall: analysis, adjustment and extension of the 2001 England and Wales Census data', unpublished PhD thesis, University of Plymouth, 2012.

I.

Michael Ignatieff (1993), *Blood and Belonging - Journeys into the New Nationalism*, London: Vintage.

Allan Ivey and Philip Payton, 'Towards a Cornish Identity Theory', in *Cornish Studies*, vol. 2, (1994), pp. 151-163.

J.

Peter Jackson, 'Mapping Culture', in Alisdair Rogers and Heather Viles (eds.) (2003), *The Student's Companion to Geography*, 2nd Edition, Oxford: Blackwell.

Frederick W.P. Jago (1882), *The Ancient Language and Dialect of Cornwall*, Truro.

Simon James, (1999), *The Atlantic Celts - Ancient People or Modern Invention?,* London: British Museum Press.

Frederic Jameson (1983), 'Postmodernism or the Cultural Logic of Late Capitalism', *New Left Left Review*, No. 46, (1984).

A. Jaworski and C. Thurlow (2010), *Semiotic Landscapes: Language, Image, Space*, London, New York: Continuum International Publishing Group.

Frederick Jameson (1988), *The Cultural Turn : Selected Writings on thePostmodern 1983-1988*, London and New York: Version.

Frederick Jameson (1988), *Post-Modernism and Consumer Society*, in A. Gray and J.McGuigan (eds.) (1997), *Studies in Culture: An Introductory Reader*, London: Arnold, pp. 192-205.

Eric Jay (1992), *Keep them in Birmingham, Racism in the South-West*, Commission for Racial Equality, Bristol.

Alfred K. Hamilton Jenkin (1934), *Cornish Homes and Customs,* London: J.M. Dent.

Richard Jenkins (1992), *Pierre Bourdieu*, London: Routledge.

Henry Jenner (1904), *A Handbook of the Cornish Language*, London: David Nutt.

Karen E. Johnston and Paula R. Golombek (eds.) (2002), *Teachers' Narrative Inquiry as Professional Development*, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Sue Johnston (Canberra), 'Is Action Research a 'Natural' Process for Teachers?', in *Educational Action Research*, Vol. 2 (1), (1994), pp. 39-48, Routledge.

B. Junker (1960), *Fieldwork,* Chicago: University of Chicago Press, cited in C. Seale (2005) (below).

K.

Robin Kearns and Lawrence Berg, 'Proclaiming place: Towards a geography of place-name pronunciation,' *Social and Cultural Geography*, vol.3, no.3, pp. 283-302, 2002, Routledge.

http://www.chrdi.org/ldb/pubs/RAKLDB02.pdf (Accessed 20th November 2010.)

Robin Kearns, Tim McCreanor, Karen Witten, 'Linking Health, Place and Healthy Communities', *Territoris*, Vol. 5, (2005), pp. 189-203, Universitat de les Illes Balears.

http://www.raco.cat/index.php/Territoris/article/viewFile/117020/147942 (Accessed 16th November 2011).

Michael Keating (2001). 'Rethinking the Region. Culture, Institutions and Economic Development in Catalonia and Galicia', *European Urban and Regional Studies*, vol. 8, no. 3, pp. 217-234.

Michael Keating, 'A regional history of modern Europe. Territorial management and the state', in Bill Lancaster, Diana Newton and Natasha Vall (eds.) (2007), *An Agenda for Regional History*, Newcastle upon Tyne, Northumbria University Press pp. 149-164.

Gavin Kendall and Gary Wickham (1999), *Using Foucault's Methods*, London: Sage.

Neil Kennedy (1995), 'Racial equality in Cornwall', in Commission for Racial Equality, 'Challenging Racism in the South-West: report of a one day seminar for Cornwall', Truro, pp. 18-21.

Neil Kennedy and Nigel Kingcome, 'Disneyfication of Cornwall - Developing a Poldark Heritage Complex', in the *International Journal of Heritage Studies*, vol. 4, no. 1, (1998), Exeter.

Alan Kent (1998), *Dreaming in Cornish*, Liskeard: Giss' on Books.

Alan Kent (ed.) (2000), *Voices from West Barbary: An Anthology of Anglo-Cornish Poetry 1549-1228*, London: Francis Boutle Publishers.

Alan Kent (2000), *The Literature of Cornwall, Continuity, Identity, Difference 1000-2000*, Bristol: Redcliffe Press.

Alan Kent (2002), *Pulp Methodism: The Lives and Literature of Silas, Josephe and Salome Hocking*, St. Austell: Cornish Hillside Publications.

Alan Kent (2002), *Love and Seaweed*, St.Austell: Lyonesse Press.

Alan Kent (2010), *The Theatre of Cornwall: space, place, performance*, Bristol: Redcliffe/Wescliffe Books.

Alan Kent, 'From Ingraine to Callin' 'ome Mouzel: Two Paradigms of Memory, Language and Literature in Cornwall', (Prepublication copy: 2012).

Alan Kent and Tim Saunders (eds.) (2000), *Looking at the Mermaid: A Reader in Cornish Literature 900-1900*, London: Francis Boutle Publishers.

Moya Kneafsley, 'Rural Cultural Economy: Tourism and Social Relations, *Annals of Tourism Research*, vol. 28, no. 3, (2001), pp.762-

783.

Jane Smith Korey (1992), *As we belong to be: The ethnic movement in Cornwall*, England, Thesis, Brandeis University.

Julia Kristeva (1969), *Séméiôtiké: recherches pour une sémanalyse,* Paris: Le Seuil.

Julia Kristeva (1980), *Desire in Language: A Semiotic Approach to Literature and Art.* Oxford: Blackwell.

Norman Kunc (2011 [1992]), *The Need to Belong: Rediscovering Maslow's Hierarchy of Needs,* Baltimore: Paul H. Brookes Publishers.

L.

Bill Lancaster, Diana Newton and Natasha Vall (eds.) (2007), *An Agenda for Regional History,* Newcastle upon Tyne: Northumbria University Press.

Rodrigue Landry and Richard Y. Bourhis, *Linguistic Landscape and Ethnolinguistic Vitality: An Empirical Study, Journal of Language and Social Psychology,* Vol. 16 (1), (March 1997), pp. 23-49.

Andrew Lanyon (1985), *The First and Last Straw,* [s.n]

John Lechte (1994), *Fifty Key Cotemporary Thinkers - From Structuralism to Postmodernity,* London: Routledge.

Robert Le Page, 'Acts of Identity', in *English Today,* Vol.2, Issue 4, pp.21-24 (1986).

Annaig Le Gars (1998), *Les Bretons par eux-mêmes, Essai sur la condition bretonne,* Ar Releg-Kerhuon: An Here.

Robert Longsworth (1967), *The Cornish Ordinalia: Religion and Dramaturgy,* Cambridge Massachusetts: Harvard University Press.

Ania Loomba, (1998), *Colonialism/Postcolonialism,* London and New York: Routledge.

David Lowenthal (1998), *The Heritage Crusade and the Spoils of History,* Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Sharon Lowenna, "Noscitur A Sociis': Jenner, Duncombe-Jewell and their Milieu, in P.J. Payton (ed.), *Cornish Studies,* no. 12, (2004), pp. 61-87.

Sharon Lowenna, 'Charles Roger's 'Vocabulary of the Cornish Language', The Rylands Vocabulary, and gatherers of pre-'Revival'

fragments', in P.J. Payton (ed.), *Cornish Studies,* no. 19, (2011), pp. 105-122.

David Lowenthal (1975), *'Past Time, Present Place: Landscape and Memory', in The Geographical Review,* Vol. 65 (1), (January, 1975), pp. 1-36. http://www.jstor.org/stable/213831, (Accessed, 25th January 2010.)

David Lowenthal (1985), *The Past is a Foreign Country,* Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

John Lowerson, 'Celtic Toursim - Some Recent Magnets', in P.J. Payton (ed.), *Cornish Studies,* Vol. 2, (1994), pp. 128-137.

György Lukács (1971 [1923]), *History and Class Consciousness: Studies in Marxist Dialectics,* Translated by R. Livingstone, London: The Merlin Press.

Rod Trevelyan Lyon (2001), 'Cornish - The Struggle for Survival', Paper for The Cornish History Network, Nancegollan: Tavas an Weryn.

Rod Trevelyan Lyon and John Pengilly, *Notes on Spoken Cornish,* Redruth: Dyllansow Truran.

Jean-François Lyotard (1984 [1979]), *The Postmodern Condition: A Report on Knowledge,* Manchester: Manchester University Press.

M.

William of Malmesbury, *Gesta Regum Anglorum,* 1125, cited in Susan Pearce (1978) (below).

Mary McArthur (1988), 'The Cornish: A Case Study in Ethnicity', Unpublished M.Sc. Dissertation, University of Bristol.

Michael McGinnis, (ed.) (1998), *Bioregionalism,* New York: Routledge.

Kenneth MacKinnon (2000), *An Independent Academic Study on Cornish,* EKOS Ltd. & SGÙD for the Government Office of the South West, Plymouth.

Iain McLean (2006), *Adam Smith, Radical and Egalitarian,* Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press. http://books.google.com/books (Accessed 4th May 2010.)

Marshal McLuhan (1964), *Understanding Media: The Extensions of Man,* London: Routledge and Kegan Paul.

Yannig Madeg interviewed by Olivier Berson and Christian Le Meut, 'Panelloù hent divezhek ha toponomiezh', *An Dasson,* no. 74, (October 2011), pp. 4-33, Auray: Sten Kidna.

Jeannette Marie Mageo (ed.) (2001), *Cultural Memory*, Honolulu: University of Hawai'i Press.

Elaine Marks and Isabelle de Courtivron (1981), *New French Feminisms - An Anthology*, Hemel Hempstead: Harvester Press.

Karl Marx (1969 [1867, 1883, 1885]), *Le Capital,* translated by J. Roy, Garnier-Flammerion.

Karl Marx (1977 [1867, 1883, 1885]), *Capital*, vols. 1-3, translated by B. Fowkes, New York: Vintage Books.

Karl Marx (1990 [1867]), *Capital, Vol. 1: A Critique of Political Economy*, translated, Ben Fowkes, London: Penguin, p. 126.

Karl Marx, *Capital*, vol. 3, in D. McLellan (ed.) (2000), *Karl Marx: Selected Writings*, Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Abraham Maslow, 'A Theory of Human Motivation', first published in *Psychological Review,* no. 50, (1943), pp. 370-396. http://psychclassics.yorku.ca/Maslow/motivation.htm, (Accessed 16th September 2012.).

Abraham Maslow (1987[1954]), *Motivation and Personality*, Cynthia McReynolds (ed.), New York: Harper and Row Publishers. http://ways-ahead.net/meditation/037-2-Maslow.pdf, (Accessed 3rd May 2010.)

Doreen Massey (1994), *Space, Place and Gender*, Cambridge: Polity.

David Matless (1998), *Landscape and Englishness*, London: Reaktion.

Daphne du Maurier (1967), *Vanishing Cornwall: The spirit and history of Cornwall*, Harmondworth: Penguin.

Marcel Mauss (1934), 'Les Techniques du corps', *Journal de Psychologie,* 32 (3-4). Reprinted in Mauss, *Sociologie et anthropologie,* 1936, Paris: PUF.

Kobena Mercer (1994), *Welcome to the Jungle: New Positions in Black Cultural Studies*, London and New York: Routledge.

Don Mitchell, 'Cultural landscapes: the dialectical landscape – recent landscape research in human geography', in *Progress in Human Geography,* vol. 26 (3), (2002), pp. 381-389.

Sara Mills (1997), *Discourse*: *The new critical idiom,* London: Routledge.

Prys Morgan, 'From a Death to a View: The Hunt for the Welsh Past in the Romantic Period', in Hobsbawm and Ranger (eds.) (1983, 1989), op.

cit.

Christopher Mosely (ed.) (2010), *Atlas of the World's Languages in Danger,* Paris: UNESCO Publishing.

Chantal Mouffe (1988), 'Radical Democracy: Modern or Postmodern?', in Andrew Ross (ed.), Universal Abandon?: The Politics of Postmodernism. Minneapolis:University of Minnesota Press.

Brian Murdoch (1993), *Cornish Literature,* Cambridge: D.S. Brewer.

Jonathan Murdoch, (2006), *Post-structuralist Geography - A guide to relational space,* London: Sage.

N.

Robert Morton Nance, 'Cornish Culture', in *The Cornish Review,* no.1, April 1949, p.3.

Robert Morton Nance (1958 [1929]), *Cornish for All: A Guide to Unified Cornish,* 3rd edition, Federation of Old Cornwall Societies

Robert Morton Nance, 'What we stand for.', in *Old Cornwall,* no. 1, (1925).

Robert Morton Nance, [n.d.]: *A Guide to Cornish Place-names; with a list of the words contained in them.* Federation of Old Cornwall Societies.

Robert Morton Nance (1958 [1929]), *Cornish for All: A Guide to Unified Cornish,* 3rd edition, Federation of Old Cornwall Societies.

Catherine Nash, 'Remapping and Renaming - New Cartographies of Identity: Gender and Landscape in Ireland', in *Feminist Review,* No. 44, Summer 1993.

O.

Objective One Programme for Cornwall and the Isles of Scilly, 'Single Programming Document', (December 2005).

Jean Olivro (2010), *Projet Bretagne,* Rennes: Editions Apogée.

Bertell Ollman (2003), *Dance of the Dialectic: Steps in Marx's Method,* Urbana and Chicago: University of Illinois Press.

Margaret Olson, 'Where the Story Leads: A Response to Cheryl Craig', in *The Canadian Journal of Education/ Revue Canadienne de l'éducation*, vol. 25 (4), (2000), pp. 349-352. www.jstor.org/stable/1585856 (Accessed 11th May 2010.)

Cathal Ó Luain (ed.) (1983), *For a Celtic Future: A Tribute to Alan Heusaff*, Dublin: The Celtic League.

Tim O'Sullivan, John Hartley, Danny Saunders, Martin Montomery, John Fiske (1994), *Key Concepts in Communication and Cultural Studies*, 2nd Edition, London: Routledge.

P.

Oliver Padel (1985) *Cornish Place-name Elements,* Nottingham: English Place-Name Society.

Michael Parker (1993), *Séamus Heaney - The Making of the Poet*, Iowa City: University of Iowa.

Simon Parker (ed.) (1998), *Cornwall Marches On!*, Keskerdh Kernow 500: Truro: Keskerdh Kernow Ltd.

Philip Payton (1989), *Modern Cornwall: The Changing Nature of Peripherality,* Unpublished Thesis.

Philip Payton (ed.), *Cornish Studies,* 2nd Series, nos. 1-20, (1993-2012), Exeter: Exeter University Press (Institute of Cornish Studies).

Philip Payton (1992), *The Making of Modern Cornwall: Historical Experience and the Persistence of 'Difference'*, Redruth: Dyllansow Truran.

Philip Payton (ed.) (1993), *Cornwall since the War: The Contemporary History of a European Region,* Redruth: Dyllansow Truran and Institute of Cornish Studies.

Philip Payton (1996), *Cornwall,* Fowey: Alexander Associates.

Philip Payton, 'The Ideology of Language Revival in Modern Cornwall', in R. Black, W. Gillies & R. Ó Maolalaigh (eds.), *Celtic Connections: Proceedings of the Tenth International Congress of Celtic Studies,* Vol.1, *Language, Literature, History, Culture*, Edinburgh, (1999), pp.395-424.

Philip Payton (1999), *The Cornish Overseas*, Fowey: Alexander Associates.

Philip Payton, 'Industrial Celts? Cornish Identity in the Age of Technological Prowess', in P.J. Payton (ed.), *Cornish Studies,* vol. 10, (2002), pp. 116-135.

Philip Payton (2004), *Cornwall – A History,* Fowey: Cornwall Editions Ltd.

Philip Payton, 'A Duchy in every respect un-English': discourses of identity in late-modern Cornwall', in Bill Lancaster, Diana Newton and Natasha Vall (eds.) (2007), *An Agenda for Regional History,* Newcastle upon Tyne, Northumbria University Press, pp. 321-332.

Philip Payton and Bernard Deacon, 'The Ideology of Language Revival', in P.J. Payton (ed.), (1993) *Cornwall Since the War.*

Sarah Payne, Brenda Henson, David Gordon and Ray Forest (June 1996), 'Poverty and Deprivation in West Cornwall in the 1990s', Statistical Monitoring Unit, School for Policy Studies, University of Bristol.

Susan Pearce (1978), The Kingdom of Dumnonia, Padstow: Lodenek Press.

Susan Pearce, 'The Construction and Analysis of the Cultural Heritage: Some thoughts', International Journal of Heritage Studies, no. 4, (1998), pp. 86-102.

Kenneth Pelmear (1960), *Rugby in the Duchy,* An Official History of the Game in Cornwall, Falmouth: Cornwall Rugby Football Union.

John Pengilly, (1987) correspondence in *Cornish Scene,* vol. 2, no. 4, p.24.

Ron Perry, 'Celtic Revival and Economic Development in Edwardian Cornwall', in in P.J. Payton (ed.), *Cornish Studies,* no. 5, (1997), p.112-124.

Ron Perry (1999), 'The Changing Face of Celtic Tourism in Cornwall, 1875-1975', in P.J. Payton (ed.), *Cornish Studies,* no. 7, (1999), pp.94-106.)

Ron Perry, 'Economic Change and Opposition Economics', in P.J. Payton (ed.) (1993), *Cornwall since the War.*

Ron Perry, 'The Making of Modern Cornwall 1800 – 2000: A Geo-Economic Perspective', in P.J. Payton (ed.) *Cornish Studies, no. 10,* (2002).

Ronald Perry, Ken Dean and Bryan Brown (eds) (1986), *Counterurbanisation: case studies of urban to rural movement,* Norwich: Geo Books.

N. Roy Philips (1987), *The Saffron Eaters,* Exeter: Devon Books.

N. Roy Philips (1996), Horn of Strangers, Tiverton: Halsgrove.

Susan Pitchford, 'Ethnic tourism and nationalism in Wales', in *Annals of Tourism Research*, vol. 22 (1), (1995), pp. 35-52.

Michael Polyani (1966), *The Tacit Dimension*, New York: Doubleday & Company.

Richard Polwhele, (1977 [1803]), *The History of Cornwall*, vols.1 and 2, Dorking: Kohler & Coombs.

Peter A.S. Pool (1985), *Place-Names of West Penwith*, Federation of Old Cornwall Societies.

Glanville Price (1984), *The Languages of Britain*, London: Edward Arnold.

Robert D. Putnam (1993), *Making Democracy Work: Civic Traditions in Modern Italy,* Princetown, N.J.: Princetown University Press.

Robert D. Putnam, 'Tuning in, tuning out: the strange disappearance of social capital in America', *Political Science and Politics*, no. 28, (1995), pp. 664-83.

Robert D. Putnam (2000), *Bowling Alone: The Collapse and Revival of American Community*, New York: Simon and Shuster.

Q.

Arthur T. Quiller-Couch, *The Cornish Magazine*, vol. 1. (1898), p.237.

R.

Donald R. Rawe, 'Review of *Berdh Arnowyth Kernewek*: Modern Cornish Poets', in *An Baner Kernewek*, no. 83, (February 1996).

Peter Reason and Hilary Bradbury (2007), *Handbook of Action Research*, 2nd Edition. London: Sage.

Diana Reay, 'Insider Perspectives or Stealing the Words out of Women's Mouths: Interpretation in the Research Process', *Feminist Review*, no. 53, 'Speaking Out: Researching and Representing Women', (Summer, 1996), pp. 57-73. http://www.jstor.org/stable/1395661 (Accessed 8th February 2011.)

Diana Reay (2004), 'Gendering Bourdieu's concept of capitals?: Emotional capital, women and social class', in L Adkins and B Skeggs (ed.) *Feminism after Bourdieu,* Oxford: Blackwell.

Diana Reay (2004), "It's all becoming a habitus': Beyond the habitual use of Pierre Bourdieu's concept of habitus in educational research',

Special Issue of British Journal of Sociology of Education on Pierre Bourdieu, vol. 25, no 4, pp 431-444.

Alisdair Rogers and Heather A. Viles (eds.) (2003), *The Student's Companion to Geography,* 2nd Edition, Oxford: Blackwell.

Robert Reynolds (2007)., 'Young proud and Cornish', Available at: http://www.magakernow.org.uk/.

John Rowe (2004), *The Hard Rock Men-Cornish Immigrants and the North American Mining Frontier,* St. Austell: Cornish Hillside Publications.

Alfred L. Rowse (1969), *The Cornish in America,* London: Macmillan.

S.

Edward Said (1999), *After the Last Sky - Palestinian Lives,* New York: Columbia University Press.

Edward Saïd (2003 [1978]), *Orientalism,* London: Penguin Books.

Tom Salmon (1983), *The First Hundred Years - The Story of Rugby Football in Cornwall,* Illogan: Cornwall Rugby Football Union.

Ian Saltern (March 2011), 'The Cornish National Minority Report 2', Redruth: Azook Community Interest Company.

Tim Saunders, 'Cornish Symbol and Substance', in Cathal Ó Luain (ed.) (1983), op. cit., pp. 253-258.

Tim Saunders (ed.) (2000), *The Wheel: An Anthology of Modern Poetry in Cornish,* London: Francis Boutle Publishers.

Andy Seward, 'Cornish Rugby and Cultural Identity: A socio-historical perspective', in P.J. Payton (ed.), Cornish Studies, no. 5, (1997), pp. 164-179.

Madan Sarup (1993), *An introductory Guide to Post-Structuralism and Postmodernism,* 2nd edition, Hemel Hempstead: Harvester Wheatsheaf.

Ferdinand de Saussure (1967 [1915]), *Cours de Linguistique Générale,* Paris: Payot.

William Scawen (c.1680), 'Observations on an Ancient Manuscript entitled Passio Christi'. This M.S. is currently being restored, digitalized and recatalogued for Cornwall Records Office.

Simon Schama (2004), *Landscape and Memory,* London: Harper

Perennial.

Ernst F. Schumacher (1974), *Small is Beautiful - A Study of Economics as if People Mattered*, London: Abacus and Sphere Books.

Sharon Schwartz, 'Bridging the Great Divide; Cornish Labour Migration to America and the Evolution of Transnational Identity', *Journal of the Cornish History Network*, (2001).

Clive Seale (ed.) (2004), *Researching Society and Culture*, 2nd Edition, London: Sage.

Mark Sebba (2010), 'Discourses in transit', in *Semiotic Landscapes: Language, Image, Space*, London: Continuum.

Mark Sebba (2010). 'Book review: "Linguistic Landscapes: A Comparative Study of Urban Multilingualism in Tokyo", by Peter Backhaus', in *Writing Systems Research,* vol, 2 (1), pp. 73–76.

A. Schutz (1964), Collected Papers, vol. 2, The Hague: Martinus Nijoff, cited in C. Seale 2004, op. cit.

Gareth Shaw and Allan Williams, 'Tourism and employment: reflections on a pilot study of Looe, Cornwall', (Department of Geography, University of Exeter) in *Area*, vol. 20 (1), (1988), pp. 23-24.

Gareth Shaw and Allan M. Williams (2004), *Tourism and Tourism Spaces*, London: Sage.

Mary Shaw, Daniel Dorling, David Gordon, George Davey Smith (1999), *The Widening Gap: Health inequalities and policy in Britain*, Bristol: Policy Press, University of Bristol.

Morag Shiach (1991), *Hélène Cixous: A Politics of Writing*, London: Routledge.

Elana Shohamy and Durk Gorter (eds.) (2009), *Linguistic Landscapes: Expanding the Scenery,* Abingdon, Oxon. and New York: Routledge.

David Silverman (ed.) (2011), *Qualitative Research,* 3rd Edition, London: Sage.

Beverley Skeggs (1997), *Formations of Class and Gender,* London: Sage.

Anthony D. Smith (1986), *The Ethnic Origin of Nations,* Oxford: Blackwell.

Anthony D. Smith (1991), *National Identity,* Harmondsworth: Penguin Books Ltd. Anthony Smith, 'Civic and ethnic nationalism revisited: analysis and ideology', in The ASEN Bulletin, no. 12, (Winter 1996/67).

Anthony D. Smith (1997), *Nations and Nationalism in a Global Era*, Cambridge: Polity Press.

Anthony D. Smith (1998), *Nationalism and Modernism,* London: Routledge.

Gayatri Chakravorty Spivak, Donna Landry, and Gerald M. MacLean (1996), The Spivak Reader: Selected works of Gayatri Chakravorty Spivak, London: Routledge.

John Storey (ed.) (2006 [1994]), *Cultural Theory and Popular Culture: A Reader* (3rd Edition), Harlow Essex: Pearson Education Ltd.

Joan Symons in, 'White Paper for Culture', Truro: Cornwall Council, (October 2012), *Foreword.*

T.

Marcus Tanner (2006 [2004]), *The Last of the Celts,* New Haven: Yale University Press.

Louis Tay and Ed Diener (2011), 'Needs and Subjective Well-Being around the World,' *Journal of Personality and Social Psychology,* vol. 101 (2), pp. 354–365. http://www.apa.org/pubs/journals/releases/psp-101-2-354.pdf. (Accessed 16th September, 2012.)

Alys Thomas, 'Cornwall's Territorial Dilemma: European Region or 'Westcountry' Sub-region?', in Cornish Studies, vol. 2., (1994), pp. 138-150.

Charles Thomas, *The Importance of Being Cornish in Cornwall,* Redruth, Inaugural Lecture of the Institute of Cornish Studies, (1973).

Chris Thomas, 'See Your Own Country First: The Geography of a Railway Landscape, in E. Westland (ed.) (1997) (below), pp. 107-128.

Peter Thomas and Derek Williams (eds.) (2007), *Setting Cornwall on its Feet: Robert Morton Nance, 1873-1959,* London: Francis Boutle Publishers.

Bjørn Thomassen, *'The Uses and Meanings of Liminality'* in *International Political Anthropology,* no.3, (2010).

http://www.politicalanthropology.org/component/search/?searchword=liminality&ordering=&searchphrase=all (Accessed 5th May 2011.)

John B. Thompson, Preface in Pierre Bourdieu (1982, 2001), op. cit.

Paul Thornton, 'Cornwall and Changes in the 'Tourist Gaze', in P.J. Payton (ed.), *Cornish Studies,* no. 1, (1993), pp. 80-96.

Paul Thornton, 'Tourism in Cornwall; Recent Research and Current Trends,' in P.J. Payton (ed.), *Cornish Studies,* no. 2, (1994), pp. 108-127.

Paul Thornton, 'Second Homes in Cornwall', in P.J. Payton (ed.), *Cornish Studies,* no. 4, (1996), pp. 152-157.

Sarah Thornton, in Gelder and Thornton (1997), pp. 213-216.

Charlie Tims and Shelagh Wright, 'Bidding for a competition that doesn't exist! - How Cornwall imagined a Region of Culture and found a future', DEMOS Report for Cornwall Council, 2006.

Garry Tregidga, 'Celtic comparisons: Brittany and the Cornish Revivalist Movement', conference paper at, 'Les rencontres, Bretagne/Monde Anglophone, Université de Bretagne Occidentale, Quimper, 29th June 2012.

Garry Tregidga and Lucy Ellis, 'Talking Identity: Understanding Cornwall's Oral Culture Though Group Dialogue,' in P.J. Payton (ed.) *Cornish Studies*, no.12, (2004), pp.88-105.

Carol Trosset, 'Welsh Communitas as Ideological Practice', Ethos, vol. 16 (2), (June 1988), pp. 167-180. http://www.jstor.org/stable/640444 (Accessed 8th February 2011.)

Christine Truran [Crysten Fudge], (1998 [1977]), *Cornish Names for Cornish Homes,* Redruth: Dyllansow Truran.

Graham Turner (1990), *British Cultural Studies: An Introduction*, London: Unwin Hyman.

Julia Twomlow and Kevin Brownridge (2007), 'Counting on Creativity - An assessment of the impact of Objective One funding on Creative Industries enterprises in Cornwall, 2000-2006.', Newlyn: Perfect Moment.

U.

John Urry (1995), *Consuming Places*, London: Routledge.

John Urry (2002 [1990]), *The Tourist Gaze*, 2nd Edition, London: Sage.

V.

Caroline Vink, "Be Forever Cornish!' Some Observations on the Ethnoregional Movement in Contemporary Cornwall', in P.J. Payton (ed.), *Cornish Studies*, no. 1, (1993), pp. 109-119.

W.

Craig Weatherhill (1996), *Cornish Place-Names and Language*, Wilmslow, Cheshire: Sigma Leisure.

Craig Weatherhill, '"The best Cornish Form of Cornish Place-Names": Review of the Cornish Language Board's Place-Names in Cornwall', in Michael Everson (ed.) (2007), *Form and Content in Revived Cornish,* Westport, Co. Mayo: Evertype.

Craig Weatherhill, '"Studying Cornish place-names": Review of the Cornish Language Board's *Formation of Cornish Place-Names'*, in Michael Everson (ed.) (2007), *Form and Content in Revived Cornish,* Westport, Co. Mayo: Evertype.

Welsh Assembly Government, 'A Culture Strategy for Wales', Cardiff (January 2002).

Welsh Government, 'The Culture and Heritage of Wales', Welsh Government, Cardiff: 2011,

http://wales.gov.uk/docs/strategies/110929chap12en.pdf (Accessed January 2013).

Ella Westland (ed.)(1997), *Cornwall, the Cultural Construction of Place*, Penzance: Patten Press with the Institute of Cornish Studies.

Joanie Willett, 'Cornish Identity, Vague Notion or Social Fact', in P.J Payton (ed.), *Cornish Studies,* no. 16 (2008), pp. 183-205.

Joanie Willet, 'Sustainable Communities, Innovation, Social Capital and the Inland China Clay Villages', in P.J Payton and S. Trower (eds.), *Cornish Studies,* no. 17, (2009), pp. 136-156.

Joanie Willet, 'Why is Cornwall so Poor? Narrative, Perception and Identity,' unpublished Ph.D. thesis, University of Exeter (2009).

Carol Williams (1995), 'Housing in Cornwall: A two-tier system?', P.J Payton (ed.), *Cornish Studies*, no. 3, (1995), pp. 194-205.

David Williams, 'Rugby ew gon gwari nei', *An Garrak* (2010), Redruth: Cussel an Tavaz.

Gwyn A. Williams (1985), *When was Wales?: A History of the Welsh*, Harmondsworth: Pelican Books Ltd.

Malcolm Williams (1993), 'Housing the Cornish', in P.J. Payton (ed.) (1993), *Cornwall Since the War*, op. cit.

Malcolm Williams (2002), 'The New Cornish Social Science', in P.J. Payton (ed.), *Cornish Studies,* no. 10, pp. 44-66.

Malcolm Williams and Eric Harrison (1995), 'Movers and Stayers: A comparison of migratory and non-migratory groups in Cornwall, 1981-91', P.J. Payton (ed.), *Cornish Studies*, no.3, (1995), pp 176-193.

Malcolm Williams, Peter Mitchell and Lyn Bryant (1995), 'Movers and Stayers: Population and Social Change in Cornwall, 1971-1991', University of Plymouth.

Malcolm Williams and Tony Champion, *'Cornwall, Poverty and In-Migration'*, P.J. Payton (ed.), *Cornish Studies*, no. in P, Payton (ed.), *Cornish Studies*, no. 6, (1998), pp. 118-126.

Malcolm Williams, 'Why is Cornwall So Poor?, Poverty and In-Migration Since the 1960's', *Contemporary British History*, no. 17, (2003), pp. 55-70.

Nicholas Williams (1995), *Cornish Today: An Examination of the Revived Language*, Sutton Coldfiled: Kernewek dre Lyther.

Nicholas Williams (2006), *Cornish Today: An Examination of the Revived Language*, Third Edition, Westport, Co. Mayo: Evertype.

Raymond Williams (1988), *Keywords - A Vocabulary of Culture and Society*, London: Fontana.

Raymond Williams, 'The Analysis of Culture' in J. Storey (ed.) (2006), op. cit. pp.48-56.

Peter Wills (1992), *Water, Water Everywhere*, Camborne: CoSERG.

Peter Wills, Unpublished analysis of Cornwall Rural Community Council's Parish Housing Surveys, CoSERG. (Late 1990s).

Harry Woodhouse (1994), *Cornish Bagpipes, Fact or Fiction?*, Redruth: Dyllansow Truran.

Jessica Wright, 'Dancing Around Cornish Identity', B.A. (hons) Dissertation, University College Falmouth [n.d.].

Mary Wright (1979, 2008), *Cornish Guernsey's and Knit-frocks*, Polperro: Polperro Heritage Press.

Derek Wynne (1998), *Leisure, Lifestyle and the New Middle Class*, London: Routledge.

Yu Wujin, 'Thing, Value, Time, and Freedom: A Consideration of Some key Concepts in Marx's Philosophical System', translated by Jie Tang in *Frontiers of Philosophy in China*, Vol.1 (1), (Jan., 2006), pp. 114-123, Springer. http://www.jstor.org/stable/30209956 (Accessed 22nd July 2010.)

Y.

Bernard Yack, 'The myth of the civic nation', in Ronald Beiner (ed.) (1999), *Theorizing Nationalism*, New York: State University of New York, pp. 103-118.

Frequently accessed websites:

Awen Productions: http://www.awen.org.uk/

Bewnans Kernow: http://www.bewnanskernow.org.uk/

Offis ar Brezhoneg (Breton Language Office): http://www.ofis-bzh.org

Business Cornwall: http://www.businesscornwall.co.uk

The Celtic Link: http://www.thecelticlink.com/help/text/aboutus.aspx

Cornish Assembly: http://www.cornishassembly.org

Cornish Dance Society http://www.cornishdance.com

Cornish Folk Arts Project: http://www.an-daras.com/

Cornish Gorsedd - Gorsedh Kernow: http://www.gorsethkernow.org.uk

Cornish Language Partnership, MAGA: http://www.magakernow.org.uk

Cornish Oafs: http://www.facebook.com/CornishOafs?ref=stream

Cornish Social and Economic Research Group, CoSERG: http://www.cornwallcoserg.org.uk/

Cornwall Brand: http://www.cornwallbrand.co.uk/

Cornwall Council: http://www.cornwall.gov.uk/

Invest in Cornwall: http://www.investincornwall.com

It's Our Cornwall: http://www.facebook.com/pages/Its-Our-Cornwall

Keep Cornwall Whole: http://keepcornwallwhole.org/?p=393

Office of National Statistics: http://www.ons.gov.uk/ons/index.html and http://www.statistics.gov.uk/hub/index.html

Produit en Bretagne: http://www.produitenbretagne.com

This is Cornwall: http://www.thisiscornwall.co.uk

Visit Cornwall: http://www.visitcornwall.com

Welsh Government: http://wales.gov.uk