Singing to be Normal: Tracing the Behavioural Influence of Music in Conflict Transformation

Submitted by Craig Robertson to the University of Exeter as a thesis for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy in Sociology, May 2013.

This thesis is available for Library use on the understanding that it is copyright material and that no quotation from the thesis may be published without proper acknowledgement.

I certify that all material in this thesis which is not my own work has been identified and that no material has previously been submitted and approved for the award of a degree by this or any other University.
Abstract

Music is often heralded as a means of bringing people together or celebrating diversity and therefore it is also often assumed that music can be a beneficial tool in conflict transformation settings. Despite this widespread belief there is little empirical evidence to support this notion. Indeed, there is more evidence that suggests the opposite; music can increase solidarity within one group but that very process strengthens the borders between what is accepted as in-group or out-group. It is this strengthening of identity borders that can lead to outright conflict if certain other social conditions prevail. One question remains, why is the belief in the power of music so widespread when there is evidence that demonstrates potential negative outcomes? In order to address that question, it is useful to observe that music continues to be used in community projects and within NGOs as a means to bond groups in social conflict despite the lack evidence to support their actions. The belief in the positive power of music has influenced behaviour so that musical activity is included in peace work. Indeed, belief can be seen as a prime motivator of behaviour in most sectors of the world, much more so than hard evidence. This thesis is an exploration of the social processes that occur in musical experiences that affect memory, identity and emotions and how they affect understanding and belief which in turn affects group behaviour. The research is inter-disciplinary, drawing on music sociology, social movements, cultural studies, ethno-musicology and conflict theory, and data was collected using qualitative methods (ethnographic interviewing, action research, observation/participation, grounded theory). The fieldwork was conducted with an inter-religious choir in Sarajevo, Bosnia-Herzegovina, and a comparative study conducted with a world-music community choir in London, UK.
# Table of Contents

## Contents

Singing to be Normal: Tracing the Behavioural Influence of Music in Conflict Transformation ........................................................................................................ 1

Abstract .................................................................................................................. 2

Table of Contents .................................................................................................. 3

List of Tables .......................................................................................................... 7

Acknowledgements ................................................................................................. 8

1. Introduction ........................................................................................................ 9

   1.1 Background ................................................................................................... 11

   1.2 Summary ..................................................................................................... 15

2. Literature Review ............................................................................................. 16

   2.1 Interdisciplinary .......................................................................................... 16

   2.1.1 Why is the standard literature review process not fit for purpose in this instance? .................................................................................................................. 16

   2.2 Precedents .................................................................................................. 17

2.3 Current Literature on Music and Conflict Transformation ............................. 22

   2.3.1 Music in Conflict .................................................................................... 23

   2.3.2 Music for Peace ...................................................................................... 30

   2.3.3 Music as Representation ......................................................................... 33

   2.3.4 Music as a Magic Bullet .......................................................................... 38

   2.3.5 Music for Identity Formation .................................................................. 40

   2.3.6 What is wrong with this model? What is conflict transformation attempting to achieve and how can music be involved? ........................................... 42

2.4 Social Change and Conflict Transformation .................................................... 45

   2.4.1 Conflict theory ....................................................................................... 45

   2.4.2 Conflict Transformation Approaches ....................................................... 50
2.4.3 Turning Points.............................................................................................................. 53
2.5. How Belief Affects Behaviour...................................................................................... 56
2.6. How Emotions, Memories and Identity-Work Affects Belief .................................. 61
    2.6.1 Emotions and Belief ................................................................................................. 62
    2.6.3 Memories and Belief ............................................................................................... 63
    2.6.4 Identity and Belief .................................................................................................. 64
2.7. How Musical Meaning Relates to Emotions, Memories and Identity ...... 65
    2.7.1 Music and Emotion .................................................................................................. 65
    2.7.2 Music and Memory .................................................................................................. 68
    2.7.3 Music and Identity .................................................................................................. 70
2.8. Summary and Conclusion ............................................................................................ 78
3. Methods.......................................................................................................................... 81
    3.1 Background.................................................................................................................. 81
    3.2 Aims and Methods ....................................................................................................... 88
    3.3 Summary of Fieldwork and Methods Used ................................................................. 91
       3.3.1 Pontanima............................................................................................................... 98
       3.3.2 Songlines ............................................................................................................... 105
       3.3.3 Benefits of using 2 sites ....................................................................................... 108
    3.4 Methods ........................................................................................................................ 108
       3.4.1 Methods for Pontanima ....................................................................................... 110
       3.4.2 Methods for Songlines ....................................................................................... 114
    3.5 Reflexivity, Musical Ethnography and the Primacy of Linguistic Symbolism .......... 118
    3.6 Fieldwork.................................................................................................................... 121
    3.7 Additional Research .................................................................................................... 123
    3.8 Data Analysis .............................................................................................................. 124
    3.9 Critical Reflection ....................................................................................................... 126
3.10 Summary .............................................................................................................. 129

4. Introduction to Research Sites ...................................................................................... 130

4.1 Songlines ....................................................................................................................... 130

4.1.1 London and UK Context ................................................................................................ 132

4.2 Pontanima ...................................................................................................................... 142

4.2.1 Bosnian Context ......................................................................................................... 148

4.2.2 Bosnian Conflict ......................................................................................................... 148

4.2.3 Nationalism, Yugoslavia and the Bosnian War ............................................................. 154

4.2.4 Pontanima’s ‘Mission’ ................................................................................................. 158

5. Findings .............................................................................................................................. 162

5.1 Introduction ................................................................................................................... 162

5.2 Music in Context .............................................................................................................. 163

5.2.1 Music as a contextual normalisation tool .................................................................. 163

5.2.2 Music as a reflexive memory management tool ........................................................ 182

5.2.4 Music as a belief construction tool .............................................................................. 189

5.3. Music as a procedural metaphor .................................................................................. 194

5.3.1 Musical processes as a metaphor for conflict transformation processes .................. 194

5.3.2 Reflexive relationships between music, belief, identity, emotion, memory and behaviour ......................................................................................................................... 203

5.4 Music as tacit cultural knowledge .................................................................................. 211

5.5 Summary ......................................................................................................................... 218

6. Analysis ............................................................................................................................... 220

6.1 Introduction .................................................................................................................... 220

6.2 Music as Conflict Transformation .................................................................................. 220

6.3 Music as Ethnography/Tacit Culture .............................................................................. 235

6.4 Linking the Everyday to the Extra-Ordinary ................................................................. 239
1.5 Inter-Group Theory, Music and Everyday Life and the Reflexive Model 243
1.6 Summary ........................................................................................................................................245

7. Conclusion ........................................................................................................................................248
7.1 Point 1 - Musicking affects belief through interaction with memory, emotions and identity which in turn affects behaviour at the personal and social levels..........................................................................................................................250
7.2 Point 2 – Musicking is not an inherently positive activity .................................................................252
7.3 Point 3 – How musicking interacts with memory, emotions and identity is context dependent ..........................................................................................................................................................252
7.4 Point 4 – Music and musicking are both forms of ethnographic data .... 254
7.5 Future Research ..................................................................................................................................255
7.6 Final Thoughts ....................................................................................................................................255

8. Appendices ...........................................................................................................................................257
8.1 Appendix A – Pontanima Information Sheet and Consent Form (English) .................................................257
8.2 Appendix B - Pontanima Information Sheet and Consent Form (Serbo-Croat) .....................................................259
8.3 Appendix C: Songlines Information Sheet and Questionnaire .......... 261
8.4 Appendix D: Proposal for consideration by HuSS Ethics Committee .... 263
8.5 Appendix E: Alliance Changes in Bosnian Region ..................................................................................272
8.6 Appendix F: Border Changes in Bosnian Region ....................................................................................275
8.7 Appendix G: Mass Population Changes in Bosnian Region ...... 283

9. Bibliography ...........................................................................................................................................286
### List of Tables

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table 1</th>
<th>Diplomatic Tracks</th>
<th>Pp.50-51</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Table 2</td>
<td>Music and Conflict Project Comparison</td>
<td>Pp.78-79</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 3</td>
<td>Pontanima and Songlines Characteristic Comparison</td>
<td>Pp.83-85</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 4</td>
<td>New Research Criteria Comparison</td>
<td>Pp.87-88</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 5</td>
<td>Pontanima Interviewee Matrix</td>
<td>P.91-95</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 6</td>
<td>Songlines Interviewee Matrix</td>
<td>Pp.98-99</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 7</td>
<td>British Choir Survey</td>
<td>Pp.127-130</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 8</td>
<td>Pontanima members’ identity, gender and age</td>
<td>P.137</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 9</td>
<td>Pontanima Informant Careers</td>
<td>P.138</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 10</td>
<td>Alliance Changes in Bosnian Region</td>
<td>Pp.259-261</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 11</td>
<td>Border Changes in Bosnian Region</td>
<td>Pp.262-269</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 12</td>
<td>Mass Population Changes in Bosnian Region</td>
<td>Pp.270-272</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Acknowledgements

I would first like to thank Tia DeNora for accepting me into the SocArts family, being an inspiration for understanding music in society and also for allowing me to carve my own path through the academic jungle. Thanks must go to Arild Bergh who was the first one to empirically tackle the issue of music and conflict transformation. I would also like to thank the rest of the SocArts family (Trever Hagen, Mariko Hara, Pinar Güran, Sigrún Einarsdóttir, Simon Procter, Sophia Acord, Ian Sutherland, Rita Gracio Alberto and Pedro dos Santos Boia) for camaraderie, inspiration, practical help and friendship. Thanks must also go to my family for their patience and support over the past few years.
1. Introduction

What is the purpose of musical activity in society? In the modern capitalist age it can seem that music is produced and consumed on a global scale for the purposes of entertainment or emotional regulation. Indeed, music has been shown to have positive applications for individual psychology through the process of entrainment which can improve personal health and socialisation (Clayton, Sager and Will 2004 for example). There is a commonly held belief that music has a much greater power to influence collective behaviour through shared emotions and memories but current research is less clear about how this process occurs, if at all. The question remains, can music play a role in positively affecting collective behaviour in a manner that is separate from the commodification processes involved in the global music industry? This thesis addresses this question through an empirical study of Pontanima, an inter-religious choir in Sarajevo, and a collaborative engagement with Songlines, a London-based world music choir.

The question of music's influence on behaviour apart from the music industry first sprang to mind when I was a secondary school music teacher a few years ago, feeling frustrated at the then UK governmental focus on the teaching of music as an industry rather than an art\(^1\). I felt from an early age that musical experience was not about money but rather about connecting the personal with the social and the physical with mental. This attitude may go some way to explain why I am not a full-time professional musician (musicians are generally not hired based on their desire to connect) but it does explain why I chose to teach: I wanted to help enable children, especially children in the deprived inner city areas of London, to have the opportunity to have these musical tools to connect to each other and others around the world through musical activities. The cost/benefit analysis that fuelled governmental objectives that encouraged

\(^1\) Matters have worsened for public music education in the UK over the course of the writing of this thesis with the government of 2013 attempting to remove music from the national curriculum altogether.

the teaching of music for industrial purposes was at odds with my own personal feelings and experiences on the subject.

It was during this time that I discovered the West-Eastern Divan Orchestra, the Daniel Barenboim and Edward Said project that purported to bring together young Israeli and Palestinian orchestral musicians in order to perform Beethoven's music in Germany and further afield. At the time (2004) there was plenty of writing about the orchestra in the popular press that praised Barenboim and Said's efforts at developing a musical conflict transformation project but there was very little in the way of academic research into just what the project had achieved in terms of conflict reduction. This led to my masters thesis at Goldsmiths College, University of London during which time I began to develop a theory that indicated that creative collaborative music-making should be able to play a role in conflict transformation through the creation of new shared cultural identities. This was based on an analysis and fusion of cultural theory (Levy 2004), social geography (Forman 2004; Mitchell 1996), anthropology (Bowman 2001; Clastres 1994; Kloos 2001; Schmidt and Schroder 2001), musicology (Connell and Gibson 2003; Merriam 1964; Small 1998), music therapy (Forrest 2000), and conflict resolution studies (Bercovitch 1984; Burgess 2003; Fisher 2001; Paksoy 2001; Quigley 2002; Ting-Toomey 1999) as well as the rare writing on music and conflict at the time (Skyllstad 2004). In addition to exploring the West-Eastern Divan Orchestra as a music and conflict transformation project, I also examined the evolution of hip hop as a more organic example of how music has been claimed to reduce social conflict.

The West-Eastern Divan Orchestra was found to have had no lasting effect on conflict transformation for either the participants or the audiences despite being lauded in the media for doing so. The experience did seem to illustrate to the participants how different relationships other than those of conflict were possible but the relationships were not equal as Barenboim had suggested. In fact, it showed a rather dictatorial musical relationship that might not have been attractive to the participants. The participants claimed to have felt a connection during the events themselves, but this dissipated after they were over. The audiences were not those in conflict so the performances had no chance to alter
any perceptions of the communities that were actually in conflict. The orchestra was not permitted to perform in Israel which illustrates that a desire to become involved in conflict transformation is critical to any chance of success.

I’ve called Hip Hop a 'project' but it is in fact a social movement encompassing music, poetry, dance and art. Many commentators over the years have, similarly, claimed that this movement was largely successful in reducing conflict between gangs in New York. Gang violence continues and, furthermore, some hip hop has taken violence as its message across the disenfranchised urban youth diaspora. Hip Hop did succeed in developing a new shared sense of cultural identity in New York and this had been spread across the world and has been reinforced through performances and the spread of recorded music.

Despite the lack of any existent music and conflict transformation project that had actually succeeded in measurably reducing conflict the belief that music can and does operate in this manner continues unabated, from famous musicians like Daniel Barenboim (2006) and academics such as Edward Said (Barenboim and Said 2004) to peace researchers like Paul Lederach (2005). This in turn led to further questions: why do people believe in the power of music so strongly when evidence suggests that music is no better in this context than any other joint social endeavour? And why do my own musical experiences and those of fellow musicians seem to be at odds with this evidence? Can music actually play a role in positive conflict transformation or are any such attempts destined to fail?

The purpose of this chapter is to explain the background to this research project exploring the related fields that have shown an interest in the topic of music and conflict transformation. There are many common threads throughout these fields in as much as they share common themes but also common problems which form the basis of my enquiry.

1.1 Background

Despite the lack of empirical evidence, there are remarkable structural similarities between successful conflict transformation processes and musical processes. There are likewise similarities between the social derivation of
musical meaning and conflict transformation processes. In other words, there still seemed to be a possible connection between music and conflict transformation that was as yet untapped in practice but still managed to resonate with many people in the form of their beliefs and it is possible empirically to collate beliefs in this regard. Is belief somehow the key to the power of music, or the power of anything that ultimately influences behaviour for positive or negative purposes? The question for this thesis to address, therefore, is not only can music play a positive role in conflict transformation but how does music affect beliefs and behaviour in general and, ultimately, how can that assist in positive conflict transformation scenarios? If music can be seen as a redemptive approach to conflict transformation where the belief in the power of music inputs into music's actual powers in situations of use, the influence of belief in practice needs to be traced.

The connection between music and social movements is well-established within sociology and culture studies but these traditions tend to focus on the social scenes surrounding the music or the lyrical content of the songs rather than the music itself. There is a growing body of work on music and conflict and torture and a nascent field of music and conflict transformation is slowly emerging. In the case of music and conflict the work in sociology again focuses on the social scenes surrounding the music and psychologists have been attempting to track specific sounds to specific psychological responses. Music and conflict transformation has been emerging from social activism, conflict theory, ethnomusicology and sociology but there has yet to emerge a coherent theory of what happens when music is engaged with for the purposes of conflict transformation or fit for purpose toolkit for investigating this phenomenon. Each influencing field has a large body of literature to support their theories, methods, practices and modes of understanding and, as will be explored in the literature review in this thesis, there are remarkable overlaps between them. One target of this thesis is to demonstrate the links between these fields based on solid theory and practice but also verified and progressed through grounded empirical research.
Music and conflict transformation as a nascent field has been thus far dominated by practitioners, musicians and activists, on the one hand, and philosophers and academics with a love of music and a desire for peace on the other. The common problem with all of these approaches is that at no point has there been any discussion about the processes involved, or what is special about music, or how music actually works in conflict contexts. The most outwardly critical voice in the field, sociologist Arild Bergh, has illustrated how in many cases music and conflict transformation projects have failed to produce any discernible positive change and he blames this outcome on the common belief in the magical power of music. Interestingly, many of these projects not only attempt to deal with external conflict, but they contain within themselves a level of conflict. Even within the field sites for this thesis there was considerable internal conflict. Within Pontanima there was a tension between those that wished to pursue an active and explicit peace agenda with their music and those who wished to pursue a purely musical path. This tension has at times led to long-standing members quitting the group and the musical director becoming hospitalised due to stress. The conflict within Songlines was not as severe, but the tensions between its musical director and some members of the choir has likewise led to ill-feeling and some resignations. What Bergh does not explore is why this belief is common, especially across such disparate fields and in the face of contradictory evidence. If there is little evidence to support the idea that music can positively transform conflict in a given particular setting yet the belief that it can continues to be rife, then it is sensible to zoom out from the specific and examine the universal: what are the commonalities within these fields in relation to conflict transformation?

Bergh has helpfully shed some light on how many music and conflict transformation projects have failed by creating a useful taxonomy of approaches in the field. Inevitably in such a young field we cover many of the same points of interest and resources and it is interesting to note how much in agreement we are regarding specific contexts yet somehow draw very different conclusions. The reason here is a question of scale: Bergh has looked at specific sites and sought to explain their failure at producing measurable social change and ultimately blames subjective beliefs in the power of music as the
reason for these failures. He further blames the musicians themselves for assuming the embodied experiences they felt during these projects were universally applied to the subjects of the project. My approach has been to take a step back at this stage and explore these beliefs about music, why they exist, how they develop and how they influence behaviour. Furthermore, as a musician who has felt connections with others during musical experience, I wanted to explore how this type of personal experience relates to a wider social experience and how it informs belief systems.

The purpose of this thesis, therefore, is to explore how beliefs are constructed in music and conflict transformation settings from musicological, sociological and conflict theory perspectives and how these beliefs inform behaviour of not only the subjects of study but of the researchers and practitioners themselves. I posit that this belief construction process operates in a similar manner to musical processes themselves as they interact with memory, personal and cultural identities and emotions and that music as an experiential process is well-suited for such belief construction. When examined from this perspective, it is not surprising that belief in the power of music proliferates despite a lack of supporting evidence. This lack of supporting evidence is a problem, especially if the field is to have any practical applications, but I further posit that this is due to a lack of understanding of the processes involved and that music is often considered by those involved as an abstract object rather than an ever-evolving meaning/belief construction procedure.

In the literature review I have drawn together elements of the three parent fields to develop a theoretical framework that I suggest should underpin the field of music and conflict transformation. This is supported both by theoretical developments in sociology, musicology and conflict transformation but also by the empirical research conducted by others. Once this was established, I conducted my own empirical research in music and conflict transformation settings in order to challenge and further develop these theories.

This thesis explores music’s relationship with social change and whether or not this relationship can be actively utilised in conflict transformation settings. In order to do this I have consolidated the current literature on music and conflict
transformation, explored its strengths and weaknesses, and drawn on the literature from its parent fields of musicology, sociology and conflict theory. With the resultant theoretical framework I conducted research in two contrasting research sites in order to further develop the theory, the field and the tools necessary to inch closer to answering the ultimate question of whether or not music can play a role in positive conflict transformation scenarios.

The structure of this thesis is arranged beginning with a quick survey of the music and conflict transformation field itself followed by an exploration of the various fields that feed into music and conflict transformation. I do not exhaustively cover the latter since this has already recently been completed very well by Bergh as already mentioned. Once the common themes and gaps in the literature have been identified they have been assembled into a theoretical framework to use as a basis for empirical research. In the Introduction to Research Sites chapter, I explain in detail how the research sites were chosen based on the theoretical framework, what projects were existent at the time of the research and how accessible the research sites were. This is followed by a demonstration of the themes that emerged from the fieldwork and how they related to the literature in the Findings chapter. In the Analysis chapter I further explore which aspects of the musical experiences in the findings are everyday or extraordinary in order to determine the form of musical process that is most effective at positive social change. I also analyse the findings further using the original theoretical framework as improved by the empirical findings. Finally, I conclude with the theoretical role music can play in conflict transformation supported by both evidence and literature; the basis on which the field of music and conflict transformation can be further built, and the suggestion that musical experience itself can and should be considered as data in sociological enquiry.

1.2 Summary

In order to determine how music can play a role, positive or otherwise, in conflict transformation settings, it is necessary to investigate how meaning is attached to musical experiences. It is for this reason that the mode of enquiry into the problem of music and conflict transformation is sociological in nature as
other modes of enquiry would not be able to unpack the socially-derived meaning-making processes. Once the social processes in musical meaning have been identified the interaction with the musical material itself can be engaged with, which brings in the ethno-musicological mode of enquiry. Once an understanding of the social context and musical material has been established, then a process of matching to conflict transformation procedures can be conducted for suitability. This was the approach taken in order to discover appropriate research sites, as will be further explained in the Introduction to Research Sites chapter.

Looking at this line of thought, the goal of this thesis is to answer the following four questions:

- Is it possible for musical activities to help positively affect conflict transformation scenarios and if so, how?
- How does musical experience affect personal and social beliefs about this experience and other aspects of life and how does this frame the idea of the power of music?
- What are the commonalities between music sociology, ethnomusicology and conflict transformation?
- Is there a mandate for the establishment of music and conflict transformation as a separate field in its own right and, if so, upon what basis could it be built?

2. Literature Review

2.1 Interdisciplinary

2.1.1 Why is the standard literature review process not fit for purpose in this instance?

There is as yet no one established field of inquiry especially suited to answering the question of whether or not music can play a positive role in conflict transformation. The sociology of music, for example, examines meanings and behaviours that result from music but not the musical material itself. Conversely musicology and ethnomusicology are primarily concerned with the musical material itself rather than the behaviours associated with it. Conflict and peace studies are beginning to discuss alternative cultural paths to peacebuilding and
reconciliation (Lederach 1995, 2005; Francis 2004; Gelleman 2007), but this is largely based on intuition rather than empirical evidence. Nevertheless, there are numerous clues in all of these fields that point towards a particular manner in which music can operate in this context, even if it is not mentioned explicitly. It is through this investigative work involving several fields that the new field of music and conflict transformation is emerging.

While the norm for a literature review is to illustrate where the gaps in the current literature in a particular field are, this has proved problematic in this instance. Music and conflict transformation is not as yet a recognised field so in order to make sense of it literature from many fields has had to be examined (musicology, sociology, anthropology, social geography, social psychology, culture studies and semiotics). Even having narrowed the fields down to music sociology and conflict transformation the process is still problematic since this current work is not so much attempting to find a gap in the current literature but to synthesise relevant and related material between two apparently unrelated fields. The gap, therefore, is not within any one field, but between fields. It is due to this expansive approach that this literature review chapter is longer than most. Music and conflict transformation has the potential to become a field in its own right through this combination and synthesis of literature and that is the academic gap that this chapter is attempting to address. This synthesis of concepts between sociology and conflict transformation is the original contribution that this thesis offers to both fields as well as developing the conceptual toolkit for the establishment of music and conflict transformation as a field in its own right. What follows is a survey of the nascent field categorised into dominant themes. I believe that this will illustrate the main problem that there is not one theme that can ultimately address the question of how music can play a role in positive conflict transformation, but that a reordering of concepts based on commonalities between the influencing fields can shed some light on the processes involved.

2.2 Precedents

The precedent for music as a force for conflict transformation was set by Theodor Adorno when he contemplated a peaceful utopia where people would
exist with a sense of distinctness without domination and that art in general and
music in particular offered a state of autonomous distinctness with interactive
non-domination (Adorno in O’Connor 2000, p.140). Music philosopher Leonard
Meyer had already hinted at the possibility of music as a problem-solving
medium, and suggested that music and conflict management were essentially
one and the same, with the proviso that aesthetic structural problems are
intelligible and resolvable (Meyer 1956, p.88). Adorno’s concepts of
autonomous art and modernist European art music proved to be too narrow to
be of much practical use (DeNora 2003) yet he has continued to be influential in
new musicology and the sociology of music.

Edward Said is known for his involvement with the West-Eastern Divan
Orchestra project with Daniel Barenboim, which was originally purported to be
an attempt at reconciliation between Israeli and Palestinian musicians. Said’s
comments around this project were uncharacteristically romantic in nature, and
did not go into grounded or even philosophical detail about how such a project
was going to work or be very useful in the context of the middle east conflict.
Said does however, borrow Adorno’s concept of negative dialectics and apply it
to the Palestinian situation and the Oslo Accord in such a way to suggest that
musical thought has a directly useful application in a conflict situation (Bayoumi
2005, pp.59, 61). In other words, if Adorno’s work is wilfully aesthetic and
difficult in order to reflect the incongruities of the modern era from which it
emerged, then the borrowing of Adorno’s concepts is akin to quoting in the
aesthetic sense.

There are numerous examples of music projects throughout the world that claim
to address cultural conflicts or social injustices, including such intentionally
derived projects as the West-Eastern Divan Orchestra and El Sistema as well
as organically developed social and artistic movements such as hip hop culture.
Reports from participants and the media tend to very positive although evidence
is largely anecdotal (Barenboim and Said 2004; Bergh 2010) and these
assumptions are increasingly being challenged (Bergh 2010; Beckles-Willson
2009; Robertson 2006; Riiser 2010). In this chapter I will argue that this
illustrates how music has the power to affect our beliefs about our world,
including a belief about the power of music. Indeed, Nick Prior has noted how for Bourdieu artistic fields in general were themselves a “universe of belief” (2011, p.124). If it can be said that our beliefs dictate or at least influence, our behaviour, then music can indeed have a positive role to play in conflict transformation. There is a darker side, however, as music has often been used for negative purposes (Kent 2008; Hogg 2005; Pettan 1998; Jovanović 2005). This chapter suggests that musical material is amoral yet has potential social impact through connections to memory, emotion, identity and belief. Finally, an understanding of the process of meaning production, rather than purely the musical material itself, is key for any practical application to be made in conflict transformation settings.

The relative lack of explicit empirical academic literature on this topic illustrates that there exists a widespread form of tacit collective belief in the power of music, or what Prior describes as “a universe of collective belief – a magic belief” (2011, p.124). The literature that is extant shows that musicking in the field of conflict transformation has had very little long-term effect on the conflicts themselves or, in some cases; the musical aspects had been hijacked for political purposes in a less than helpful manner (Bergh 2010). Yet practitioners, musicians and audiences continue to believe that music has the power to positively influence these situations.

Perhaps the most widely known publication in the field is the highly publicised tome bearing the title of the subject itself, Music and Conflict Transformation, edited by Olivier Urbain, that contains a collection of essays from peace researchers, academics, conflict transformation practitioners, music therapists and musicians who have had some active connection to both music and conflict transformation (Urbain 2008). Unfortunately, most of the essays contained within are anecdotal and ungrounded. Nevertheless, Urbain and his sponsors at the Toda Institute were the first to attempt to compile literature on music and conflict transformation. They have since followed this book with Music and Solidarity (Urbain and Laurence 2011) which was much more practical in its approach and has attempted to engage more theoretically and empirically than the previous book. They have also included many perspectives from around the
world and are more sociologically focused, building on the legacy of Christopher Small’s musicking concept (Small 1998). Continuing on this theme is a yet to be published third book in the series, Music, Liberty and Power which should further develop the concept of music and conflict transformation framed in robust sociological thinking.

Another supporter of the idea of arts and conflict transformation is Craig Zelizer, the founder and director of the Peace and Collaborative Development Network and associate director of the MA in Conflict Resolution at Georgetown University. Zelizer spent over a year in Bosnia-Herzegovina during 2000-2001 documenting artistic activities within the civil society arena that he purported to have made some headway towards peace and reconciliation between the sides that had been involved in the worst European conflict since World War II (Zelizer 2003). What Zelizer discovered was a plethora of civil society and NGO projects that were using the arts in order to transcend cultural barriers and painful memories. Most of what he observed he claimed to be not only positive but also a provided a potential way forward for peace studies in general. Upon closer examination of his findings, however, it appears that most of the observed activities were aesthetic expressions of in-group identity, at the exclusion of the out-group. Arts and music as a representation of a cultural identity is potentially harmful, as will be discussed later, but nevertheless Zelizer was one of the first researchers to robustly document this phenomenon of arts and conflict transformation activities.

Ethnomusicology has been very influential on the thinking found within music and conflict transformation, although there has been little in the way of direct engagement with conflict transformation within ethnomusicology itself. One exception was the book, Music in Conflict (O’Connell and Castelo-Branco 2010), which collected the first attempts within ethnomusicology to address these connections between music and conflict observed around the world. Despite the book’s title, many of the chapters primarily examine the peaceful roles and potential of music, from Sugarman’s look at the role of songs and the internet as a peaceful means in Kosovo to Cooper’s examination of how traditional music in Northern Ireland has crossed sectarian divides. This is an
important step for two reasons: musicology and ethnomusicology still tend to focus on the material aspects of music, even as they have since begun to incorporate the multitude of possible meanings following the emergence of the New Musicology in the 1980s. This book has many aspects that focus on the social actions and meaning of musical actions rather than the specificity of notation, recordings or particular performances. Secondly, it unpacks perhaps for the first time just what is happening in the music itself when music and conflict situations occur. In ethnomusicology music is data whereas sociology is ill-equipped to utilise music as data. Even sociologists who are themselves musicians, such as Howard Becker, have not gone as far as to say that the music itself is sociological data.

There is a small handful of unpublished PhD theses in music sociology that conclude that while music still appears to have potential in the field of conflict transformation, there is scant empirical evidence to suggest that any such project has been very successful (Bergh 2010, Robertson 2013). While this seems to be an isolated pocket of social researchers, there is increasing references to this work, including Micah Hendler’s work with music and reconciliation at Yale University (Hendler 2012) and a recent research project conducted by the Post Conflict Reconstruction and Development Unit at York University and the British Council investigating the role of the arts in the Arab Spring events (Barakat, Elias, Gandolfo and Robertson 2013). In all of these examples it is the qualitative methodologies of ethnography and grounded research that have been the most successful in unearthing empirical data.

This examination of such disparate fields has revealed a startling procedural similarity between the definitions of musical meaning, conflict transformation and ethnography. Meaning in music has a dynamic reflexive relationship with perceptions of identity, memory, emotion, belief and ultimately behaviour (DeNora 2000, 2003; Bergh 2010; Adams 2008; Connell and Gibson 2003; Frith 1996, 2002, 2008; Kong 1995; Negus and Velazquez 2002; Vinader 2008; Huda 2007; DiMaggio 1997; Sloboda and O’Neil 2001; Greasley and Lamont 2006; Meyers and Zandberg 2002; Pavlicević and Ansdel 2004). Successful conflict transformation requires the participants to understand the relationships
between the identities, memories, emotions, beliefs and behaviours of the ‘other’ (Goodhand and Hulme 1999; Fetherston 2000, Fisher 1990; Galtung 2008; Lederach 2005; Schein 1996; Ramsbotham 2010). The purpose of ethnography is to attempt to understand a social group as they understand themselves in terms of identities, memories, emotions, beliefs and behaviours. (Araújo 2006; Hammersely and Atkinson 2007; Finnegan 2003). This illustrates that there are connections to be made not only between music and conflict transformation but with agency in the sociological sense. But what form do these connections take? Are they observable, predictable, tangible? Finally, how can a synthesis of these fields help us to apply music positively in a conflict transformation setting as well as understand why is music used for overtly negative purposes?

2.3 Current Literature on Music and Conflict Transformation

Literature on music and conflict transformation specifically is scarce, but there are certain similarities between the literature on the social change aspects of music and conflict transformation itself. In order to be successful both fields claim to require co-operation, an empathetic approach and an understanding of the other, and both deal with concepts of identity, memory, emotion, belief and behaviour. It is important to point out that there is much more research available on the negative uses of music, such as for torture, control and spreading hate. In this section I will first summarise some current approaches to music and conflict and music and conflict transformation followed by a re-ordering of concepts and linking to arts sociology, social psychology and conflict theory in order to better understand how music theoretically works in conflict scenarios.

Arild Bergh, the first sociologist to empirically tackle this field, created a typology of music and conflict transformation as follows:

- Music as Representation
- Musicking as a Joint Activity
- Music as an Emotional tool (Bergh 2010)

While I agree that music as representation represents a large aspect of the field, I feel that the other categories can be more usefully altered to the following:
• Music in conflict
• Music for peace
• Music as representation
• Music as a magical power
• Music as a resource for developing new shared identities

The themes all deal with how music is mobilised to affect agency. I will next address each category including the elements of Bergh’s categories followed by a suggested manner in which to conceive a general theoretical approach to music and conflict transformation.

2.3.1 Music in Conflict

Despite much of the popular narrative around the positive powers of music, the art-form has been frequently used for negative purposes both consciously and unconsciously. Music has long been deemed dangerous to social order from Plato (n.d.) onwards and has since been used for such unromantic purposes as social control (Brown and Volgsten 2006) and torture (Cusick 2006; Neustadt 2004; Cloonan and Johnson 2002). Even mobilising music to strengthen a shared identity within a social group can give rise to the unwanted side effect of creating a sense of separateness or otherness from other social groups. This in turn could provide a basis for fostering future conflicts between these in and out groups (North and Hargreaves 1999; Jovanović 2005; Hogg 2005; Pettan 1998; Levi-Strauss 1968; Kent 2008). George Kent referred to these negative applications as ‘unpeaceful music’ which includes repellent, nationalistic, insurrectionary and hateful music as well as music as commodity.

Kent used the term repellent music to refer to a few newspaper articles that discuss the use of classical music in shops and other public spaces to discourage loitering by groups of youths (Kent 2008, p.104). This practice has been researched in more depth by Gayle Young (1993) and Hargreaves and North (1999) who essentially noted the same phenomenon. The basic premise is that those in charge of a space like a shop will wish to ensure that undesirable groups (those that generally do not spend money in the shop and might discourage other money-spending groups from entering the shop) are moved along. There is an assumption about these types of groups and the music that will attract or repel them and indeed the increased use of classical
music to repel teenagers has resulted in fewer teenagers in these shops (Kent 2008; Young 1993).

Kent notes that national anthems are very militaristic in style and the lyrics are also dominated by military references (Kent 2008, p.105) although he mainly focuses on the lyrics which do not examine what is unpeaceful about the music as such. Many others, however, have discussed nationalistic music and its negative connotations (O’Flynn 2007; Smith 2007; Hudson 2007). What all of these authors note is that music in this context is used in an attempt to forge or strengthen a sense of identity common across a national spectrum but that it does so through excluding one or more social groups. If all of one group feel that they are unified and represented by a certain type of music, those that are not part of this group could feel alienated not only from the music but from the whole idea of the nation. Kent does not go into this very deeply, but presumably this is what he means by labelling nationalistic music as unpeaceful. Kent notes that Barenboim thought that performing Beethoven under the Nazis would have been a call for freedom since he felt Beethoven represented the yearning of the freedom of the individual yet Beethoven was actually one of the approved Nazi composers (Kent 2008, p.106).

Attali has pointed out that music is an activity that helps to cement group cohesion (Attali 1985, p.6) and Kent concludes from this that this could mean a group with a common feeling of hatred for another group. Thus musicking within this group would be a hateful application of music (Kent 2008, p.108). Others who have illustrated how music can be used in hateful ways and to foster conflicts through consolidation of nationalism and hatred include Pettan (1998) and Hogg (2005). The usage of Turbofolk, the dominant musical genre in Serbia in the early 1990s, by the Serb nationalists is a prime example of unpeaceful music. Originally developed for light entertainment Turbofolk came to replace traditional folk music that stemmed from traditions and customs and rites. This type of music paid lip service to traditional Serbian folk in the form of keeping the accordion or a synthesised version of the accordion and a vocal style tremor popular in the region. Aside from that it was completely manufactured with no connection to Serbia at all, and was primarily consumed by aspiring urban
peasants. The lyrics were not overtly political and focused on topics of love and relationships and the visual representation of Turbofolk artists was glamorous. (Gordy 1999, p.134; Jovanović 2005, p.134). Essentially, Turbofolk disseminated the message to Serbs wherever they are that they were connected by this music to their homeland and that their homeland, if unified, was the ‘Promised Land’.

The collapse of Yugoslavia produced an identity crisis in many Serbs who thought of themselves as Yugoslavs. They bonded with the new Federal Republic of Yugoslavia which had sanctions imposed on it that led to poverty and rising crime. Matters were made worse by a steady influx of Serbian refugees from Croatia, Bosnia and Kosovo. Amateur singing decreased in popularity as the belief that singing now belonged to trained individuals and groups proliferated. Folk spectacles as designed by the government were always hired professionals with little or nothing to do with the folk traditions of Serbia and it was more important to be a spectacle then to be either musically good or tasteful.

“Mass communication has been responsible for the diffusion of such programs and government authorities have used them to maintain social control and mould collective tastes and needs.” (Jovanović 2005, p.135-6).

This is confirmed and elaborated in Gordy’s book on Serbian nationalist strategies which noted that Milosović’s government owned most public communication outlets including radio, television and magazines and strictly limited the types and forms of music available in the public discourse. The result was a unified Serbian identification with the dominant form of publicly heard music: Turbofolk (Gordy 1999). Gordy illustrates how strongly Turbofolk was connected to Serbian nationalism by showing that when it became clear that the Balkan wars needed to end as the West began to mount its campaign against Serbia, Milosović removed his support for Turbofolk artists and stopped playing that type of music on national outlets (Gordy 1999, p.105).

Originally a type of Balkanised ‘Europop’ carrying more or less conservative family values, as the nationalist regime of Milosović took hold it became
transformed, in the words of Jelena Subotić, a presenter of Belgrade’s independent Radio B-92, into ‘a perfect channel for disseminating the poisonous seeds of hatred’ (Collin 2001, p.80; Hogg 2005, p.223). Turbofolk not only helped consolidate Serbian national identity it projected it wherever it was played (Hogg 2005, p.224). Hogg argues that this is akin to CCTV where the technology is visible (audible) and it attempts to control society by letting them know that the authorities are near and they are being watched; not that their space will be invaded but rather that it already is occupied because the air is already dominated (Hogg 2005, p.224). Hogg argues that this musical space occupation expresses ownership, authority and exclusivity over the space in which it occupies. He argues that this ties in with Dandeker’s writings on surveillance who proposes that strategies for sanctions to be mobilised in surveillance include the coercive which recorded music could be:

“...to devise mechanisms of excluding potential rule breakers from the opportunity to disobey instructions.” (Dandeker 1990, pp.38-39).

While superficially it appears that a new cultural identity was formed by Turbofolk it was more about finding an old style that appealed to the greatest proportion of the population who were too poor to search elsewhere for new music. Other forms of internal conflict were decreased by economic circumstance and then music from the poor of the past was uncovered to create a renewed sense of cultural identity.

But what else happened? Was this music listened to while ethnic cleansing of the Bosnians occurred? What do the other Balkan people think of this music and this new sense of identity? What about Serbs still in other Baltic states, do they feel attached to this music as well? What happened to the Yugoslav identity that the Serbians liked so much? Has there been any music-making with Croats or Bosnians? Is there any shared musical experiences? Is it possible for a resurgence in Turbofolk to occur in order to bring about a renewed sense of togetherness amongst the Balkan people? Does music even need to be good in order to be useful? These questions were completely unanswered by Jovanović and much of the available literature on this topic is written in Serbian and remains un-translated.
Closer to home, Bruce Johnson and Martin Cloonan have examined the usage of popular Western music and its role in violent acts. They begin with a quote from one of Adorno’s contemporaries, Walter Benjamin which I shall repeat here:

“‘There is no document of civilisation that is not at the same time a document of barbarism.’” (Johnson and Cloonan 2009, p.1).

That music itself is an amoral mode of attention is core to their theory and I have echoed this elsewhere in this thesis. They are keen to point out that any usage of music that appears to be positive and peaceful to one group can simultaneously feel rather unpeaceful to another group. They have attempted to illustrate that the popular music studies hegemony focuses on the emancipatory aspects of popular music and how it creates space to create personal and social identities which ignores that the same music and processes can help create oppression and violence. Indeed, if an oppressed group actively seeks freedom, this act is often viewed as an invasion by the oppressing group (Johnson and Cloonan 2009, p.30).

Johnson and Cloonan have made an extensive catalogue of cases throughout history where music has been used in partnership with violence, in literature and myths as well as history. It is informative to list these here:

- The destruction of the walls of Jericho with trumpets and shouting (The Book of Joshua, chapter 6, verses 20-21).
- Plato believed that certain modes of music could de-stabilise the mind and society.
- 1950s rock n roll fans slashing seats and vandalising venues
- Hip hop and drive-by shootings
- Battle music from the ancient Greeks to Henry V’s invasion of France and the Spanish Armada all had musicians in their armies
- North and South Korea blare their anthems towards each other
- The banning of certain types of music enforced by violence
- Irish songs that encouraged the Irish nationalist uprisings in colonial Australia
- Rock music in Iran (Johnson and Cloonan 2009, pp. 31-47).

The above cases can be classified into music as a weapon, music as an influence on behaviour and music as representation. The physical sonic
properties of music are presumably the cause of the walls of Jericho falling, not the social meaning of such. Although the message of the voices and sounds of the many, even if they have no other weapons, can still bring the mighty crashing down; a poignant call for mass protest if ever there was one.

Conversely, military battle music has a dual purpose in its meaning and its physicality. Most military music involves drums and a steady repetitive rhythm which entrains those that listen to move in this disciplined manner and helps focus their minds on the tasks at hand. The knowledge and memory that this music represents their own culture as one of power is meaningful to them and helps give them courage in the face of battle. Their enemies, if unfamiliar with the music and combined with the sights of an amassing army and the fear of death and injury combines to spread fear and panic amongst them, or at least that is the plan. Of course, both sides might have the same strategies and often do have. It is under-documented just how these battle musics affected either side, but they maintained a motivational force at least on their respective sides.

Beginning with Plato, it has been assumed that the music itself directly influences behaviour and this continues wherever there is musical censorship or public outcry against a form of music. There is a belief and fear that the simple act of listening to some forms of music will create an awakening in the audiences that will then spill over into a social change that will threaten the dominant hegemony and, ultimately, threaten the authority of the state or powers in control. As this thesis explains elsewhere, the reality is a little more complex than that, but it does illustrate that dictators and despots have long been in the lead in understanding the power of music as a tool for social change and control, and that by controlling what music their population has access to limits their ability to mobilise and challenge the status quo (Illiano and Sala 2009).

In Music and Dictatorship in Europe and Latin America edited by Roberto Illiano and Massimiliano Sala (2009) there is much ethno-musicological discussion about what music was supported and popularised during times of dictatorship yet, as with most musicological discussions of this topic, the focus is too much on the music itself or how the social situations affected the music rather than
the interplay between musical creation, proliferation, ideological and identity construction and so on. What it does cover, in several languages, is how dictatorships have affected the music and musicians in Nazi-controlled France, Germany, Greece and Serbia, fascist Italy, Portugal, Spain, Serbia, Hungary, Argentina, Brazil and Chile, and communist Poland, Russia, Serbia, and Cuba (Illiano and Sala 2009). Unfortunately there was no consideration about how the process flows the other way; how music created, performed and listened to during these periods and places affected the society which had to deal with such circumstances.

Music as representation refers to any music that galvanises one group as a unified whole and rejects other groups as separate. Music strengthens borders of identity and can plant the seeds of future conflict if the needs and wants of these groups begin to clash, just who is going to fight who can help be determined by the music associated with each of these groups which will be discussed later.

### 2.3.1.1 Consumption

It is feasible that this uncontrollable and unpredictable aspect of musical affect on a population is the real reason that makes totalitarian leaders wary since things that affect behaviour in uncontrollable and unpredictable manners are dangerous at worst or at the very least risky for any state. Western democratic states lack the explicit powers available to dictators and despots but they at least attempt to control music’s power through the encouragement of the commodification of music in the capitalist system. Music that embodies a challenge to the state once commodified can satisfy the desire to challenge by those that consume music as a product without actually challenging the state; commodification of music can effectively neuter the change potential of musical experience. This is a form of conflict management but not of a mutually beneficial variety since one or more sides to the actual and potential conflict are circumvented, suppressed, diverted or otherwise prevented from equalities (Attali 1985; Hesmondhalgh 2007). This is a whole topic in itself and it is not within the scope of this thesis to address the commodification of music as social control apart from noting it here.
2.3.2 Music for Peace

Music for peace includes any usage of music as a platform for lyrics to promote certain ideologies centred on peace and non-violence such as anti-war activists and human rights social movements (Eyerman and Jamieson 1998). Musicians have long been involved in peace movements, from Pete Seegar to Bono, yet there is very little if any evidence to suggest that the music in these cases actually helped positively transform any conflict, at least directly. In the cases where song was the musical form, music provided the scaffolding on which to hang certain messages; it provided an amplification system for communication purposes. Music attracts audiences and where audiences gather messages can be spread, but music itself does not spread literal messages, the lyrics do. Any discussion about peace protest songs is really about the lyrics with galvanising messages being helped to spread on a musical vehicle. Another factor in these cases is that fame and notoriety increase the likelihood of a message being heard, not the music itself. This has been confirmed by Kruse in his study of the peace campaign of John Lennon and Yoko Ono where the music played only a small part in their peace activism when compared to the role that their fame and public access played (Kruse II 2009).

In the book edited by Johannson and Bell the focus is almost exclusively on the lyrical content (Johannson and Bell 2009, pp.40-1, 43, 96-7, 115-6, 163-5) and very little mention is made of the music itself. Instead Kuhlke’s analysis of Canadian rock band Rheostatics and their connection to Canadian identity contains the only mention of music itself, albeit fleetingly when he mentions one of their songs ‘Chanson les ruelles’ (Songs of the Little Streets) as having a melody that was Canadian. This may be so, but no further analysis of said melody is conducted (Kuhlke 2009, p.165). This is a very popular trend when analysing peace songs. Firstly, the analysis occurs almost exclusively in the popular music and cultural studies fields, which has long been entrenched in the linguistic and critical analysis turns and has yet to have a musical turn despite the subject matter. The musical expertise is simply not largely available in these fields, so just how the music helps, hinders and interacts with the lyrics, the performers and/or the audience is simply not explored.
A collection of peace songs assembled by the Workers Music Association in the UK entitled simply Peace Songs illustrates that the idea of singing for peace is not by any means a new one. The songs are listed in chronological order with the oldest, ‘Christe d Beistand’ dating from the mid 1600s during the 30 Years War. The topics covered ranged from the Thirty Years War in seventeenth century England, the American civil war, the cold war, the World Wars and the Vietnam War amongst many other conflicts but by far the most represented was a conflict that did not actually occur: the threat of nuclear war with roughly one in six songs having that as the explicit topic (Jordan 1989). There is no social analysis included in this case, but it is a fine illustration that the notion is not new nor is it a geographically specific phenomenon. It also illustrates that potential conflict, such as the threat of nuclear war, was as much if not greater an inspiration for peace songs as actual conflict. The one thing that all of these music for peace examples have in common is that the medium may have been music but the message is clearly in the lyrical content.

William Roy’s research on social movements, race and music (2010) is one of the only books of its kind that has established the link between active musical production and social change. He concluded that the lyrical content was secondary in the civil rights movement singing of peace songs, but the physical act of singing together in a group with a perceived common purpose was key in breaking down barriers of race and difference. This confirms the theories proposed by Small that musical production is a more effective means of strengthening a shared sense of identity then the consumption of music (1998).

When the music is instrumental, things are a little more complex. In the case of the West Eastern Divan Orchestra, Barenboim and Said first believed that creating a musical entity that brought together Israeli and Palestinian musicians could be a demonstration and an analogue of how these two warring nations could cooperate together and, ultimately, end the conflict. The end result is a credible world-class orchestra but it has had very little effect on the daily lives of the participants, let alone the attitudes of the people within Israel and Palestine. The participants temporarily adopt a shared identity while they are within the orchestra but revert to their old identities when they return home (Beckles
Willson 2009). The limitations placed on the orchestra in terms of the music they perform (mainly Beethoven), where they perform (mainly Europe and never in Israel where the Palestinian musicians were not granted working visas) and how they perform (equal status under the conductor and composer) means that this project was ultimately unlikely to make a lasting transformational impact on this conflict.

Kosovan music educator Luzha remembered that even during the worst of the conflict in Kosovo in the 1990s children sang songs of peace and freedom as way of maintaining hope for a better future (Luzha 2005, p.150). She goes on to describe how she and other music educators organised a classical concert after the end of the conflict in 1999 in an effort to show how they are ready to join Europe and express themselves in the way they believed European societies did. The concert was held outdoors even though it was in the freezing cold of a Balkan winter. She noted how the musicians were dressed formally in concert attire and how the “sounds they produced created a warm environment” (Luzha 2005, p.150). The article is not a piece of research but it illustrates three things about how music has been used and continues to be used effectively in post-conflict situations: 1) music provides a mode of attention that is different and separate from the non-musical life. In terrible situations like the Kosovo conflict such modes of attention enable the participants to take a break from the harshness of reality. When coupled with meaningful lyrics, in this case lyrics of hope for peace, the message becomes entwined in the experience of the mode of attention. Furthermore, the memory of this entwined experience enables the idea of hope to continue beyond the experience itself; a message of hope combined with an experience that enables a break from harsh realities enables hope to carry on even when the harsh reality is becomes the mode of attention once more. 2) The people of Kosovo, or at least the music educators, were very keen to show how they were normal; they were Europeans just like any other European nation. This normality meant in the first instance that they were no longer at war. They also wanted to show that they were civilised and ready to join everything that other Europeans did as represented by cultural expressions, especially high art expressions which they believed were normal European expressions of culture. 3) The outward show of braving the bitter cold to perform
outside in concert attire combined with the experience of the mode of attention afforded by the musical experience of the concert created a sense that the cold was unimportant. Instead, what was important was that the country was expressing itself and that they were free to do so. Again, the memory of this emotion and sense of pride and solidarity remained after the experiential aspect of the concert had ceased.

2.3.3 Music as Representation

Music as representation often appears to be noble where social groups, often marginalised within wider society, are represented by certain musicians or musical events which promote a unified cultural identity amongst those represented but this can potentially lay the framework for future conflicts between those represented and those not represented within this cultural context. Unfortunately, it is this form of musical mobilisation that is considered worthy amongst many musicians, politicians and public as well as many academics themselves (Urbain 2008). This becomes tied up with the historic growth of specialised music as separate from their social contexts through the growth of the patronage systems, through to the emergence of the middle classes and onto the capitalisation of music (Chanan 1994). Music as representation has been used as a marker of excellence from certain social groups whereby favoured musics have been elevated to a higher status unattainable by most; music has become estranged from the cultures they represent. It is not surprising, therefore, that this form of social musicking is the dominant one in the developed world and increasingly the undeveloped as poorer social groups globally attempt to gain recognition and support within the current paradigm (Skyllstad 2000; Zelizer 2003).

Bergh observes that music used as representation is unlikely to produce harmonious results as it highlights differences rather than similarities (Bergh 2006, p.2). One of Bergh’s research sites was the Norwegian Resonant Community project which was an attempt to reduce indigenous Norwegian prejudice against immigrants in schools by presenting concerts of traditional music from the immigrant countries to schools. The project was deemed by Bergh to have ultimately failed to reduce conflict between native Norwegians...
and the immigrant community since it utilised music as representation that strengthened cultural boundaries. Another reason for the relative lack of success could have been due to the fact that the children were passive recipients of performances rather than actively engaged in producing music themselves. This ties in with what Small (1998) and Attali (1985) suggestions that musical production and active participation is more likely to produce stronger group cohesion than passive consumption of music, although Small does point out that even music consumption is a form of active musicking. Despite this apparent failure, the project had been reported as a success and continues to be referenced as such. Bergh suggests that this is due to the original report being focused on abstract attitudes towards the idea of another culture existing somewhere else rather than within their own community (Bergh 2006, p.4). This highlights a common problem with music and conflict transformation projects such as the West-Eastern Divan Orchestra which is often reported as successfully illustrating how Israelis and Palestinians can work together when in fact the orchestra has not changed the daily lives of those involved outside of the orchestra and it has had even less effect on the rest of Israel and Palestine. If anything, that particular project has had a negative effect on the conflict since it has satisfied some observers that the situation is improving if such a project can exist when in fact the situation is the same or worse. Bergh suggests that these large media-savvy music and conflict transformation projects are driven by the favoured Western discourses on music which assume the greatness of music and use big festivals and professional musicians and that these discourses are driven by the musicians themselves (Bergh 2006, p.5), although this attitude is slowly changing and this has been documented and discussed at great length by Small (1998), Becker (1982) and DeNora (2000, 2003). Furthermore, none of these studies have discussed the internal conflicts found within the projects themselves, as observed by both Bergh and myself. The Resonant Communities project, for example, contained within it some conflicting goals that were never addressed; the organisers wished to reduce prejudices between immigrant school children and indigenous Norwegians, the musicians wanted to demonstrate their culture(s) to the
children as well as earn a living and the children for the most part just enjoyed participating in an event that enabled them to leave the classroom.

Music and identity is oft discussed in musicology (Born and Hesmondhalgh 2010), sociology (DeNora 2000, 2003; Adorno 1988), cultural studies (Clayton, Herbert and Middleton 2003) as well as feminism (McClary 1991), gender studies (Citron 1992; Whiteley 1997), queer studies (Hubbs 2004; Brett, Wood and Thomas 2006), race studies (Cvetkovich and Kellner 1997), human geography (Mitchell 2002) and even psychology (Hargreaves and North 1999) and neurology (Zeman 2005), yet just what is meant by identity has an equal array of variety. In the vast majority of cases, the type of identity referred to, however, is either the personal sense of identity and the social or the transference between the two. Most of the literature deals with how things are or how things were, with very little attention to how this process occurs and continues to occur throughout one’s life and the life of the society/societies that that individual belongs. This has more recently been rectified with the works of DeNora and the Exeter School as well as Shepherd (1991), Hennion (1995), Frith (1996, 2002). Still, in most cases, what is being discussed is music as representation, a term coined by Bergh (2010).

If music is used to galvanise people who are oppressed or otherwise marginalised then those in the dominant hegemony would likely feel threatened by this same music. This illustrates an earlier point that conflict itself is not inherently bad, in fact it is necessary for change, especially social change that needs to occur in order to increase the percentage of a population that are treated equally with roughly the same access to resources and opportunities. Regardless of whether or not a social action is just, however, it is important to understand that in these cases music is still being used as a representative force: this music represents a particular social group beyond the lyrical content. If a member of a protest group participates in a group singing of a protest song at one point in time and then at a future point they hear a fragment of the music from that same song without any words in it, it is likely that person would not only remember the song, and possibly the words, but also the feeling of
participation and belonging as well as the social-political message within the song (Connell and Gibson 2003; Whiteley, Bennett and Hawkins 2004).

Yair Dalal is a musician who has attempted to conjoin separate identities through the music itself by combining Jewish and Arab music to some degree, in an effort to show how the two cultures can peacefully co-exist, at least in the musical world. Dalal based his practice on social constructivist thought and believes that if conflicting groups could be made aware of their commonalities then they could understand how their current identities had been constructed, but Dalal ultimately falls into the music as representation category. Dalal believed that his approach to playing music could help create this awareness which includes performing Babylonian music, mastering the oud and the violin, mixing Jewish and Arab musics together in a hybrid, organising concerts from both traditions, sharing views in interviews (Urbain 2008, p.204). Prior to Jews or Arabs in the middle east region was the Babylonian empire, and Dalal believes that Jews and Arabs were once the same people and by performing this ancient music he thinks audiences will realise this and wish to be in conflict less. He believed that by mastering the Arab oud and the Jewish style of violin playing he demonstrates his understanding and empathy with both cultures as well as gaining access to those audiences. Hybridising the music is Dalal’s attempt to hybridise their cultures to show how a new shared identity could be like. Finally, the interviews he gave spread knowledge of his activities. While this sounds intriguing and artistically exciting, there are a number of questions that remain unanswered. How do differing audiences perceive the Babylonian music? Is it simply too old for either Jewish or Arab audiences to feel that it somehow belongs to their heritage? When Jewish and Arab music is mixed is that fully understood by Jewish and Arab audiences? Are they always mixed equally? Are there any power relation issues found within the hybrid? For example, has Dalal mixed a dominant Arab melody with subservient Jewish accompaniment or the other way around? Is the hybrid music recognisable even by either audience? How much of that shared history can be communicated through the music alone? If it was the case then he would not need to disseminate this information through interviews. Dalal’s experiments may have had some effect but at the moment this is simply unknown as there
has not been any solid research conducted in this area. From the evidence provided, the most that can be said for certain is that Dalal is a committed artist who engages with the cultural material of two conflicting sides to support his own aesthetic argument that they are actually one people and he attempts to show and tell as many people as he can about this. What can be concluded here, however, is that Dalal is using music as representation, albeit in a slightly altered manner. When Dalal performs Babylonian music he is representing an imagined shared past culture, when he performs hybridised music he represents an imagined shared future. The concerts that he organises are even more obviously delineated representations of both cultures. In all cases, he has marked boundaries between in and out groups. The interesting point here is that representation in music has so far been considered unhelpful in a music and conflict transformation setting but if a new boundary can be formed that includes the currently conflicting parties then this could be viewed as positive, at least for those parties. What consequences this has for other parties with various vested interests in the conflict is unknown.

The power of music is invoked by many in a manner which presupposes its meaning and is rarely unpacked in terms of what this power really is, how it works and how it is applied in context. This in turn often results in music being utilised for representation but at the core of any application is the belief in the power of music which is so ingrained in the minds of those that invoke it to be unquestionably a part of one’s tacit knowledge. This is combined with the experiential aspects of music as a force that is not only felt in real time but through memory work, simultaneously and separately. It becomes clear that the true power of music lies within both the belief that it actually wields such power as well as the very nature of a social process which exists in all temporal forms; the present while the music occurs, the past in memories and the future through expectations. Most writing on music in this category is anecdotal, surface or otherwise ungrounded. (Barenboim and Said 2004; Urbain 2008). This is a key issue since anecdotal evidence is easily dismissed and the hidden workings of music on the level of tacit knowledge are equally easily missed.
2.3.4 Music as a Magic Bullet

Bergh has looked at much of the literature so far in existence yet he is dismissive of much of it, including the whole of the Urbain book, labelling their approach as ‘magic bullet’ theory. Essentially, Bergh believes that Urbain et al, who mostly have illustrious careers in academia or other well-respected positions, become overly romantic when they write about the ineffable powers that music possesses which manifested itself in expressions of anecdotal evidence or descriptive passages (Bergh 2006, p.2). The main criticism therefore is of grounding and, if it is grounded, there is not sufficient evidence to suggest that it is definitely music that has done anything or, even if it had, why music would be better at it than any other social activity. This is a sensible criticism since the book does not provide much in the way of any evidence or grounded research to support the arguments contained within. Bergh seems to be searching for hard evidence and is frustrated at the lack of it, but perhaps there are some useful points still to be taken from Urbain et al. What is currently absent from all literature on music and conflict transformation, including Bergh, is why there is such a widespread and strong belief in the almost magical properties of music to beneficially change conflict contexts? For example, why do so many highly articulate and intelligent thinkers and writers become overly romantic and unscientific when discussing the power of music? Is their collective belief shrouding their reason or is there something else going on? Is there a compositional-performative element to the Urbain et al book that Bergh has not addressed? In other words, like Adorno and McClary, is the manner in which the book is written a subtext for the proliferation of a certain belief about music with the additional belief that if the text can influence more people to believe in this power of music then more people will adjust their behaviour accordingly? There are a growing number of auto-ethnographers who believe so (Ellis 2004; Pelias 2005; Denzin 2003, 2006; Jones 2005; Spry 2001; Neuman 1996; Anderson 2006). All of these authors claim different purposes and approaches but they all include the performance of self in their writing and

---

2 From a personal conversation, May 2009.
research. The approaches range from attempts to tie in the personal to the cultural via embodiment and emotion (Ellis 2004; Jones 2005), placing self in social context (Neuman 1996), as a means of using oneself as a research tool for analytical purposes (Anderson 2006), the act of writing oneself into their research is a performative one. Bergh is correct to point out the lack of empirical evidence and grounding in Urbain’s collection, but it still demonstrates that the common motivation behind the book and many other music and conflict transformation projects is the belief that music has the power to change. It also goes some way to explain Bergh’s motivation for conducting his research in the first place. Therefore, even if music does not directly cause change, people behave as if it does due to their belief that it does. Since this belief is widespread, it is important to understand how these beliefs propagate.

Bergh’s own work provides a much a needed but rarely seen set of grounded research from Norway, as already discussed, as well as from a refugee camp in the Sudan. His research seems to have illuminated more problems with using music in conflict transformation than it solves, such as if music is to work in this manner it requires much repetition and time which would in turn require prolonged funding and that is a practical problem rarely overcome (Bergh 2008, pp.15-6). Bergh’s research seems to further suggest that music is related to belief structures in as much as those who initiated the Resonant Communities project and the musicians involved believed that music was going to have a positive effect on the sense of conflict within the communities involved. It was this belief mediated and reinforced through the music which motivated their behaviour. This belief seems to have been propagated through active musicking rather than passive reception (whether or not reception is passive is another debate!) which could explain somewhat why the children were less affected by this music-belief system. Elsewhere, Prior has noted how musicians often produce collective beliefs about their work which are not necessarily backed up with any evidence, as was the case with online communities of glitch musicians (2008, p.309). Furthermore, it seems that music’s effect in this context is limited to the time and location in which it occurs. Is it possible that the effect could last longer or even develop into a more permanent effect through repetition? Small (1998) and Attali (1985) seem to think so, and this is further backed up by
Atkinson (2006), Roy (2010) and Hara (2013) but unfortunately this project was not set up in this manner. Repetition will be discussed in more depth in the section on music and memory below.

2.3.5 Music for Identity Formation

The creation of new shared identity is one path to follow in order to build trust amongst those in conflict to the point where fruitful negotiations can occur where the outcome is more likely to be agreeable for all involved. Active music-making in groups does seem to have this effect (Small 1998). Bergh’s suggestion that music would be more successfully utilised in a conflict transformation context if there is a dialogue and the participants actually participate in the musicking. Peace initiatives on paper are heading in this direction, using pre-existing cultural capital rather than importing or creating from scratch (Bergh 2006, p.6) and this seems sensible.

There is a common conflict resolution problem where all participants work together well during a project but when returning back to their place of origin they conform to existing behaviour in the groups. Any effect or feeling of togetherness does not last (Bergh 2006, p.6). This conforms to Small’s concepts of musicking and how group cohesion is more likely to occur amongst protracted, repeated, joint creative processes rather than one-off projects. Finally, Bergh implores musicians involved with conflict transformation to not over-romanticise their art but rather take it practically and seriously as those who use music for negative purposes already do.

Identity is always a thorny issue, and particularly in places of protracted identity conflict such as Northern Ireland. Northern Ireland has had a long history of various conflicts between Protestant Loyalists and Catholic Republicans but as many observers have noted, these two conflicting groups have more in common with each other than with Britain or Ireland respectively (Davis 2003, p.17-36; Cooper 2009, p.27; Doherty 2000). This is a clear illustration of how identity is entwined with the belief of what it is regardless of outward evidence that contradicts it. Furthermore, it is not even the belief of what it is now but also the memory of past beliefs and the belief that certain memories take precedent over others. Despite this initial connection, Cooper does not mention the role of
memory, belief or emotion in the music – identity matrix or how this has affected behaviour over time in the Northern Irish context.

Finally there are a growing number of researchers who frame social musical processes as resource for developing new shared identities (DeNora 2000, 2003; Bergh 2010; Jordanger 2008; Pavlicević and Ansdell 2004). While DeNora’s initial research mainly focused on how the consumption of music works in this manner, many researchers within the music and health subfield have since focused on the active musicking itself, including DeNora herself (2010, 2011). Bergh’s work concluded that since music has this potential it is possible and that a sense of shared identity is considered by those in the conflict transformation field as key to positively transforming conflict that music should be able to work in this manner. Unfortunately, the research Bergh conducted did not result in any evidence that supports this. This does not disprove the possibility, however, since it could be argued that since Bergh’s fieldwork sites did not utilise music in a manner demonstrative of an understanding of the processes involved and therefore less likely to succeed. This is also true for most other music and conflict transformation projects that have been examined so far with the one exception of Pontanima, an inter-religious choir from Sarajevo, Bosnia-Herzegovina. The choir is not flawless in its efforts at conflict transformation, but there is at least a trace of evidence in its efforts and I will argue that this is due to its adherence to an understanding of some of the musical processes, albeit in a tacit manner. This will be discussed in greater detail in the next chapter since Pontanima was one of my research sites.

Gilad Atzmon, a UK-based Israeli improvising saxophonist, presents an interesting case of this form of music as identity formation. Atzmon has been known in his Orient House Ensemble to merge Jewish melodies with Arabic scales and vice versa in an attempt to subvert the cultural distinctions of each culture. Again this is an artistic practice but the result is difficult to grasp as an audience, especially for western ears which find the different aspects difficult to differentiate. Similar to Dalal, there is no audience data from Atzmon’s performances in the Middle East to determine their perception and relative level
of acceptance. While this aspect of conflict transformation was attempted purely through Atzmon’s music, Atzmon is deeply involved in anti-Israel/pro-Palestine activism which is increasingly militant and perhaps at odds with the conflict transformation project set out in his music. His point here is that in asymmetrical protracted conflicts such as that between Israel and Palestine no amount of equal discussion and debate is possible until the underdog, Palestine, is given the same rights and privileges on the world stage. In other words, Atzmon has chosen a side to champion for reasons of perceived justice and the taking of any side in a conflict over another is not likely to be completely peaceful. This brings up a serious ethical debate about the whole nature of conflict transformation: is the goal of conflict transformation to bring about peaceful negotiations between two conflicting parties to prevent further violence or is the goal to raise the consciousness, ability and state of wellbeing of a side that is being persecuted by another? The former is politically viable but potentially practically impotent as the Israeli-Palestinian conflict illustrates. The latter is a form of activism which is politically unpopular although perhaps more successful at garnering popular opinion which, eventually, may influence politics. What Atzmon illustrates is that conscious efforts by an artist to demonstrate possible new shared identities between conflicting cultures has done little to affect opinion and this primarily because he was the only one involved in these creative decisions. Most listeners would be unlikely to pick out the compositional details of what was Jewish and what was Arabic, stylised as it is, and it is therefore only the high-profile activism that Atzmon participates in that has drawn attention to this style. That is not to say that hybridisation is not a successful strategy, on the contrary, evidence suggests the opposite, but the people in the conflict seem to need more input if their own identities are to be affected (Atzmon 2011; Abi-Ezzi 2010).

2.3.6 What is wrong with this model? What is conflict transformation attempting to achieve and how can music be involved?

While the current literature on music and conflict transformation is divisible into the above categories there is still little in the way of explanation of how music can practically positively affect the conflict process. There is evidence to support how music can achieve the opposite goal of negatively affecting
conflict, or at least affecting the balance of a conflict towards a win-lose outcome as opposed to a win-win outcome. Music for peace discussions generally do not examine what happens in the music itself, rather focusing on lyrical content or the social phenomenon surrounding the music. Music as representation often exacerbates difference and is less about cohesion between groups, which is usually precisely where conflicts lie. Magic bullet commentators, similar to music and peace commentators, usually do not discuss what is happening with the music itself, relying on a shared belief that the music does something almost supernatural. Even the work done on music and identity formation focuses on snapshots of a situation where the music is discussed as an object with causal properties and the resultant identity. It does not generally develop into how this process is dynamic. With this in mind, the thesis question needs to be revisited: firstly, what is conflict transformation itself trying to achieve? Secondly, can music help conflict transformation processes achieve their goals and, if so, how? Thirdly, what is the evidence to support these theories? The first question demands an examination of the conflict transformation literature itself. The second question is a social one: both conflict and music are social activities therefore music sociology is the most relevant discipline in order to address this question. Empirical evidence is scarce but this thesis is an attempt to develop this aspect.

2.3.6.1 Belief in the power of Music

As well as attempting to utilise musical material for positive social change purposes, the common characteristic that these examples share is the belief that such an endeavour should be successful. The fact that this belief is still strong demonstrates that this characteristic is the reason why these projects continue despite evidence suggesting that they are not wholly successful. The redemptive nature of this belief in the power of music, therefore, inputs into the actual power of music in practice, and this needs to be understood in order to better steer such projects in the future.

There has been much discussion about how beliefs form the basis for human action and behaviour within arts sociology (Acord and DeNora 2008; Bergh 2010; Barnes 2000; Weber 1991), psychology (Tversky and Kahneman 1974;
Johnson-Laird and Oatley 2008) and organisational behaviour researchers (Moorman and Miner 1998). These examples refer to belief as understanding, cognition and perception and behaviour as action, decision and judgement which suits the purposes of this chapter. Combining the literature from sociology and psychology it becomes apparent that belief systems are reflexively related to notions of memory, identity and emotion and often very little to do with empirical reality. In other words, memories, emotions and a sense of identity influence belief systems and the influence also flows the other way, from belief systems to memories, emotions and identities. This is particularly evident in areas of great conflict or trauma, such as Northern Ireland where conflicting Catholics and Protestants have much more in common with each other than with either Ireland or the United Kingdom (Davis 2003, p.17-36; Cooper 2009, p.27; Doherty 2000); their belief system based on their sense of self and where the boundaries lie has been built up over time and hardened by past experiences that conjure up great pain and emotion to such a degree that they cannot see their commonalities. Finally, individual beliefs are largely shared with the social groups with whom they identify with (Bourdieu 1985; Bar-Tal 2000). Music’s own connections with the experience of identity, memory and emotion therefore potentially affect belief systems and only indirectly influence behaviour. The fact that the belief in the power of music proliferates despite evidence that it does not have this direct power illustrates that it is this belief in the power of music that is key to its potential in conflict transformation settings, not just the musical material and experience itself.

Interestingly, many conflict transformation practitioners also believe that their work has the best chance for success when identities, memories, emotions and beliefs are taken into account. Third-party intervention theory is largely based upon a neutral outsider attempting to understand how the sides in conflict view themselves, what negative and traumatic memories do they possess about the perceived ‘other’, how do they feel over time and how has this affected their beliefs about the context, themselves and the ‘other’ (Bar Tal 1998; Long and Brecke 2003; Welz 2010). If this can be achieved, then it may be possible to educate the sides about each others’ stories and this type of understanding is considered crucial for a lasting, positive transformation of the conflict.
Music appears to be able to be a conduit between memory, belief, identity on a social level which in turn can influence action and behaviour, both positive and negative but how does this happen? If music has a relationship to each of these aspects, then it follows that music has a wider relationship with all of them together in a wider web of understanding and interdependence. If music can affect behaviour in this way, how can it affect behaviour in a conflict transformation setting? Since there is scarce literature on music and conflict transformation, it is necessary to look at conflict theory itself and how it intersects with the aspects of behavioural change that music can affect.

2.4 Social Change and Conflict Transformation

2.4.1 Conflict theory
The field of conflict resolution began in the wake of Hiroshima and Nagasaki in the United States with the founding of the Peace Research Laboratory in St. Louis in 1945. This led to the eventual initiation of the Journal of Conflict Resolution and the Center for Research on Conflict Resolution at the University of Michigan in the late 1950s (Bercovitch, Kremenyuk and Zartman 2009). Mack and Snyder were possibly the first authors to attempt to generalise and clearly define conflict theory and much of current conflict theory is reliant on their 1957 survey of the field. In a very general manner, they view conflict as an “interaction system” consisting of two or more parties with one or more issues and differing levels of power (Mack and Snyder 1957, p.238). This American pragmatic approach contrasted sharply with the European structuralist approach started by Galtung and largely developed in the 1960s throughout northern Europe. Galtung’s approach was heavily influenced by Ghandi and it consisted of what he coined ‘positive peace’ which referred to active social structural changes, the development of empathetic relationships and community (Ramsbotham et al. 2011, p. 43-4). It is not difficult to imagine how music might play a role in Galtung’s perception of conflict resolution and, indeed, he has been an active member of the burgeoning music and conflict transformation field (Galtung 2008).

Burton, meanwhile, developed the much used concept of protracted social conflict to describe the type of conflict that is sustained and unlikely to end.
without intervention. Particularly influential here were the game theories of Schelling and Rapoport and Chammah who demonstrated the irrationality of competitive strategies (Schelling 1960) and the defeating logic of win-lose strategies (Rapoport and Chammah 1965). Also gaining influence here were industrial relations theories (Walton and McKersie 1965), community mediation and alternative dispute resolution (ADR). Burton used these theories to advance his own view that intractable conflicts needed to be unlocked through problem-solving rather than focusing purely on the needs-based approaches that preceded him (Burton 1990). Rapoport built on Burton’s ideas and suggested that participative design processes were required that directly involved the communities affected (Rapoport 1986), essentially foreshadowing the construction approach of the 1980s. But the key point here is that communities themselves are best placed for active peace work.

In Harvard during the 1970s and 1980s Burton’s and Rapoport’s methods began to be applied in the field and the resulting experience fed back into the theory production. The results of which included the need to build better relationships to tackle underlying conflict and the move towards win-win mutual gain problem-solving as detailed by Fisher, Ury and Patton (1991). Similarly, Curle began to practice his Track II diplomacy via unofficial organisational channels in what he coined citizen’s diplomacy (Berman and Johnson 1977; MacDonald and Bendahmane 1987). Lederach is one of the prime advocates for grassroots diplomacy, or Track III diplomacy, arguing that it is the only way that empowers those affected by the conflict and helps third parties to see the transformation in terms of validation and building on the people and resources available (Lederach 1995). With this form of approach it is not difficult to see how music might help in this context, and, indeed, Lederach has discussed the potential role of aesthetic approaches to conflict resolution elsewhere (Lederach 2005).

---

3 Track I diplomacy referring to official state to state diplomacy and Track III referring to grassroots attitudinal change.
Criticism of the conflict resolution approaches came in the form of critical theory, which suggested that problem-solving approaches prolonged some conflicts by continuing the hegemony of foreign colonial power structures (Jabri 1996; Cox 1981). This in turn led to more gendered (Boulding 1988; Byrne 1996; Duffy 1998) and cultural aspects being applied (LeVine 1961; Gulliver 1979; Ross 1993).

From a sociological perspective, Georg Simmel (1904) believed that emotional states played a significant role in the development of conflict at both the personal and social levels. According to Simmel, this could manifest itself as a perceived threat to one's possessions which is also perceived as a threat to one's own personality or as a fear of being mistaken as a member of a similar but competing social group. Simmel further believed that the entangling of social circles inevitably results in various forms of conflict but that this instability can either strengthen group cohesion or instigate change. In either case, Simmel believed that conflict was a necessary part of the social fabric (1955). Coser built upon this concept of how conflict is not necessarily an undesirable condition but he criticised Simmel's lack of differentiation between violent and non-violent conflict (1964). These concepts were further developed first by Kapila and later by Goodhand and Hulme, who defined conflict as follows:

“...struggle, between individuals or collectivities, over values or claims to status, power and scarce resources in which the aims of the conflicting parties are to assert their values or claims over those of others...conflict can also be seen as having a positive dimension as 'normal forms of social interaction which may contribute to the maintenance, development, change and overall stability of social entities' (Coser). From this perspective, conflict 'is only a problem when society cannot represent, manage or resolve its different interests in a productive manner, thus initiating a degenerative or destructive cycle of physical violence' (Kapila).” (Goodhand and Hulme 1999, p.14).

This appears to be a fair definition for the purposes of this paper, although some variations will be examined below.

Bartos defined all types of conflict as:
“...a situation in which actors use conflict behaviour against each other to attain incompatible goals and/or to express their hostility.” (Bartos and Wehr 2002, p.13).

What this definition does not cover is conflict potential where there are two or more groups of people that collectively believe that their goals are incompatible yet conflict behaviour has not as yet been engaged. Some have called for more conflict prevention methods but conflict is required for social change and until all humans are considered to co-exist peacefully and equally it is unlikely that conflict can be prevented or should be. Conflict can potentially be managed, however, and prevented from escalating into violence, which is likely what was intended by those who call for conflict prevention.

According to Ronald Fisher, the social psychology approach to conflict characterises conflict on phenomenological, interactive and multi-level grounds ranging from internal group to ethnic to international levels of conflict (Fisher 1990). Fisher also covers causes and escalations of conflict and how they relate to individual cognition and beliefs in identities. This seems to be a more useful definition of conflict in this context since it can include feelings or perceptions of conflict beyond the actual conflict behaviour as mentioned by Bartos and Wehr.

Ramsbotham et al. follow the basic model for possible conflict outcomes as being win-win, lose-lose or win-lose with the added proviso that no conflict can be satisfactorily resolved (i.e. win-win) unless all basic needs are met (security, survival, identity) (Ramsbotham et al. 2011, p.8-9). Often in intractable conflicts at least one side is always aiming for the win-lose outcome since that would ensure a larger slice of the conflict cake which is why so many third-party interventions occur. The purpose of these interventions can be coercive or non-coercive, which is often referred to as hard or soft power or, in diplomatic circles, Track I or Track II diplomacy (Ibid, p.10-11).

All of these forms of conflict discussed thus far are symmetric conflicts where both parties are relatively equal but many conflicts, especially currently, are unequal and therefore asymmetric. Viewed from classical conflict resolution, asymmetric conflict requires structural change which would not be viewed as a win by side with the advantage. Curle, Lederach and Francis all argued that any
structural change costs all parties yet the outcome can be mutually beneficial (Curle 1971; Lederach 1995; Francis 2004). Another manner in which to categorise conflicts is at the inter-state, extra-systemic, civil or complex intra-state levels as explored by Singer (1996) and Holsti (1991). Since no amount of brilliant musical intervention will make any difference if the conflict is active and violent, this system of categorisation is less relevant to this thesis. Conversely, Galtung proposed a very influential model where full conflict requires poor attitudes, negative behaviour and structural contradictions to be realised; where any of these three criteria are missing the conflict is latent rather than overt (Galtung 1969; 1996). Galtung elaborated this by suggesting that direct violence such as genocide requires behavioural change, structural violence such as mass deaths due to poverty requires the resolution of structural contradictions, and cultural violence such as lack of motivation to address injustice requires change in attitude (Galtung 1981). Galtung’s usage of the term attitude relates to my usage of the term belief later in this chapter, since Galtung refers to the cultural attitude of one side of a conflict towards another based on what they think and feel, or believe.

All of these approaches illustrate that there is no unified theory of conflict despite some attempting to create one (Vasquez 1995; Ramsbotham et al. 2011, p.66). Azar’s protracted social conflict theory changed the field dramatically by suggesting that the conflict prevention methods devised and employed since World War II have been largely ineffectual in most modern conflicts, due to their focus on inter-state war, when most world conflicts today are no longer inter-state (Azar 1990). This is verified by an analysis of protracted conflicts active during the period of 1995-7 which showed of the 48 active protracted conflicts, none were inter-state and the vast majority being about identity or secession, with the remainder dealing with revolution and ideology or inter-factional wars (Ramsbotham et al 2011: p.80). Another look at similar data examined the causes of conflict and the vast majority of these were caused by poor leadership, triggered amongst the elite classes as opposed to the masses (Brown 1996) which implies that the masses were coerced or manipulated into the conflict, and perhaps convincing them otherwise would put enough pressure on the leadership to change their methods.
2.4.2 Conflict Transformation Approaches

Mack and Snyder were at pains to point out that the whole concept of conflict is vague, saying conflict

“...is for the most part a rubber concept, being stretched and molded (*sic*) for the purposes at hand. In its broadest sense it seems to cover everything from war to choices between ice-cream sodas or sundaes.” (Mack and Snyder, 1957, p.212).

They also have pointed out that there is a commonly held belief that all conflict is bad (Mack and Snyder 1957, p.212). Indeed, social change is not possible without an element of conflict (Ramsbotham et al. 2011, p.5). Mack and Snyder list many methods of conflict transformation, such as negotiation or mediation, with each method belonging to a type, such as compulsory or voluntary (Mack and Snyder 1957, p.238). It has since become generally accepted that a higher level category exists within which all of the Mack and Snyder types and methods can be placed, and that is top-down versus bottom-up approach. Top down cases are where negotiations and decisions are made at a leadership level and the results are trickled down to the public, usually in form of accords, treaties and laws. Bottom up approaches involve changing the attitudes of the public first who in turn pressure their leaders to change their attitudes or laws accordingly. This is also commonly referred to as Track I and Track III diplomacy, with Track II being a middle ground between the two. Below is a summary list of forms of conflict transformation categorised into one of these approaches:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>TRACK I*</th>
<th>TRACK II*</th>
<th>TRACK III</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Formal state to state</td>
<td>Unofficial/informal</td>
<td>Grassroots</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>State third party intervention</td>
<td>Third party interventions from religious organisations, academics, NGOs, think</td>
<td>Building relationships across society</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Diplomatic Tracks</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>tanks. Charities</td>
<td>'Peace constituency': support for peace is a pre-requisite for lasting peace negotiations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>special envoys</td>
<td>Deals with relationship change and understanding</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>mediation</td>
<td>Trust-building Building social capital</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>negotiation</td>
<td>Consultation Psycho-social therapeutic applications</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>fact-finding missions</td>
<td>Problem-solving workshops with cultural leaders Projects that encourage togetherness: arts, business, inter-religious dialogue, education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sanctions: expulsion from international bodies, military intervention</td>
<td>Challenge stereotypes Person to person</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Positive incentives: aid, weapons, trade</td>
<td>Improve communication Slow and difficult to monitor</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Balancing through assistance to weaker conflict state</td>
<td>Public dialogue Longer-lasting in the long-term</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Peacemaking: military support to weaker conflict state, political support, financial incentives</td>
<td>Increased moderation Spreading universal beliefs and norms</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ceasefires and ending human rights violations</td>
<td>Developing social structures Media exposure</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>International Criminal Tribunal</td>
<td>Susceptible to spoilers: rejectionists, hardliners, unequal power relationships If third parties are involved it is as facilitators or through training rather than interventions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Official recognition</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Deals with resources and survival</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Table 1: Diplomatic Tracks**
Edward Said sums up the top down Track I and even Track II diplomatic approaches, and the reasons why they often fail to produce tangible results, by claiming that this is essentially reconciliation under duress (Said 1998). Reconciliation under duress implies that two public sides in a conflict have been ordered to cease the physical conflict by their respective leaders, but the underlying causes of the conflict have not been addressed, so for all intents and purposes the conflict still exists, albeit in a more hidden fashion. This type of conflict transformation is unstable and has the potential to disintegrate into further open conflict in the future. It is plausible therefore that mutually acceptable and lasting conflict transformation needs to take place from the bottom up, and it is within this grassroots community level Track III diplomacy that music has a chance to be used in this context.

Arild Bergh has pointed out that a bottom-up approach is claimed to be favoured as an approach within the various umbrella categories involved with conflict transformation, such as development, peacebuilding and conflict transformation itself. He also has observed that what is claimed to be favoured often does not actually occur. Indeed, the actual practice of some NGOs has been criticised for their political and ideological manoeuvrings under the auspice of bottom-up assistance (Bergh 2008, p.10). Bergh concludes that musicking belongs in the bottom-up approach rather than top-down since it involves cooperation, understanding and building identities (more on this later).

Furthermore Bergh notes that bottom-up approaches are more sustainable than top-down approaches but that they take a lot longer. Constraints such as unwieldy NGO funding structures and reporting requirements often prevent such long-term initiatives to take place (Bergh 2008, pp.15-6; Jennings and Baldwin 2010). While Bergh has focused on the potential and problems with music projects in the field of conflict transformation, he does not discuss in much detail the actual process of musicking and the potential of using this type process, or this form of cognition, in conflict transformation. This is what Lederach called the ‘turning point’ (Lederach 2005).
2.4.3 Turning Points

Many conflict transformation practitioners have mentioned that no positive conflict transformation is possible until an almost mystical turning point in the communications between the parties occurs (Lederach 2005). Some, such as Covey, Dziedzic and Hawley, link the term turning point to when it seems that a lasting peace is viable (2005, p.xi). There is considerable debate about what this is or how to exactly achieve it, but there have been a number of commentators who compare the process to achieving an aesthetic moment (Lederach 2005; Cohen 1997; Powell 2003; Skyllstad 2000; Urbain 2008; Urbain and Laurence 2011). Importantly the turning point is not the end but rather the beginning of fruitful negotiations. This implies then that aesthetic processes should have some access to the processes of conflict transformation, if not directly then indirectly. If an indirect aesthetic process or musical approach was utilised in conflict negotiations, then the turning point would have the potential to be realised in a more timely fashion than would otherwise be possible.

Most peacebuilding efforts focus on the prevention of relapse into violence but this tends to involve the interests of the elites on all sides and ignores the wants and needs of the rank and file. The general citizenry often feel elated when the violence ends, but are quickly dismayed and disillusioned during the early stages of peacebuilding when they are not listened to. Crime rates increase as does unemployment as soldiers are no longer needed and refugees begin to return. A functioning black market and proliferation of arms adds to the instability and often free market impositions exacerbate this instability as the breadth of the gap between rich and poor increases (Ramsbotham et al. 2011, p.202). This demonstrates how conflict could arise once again in such a situation, and it all falls within the Track II diplomatic category of psycho/social therapeutic applications mentioned earlier and it is within this category that conflict resolution practitioners often attempt to work. Additionally, it is precisely within this category that music has the potential to be of assistance given its connections to psychology, emotions and social identities.
Ramsbotham et al. have developed a framework for post-settlement peacebuilding and it is useful to include some of it here to illustrate just where aesthetic culture work, including music, can fit in. There are five categories, including the military/security, political/constitutional, economic/social, psycho/social and international. Each of these categories has short, medium and long-term measures to consider. The first three categories are purely practical and tangible and there is no room there for musical praxis. Within the psycho/social category, the short term goal is to overcome initial distrust, which, as will be shown below, music can help to do. The medium term goal is to manage conflicting priorities of peace and justice, and increased shared musical activity can help pave the way for productive negotiations on this topic. The long-term goals are healing psychological wounds and long-term reconciliation. The repeated practice of joint musicking can help this over time but the reason why thus far no musical project has helped dramatically in this manner is mainly down to the short duration that such projects are funded for and for the ill-judged approaches through which they were delivered, as will be examined below. The International category goals range from culturally sensitive support to integration into cooperative and equitable regional and global structures. International cultural exchanges form a normative basis between which sovereign nations establish themselves and identify themselves to each other and music certainly has an obvious part to play on that level (Ramsbotham et al. 2011, p.203).

The UN’s focus on the third category of economic/social usually involves the introduction of liberal free markets which has been seen to exacerbate problems and inequalities rather than help them (Mani 1997). Others have strived for local empowerment (Smock and Crocker 1995). Even grassroots interventions by NGOs are considered suspect in terms of imposing their western ideologies on non-western cultures (Williams and Young 1994). It is for this reason that many conflict resolution practitioners believe that more work should and could be done within the psycho/social category.

The psycho/social category is crucial for every other part of peacebuilding since the initial goal is building trust (Ball 2001; Ramsbotham et al. 2011, p.206).
Some have argued that physical separation is the only solution to peacebuilding after an accord ends the violence in an intractable conflict (Kaufmann 1996), yet this is rarely possible due to geographical considerations and the alternative is to attempt to reconstruct identities so that they are inclusive rather than us-them in nature (Northrup 1989:p.80).

Building on this is the trend towards truth and reconciliation which is perhaps best illustrated by the Truth and Reconciliation Commission in South Africa. There, as elsewhere where this approach is utilised, the stages are truth, involving revelation, transparency and acknowledgement, followed by justice or restitution and finally mercy which involves acceptance, forgiveness, compassion and healing (Kriesberg 2004). It is during this last stage that music could play a role through the forging of new shared identities. There is currently much debate about the level of cultural specificity required in these processes. The tradition as it stands is to incorporate a Western model of post-traumatic stress disorder approach which an increasing number of commentators suggest is inappropriate in non-western cultures (Summerfield 1996; Nordstrom 1995; Farah 2013). Others have noted the danger of incorporating only local processes since they could strengthen local systems of oppression, exclusion and exploitation (Pankhurst 1998). There is a growing body of evidence to suggest that small-scale often unreported grassroots conflict resolution practices are more effective long-term than third party interventions (Fetherston 2000; Large 1997), although some argue that this approach is far too long to be of much practical use\(^6\). In the end, the field of conflict resolution increasingly accepts that local empowerment is required for long-term positive peace and that requires, at the very least and regardless of the style of application, an increased understanding of cultural specificity and, therefore, indigenous tacit cultural knowledge.

\(^6\) From a personal conversation with Professor Sultan Barakat, director of the Post-war Reconstruction and Development Unit (PRDU) at the University of York, January 2012.
2.4.4 Intergroup Contact Theory and Prejudice Reduction

Another way to examine the turning point concept is through the lens of intergroup contact theory, which stipulates that under certain conditions contact between prejudiced groups will improve relations and reduce prejudices and potential conflict (Allport 1954). Broadly speaking, these conditions are:

- Equal status
- Common goals
- Intergroup cooperation
- Support of authorities, law and/or custom
- Potential for developing friendship

In addition to these necessary conditions, Pettigrew (1998) suggests that there are four inter-related processes at work during inter-group contact:

- Learning about the out-group
- Changing behaviour
- Generating affective ties
- In-group reappraisal

Furthermore, Pettigrew has suggested that the move from particular intergroup contact and attitude change towards generalisation must proceed through three linear strategies:

- De-categorisation (intergroup contact is most effective when group saliency is low)
- Salient group categorisation (stereotype change generalises best to the intergroup level when the individuals involved are typical group members)
- Re-categorisation (After extended intergroup contact, individuals may begin to think of themselves as part of a larger group) (Pettigrew 1998, pp.74-75)

Pettigrew points out that re-categorisation is the final state of interacting groups that is by no means automatic and may never actually be reached (Ibid, p.75).

2.5. How Belief Affects Behaviour

Plato believed musical innovations had the power to challenge the power of the state and should therefore be strictly controlled (DeNora 2003, p.3; Plato, Republic V,4 24c). Views such as those of Plato had been influential over the
millennia and as can be seen in such cases as British colonial restrictions placed on indigenous ngoma music in Kenya, Tanganyika and Zanzibar (Askew 2003, p. 633), Soviet control over Shostakovich’s compositions, Nazi banishment of atonal music, and the Taliban banning music altogether (DeNora 2003, p.2).

Music sociology tends to focus on the meanings felt and believed by individuals and groups when interacting with music and how this has affected their choices and behaviours. DeNora has demonstrated that music is considered by many to be a resource to be mobilised in order to afford certain modes of attention and actions (DeNora 2000). DeNora’s idea that music affords certain behaviours, recollections and emotions implies that a social actor has the ability to listen to a chosen music in certain situations in order to achieve particular modes of attention, to imagine pasts and feel specific emotions and that by doing so reinforces a sense of personal identity and social identity with those who might be doing similar things at similar times, or at least imagine that there are others connected in this way.

While DeNora’s earlier research dealt with the consumption of music, her more recent work in the sub-field of music and health and wellbeing has dealt more directly with active music production, which is linked to music therapy theory, especially that of community music therapy (Pavlicević and Ansdell 2004). In DeNora and Ansdell’s chapter in Music, Health and Wellbeing, it is noted how recent music and sociological research has influenced the theory and practice in community music therapy but it also illustrates how musical production can affect individual mental health. Ansdell and DeNora have pointed out that the very notion of health and wellbeing is socially constructed and that musicking can help to reorient someone from the dichotomy of illness/cure towards that of human flourishing (Ansdell and DeNora 2012). DeNora and Ansdell have researched how active musicking is performative of an embodied consciousness in relation to “an ecology of people, places and things.” (DeNora 2011, p.310) which demonstrates the influence of the social on the personal and how this process is embodied in the entrainment of physical response. Just how the influence flows from the personal to the social still needs to be...
considered, in order to understand how music can affect social behaviour via the affect on the beliefs of an individual.

Behaviour is influenced by belief (Fishbein and Ajzen 1975) and it is the belief in what music does for a person or group that influences the behaviour of that person or group, not the music directly. There are aspects of music which can connect to a person pre-lingually and physiologically adding an experiential dimension to the belief afforded by a musical event (Johnson-Laird and Oatley 2008). This in turn gives the appearance that the ensuing behaviour is directly influenced by the music, but I argue that there is the interim step of belief affordance that needs to be considered, especially since it is belief that is key to understanding identity and conflicts. DeNora has pointed out that musical entrainment is a process that bypasses beliefs through the physical act of matching a sense of pulse to others as a form of intrinsic contextual socialisation (2011) although this in turn feeds into a belief system regarding that form of music.

Belief affects behaviour and it seems that influences on belief are both pre-lingual and based on the memories of previous experiences, especially concerning emotions and a sense of identity. According to DeNora music configures an environment that enables a shift in consciousness or orientation and it does this through memories and music that triggers memory changes in the recipient physiologically as well as affecting recall. One can relive experiences, including past feelings, make temporal connections, and relate identity all simultaneously. For example, music can trigger a current emotional response from a past memory (DeNora 2003, 60). Hesmondhalgh criticises this aspect of DeNora’s work claiming that it does not take into consideration false memories or a ‘rose-tinted glasses’ view of the past (Hesmondhalgh 2007, p.338) but DeNora points out that memory is a dynamic medium that it is continuously being constructed and music is a powerful means to configure this construction (DeNora 2003, 61-82). Moorman and Miner have connected this concept through the term ‘improvisation’ and have suggested that musical improvisation is a form of social behaviour based on innovation and memory of
previous musical interactions which is analogous for any improvised social behaviour (Moorman and Miner 1998).

Adorno was again perhaps the first to discuss music in terms of what groups of people believed it meant to them and therefore informing their behaviour. He believed that habitualising music consumption objectivised music and commodified it. Objectification defeats dialecticism, as it is oriented around recognition and reproduction rather than interrogation. It makes assumptions about the world and classes and categories of people and the nature of things rather than engaging with the “intimate experience of things.” (DeNora 2003, p.5). DeNora has pointed out that Adorno viewed this objectification as preventing challenging cognitions and was easily subjected to external controls. Adorno calls this belief in the stable connection between ideas and reality ‘ontological ideology’ (Adorno 1981, p.62 in DeNora 2003, p.6) and he believed that this was conducive to actors to relate their specific experiences to general concepts. (DeNora 2003, p.6). In other words, by consuming music for pleasure habitually (the fetishisation of music (DeNora 2003, p.17)), the public was reinforcing the social status quo and was less able to engage dialectically with music in an effort to affect change within society; they would avoid challenging music that might raise their consciousness, through negative dialectics (Thomas 1989, p.161). New structures in music would be meaningless to them unless value was placed on challenging the structure of society. If the current social structure provided commodified music that was habitually consumed for pleasure, there is little or no incentive to engage in any other manner with music. Lilienfeld has pointed out that Adorno was not alone at the time in this view, as Ernst Bloch and Georg Lukacs also believed in this connection between the objectification of music, capitalism and consumption (Lilienfeld 1987).

Zuidervaart makes more explicit the link between belief, or cognition, meaning and action in Adorno’s thought by noting that Adorno believed that art was social knowledge with both cognitive and empirical qualities; belief and action in social meaning (Zuidervaart 1990, p.65). DeNora, meanwhile, argues that Adorno believed that in the modern era
“art had been stripped of its status as a means for knowing and, with it, the role of the un-conscious (or quasi-conscious) in knowledge formation forgotten.” (DeNora 2003, p.9).

This is perhaps the precedent for viewing art in general and music in particular as an ethnographic process in its own right; the process of musicking as a semi-conscious form of joint-ethnographic understanding in the sense that it provides a sub-verbal form of mutual understanding. Of course, as Bayoumi points out, Adorno seemed to believe that aesthetic knowledge formation existed only in the autonomous art and therefore autonomous thinking; knowledge formed through reason rather than accepting what is given. Art and reason are incongruous with the modern world, which is based on emotional gratification and consumption, therefore, art and reason provide challenges to the status quo. Bayoumi further suggests that this is at least one reason why Adorno’s writing is so difficult, as he approaches his textual writing as a composer, as art, and therefore his reasoning is artistic and aesthetic in nature (DeNora 2003, pp.10-1; Gillespie 1995). Due to this aesthetic dimension, his work, in his mind, should not be easily accepted or understood, but needs contemplation to fully understand, and perhaps requiring a turning point, an ‘a-ha’ moment of comprehension (Bayoumi 2005, p.53). Bayoumi further points out that the major problem with Adorno’s philosophy of reason is that the world is not currently, if it ever was, geared up for reason; people’s behaviour is governed by perceptions, beliefs and meanings attached to objects, processes and the actions of others (Bayoumi 2005, p.55). This ties in with DeNora’s criticism that Adorno’s work is too theoretical and ungrounded to be of much practical use (DeNora 2003, p.33).

As has already been discussed, music appears to link directly with basic emotions, both reflecting and evoking them. These emotions then combine cognitively to produce complex emotions connected with memories and a sense of identity. These in turn provide meanings with which to attach to this music that are believed to be true and real. Finally, certain modes of attention and behaviour are afforded by these beliefs in the meanings attached to music through this process. Unfortunately, capitalism is very adept at the
commodification of beliefs, which will be examined next. Attali has noted that the fetishisation of music and how it de-ritualises a social form can:

“...repress an activity of the body, specialise its practice, sell it as a spectacle, generalise its consumption, then see to it that it is stockpiled until it loses its meaning.” (Kent 2008, p.110).

Music is viewed here as a product that is consumed and as a consumable has little power whereas music as a process has more potential for social change.

Rice has made another connection between music, behaviour and belief when he observed certain cultures and their usage of music. The Navajo believed that music heals and that their behaviour in the form of healing rites reflected this and he referred to the studies of McAllester and Mitchell (1983) to back this up. He also claims that some Muslim groups believe that the music is the work of the devil and behave accordingly towards all forms of music (Rice 2001, p.23). He does not reference anything for this last claim, so it is impossible to determine which groups he means. Nevertheless, both cases demonstrate that it is the belief in what is real that influences behaviour rather than empirical evidence.

2.6. How Emotions, Memories and Identity-Work Affects Belief

If it can be said that what one believes to be true affects one’s behaviour, then it is next necessary to understand what affects one’s beliefs. Sociology and Psychology converge on this matter and conclude that the various permutations of emotions, memories and identities influences how one perceives the world, believes about the world and ultimately behaves in the world. The term belief here is intended to include religious belief, consciousness as well as ideology. While there is little overtly written about non-religious belief in this manner, it is a useful term for the purposes of this thesis. Music and ideology, for example, have been strongly linked together in Lily Kong’s study of cultural politics, music and resistance (1995) and Terri M. Adams and Douglas B. Fuller’s study of how music relates to the ideologies and emotions of the hip hop culture (2006). There are some writings linking music, religious belief and identity together such as Stanley Waterman’s study of the Kfar Blum musical festival in Israel that serves to affirm both cultural identities and religious belief (1998) and Jeffrey K.
Olick and Joyce Robbins’ work on the sociology of knowledge which has attempted to understand the processes of knowledge acquisition as related to collective social memory (1998). Tying these disparate angles together is the concept that temporally situated emotions regarding identities affects one’s beliefs about the world and the collective beliefs of a social group. What follows is an exploration of the writings extant on this concept with links to music.

2.6.1 Emotions and Belief

Basic emotions, such as fear, can be situated prior to the meaning-making processes (Johnson-Laird and Oatley 2008) which can be instigated by sound. This has the possible evolutionary purpose of enabling a quick fight-or-flight response. The associating of meaning to an emotion is a later cognitive function that changes over time depending on circumstances and stimuli. According to the psychological belief-desire theory of emotion as discussed by Rainer Reisenzein, basic emotions are non-conceptual mechanisms that monitor a person’s belief-desire system so that they are equipped to deal with the changes to such a system. In other words, emotions signal to the feeler confirmation or challenges to both their own beliefs and desires (2009). More complex emotions require the outward exchange of mental states as in the cases of shame, embarrassment and pride which is often labelled social emotion (Bernett et al. 2009). Building on this is the theory of mind which links emotions, beliefs, intentions and knowledge between the self and the society and current theories on autism and other mental health problems use this theory to explain deficits in this system (Korkmaz 2011). What theories of mind attempt to explain is how one believes what another is feeling which in turn influences behaviour and furthermore it suggests that this is an innate human ability (Carruthers and Smith 1996). This is somewhat at odds with the cognitive emotion theory as discussed by Lazarus (1991) who posits that emotions are derived from what is believed to be true about one’s world. This has since been challenged by the opposite concept that emotions determine one’s beliefs, at least to a degree. Throughout much of human history it was assumed that emotions influenced beliefs (Spinoza 1989; Aristotle (n.d.)) yet this has been a lesser-studied phenomenon in recent times. Frijda, Manstead and Bem (2000) have suggested that this shift came about with the Enlightenment and the focus
on empirical, objective thought and how the emotional realm had been considered lesser, unreliable or even undesirable. Regardless of the social reasons, Frijda, Manstead and Bem argue that firstly behaviour is by the strength of beliefs about the world which is fed by the emotions experienced about the world:

“...participation in physical violence or, at least, support for violent movements by one’s votes, one’s budget allocations, or one’s emotional support, is facilitated by the firmness of one’s beliefs regarding the states of the world motivating those actions, and that such firmness of beliefs is fed by the emotions connected to those states of the world.” (Ibid: 4).

Emotions as a psychological state have a direct impact on one’s personal beliefs but also about the beliefs about other’s emotions which in turn influences not only personal behaviour but group behaviour.

2.6.3 Memories and Belief

Similar to emotions and beliefs, memories exist within the self as explained by psychologists and neuroscientists but they are also shared socially. Tota, for example, has suggested that music and other cultural activities help define a collective memory of certain events. Tota’s interest was specifically in collective memory work in and around traumatic events, but this concept could be applied more generally. In her investigation into commemorative activities and collective memory surrounding a bomb attack in Bologna in 2001, Tota observed that, over time, people’s individual memories of the event became more and more associated with the music and other cultural activities that commemorated the event rather than with the original event itself (Tota 2005, p.298); individual memories had been collectivised through cultural processes. Tota is quick to point out that this process could not have occurred in this instance without the pre-existing collective feeling that the victims were mourned by the whole nation, not just the families. This led to an acceptance of the idea of a collective mourning mediated by cultural means (Ibid, pp.298-9). In other words, Tota has made the case for how memory and beliefs are reflexively related. A belief in a meaning associated with an event, in this case the belief that the victims of the bombing were to be mourned nationally not just individually, permitted the commemorative cultural activities to collectivise individual memories of the
event itself. This process in turn alters the belief in the present and strengthens, in this case, the notion of togetherness and that this sense of togetherness could be understood as a form of identity.

2.6.4 Identity and Belief

It has thus far been illustrated how emotions and memories are intrinsically and reflexively linked to both personal and social beliefs about the world. How this is mobilised into action and behaviour depends on the individuals or groups involved and just these are best described in terms of their identity. Identity as an object is a problematic concept being inherently unstable over time but as a process intrinsically linked to memories, emotions and belief it is decidedly more useful.

One example where music, identity and perception are entwined is in Stanley Waterman’s ‘Place, Culture and Identity: Summer Music in Upper Galilee’, in which Waterman discusses Russian Jewish perceptions of what was considered to be ‘Oriental’ which is essentially a cultural belief associated with that label linked to a sense of identity in turn associated with that belief. The music in turn is associated with both the belief of what the label Oriental means but also to the identity as a Russian Jew (Waterman 1998).

Beliefs have been shown to influence personal and group behaviour and that emotions both inspire beliefs as well as embed these in memories which can be collectively shared. Social groups that share these emotions, memories and beliefs are identified together. Finally, none of these aspects are static. This set of processes is something that has long been understood and manipulated by world leaders with a vested interest in controlling population behaviours (Cloonan and Johnson 2002). One of the ways in which such dictators use to control its population is through the control of publically available music. Musical properties have also been harnessed for more positive purposes which is especially apparent in the field of music therapy, especially with the socially minded community music therapy as pioneered by the Nordoff Robbins music therapy school of thought (Pavlicević and Ansdell 2004). There is much anthropological and sociological evidence that suggests that music plays a significant role in the social cohesion of any particular social group (Eyerman
and Jamison 1998; Small 1998) although this can also strengthen the borders between in/out groups, thus affording possible future conflict. Music has, on the other hand, also been used for torture, as was the case in Guantanamo (Cusick 2006), and oppression as was the case with turbo folk during the Bosnian war (Jovanović 2005; Kronja 2004). Music is often considered to be entertainment and entertainment is often considered to be a positive or benign experience and activity, yet when autocratic regimes use entertainment to distract a population from darker or more critical thoughts it takes on a more sinister edge. As can be seen it is not any one particular relationship between belief, emotion, memory and, indeed, music, that ultimately affects behaviour but the processes of relational changes that occur between them. I will next delve further into these concepts and how music has been shown to play a significant role in influencing these aspects individually and collectively.

2.7. How Musical Meaning Relates to Emotions, Memories and Identity
Music has been much discussed in partnership with emotions, memory and identity separately but rarely altogether. In addition, in most cases the music investigated was objectified to a large extent, where a specific recording or piece of music, or a style of music, was considered when determining the relationships between it and the person or people being studied. DeNora has discussed at length, however, the abstracting nature of music that affords modes of attention which could be any combination of emotional, memory or identity states and Pavlicević and Ansde have considered how this mental workspace could be useful in a therapeutic setting. What follows here is an exploration of how music interacts with these individual components, followed by a drawing together of the literature in order to better understand these relationships as ever-changing processes rather than singular objects.

2.7.1 Music and Emotion
Communicative theory suggests that emotions are communications and these communications are embodied first in gestures and behaviours that signal emotional states. This form of communication is pre-literate and pre-memory, as it is a current state (Johnson-Laird and Oatley 2008, p.103); ‘what am I feeling now’ rather than ‘what was I feeling yesterday.’ Basic emotions and their
outward signals are universal and can exist without any understanding of their cause. Complex emotions on the other hand arise through combining basic emotions with cognition (Ibid, p.104).

Like emotions, music is universal, yet some claim that music does not convey anything since it has no propositional content, whereas emotions are about something (Nussbaum 2001; Sloboda and O'Neill 2001). Communicative theory suggests that emotions can, however, be experienced without propositional content. Evidence suggests that music alone can elicit basic emotions but complex emotions require other elements such as lyrics, visuals, memories in order to make sense of it (Johnson-Laird and Oatley 2008, p.106). Some have suggested that listeners experience complex emotions even when exposed to pure music, but Johnson-Laird and Oatley counter that listeners subconsciously ascribe more complex emotions but this is not originating in the music itself (Ibid).

Ethnomusicologist Timothy Rice has observed that many musicologists view both music as an emotional response and music as social behaviour as metaphors (Rice 2001, p.23). In other words, neither the emotional response nor the behaviour are the music itself and therefore they are of lesser importance when attempting to understand the music itself. Rice continues to point out that many totalitarian states have been interested in controlling music production due to their belief in music's affective power to alter the public's behaviour in a manner that might be antagonistic towards the state. He suggests that totalitarian leaders might understand music's power "...better than even some scholars do, music's affective power and therefore the emotion that goes along with its interpretation." (Ibid, p.34).

In other words, totalitarian leaders believe in the power of music to alter and influence the behaviour of others through the emotions that it evokes, which in turn affects the behaviour of the leaders when they attempt to control its production. Rice suggests that music has multiple possible meanings laden with emotions.
“...rich with possibilities for ideological modelling and control and yet able, in many instances, to wiggle free of that control, either because of the uncontrollability of the electronic technologies in which it is disseminated, the multiplicity of references inherent in music as a semiotic form, or the claim by its makers and listeners that it is, after all, not a sign that signifies at all but an art.” (Ibid, p.36).

Direct emotional connections to sound and therefore music are deeply rooted in human instinct, therefore, but more complex meanings are derived from repetition of sounds and any repetition implies a memory of what has happened before.

The voice has often been given primacy as a medium for communicative musicality (Malloch and Trevarthan 2010) carrier of emotional meaning for both speech and music. Since choral singing combines both, it seems logical that the emotional meaning would be strong at the level of inference and transmission (Scherer 1995). It is useful, however, to investigate the notion of vocal primacy, however, as being culturally and contextually situated. Flewitt (2005), for example, has noted that the voice is considered the primary meaning-making form of expression in the British education system despite research showing that young children express meaning multi-modally, or through a combination of voice, physical expression, gesture and movement (pp. 207-8). This issue is even more noticeable in some non-Western contexts, as Kearins (1986) discovered in his study of Aboriginal Australian children who used non-verbal visual-spatial skills to recreate patterns more effectively than white Australian children could do verbally. Clifford (1988) echoes this sentiment by noting that the focus on authentic voices and their identities especially of Indigenous peoples is a hegemonic move that denies other values such as exchange of ideas, and that events are always mediated by local cultural structures (p. 344).

The voice is given primacy in the West, however, and both research sites are Western so it follows that research sites would have a shared history of vocal hegemony. Maybin (2001) has suggested that, in academic circles, the focus on the voice as a site of meaning-making can be traced to the social turn in linguistics and the linguistic turn in the social sciences (p.64). Scherer (1995) goes much further back, however, and suggests that both speech and vocal
music share the same evolutionary purpose which was to express emotions which is a "vital function of externalizing an individual's reaction and action propensity and of communicating this information to the social environment." (P.235). Scherer continued to suggest that, as a result, human singing should be the most prone form of music to evoke strong emotional response in listeners and that opera was perhaps the best example of this (p.243). Despite studies that show that the acoustic cues for inhering basic emotions are similar in both singing and speaking (p.245), Scherer has done little to examine how emotional attachment to a particular form of music is culturally and contextually influenced in the ways just considered via Clifford's work above, or how the cultivation of taste influences one’s emotional understanding of certain forms of music and that taste is influenced by social-economic factors (McCain 1979).

Recent theoretical developments in neuroscience suggest that music is a transformative technology of the mind, or TTM (Patel 2010, p.3). Music experience is directly linked to the brain’s emotional regulatory centres (Ibid, p.20) and it is suggested that music influences emotions through direct response to acoustic features, visual imagery, acoustic cues that resemble human voices, confirming or challenging expectations or association with past events (Ibid, p.22). These last two points link to the next section of how music interacts with memory.

2.7.2 Music and Memory
It is sensible to surmise that music and memory are connected, yet it is possible to recognise music as such with no prior exposure to it, and therefore no memory (Green 2006, p.79). Green argues that music is cognitively processed and recognised as music even with the shortest of snippets that could not be connected to any memory or social aspect (Ibid, p.78). Despite this perspective, complex meanings associated with music are developed over time, either within the music being presented as a temporal art or through the traditions and histories associated with the music, the performers and/or the audiences.

Leonard Meyer suggested that music and memory are so intrinsically linked that musical experience is not even possible without memory and that musical experience not only evokes memories, it can arouse other affective processes.
that can in turn operate independently of the musical stimuli (Meyer 1956, p.258). He points out that a great deal of musical appreciation derives from expectation, and expectation cannot exist without a memory of earlier relevant experiences (Meyer 1956, p.88). Meyer draws upon the memory theories of Koffa who claimed that traces of memories change through normalising (repetition leads to familiarisation) (Atkinson 2006; Roy 2010; Hara 2013), emphasising (a particular aspect becomes exaggerated when noticed), or autonomously (through inherent stresses in the trace pattern itself) (Meyer 1956, p.89). A piece of music that at first seems strange and alien becomes less so the more it is heard. Noticing a certain musical element when listening to a piece of music could lead to a person remembering it for that element, exaggerating the element. Koffa implies that the music itself has the power to change one’s memory through the intrinsic temporal properties contained within it. An element of music that occurs earlier on can lead to expectations and recognition later on, all contained within the music itself. Meyer also draws upon the law of Prägnanz which states that memory tends to complete what is incomplete or regulate the irregular. Meyer interprets this as meaning an unstable memory trace will try to stabilise through completing or regulating, otherwise it is forgotten. This has an implicit inverse relationship as well, so that not only does memory affect the understanding of music, but music affects memory itself since repetition of a phenomenon leads to familiarisation and belief about it which can then be affirmed or challenged with each subsequent repetition or deviation. This is confirmed by Paul Atkinson who noted in his ethnography of operas that much repetition was required during rehearsals until music had become internalised and second nature, or normalised and familiar (Atkinson 2006). In this performance context, however, the difference was that the goal of repetition was that of sublime performance rather than the making of a tacit culture, but the performers would not have been able to concentrate on their finer elements of their craft if they had not internalised the music to such a degree that it is in effect tacit culture within the opera workers.

As mentioned already in the discussion of neuro-scientific work above, music activates both emotional and memory areas of the brain. It is easy to imagine that expectations require memories of past musical experiences in order to be
confirmed or challenged, but studies have also shown that non-musical, such as verbal, memories are stronger in stroke patients that had more musical experience than those who had less (Patel 2010, p.17). While none of these aspects is unique to music, music is possibly the only human activity that does all of them simultaneously (Ibid, p.22).

2.7.3 Music and Identity
Levi-Strauss suggested that characteristics in one part of culture are reflected in another, for if they did not the simultaneous non-connections would be akin to a jumble rather than meaningful continuity (Levi-Strauss 1968, p.79). This implies there is an inherent sociality of music that is related to other aspects of social life, including identity. John Shepherd has suggested that if there is a connection as Levi-Strauss suggests, then it follows by studying one you can gain knowledge of the other. Analysing music, therefore, should enable one to gain a deeper understanding of the culture that produced it (Shepherd 1991, p.12). Shepherd only considers music in the forms of artefacts, however, and does not consider musicking as a process, nor did he consider the reflexive nature of musical objects, how the meaning of any artefact was in constant flux, and how the creation of music not only reflected the culture from which it came, but that it also altered the same culture simultaneously (DeNora 2000; Small 1998). Furthermore, viewing music as an object ignores the performative, visual and gestural knowledge and communication that occurs when musicking.

Nevertheless, Shepherd makes a solid case for the connection between music and social identity. For example, change in such societies happens gradually and infrequently and this is reflected in their music (Shepherd 1991, p.22). Shepherd suggests that pre-literate societies sense power and immediacy in sound and words that literate industrial societies find difficult to grasp; words and sounds are things, not representative of things (Ibid, p.28). Music absolutists in Western literate cultures, on the other hand, are visually

7 Musical absolutism emerged in the late nineteenth century starting in Germany as a belief that music is a “metaphysical entity, without genealogy or narrative.” (Chua 1999, p.3).
dominant and are able to abstract music into form and content. This process of abstraction within views of music enables one to see how the societies that create this music are visually-based and literate (Ibid, p.29). Shepherd is so convinced of the intrinsic link between music and social identity that he doubts there is a division between music and society at all (Ibid, p.68).

Shepherd notes that this ability of music to embody (and implicitly influence, mediate and form) social identities goes hand in hand with social change. Conversely, capitalism has a powerful ability to appropriate these identities and sell it. For a new form of music challenges the status quo and shows a possibility of new relationships that are separate from the current power structures. Capitalism elevates these musicians to star status and then sells their artefacts to consumers who admire the status, not the challenge (Shepherd 1991, pp.150-1). This ties in with the claims of Negus and Valazquez that identities are not just reflected by music but those identities are fabricated through music consumption:

“We get to know, or we are able to actively ‘construct’, our identities through the musical practices. There is certainly a value in this argument, both political and sociological. It does pose a challenge to previous essentialist assumptions, and it points to how we might get to know ourselves through music and how we can use music for the construction and communication of specific identities...An emphasis on the contingent and constructed character of identity can also show, in Richard Peterson’s (1997) terms, how ‘authentic’ identities can be quite actively and self-consciously ‘fabricated’”. (Negus and Velazquez 2002, p.5).

In other words, Negus and Velazquez are highlighting the strength as well as the risk of the conception that music can be and usually is involved with self-identity work. While music may indeed, they suggest, help create one’s sense of self-identity, the same self may and probably does actively and self-consciously consume certain types of music in accordance with these identity beliefs. There is no ‘authentic’ identity; it is constantly being reconstructed reflexively between the individual, the social groups that the individual belongs
to, the memories the individual has, or believes they have, as expressed, transmitted and influenced by mediatory devices\(^8\) such as music. Already it can be seen that the music and identity relationship involves memory, meaning and action, and beliefs and conceptions. What is not seen, however, is just how these elements interact together and whether or not an understanding of this matrix of social-musical understanding bears any relationship to the literature on conflict transformation.

Identity itself can be further classified into four categories: national identity; diasporic identity; cultural and ethnic identity; and temporal identity. These will be explored more fully below.

National identity refers to how citizens of a particular nation view themselves as a separate social group from other nations (Smith 1993), and there are several sources that illustrate how music has played a role in establishing this sense of national identity. Smith has pointed out, however, that national identity has roots in ethnic and cultural identity concepts. Ruth Adams for example has discussed how the punk music scene in England has influenced and continues to inform the English sense of national identity (Adams 2008). The Adams example illustrates how a sense of national identity can be fostered from the bottom-up, as opposed to top-down; punk was a grassroots movement based largely around music, but also common attitude and frustration with the status quo, not to mention art and fashion. Punk, therefore, formed a cultural identity that influenced the English national identity and, arguably, the international punk diaspora (Moore 2001).

Bujić discusses how questions of Bosnian national identity arise with memories of certain events, as in how a group collectively remembers a past event helps to determine their present sense of identity. This process forms a continuum of identity-formation, Bujić argues, that can be examined through the changes in

---

\(^8\) Hennion understands an art-work, including music, as a form of mediation that includes all of the associated gestures, bodies, habits, materials, spaces, languages and institutions. (Hennion 2002. p.82).
dominant musical forms found historically within the Bosnian region and the tensions that continue to exist between the different musical traditions (Bujić 2006, p. 73). This example illustrates how national identity can be linked to temporal identity. For much of the region’s history, Bosnia has not had an independent state nor has it a singular ethnic or cultural identity on which to draw. Instead there are specific instances throughout the area’s history where there is a collective memory of a national identity. Cobbled together these temporal identities have come to form their current sense of national identity. Again, this is a bottom-up approach, as evidenced by the opposing official national attempt to separate identities based on religion (see Introduction to Field Sites chapter). Alcock sums this concept up nicely:

“Tradition is not replaced by modernity, but subsumed within and articulated in relation to it.” (Alcock 2000, p.19).

Alcock continues to point out that identities may have some core “primordial” roots, the construction of current identities, in this case national identities, is a joint construction where some aspects of the primordial shared identities are highlighted at the expense of others (Ibid, p.314). This is a very clear way of explaining the reflexive relationship between memory and identity and belief and it is important particularly in the Balkans since many identities are believed to be continuous from antiquity and these beliefs were sufficiently strong to embark on a long and incredibly brutal and bloody war. The reality is that these identities themselves were nothing more than a social construction in the present (Ibid, p.323) and this (re)construction continues today.

Ethnic identity refers to the socialised groups based on ethnic similarities and cultural based on a shared past culture. At least until relatively recently, these two aspects were considered one and the same and continue to be so in many parts of the world. Arild Bergh has discussed how shared cultural identity formation had been attempted in social-musical projects in Norway and the Sudan (Bergh 2008). This is an example of a top-down approach where an organisation devised and implemented a project that purported to create a new sense of Norwegian cultural and national identity that could accept and include the immigrant communities.
Diasporic identity refers to a sense of belonging to a diaspora not bound by ethnicity or national boundaries. This often takes the form of separate social groups that feel an affinity to one another due to similar types of circumstances, such as the feeling of youth oppression amongst the “hip-hop diaspora” (Mitchell 2002, p.31). Luis Alvarez has also illustrated how reggae music has enabled a shared sense of cultural identity amongst many geographically and ethnically diverse peoples and they have argued that this is possible due to a shared sense of Diaspora based on common daily struggles (2008).

Finally, temporal identity refers to how one’s sense of identity changes over time, and that past forms of identity can be reinstated, albeit in a changed manner, through memory work (Hauser 1971). Sara Cohen’s study of production of place through music which follows an individual and their musical interactions within the city of Liverpool, shows how a sense of identity interacts with emotions and memory through music. “Jack”, who is Jewish, expressed feelings of stability when listening to Synagogue music which he feels to be “timeless” and having always been there. Conversely, some older women in his family remember this music from their homeland and it reminds them of this and evokes sadness at what they have left behind when they immigrated (Cohen 1995, p.437).

Summing up these four discussed aspects of identity, one’s sense of cultural identity is unavoidably situated within the temporal realm and may or may not be linked to a sense of national, ethnic, cultural and diasporic identities. Looking at any other one of the aspects, however, will certainly involve a sense of cultural identity. Furthermore it is clear that music can play a role in representing, forming and maintaining all forms of identity.

2.7.4 Conflict and Cultural Capital

It is worth exploring Bourdieu’s concepts of capital and how they can help further understand the connection between music and conflict transformation, in particular his concepts of cultural capital and symbolic domination. This is especially relevant to the tensions within and between the two choirs researched for the fieldwork, which will be addressed in later chapters.
Bourdieu’s concept of cultural capital points to the ways that cultural processes and artefacts, including music, can be understood to be part of a hierarchy of tastes, materials (forms, media, genre) and practices (skills, habits of consumption, knowledge) which in turn have exchange value in social interaction. The concept of cultural capital is further developed by Bourdieu in relation to three further sub-types as follows:

- **embodied cultural capital** is inculcated and assimilated over long periods of time, requiring investment, personal expense and sacrifice. It cannot be quickly transmitted and gradually becomes part of one's habitus (Bourdieu 1986, p.48). Those with more economic capital have more free time than those with less and therefore can invest the time in developing their embodied cultural capital (Ibid, p.49).

- **objectified cultural capital** refers to cultural objects that can be exchanged materially and economically but the importance associated with it is the symbolic capital believed to be embodied within it (Ibid, p.50).

- **institutionalised cultural capital**, such as levels of education, serve as a guarantee of cultural competence that can sometimes be exchanged for economic capital, dependent on its scarcity (Ibid, p.50-51).

Bourdieu defined social capital in terms of membership of a group or set of relationships that guaranteed access to collectively held capital and that the volume of this social capital was dependent on the size of the network and the size of the cultural, symbolic and economic capital held individually and by everyone in the network (Ibid, p.51).

Music, as an art-form, fits into Bourdieau’s capital model largely through the belief that capital is a marker of distinction; it simultaneously demonstrates membership to a class or group and fosters further belief in cultural superiority or inferiority (Bourdieu 1980). The hierarchy of art-forms and genres can change over time through what Bourdieu referred to as "sacrilege" (Ibid, p.266), as a way of breaking belief in old forms of value and creating new ones. The belief that certain art-forms and genres are somehow superior to others reinforces the hegemony of those with the economic capital to invest in time to develop cultural capital and to extend their influence via their social capital networks. To this end, there is a struggle for monopoly on power to consecrate these forms and genres so that they can begin to operate independently of...
market forces and remain dominant (Ibid, p.265, 268; Bourdieu 1983, p.320). Furthermore, this system of beliefs is dependent on the acceptance of the illusion that the field as a set of positions defined by the distribution of forms of capital (Ibid, p.311) is necessary for the cultural and social capital to exist (Ibid, p.353). More recently the notion of institutionalisation legitimising certain art-forms has been challenged by McCormick (2009) whose research has shown that status and legitimacy are more ongoing social processes that are, in the case of music, negotiated through performance.

DiMaggio's theory of classification further develops Bourdieu's cultural hierarchy concept and attempts to explain the maintenance of and challenge to dominant cultural hegemonies by building on Durkheim's concept of the relationship between social organisation and systems of classification and Becker's observation that arts classifications need to be continually enacted in order to persist (DiMaggio 1987, p.441). DiMaggio's theory claims that musical genres are forms of ritual classification that vary by differentiation, hierarchy, universality and boundary strength and that each of these variations are mediated by artistic production through commercial, professional and bureaucratic means (Ibid, p.440). Collectively, this system is referred to as an Artistic Classification System, which will be briefly explained below along with DiMaggio's associated propositions (Ibid, pp. 447-450):

- **Differentiation** refers to how many genres an ACS is divided into.
  - The more diverse the statuses in a social system and the greater the range of social networks the more differentiated the ACS.
  - The greater the structural consolidation, the less differentiated the ACS.
  - The greater the access to higher education, the more differentiated ACS.

- **Hierarchy** refers to the stratification of prestige and cultural capital within an ACS.
  - The more consolidated the status parameters, the more hierarchical the ACS.
  - The greater the degree of social inequality, the more hierarchical the ACS.
  - The more intergroup sociable interaction, the less hierarchical the ACS.
o The greater the access to higher education, the less hierarchical the ACS.
  o The more internally stratified the education system, the more hierarchical the ACS.
  o The more differentiated the ACS, the less hierarchical it is.
  
- Universality - The greater the social heterogeneity, the less universal any one classification is within an ACS.
  o The less consolidated the status parameters and the greater the interaction between social groups, the greater the universality.
  o The less social inequality exists within the ACS, the greater the universality.
  o The more universal general education there is and less differentiated the education system is, the greater the universality.
  o The more differentiated the ACS is, the less universal it is.
  o The greater the boundary strength, the more universal the ACS is.

- Boundary strength - How boundaries between classifications in an ACS are maintained.
  o The greater the structural consolidation, the stronger the boundaries.
  o The greater the status diversity, the weaker the boundaries.
  o The greater the number of hierarchies, the stronger the boundaries.
  o The more universality in the ACS, the stronger the boundaries.
  o The more differentiated the ACS, the weaker the boundaries.

These ritual classifications are further influenced by the modes of production involved. Categories made by the market are reinforced by the market. These may on occasion match ritual classification categories but the stronger the commercialisation, the weaker the boundaries (Ibid, p.450). Strong ritual classifications resist commercialisation, which relates to Bourdieu's relationship between institutionalisation as a means of reducing the influence of the market (Bourdieu 1980). Professionalization refers to how artists compete for status and material success (Ibid). This is more prevalent the more autonomous the ACS is, or the less commercial it is (Ibid). Bureaucratization refers to the art categories defined by the state that have influence on artistic practices through regulatory policies or public grants (Ibid).
DiMaggio’s theory is a complex method of how to trace the changes to social belief in the meanings of musical meaning and their associated social structures as well as how they are affected by various influences.

Dubois, Méon and Pierru (2013) and Dubois and Méon (2013) have used Bourdieu’s concept of cultural domination to explore the social context of wind bands in France. They suggest that wind bands are culturally dominated by more legitimate musical groups such as classical orchestras even if they are partially protected from the effects of domination through the maintenance of a specific cultural universe that includes strong local networks and a relatively closed peer group. Dubois et al discovered that the perceived cultural autonomy of the wind bands were challenged when the social conditions that protected them from domination began to erode; working class communities began to disintegrate and alternative leisure activities, such as television, began to grow in popularity. This perspective is challenged somewhat by Peterson and Kern (1996) who suggest that markers of distinction are not necessarily those of the traditional cultural elite but rather are more broadly associated with omnivorous cultural appetites. This theoretical perspective, combined with Bourdieu’s concepts of cultural and social capital, will be reconsidered in the Findings chapter when I return to the reciprocal influence of music and belief.

2.8. Summary and Conclusion

Music and conflict transformation is a young and nascent field that has many different approaches, yet none of them as yet can answer how music can positively affect conflict transformation for all of those involved. The primary reason why music continues to attract thinkers and doers to this field is the popular belief that music has some intrinsic properties that can ‘do’ something to a conflict situation. Evidence shows how people engage with music in this area, through identity work, representation, and even unpeaceful means, yet it is rare to find any research that delves into the how and why, or even if it is happening at all. This was also the conclusion of Arild Bergh’s research but where he found that result frustrating, I find it intriguing and even useful. The common thread through all the research and the practical projects discussed is that there is this belief in the power of music. It has also been shown how
beliefs influence behaviour probabilities so in essence, music does have the power to alter behaviour through its affect on belief. Since music can affect belief and therefore indirectly behaviour, why have the existent projects been less successful than hoped or believed at reducing levels of conflict? How have internal politics and conflicts affected the effectiveness of the projects? The approach to answering these questions came with an exploration of what was considered to make a successful conflict transformation process on the one hand and just how music affects belief on the other.

Conflict in itself is not problematic; it is violent conflict that is the primary target of conflict transformation. Furthermore, most ends to a conflict are not desirable for all parties. For the purposes of this thesis the conflict outcome that is desired is that of a win-win situation that lasts beyond any Track I diplomatic interventions. Track I and II Diplomacy still have their purpose, especially when it comes to directly ending violence, but Track III grassroots activity is required in order to develop support for peace plans and to change the attitudes and beliefs of any group, which is the reason why music seems to have a potential role in Track III diplomacy.

Music affects belief through its interactions with memory, emotions, beliefs and identities. This process has been labelled affordance of modes of attention by DeNora. While DeNora's model is extremely useful, it only explains how belief is affected by music, memory, emotion and identity after they have been habitualised, or have developed a habitus (Bourdieu 1986), through repeated exposure and experience. Prior to habitualisation new musical experiences are extra-ordinary events that both resonate with emotions and identities as well as challenge them and it is at this level of resonation and challenge that social change becomes possible. Memories are retrieved but equally challenged as music enables the mode of attention that highlights other previously forgotten aspects. It is during these musical moments that belief-change is possible. It is likely that individual events can change deeply-held beliefs on their own, but repetition over time does appear to affect belief change as new memories are formed, old ones re-imagined; emotions evolved through growing familiarity and possibly even the extension of in-out group borders. This process can result in
positive change but equally negative change is possible. The fact that there is currently more research on the negative aspects of music usage should not be discouraging, since it is shown here that it is precisely the same process involved. It also shows why most current music and conflict transformation projects are unlikely to produce tangible positive change since they have not been developed with these processes in mind.
3. Methods

3.1 Background

After examining a number of music and conflict projects around the world, I decided to research the inter-religious choir Pontanima based in Sarajevo, Bosnia-Herzegovina. Almost all projects that were investigated met almost none of the criteria (described below) indicated either in my previous research (my masters degree) or the literature (as described above in the Literature Review chapter), whereas Pontanima had at least met some (see Table 2). More pragmatically, I already had access to a gatekeeper for the choir through past experiences as a freelance musician with the London-based world music choir, Songlines.

From my contacts within Songlines, I discovered that Songlines was embarking on a joint project with Pontanima. After some discussions with Songlines’ leader, Theresa Kay, I decided to research Songlines as well as Pontanima. Songlines did not meet many of the criteria and they were not even in a post-conflict environment, but they did attempt to be inclusive regardless of identity and they have an implicit strategy for promoting peace through their music. I decided that researching both choirs would enable me to develop a stronger theory of how music can work in different contexts, how much of this work is choir specific or pertains to music generally, and comparison of the two choirs would elicit much rich data. Furthermore, it would enable me to temporarily join Pontanima and observe and participate from within as a member and the joint project would provide a unique opportunity to observe how the two choirs managed prejudices and latent conflict in a musical setting.

Pontanima was the primary research site since it was a community music project with an explicit conflict transformation remit. Songlines was the secondary research site that was included for three specific reasons: it provided easier access to Pontanima through the gatekeeper in Songlines; it served as a foil against which to explore the dynamics and musical dynamics within Pontanima; it provided data on how Pontanima interacted with another musical entity, including how they managed their own prejudices.
Vocal music is the focus of research for this thesis not because of an intrinsic value of vocalisation, as discussed by Scherer (1995), but rather because Pontanima as a music and conflict transformation project met more of my initial theoretical criteria than any other project known at the time. The reasons why members of Pontanima chose to join a choral group were down to their own prior experiences of that form of music and what it meant to them in their cultural context. As can be seen in the Findings chapter, many informants expressed this form of emotional communication mentioned by Scherer but there is no evidence to suggest that non-vocal music could not have been used if the context had been different.

Pontanima has been investigated a number of times previously by both journalists and academics, but none of fully addressed how the choir uses music as a conflict transformation activity. Jadranko Nirić, the spiritual leader of Pontanima, is a theologian and has written academic articles about inter-religious relations that mention Pontanima (Marcović 2012) but there is no exploration of what he thinks music itself does. Similarly, Zoran Brajović from the European Policies Initiative has written about the importance of inter-religious dialogue in Bosnia (Brajović 2006) that mentions Nirić and Pontanima, but only as an example of an inter-religious activity in Bosnia. Similarly, Craig Zelizer has mentioned Pontanima as an example of arts and cooperation in post-war Bosnia (2003), but he does not explore what, if anything, the music itself does for the choristers and audiences. This research differs from the aforementioned examples by empirically investigating how Pontanima engages with conflict transformation through musical activity.

Reflexivity is one of the key recurring motives throughout this thesis and this applies equally to the research question itself. At several intervals during the literature review, I was forced to re-examine the original research question of ‘can music play a role in conflict transformation?’ One characteristic about assigning meaning to music that became clear from the literature review is that meaning itself is a constantly evolving entity and can be many things simultaneously. It was therefore necessary to further define the research question since I was wishing to examine how music might have a positive role
in conflict transformation, differentiating my research from the areas of music and conflict, music and torture or conflicts that result in unequal or negative outcomes. Positive here also refers to a mutually beneficial, or win-win, outcome of a conflict. The question, therefore, evolved to become ‘can music play a positive role in conflict transformation.’

The literature review of conflict transformation theory required another alteration since it was unclear which aspects of the conflict lifecycle I was focusing on (latent conflict, open conflict or post-conflict). Examining how the literature of conflict intersected with the fields of music and social research, it was clear that the research question had to be altered to ‘can music play a positive role in post-conflict reconstruction’ or ‘can music play a positive role in peace-building’. Building on the theories posited by Christopher Small that suggested that active production of musicking would produce deeper and stronger shared identities than that of consumption of music, the question developed again to be ‘can creative-collaborative music-making play a positive role in post-conflict reconstruction/peace-building?’ After the fieldwork, however, it became apparent that creative-collaborative music-making might not be as effective as structured hierarchical music-making, depending on the cultural context. The question reverted back to ‘Can music play a positive role in post-conflict reconstruction/peace-building?’

No specific studies had been conducted at the time that touched on this question, so it was deemed necessary to conduct ethnographic research in order to ascertain what people in these post-conflict contexts believed music has done or could do. The very nature of ethnography, perhaps not surprisingly, is also reflexive as data emerges, understandings grow and shift, which informs future investigations, and so on.

There is very little academic research explicitly dealing with music and conflict transformation, with the exception of the Toda Institute book series, a handful of articles by Arild Bergh, Beckles-Willson and myself, and a couple of recently conducted PhD theses, again, by Bergh, Craig Zelizer and myself. This has forced me to find inferences from the other fields mentioned and develop
synthetic theories from that using the mathematical approach of set theory to organise concepts.

The majority of the literature on music and conflict transformation is anecdotal, opinion or focuses on lyrical content rather than music. Articles by Bergh and Beckles-Willson have highlighted these issues and their fieldwork has attempted to redress the situation. Still, these discussions deal with the consumption of music (Bergh 2010) or the difference between what is reported and what is experienced by those involved (Bergh 2010; Beckles-Willson 2009). There is no known current research on just how music might be used to assist in positive relationship-building in a post-conflict context.

Drawing on the literature I explored for my masters degree I developed the following hypothesis which I quote in full here:

“The hypothesis presented by this paper is that the creation of new music created through not only co-operation of the participants, but active and equal collaboration with the guidance of an impartial third party, would help to create a new cultural identity shared by the groups involved. For example, a group of Israeli-Muslims with a shared sense of achievement could reach beyond the participants, whereas a group of Israelis and Muslims who maintained their separate identities could not. The resulting cultural artefact would have the same level of meaning to both sides and the larger social groups of both parties since it would be created with equal participation. While other cultural channels can also help create identities, it is proposed that music is the most effective means with which to propagate and reinforce this sense of shared identity, building trust to a level where fruitful negotiations between the conflicting parties can take place.” (Robertson 2006).

I proceeded to engage with the literature on how conflicts are resolved, how conflict resolution and cultural identity intersect, and how musicking helps create cultural identity. These three areas were then combined and applied to the two projects already discussed. In the end I concluded that the projects ultimately failed to transform conflict, but they illustrated how it would be possible to transform conflict through musicking but only if certain criteria were met:

1. Both sides of a conflict need to desire a transformation.
2. A third party mediator is required to assist the process but not lead it.
3. The process needs to take place at the community level, not from a directive.
4. The process needs to take place in a neutral environment.
5. Music is a particularly effective means in which to conduct mediation since it can contain within it conflicting cultural values and power structure of the societies that created it.
6. New music would need to be created rather than listening or performing pre-existing music.
7. The third party would need to help the parties identify cultural and musical commonalities on which to build a hybrid form of music. This hybrid would need to contain cultural elements that both sides felt were equally important to them.
8. Both sides would need to collaborate as equal partners.
9. The form and style of music would need to contain equal power structures, possibly improvisation or group composition.
10. Once a new form of music had been developed to represent a new identity, it would need to be propagated amongst the represented communities through performances and education.
11. Passive listening is less powerful than active participation so education and encouragement of the communities to continue creating and performing the new music is critical for lasting effect.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table 2: Music and Conflict Project Comparison</th>
<th>Divan</th>
<th>Hip Hop</th>
<th>Pontanima</th>
<th>Songlines</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Both sides of a conflict need to desire a transformation</td>
<td>Y/N</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>Y/N</td>
<td>N/A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A third party mediator is required to assist the process but not lead it</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>N</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The process needs to take place at the community level, not from a directive</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>N</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The process needs to take place in a neutral environment</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>Y</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Music-making as opposed to music-consuming</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>New music would need to be created rather than listening or performing pre-existing music.</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y/N</td>
<td>Y/N</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The third party would need to help the parties identify cultural and musical commonalities on which to build a hybrid form of music. This hybrid would need to contain cultural elements that both sides felt were equally important to them.</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>Y/N</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>N</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Both sides would need to collaborate equally</td>
<td>Y/N</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>Y/N</td>
<td>N</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The form and style of music would need to contain desirable i.e.) equal power structures. Possibly improvisation or group composition</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>Y/N</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Once a new form of music had been developed to represent a new identity, it would need to be propagated amongst the represented communities through performances and education.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>N</th>
<th>Y</th>
<th>Y</th>
<th>N</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

Passive listening is less powerful than active participation so education and encouragement of the communities to continue creating and performing the new music is critical for lasting effect.

|                         | N | N | N | N |
3.2 Aims and Methods

I have a purely musical background rather than a sociological one, which has meant that my philosophical perspective has also necessarily been reflexive; as I was exposed more to sociological theory I became less focused on the musical material as an end in itself and more on the social meanings associated with musical experience and activity. I treated all philosophical and theoretical perspectives more or less equally until they were assessed for their appropriateness and usefulness. Unsurprisingly, I discovered that not one perspective would fully cover a project such as this. I therefore believe myself to be situated within an interpretivist/constructivist framework and I have used critical ethnography to collect data. This data has then been analysed and framed using a combination of integrative, conflict, critical and grounded theories in order to discover the actual in order to reflexively inform the possible.

Blumer stated that culture is

“...the acquired knowledge that people use to interpret experience and generate social behaviour” (1969, p.2).

and that

“...meanings are handed in, and modified through, an interpretive process used by the person dealing with the things he encounters.” (Ibid).

Interpretivism is perhaps the largest influence on arts sociology which is not surprising considering their shared focus on understanding and explaining the meaning of things (Alexander 2003, pp.2, 10).

Spradley claimed that in order to understand the behaviour of a group of people, their culture must be understood as closely to the way they understand it themselves


---

Constructivism here, also known as social constructivism, includes other categories of philosophy and methodology such as discourse analysis, deconstruction and post-structuralism. Burr has suggested that constructivism includes four basic premises:

- A critical stance toward taken-for-granted knowledge
- Historical and cultural specificity
- Knowledge is sustained by social processes
- Knowledge and social action go together (Burr 1995).

This thesis attempts to understand the meaning people attach to musical activity as a motivation for certain modes of attention and behaviour, and it is clear that my research was interpretivist using ethnographical methodologies. I am challenging popular beliefs about the power of music as a general force by demonstrating how its effect and affect are cultural and temporally specific and as a form of tacit cultural knowledge how it influences social behaviour, which places this research firmly within constructivist grounded theory thinking (Mills et al. 2006).

Given the idea that all meaning and the nature of the relationships between the concepts discussed are in a constant state of flux, it is sensible to conduct research qualitatively as opposed to quantitatively. Quantitative research would have resulted in sets of data that would imply independent facts which would be of no use in a project such as this, since ‘facts’ have multiple ever-changing meanings depending on temporal and spatial contexts as well as personal and group perspectives.

Focus groups were organised for both Pontanima and Songlines as an effective means to gather much data in a short amount of time. A focus group as defined by Powell et al. is

“...a group of individuals selected and assembled by researchers to discuss and comment on, from personal experience, the topic that is the subject of the research.” (1996. p.499)

Focus groups rely on “interaction within the group based on topics that are supplied by the researcher. “ (Morgan 1997, p.12). This approach draws upon a group’s attitudes, emotions, memories, beliefs and reactions in a manner that gathers more data in a shorter amount of time than individual interviews, as well as gaining an
insight into group interaction, consensus and difference (Morgan and Krueger 1993). The focus groups were usually conducted in a pub or a bar after a rehearsal and they were used to explore the research question (Krueger 1988), help generate hypotheses (Powell et al. 1996) as well as to allow for triangulation and validity checking (Morgan 1997; Moran-Ellis, J. et al. 2006).

There were a number of documentary sources that contained verbatim discussions with some of the informants in Pontanima, and Glenn Bowen's qualitative document analysis approach (2009) was used in these cases. Since the data was in the form of interviews, it could also be analysed in the same manner as the interviews that I conducted myself. It was also useful to see when certain themes were verified or contradicted between the sources. To discover and develop themes derived from the data, I used the computer-assisted methodological tool NVivo.

I was embedded within both choirs; Songlines for six months and Pontanima for one week. Ethnographic data was collected through active participation, observations made personally and via filming and ethnographic interviews. This approach has some similarities to action research as defined by Reason and Bradbury, which

“...draws on many ways of knowing, both in the evidence that is generated in inquiry and its expression in diverse forms of presentation as we share learning with wider audiences.” (2008, p.4).

Finally, from the beginning of the project there was the possibility of the two choirs meeting for a joint project in Sarajevo in September 2009

My research also draws on multiple ways of knowing, including musical knowing as a form of embodied understanding of musical phenomenon; evidence is generated in both inquiry and its multiple expressions through grounded theory and musical expression. There is a common concept within action research, however, that the research has a purpose for collaborative positive social change within the group being researched (Reason and Bradbury 2008, p.5). I had no intention of changing either social group and no informant was involved as much as to be labelled a co-investigator. I am interested in how this research may be practically applied for social change elsewhere, but this differentiates my approach from a standard action research one.
I needed data that illustrated how music was thought to be used and how effective it was believed to be in post-conflict environments. This data would need to be ethnographic in nature, since qualitative data such as statistics would not explain motivations, beliefs and meanings and, more importantly, it would not illustrate the reflexive nature of the conceptual framework. This combination of different forms of data was useful for enhancing the final explanations of how and why the informants interacted musically (Irwin 2006).

### 3.3 Summary of Fieldwork and Methods Used

Using Songlines and Pontanima together made for a tidy research project, with a coherent shape and structure to it. Effectively joining Songlines not only greatly increased my access to Pontanima, since they were engaged in a joint project, it enabled me to determine what data belonged to which characteristics. For example, data that was common to both sites would imply that there was a general principle at work. Conflicting data would imply more specificity. Below is a table that illustrates the common and different characteristics between the sites:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table 3: Pontanima and Songlines Characteristic Comparison&lt;sup&gt;10&lt;/sup&gt;</th>
<th>Pontanima</th>
<th>Songlines</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Choir</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Community-based</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Representative of the community</td>
<td>Y/N</td>
<td>N</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Liturgical</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>N</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Music from around the world</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>Y</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Strong authoritarian leadership style</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<sup>10</sup> This table was based on information found in the choirs’ own literature as well as my own observations and initial comments from some informants.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Y</th>
<th>N</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Formal</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Traditional structure</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>N</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Explicit Conflict Transformation remit</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>N</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Majority of members focus on the music and socialising aspects rather than the philosophy of the leaders</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Yearning for normality</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>N</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Majority of members claimed to have yearned for sense of belonging</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Majority of members expressed a sense of loneliness</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>Y</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Large age range</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>N</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Strong bass section</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>N</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A focus on precise singing techniques</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>N</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Expressive</td>
<td>Y/N</td>
<td>Y</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Improvised</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>Y/N</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Written music</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>N</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Aural learning</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>Y</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Friendships often extend beyond the choir</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Multi-ethnic/religion/identity</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Personal identity temporarily overridden by choral identity</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Secular</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>Y</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Whole group music-creation</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>N/Y</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Majority of members have found the leaders intimidating</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
at times

| Members have claimed to have felt a sense of unfairness within group at times | Y | Y |
| General enjoyment | Y | Y |
| Affects life outside group | Y | Y |
| Perception and experience of audience reaction positive | Y/N | Y |
| Positive compared to other music experiences | Y | Y |

From this chart I could focus interviews to elicit more data to develop a typology of community choirs involved to a degree with conflict transformation. For example, both choirs have strong leadership. From the chart alone it is impossible to determine if this is a key characteristic of all choirs, or all musical groups, or is it specifically community choirs that require this level of leadership? We can tell from this same data, however, that it is certainly not down to whether or not the choir is explicitly involved with conflict transformation since both choirs have this characteristic.

With my original set of criteria none of the potential sites could be expected to be wholly successful in positively aiding in a conflict transformation context, yet Pontanima had the greatest chance of success. Data gained from Pontanima in particular, however, led me to reflexively alter some of the criteria. Pontanima did not generally create new music, although they do commission new pieces in liturgical styles from time to time. They do not participate in a form of music that represents equal power structures. The average member of the choir has little or no say in how things are run, what music they learn, practice and perform, or what role they themselves are to play. There is no third party. They perform in extremely culturally laden venues, such as Croat churches, Bosniak Islamic sites, and Serb Orthodox churches. The music of the different cultures that Pontanima perform are never hybridised, with the exception of the ilahija, Islamic religious songs, which in their original form are male only and monophonic. These have been arranged for
Pontanima in SATB\textsuperscript{11} mixed choir format, which could be said to be a form of Islamic/Christian hybridisation of liturgical music. Although some Christian (both Catholic and Orthodox) liturgical music from predominantly Arab regions, like Egypt and Saudi Arabia, are also monophonic and male-only and they use the same Arab scale found in Islamic liturgical music. In these cases, only the words and subject matter enable them to identified as Christian songs instead of Islamic ones. They have two strong leaders, one philosophical and one musical. This in itself was a source of internal conflict, which will be discussed later in the fieldwork and analysis chapters.

All of this required themes and theories to emerge from the data in order to make sense of it. What emerged was a sense that the idea of equal power structures was a concept that appeared sensible to an outsider looking to reconcile two opposing factions. In the Pontanima context, however, all factions wanted to be equal but only under a rigid, recognisable and reliable hierarchical structure, but one that had enough flexibility to allow individuals to move up and down the hierarchy regardless of their personal identity. In this context they did not want to create a new shared identity, rather they wanted to recall a remembered past in which their personal identities did not matter. They looked to other parts of Europe and yearned for the kinds of structures and power balances they perceived to be there. Sarajevo had suffered tremendously during the siege in the 1990s and there is a huge mistrust of foreigners who claim to want to help. This explains why a third party would not necessarily be as useful in this context as local community leaders. Jadranko Nirić, the philosophical leader, believed that horrible memories and emotions caused by the war needed to be confronted in the physical spaces most loaded with barriers that separate the cultures with repeated musical normality. This was not by any means neutral territory. This approach is perhaps uniquely suited to Bosnia-Herzegovina since there is a cultural sense of a pre-existing collective identity that spans the three cultures in question. This approach would be unlikely to work in Israel and Palestine, for example, since the two liturgical musics have never been

\textsuperscript{11} Standard four-part choral membership structure (Soprano, Alto, Tenor, Bass).
heard in the same aural and physical space while everyone goes about their business as normal. This has led to the creation of a new set of criteria, although some, such as the desire to transform the conflict, remain.

I knew that many within Pontanima could speak English and that they could translate for those that could not. I was also able to prepare at least some of the informants prior to my visits through the Pontanima administration and sending them consent forms that had been translated into Serbo-Croat. For reasons to do with the practicalities of data collection and informed consent, and also with data management and to avoid the dangers of becoming over-loaded with data (given the time-frame of the PhD work), I decided against attempting to collect audience data.\(^\text{12}\) This could be followed in a future study. Instead, I confined my focus to the interactions of the choristers and other related members of the choirs. Data related to the audiences only emerged through anecdotes and impressions from the informants and is considered as it relates to the emerging themes. This is further explored in the Findings chapter.

\[^\text{12}\] The Ethics Committee requirement for all informants to read and sign these consent forms proved to be too cumbersome to use to collect audience data. The level of English competence amongst audience members was also unknown.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table 4: New Research Criteria Comparison</th>
<th>Divan</th>
<th>Hip hop</th>
<th>Pontanima</th>
<th>Songlines</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Both sides of a conflict need to desire a transformation</td>
<td>Y/N</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>Y/N</td>
<td>N/A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Third party consultancy to aid local groups and leaders develop their own contextual projects</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>N</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The process needs to take place at the community level, not from a directive</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>N</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The process needs to occur in an environment that does not provoke to the point of violence and this needs to contextually evaluated</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>Y/N</td>
<td>Y</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Music-making as opposed to music-consuming</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The context will determine whether or not new or existing music is required but the identities that are recalled, created or altered need to be positive and desired by all involved.</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>N/A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Third parties could assist with hybridisation which may work if new equally shared identities are required as determined by the context. Otherwise, hybridisation is not a requirement.</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>Y/N</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>N</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Both sides would need to collaborate equally or at least be satisfied with their status</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
within the power structure found within the music utilised

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>N</th>
<th>Y</th>
<th>Y</th>
<th>N</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Once a new form of music had been developed to represent a new identity, it would need to be propagated amongst the represented communities through performances and education.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Passive listening is less powerful than active participation so education and encouragement of the communities to continue creating and performing the new music is critical for lasting effect.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Repetition is key to aid in memory-related identity forging</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
3.3.1 Pontanima

Ultimately, this choir site was chosen not specifically for being a choir, or because group singing is involved, but rather for the abstract qualities inherent in the processes they engage in and the explicit remit they have as a ‘grassroots’ music and conflict transformation organisation.

The first gatekeeper for this site was an English man, Nick Turner, who currently lives in London, UK, who had lived in Sarajevo for a number of years before the war and immediately afterwards. He was a good friend of the founder of Pontanima and had been a member of Pontanima from the beginning until his job was relocated to London. In London, he was part of another community choir with an explicit remit to be inclusive and to demonstrate the wonders of diversity, called Songlines. He was helping Songlines connect with Pontanima to arrange a joint project between the two choirs. Songlines, therefore, seemed like a good second site for research because of this connection but also to determine which aspects of the research would relate to community choirs generally and which were specific to conflict transformation purposes. In addition, it would be ethnographically interesting to participate with and observe the interactions between the two choirs during their joint project, especially regarding any conflicts between and within the choirs.

Theresa Kay, the director of the Songlines choir, invited delegates from Pontanima to London based on Nick’s suggestion, to discuss the possibility of a joint project. In the meantime, I joined Songlines as a bass singer which enabled me to be in close proximity to the two Pontanima delegates once they arrived. In preparation for the arrival of the Pontanima delegates, I prepared an information sheet and consent form as required by the University of Exeter ethics committee which was translated into Serbo-Croat (See Appendix A). Before interviewing every different informant I asked the informant to read and sign a copy of this form. In addition to socialising, singing and working with these two, who were Kresimir ‘Kreso’ Lakoš (musical director) and Emil Celebić (bass and translator for Kreso on this occasion), I was also able to conduct my first interview with them. Based on this experience Kreso granted me permission to contact the administrator of the choir, Sonja Kolar, who I
was informed would be able to arrange a visit and the rest of my required interviews, attendance of rehearsals and concerts.

I had made an initial analysis of a number of the members’ individual biographies via Conrad’s 2009 biography of the choir (Conrad 2009). Conrad let the members tell their own stories with almost no editorial or authorial input, making this publication ethnographically useful. I first compiled a chart that detailed the choristers’ age, sex, national, ethnic and religious background and career (See Table 5), which I then used to shortlist eleven members that covered a wide contrasting selection of backgrounds, beliefs and attitudes to start with my ethnographic interviews. I requested that Kolar arrange for me to interview six of them during my week in Sarajevo. My plan was to use these six interviews to inform my future interviewees. Dealing with Kolar gave me my first taste of organising things in the Bosnian style. This was not done as such and every time I asked about it, the response was a rather irritated ‘No Problem!’ In the end only one interview had been firmly arranged before I arrived in Sarajevo. I was invited on my first day, however, to a choir rehearsal where I was able to meet some of these people and arrange interviews throughout the week accordingly. As I conducted the interviews, attended rehearsals and accompanied them on a mini-tour to Mostar, I encountered other members both new and old that expressed an interest in talking to me about themselves, the choir, the choir’s mission and the state of affairs in Sarajevo, Bosnia-Herzegovina and the Balkans generally. All in all, I conducted twenty ethnographic interviews during this trip, attended two rehearsals, went on one road trip to Mostar and a full day of concerts, and conducted three informal data gathering sessions at social events.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Nationality</th>
<th>Religion</th>
<th>Skill Level</th>
<th>Range</th>
<th>Role</th>
<th>Sex</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Bosniak</td>
<td></td>
<td>Pro</td>
<td></td>
<td>Pro</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Croat</td>
<td></td>
<td>Gifted Amateur</td>
<td></td>
<td>Chorister</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Serbian</td>
<td></td>
<td>Amateur</td>
<td></td>
<td>Leader</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>American</td>
<td></td>
<td>Novice</td>
<td></td>
<td>Music Director</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Slovenian</td>
<td></td>
<td>Solo?</td>
<td></td>
<td>Composer</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Canadian</td>
<td></td>
<td>ok</td>
<td></td>
<td>Arranger</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Private</td>
<td></td>
<td>ok</td>
<td></td>
<td>Accompanist</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UK</td>
<td></td>
<td>Novice</td>
<td></td>
<td>Admin</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bosnian</td>
<td></td>
<td>Soprano</td>
<td></td>
<td>Male</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Croatian</td>
<td></td>
<td>Alt</td>
<td></td>
<td>Male</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Austrian</td>
<td></td>
<td>Tenor</td>
<td></td>
<td>Male</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dutch</td>
<td></td>
<td>Bass</td>
<td></td>
<td>Male</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Greek</td>
<td></td>
<td>Bass</td>
<td></td>
<td>Male</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Italian</td>
<td></td>
<td>Bass</td>
<td></td>
<td>Male</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Norwegian</td>
<td></td>
<td>Bass</td>
<td></td>
<td>Male</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Swiss</td>
<td></td>
<td>Bass</td>
<td></td>
<td>Male</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Swedish</td>
<td></td>
<td>Bass</td>
<td></td>
<td>Male</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Turkish</td>
<td></td>
<td>Bass</td>
<td></td>
<td>Male</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ukrainian</td>
<td></td>
<td>Bass</td>
<td></td>
<td>Male</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Albanian</td>
<td></td>
<td>Bass</td>
<td></td>
<td>Male</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bulgarian</td>
<td></td>
<td>Bass</td>
<td></td>
<td>Male</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Czech</td>
<td></td>
<td>Bass</td>
<td></td>
<td>Male</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Danish</td>
<td></td>
<td>Bass</td>
<td></td>
<td>Male</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Egyptian</td>
<td></td>
<td>Bass</td>
<td></td>
<td>Male</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>French</td>
<td></td>
<td>Bass</td>
<td></td>
<td>Male</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>German</td>
<td></td>
<td>Bass</td>
<td></td>
<td>Male</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Greek</td>
<td></td>
<td>Bass</td>
<td></td>
<td>Male</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hungarian</td>
<td></td>
<td>Bass</td>
<td></td>
<td>Male</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Icelandic</td>
<td></td>
<td>Bass</td>
<td></td>
<td>Male</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Indonesian</td>
<td></td>
<td>Bass</td>
<td></td>
<td>Male</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Irish</td>
<td></td>
<td>Bass</td>
<td></td>
<td>Male</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Italian</td>
<td></td>
<td>Bass</td>
<td></td>
<td>Male</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Japanese</td>
<td></td>
<td>Bass</td>
<td></td>
<td>Male</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mexican</td>
<td></td>
<td>Bass</td>
<td></td>
<td>Male</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mongolian</td>
<td></td>
<td>Bass</td>
<td></td>
<td>Male</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Moroccan</td>
<td></td>
<td>Bass</td>
<td></td>
<td>Male</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Norwegian</td>
<td></td>
<td>Bass</td>
<td></td>
<td>Male</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Portuguese</td>
<td></td>
<td>Bass</td>
<td></td>
<td>Male</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Romanian</td>
<td></td>
<td>Bass</td>
<td></td>
<td>Male</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Russian</td>
<td></td>
<td>Bass</td>
<td></td>
<td>Male</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Serbian</td>
<td></td>
<td>Bass</td>
<td></td>
<td>Male</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Slovak</td>
<td></td>
<td>Bass</td>
<td></td>
<td>Male</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Spanish</td>
<td></td>
<td>Bass</td>
<td></td>
<td>Male</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Swedish</td>
<td></td>
<td>Bass</td>
<td></td>
<td>Male</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Turkish</td>
<td></td>
<td>Bass</td>
<td></td>
<td>Male</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ukrainian</td>
<td></td>
<td>Bass</td>
<td></td>
<td>Male</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>27</td>
<td>x</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>28</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>29</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>30</td>
<td>x x</td>
<td>x x</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>31</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>x</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>32</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>33</td>
<td>?</td>
<td>x</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>34</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>35</td>
<td>? ?</td>
<td>x x</td>
<td>1996</td>
<td>x</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>36</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1996</td>
<td>x</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>37</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>38</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>39</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>40</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>41</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>1998</td>
<td>x</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>42</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>43</td>
<td>x x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>1999</td>
<td>x</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>44</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>45</td>
<td>x</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>46</td>
<td>x</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>47</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>48</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>49</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>50</td>
<td>?</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>51</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Career</td>
<td>Origin</td>
<td>Born</td>
<td>From</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-----------------------------</td>
<td>-----------------</td>
<td>----------</td>
<td>-------------</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Theologian</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>1968 Sarajevo</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Musician</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>1950 Zenica</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dentist</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1974 Sarajevo</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Physician</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>1978 Tucson</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teacher</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>1976 Sarajevo</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Electrical Engineer</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>1966 Sarajevo</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pastor</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>1982 Sarajevo</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Graphic Designer</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>1975 Sarajevo</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Manager</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>1977 Sarajevo</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Physicist</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>1971 Columbus</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Composer</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>1933 Mostar</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conductor</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>1981 Sarajevo</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Physiotherapist</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>x</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14</td>
<td>x</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1959</td>
<td>Sarajevo</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15</td>
<td>x</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1953</td>
<td>Sarajevo</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16</td>
<td>x</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1978</td>
<td>Sarajevo</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17</td>
<td>x</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1953</td>
<td>Ptuj, Slovenia</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18</td>
<td>x</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1983</td>
<td>Zenica</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19</td>
<td>x</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1975</td>
<td>Sarajevo</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20</td>
<td>x</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1977</td>
<td>Sarajevo</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21</td>
<td>x</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1974</td>
<td>Sarajevo</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>22</td>
<td>x</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1976</td>
<td>Sarajevo</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>23</td>
<td>x</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1979</td>
<td>Milan</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>24</td>
<td>x</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1978</td>
<td>Sarajevo</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>25</td>
<td>x</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1948</td>
<td>Bosanska Gradiška</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>26</td>
<td>x</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1973</td>
<td>Chilliwack</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>27</td>
<td>x</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1973</td>
<td>South Dakota</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>28</td>
<td>x</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1974</td>
<td>Sarajevo</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>29</td>
<td>x</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1982</td>
<td>Zenica</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>30</td>
<td>x</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1979</td>
<td>Sarajevo</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>31</td>
<td>x</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1975</td>
<td>Sarajevo</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>32</td>
<td>x</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1971</td>
<td>Sarajevo</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>33</td>
<td>x</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1973</td>
<td>Zagreb</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>34</td>
<td>x</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1981</td>
<td>Zenica</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>35</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1968</td>
<td>Sarajevo</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>36</td>
<td>x</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>x</td>
<td>1973</td>
<td>Tuzla</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>37</td>
<td>x</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1950</td>
<td>Sarajevo</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>38</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>x</td>
<td>1949</td>
<td>Sarajevo</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>39</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>x</td>
<td>1961</td>
<td>Sarajevo</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>40</td>
<td>x</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1937</td>
<td>Sarajevo</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>41</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>x</td>
<td>1942</td>
<td>Belgrade</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>42</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>x</td>
<td>1979</td>
<td>Sarajevo</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>43</td>
<td>x</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1981</td>
<td>Sarajevo</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>44</td>
<td>x</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1983</td>
<td>Doboj</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>45</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>x</td>
<td>1978</td>
<td>Srebrenica</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>46</td>
<td></td>
<td>x</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1984</td>
<td>Zenica</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>47</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>x</td>
<td>1979</td>
<td>Novi Šeher</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>48</td>
<td>x</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1983</td>
<td>Fojnica</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>49</td>
<td>x</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>x</td>
<td>1982</td>
<td>Sarajevo</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>50</td>
<td>x</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1934</td>
<td>Osijek, Croatia</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>51</td>
<td></td>
<td>x</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>x</td>
<td>1942</td>
<td>Sarajevo</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>52</td>
<td></td>
<td>x</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1970</td>
<td>England</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>53</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>x</td>
<td>1973</td>
<td>Sarajevo</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>54</td>
<td>x</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1982</td>
<td>Sarajevo</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>55</td>
<td>x</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1982</td>
<td>Vitez</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>56</td>
<td>x</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>x</td>
<td>1966</td>
<td>Sarajevo</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>57</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1969</td>
<td>Sarajevo</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>58</td>
<td>x</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1952</td>
<td>Sarajevo</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>59</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>x</td>
<td>1942</td>
<td>Sarajevo</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 5: Pontanima Interviewee Matrix
Two months after this initial visit, I returned, but this time with Songlines. I had very little time to do extensive interviews during this trip as I was fully integrated into Songlines at this stage. I used three separate social occasions to gather data informally and I videoed the joint project during rehearsal, performance, and I wandered around Pontanima after the performance with my video camera asking informal questions.

Finally, I made a third trip a year later. The purpose of this trip was mainly to discover what had happened since my last visit and to complete the domain analysis with the informants. I had been hearing rumours of major infighting within the choir and that the choir itself was close to disintegration. None of my informants were willing to discuss much of this via email or other distance communications, so I had to return to find out. While I recorded these interactions, they were generally informal in nature. I did however, begin the contrast set stage of interview questions as and when appropriate.

The last part of data gathering was done via emails to confirm domains and contrast sets.

3.3.2 Songlines

The second site as already mentioned was the Songlines choir, a ‘community’ choir based in north London, UK that performs folk music from around the world. They are an open and inclusive choir that actively encourages people from all walks of life, backgrounds, beliefs and skill levels to join. There is a common belief amongst the choir members that music has the power to transcend political, religious, and cultural barriers, but they do not have an explicit remit or mission like Pontanima, nor are they comprised of people involved in any sort of conflict. Most do not live in the locale surrounding the spot where they mainly congregate which means they are not even really from the local community.13

13 For further discussion about Songlines and the label community choir, see the Introduction to Research Sites chapter.
Due to their open door policy, and my previous experience as a guest musician with Songlines, it was a simple matter to join the choir. My vocal range is that of a traditional bass which is a rare and sought after quality in UK amateur choirs, which also proved to be helpful in gaining access. Most choristers expressed a keen interest in my project and said they would be happy to help in any way that they could and often asked me about it. As with Pontanima, I sent all Songlines members an information sheet but since they had already given me consent I included an initial questionnaire to assist me in choosing my sample (see Appendix C). My sample was based on finding as many different categories of chorister with a variety of roles, length of time in the choir, gender, age, occupation, and attitude to the choir and its music. Despite the initial positive verbal response, however, I received only twelve responses. I assembled the questionnaire data into a spreadsheet, including my own data since I was also a resource from which to draw in this case, and chose the seven informants that best covered a range of backgrounds and experience (See Table 6).

While all informants were willing to participate, many were very busy and had little time to meet me for interviews. I tried where I could to make this process easier by travelling to their places of work and interviewing them over lunch. This process was interrupted, however, by my personal move away from London one year into the project. Since then the interviews have been sporadic simply due to access problems, although contact has been maintained and data collected via emails. In the end I conducted ten formal interviews, was a participant-observer within the choir for six months, performed with the choir in five concerts, went to Sarajevo for a joint project with Pontanima, toured Bosnia and attended several social events.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Sex</th>
<th>Age</th>
<th>Career Type</th>
<th>Years in Songlines</th>
<th>Skill Level</th>
<th>Heritage</th>
<th>Sarajevo</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Zelda</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>20-30</td>
<td>Unemployed</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Maura</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>31-40</td>
<td>Artistic</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tessa</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>41-50</td>
<td>Professional</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nicky</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>51-60</td>
<td>Trade</td>
<td>13+</td>
<td>amateur</td>
<td>x</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Derek</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>61-70</td>
<td></td>
<td>8-12</td>
<td>amateur</td>
<td>x</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Liza</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>20-30</td>
<td>Artistic</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Richard</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>31-40</td>
<td>Trade</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Katrina</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>41-50</td>
<td></td>
<td>8-12</td>
<td>amateur</td>
<td>x</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Noel</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>51-60</td>
<td></td>
<td>13+</td>
<td>amateur</td>
<td>x</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Charlotte</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>61-70</td>
<td>Trade</td>
<td>8-12</td>
<td>amateur</td>
<td>x</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Daisy</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>20-30</td>
<td>Artistic</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Theresa</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>31-40</td>
<td>Trade</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sheila</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>41-50</td>
<td></td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 6: Songlines Interviewee Matrix
3.3.3 Benefits of using two sites

Ultimately, the goal was to determine what musical activities and interactions Pontanima engage in that directly affect conflict transformation, if any. Ethnographic data concerns both choirs and it should be possible to determine which attributes are Pontanima specific or choir attributes generally. Researching Songlines was necessary for two reasons. First, to facilitate access to Pontanima through Nick Turner and through the proposed joint project between the two choirs. Second, Songlines acted as a kind of foil for viewing Pontanima by providing a glimpse into a different choir-world, with the aim of highlighting the degree of specificity or generality of the data gained from Pontanima. Thus, while the study was not intended to be explicitly ‘comparative’ the consideration of the two choirs allowed me to use the same methodological tools with the aim of uncovering the interactions of underlying social, and musical, processes.

3.4 Methods

Once it was decided that this study would be a sociological as opposed to a musicological one, it became obvious that the methods used would need to be qualitative rather than quantitative since I was interested in meanings associated with musical practices and motivations surrounding such activities. Quantitative methodologies are not as effective as qualitative ones at understanding meanings or motivations, since they focus on statistics that are interpreted by those other than the people involved in the social scene itself. As a result it would become likely that the final interpretation of such data would bear little resemblance to the informants’ own belief systems. Qualitative methodology, with its focus on meaning making and understanding the reasons behind social behaviour, was the only sensible choice in this case.

Within qualitative methodology I originally investigated action research as a modus operandi since I was planning to do two things during the course of my research: be directly involved with the scene by joining the Songlines choir and, through Songlines, sing at least once with Pontanima. Secondly, I was motivated to find a way to use my background as a musician and music educator in order to assist in conflict transformation in the most effective long-reaching manner. After researching this approach, however, it seemed that this would not help me to understand what
music currently does in these situations and how people feel, believe and utilise musical material in conflict and post-conflict environments.

I eventually settled on ethnography in general, and a dual approach of participant-observation and ethnographic interviewing. Ethnography is seen by many as a means to understand a cultural scene as close to the manner in which the informants understand it themselves (Hammersley and Atkinson 2007, p.6). Seeing whereas I wanted to understand what the informants believed music was doing, what they were doing with music and why they were doing it, this is a logical method to choose here. Participant-observation as an ethnographic technique placed me within the action, as it were, and helped me to understand the informants’ positions from as inside a place as possible. Spradley’s ethnographic interviewing techniques were very useful and this methodical method enabled me to elicit the symbols used in the cultural scene which in turn provided the tools necessary to understand the scene itself (Spradley 1979, p.6). If I was able to understand the cultural scene, then I, in theory, should be able to determine how and why they use music in that scene.

In the field, participant-observation proved to be the most effective technique when dealing with Pontanima. Once I participated in the choir as a singer they looked at me differently and said things like “you are a musician!”, even though I always told informants about my musical background at the start of any interaction. Pontanima were for the most part reluctant to participate in interviews but I was only turned down once14. During interviews I was often given the shortest possible answer. Very rarely did informants elaborate. For some informants, this changed for the better the second time I visited Sarajevo and it improved again the final time I visited. Nevertheless, some informants were quite happy to participate in interviews and handfuls were very verbose and generous in the information they provided about their cultural scene.

14 Danko Lakoš is Kreso’s twin brother and a professional composer and arranger. He had arranged a significant proportion of the music that Pontanima sings. He refused to be interviewed, however, since he had negative experiences of his views being misconstrued in previous interviews, especially those not conducted in Bosnian.
Due to time and access constraints I was unable fully to follow the Spradley model, although I did use his sequential interviewing approach where the end of one informant’s interview led to the second stage interview of my next informant (Spradley 1979). This again was not followed strictly, as almost every informant wanted to discuss some of the same details which I found useful as it provided a much fuller picture of certain space, events and feelings.

3.4.1 Methods for Pontanima
I planned to conduct fifteen to twenty ethnographic interviews during my first trip to Sarajevo, which was scheduled for one week in July 2009. I also planned to attend two rehearsals and two concerts. I hoped to meet the choristers socially as well, once I got to know them a bit. I then planned to revisit Sarajevo with Songlines in September 2009. Finally, I made a provisional plan to make one further visit to conduct additional interviews and observations to expand my data as much as possible. I knew that this surgical strike approach was not the usual manner in which to conduct ethnographic studies, but funding was an insurmountable issue which made it unfeasible to spend a great deal of time in the field. This is increasingly the case with current sociological research, as Bergh discovered during his own research in the Sudan (2010). With this in mind, I collected as much simultaneous data as possible using observation notes, participation notes, audio and video recordings, and informant-led research. This is related to a mixed-methods approach Axinn and Pearce refer to as the “micro-demographic community study approach” (2006, p.54) which simultaneously combines surveys, unstructured ethnographic interviews and observation. This approach has three particular strengths:

- “Promoting the investigator’s direct involvement at the study site, which improves data quality and enhances the researcher’s grasp of the social context;
- Providing multiple types of data, adding depth to the layers of evidence available for testing hypotheses;
- Fostering flexibility in the research process, producing insights and possibilities one method alone could not.” (Ibid).
As already mentioned, it was impossible to organise much before I went which forced me into a reflexive state right from the beginning of this research. I was often forced to think on my feet without the luxury of referring to my mythological notes or my handy Spradley guidebook. The result was sometimes ad hoc or ‘messy’, but accurate, as could be seen by asking confirmation questions and the consistent native language that was observed. Many times interviews went off script as it seemed necessary to follow the informants where they wanted to go in a conversation. It was only when I allowed myself to use this approach did the informants relax enough to give me insights that I would not have otherwise gained. Bell and Encel (1978) suggest that this approach is more common than reported, referring to the reality of social research as more “messy” and interesting than is often suggested in final papers. Wekker has noted that this approach is useful when dealing with the complexities of everyday life (2006, p.255).

Most of my informants could speak English to a high level and those that could not had colleagues from the choir to interpret for us. Inevitably in such a situation, there must be translation issues. As Spradley pointed out, there would have been translation issues even if we all spoke the same native language (1979), but in this case native terms were rarely truly native. One such example was the usage of the Bosnian word ‘inat’ which was essentially used to describe a certain sense of stubborn spite.

“Our say ‘don’t do that, I don’t like it’ and I say ‘well, I’m going to do it anyway whether you like it or not.’ That’s inat.” (Melita).

Despite this obvious language problem, the informants were surprisingly consistent with the English versions of their native terms. For example, every informant mentioned the idea of ‘normal’ several times in every interaction and ‘normal’ became a key domain that was explored further.

The term mess indicates the complex and unplanned manner in which a number of my research interactions occurred and it certainly indicates the chaotic unpredictable element that I felt while conducting the research. I feel that using the term reflexive/reactive is more conducive to understanding what really occurred, however. I had a plan for gaining ethnographic knowledge through participant-observations.
and ethnographic interviews, yet when I followed this plan religiously at the beginning, I would often get resistance from the informants and they often reacted negatively to the presence of audio and video recording equipment. Once I put my equipment and my notepad away and suggested we forget about my project and just talk, they visibly relaxed and would often chat in a far more natural manner. Most of my richest data collection occurred in this manner, letting the informants lead me where they wanted to lead me. It was technically more difficult to work in this way since I would then have to recall as much verbatim conversation and write it down afterwards, often in the early hours of the morning since these interactions tended to happen at night when the informants were available.

Inevitably there are power relation issues (Hollway and Jefferson 2000; Stanley and Wise 1983; Maynard and Purvis 1994) when conducting research in the field, but I attempted to minimise this by again by allowing the informants to lead me where they liked. I continued to respond by asking for verifications, descriptive questions, structural questions, contrast questions and observations and analysis of field notes. Given the time and language constraints, it was never less than obvious that I was an outsider and I was never able to obtain insider status. This created some tensions occasionally when an informant wished to tell me something controversial or potentially harmful to them should the wrong people find out that they had said it. Every informant was given a fact sheet about my research, translated into Bosnian, and they were assured that all information they provided would remain anonymous. (See Appendix B). The only other ethical concern was the possibility of traumatic memories being fore-fronted during the interview process. I decided I would not ever directly ask about the war itself to prevent this from occurring. In the end, many informants would discuss the war in the context of music and identity broadly to illustrate a point. The informants were always in full control of what information they shared with me.

An age old issue with any interviewing is that of memory recall and fabrication (Thompson 2007). How is it possible to tell if an informant is recalling the memory of a particular event accurately and how do we know they are not consciously distorting it for some personal reason? By analysing several interviews and cross-referencing with my own observations, a generally accurate picture begins to emerge, which
reduces the likelihood of accepting consciously fabricated or false information as fact. If such an intentional mistruth is discovered, it would actually raise interesting sociological questions such as why did that person, or type of person, wish to deceive me on this topic? As it turned out, I do not believe any of my informants wished to deceive me and this is supported by the evidence which tended to be fairly consistent. One informant, however, did have a tendency to exaggerate the physical dangers of Sarajevo and his own level of importance within the Sarajevo community, or at the very least, these dangers and levels of importance were not observed or noted in any other data except during interviews with him.

As for the issue of recall, as I will discuss in the Analysis and Findings chapter, the belief in a memory affords particular future behaviour whether or not it is distorted or faulty. Accurate memory recall is not necessary if the process can somehow be traced. The benefit of asking several informants about the same historical event should provide a general consensus or group memory (Halbwachs 1992). Where possible this has been comparatively analysed against outside reports of the same event. Where there are correlations, it was interpreted that these memory recollections were fairly accurate. Where there were discrepancies, it led to some sociological questions such as why are there such discrepancies and how has this affected their behaviour and how will it affect their behaviour in the future? For example, most informants discuss the Tito-era Yugoslavia with fondness, even those too young to really remember what the country was like and even from those who had not even been born during Tito’s reign. Not one informant ever mentioned the negative aspects to Tito’s rule, such as the lack of freedom of press and speech, or the systematic killing or imprisoning of political prisoners. It does not matter to the informants that their memory of this time is faulty or inaccurate, since they behave presently in a fashion that assumes their memory is accurate. This directly relates to my reflexive model of music, identity, belief, emotion and behaviour that is detailed in the Findings and Analysis chapters.
One final issue that was noted on this site was that of foreigner fatigue. Since the Bosnian war, there has been an endless stream of foreign interest in the region, from NGOs and journalists to the UN and NATO\textsuperscript{15}. Tourism and development have been slow to take off in Bosnia compared to Croatia\textsuperscript{16}, although there is an increasing amount of backpackers. All of this amounts to weariness when dealing with yet another foreigner asking questions. Some have told me rather bluntly that I had no chance in really getting to know anyone because they knew that when my job was done I would be leaving and they would be better off not investing any time or emotional energy in building a relationship with me. This was rather disheartening to hear on my first fieldwork experience, but even within my short visits, I feel I have developed a relationship with many of the members of Pontanima, although many more did fit this predicted model of distance.

3.4.2 Methods for Songlines

I planned to use exactly the same methodology with Songlines that I did with Pontanima as far as ethnographic interviews and participant observation were concerned, but I was privileged enough to be able to join the choir as a proper member for six months. This ensured that the data could be appropriately compared to Pontanima in order to determine what aspects were specific to each choir or more universal. Any similarities discovered between the choirs where the context, music, behaviours and modes of attention are different would suggest these would be general choral characteristics while the differences would highlight the influences of specificities. It was this experience that brought the deepest insights into how Songlines operates and how the members interact. It also provided its own set of unique challenges, however, which I will discuss in more detail below.

\textsuperscript{15} See the International Crisis Group report, Bosnia: Reshaping the International Machinery. 2001. \url{http://www.crisisgroup.org/~/media/Files/europe/Bosnia%2043.pdf}. [Accessed 26/11/2012].

\textsuperscript{16} Not a single McDonalds or Starbucks can be found in Sarajevo, which is something many Bosnians are quite proud of. Interestingly, however, some have lamented this, not because they long for McDonalds, but because they view such things as markers of development and eventual acceptance in Europe.
The first method was joining the choir. I knew a few of the members and the director from a previous performance where I had been a guest musician, I was a relatively rare bass singer, and I could read music. This last point would not normally have been important in Songlines since the director does not read music and she teaches the parts to the choir aurally, but since they were planning a joint project with Pontanima, the director felt it was necessary to have some people on board who could read music well to help teach the choir. This was not quite what I had in mind, however, and from the very beginning it became difficult to act as just another choir member. I was routinely singled out to either play piano to accompany the choir or lead the male singers on a certain song. Pontanima had sent printed sheet music of two songs for Songlines to learn, and I was asked/told to play and sing all the parts for the choir and also for a recording that all choristers could take home to learn independently. This put me in a privileged position and it took me a little while for the normally accepting choir to actually accept me as a chorister instead of the director's assistant. This finally occurred after one rehearsal when a number of choristers retired to a pub to which they invited me. Similarly, I could not conduct much research either within Songlines or Pontanima without the director asking me questions about what was happening. Another issue is that the Songlines director was very much interested in using me and my insights into Pontanima and Bosnian culture to help her devise the upcoming joint project and help come up with fundraising ideas and plans. This state of affairs continued for a month or so until I was invited one time in April 2009 to go to the pub some of the choir. There, after many amusing stories about the “tyranny of Theresa” and several drinks a single apple was divided into portions equal to the number of choristers in the pub in a peculiar but common post-rehearsal ritual. Upon accepting my slice of the fruit, one of the members now looked me in the eye and said “you are now one of us!”

Once I had been generally accepted within the choir, it was relatively easy to arrange interviews. In fact, almost everybody wanted to help and participate. I could not feasibly interview everybody, nor did I feel it was necessary. Instead, I decided that I needed to conduct a short survey to establish the different types of people that were active within the choir for at least a year, as Spradley suggested with his description of a good informant. Within that subset, which was actually most of the choristers,
there were a number of statistically similar potential informants, the most common being a middle-aged, middle-class, professional, left-leaning single woman who is not originally from London. To start, I decided that I only needed one informant from this researcher originated category. As the research progressed, however, I became a little more flexible since I was never able to predict who was going to tell me something interesting and relevant. Inevitably, my research-led categories were rarely if ever referred to as such by the informants, but it served as a useful starting point.

Despite being accepted by the choir, there were still difficulties in getting the informants to be natural around me, especially during interviews. They were friendly and helpful, but would often be deferential to me saying things such as “Well, I’m not really a musician like you, so you probably know better than I.” This attitude was widespread, which may have been good for my ego but not as useful for my research. This problem was caused by the director elevating me to a lofty ‘favourite’ position. This is an approach that I have observed with her on other occasions. It is overall a pretty relaxed environment and everybody tends to get along, but there is definitely an element of favouritism and certain people, like me, were asked our opinions more often than others. No one outwardly grumbled about this or directly mentioned me when discussing this, but I could sense it and observe slight differences in how most choristers talked to me. Some informants would refer to “favourites” or an “inner circle”, however, but there was no animosity. Interestingly, favourites and inner circle were not the same informant category, with favourites being alterable with time and the inner circle remaining largely fixed over time, with some variation. I, for example, belonged to the favourites at least for the short time I was involved with the choir. The inner circle, however, had been with the choir a long time, were perhaps involved with the management and administration of the choir, and probably long-term social friends of the director.

Another problem with this group of informants was their relative education level, which was almost entirely at least degree level and often graduate degree level. This led to many informants trying to guess or imagine what kind of information I was looking for and translating it for me. They would often not speak to me in the manner in which they would speak to each other. Meanings for personal and group actions
were often suggested to me in ready-made packages. I tried to emphasise my interest in the way they talk to each other, but invariably I was given their interpretations of the way they talk to each other. To counter this I had to cross-reference the interviews with native language samples gained from recordings and observations in the Songlines settings and scenes themselves. By doing this, I was able to determine which language samples were native language and which were informant interpretations.

While there had been little problem in terms of access to start with, since I lived in London about thirty minutes away from where the choir rehearsed, access became a problem shortly after the joint project with Pontanima, since I moved north to Leeds. Since that time, I have been in email and Facebook contact with most of my informants and have managed to conduct a couple of further face-to-face interviews. I have been to one Songlines rehearsal since I moved. All of my informants were happy to be contacted via phone and email for verification and contrast question purposes, which has enabled me to continue to analyse my data from a distance and without formal interviewing.

I predicted at the start of my research that Songlines would have been the easier site to research, since I was a native language speaker, could actually join the choir as one of them, and I knew many of them already. Despite this, I found that Pontanima yielded clearer themes in a shorter amount of time then Songlines was able to. This is down to the very different character that people in Bosnia seem to possess compared to that of the British. Bosnians tend to be very direct and sure of what they think and feel, and do not mind stating it thus. British language is often full of uncertainty and guessing. Often when I asked verification questions of a domain or some such characteristic, a Songlines informant would then guess that perhaps I found this term significant in some way and was possibly going to base my entire PhD on it, and therefore they had better improve or change what they said about it, because they would not want a whole body of research to be based on some perceived flippant (but in actuality, natural and native) comment.

There was the additional problem of interpersonal friendships and alliances within Songlines. Those within the Inner Circle were hesitant to state anything that might be
construed as a criticism of the director because of their friendship with her. There were other circles of friends within the choir, and they were unlikely to say anything controversial about them due to these loyalties. Others, such as Richard, had no qualms and said many controversial things. He is well known within the choir for doing this, and is seen as a bit of an agent provocateur.

Data was collated and compared in order to uncover trends. Where there were discrepancies I looked at these competing alliances and loyalties to check if they might be the reasons for these discrepancies. Further validation was conducted via email and Facebook communications with the informants.

It would have been uninformative to have approached Songlines with quantitative methodologies since they would not have unearthed these nuances of motivation and inter-relationships. A quasi-quantitative approach did help me choose my original informants, however, since I took a statistical approach to determine different types of chorister.

There was not much in the way of ethical issues with the Songlines site, except the usual power issues between researcher and informants. As with Pontanima, I promised that all informant conversations would be portrayed anonymously, although a number of them told me that they would not mind if we used their real names. For the sake of continuity and fairness, I decided to ensure that all names were changed in any references.

### 3.5 Reflexivity, Musical Ethnography and the Primacy of Linguistic Symbolism

My methodological starting point for this research was ethnographical since within the realm of sociology, and ethnomusicology for that matter, the accepted manner in which to understand a culture as it understands itself is through a series of open-ended ethnographic interviewing techniques and active participant-observation. I had used certain models as a basis of operation, such as the Spradley (1979) interview and analysis techniques and the Hammersley and Atkinson (2007) model for ethnographic inquiry and the Glaser and Strauss model for grounded theory (1968). In the field, it became quickly apparent that these models were just that: models. Reality rarely fits into models and my case was no exception to this rule. What
occurred in the heat of fieldwork was an instinctive approach that reflexively moved from methodological theory and experience and back again. It required a trust in one’s knowledge of methods and an improvisatory, even musical state of mind, in order to continue to collect data when reality did not match my carefully laid out plans.

The basic premise for this is one learns as much about a site and the methods to be used prior to the fieldwork, but once there, it is nearly impossible to refer to your notes or manuals or models while actually conducting the fieldwork. Hesitation while you try to remember something from a monograph on ethnographic interviewing techniques has only brought an interruption to the natural flow of a conversation, furrowed brows from my informants, and the possibility of losing the ‘connection’ that I had established, which in turn has led on occasion to a lack of further useful data being collected from that informant. Once I learned to relax and ‘dive in’, I discovered that I was able to gain much more data, although in a more ad hoc, unplanned, improvisatory fashion. This was the first time I thought about music as ethnography and vice versa, since this is exactly the state of mind I find I need to be in when I am in an improvisatory musical situation: I trust my skills and knowledge about music, my chosen instrument and the context in which I am about to perform, and then I consciously stop thinking and just do it.

Thinking more about this music/ethnography analogy, I began to look at the processes involved with both activities. What I discovered was a similarity of procedure which involved a reflexive relationship between identity, memory, emotion, belief and behaviour, along with the external mode of understanding, being, in this case, music or ethnographic inquiry. Both activities attempt to understand the others involved in terms of these relationships (more on this in the Analysis chapter) and, if this is the case, what is actually different? The main difference seems to be ethnography’s focus on linguistic symbols as the primary medium for meaning making within a culture, even when it is music that is being researched. In other words, a piece of research on music will be most likely conducted using language and written in a language. Music’s focus on sound symbols that are experienced pre-lingually lends itself to emotional or even spiritual sensations which are often difficult to express linguistically, which in turn leads to it being discounted somewhat as a
discourse of knowledge in its own right. Musical activity is a form of tacit knowledge exchange (Sloboda 2005) and a successful musical interaction is akin to a verification of a successful ethnography. If this is the case, then musical interaction is itself a form of ethnographic inquiry, especially if conducted by people of differing cultures.

Precedence for the use of musicking as a form of ethnographic enquiry can be found in recent developments within the fields of ethnomusicology and that of social and cultural geography. The practice turn in ethnomusicology (Rice 1994; Bakan 1999; Cooley 1997; Barz and Cooley 1997) has refocused attention on the performative aspects of musical processes, as opposed to the categorisation and analysis or musical objects. Mary McGann has referred to the methodology of phenomenological and reflexive participation in experience construction as a research tool as “intentional participation.” (McGann 2002). While this is still not a universally practised method, it is gaining popularity not just within ethnomusicology (Shelemay 1997; Myers 1992) but in ethnography in general (Jackson 1989; Beaudry 1997). Within social and cultural geography, there has also been an increased interest in the temporal spaces and places created during the practice of social and cultural expressions (Latham 2003, 2004; McCormack 2003, 2004; Smith 2001). Frances Morton is one who has successfully combined the practice turns of social and cultural geography with that of ethnomusicology framed by the non-representation theory of Thrift (2000) and practice-based research of music therapy, in her performance-ethnography of traditional Irish music sessions (Morton 2005). Morton’s performance-ethnography method refers to the active participation in musicking not as a means to describe later in a traditional ethnography but the embodiment and expression of a way of knowing and being in a temporal and temporary space that can only be experienced and understood at the time of co-creation with the research participants. Furthermore, these spaces of knowing cannot be accurately linguistically captured, as they exist within the musical experience itself.

Within Songlines, but also to a certain extent within Pontanima, I have had the privilege of singing with talented and generally pleasant groups of people from different cultures, both alien to me in their own ways. Pontanima was alien due to
obvious cultural and linguistic differences, as well as traumatic experiences from the war, while Songlines was alien inasmuch as the general attitude within the choir was middle-class, British, liberal, even "hippy", or as one self-deprecating informant noted "full of sitting around on cushions types trying to figure out who they really are" and that

"no one in this choir has a proper job, they’re all aroma-therapists or actors or whatever".

In both cases I experienced distance and hesitation with their dealings with me. Again in both cases, this changed through the act of singing together. Once we had sung together a number of times, a trust had developed as I began to be able to demonstrate to them that I did indeed understand them, at least musically, and therefore to a certain pre-lingual degree, their culture. With this trust developed, it then became easier to move to the linguistic realm and begin my original idea of ethnographic inquiry based on linguistic symbolism. With hindsight, I wonder what would have happened if I continued to explore these cultures ethnographically in purely musical terms and what would a final report or PhD from such a medium be like. In the meantime, I cannot report fully my experience of using music ethnographically, although I think I have illustrated some of its actual use and hinted at its possibilities. Furthermore, I will connect this theory in the Analysis chapter with the theory of conflict transformation itself. Finally, I will propose a potential manner in which this method of gaining ethnographic understanding of a culture could be directly useful in conflict prevention and post-conflict peace-building initiatives.

3.6 Fieldwork

This research used the study of two quite different choirs in order to determine what aspects of a chorister’s musical experiences may be due to social processes, general musical processes, choir-specific processes, or site specific processes. Pontanima had an explicit conflict transformation remit and all the members either directly experienced the traumas of violent conflict, as both victims and participants, or, indirectly in the form of shadowy collective memories. Songlines, on the other hand, provided a useful foil, having no explicit remit and having operational characteristics that are far removed from those of Pontanima. In addition, researching Songlines using the same methodological and empirical approach was
useful for discovering what aspects of the data were site-specific. In general, music is very site-specific and any general applications by necessity become highly abstracted in order to be mobilised in other contexts.

Pontanima has been heralded by so many foreign media outlets as a successful collaboration between Serbian, Bosniak and Croatian cultures, not to mention to the conspicuously absent Jewish culture, that many choristers are very used to giving stock answers to foreign journalists or even academics. One informant, however, told me early on that:

“You will never be part of us. You come here, you do your job, you go. We will help you if we can, because Fra Jadranko asked us to and we will be polite, but do not try to be one of us.” (Melita).

This was a helpful insight, if a bit difficult to accept. This was overcome only by active participation in their musical activities and socialising after rehearsals and concerts. Due to financial constraints, I was unable to spend very long in Sarajevo at any one time, which compounded this problem. While there was a significant portion of the choir that I was never able to engage with, I was eventually able to break down these barriers and gain richer detail. By the end of my field work, Melita later informed me: “You are one of us now, you are my friend.” Songlines, as already mentioned, did not suffer from these difficulties and I was able to be an active member of that choir for six months\(^\text{17}\).

Active participation in both choirs was necessary in order to access members’ trust and to show that I could relate to the musical material in a similar manner to how they related to it. In addition, it enabled me to draw upon my own experiences singing with both groups as a valid data source, especially when combined with other ethnographic methods. Reactions to my research in Pontanima first ranged from the semi-hostile (“I do not want to be interviewed or be any part any project; I come here to sing.”) to the semi-enthusiastic (“I find your project really interesting.”)

\(^{\text{17}}\) Although I was also informed that “You are one of us, now” by one Songlines informant after one social gathering after a rehearsal.
and within Songlines from the vaguely interested (“That sounds interesting, I guess.”) to the very enthusiastic (“Wow! That sounds amazing!”). What these reactions do not tell us yet is how many of these reactions, both negative and positive, come from a more general cultural attitude towards such projects, although there is evidence to suggest that war- and foreigner-weary Bosnians are less outwardly enthusiastic about much compared with the leftwing middle classes found within Songlines.

After a discussion with Nick and Theresa, it was agreed that a joint project involving both Songlines and Pontanima would be an excellent collaboration between two very different choirs that nonetheless shared a similar attitude towards music and peaceful interactions. Theresa went to Sarajevo to meet Pontanima and she was very impressed not just with the quality of the music they produced but also by their story and mission statement. Kreso and Emil were invited by Songlines to visit London, meet Songlines and discuss further plans of action. By this time the power relationships between the choirs began to emerge. Pontanima is a classically trained choir where all members can read musical notation and their execution is precise and controlled, yet emotional and passionate. Songlines is a choir of trained and untrained singers and musical literacy is not only not required (even Theresa had limited musical notation reading skills), it is shunned in favour of adlibbing and oral/aural transmission of musical lines.

It was planned that I would travel to Sarajevo with Songlines and act as a member of Songlines for the joint project, but it was understood by Theresa and the rest of the choir that I would also be interacting with Pontanima separately on occasion. The data collection for this part of the research was to be primarily through participation-observation as well as ad hoc interviewing as time and circumstances permitted. I had a video camera that was set up in the corner of the room to capture events such as the workshop and the concert which was analysed later. I planned to carry around the camera to capture the social events that were planned for after the concert.

3.7 Additional Research

In addition to the participant-observations, musical ethnography and ethnographic interviews, I also listened to all of the Pontanima recordings, I attended many social
events from both choirs, and performed with them as a bass singer. Below is a list of all of these activities:

- Listening to Pontanima and Songlines recordings
- Reading popular media reports on Pontanima and Songlines
- Attending pub sessions with Songlines and Pontanima after rehearsals
- Attending fundraisers for Songlines
- Attending other music events involving Songlines and Pontanima members outside of the choir
- Observing Sevda singers in Mostar and discussing their role in post-conflict Bosnia
- Talking with academic in international relations and post-conflict reconstruction
- Meeting musicians, sociologists and political activists in areas of conflict, such as Egypt, Libya and Tunisia, and discussing the role of music in those contexts.

3.8 Data Analysis

Most current research on music and conflict transformation is anecdotal, theoretical or not sociological enough in order to answer the question about if and how music can be used positively to affect conflict situations. As a result, I decided that a grounded theory approach would be the most useful analysis method since the theory emerges from empirical evidence (Charmaz 2006). I predicted at the beginning of the project that no research site would be wholly successful since none of them met my predefined set of criteria. These two elements to the research project were at odds with each other, since grounded theory should not have a theoretical set of criteria prior to research. To overcome this issue, I have essentially tailored the grounded theory approach to take into account my theoretical framework that I had previously developed, but this framework was constantly revisited and altered reflexively as more data was retrieved and analysed using a grounded theory approach.

The primary example of how this reflexive methodological mechanism worked occurred on my first day of field work in Sarajevo. Armed with my set of criteria, including one which led me to believe that the most effective musical intervention in a post-conflict reconstruction setting would be an active and creative group effort with a flat hierarchy, I believed that Pontanima would prove to be unsuccessful in its
conflict transformation efforts since it was a strictly hierarchical group where most of the participants were not actively creative. I was proved somewhat wrong, since the members felt very strongly about the music they sang, and newly created music would have been unlikely to have the same resonance. This in turn led me not only to alter that criterion but it also eventually connected the new set of criteria to an emerging theory of reflexivity between music, identity, memory, emotion and belief.

In both the Charmaz and Spradley models of conducting ethnographic research and analysing the data with a grounded theoretical approach, saturation is considered to be the ideal condition of completed research (Bowen 2008). In the case of Spradley, saturation was required in order to sufficiently and accurately conduct ethnography of a certain group. For Charmaz, it was to ensure that a newly emerging theory was effectively supported by the evidence. The purpose of this research was not to conduct a full ethnography of either choir, but to use the same methods to gain insight into what the informants did and why they did it in these contexts. It is for this reason that Spradley’s saturation techniques were not required. The emerging grounded theory was constantly reflexively used to interact with the existing theory, which meant that as evidence grew, the case for altering theory became stronger and more convincing, but saturation was not necessarily required as long as some new evidence-based theory became possible (O'Reilly and Parker 2013). Finally, saturation was not technically feasible within the Pontanima site given the sporadic and brief nature of the field work.

As my research progressed, I continually made research memos about what I experienced, witnessed and felt. These memos fed directly into my findings later on. I also kept an ethnographic research log which detailed as much as possible all data that was collected through my interviews, recordings and videos. This memo-taking enabled me to keep track of potential themes as they emerged and influenced data collection in a reflexive nature, as I switched from data collection and analysis as per the Spradley model. For example, during my initial interviews with Pontanima, I noted that many informants often referred to a notion of what was considered to be ‘normal’. I began to make memos about these occurrences. Tracing this normality concept eventually led to an understanding of how a sense of normality was tied into my emerging theory of identity, memory, belief and emotion.
I presented the material found within these memos and notes several times at international sociological and musicological conferences around Europe. This was a useful manner in which to consolidate my notes into coherent narratives. Once structured into narratives, it became easier to connect my research to the literature and examine any discrepancies or gaps. This was very useful in ascertaining where precisely the literature was wanting, as well as highlighting where my own research and emerging theory needed further exploration.

Each initial interview was transcribed fully in order to best search for thematic words. Following Spradley’s model, a small sample from an interview was coded first in order to ground the research, but then searches for the coded words were conducted throughout all interviews. Subsequent interviews were listened to and the sections that were relevant to the emerging theories were transcribed and the rest of the interview annotated.

Data that was relevant to my research was first grouped and coded and kept on the coding software NVivo. Codes that were similar were then grouped together; for example, the codes churches, Islamic schools, Synagogues in Pontanima all became part of the wider category of ‘Religious Performance Spaces.’ Once these general codes were in place, I then drilled down deeper into the data using Spradley’s model in order to develop domain analyses. From this more elaborate coding, I was able to draw coherent narratives out for the Findings chapter.

The additional material that I collected through recordings, videos and popular media was not always coded in the same manner, as they were used for additional illustrative purposes. One exception was the biographical book by Conrad (2009) which contained auto-biographical statements from many of my informants. Conrad’s book proved invaluable in order to get a sense of the choir and its members but also to have a basic understanding of their background and history before I met them. It also enabled me to bypass many introductory questions and spend most of our time together asking more probing questions related to my research question.

3.9 Critical Reflection

As an interpretivist/constructivist, I was not assuming that the data spoke for itself outside any influence or interpretation from my own bias. The very nature of
observation affected the object of study, as the Hawthorn Effect demonstrated when behavioural changes in those being observed were introduced by the act of observation itself (French 1950). Interpretivism implies that in order to understand the meanings behind people’s actions, you need to attempt to understand them as they understand themselves. This is, of course, why I chose ethnography as a tool in this case. Since social reality is deemed to be a subjective construction based on interpretation and interaction, my own reality as a researcher was also constructed in this manner. Similarly, constructivism implies that social reality is constructed dynamically through social transactions involving ongoing interpretations and knowledge. This implies that awareness of the social process and one’s past experiences affects the current and future social reality. With this in mind, it is important to divulge my own bias and how it may have affected the research process (Ogden 2008).

I have a background as a musician with a conservatory-style music education, which tended to favour, at least in the 1980s and 1990s, positivist thinking; music was considered to be a closed system unaffected by social or other non-musical considerations. While I never really believed this point of view, I maintain that music is an important phenomenon that is beyond that of consumerism or entertainment. This bias has led me to look for how music can have an effect in the social realm, but I have attempted to back up any claims in this sphere with empirical evidence where I can. Being a musician has enabled me to gain the sort of access to both research sites that would have been difficult otherwise. This was especially true in Pontanima: when I ‘proved’ myself by singing with them competently, many began to open up to me for the first time. Finally, my own matrix of memory, emotion, belief and identity has led me to continue to look for the possible as opposed to the evidence. There remains little evidence directly to support my theories of how music could positively affect conflict transformation yet there is also no evidence to support the notion that it is impossible. If I did not have the strength of feeling and belief that this was possible, and also the memory of feeling that I have already in some way experienced this as a musician already, I would have probably concluded something rather more negative.
My position as a musician is at odds with Bergh’s investigation into his own biases during his research into music and conflict transformation. Bergh was a journalist and not a musician, which he claimed was an asset since he had observed on many occasions how musicians exaggerated their claims for the magical properties of music or how effective it was in a given situation. To say that musicians are not best placed to explain their own experiences within the medium is to fail to understand the medium itself. Discussions and writings about music are translations of experience, and many musicians are not as adept at this type of translation for sociologically-minded audiences. Musicians are at the very least adept at the medium of music, and if they are able to communicate tacit knowledge, a sense of belonging and the projection of new identities without the aid of linguistic statements and explanations, then their lack of translation skills should not discredit them. Musical understanding itself is a form of data and the interpretive tool is the expression and experience of the medium. There remains a translation issue between musical experience and the written explanation, and I would argue that ultimately it is an unnecessary one. Just as an ethnographer attempts to translate as little as possible in order to maintain authenticity and clarity of meaning, so should a musical social researcher. Having a musical background, therefore, is beneficial to musical social research by the very nature of its bias.

The research design was evaluated according to Charmaz’s concept of practical concerns for non-academics (2006, pp.182-183). In this case, the question was ‘will the outcomes of this research be of practical use for those involved in musical reconstruction and development projects?’ In order to answer this question, Lincoln and Denzin (2000, p.21) have suggested that the research must be credible, transferable, dependable and confirmable. I have attempted to ensure credibility by designing the research using accepted sociological tools that are both dependable and confirmable. One of the major points of this research is that effective music usage in social change projects is very context-specific and therefore not readily transferable as a contained set of instructions, sounds, or objects, but the abstracted processes of how music intersects with notions of identity, memory, emotion and belief at the personal and social levels is transferable to any context.
Before research could begin, I had to submit a research proposal to the University of Exeter’s ethics committee (See Appendix D). Following the suggested guidelines, I originally intended to hand out information sheets and consent forms to every informant prior to interviewing them. I had these sheets translated into Serbo-Croat for the Bosnians. Also as suggested I stated that all data would remain confidential and anonymous. This strict formal approach created a barrier which was at times difficult to surpass, which was discussed by Davison et al. (2008). As a result, for many later interviews I obtained verbal permission from informants after verbally explaining the project to them. Evidence of this was captured through audio recordings. This process expedited the process and enabled me quickly to get to the interview itself and reduced formalities and awkwardness. Anonymity turned out to be rather ridiculous for this project, since there is only one choir that fits either Pontanima’s or Songlines profile and many informants are easily identifiable by their roles and what they say and do. Nevertheless, I was bound by the signed consent forms to not only offer anonymity but to ensure it.

3.10 Summary
Given the nature of the research project, it was logical and sensible to engage with qualitative, ethnographic methodologies in order to surmise informants’ understanding of the actions they participated in. The development of a grounded theory approach was also sensible in order to limit my own biases, yet I used a theoretical criteria list in order to frame my research. The relationships between pre-existing theory and emerging theory were constantly revised in a reflexive manner that was analogous to the reflexive relationships between music and conflict transformation.
4. Introduction to Research Sites

My research was based on two research sites, the Pontanima Inter-Religious Choir in Sarajevo, Bosnia-Herzegovina, and the Songlines Community Choir in London, UK. In this chapter I will describe the sites themselves as well as contextualising both of them by providing localised demographic information, how the sites came to be and how they developed over time as well as a deeper historical context. This is especially important for Pontanima, since the Balkan region has had such a long and complicated history which has had a direct influence on my informants’ beliefs and attitudes.

The two sites were chosen for a number of reasons: Pontanima was always intended to be my primary research site, yet access to a choir I did not know in a country I had never visited that uses a language I did not understand was problematic. My gatekeeper in this case was a member of the British Council who had been stationed in Sarajevo prior to and after the war there, and whilst he was there he had been a member of Pontanima and a close friend of Jadranko Nirić. At the time of my research, however, he lived in London and was a member of Songlines. Furthermore, he had suggested that the two choirs do some sort of joint project, which eventually did take place. I had previously worked as a musician with Songlines and access to that choir was unproblematic. I was able to embed myself as an active member of Songlines for six months, which enabled me to approach Pontanima and gain access to that site. Finally, the two choirs were very different, and gathering data both separately and during their joint project would enable me to determine what aspects were site specific, choir specific, music generally or conflict and conflict transformation specifically.

4.1 Songlines

Songlines until very recently (2010) had labelled itself as a community choir which was based in north London in the area between Islington and Canonbury. Since early 2011 they refer to themselves as “London’s Largest World Music Choir.” They are an all-inclusive choir that accepts members regardless of background or ability, but they are streamed by compatibility and ability within the choir. The divisions are identified and named by the evening that they rehearse: Mondays, Tuesdays and
Wednesdays. The Mondays and Tuesdays are fairly similar in make-up and ability, with about 75% women and 25% men, with some excellent singers and many for whom this was one of their first singing experiences. The Wednesdays are a smaller elite group of only women. All of the singers are experienced and/or trained. The choir may have been overall inclusive, but some sections therein were not so.

Formed in 1996 as a creative outlet by the current musical director, Theresa Kay, Songlines’ repertoire consists of folk music from all over the world and some original material written and arranged by Theresa. Membership is from all over London although very few of the members were actually originally from London, most having moved to London as economic migrants. Furthermore, the choir itself was based in Islington, where very few members actually lived. While the age range during my stay with Songlines reached from the early twenties to the early seventies, most were in their forties or fifties. This is compared to the largest age group in the local area of Islington which is late twenties\(^ {18}\) and the average age is 35\(^ {19}\). About 75% of the choir were women, whereas in Islington it is more like 52%\(^ {20}\). Most of the Songlines members labelled themselves “lefty socialists” or “Guardian-readers”. Most of the members had occupations that were either urban professional, such as doctor, solicitor, teacher, nurse or alternative, such as actor or aroma-therapist and this is in line with the Islington statistics\(^ {21}\).

At the time of the research, most of the sixty-odd members were Caucasian, with two African or Caribbean members and one Chinese, although almost all were British born, with the exception of two from Zimbabwe, three from Canada, one from the USA and two from Germany. This is clearly at odds with the local Canonbury/Islington community where only about 67% are British born, with 20%

being born outside of the EU\textsuperscript{22}. Furthermore, Islington has almost one in four citizens belonging to an ethnic minority\textsuperscript{23}.

The only language spoken within Songlines is English and almost all are native English speakers, with the exception of the two Germans. Religion was rarely discussed within the context of the choir, and only two informants referred to themselves as religious and they belonged to an unnamed Protestant Christian religion. A number of informants referred to themselves as spiritual. This is in line with the 33\% of Islington who do not adhere to an organised religion, yet not with the over half of Islington who claims to be Christian of some description\textsuperscript{24}.

A much discussed philosophy within the choir is how music transcends borders and illustrates a common humanity, although this is not an explicit remit or mission statement and there is nothing officially declared as such in the Songlines literature. Theresa cannot read or write musical notation well enough to direct in the traditional Western manner, so all music is arranged in a personalised shorthand style and the choir is taught their parts aurally as call and response. Traditional labels such as sopranos, altos, tenors and basses are eschewed for such labels as tops, mids, bottoms, tunes. Confusingly, the term ‘basses’ is used occasionally but this does not mean the low register as is normally the case but rather the bottom notes of Theresa’s arrangements, regardless of what vocal range the singer is in. In other words, a high pitched singer could be a bass if that is the part she is singing and a low pitched singer like myself could be a top or tune, even though my register is a couple of octaves lower than the others.

4.1.1 London and UK Context

This thesis discusses at length the nature of social memory, which has demonstrably spanned centuries in some cases. For this reason, a temporal and social context of choral activity in the UK and London is necessary. London is one of the most diverse and cosmopolitan cities in the world, with sizable populations of dozens of cultures.

\textsuperscript{22}\textit{Ibid}
\textsuperscript{23}\textit{Ibid}
\textsuperscript{24}\textit{Ibid}
and ethnicities. The borough of Islington, where Songlines is based, is still largely white British, with Black Caribbean being the largest minority. The population of the area is predominantly young single urban professionals, or low-earners, or those living on benefits, which illustrates an urban planning typical of British cities where expensive city living exists alongside council estate deprivation. Taking the average for the area, Songlines membership is not representative, but it is representative of the urban professional category, although many are older, married and have children.

Singing groups of one variety or another have been a part of almost every culture throughout history and around the world, and London has a rich tradition from monastic chants, madrigals and folk songs, to cathedral choirs, gospel choirs, world music choirs and popular singing (Walker 1952). The community choral society, however, developed in earnest in England during the Victorian age, alongside the growth of community brass bands (Nettel 1945; Russell 1987, p.248). Choral societies originally formed around the country in order to perform and compete in local music festivals (Cowgill and Holman 2007, pp.112, 232, 255; Russell 1987, p.249). Many commentators at the time and more recently (Russell 1987; Blake 1997) have harboured the myth that these regional choral societies were a working class movement, yet there is evidence to suggest that membership was an unusual mix across the social classes, although on average two-thirds were indeed working class (August 2007, p.218; Cowgill and Holman 2007, pp.196, 208, 321; Richards 1997, pp.216, 305; Russell 1987, pp.249-253). Choral society membership during this time was largely restricted to skilled working class men, reflecting the domestic commitments of women and the lack of money or time available to the unskilled working class or women (Smither 2000, p.167; p.113; Russell 1987; p.255). By the end of the 19th century, however, women had become a majority in many of the smaller regional choral societies, reflecting increased emancipation and leisure time (Russell 1987; p.259). Indeed, choral singing was at first one of the few public music-
making opportunities available to women, since it was normally considered both unladylike and threatening to male hegemony to perform music in public (Blake 1997, p.33). Choral societies tended to maintain strict discipline and order, yet they were, at least at first, quite democratic with directors being voted into position for fixed periods (Russell 1987; 261).

As the Victorian Age progressed, the choral society repertoire changed from religious music to more secular music, as the choral publishing market developed a synergetic relationship with the choirs themselves, eventually establishing a choral society repertoire as separate from other choral musics such as Cathedral choirs and oratorio choirs (Cowgill and Holman 2007, p.306; Russell 1987, p.262). While the music written for such choirs may not have been cutting edge or of international high art standards, it was of great importance to those involved who might not have been able to participate in high culture without it (Russell 1987, p.262).

This European industrial-age cultural philanthropy work is also evident in the orphéon societies in 19th century France, who promoted participation in wind bands to the working classes in order to promote socialisation, civic-mindedness, team spirit and discipline (Dubois, Méon and Pierru 2013). The difference here, according to Dubois et al, is that this apparently philanthropic behaviour was also intended to impose moral values, stabilise the workforce and develop political edification which served to place the wind bands as an inferior cultural practice, dominated by more legitimate musical groups such as classical orchestras. How this relates to Bourdieu's theory of cultural capital is discussed further in the Literature Review chapter and how this applies to the fieldwork for this thesis is discussed in the Findings chapter.

Another singing society that emerged in the late 19th century was the operatic society as popularised by Gilbert and Sullivan operettas, light operas with a mass appeal. These amateur production operas proved to be immensely popular as a form of entertainment and community involvement up until World War I. Choral competitions gained popularity also in the late 19th century as part of the music education philosophy of the time, as well as a new competition for glory and money that emerged especially in Yorkshire and Lancashire (Lowerson 2005, pp.43-74; Russell
1987; p.266-8). These competitions began using existing repertoire but eventually began attracting new commissions specifically for competition. These competitions continued to be popular throughout the Edwardian era, albeit with increased competition from cinemas and football as leisure pursuits (Blake 1997, p. xi).

What this illustrates is the beginnings of the contemporary belief in the UK and elsewhere in the power of music to transform social situations. In this case it was the Victorian philanthropic belief that those suffering social deprivation could be elevated out of their miserable existences through exposure to higher culture such as music (Blake 1997, p.44), as prescribed by such socialists as Beatrice Webb and Samuel Barnett (Waters 1990, p.66). This is a common theme throughout this thesis as people behave based on a common belief, whether or not this is supported by any empirical evidence.

Choirs and choral societies have an established history of having a political agenda ever since the Manchester socialist newspaper owner Robert Blatchford began the Clarion Vocal Union in 1895 which expanded to thirty-nine chapters by the following year (Blake 1997, p.60; Waters 1990, pp.2, 96, 121). Although the explicit aim was to lighten the mood of the notoriously dour socialist movement at the time (Blake 1997, p.61; Waters 1990, p.97), Blatchford developed a socialist musical philosophy where the choir was deemed to represent individuals banding together, each committed to doing their part, with a sum greater than its parts. It also served as, for many, the first taste of enjoyment gained from leisure pursuits (Blake 1997, p.61). This approach was echoed in the non-socialist but radical Co-Operative movement choirs around the same time. Both types of choir, however, used pretty much the same repertoire as non-political choirs (Blake 1997, p.61-2), which leads to the question of just what was the music doing in these cases?

Since this golden age of choral societies, membership has dropped dramatically, a development which has been blamed by many on the increased preoccupation with football and the emerging cultural experience and spectacle of the cinema (Blake 1997, pp.295-6; Waters 1990, p.179). As we delve into the more recent past, further distractions and preoccupations have only grown with the advent of radio, television and now the internet and digital gaming.
Choral societies as they had been known are fairly rare now, but there continues to be a strong interest in amateur group singing, whether it be church or cathedral choirs, university choirs, community classical singing groups or the growing trend of folk and world music singing groups. Indeed, as of 2009, Songlines has rebranded itself as a world music choir. As a result, it is useful to examine the tradition of world music choirs in the UK today. A quick survey of British choirs with at least some explicit world music repertoire is detailed in the following table:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Choir Name</th>
<th>Location</th>
<th>Repertoire</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Accendo Singers</td>
<td>Kingston, Surrey</td>
<td>Classical, gospel, world</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Akabella</td>
<td>Wiltshire</td>
<td>World</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bishopsgate Singers</td>
<td>City, London</td>
<td>Popular, world, folk (class)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Blackburn Peoples Choir</td>
<td>Blackburn, Lancashire</td>
<td>World</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vocality</td>
<td>(Various) London</td>
<td>Folk, spiritual, pop, folk, world</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bradford Voices</td>
<td>Bradford, West Yorkshire</td>
<td>World</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bristol Male Voice Choir</td>
<td>Bristol</td>
<td>European (world)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Castle Voices</td>
<td>Shropshire</td>
<td>World</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Clarion Choir</td>
<td>Burnley, Lancashire</td>
<td>Folk, world</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Downton Community Choir</td>
<td>Wiltshire</td>
<td>World</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Duffield Singers</td>
<td>Derby, Derbyshire</td>
<td>Folk, classical, world, gospel, show tunes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Earthly Voices</td>
<td>Esher, Surrey</td>
<td>Pop, world</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Eclectic Voices</td>
<td>Highgate, London</td>
<td>Classical, jazz, gospel, world</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Euphonix</td>
<td>Kingston, Surrey</td>
<td>Pop, folk, world</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Choir Name</td>
<td>Location</td>
<td>Genre</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-----------------------------------------------</td>
<td>---------------------------</td>
<td>------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Finsbury Park Community Singers</td>
<td>Finsbury Park, London</td>
<td>World</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fishpond Choir</td>
<td>Matlock Bath, Derbyshire</td>
<td>World</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Forres Big Choir</td>
<td>Moray, Scotland</td>
<td>World</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Get Singing Thornbury</td>
<td>Gloucestershire</td>
<td>World, gospel, folk</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Global Harmony</td>
<td>Various around UK</td>
<td>World, doo-wop, gospel</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Haringey Shed's The Very Vocals</td>
<td>Haringey, London</td>
<td>R&amp;B, soul, folk, world, soul</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hemblington Harmony</td>
<td>Norfolk, Norwich</td>
<td>World, gospel, folk</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Holler</td>
<td>Spitalfields, London</td>
<td>Soul, world, pop, jazz</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hull Community Choir</td>
<td>Hull, East Yorkshire</td>
<td>World</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Leeds Peoples Choir</td>
<td>Leeds, West Yorkshire</td>
<td>World</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Leicester Amika Choir</td>
<td>Leicester, Leicestershire</td>
<td>World</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Liverpool Philharmonic Community Choir</td>
<td>Liverpool</td>
<td>Pop, rock, folk, classical, world, jazz</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Maridadi Singers and Drummers</td>
<td>Canterbury, Kent</td>
<td>World</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Meeting Voices Community Choir</td>
<td>Chard, Somerset</td>
<td>World, folk</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Merthyr Aloud</td>
<td>MerthyrTydfil, Wales</td>
<td>World</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oxford Community Choir</td>
<td>Oxford, Oxfordshire</td>
<td>World, folk, pop, gospel, jazz, blues</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pebbles</td>
<td>Stafford, Staffordshire</td>
<td>World</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Choir Name</td>
<td>Location</td>
<td>Genre</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>----------------------------------</td>
<td>----------------------------------</td>
<td>--------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Protest in Harmony</td>
<td>Edinburgh, Scotland</td>
<td>World protest songs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Quire Colchester World Music Community Choir</td>
<td>Colchester, Essex</td>
<td>World</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ringwood Musical and Dramatic Society</td>
<td>Hampshire</td>
<td>Opera, classical, gospel, folk, pop, world</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rough Truffles Community Choir</td>
<td>Derbyshire</td>
<td>World, jazz, gospel</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Serenade</td>
<td>Hull, East Yorkshire</td>
<td>World</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sheffield Socialist Choir</td>
<td>Sheffield, South Yorkshire</td>
<td>World protest, rights, freedom songs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Singing It Back</td>
<td>Kingston, Surrey</td>
<td>World</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Solid Harmony Choir</td>
<td>Newham, London</td>
<td>Gospel, R&amp;B, rock, folk, world, classical</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Songlines</td>
<td>Islington, London</td>
<td>World</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Soundswell</td>
<td>Nottingham, Nottinghamshire</td>
<td>Folk, world pop</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Big Noise Chorus</td>
<td>Torquay, Devon</td>
<td>Pop, rock, motown, soul, world</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tonic Choir</td>
<td>Harrow, Middlesex</td>
<td>Folk, pop, world, musical theatre, opera, humorous</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VoiceMale</td>
<td>Morpeth, Northumberland</td>
<td>Gospel, world, pop</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Voices in Harmony Community Choir</td>
<td>Bridgnorth, Shropshire</td>
<td>World</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Table 7: British Choir Survey*
As can be seen from this table, there were twenty active choirs in the UK as of April 2011 that had a repertoire entirely consisting of world music. What exactly world music is will be discussed later. Of these twenty choirs, half are either in the north of England or the Midlands, with only Songlines and the Finsbury Park Community Singers being based in London. This is reflective of the history of choral societies in the UK, as already mentioned by Russell (Russell 1987). Of the 45 choirs with at least some world music repertoire in this table, the ratio between the north and Midlands versus London and the Home Counties evens out slightly, 18 and 15 respectively, and London only outnumbers the rest of the country when the choirs are more traditional, liturgical or classically oriented. Likewise, Wales is underrepresented here, and this is possibly due to the strong classical and local folk music tradition in that region.

While the Finsbury Park Community Singers and Songlines are both based in north London, they both claim to be a community choir (at least until recently) and they both claim to have a world music repertoire. An examination of local discussion boards for the Finsbury Park Community Choir27, however, revealed that the choir is not strictly focussed on world music, but rather included whatever the choir voted on, whether it be classical, opera, pop, children’s music, or world music. Furthermore, there is an explicit remit to be a choir from the local Finsbury Park community, going as far as to specify the post codes eligible for membership. Confusingly, their own website28 refers to them as the Pooles Park Community Choir, since their rehearsal space is in the Pooles Park Primary School, which is located in Finsbury Park. Even more confusing is the frequent referral to Islington in their news updates and blogs, as in “putting the sing back into Islington.” Another difference is that the director of the Finsbury Park Community Choir is a former Cambridge choir boy and opera singer and the choir has a regular pianist who is a local music teacher. The choristers are not required to possess music reading skills, however, which is similar

to Songlines, but the leaders are obviously formally educated in music whereas Songlines' Theresa is not.

Even within Songlines itself there are some discrepancies between what is claimed and what happens within the choir, which is not unusual. Songlines until very recently claimed to be a community choir, yet almost none of the members lived locally to where the choir rehearses and as mentioned already were not representative of the community. Within the past year this claim has been dropped from their website and Songlines is now labelled London’s largest world music choir. This claim seems to be true in light of the above, since they appear to be the only London choir to claim to be primarily a world music choir. Songlines do sing songs other than purely world folk traditions, such as the occasional gospel and pop song, as well as originals written by Theresa. If the other choirs in the table in London which claim to sing world music in addition to other styles such as gospel, folk and pop were taken into consideration, Songlines may have many more contenders for the claim about being London's largest world music choir. The bottom line point here is that Songlines is the largest choir in London that claims to sing world music exclusively, since these other choirs have not made such a claim.

It is important to understand what exactly is meant by the label ‘world music’ since this is the primary public manner by which Songlines identifies itself. Since this thesis addresses the relationships between musical activity and identity, it is vital to fully understand what is meant when Songlines identifies itself as a world music choir. Songlines claims that its repertoire is derived from the folk vocal harmony traditions from all over the world, including the West and England. Other choirs presumably have a slightly different definition, if they list in their repertoire world music as separate from folk and gospel. Is there a general consensus about what world music is? Is it purely the folk traditions from every and any part of the world, or is it more about something as separate from the West; a form of musical orientalism stemming from a colonial expansionist mindset? There is not a shortage of writing on this subject, with most seeming to lean towards this latter definition (Born and Hesmondhalgh 2000; Broughton, Ellingham and Trillo 1999; Clayton and Zon 2007; Leppert and McClary 1989; Mackenzie 1995; McClary 1992; Feld 1995; McConnachie 2000; Said 1979).
Steven Feld has built on Simon Frith’s notion of popular music being “colonised by commerce” (Frith 1989) to establish the idea that world music has been colonised not only by commerce but by Western modes of production, ownership and even identity (Feld 1995, p.100). Feld disagrees with earlier writers who felt that the growth of the world music scene highlighted the skill, creativity and diversity of local musics around the world (Frith 1989; Goodwin and Gore 1990) or that it illustrated how trans-culturation can be peacefully and successfully managed and disseminated (Hannerz 1987; Malm and Wallis 1992; Wallis and Malm 1984) and how this somehow could balance the force of imperialism (Laing 1986; Tomlinson 1991).

What these all have in common, however, is that they all refer to world music as separate from other musics such as pop, rock, western classical, jazz, and so on. Even Feld who maintains a criticism of this approach falls into the same trap when he refers to an early WOMAD compilation as

“juxtaposing pop stars Peter Gabriel, David Byrne, Jon Hassell, and Pete Townsend with African, Jamaican, Balinese, and Indian artists and styles” (Feld 1995, p.101).

Why does Feld privilege the Western artists by listing by name and not those from the rest of the world? Perhaps ‘world music’ is a more heavily loaded term then even Feld imagined.

Some writers demarcate the difference between authentic world music, or the folk traditions as performed by those from that culture, as opposed to world beat, or hybridisation, creoles or collaborations between cultures and folk musics (Feld 1995, p.103; Nidel 2005, p.2). With this definition, Songlines would fit largely within the first category, although the arrangements and participants are invariably not from the original culture, there is a concerted attempt to be as true to the original practices as possible.

Bohlman’s concise introduction to the topic of world music (Bohlman 2002) starts by correctly pointing out that the term is bound to be problematic everywhere since there are multiple meanings to both constituent words. The idea of what the world is and even what music is can be very different in different parts of the world (Ibid, p.5). As already mentioned, the meaning of world music to those in the West usually
consists of an idea of otherness, or at least different to the everyday popular or art cultures in the west. But what does it mean to those in other places? Bohlman points out that it can mean anything from religious zeal and magic to life-cycle customs and food (Ibid, pp.5-6). Music can have a variety of ontologies which can prove problematic to define. Recitation of the Quran, for example, is often viewed as music by the West since it uses Arabic melodic modes but this is a Western ontology and many Muslims do not view the recitation of the Quran as music at all (Ibid, p.6). This view has proved to be a sticking point with Pontanima’s relationship with the Sarajevo Muslim Council, as will be discussed in the Findings chapter. While these varying epistemologies and ontologies can be seen as problematic for world music as a consensual term associated with particular sounds with specific meanings, it does not change the idea that Songlines views itself as a world music choir and that the meaning associated with the term relates to indigenous folk harmony traditions from wherever in the world they can gain access to via visiting practitioners. Interestingly, however, Pontanima could be viewed as a world music choir according to some of these definitions, yet they never use any of these terminologies.

4.2 Pontanima

Pontanima is a self-labelled inter-religious choir consisting of roughly equal membership of the three dominant cultures and religions in the region, Croat Catholic, Serb Orthodox and Bosniak Muslim. It should be noted now that this pairing of nationalism with religion has not always been the case, which is important to remember when considering Pontanima and the Balkan context in which they exist. This will be explored more fully below. They sing primarily liturgical music from these traditions, as well as Jewish liturgical music in homage to the fourth dominant culture and religion in the region from the 16th century until Hitler’s Final Solution destroyed the Jewish culture there during World War II (Gilbert 2003; Malcolm 1996, pp.51-3, 108, 113-4, 175-6). The choir members’ similarities and differences are deeply connected to a collective sense of what it means to be from Sarajevo specifically and, to a large extent, Bosnia generally. Current feelings and beliefs about what is ‘Bosnian’ today are varied yet contain some common threads, as will be discussed in the Findings chapter, yet these definitions have been in flux for centuries. Bosnian history is perhaps one of the most complex and least understood in European
history, having been on the unruly borders of empires since the time of Alexander the Great. It is therefore necessary to contextualise Pontanima’s position temporally and culturally in order to appreciate how unique the choir is in the field of music and conflict transformation.

Regarding Bohlman’s discussion on world music, Pontanima as a matter of routine deals with differences and combines the worlds of the three dominant religions as well as that of the Jewish liturgy. One of the choristers is a professional composer who arranges Islamic Ilahija songs for the choir which, according to Fra Jadranko and Yeşim, has proved problematic with the Sarajevo Islamic Council. Ilahija are traditional calls to prayer sung only by solo men, which implies monophony or a lack of harmony. Many Muslims also do not consider this as music per se, but the harmonisation for choir and the inclusion of women singers has caused some debate in the Islamic circles in Sarajevo. As a result, Pontanima could be seen to be world music choir using the Bohlman model, but since no one in Pontanima themselves use this term, it will not be referred to as such.

At the time of the initial fieldwork in 2009, Pontanima had 57 members ranging from their early twenties to their seventies, with most falling within the 26-35 age range (See Tables 8 and 9 below). Since the choir began in 1996 and it is an adult choir, this implies that most people currently in Pontanima have not been involved since the beginning. On the surface, it appears as if Catholics far outweigh any other religion in the choir, but when mixed marriages are taken into account, and atheists or other beliefs are counted as if they fall within their background’s culture, the numbers are more even with 24 Catholics, 11 Orthodox and 18 Muslim. Over 60% of the choir are women. There are more professionals within the choir than any other category, and over 20% are professional musicians. Just over 20% are either unemployed or students, which is less than half the national average of 45%, according to their national statistics website. Only about half of the working age population, however, are listed as employed or unemployed, which implies that

around half of the Bosnian working age population is studying, infirm or otherwise unable to work. Over 2/3\textsuperscript{rd}s of both employed and unemployed have secondary school education, indicating that that level of education has little bearing on employment, although over 15\% of the employed had university education, as opposed to less than eight percent of the unemployed, indicating some correlation there\textsuperscript{30}. According to this same survey almost half of the employed population work in the service industry, followed by 32\% in industry and 20\% in agriculture\textsuperscript{31}. It is unclear from this document what exactly is meant by services, but presumably it includes any job that provides a service as opposed to an exchange of goods. If Pontanima members were divided in this manner, 82\% of the working age population was either employed or unemployed and 100\% of the employed work in services, which is obviously very different from the national statistics. These statistics clearly indicate that Pontanima membership is not representative of Bosnian society as a whole, which is largely rural, uneducated and segregated. It is indicative of an urban, educated class that is generally open and accepting of those from different religious, ethnic and/or social backgrounds, which is correlated later in the Findings chapter.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Identity</th>
<th>Gender</th>
<th>Age</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>Female</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sarajevo</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bosnia</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Yugoslavia</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Male</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Female</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18-25</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>26-35</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>36-45</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>46-55</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>56-65</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>66+</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Catholic</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Orthodox</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Muslim</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Catholic-Orthodox</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Catholic-Muslim</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Muslim-Orthodox</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Protestant</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Atheist</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Spiritual</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table 8: Pontanima members’ identity, gender and age

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Unknown</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>1</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>1</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>34</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>35</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>29</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>6</td>
<td>6</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Career</td>
<td>Student</td>
<td>Musician</td>
<td>Artistic</td>
<td>Religious</td>
<td>Education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------------------------------</td>
<td>---------</td>
<td>----------</td>
<td>----------</td>
<td>-----------</td>
<td>-----------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Catholic</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Orthodox</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Muslim</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Catholic-Orthodox</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Catholic-Muslim</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Muslim-Orthodox</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Protestant</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Atheist</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Spiritual</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unknown</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TOTAL</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Table 9: Pontanima careers**
4.2.1 Bosnian Context

Politically, Bosnia-Herzegovina is a sovereign presidency with two internal entities as dictated by the Dayton Accord in 1995. These entities are the Federation of Bosnia and Herzegovina, which is based on an alliance between the Bosnian Croat Catholics, the Bosniak Muslims and any other Bosnians that wished to remain an independent, united Bosnia, and the Republika Srpska, the Serbian Orthodox region. The former consists of 51% of the country’s landmass versus the latter’s 49%\(^32\). Regionally, unemployment rates are lower in Serbian-controlled Republika Srpska than in the Federation of Bosnia and Herzegovina\(^33\) of which Sarajevo is a part. With this in mind, the comparison is to an unemployment average of 29%, which is still significantly lower than the 45% mentioned earlier. All of the above indicates that Pontanima, despite its diverse make up, is not wholly representative of Bosnian society. Many within the choir have stated that they believe Pontanima represents more how Bosnia in general and Sarajevo used to be before the war, but there is little evidence to support this belief. This discrepancy between belief and evidence crops up many times as will be seen in the Findings chapter.

4.2.2 The Bosnian Conflict

It is necessary to go into great detail about the ancient past of Bosnia since Milosevic assembled hundreds of thousands of Serbs to hear his speech on the 600\(^{th}\) anniversary of the Battle of Kosovo to tell them that they would not be beaten again and that Serbia was wherever there were Serbs\(^34\). The first pan-Slav Yugoslav prototype was called Greater Illyria after a non-Slav nation that had become extinct nearly 1800 years (Lampe 2000, p.43) previously, and neighbouring empires and nations have for centuries used common beliefs to justify invasions and this continued during the Bosnian war, first with Serbia and also with Croatia. Finally, it is difficult to make sense of the Bosnian War without understanding how Serbs could be mobilised using references to events six centuries in the past.

\(^{32}\)http://www.ohr.int/dpa/default.asp?content_id=380
\(^{34}\)http://emperors-clothes.com/milo/milosaid.html#2
The Bosnian conflict was most recently forcibly ended by the UN Dayton Accord and enforced by NATO as of November 1995 after three years of atrocities on all sides, but undeniably the most suffering was endured by the Muslim population and those of any culture that attempted to remain a united nation (Malcolm 1996, p.268; Cox 2002, xviii; Mertus 1999, p.5). Today, Bosnia and Herzegovina maintains an odd, and some have argued, unsustainable political system of rotating presidencies with a Muslim, Catholic and Orthodox president each getting their turn. The country is politically split into two between the Federation of Bosnia and Herzegovina, an alliance between the Bosnian Catholics and Muslims, and the Republika Srpska, the autonomous Serbian region. Each culture maintains their own independent education systems and therefore completely separate mythologies about the war are being maintained within each culture (Russo 2000; pp.945-66). There are exceptions to this situation, of course, and Sarajevo in general continues to be the most integrated and cosmopolitan area within the nation (Markowitz 2010, p.12). Although some have disputed this, believing that cosmopolitan Sarajevo died in the war (Pollock, Bhabha, Breckenridge and Chakrabarty 2002). This ties in with many of those within Pontanima who claimed that many of the cosmopolitan citizens of the pre-war Sarajevo either fled or were killed. Pontanima represented a declining demographic in a changing Sarajevo, as Bosnians from the rest of the rural, segregated country moved in to fill the population gap. With this in mind, it is unlikely that Pontanima could have emerged from any other Bosnian city. If Pontanima can be seen to be a Sarajevo phenomenon, why do they have the desire to spread their mission across Bosnia? Are there historical precedents for such cross-cultural cooperation? If there are, how did such a brutal conflict emerge in the first place? All of these questions are rather loaded and an examination of Bosnian history should shed some light on it.

To many it might seem strange to call upon ancient history in order to bolster current arguments, but that is just what happens regularly in the Balkans. Those in the north of England might still joke about the War of the Roses between Lancashire and Yorkshire, but Serbs often refer to an event in their own history that predates the War of the Roses by some seventy years as still relevant today. This event, the total defeat and beginning of the end of the medieval Serbian kingdom by the Ottomans in
present-day Kosovo, was most recently evoked in 1989 as Milosović whipped Serbia and Serbs throughout the Balkans into a nationalistic frenzy (Clark 2000, p.22; Malcolm 1996, p.213; Meier 1999, pp.25, 175). History in the region is long and exceedingly complex, and simply beyond the scope or purpose of this thesis, so I have divided some details into themes, since history has in effect repeated itself many times here. This will help contextualise more recent events and illustrate the themes that continue in the region even now. Further justification for this is embodied in the ethnographic mantra that to understand a culture requires understanding life as closely as the people within it understand it (Hammersley and Atkinson 2007; Wolcott 1999; Murchison 2010). Bosnians and Balkans in general have a definite interpretation of ancient history, whether they consciously ignore it, filter it or embrace it, or on occasion all of the above.

Four things that can be said about Balkan and Bosnian history that are indisputable are that over the centuries there were many alliances between empires made and broken (See Appendix E), borders were frequently in flux (see Appendix F) and many large migrations of a people occurred from one area to another due to war (see Appendix G). I am going to avoid a purely chronological telling of the history of Bosnia, since Bosnia as we now know it is a modern construct. This modern construct means a great deal to those who label themselves Bosnian, but “Bosnian” has meant many different things throughout the ages. This leads to questions of identity, of which there are many. If Bosnian identity has not been stable, what other forms of identity have there been in the region, over time and from ethnicity to ethnicity? What I will illustrate next is that it is a sense of belief in a particular identity at a particular time that has afforded the four indisputable occurrences already mentioned. A belief that a set of people have a shared identity, whether it be religious, ethnic, cultural or political, at a particular time has provided motivation for alliances, wars and migrations which in turn have altered borders. So what is it to be Bosnian?

The dominant ethnicity in Bosnia today is South Slav, but this is no different from the rest of the Balkans. Croats, Slovenes, Bosnians, Serbs, Montenegrins and Macedonians are all more or less ethnically the same. This has been the case ever since Christianity was spread by Cyril and Methodius in the region and, along with it,
the Cyrillic alphabet and a regional identity (Forbes 2004, p.21; Rossos 2008, p.33; Clissold and Darby 1969, p.23; Meier 1999, p.176). Laying blame for recent conflicts or any of the region's conflicts on ancient ethnic hatreds is simply false. Furthermore, South Slavs were not even the original inhabitants of the land.

From at least the eighth century BC, Bosnia was populated by Illyrian sheep herders (Malcolm 1996, p.2). There is little trace of Illyria in Bosnia nowadays, having succumbed long ago to Macedonian (Errington 1990, p.42, 54, 76; Roisman and Worthington 2010, p.293; Rossos 2008, p.14, 16) and Roman (Clissold and Darby 1969, p.9; Forbes 2004, p.9; Malcolm 1996, p.2; Rossos 2008, p.17) invasions. Despite this, some Illyrian traditions such as tattooing survived up until the 18th century in the south Slav culture (Malcolm 1996, p.3-4). In a fashion that seems familiar for the region, Illyria had allied or warred with both Macedonia and Rome at different times during its slow demise (Clissold and Darby 1969, p.9; Errington 1990, pp.1, 29-30, 37, 40, 42, 54, 76; Forbes 2004, p.9; Goldstein 1999, p.11; Green 2013, p.12; Heckel 2002, p.13; Roisman and Worthington 2010, p.158, 293; Rossos 2008, pp.9, 12, 14, 16; Wilkes 1996 p.121) until Rome finally assimilated the last Illyrian tribe in 9AD (Clissold and Darby 1969, p.9; Malcolm 1996, p.2). Despite this, the idea of Illyria continued first as a province of Rome, Illyricum, but was very shortly afterwards incorporated into new provinces of Pannonia and Dalmatia (Forbes 2004, p.9). Illyria remained an unused name until France established the Illyrian Provinces during Napoleon’s conquest (Benson 2001, p.5; Clissold and Darby 1969, p.33; Malcolm 1996, p.88). Finally the kernel for a pan-Slav nationalistic consciousness was labelled Greater Illyria at the end of the 19th century amongst Croatian, Slovenian and Serbian intellectuals (Benson 2001, p.5; Clissold and Darby 1969, p.33-4; Lampe 2000, p.43-5).

These events had effectively set the precedent for all the conflicts in the region since: creating an idea and belief precedes behaviour inasmuch as a belief in Illyria precedes actions to create a pan-Slav state called Greater Illyria, even though it had very little to do with Illyrians, except that they occupied the same landmass more or less; ancient history is used to foster beliefs for this reason, even if they are inaccurate. Bosnian interests are routinely ignored in favour of their more powerful neighbours; strength comes from neighbours with similar beliefs. Since the fall of the
Ottoman Empire, Bosnia has been isolated as an Islamic state surrounded by Catholic and Orthodox Christian states that have encouraged Bosnian Catholics to identify themselves as Croats or Bosnian Orthodox as Serbs. Further complicating matters is the fact that those who were Macedonians then are not Macedonians now. Macedonians were originally from the same ethnicity as the ancient Greeks (Rossos 2008, p.12) but since then the Greek population had been replaced by other invaders, starting with Rome (Ibid, p.16-7) followed by Byzantine (Ibid, p.9, 17) and finally the South Slavs (Ibid, p.9) who continue to dominate the country, except since World War II in Greek-controlled Aegean Macedonia, but that is another narrative beyond the scope of this thesis.

Roman rule in the Balkans was not absolute, however, and Emperor Diocletian, himself from Dalmatia in modern Croatia, split the empire into more manageable chunks of west and east in the late third century with Dalmatia and Pannonia staying with the west, but the rest of the Balkans went to the east (Clissold and Darby 1969, p.9; Forbes 2004, p.10; Rossos 2008, p.17). The Western Roman Empire fell to the Germanic tribes shortly thereafter, and after a brief occupation by the Goths all of the Balkans became part of the eastern, or Byzantine, empire (Forbes 2004, p.10; Goldstein 1999, p.1). Meanwhile, nomadic tribes originally from as far away as Persia (Iran) began to settle in the Balkans. Among them were the Slavs (Malcolm 1996, p.2; Cox 2002, xv; Pavlowitch 2002, p.1; Forbes 2004, p.13-4; Benderly and Kraft 1996, p.4; Goldstein 1999, p.13; Rossos 2008, p.18, 23; Lampe 2000, p.16). The South Slavs were actively encouraged by Byzantium to settle in the Balkans in order to stabilise their border region and they have been the dominant ethnicity in the region ever since (Rossos 2008, p.24).

It is worth remembering that the association of Catholicism and Orthodox Christianity with the Holy Roman Empire and the Byzantine Empire was not always in existence. Christianity was only legalised in the empire during the fifth century by Constantine, when the capital was moved from Rome to Constantinople, now Istanbul (Neusner 2008; Odahl 2004; Pohlsander 2004). Even at that stage, there was only one unified religion. This split did not occur until the eleventh century, referred to as the Great Schism (Posnov 2004; Malcolm 1996, p.11; Forbes 2004, p.60; Lampe 2000, p.15). This marked the beginning of the empire building phase based on capturing beliefs
first followed by borders. Initially, all of current Bosnia remained under Holy Roman jurisdiction, controlled by the bishopric of Ragusa (Dubrovnik) in Dalmatia (Malcolm 1996, p.11; Vlasto 1970, p.231). From this point onwards, nations or peoples adhering to Roman Catholicism or Byzantine Orthodoxy would use religion and the backing of the empires to expand their borders and, by proxy, the empire. The area around Bosnia changed hands many times, and only emerged for a brief time as an independent Kingdom of Bosnia in 1180 (Forbes 2004, p.58; Lampe 2000, p.18; Malcolm 1996, p.11, 13; Rossos 2008, p.38). The name Bosnia itself was not used until 958 when Byzantine documents refer to it as a province of Serbia (Malcolm 1996, p.10; Ramet 2006, p.2).

From the mid 13th century Hungary began installing monastic orders in Bosnia in a bid to convert the population to Catholicism prior to an invasion (Malcolm 1996, p.16), and border and belief disputes between Byzantine nations such as Serbia, Bulgaria and Hungary continued until the rise of the Ottomans (Malcolm 1996, p.21; Forbes, 2004, p.33, 67). The Ottomans, on the other hand, operated in reverse. They conquered land militarily, seeing weaknesses as other empires over-extended themselves. They quickly followed with policies of acceptance; all religions were tolerated and accepted. It was widely known, however, that Muslims had a higher status in society and there were social, tax and legal benefits available to anyone who converted. Many did, from both the Catholic and Orthodox cultures (Malcolm 1996, p.52, 65; Pavlowitch 2002, p.14; Benson 2001, p.4).

It is worth taking a moment to consider Serbia, the primary South Slav Orthodox nation. Originally a Serbian Princedom in Byzantine centring on modern day Kosovo, Serbia grew in time to become a kingdom and eventually a small empire. The Ottomans decisively defeated Serbia in June 1389 (Bieber and Daskalovski 2003, p.13, 29; Clark 2000, p.20-1; Cox 2002, xv; Forbes, 2004, p.33, 67; Lampe 2000, p.9, 17, 25; Malcolm 1996, p.20; Meier 1999, p.24; Pavlowitch 2002, p.9-10; Petrovitch 2007, p.61), which marked the end of the Serbian nation. Serbs would spend the next 300 years and more under Ottoman rule, only to be handed over to Austria after the Austrian-Ottoman war in 1718 (Clissold and Darby 1969, p.30; Lampe 2000, p.37; Malcolm 1996, p.86; Pavlowitch 2002, p.20; Petrovitch 2007, p.66). Independent Serbia did not exist again until very recently but this did not stop
Serb nationalism which began with the Greater Illyria movement. The Greater Illyria movement lobbied for a pan-Slav nation within which was the idea for a Greater Serbia (Clark 2000, p.21; Rossos 2008, p.75; Lampe 2000, p.52; Benson 2001, p.3; Meier 1999, p.181), through the attempts to remove Austria-Hungary from power in the Balkans which triggered World War I (Malcolm 1996, p.155; Cox 2002, xvi; Pavlowitch 2002, p. ix; Forbes 2004, p.56; Clark 2000, p.22; Benson 2001, p.20) until the most recent Balkan conflicts where Serbia as a Yugoslav republic had gained control of the federal machine and used it for nationalistic purposes (Malcolm 1996, p.212; Bieber and Daskalovski 2003, p.21).

To summarise, Bosnia was originally Illyrian as were all of the Balkans, followed by Roman occupation. Neither of these historical aspects is evident today except in archaeological sites and artefacts. South Slavs migrated to the area and quickly became the dominant ethnicity as it is now. Christianity spread around this time but Catholicism and Orthodoxy did not split until the eleventh century. At this time, the Balkans were split between these belief systems with Bosnia remaining Catholic. Parts of Bosnia frequently changed hands between Catholic or Orthodox control, and the methods used by both sides were to convert the population, then invade. Catholics tended to be near Catholic Croatia and Orthodox tended to be near the Serb border. The Ottomans invaded and many Catholics and Orthodox people voluntarily converted in order to gain the benefits awarded Muslims. Meanwhile the Serb nation was destroyed by the Ottomans, and most Serbs migrated from the point of origin in Kosovo to modern Belgrade. Many more later moved to the borderlands in modern Bosnia at the request of Austria who offered them a better life than under the Ottomans. Bosnia was under Austrian protection from the eighteenth century, and a century later annexed it altogether. Once again, Bosnia became a Catholic nation, albeit this time with a very mixed population. The rise of nationalism culminated with the assassination of Franz Ferdinand, which through a long series of mutual protection pacts triggered World War I.

4.2.3 Nationalism, Yugoslavia and the Bosnian War

In the wake of World War I, the first Yugoslavia was born as the Yugoslav Kingdom of Serbs, Croats and Slovenes (Cox 2002, xvi; Pavlowitch 2002, p. viii), yet any mention of Bosnians is notable by its absence. When it came to the question of
Bosnia, Croats tended to view Bosnian Catholics as Croats and Serbs tended to view Bosnian Orthodox as Serbs. Both nations viewed Bosniak Muslims as either Croats or Serbs who had converted during the Ottoman Empire era. Slovenia tended to stay out of debates such as these, being geographically protected except for a shared border with Croatia. In other words, Bosnia did not exist in the eyes of many. It was this initial attitude that paved the way for such atrocities decades later. In any case, this was more or less Greater Serbia in anything but name with the king and all those with power being mostly Serbian.

Prior to World War II, Judaism was a strong fourth culture and faith in Bosnia. During the 15th century the Jews fleeing persecution in Spain arrived, followed shortly after by Jews persecuted in nearby Hungary and other Catholic nations (Rossos 2008, p.52-3; Malcolm 1996, p.51, 108). Over 500 years of being part of Bosnian heritage was utterly destroyed by the Nazi Final Solution when Germany invaded Yugoslavia (Malcolm 1996, p.175-6). Not much of this heritage is extant today, except for a few poignant graveyards and a few still-standing synagogues. It is for this reason that Pontanima sing a near-equal number of Jewish songs compared to the other faiths in their repertoire.

Even before the end of World War II, there were nationalist conflicts in Yugoslavia between the Communist partisans led by Tito and the Serbian royalist Cetniks (Malcolm 1996, p.183). In the end, the Partisans won and Yugoslavia quickly became part of the Cominform after the end of World War II (Malcolm 1996, p.194-5; Rossos 2008, p.218). This was not to last, however, since Tito’s ambitions led to Stalin ejecting Yugoslavia from the Cominform in 1948 (Malcolm 1996, p.194; Cox 2002, xvii; Rossos 2008, p.81, 211). Yugoslavia remained Communist until its eventual demise in January 1990 (Malcolm 1996, p.214-5). Tito is fondly talked of even by those too young to have known what it was like during the Tito era, which is perhaps due to how Tito’s government absorbed huge international debts without passing it onto the people in forms of taxes (Meier 1999, p.10). As a result, many enjoyed a relatively luxurious lifestyle compared to other Communist nations. We should not forget, however, that Tito very swiftly and brutally crushed any dissent and was not afraid to kill his own people in order to maintain order. That much he
had learned from his old mentor Stalin (Malcolm 1996, p.193; Cox 2002, xvii; Rossos 2008, p.236).

One interesting and confusing result of this new style of government was the devaluing of religion in communist society. While the people were free to continue their churches, they were discouraged from spending much time on religion and it was removed from schools and public discourse, especially Muslim public outlets (Malcolm 1996, p.195). Furthermore, Tito tried to pre-empt nationalist uprisings and encouraged migration and inter-marriage across the republics (Clark 2000, p.41; Meier 1999, p.23). As a result, by 1989 when the most recent conflicts began, Yugoslavia was a very mixed place indeed, with thousands of mixed marriages and mixed children, and people of all faiths and backgrounds living in all republics (Malcolm 1996, p.222).

This did not stop nationalist feelings, however, which started in earnest unsurprisingly in Kosovo in 1989, nine years after Tito’s death (Mertus 1999, p.9; Bieber and Daskalovski 2003, p.15). Yugoslavia had finally been forced to deal with its international debt and the population was thrown into poverty (Malcolm 1996, p.210). Every republic began to express nationalism in some form or another. Serbs were then a minority in Kosovo, with the majority being Albanian. This came about 600 years earlier after the Battle of Kosovo when most Serbs fled the region, known in Serbian folklore as the great migration (Malcolm 1996, p.20; Cox 2002, xv; Pavlowitch 2002, p.9-10; Forbes, 2004, p.33, 67; Petrovitch 2007, p.61; Bieber and Daskalovski 2003, p.13, 29; Clark 2000, p.20-1; Lampe 2000, p.9, 17, 25; Meier 1999, p.24). In the late 17th century, after a war with the Habsburgs in the region, the population gap was filled by those from the Ottoman-controlled Albania and it has been a Muslim Albanian majority ever since (Pavlowitch 2002, p.19-20; Bieber and Daskalovski 2003, p.29; Clark 2000, p.20-1; Rossos 2008, p.54; Lampe 2000, p.26; Meier 1999, p.24; Benson 2001, p.3). In 1989, Kosovo Serb nationalists began to orchestrate ways in which to overthrow the Albanian Kosovo government which in turn led Milosović, at the time a leading figure in the Serbian Communist Party, to make his claim to protect Serbs wherever they were. Where they were, of course, was everywhere within Yugoslavia. The intent was clear: Yugoslavia was to become to all intents and purposes Greater Serbia (Clark 2000, p.7; BBC 1995).
It took a while for this to begin, and a lot longer for the rest of the world to realise what was happening, but Milosović began changing hostile republican governments with Serb governments until he effectively controlled Yugoslavia and its federal army (Malcolm 1996, p.211; The Death of Yugoslavia 1995). Whenever a republic announced its cessation from Yugoslavia, Milosović would label it rebellion and civil war, so that the UN or other outside forces would not interfere (Malcolm 1996, p.230). Slovenia managed to secede first and this was done with a minimum of conflict, mainly due to the fact that Slovenia was well-prepared and too far away from Serb or federal forces to intervene (Malcolm 1996, p.225; Cox 2002, xviii; Pavlowitch 2002, p. viii; Benderly and Kraft 1996, p.232). Not so for Croatia or later in Bosnia. Serbs in Croatia and Bosnia formed their own independent zones and began to ethnically cleanse these areas (Malcolm 1996, p.248). Later, after Serbia and Croatia ended their conflict, Croatia joined in the Bosnian conflict, first against the Muslims in an effort to gain land for Croatia, and later with the Muslims against the Serbian oppressors (Malcolm 1996, p.230). Only after nearly a quarter of the Bosnian Muslim population were killed or fled did the international community finally step in which culminated with an end to hostilities in November 1995 with the Dayton Accord (Malcolm 1996, p.268; Cox 2002, xviii; Mertus 1999, p.5).

What we can see here is that a belief in a nation preceded actions to create a nation. The idea of a nation was based on a common cultural memory and common religion. Assistance with nation-building came from perceived similar neighbours. Anyone who stood in the way of this nation-building was viewed as an enemy or worse, not even human, in order to allow for the atrocities that were committed. Ancient events were cherry-picked for modern purposes: Serbia never declared war on Turkey, for example, which had been the cause of the 1389 cessation of the medieval Kingdom of Serbia. In the end, the only group of people who attempted to keep Yugoslavia together were the Bosnian Muslims. Cynics say that this is purely because they stood to lose the most through independence, since they would not get support from any like-minded neighbours. Even if this has any truth to it, this stance led to them suffering the most.

To complicate matters further, there were many Bosnian Croats and Bosnian Serbs that did not want to become part of Greater Croatia, or Serbia and sided with the
Bosniaks, especially in cosmopolitan Sarajevo. It is from this group that the members of Pontanima largely originated. In all cases, the reasons for people’s decisions and actions can be traced to how they believe their current identities and memories of past identities, tempered by emotions past and present, have interacted with external circumstances and events. Invariably, those with the worst physical hardships but a strong sense of identity-borders are the easiest to manipulate with promises of an improved quality of life while those from the more educated, affluent classes are more likely to resist change.

4.2.4 Pontanima’s ‘Mission’

The mission is stated on their website as:

“By singing each other's songs, members of Pontanima attempt to better understand and respect each other. Pontanima's music is a celebration of the beautiful artistic diversity that has resulted through the differing spiritual influences in Bosnia-Herzegovina. The goal is to enter into the heart of what is different in order to receive these differences in the heart of one’s own being, to feed the soul with the highest spirituality of different people. This is not syncretism, but a method of dialogue, ecumenism and creative life.”

Pontanima is an inter-religious choir formed in 1996 by Fra Jadranko Nirić, a Franciscan theologian, and Kreso, a professional opera singer, who became the musical director, immediately following the Balkan conflict. It began as a choir for a Catholic church but it quickly expanded to include singers from the other dominant faiths in the region for purely practical reasons, as there were simply not enough skilled Catholic singers in the area. From the very beginning of this project, in other words, the music itself was of greater importance than any cultural, religious, ethnic or political identity. It was not long before Nirić developed his concept of ‘a symphony of religions’ and renamed the choir ‘Pontanima’, derived from the Bosnian for ‘bridge of souls’ (Conrad, 2009).

Pontanima performs songs from these three traditions with the addition of Jewish music, since the Jewish community had been a significant and thriving part of the

regional culture from the fourteenth century until their near elimination in World War II. Some newly composed material from composers within these traditions has also been commissioned by the choir. Pontanima has a very high international profile and has performed around the world for such events as UNESCO in Paris (2003) and the World Council of Churches Inter-religious Conference in Geneva (2005). From their inception, the choir has had to confront resistance from their own community and even within the choir itself.

Around a fifth of the choir are professional musicians or music students and the skill level is very high. They have competed in choir competitions around the world and do fairly well, such as their award for Best Interpretation of an Early Sacred Work at the international Zlatna Vila choir festival in 2005. In addition to performing around the world at various peace events, Pontanima have won several peace awards including Tanenbaum Peacemakers in Action Award (1998), the Common Ground Reconciliation through the Arts Award (2004), and most recently, the Pax Christi International Peace Award in April 2011.

Nirić is the philosophical force behind Pontanima and has defined the choir’s mission as providing

“...hope, vision, foresight and longing of humanity that the strongest spiritual energies of humankind not be used up in quarrels and conflicts, but turned towards shared goals.” (Conrad, 2009, p.5).

The choir gives equal importance to each religious tradition and a typical Pontanima concert would consist of two songs from each faith. They perform frequently with an average of more than 25 performances per year (Ibid, pp.137-145), and Nirić prefers to perform in places of worship from the predominant religious communities in the region. In other words, Pontanima has performed Muslim songs in Catholic churches, Orthodox churches and synagogues, and Orthodox songs in courtyards of mosques for example. The members of Pontanima are more or less equally representative of these traditions but there are also a number of self-proclaimed atheists and other faiths. They perform mostly around Bosnia and Herzegovina in areas worst affected by the war. Audience reactions to their performances have
apparently ranged from anger and death-threats to tears of joy. Either way, most audiences were observed to have reacted with “shock” to some degree.

Pontanima resembles a classical choir in as much as they read from scores, the parts are arranged in a typical SATB format, the musical director directs using classically-trained gestures, the sound production is classical in technique, and at least a dozen choristers are professional opera singers. On occasion, Pontanima will sing pieces from the classical repertoire, especially if they are attending an international choir competition.

Today, Bosnia and Herzegovina as a country and society seems to be in a dire state. The common feeling is that the war has never ended; just that the killing has ceased, at least temporarily. People of all faiths struggle economically (the 2008 unemployment rate was over 45% \(^{36}\)) and the current government is believed by many to be actively part of organised crime or at least in collusion with it. Mostar, for example, the second largest city in Bosnia, remains completely divided, with Muslims on one side of the famous Stari Most and Catholics on the other. Due to this divide there was no elected mayor for over a year from 2008-2010 in Mostar as the Muslim and Catholic communities cannot agree on one. Meanwhile, buildings that were shelled sixteen years ago remain crumbling husks.

Conversely, Sarajevo has long been considered the most tolerant and ecumenical city within Bosnia and Herzegovina, and even all of Europe (Malcolm, 2002, p.149). According to members of Pontanima, this tolerant attitude was common in pre-war Sarajevo but has, however, changed since the war. They claim this has changed due to the amount of original citizens who were killed in the conflict, or escaped to other countries and who have not returned. The space that was left in the city was filled by people from the surrounding countryside. Most members of Pontanima are original citizens, and they feel that these newcomers are less tolerant and more likely to succumb to divisive nationalistic and religious propaganda. This implies that Pontanima is no longer representative of the Sarajevo community as it currently

\(^{36}\) http://www.indexmundi.com/g/g.aspx?c=bk&v=74 [Accessed 13 April 2013].

stands; it is representative of a pre-war educated and cosmopolitan Sarajevo society. Even within Pontanima itself, signs of dissent are emerging. Some within Pontanima are beginning to question for the first time in the history of the choir whether or not Nirić’s original mission is relevant anymore.
5. Findings

5.1 Introduction
The separate themes that have arisen between these two choirs illustrate site-specificity and similar themes indicate commonalities. Across the two sites there arose three broad categories:

- musical meaning is contextual;
- music as a procedural metaphor;
- music as tacit cultural knowledge.

Music as a social cultural activity may be universal, but any one particular type of music is very much particular and, while it is physically easy to transport music in the modern age to anywhere on the planet, the meaning of the music is less straightforward. These concepts will be further explored below.

Music in context can be further broken down into the following categories:

- music as a contextual normalisation tool;
- music as a reflexive memory management tool;
- music as an emotional regulator;
- music as a belief construction tool.

Music as a procedural metaphor can be further broken down into the following categories:

- musical processes as a metaphor for conflict transformation processes
- the reflexive relationships between music, belief, identity, emotion, memory and behaviour.
- music as tacit cultural knowledge, including concepts of cultural identity, collective beliefs and understanding as expressed and mediated through musical experiences.

Throughout the rest of this chapter, I will systematically look at each of these categories and subcategories to discover how music has been used in these ways, and to consider how this relates to conflict transformation. This will be followed in the next chapter by further analysis of the findings.
5.2 Music in Context

5.2.1 Music as a contextual normalisation tool

The term normal is rather problematic since it has many connotations ranging from the mathematical usage of the most commonly occurring to what is commonly deemed acceptable in social situations. Nevertheless, it is the appropriate term to use here as both an umbrella term including such concepts as identity formation, in-out group boundary defining and the construction of beliefs about one’s world. In other words, what is ‘normal’ to any one group is very much dependent on the context from which it is derived. There is no one ‘normal’ identity, although within any identity there is a feeling or belief of what is normal. Part of any identity formation is an understanding of where the boundaries lie between belonging to one identity or another. These boundaries therefore determine what lies within a particular norm and what lies outside. None of these concepts are concrete and are pure social constructs based on the shared beliefs of those within any social group. These beliefs are reflexively influenced by the context in which they arose. Music intersects with all three of these concepts, whether it is through consolidating existing identities, realising potential new identities or challenging existing identities. Belief systems are influenced by contextual memories, emotions and sense of identity and musical experiences are meaningful only as much as they can be understood in terms of memory, emotion and belief. Musical experience itself affirms or challenges memories, emotions and identities and in this way music can be seen to influence belief. Furthermore, since behaviour is often influenced by belief, music therefore indirectly influences behaviour through these channels.

"Normal" was the single largest informant category that emerged from my fieldwork with Pontanima, but it also arose at the Songlines site. Even within the specific context of Pontanima the term was used in a variety of manners, from anger and confusion towards those who caused atrocities as "normal":

“...we were so angry and confused...why would they, who were also Bosnian, ok they were Bosnian Serbs, but they were still Bosnian. And there were Bosnian Serbs in Sarajevo who were also confused. Why would they do this to us? It was normal to think like this.” (Ruža)
...to all faiths in the region living harmoniously side by side being reported as "normal":

“...it was normal in Sarajevo before the war for everyone from different backgrounds to do things together, growing up together.” (Melita).

This focus on ‘normality’ ties in with the Luzha’s discussion about how Kosovans wished to express themselves in a similar manner to how they perceived normal European countries did (Luzha 2005). In the beginning, Pontanima desired to demonstrate normal European cultural expression through a high musical skill set and cultural capital yet the later observation that normal European countries generally do not have cultural expressions with a specific peacebuilding agenda led some in Pontanima to call for the abolishment of this agenda. The sense of normality that bridged both the peacebuilding agenda and the desire to end it is the sense of a habitus of tolerance and ethnic intermingling that was believed to have occurred in pre-war Sarajevo as represented by the public displays of choral music. "Normal" in this context was what they believed to be normal for them in their context, what they remembered they believed to be normal and what they desired to be normal in the future.

Songlines, being comprised of mainly middle-class middle-aged British women, simply has not had the extreme memories and emotions found within Pontanima, which has led to a more blurry understanding of the term, yet it has been used by most choristers there. In the Songlines context it was considered normal to be ambitious within the choir:

“I just wanted to sing as well as I could in Songlines. So did everyone, that was normal, I think.” (Daisy)

...as was it to fall in and out of favour with various other members of the choir, especially the director:

“Well, I mean, we don’t always get along like best buddies...we sometimes argue or fall out, especially with Theresa...it’s quite normal to fall out with Theresa on occasion.” (Richard).

In all cases, music was used in the normalisation process and the type of music, the way it is performed and the musical content all contributed to this.
5.2.1.1 Pontanima before meeting Songlines

“They first performed the Ilahija was 1998 in October at the Inter-Religious Meeting. It is something that occurs every year here in St. Anthony’s Church so it was the first time it was here. The reactions were normal when you consider everything that happened here because the wounds were still open when they performed the Ilahija so it was normal to expect the people wouldn’t have just forgot everything that was happening here: the evil and the shock, whatever. Also there were death threats to Fra Jadranko. We were protected because he stood in front of the choir and everything that was addressed to the choir Jadranko was the one that took it well when you consider death threats you have to consider whether you continue or not, but he continued. There’s also mixed reactions from Bosnian Franciscans here. Also you have to separate the Bosnian Franciscans from the Roman Catholic orders so there was also mixed reactions here they thought we were creating a new religion or something like that because they didn’t understand what was happening. They couldn’t understand that Ilahija, or Orthodox songs or Jewish songs were performed here in the church. They couldn’t comprehend what was going on. Because in the beginning there was some trouble but with the continuous work, they had a goal to be fulfilled, they somehow healed the people, it destroyed the prejudices the people had. That you could sing Islamic, or Orthodox, or Jewish songs in the church. And nowadays I think it’s normal for them to hear so there’s no problem nowadays.” (Yeşim).

What Yeşim describes here is how strong traumatic memories and emotions of recent events had normalised certain beliefs about segments of Bosnian society and their cultural expressions. When this normality was challenged, there were strong emotional reactions which by their very nature are prone to become strong memories. By carrying on and repeating this process over time, Pontanima have gradually been able to temper some of the more hateful and negative memories and emotions with more benign and even pleasant ones associated with the performances. Additionally, having people from other cultures enter their holiest and precious spaces to perform cultural expressions of a former enemy has now become normalised and therefore less problematic.

Pontanima generally look towards European and other western nations as the gold standard for what is considered to be normal. Pontanima performed at the World Council of Churches in Geneva in 2004 and Kreso described meeting people from other European countries that did not have this recent memory of civil war:
“The people there they were ‘normal’. It was really interesting for them to see how we perform.”

Another informant, the same one who told me I would never be a part of Pontanima, told me:

“You are Canadian; you are from a normal country. You’re normal. You don’t understand Bosnia.”

There is a feeling that the rest of Europe thinks that Bosnians and other Balkans are inherently violent and that this attitude has rubbed off on the Bosnian psyche.

“The Balkans, when you look at the Balkans, they also look at the people as a savage people that we always have to be at war, every 50 years we have to kill each other, etc. That point of view is something, it’s not our point of view but it came from central Europe, from other part of Europe. But at some point we accepted that point of view so we ourselves consider ourselves as a savage people, it’s normal for us to be at war.” (Yeşim).

This implies that they believe that Bosnia is somehow not normal but they wish to be and they refer to other Western countries as models. They also look to Pontanima and performing to an international standard as a normal public expression of nation. Indeed, it is this desire for a national expression of normality that has fuelled the pressure from some within Pontanima to perform concert repertoire at festivals and competitions, instead of the purely liturgical music as dictated by the choir’s mission:

“We would like to perform as a good choir at competitions, to sing arias and secular pieces, to be a normal good choir.” (Neno).

This concept of normalisation goes beyond direct experience, and is demonstrated in a shared collective memory or system of beliefs about the past. Many informants who were old enough to remember the Tito era do so with fondness. Many refer to Tito as “like a father to us” (Melita). Those in Pontanima who were too young to remember this era also refer to Tito in positive terms.

“Tito was good to us, there was no war between Muslims, Orthodox and Catholics, we had jobs, could go on holidays, he was like an uncle. Bosnia was normal then.” (Draga).

The facts about Tito’s violent suppression of opposition and his complete denial of growing economic crises are either unknown amongst the informants or they chose
to ignore them. In either case, the Tito era is viewed as generally positive and normal compared to the current era: there was low unemployment, relative freedom of movement, and a freely mingling diverse cosmopolitan population. It is this last point that inspired Pontanima in the first place. Pontanima serves as a reminder that it was considered normal for all three religions and nationalities to co-operate together within Bosnian society.

According to Coser (1964), a conflict situation is manageable if it consists of normal forms of social interaction that affect the maintenance, change, development and/or stability of any particular social entity. Conflict transformation would be deemed to be successful, therefore, if the conflict violence had been arrested and this normal level of conflict was established. Normal here is a limitation of conflict: if a conflict does not escalate into violence and it inhabits the ever shifting boundaries between stability and change, then that conflict is normal. If a conflict escalates into violence it is no longer normal, according to Coser. Of course, what is considered normal in one context might lead to violent conflict in another, as Fattah describes in discussion about cultural abuse:

“Abuse...is culturally relative, and even within the same culture what may be considered abuse in a given social class may be a normal or standard practice in another.” (Fattah 2003, p.770).

In the case of Pontanima, therefore, this process of remembering a perceived less conflictual, normal, time combined with an attempt of over-riding the current normality of hatred through repeated unharmful exposure to the perceived enemy has gone some way towards establishing a normal level of conflict in the areas in which they perform. This may be temporary, as the memory of the experience fades, but this is precisely why Pontanima revisit these spaces when they can. Each recurrence helps to establish the memory, the emotion and the belief a little more.

Music itself can be viewed as an analogue of conflict; an ever-changing sonic sea of tensions and releases. Experiencing these little conflicts through music embodies Coser’s manageable normal conflict definition. This occurs as an experience transferring tacit knowledge about what is normal, both within the musical setting itself but also within the culture(s) from which the music came. In the case of
Pontanima, therefore, working together to produce sounds and performances that they feel is good and normal, and gets approval from Kreso as the musical director in the first case, but also from the international choral community. This is the musical embodiment of a wider cultural normality, which is what so many of those within Pontanima yearned for:

“We just want to be seen as a normal choir...if Kreso like what we do they we are happy...We want to be a good choir that can compete in competitions all over the world.” (Anita)

Indeed, when the choristers were actively participating in Pontanima, they identified themselves as ‘Pontanima’ rather than as individuals: “When we sing together, we are Pontanima, nothing else.” (Anita).

As mentioned earlier, the strength of the normalisation category as found within Pontanima was largely absent or much weaker within Songlines. This further strengthens the idea that music’s ability to engage with conflict transformation is very much based in the context from which it sprung. The form it takes, from the musical content, the form of expression, and the meanings associated with it are inevitably going to vary greatly from site to site. What is important is to understand the process of how music interacts with memory, emotion, identity and belief is the same even if all else is drastically dissimilar.

5.2.1.2 Songlines

While the term normal was used comparatively rarely by Songlines informants, it was used occasionally. Richard, a long standing member of the choir, illustrated the nebulous understanding of normality within Songlines:

“It’s just a bunch of normal people who enjoy singing, getting together and singing.”

Later on in the interview he contradicted this somewhat:

“Songlines isn't a normal community choir; it's full of middle-class liberal Guardian-readers, which I wouldn't say is normal for this community around here.”

There was considerably less consensus on what normal meant within Songlines.
Normality is not only contextual, but it is also in constant flux as memories, emotions, beliefs and actions influence each other. Music, as a form of social interaction, communication and expression, intersects all of these areas making it particularly effective at tracing and instigating such changes. Elements of this model can be found within the music sociology literature as well. DeNora, for example, has discussed how musical repetition in children’s songs entrains and embodies what is viewed as normal sexual orientation (DeNora 2000, p.78). Conversely, people use music in situations that are not normal, or regular, in order to help get themselves into a particular mood or frame of mind that is out of the ordinary (Ibid, p.57). Frith has pointed out that, within popular music, a sense of normality largely controls the industrial-musical output through the exposure and repetition of songs. This process, on occasion, somehow transcends normality as well as when a song is considered by many to be of superior quality (Frith 2007, p.305). As Foucault claimed, state institutions have played a large role around the world in attempting to establish what is normal within their jurisdiction through education and cultural procedures (McGushin 2007, p.227). What all of these disparate strands have in common in this context is that normality is a collective understanding about what a group believes, feels and remembers and that these emotions, beliefs and memories can be affected by repetition and, indeed, music.

5.2.1.3 The meeting of the choirs

While Theresa and for the most part all of Songlines were impressed by Pontanimá’s approach and results, Kreso in particular was not as impressed by Songlines. During later interviews it became clear that Kreso did not respect Theresa’s approach and he thought it was childish. He was essentially using the invitation as an attempt to raise funds to bring Pontanimá to the UK.

“Kreso told us that Songlines was a fun choir which meant that it was not a serious choir. For many of us this meant ‘why should we be involved with a choir that is not serious?’” (Melita)

“So Kreso was saying that ok, maybe Songlines isn’t such a great choir but maybe they can invite us to go to London and we’ve never been to London, so maybe we should work with them to do that.” (Ruža).
Emil, on the other hand, understood some of the potential benefits of working with Songlines.

“So many people in Pontanima are so full of shit, they think they know everything. They can’t see that trying to work in a different way isn’t somehow degrading, but that it can open your mind up to new possibilities. They think that Theresa’s way of working is childish but she’s an artist and we could use some of her loosening up of things.”

They did agree on a joint project where Songlines would visit Sarajevo for a workshop and concert with Pontanima, followed by the reverse with Pontanima visiting London and Songlines. In addition to performing some of their own repertoire, it was agreed that each choir would learn a couple of songs from the other choir’s repertoire in the manner in which they would learn it themselves. This was a crucial point since that would mean Pontanima would learn two Songlines pieces aurally without sheet music and that Songlines would learn two Pontanima pieces with sheet music.

Theresa was very worried about how Songlines was going to come across to Pontanima, given Kreso’s attitude during their meeting. Many within Songlines expressed that they felt Pontanima were being rather arrogant. Theresa suggested that what Songlines could teach Pontanima was not technique or skill but about world music traditions and a sense of fun.

“Pontanima are such a fantastic choir but they don’t know how to enjoy themselves and have fun. That’s what we can show them. Songlines is all about everyone singing and dancing and celebrating life in the traditions of the world. I mean you watch Pontanima and you hear this amazing sound but look at how they stand, they are so stiff and formal. Songliners move around with big smiles on our faces, so that’s what we can teach them.” (Theresa).

Meanwhile, Theresa told Songlines that she was making another subset of the choir for the Sarajevo trip, which would have to include only those who could afford to pay their own way and, crucially, had the ability to read music. Some, including Emma, were very upset about this turn of events, since they believed it went against the very inclusive nature of Songlines which did not require such skills to take part.

“I just think that one of the main reasons why I love Songlines is that it was so inclusive. As soon as you make the choir exclusive, excluding some members
who had been loyal for so many years, it is no longer the same thing. I don’t agree with it and I can’t be a part of a choir that dismisses longstanding loyal members just because Theresa has a project she wants to do.” (Emma)

Emma actually did have these music skills but she quit the entire choir since this went against her principles. Most of the others who were excluded in this process actually seemed to be accepting of this state of affairs. This new Sarajevo-Songlines group had a separate rehearsal time arranged and I, unfortunately for observation purposes, was recruited by Theresa to play the written parts on piano and also to sing them for the choristers to record on their Dictaphones or other recording devices so they could rehearse at home at their leisure. In other words, non-music readers did not have to be excluded since there was this manner of learning occurring.

By the time Songlines visited Sarajevo in September 2009, the Sarajevo section of the choir had learned two songs from the Pontanima repertoire partially through reading the music scores and partially through repeated aural learning. Songlines arrived in Sarajevo the night before the planned joint workshop and early on the next morning Kreso arrived at the hotel where Songlines was staying and “requested” (some would later say “demanded”) that the Songlines pieces be notated for Pontanima. The resident “musician” from the Wednesdays section of Songlines, Maura, was recruited at this point to notate all the parts for these two songs by Theresa, singing each note of each line one by one. Maura has solid relative pitch skills, so this at least was possible, but quite stressful for her, especially since Kreso was continually looking over Maura’s shoulder as she worked, frowning.

When it came time for the workshop, Theresa and Songlines were informed that Songlines could use the space to rehearse for most of the day and Pontanima would join them for one hour for the workshop followed by 30 minutes of their own rehearsal time, then they would leave. This was not what Theresa had believed was happening. Indeed, it is this particular issue that later caused much confusion and ill-feeling between the choirs, the directors and also within the respective choirs themselves, as will be explained later.

One thing all of this illustrates is that the power relationships between the choirs and within the choirs are unequal, with various individuals behaving and assuming
certain expectations of themselves and others. Theresa and many in Songlines felt insecure and intimidated, while Kreso and Pontanima felt superior and confident. This was manifested in Kreso making further demands of Songlines and Songlines complying. It also explains the lack of concern shown by Pontanima regarding the visit by Songlines and how they changed plans at the last minute. It also goes some way to explaining why so few from Pontanima actually participated in both the workshop and the joint concert. This was confirmed by one informant:

“It makes me angry, actually, that so many people in Pontanima felt that this project was beneath them. It was a wonderful opportunity to work in a different way. Unfortunately, this attitude is common in Pontanima.” (Ruža).

People within both choirs often stated their shared identity as “Songliners” or simply “Pontanima” regardless of their role(s) within the choirs, yet in the above situation it is clear that all members were not equal. In both choirs, the directors have influenced the behaviours of their respective choirs and their attitudes to the other choir. Theresa temporarily radically changed the whole ethos of Songlines in order to participate with Pontanima in Sarajevo, by only taking the more skilled singers and notating their pieces. Kreso did not bother communicating much about the joint project to the rest of Pontanima, since he did not consider it very worthy of them, which later manifested itself in a low participation rate. Pontanima had a much stronger power advantage over Songlines that was socially agreed by all parties. Within each choir, the director had huge power advantages over the rest of the members. The internal power structures predated the joint project and so were not created by this situation. The power relations between the choirs could not have been observed without this project, for obvious reasons. How the internal power relationships manifested themselves in terms of real actions would not have occurred without this project, since Songlines would not have had the opportunity to compare themselves directly to such a choir as Pontanima; they would not have had the opportunity to feel inadequate, and have these feelings confirmed by the attitudes displayed by Kreso and Emil upon their visit to London, nor would these opportunities have inspired Theresa to forget about years of Songlines protocol in order to make the project happen.
Not only was the normalisation process occurring within the choirs, two tiers of belief systems were interacting with each other as well as affecting this normalisation process. The first tier was that the choristers tended to believe what their directors told them regarding the other choir.

“Kreso told us that Songlines were some amateur choir that just did it for fun, not a serious choir, not real musicians.” (Melita).

“Theresa kept telling us how amazing Pontanima were, we were intimidated.” (Liza).

The second tier of belief was what the choir directors believe about the other choir which is what fed down into the choirs’ beliefs. Interestingly, the two choir directors had a shared belief to an extent. Both believed that Songlines could learn a lot from Pontanima, but Theresa also believed that Pontanima could learn from Songlines whereas Kreso did not share this belief.

“Pontanima are so good, we can learn so much from them. But we also can teach them a thing or two. About having fun and freedom and movement, and expression of joy.” (Theresa).

“I think you (Songlines) have potential as a choir. You love singing. We can help you.” (Kreso).

After the joint concert was over, there was a buffet and an after-party with lots of food and rakia (a local brandy). A number of Pontanima left immediately, and a further number did not really interact with the members of Songlines. There were around six or seven members of Pontanima that did interact fully with Songlines at this point, which by the end of the party, had led both sides to change their beliefs about the other choir and in turn their ideas of what was normal. Interactions took the form of talking, sharing stories about Bosnia and England or London and Sarajevo and sharing food and drink, but the most significant form of interaction was what Theresa labelled the “choir battle.”

Immediately after the concert ended, Theresa and a few others expressed to each other (and to me) their disappointment that they were not seen in the best light since they felt that their performance had been judged by the same criteria used to define a ‘good’ performance by Pontanima. Since Songlines specialised in the informal
approach to music-making, Theresa arranged for Songlines to sing a couple of their favourite songs during the party. Theresa at one point announced that they were going to offer a gift to Pontanima through their singing and once she had everyone’s attention the Wednesdays group sang a song. This was slightly disingenuous since it was not a Songlines favourite but rather a Wednesdays favourite which showcased some of the most skilled and passionate singers, all female, in Songlines. The response from most of Pontanima was really positive and it appeared that they finally understood to some degree what Songlines had been trying to do.

“I told you before that I thought Theresa’s approach was rather childish and I wasn’t sure about Songlines as a choir, but I agreed to do this project because I trust Kreso and Fra Jadranko and because I love singing. Now I can see that you (Songlines), too, love singing. We all love singing so who cares about whether it is classical, or world music, or whatever, it is most important to love singing. So I think I understand Theresa and Songlines a bit better now.” (Melita).

Kreso interpreted this as a challenge, so he gathered some of his singers who also worked together in the Sarajevo Opera Chorus and sang an operatic number. This was very different from Pontanima, as the singers moved and laughed at their own lyrics. This in turn showed those in Songlines that Pontanima wasn’t all just about stuffy religious performativity. Throughout the night, Theresa and Kreso would gather various members of their respective choirs to give impromptu performances of pieces that they felt would somehow show their superiority over the other; technique versus fun, although ironically Theresa was highlighting their most skilful singers and pieces while Kreso highlighted his most fun pieces. The numbers involved in these bouts of choral battle gradually dwindled as members of both sides began to feel that this was really about a battle of egos between the directors.

“They are the same, actually, Kreso and Theresa. They have to win. They won’t stop, they’ll go on forever. Maybe they should get married or something.” (Emil).

Once both sets of choristers found a common ground between skill, fun and passion through music-making, they became less interested in what the directors were doing or saying, and just wanted to socialise with each other. In other words, the choirs’ beliefs were originally largely influenced by the directors until they experienced a
common musical experience. At this point, their beliefs began to change, and a form of unity and acceptance became the norm, instead one of indifference on one side and intimidation on the other. Furthermore, once a common ground had been established they were no longer dependent on the guidance of their respective leaders.

This illustrates several aspects of the normalisation process: first, normalisation is based on shared beliefs and a repetition of expressions of these beliefs; Second, what is considered to be normal is very much contextual, as every group will have at least some separate shared beliefs and memories; finally, normalisation is an ever-changing process that emerges as new experiences and realisations begin to influence beliefs. Whether or not this belief change was afforded by the music alone or extra-musical aspects will now be examined a little further.

The structures that choirs operated in are not musical in themselves and these structures helped to create or at least reinforce the choirs’ original belief systems about the other choir and therefore the normalisation process. The sharing of food and drink was a communal experience, but it did not seem to feature much in changing perceived normality. Both choirs felt that this was a normal behaviour and context for a post-concert environment, but it did nothing to challenge perceptions so therefore remained an un-discussed feature. There were plenty of extra-musical features of the performances, as there always is: Pontanima dressed in identical black t-shirts with a Pontanima logo, blue jeans, black shoes and black belts. Songlines dressed in bright primary colours. Pontanima’s mouth shapes were very open and uniform, whereas Songlines’ faces were all sorts of shapes and degrees of openness. Pontanima’s bodies did not move much at all, as opposed to Songlines’ constant movement by many. Pontanima had sheet music in black folders all held in an identical manner, half way up their bodies and Songlines had nothing. None of these extra-musical activities were witnessed as creating a change in the sense of normality. If anything, they were further expressions of the different normalities. The only observed experience that challenged the choirs’ sense of normality was the choir battles, and this was in spite of the structural belief systems passed on by their directors. Nothing exists in isolation and the connections between music and other social activities is required for any change normalisation, identity, memory or
anything to occur, yet music remains of paramount importance since it is the primary form of expression that intersects so strongly with all of these aspects required to influence behaviour, whether it be conflict transformation behaviour or any other form of behaviour.

5.2.1.4 Contextual music normalisation and conflict transformation

Pontanima has a conflict transformation remit expressed in the form of their mission statement. Fra Jadranko’s vision of a multi-faith choir all stubbornly equally sharing a platform in areas where this was often first felt to be antagonistic, has a direct relationship to the field of music and social change and to conflict transformation itself. The effects of musical normalisation within the Pontanima context are easier to explore than with Songlines, since Songlines does not have such a remit. In the case of Songlines, it is within the problems surrounding the meeting of the choirs that the role of music and conflict transformation can be explored, albeit on a safer and non-violent manner then experienced in Bosnia.

When Yeşim discussed the shift in normality from when Pontanima first began performing until now, she was illustrating how changes in perceived normality can directly affect conflict transformation conditions. One of the primary conditions of a win-win outcome in conflict transformation is a mutual understanding and acceptance of the parties in conflict. One barrier to this level of acceptance is a belief that the other party/parties is/are somehow abnormal. By changing the perceptions of normality, it is possible to access the level of mutual understanding required for successful conflict transformation processes to occur. Music appears here to have been a successful conduit for initiating this process by altering belief systems through adding positive experiential memories to the existing traumatic and negative ones. Repetition of this type of event means that those more positive memories, or at least less antagonistic memories, are more recent and growing in strength then the negative ones. The negative memories are so strong that they will probably never be forgotten, and negative feelings might continue for a very long time, but at least musical experiences of this kind demonstrate that they can open some doors towards working towards a shared future in a joint society.
Songlines and Pontanima were not exactly in conflict with each other per se, but they both harboured some prejudices about each other prior to their meeting. As illustrated in the previous section, the choral battles rather ironically enabled the choristers to explore their commonalities in a way that their normal manners of behaviour did not allow. Furthermore, it was the breaking away not only from their norm but from the restrictive controls of their directors that enabled both sets to temporarily feel as if they were a part of the same experience. In this case it was both the musical event itself as well as a reaction to the competiveness displayed by the directors in the event that led to this shift in what was felt to be normal by both choirs.

Most informants within Pontanima claimed that they were largely unaware of conflict transformation processes occurring at all when they engaged with music, but they would also suffix such claims with statements such as

“It’s just normal to want to sing with a good choir, no matter what kind of people are in it. And since these people want the same thing, it is normal.” (Draga).

This is particularly true of the younger choristers who were not present during the death threat era. For these younger members, Pontanima was already largely accepted in the areas of great tension. One exception to this is that Pontanima now have collaborative relationships with a choir in Republika Srpska and in Serbia, which was unheard of even as recently as this research.37 Those that were old enough and who were a part of Pontanima since the beginning do mention this process, as Draga expressed in the previous section. In that case they were aware of what was normal prior to the conflict, during the first times Pontanima performed in areas of great trauma, and also how this changed again after several repetitions. Furthermore, they were aware of how this shift in normality aided peaceful relationships.

37 These collaborations developed after my research completed; I was informed recently about this development by an informant via email.
Members of both choirs were aware of and often mentioned that the key moment in the meeting of the choirs was the spontaneous choral battle scene.

“Ok, it was like a war almost, but for the first time I understood that you (Songlines) were just a normal good choir who loved to sing.” (Melita).

“When we sang against each other after the concert, that was my favourite part of the trip. It was like we let our guards down and could see each other just as people who loved to sing and enjoy life.” (Charlotte)

It was the first time that both choirs could experience something that they felt was completely shared by the other, and that the other seemed to be experiencing the event in a similar manner to them. In this way they were aware of the music’s effects on this minor conflict transformation situation, yet, when asked, they both would refer to the abstract musical properties themselves and the very physical act of singing.

“Singing together is the best thing for myself but also for my connection to others. I feel the sound inside and hear it come out and I know that is myself. I know everyone else feels the same and when we sing well together I know we can get along just fine because everyone is making an effort to fit together in song.” (Ruža).

“When I sing it is me, it’s more direct than playing the piano or guitar...you are the instrument. And when you sing in a choir you are singing as something else while still being extremely personal. It’s amazing.” (Nicky).

This evidence points more towards the relationships the choristers had with musical experiences than to the musical material itself. The fact that they had similar attitudes towards specific musical material and embodied meaning attached to the physical expression of singing is the reason why they could find common ground. The experience of a temporary shared musical identity created a shift in what was sensed to be normal.

This type of experience differs from DeNora’s explorations of music and everyday life (2000) firstly since the experience was not an everyday one. Although it could be argued that what is perceived to be everyday is, in fact, normal, in the cases illustrated above it is both the challenge to the norm and the changing of norm that is important in conflict transformation. Both the experience of singing the music of a perceived enemy in one’s safest and holiest of places, and the shared experience of
the choral battle, challenged beliefs about certain groups of people, successfully altering them to a degree, and thereby shifting what was accepted as normal. In other words, everyday is normal but not everything that is accepted as normal is everyday. Perception of normality extends beyond one’s daily experiences towards an understanding of how one’s daily experiences relate to those of others. Sloboda’s work on music and emotions in everyday life confirms this:

“In relation to the quality of the experience, everyday experiences are low on intensity, memorability and integration; whereas the non-everyday experience are, on average, higher in all these respects. In relation to content, everyday experiences involve basic level self-referential emotions, with a focus on factors external to the music, and a significant proportion of negative reactions; whereas non-everyday experiences tend towards more complex, broadly positive, and other-referenced emotions drawing on the music itself. The context of everyday experience is one focussed on the goal achievement of the listener as elicited through discourse; whereas the non-everyday context focuses on the aesthetic reactions to the work and those that produced it, as elicited through a range of behavioural and psychological measures.” (Sloboda 2010, p.511).

This also demonstrates the difference between the belief in the power of musical properties themselves as pure physically experienced sound, and the slow common ground-building work that has been demonstrated above. Many informants, especially in Songlines, expressed this common belief that music, any music, can positively affect people and therefore conflict just by music’s inherent properties.

“Of course music is a great healer.” (Theresa).

“Music is such a wonderful gift; everyone should do it because it can make you feel so good and so connected to people.” (Daisy).

When probed about this, the typical response was that it had further resonance within the discipline of singing, since it was your whole body that is involved in expressing something together with others.

“You breathe in before you sing and breathe out as sound; you express yourself with your voice, your heart, your lungs and your whole body. And when you do this together as a group, it is as if you are one body.” (Theresa).
While there is plenty of evidence to suggest that any shared social activity that contains shared goals and outcomes develops stronger bonds and identities, these statements do not demonstrate how music is any different from any other social activity, as Bergh has concluded (2010). Digging a little deeper it is clear that the choristers have experienced social change within themselves, their choirs and attitudes towards the other choir, and this has demonstrably occurred within musical activity.

“It’s only when I am singing in Songlines that I feel really happy and connected...belong to some sort of community.” (Liza).

While it may be possible that this could have occurred in another fashion, it was in these cases most certainly musical activity that enabled the change in what was sensed to be normal and therefore establishing a basis for positive social change or conflict transformation.

Another key requirement of a win-win outcome in conflict transformation is a reduction in tension between the parties involved. Again, in both the cases discussed here, musical activity has played a role in this. Pontanima has demonstrably reduced tension between certain audiences and the choir through repeated performances over time. The tension was created by a feeling perceived by the audiences that the choir was acting in an antagonistic manner by performing the songs of their enemies in exactly the places they should not. During the first performances, the choir almost became the enemy. After repeated performances, two things seem to have occurred: the choir was no longer viewed as an enemy and the idea that former enemies could be viewed differently became possible.

“When we first performed in Lepenića Fra Jadranko received death threats but now, when we play in Republika Srpska, there is no problem. In fact, we have even made friends with a choir in Banja Luka. This would not have happened if we hadn’t performed what we perform in these places again and again.” (Anita).

Although it was on a much lesser scale, the tensions between Songlines and Pontanima were real and the choral battle went some way towards reducing this tension. The demonstrated bonhomie during and after these battles was palpable. Since this event, tensions have soared within both choirs and, as a result, increased
between the choirs to the point where no further collaborations were possible. This meant that the Pontanima visit to London did not occur and is unlikely to do so.

An ideal outcome in conflict transformation would be the emergence of a new shared identity felt to be equally applied in terms of power, resources and expressions by all those involved. It is clear that in these examples that each choir has a strong sense of its own identity and those within the choirs expressed very similar attitudes towards this concept. Only in the example of the choral battle has this idea of the development of a new shared identity been clearly demonstrated, however. While each choir took turns during this event and they never jointly performed anything, they both realised that their love of music was the same and how each other performed informally was also the same. This realisation in this case was enough to overcome any tensions or separateness, for at least the remainder of the trip. This form of conflict is admittedly very mild and it is difficult to see how a new shared identity was created by Pontanima’s performances. Those within Pontanima feel that they are part of the same shared identity, despite being from a variety of religious and cultural backgrounds. Shared musical experiences have strengthened their already existing sense of identity which was originally manifested from a belief that such differences did not matter at all as long as everyone could sing well.

These examples support Small’s proposition that communal music production and creation is a potent form of musicking in terms of identity formation and/or strengthening (1998). Given that the creation of a new shared identity between conflicting parties is one of the ideal outcomes in conflict transformation music production was researched rather than consumption, which is a different focus from both DeNora’s early research on consumption practices in everyday life (2000) but also distinct from her more recent research on musical entrainment and wellbeing (2010; 2011), although the latter shares a concern for the active production of music. There is an additional distance from DeNora’s research, through a focusing on the extraordinary rather than the everyday, due to the higher emotional and memory intensities these events have on individual and social actors (Sloboda 2010).

Some previous researchers in this field, like Bergh, have discovered to their frustration the difficulty in ascertaining just what is going on in the “black box” of
musical activity, especially in the context of conflict transformation settings. Coming from the opposite line of inquiry, ethnomusicologists can accurately trace the precise expressions of rhythm, melody, harmony, textures, tempi, instrumentation, and lyrical content and even the physiology and embodied gestures in music but they lack the social perspective in order to derive the complex meanings behind these phenomena. One of the major claims of this thesis is that any aspect of musical phenomena is only as meaningful to any individual or group as the interaction of identity, memory, emotion and belief has allowed. This being a completely amoral process, this can manifest in positive and negative ways, so familiar aspects in unfamiliar musics might seem attractive to some while for those dissatisfied with their own culture might find any familiarity repugnant. For this reason, it is impossible to generalise or make universal claims about any form or type of music or even any specific musical element. It is vital that the context and interaction of these elements are understood in order to ascertain the musical possibilities. For these particular research sites, it is clear that the primary elements felt to be important to the informants were harmony and melody, along with the pure physicality of singing. This was common in both sites. Culturally, this had been a common public expression of civic and cultural normality within Bosnia and so ties strongly in with memory and deep yearning for those in Pontanima. The belief that the pre-war Tito-era was a better time and that that kind of social identity is still possible in the future has motivated them to continue and this is constantly reinforced through reiterated, memory-affirming behaviour. Songlines, as was explained in the Introduction to Research Sites chapter, are part of a loose British tradition of amateur choral singing as a means of bringing together a community that stems from Victorian philanthropic thinking. The community it brings together, however, is not a traditional one, but an urban diaspora of economic migrants who felt displaced in their new home, motivated by memories of how they felt a sense of togetherness when they have sung in groups, and a belief that it is this feeling of togetherness that in actuality makes a community.

5.2.2 Music as a reflexive memory management tool
Having now established that the meaning of music and therefore the purpose and use of any music is very much dependent on the social context, I will now examine
just what happens in active musicking regardless of context. One aspect is linked to memory and how music reflexively interacts with one’s sense of memory, both triggering memories, altering them, and providing a framework for thinking about the present and future.

Music that builds upon existing positive memories has a better chance of engaging with participants in the present and therefore reinforcing these same memories. Conversely, music that builds upon negative memories could also reinforce negativity in the present. In the case of Pontanima, however, there are often cases where a musical event contains both. For example, Pontanima performed an early concert on October 31, 1998 at the Church of St. Anthony’s in Sarajevo as part of the Meditative Interreligious meeting, “Reconciliation and Peace”. As with most Pontanima concerts, the repertoire was equal parts Catholic, Orthodox, Jewish and Muslim songs, but in this instance sung in an area where there had been much suffering during the siege of Sarajevo. Here, singing Catholic songs led to feelings of solidarity amongst the majority of the audience, which built on positive memories of belonging. Orthodox and Islamic songs, on the other hand, reminded them of the enemy or the ‘other’ and this built upon negative memories.

“They couldn’t understand that Ilahija, or Orthodox songs or Jewish songs were performed here in the church. They couldn’t comprehend what was going on. Because in the beginning there was some trouble but with the continuous work, they had a goal to be fulfilled, they somehow healed the people, it destroyed the prejudices the people had. That you could sing Islamic, or Orthodox, or Jewish songs in the church. And nowadays I think it’s normal for them to hear so there’s no problem nowadays. In the country they are always asking more and more. Let’s say 12 or 13 years ago it was something completely different. But now it’s normal thing especially since we have these inter-religious meetings every year.” (Yeşim).

Having them side by side like this enabled a sort of negation to occur, or at least a lessening of the negative feelings the Catholics here had had towards Muslims and Orthodox Serbs. It would be nice to be able to say that the positive memory of the concert replaced the negative memory of the war, but that would be inaccurate since those memories are just too strong and traumatic for any event like this to erase. Yet after repeating this process a number of times, there is at least less animosity to the
choir, the idea of ‘other’ music and culture, and therefore a gradual increase in
tolerance of each other.

5.2.3.1 Music in Everyday Life

DeNora and Sloboda have written extensively on music and emotional regulation in
everyday life from sociological and psychological perspectives respectively, and I
have used these two approaches to frame how music has been used as an
emotional regulator within my research sites. One of the things that attracted
Songlines members to the choir was a sense of belonging that they generally did not
get from other aspects of their everyday lives. Most were not from London and
arrived there primarily for work purposes. This lack of family and friend networks
outside of work had led them to feel that there was something missing in their lives,
and they use the choir to achieve this feeling of belonging. This process regulated
their loneliness, and many talked about how Songlines was a primary source of
happiness for them.

One primary musical aspect that many within Songlines felt motivated them to join in
the first place was the act of singing harmony and the positive feelings that arose
from that activity.

“I just feel good when I sing with Songlines. No matter how I might have been
feeling during the day, during work, I feel better as soon as I start singing.”
(Charlotte).

A secondary motivation was the sense of pride for doing something well with others
without the pressure of work or family that arose from participation in Songlines.

“I get a lot of pressure at work and Songlines is something I do for
myself...something that I can work at in a group and feel proud of but without
the stress of work.” (Daisy).

“It feels great to work at something together and when it comes together, it’s
great. You don’t have to be worrying about other shitty things happening in
your life at that moment.” (Richard).

Finally, it was the social bonds and fun aspects surrounding the choir, although not
specifically musical in nature, that provided further motivation to remain in Songlines,
especially when they felt less than happy with the controlling nature of the director or other musical aspects.

“I have a lot of very good friends in Songlines, and to be honest, they are what keep me in Songlines, especially when Theresa is off on one.” (Richard).

Pontanima informants often echoed these sentiments during interviews, but due to access constraints this was not generally able to be observed. What are appealing to all informants are the extraordinary instances of musicking, not the everyday. Both choirs were very diverse in their personal tastes, from classical to punk, pop to death metal, but in the context of the choir it is the physical nature of the production of music that was felt to be the most important aspect of a coming together of like-minded individuals. This builds upon DeNora’s work which was more focussed on micro-management of daily activities with music, and ties it in with Small’s claims that active music production has more potential for bond-strengthening than does reception. Furthermore it builds on Sloboda’s work, in particular his joint chapter with Susan O’Neill in The Social Psychology of Music (2001), which claimed that

“...the impact of music on emotion is not direct but interdependent on the situation in which it is heard.” (p.415).

In other words, musical meaning and emotions are social and contextually derived and reflexive, or inter-dependent.

5.2.3.2 What music does versus what music is believed to do

Informants from both sites often talked about what music does to them, but when I probed further music was never mentioned in isolation. Music was always mentioned in reference to memories, emotions and beliefs about what was going on in the world around them, as well as the interior world of their sense of self, or in relation to the physical attributes of embodied expressions associated with musical expression.

Songliners, with their drive to feel connected in the anomie of the big city of London, attempted to connect with others through music and they believe they have connected on a deep or even spiritual level by doing so, which in turn generally led to a sense of wellbeing and satisfaction. However, this is tied up with childhood experiences or other previous experiences of feeling close to a group of people that shared music making. This in effect is the repetition, entrainment and embodied
cultural norms referred to by Small (1998) as well as the music and well-being referred to by Hanser (2010).

Bergh (2010) has criticised many studies in music sociology on conflict situations as they tended to focus on the experiences of the musicians or those in positions of power, rather than the subjects or recipients of such projects. Invariably, musicians have intense and positive experiences of musicking, whereas there is little data about audiences and what anecdotal evidence there is suggests that they experience music on a more mundane plane generally. Bergh concluded that the heightened experience of music production was not available to audiences, but he does not explore the potential of including audiences in active music production in order to share these experiences. Indeed, as the reflexive model shows, if a recipient does not have a strong connection to a form and expression of music in terms of their own biographical memory, identity, emotion and belief complex, then they would be unlikely to respond in the same fashion as the musicians delivering a project who have a greater chance of maintaining a stronger connection to the same music because of their biographies.

In Pontanima many choristers discussed how they felt better after having been to a choir event, be it a rehearsal or performance, no matter how they had felt prior. Their emotions have apparently been regulated, but who is actually doing the regulating? The choir have no choice in what they sing or how they sing it, for that role fell solely to the musical director. They have no choice in the style and content of the repertoire, which is decided solely by Kreso, or where they perform, that role lies solely on the shoulders of Fra Jadranko. Yet to no one does this feel like manipulation, neither by the directors nor to the choristers. One reason for this is the connection that the choristers already felt to the type of structure found within such a choir, which they felt was reassuring; they relished the knowledge of exactly what their role was and how to go about it. Even though the content of the music has been dictated by the directors of Pontanima, the choristers still felt that they were self-regulating their emotions, since they chose to be in the choir in the first place, knowing full well all that would entail. Similarly, Theresa chooses almost all of the music sung in Songlines or composes them herself, making her the emotional regulator of the choir. There was one exception to this when on one occasion
Theresa invited each Songliner to suggest a song they wished to sing in the choir. These were put into a hat and five were chosen at random. The choir was split into five parts and each part sang one of these songs after they had been arranged by Theresa. These sub-sections of the choir were temporary and these songs were sung only once in a concert setting. By and large, Theresa had as much direct control over the musical content as Fra Jadranko and Kreso did within Pontanima.

Pontanima is an arts organisation in a poor part of the world and fundraising is a necessary fact of life. This is the reason Fra Jadranko gave for breaking his mission statement of only performing liturgical music in places of worship, when Pontanima performed the Bosnian national anthem on the national radio and television stations: they were handsomely paid for their endeavours. They have also performed the Missa Bosnia, or Bosnian Mass, on a number of occasions with the Sarajevo Philharmonic Orchestra even though it is secular. This has led to internal conflicts within Pontanima. Since the choir is no longer strictly adhering to the mission statement, why bother with the mission statement at all? Many within the choir sing to a professional standard and wish to be permitted to use this wealth of skill to perform secular pieces from operas, cantatas, classical pieces, and so on. Fra Jadranko is adamant that they stick to the mission statement as best as possible. Indeed the tension was so great that Kreso had a stress related hospitalisation after a particularly turbulent tour in Germany in October 2009. Some have since claimed that they believe that Pontanima will split up ultimately because of this issue.

Interestingly, there is a discrepancy between what is generally reported by most informants and the Pontanima concert archives: informants usually claim that all concerts they do conform to the mission statement with the exception of a Christmas concert for the Church of St. Anthony’s as a thank-you for hosting them all of these years. Yet the archives clearly show that at least 88 out of 214 concerts between 1996 and 2006 did not adhere to the mission statement. While this still leaves the majority adhering successfully to the mission statement, 41% is still a significant portion to be collectively forgotten. This further illustrates how belief in the choir and its purpose affects memory in order to further bolster the collective belief. Choristers in Pontanima behave in a manner that indicates an unwavering adherence to their principles despite evidence to suggest otherwise. Ultimately, the facts matter little in
terms of understanding the choir's behavioural patterns, unless the facts are believed.

The top-down hierarchy of the choir provided a structural influence on more than just the musical selections available for the choirs to sing, it also enabled a bond between choristers that was separate from the directors as well as providing a buffer zone between the choristers and other musical agents. The bond felt between the choristers in both choirs was distinct from any bond that they felt towards the director. Most informants expressed love and admiration for the directors, but also quite often frustration, and even on occasion anger, and it was this sharing of similar feelings about the director that choristers felt more bonded as a result. These feelings of bonding in turn provided a precedent for further socialising away from the choir itself, and the directors were often not involved in these, further strengthening these bonds.

“Sometimes I really dislike her (Theresa), we all do, but we respect what she does...The most important thing is that we have all becomes good friends and we can all go the pub afterwards and bitch about her.” (Richard)

“Sometimes we don’t know why Kreso or Fra Jadranko are doing things in a certain way and we all moan about it together, which in some ways, makes us feel more tight, like a unit.” (Anita)

While the directors were close friends with some of the choristers, it was, for the most part, choristers who made close friends with other fellow choristers.

“I consider Theresa to be a friend, but I’m definitely much closer to a few others in the choir.” (Charlotte).

The directors were generally the first point of contact with the choirs, and therefore filtered and chose what other musical entities the choristers were exposed to. For example, both Theresa and Kreso have the sole responsibility for the hiring of outside musicians for any collaboration. Prior to this research, I had been one myself for Songlines, and Kreso has routinely hired outside composers and arrangers for their repertoire and involved outside musicians from the Sarajevo Opera and Orchestra. Furthermore, as was clearly seen in the meeting of the choirs, this filtering extended to personal opinions about other musical entities which quickly became the norm for opinions held throughout the choir until something provided
them with some basis on which to build a different opinion separate from that of the director.

“Kreso just told us that Songlines was not a serious choir and that maybe we shouldn’t waste our time. But now that I’ve met you, I can see that you are a serious choir and you really love singing and I have made my own mind up now to like you.” (Ruža).

My previous research suggested that this form of hierarchical musical system would not be as conducive to positive win-win conflict transformation since it has embedded within it an unequal power structure that would likely result in unequal social results. While this is still true, I had not originally taken into account the normalisation processes. A truly flat hierarchical music system where all members were equally responsible for the music production would be a form of music which had no cultural meaning in these contexts, no matter how abstractly this would seem to be the case. The memory, identity, emotion and belief matrix takes precedent over the abstract ideal of equal participation and responsibility until or unless such an ideal takes hold in the matrix. It is the active participation in a meaning-laden context that is more likely to produce desirable results than an attempt to meet a set of abstract requirements.

5.2.4 Music as a belief construction tool

While it was difficult to obtain audience data during my study, many of my informants in Pontanima claimed to have been audience members first and after that experience they decided to join. Data from interviews with Pontanima members suggests that there is a close link between performer and audience regarding music as a belief construction tool since their motivation for joining and believing in the choir stemmed originally from the experiences gained as audience members. Pontanima members are by and large Sarajevans who are proud of the city’s relatively cosmopolitan outlook when compared to the rest of Bosnia-Herzegovina. Their wish to show their skill, culture and finesse and, ultimately, normality to each other and the world at large overrules any other differences, even major ones such as religion and cultural background. Some audiences encountered at first had a very different belief system, especially when Pontanima performed in areas that suffered great atrocities. Singing the songs of the ‘enemy’ in perceived holy spaces in these
areas initially created a sense of shock and offense in many of the audience. At the end of such concerts, no one was harmed so this created a memory of the enemy culture separate from the one from the atrocities. Over time and through repetition of these activities, the music felt to represent the culture of the "enemy" becomes less offensive which in turn led the audiences to begin to view the culture in less antagonistic terms. They are not very different culturally or ethnically and music helps normalise their beliefs together.

Most informants held similar beliefs about who they were, what music did for them and what the past was like despite coming from any mix of the dominant cultures. This belief is centred on what was believed to be normal. This belief in the normal at times had little to do with what was common but rather a combination of wishful thinking, selective memories and hope for the future. For example, almost all informants held a belief that the Tito era was an almost magical one where everyone got along fine. The reality is quite different, at least for those disappeared by the dictatorship. Some of the members in Pontanima were too young to even remember much if anything of the war, and definitely too young to remember anything from the Tito era, yet they also maintained this belief in what the music did for them, what music you heard before the war and what Sarajevo was supposed to be like.

In Pinar Guran's diasporic studies of Turkish communities in Berlin, there is evidence to suggest that adults and first generation of children born in a new context of any culture maintain the core traditions, values and beliefs about themselves very strongly but that these erode and take on host characteristics and hybrids with subsequent generations (Guran 2010). In this case, there is a type of cosmopolitan diaspora just within Sarajevo itself. Those involved in Pontanima have banded together, bonded by their common belief in what is "normal" and this has been passed directly to their children and reinforced through practice in the choir, amongst other things, despite the social landscape of Sarajevo having changed so drastically since the times they refer to. It is a diaspora in their homeland, since so many Sarajevans were killed or they fled as refugees around the world. A few have returned and many who have stayed are on the constant lookout for opportunities abroad for them to leave as well. The population void has been filled by Bosnians from the surrounding countryside who generally have less cosmopolitan outlooks,
favouring their home culture as the primary and correct one for them. All children are educated in partisan schools which disseminate their own official beliefs and doctrines about the war, which generally consists of blaming the other cultures. The children of the less cosmopolitan parents do not have these doctrines countered or challenged at home, and these tend to become their own beliefs. These children are unlikely to join such organisations as Pontanima and, indeed, they could potentially be the vanguard of new future conflicts based on incompatible beliefs amongst the different cultures. The adults seem to have no more appetite for war, but the children have not directly known war, they have known hardships and poverty, and they have been taught to blame other cultures for their troubles.

The founders of Pontanima and most of the original members, many of whom are still active within the choir, have memories of experiencing choral music in Sarajevo both as performers and audience members and this has informed their belief that this is normal. As already explained, the generation born after the war does not have a firsthand memory of this and tends to believe what their parents do about the other Bosnian cultures. In this manner, the members of Pontanima are close to their traditions temporally and physically, since they still reside and conduct their musical activities in the same place.

Just how activities within Pontanima are conducted is down to the combination of power relationships and belief systems found within the choir. There is a general consensus between the choristers regarding their belief about what music does for and to them, but there is a more diverse set of beliefs regarding what the purpose of the choir is and how to go about achieving the believed goals within the choir. Fra Jadranko believes strongly in the mission of the choir, and through his large and forceful personality, he has thus far won over the majority of the choir to his side, even though when questioned personally most choristers claim that their motivation is not the mission but rather the music itself and being part of the best choir in Sarajevo. Kreso and a growing contingent of mainly professional singers have been campaigning to abandon the mission in favour of non-liturgical songs or even completely secular repertoire. These diverging beliefs may indeed split the choir at some point in the future, but importantly, the reasons for any conflict here will not be based on ethnic, historic or cultural differences, but on musical ones. Musical
conflicts may be felt passionately but not to the point of overt violence. Conflict in a musical context is not resolved, but rather it is encapsulated, contained and accepted as a necessary component of its existence.

What the above illustrates is that there is a difference between what those within the choir believe they do regarding the mission, and what they believe music does. The only thing this discrepancy does is to give ammunition to those within the choir that wish to eliminate the mission in order to sing secular music, pointing out that they sing whatever they have to in order to survive, despite claims to the contrary.

St. Anthony’s Church gave Pontanima free rehearsal space until the end of 2010 when a new Bosnian Franciscan Bishop was appointed who was less supportive of a multi-religious choir in his Catholic space. In return for this free space in which to rehearse, the expectation was to provide concerts to their congregation that were wholly Catholic in nature. These concerts usually took the form of the occasional mass and Christmas concert. The church and attached monastery are directly across the street from the brewery which was the only source of water for the people of Sarajevo during the siege and was routinely bombed, and it was in this setting of common misery that Pontanima was born in early 1996. Fra Jadranko himself is a Franciscan theologian and Franciscans are part of the Catholic Church which, on the surface, would seem to have more in common with Catholic Croatia then the Islamic majority of Bosnia-Herzegovina, yet the Franciscans have historically done more for the preservation of Bosnian culture over the past several hundred years than any other single organisation. This is not to say that Franciscans have always been this kind to Bosnian identity, since their whole raison d’être at the beginning was to soften the population for a Catholic Hungarian takeover centuries ago. Not all Franciscans support this project of saving Bosnian culture, either. Since the fall of Yugoslavia the Balkan Franciscan order within Bosnia-Herzegovina has been unofficially split between Bosnian and Croatian Franciscans, with the former supporting a free, independent Bosnia and the latter supporting a greater Croatia to which all Catholic peoples in Bosnia belonged. From the end of the war in 1995 until 2010, the bishop for the region was a Bosnian Franciscan and wholly supported Fra Jadranko’s efforts of inter-religious peace and unity. In 2010, this bishop retired and was replaced by a Croatian Franciscan. Immediately Pontanima’s activities that
included non-Catholic music and liturgies were drawn into question. They were immediately banned from using Catholic properties to practice non-Catholic music and Fra Jadranko was even stripped of his monk status and forced to vacate his home of many years. He continues to act as the spiritual leader of the choir and continues to be active in both the teaching of theology at Sarajevo University and with the inter-religious community. This further illustrates how beliefs influence actions and behaviour since the new bishop did not believe that inter-religious musical work belonged in his religious space, he removed Pontanima and Fra Jadranko from his church and monastery, while Fra Jadranko continued with his personal theological and choral missions based on his belief in their value.

How music is used in Songlines as a belief construction tool is more subtle than it was within Pontanima. Songlines is held together by sheer force of personality by their director Theresa Kay and by a common belief that all those involved need the choir, or something like it, in order to feel whole and connected, since this is believed to be missing from their daily lives. The physical feeling of the singing experienced along with the positive feelings this invokes is taken as evidence of this, which reinforced this belief. After periods of time away from the choir, informants often describe a hole or something that was missing and they were glad to return to feel whole again. In this case, music acted more like a belief reinforcement than belief construction.

The performance of and exposure to different forms of traditional music has been noted elsewhere to delineate differences between groups rather than bring them together. This is what was referred to as music as representation by Bergh. Traditional music by its very nature is laden with cultural symbolism relating to a social group’s cultural memories and identities and, as such, is often viewed as representative of what is part of that culture and what is not. In other words, promulgation of traditional musics is more often than not seen to strengthen divides between cultures by emphasising separateness and difference. Despite this, music as representation is often used for the purposes of cultural cohesion and both choirs in this research use traditional musics: Pontanima uses much of the traditional liturgical music of the four religions of their mission, whereas Songlines borrows from traditions all over the globe. In other words, Songlines has appropriated musical
traditions they have no direct experience in while Pontanima uses material that is at least somewhat familiar to all members. Paradoxically, then, both choirs use a form of musicking that has been elsewhere demonstrated to strengthen divides, yet have demonstrably achieved the unification to some degree. What this illustrates is a flaw in the music as representation theory, which assumes that all music utilised in such a way behaves in the same manner and means the same type of thing to those involved. Furthermore, it does not take into account contextual meaning or the reflexive flow of memory, identity, belief and emotion. In both research sites, this meaning-making matrix created an environment where music as representation has brought together people from separate cultural groups.

5.3. Music as a procedural metaphor

5.3.1 Musical processes as a metaphor for conflict transformation processes

Music is part of every society but it is not aesthetically isolated, being forever associated with a myriad of extra-musical parameters such as gesture, customs, settings and power relations. It has thus far been difficult for scholars to ascertain just what music accomplishes in the social world, since any analysis ends up being similar to analyses of other social activities. Bergh has raised the point: what makes music as a social activity any different from knitting? (2010). Despite this, the belief in the special status and power of music proliferates both within the professional musician classes, those who consume music and those with the means to organise social music programmes. In the literature review it was illustrated how music strongly interacts with memory, identity, emotion and belief, so it should be no surprise that music is believed to have such power regardless of any evidence shown. This is further supported within recent neuroscience research which has shown how musical activity affects more areas of the brain than any other activity, or what Aniruddh Patel refers to as a

“biologically powerful human invention, or transformative technology of the mind.” (Patel 2010: 92).

Conflict transformation, if it is to be successful, requires an understanding of the identity formation processes, since ideally a new shared identity evolving from those involved would emerge. How this process works requires an understanding of how
identity belief is related to emotions and memory, and how all of these affect behaviour, past, present and future. It has been suggested by a number of international mediators that music and the arts provides a metaphor or amalgam for conflict transformation, albeit in a safer environment (Lederach and Lederach 2010, p.206). This relates to DeNora’s work where music in everyday life provides a workspace for people to work through issues pertaining to these same categories of emotional and memory regulation and identity construction, reconstruction and/or reinforcement (DeNora 2000, p.40).

While it is true that music has been a part of every society ever known, so has language, art, and, inevitably, conflict. It is the current consensus in the conflict transformation community that conflict should not be eradicated, even if this was possible. Conflict gives rise to new ideas and creates a dynamic prone to innovation and forward thinking. It may not be pleasant but it is necessary. What conflict transformation attempts to do is reduce the level of violent conflict to manageable non-violent conflict. Violent conflict that ends in violence always has a loser and a winner, whereas non-violent conflict can be managed, in theory, to a level where both sides benefit relatively equally, or at least within some parameter of acceptability. Music by its very nature constantly deals with manageable levels of conflict, otherwise the sound worlds created would express little of interest (Meyer 1961). Even in experimental musical pieces, such as John Cage’s 4’33” which contains no overt musical material whatsoever, created levels of tension by focussing the ear on aspects other than what is considered the norm in that performance context. Given music’s strong connections to the very social aspects conflict transformation attempts to address, it follows that music could be useful in conflict transformation situations even if direct evidence to support this is currently relatively thin.

If all societies throughout history have always had music and conflict at their heart and both processes are essentially very similar, requiring the same prerequisites and having similar outcomes, it does indeed seem like they can be seen to be metaphors for one another. In a standard conflict transformation setting, one of the primary tasks of a mediator is to enable the conflicting sides to imagine the other’s position(s). This is often hampered by extremely strong emotions, memories of past
atrocities or wrongdoings, and so on. If a similar but safe environment can be presented to them where they jointly work through a procedurally similar conflict but this time in a musical space, it seems like it would be possible to enable them to imagine the type of interaction, structure and process that would be needed in order to move the actual conflict to a more acceptable level for all sides. What will follow is an examination of how Pontanima and Songlines have used music as a metaphor for conflict transformation, although it was never in either case an explicit or even conscious use.

Within Songlines there is very little overt conflict with most members getting along well and many of whom are close friends outside of the choir. Most of the conflict when it does occur is quiet in nature and is generally in form of complaints about Theresa’s methods of leadership. One of the most common complaints was regarding the frequent changes of terminology without adequate explanation. For example, Theresa referred to “the basses” (by which she meant the group who sang the bottom harmonic note in a particular harmonic setting, rather than the lowness of the pitches) early on in one rehearsal only to refer to the same group minutes later as “the tunes” (if the main melody happened also to be the lowest harmonic line being sung at that moment). Those choristers who have belonged to Songlines since its inception have learned to understand and respond to these rapid changes, but many newer members, myself included, struggled to know from minute to minute just what was happening. “So, am I a bass or a tune?” I whispered to Liza, who seemed to be singing the same part as me during this same rehearsal. “It depends.” was the shrugged reply. If a general confusion ensued, something else was gained that was noted by many members and, again, by myself. When presented with a musical interaction where your position is no longer knowable, the music continues without you. If you wish to continue to have a say and take part in this musical experience, you have to do something. In this case, that was an improvisation that sounded to the best of our ability, understanding and perception like it ‘might’ be correct or, at the very least, it fitted in somehow with what was happening in an appropriate manner. In Songlines, we quickly learned to ‘busk’ our parts since it was often impossible to tell just what our parts were supposed to be. This in turn led to an
increased confidence in our ability to deal with the unexpected; in fact, we learned to expect the unexpected.

“That’s half the fun, really, not really knowing what’s going to happen next. What does Theresa really mean by that? Sometimes we just don’t know but as we got to know each other really well over the years, we have a reasonable idea of how to work in Theresa’s way.” (Emma).

Pontanima, with their explicit remit for conflict transformation, presents an easier situation in which to track how music has acted as a metaphor for conflict transformation. Successful conflict transformation first requires the desire to do so from all involved and to do so with a win-win outcome as opposed to a win-lose outcome, even if that means if at least one side does not get all that they want or think they could if they followed the win-lose route. Secondly, all sides need to understand the other points of view as close as possible to the depth of how they understand their own. Musicking in Pontanima firstly requires a common understanding of the tools, procedures and technical knowledge required of singing written music in a classical style.

“Anybody can audition for Pontanima as long as they are a good singer and can sing properly in the choral tradition.” (Kreso).

This in itself is important to the collective memory and belief of how a normal society expresses itself culturally, i.e., through a public performance culture as modelled on the central European society prevalent in Bosnia during the Austrian-Hungarian days.

“Before the war there were dozens of world-class choirs in Sarajevo. It had been that way for around a hundred years and this was normal in Europe. We felt European.” (Cecilija).

Historic precedent and collective memory and belief have therefore set the stage for the music itself. The musical act is felt physically as air is controlled and pumped out through the larynx and mouth and lips of the dozens of singers all following the stringent conducting of the musical director. This embodies the memories already mentioned and these memories are temporarily reconstructed in the moment but not as they were, only fragments, depending on what any one singer might be thinking.
or feeling presently. This combination creates a new memory and belief about the music.

“When I first heard music from the Orthodox liturgy, I was like, woah! I’d never really experienced anything like that, so complicated. Singing it at first felt a bit alien and difficult but now, since we do it all the time, it’s my favourite type of music to sing together in Pontanima.” (Anita).

Unlike Songlines or many other choirs, the memories involved in singing the liturgical music of all the cultures in the Balkans in areas of great trauma, or at least areas with strong feelings one way or the other, are common, even if they are not historically accurate. They all ‘remember’ the Tito era with fondness “Tito was like an uncle to us.” (Entoni).38 This of course was mainly down to the social engineering of a Communist state which attempted to devalue religion in general and discourage religious discourse in public. Furthermore, Yugoslavs were encouraged to move around Yugoslavia away from traditional religious geographical strongholds and to inter-marry. According to the interview data, many did move and inter-marry during this period, and the lineage of many of those within Pontanima reflects this.

“My mother was Catholic and my father was Orthodox and they moved to a very mixed part of Sarajevo. This was normal. So common.” (Neno).

The fact that this same mixing up created the future problem of joining up all Serbs into a Greater Serbia during the Balkans War was never mentioned once during any field work. So singing in Pontanima has brought together people from all sides of the conflict into a temporary space that contains the positive elements from the Tito era, without any of the corruption or dangerous politics, through embodied enactments of a collective memory and belief. This feeling of togetherness lasts outside of the choir as well, in as much as they often claim that music should be taught everywhere so that everyone in Bosnia-Herzegovina could sing in a choir like Pontanima.

38 While this may not have been as happy a time as they recall, they did have jobs (by refusing to pass on the oil crisis to the people, that eventually resulted in a near total collapse of the Yugoslav economy) and, most importantly, all cultures and religions got along in relative harmony (forced to get along, some might argue).
“Singing in Pontanima is so great. I wish everyone could have the chance to sing in a choir like this and feel this same way.” (Ruža).

Most within Pontanima were educated to at least degree-level and most were employed, whereas unemployment in Bosnia-Herzegovina at the time of the research was around 40% for young adults, so this perhaps does not reflect the opinions of the wider Bosnian society, but within Pontanima it remains a strong belief. It is this belief in the power of music that appears time and time again and therein lays its true power.

After the Songlines and Pontanima joint project in September 2009, Pontanima increasingly became split in opinion on whether or not to maintain the inter-religious mission.

“Kreso and some others want Pontanima to do secular songs and compete like normal choirs in international choir competitions. Others want to stay true to the original mission of the choir.” (Draga).

Likewise, Songlines, which had up until then been strictly open to all regardless of ability or experience, began to audition for specialised roles within the choir and stopped accepting new members unless they demonstrated a certain level of skill and commitment as determined by Theresa.

“I want Songlines to be as good as it can be, which means I need to have a separate section with only the best singers in it.” (Theresa).

In Pontanima, for at least one instance, it elevated stress levels to such a degree as to be health- and life-threatening: On a tour of Germany in October 2009, a public argument over the mission and Fra Jadranko’s lack of organisation skills erupted, which resulted in Kreso having a heart-related breakdown. The fact that Fra Jadranko encouraged the choir to continue with their booked performances in order to fulfil mission-related commitments, while Kreso was in the hospital without consulting him, further drove the choir apart. In the end, a few choristers quit, including longstanding member and professional singer Emil, who was also part of the first set of interviews I conducted when Emil and Kreso first visited London. Interestingly, the desire to continue with what is deemed to be the best choir in Sarajevo despite such internal problems overrode the desire to do different forms of
music. “We have managed to stay together as Pontanima, for now.” (Ruža).
Nevertheless, many feel that it is only a matter of time before these desires become too strong to ignore. There is now an added pressure of favouritism within the group, as Kreso has begun to use his powerful position within the choir to elevate his favourite singers within the group, effectively creating a two-tier choir within Pontanima.

“It is annoying that Kreso gives the solos to some professional singers from the opera that have only just joined even though there are some who have been part of Pontanima since the beginning and are perfectly good singers. He even has given positions to his girlfriend who has not even properly joined Pontanima or even auditioned.” (Anita).

While this form of internal conflict is heart-felt and passionate and even possibly life-threatening to one member, it is a far more healthy way of expressing displeasure and conflict then inter-ethnic and cultural conflict. It could even be seen to further demonstrate how the choir has become a metaphor for normal and manageable social conflict.

Similarly, the new stance in Songlines has alienated some longstanding and highly skilled members, who believed strongly in the former egalitarian ideals of the choir. Some have expressed concerns of favouritism of newer less proven and less committed members, purely based on whatever Theresa fancies on any particular moment.

“These changes (to Songlines) are against everything I thought Songlines was about: inclusion and community.” (Charlotte).

While the situations surrounding Songlines have never been anywhere as serious as those experienced by Pontanima members, this change of conflict type is actually more destructive since it is not a group grassroots debate about music and through music, but rather a move away from a perceived togetherness found within the choir, increasing the gap in power relations between director and chorister. Most Western directed music groups have an element of dictatorship, but Songlines used to openly pride itself on its egalitarian credentials which were by now eroding away. The increased conflict in Pontanima is not necessarily a completely negative situation. Music always has an ending, after all, regardless of how positive the experience
was. The conflict growing within Songlines, however, will probably not destroy Songlines because Theresa has already begun to change the structure of the choir to better suit her ambitions.

This example illustrates Ramsbotham’s (and Simmel's) observation that conflict is not necessarily always a negative process, since no change (Ramsbotham et al. 2011, p.5) is possible without some form of conflict. Music itself contains a constant flux of different conflicts, wherein lies the aesthetic interest (Meyer 1961). What both research sites show is that internal project conflict can affect the members just as much as the external conflicts they have attempted to address. This type of internal conflict is manageable to a degree since no violence is likely to erupt from it and this is the same for music itself, which can simultaneously contain conflict and a representation of the relationships between those involved.

Simmel’s concept that outside pressure strengthens the identity boundaries (1903) is called into question somewhat in both field sites. For Pontanima there is not so much pressure from the outside but from the inside, as already mentioned. Furthermore, this internal pressure has the potential to affect how Pontanima exerts its externalising pressure on audiences. Interestingly, and perhaps paradoxically, if Pontanima either split into two choirs or completely abandoned the mission as such, it might become more effective at spreading the mission. Those within Pontanima that wish to secularise it and move away from the mission do so because they feel that the choir’s potential is not met because of the restrictions of repertoire and they look to other world-class choirs around the world but especially within central Europe as models which do not have such restrictions. In other words, if normalisation is a key process in demonstrating a culture at peace with itself, then the removal of mission would actually be a necessary step, however counterintuitive it may seem. ‘Normal’ choirs do not need to have a peace mission in order to demonstrate difference and/or quality. Likewise, Songlines is not being challenged by outside pressures but rather by the ambitions of its leader. It could be argued that Songlines always was a personal project of Theresa’s, as already mentioned, but it has increasingly become overt and the pressure to change into a more professional and less socially-driven choir is evident. The changes within Pontanima are for the most part bottom-up pressures, although they are to a large extent fostered and
sponsored by Kreso. This is not exclusive, however, and many are deeply unhappy with Kreso’s cronyism, as well as Fra Jadranko’s mission. Despite all of this, there is no shortage of respect for either man, just displeasure about what is happening within the choir and the direction it is taking. The changes within Songlines are not bottom-up, and this is the core of the problem as far as any social change potential found within that choir.

Whatever the potential of a musical performance or activity, it is limited to those that participate and those that witness or consume it. As mentioned in the literature review, it seems that active participation in a musical event is much more likely to produce a lasting effect on those involved than during musical consumption alone (Small 1998). Despite this, Pontanima does seem to have had some effect on its audiences, but the evidence is limited and what little there is shows the effects to be small. Only a tiny proportion of Bosnians ever attend Pontanima concerts, for example. Many would have presumably heard them perform the national anthem on the national outlets, but were not familiar with their name. I spent a couple of days wandering around different parts of Sarajevo asking random passersby if they had heard of Pontanima, and after dozens of people not one had said that they had. Some informants told me that they were not surprised by this:

Most people who come see us just go to every church event no matter what it is. They are really religious people who support their church or mosque or whatever. Those people who don’t do religious things so much probably will never have heard of us except when we do the national anthem for television. (Srećko).

In other words, Pontanima have a small core captive audience who often have not chosen to attend their concerts because of their music or their mission, but because it was an event organised by their church or religious school and they attended to support that. Despite this, the measurable effect is that when they started doing this kind of performance schedule, they would get reactions of shock, anger and would sometimes receive death threats from the audience. Now, in these same places, they are welcomed, if not warmly, at least with a degree of acceptance and hospitality. More recently, other non-sectarian choirs have been initiated in
Republika Srpska and within Serbia itself, which further illustrates the spread of the ideals and oeuvre behind Pontanima.

“When we first performed in Republika Srpska, I was really scared. But now I enjoy going there and we even have a partner choir there who do similar work to us.” (Anita).

5.3.2 Reflexive relationships between music, belief, identity, emotion, memory and behaviour.

The idea that music has this relationship with belief, identity, emotion, memory and behaviour is not completely without precedent. The founder of modern music sociology Theodor Adorno mentioned how music interacts with belief, emotion and behaviour in his book Quasi una Fantasia in his own inimitable way.

“Because the musical material is intelligent in itself, it inspires the belief that mind must be at work, where in reality only the abdication of mind is being celebrated” (Adorno 2002, p.270).

“There is music from the nineteenth century which is so unbearably solemn that it can only be used to introduce waltzes. If it were left as it is, people listening to it would fall into a despair beside which every other musical emotion would pale.” (ibid, p.59).

“Like jazz, Stravinsky’s imitation of the compulsion to repeat has its origins in the mechanisation of the labour process. Through the adaptation to machines and the jerky reflexes they produce, Stravinsky’s music tended to prescribe modes of behaviour rather than to crystallise out an intrinsically coherent compositional manner.” (Ibid, p.158).

This was never fully explored by him, however, nor any of his dedicated followers and detractors. As I have traced in the Literature Review chapter, there is much evidence to suggest that the relationships between music, identity, memory, emotion and belief do indeed exist. It is now time to explore if and how these have manifested themselves within Pontanima and Songlines.

Within Pontanima there is a common belief that choral music singing helps them to feel normal while they are doing it while simultaneously helping them to remember a time when there was less conflict. Because of the memories associated with singing, the memories associated with oppression and relative lack of freedoms were not retrieved in the same way. These selected memories were brought to the foreground.
with fondness and then afterwards, while the memory of the musical experience lingered, there was a feeling and belief that this state of harmony could be achieved if for no other reason than it is now conceivable. Due to this ongoing reflexive process, beliefs were altered and strengthened, memories were selected and foregrounded over others, past emotions influence this selection process, and current emotions strengthen the selections and beliefs. Finally, those in Pontanima continue to sing the mission, even though an ongoing reflexive relationship between these aspects continues to threaten the very existence of Pontanima.

Within Songlines there was a common belief that choral singing would help them to feel connected in some sort of community that they otherwise felt was lacking in their lives. This belief influenced their behaviour towards the choir, their motivations for joining and continuing to sing in it. They tended to feel more relaxed, connected and happy while singing together and for a little while afterwards. Once that emotion subsided there remained the memory of the musical activity and the emotions associated with it, which was then reinforced the next time the choir meets. Memories of negative experiences tended to be forgotten, while the musicking occurred and only emerged after many unresolved issues piled up. In this manner Songlines provided a space for these reflexive relationships to unfold.

Music not only mediates this set of reflexive relationships within the group, but it also mediates reflexive relationships between groups. Prior to the joint project in September 2009, Songliners shared a common belief that Pontanima were spectacularly good at what they did while they, Songlines, were possibly more fun but less technically brilliant. Many were excited about this new venture but many more were frightened by the prospect. Some Songliners were comfortable reading music and those that could not, including Theresa, were apprehensive about singing with a choir that sang purely from the written scores. There was rather an over-reliance on me as a music-reading/piano-playing resource in the months preceding the visit, and I was requested on many occasions to sing or play various parts to Songliners. In effect this was not really reading music and learning music in the same way that Pontanima does, which is what had been agreed, since those that could not read music were not much closer to being able to read music by the time of the meeting in Sarajevo. They had learned their parts through repetition and listening
to someone doing it for them, just as Theresa had been doing with them all along. A memory that had stuck in many Songliners heads is when Kreso and Emil came to London for a visit to determine if this joint project was feasible. Cynics within the choir claimed that perhaps the Bosnians were only humouring Songlines in an effort to get a free trip to perform in London, and as it turns out there was some truth to this, but as far as anyone could tell at the time, there had been a genuine interest in working together.

Many of those in Pontanima knew very little about Songlines, and Kreso and Jadranko did not explain much to them. Theresa had made a visit in early 2009 and tried to demonstrate her methods to them in the form of workshops. Some recounted enjoying her unconventional methods of choral directing, but many reported that they felt it was childish and amateur, and in their eyes, not really worth doing. Even worse, some felt it was insulting to encourage a world class choir to behave in such a manner. Because of this belief many within Pontanima refused to participate in the joint project, claiming it was a waste of their time and they did not believe that Songlines had anything to teach them for the most part. The few who did believe they could learn something from Songlines had invariably spent considerable amounts of time in the UK or the US, so they perhaps had a greater understanding of the benefits of trying things for the sake of it, rather than as a way to demonstrate skill or even normality. There was also a suspicion that Songlines were coming to Sarajevo to offer pity and then leave having made their own consciences feel better without actually having helped in any way shape or form in their daily lives. By the time of the joint project, only about twenty from Pontanima were present and most of them at first did not seem to be very enthusiastic, or at least that was what perceived by Songlines. The primary difference here is that Songliners tend to be outwardly enthusiastic and tactile, whereas Pontanima and Bosnians in general, appear more distant and less willing to show anyone what they are thinking or feeling.

One of the key points of the project was for each choir to attempt to learn two songs from the other choir’s repertoire in the manner in which they would normally learn themselves. Songlines was given sheet music from some of Pontanima’s repertoire and were expected to learn them by reading. Pontanima, conversely, was expected to learn some of Songlines’ songs by ear and they were sent recordings of them.
The morning after the arrival of Songlines, Kreso arrived at Songlines’ hotel asking to have the scores for the Songlines songs so that he could distribute them to the choir. Those Songliners who were present were rather incredulous at this, as this meant that Pontanima had no intention of learning the Songlines songs in the manner in which Songlines learned them, and it also meant that they had done absolutely no preparation for this project. As it later turned out this had little to do with the members of Pontanima, as Kreso and Fra Jadranko had not prepared Pontanima for the visit. Theresa was offended by this, and many within the choir felt that this showed little respect for the visiting choir, their motivations or the fact that they spent considerable amounts of time and money getting to Sarajevo in the first place. I expected Theresa to say something along these lines to Kreso but she did not and the Songlines composer/arranger Maura was called upon to sketch out the notation for the songs that morning to give to Kreso. To make matters worse, when the choirs finally got together, Kreso handed out Pontanima’s sheet music that had previously been sent to Songlines, and no-one within Pontanima had seen these arrangements before. They were familiar with the pieces but these arrangements were new to them. I later discovered that Kreso had his brother, Danko (Pontanima’s resident composer/arranger), rearrange these pieces more simply for Songlines, since Kreso believed that Songlines would not have been capable of singing their normal arrangements. This solved a riddle for many within Songlines, who had wondered about the poor quality of the arrangements. Furthermore, Theresa had expected a full day’s workshop to be arranged for both choirs to work together, but Kreso had not arranged it. It later transpired that he did not want to have an embarrassing situation where Pontanima were clearly so superior to Songlines, and also he did not want to insult those within Pontanima with such a demeaning task.

If Bourdieu’s claims about cultural capital (1986) are to be taken into account in these cases, how has cultural capital changed for those involved in the choirs and does the increase of cultural capital increase the likelihood of a mutually positive conflict transformation outcome? There is an enormous amount of embodied and institutional cultural capital embedded within a choir like Pontanima. The skill level is very high and many were professionally educated singers and musicians. In order to attain such a skill level, many years of training and focus would have been required,
and this time spent honing their craft is not spent producing economic capital. The ability to have the time to invest in developing this embodied cultural capital came, not from a greater access to economic capital, but from the communist system in pre-war times or due to high unemployment in more recent times. Performances therefore are public culturally constructed displays of an enormous collective wealth of cultural capital. In a sense, those within Pontanima are conscious of this amount of collective wealth they possess, since they are proud of what they do and compare themselves to choirs from other nations that have much greater economic, cultural and social capital. Thus by demonstrating their cultural capital, Pontanima have strived for normality in the absence of both economic capital and to a certain extent, social capital, since they are prevented from joining the ultimate social network in their eyes, the European Union. This embodiment and display of cultural capital has been a main source of emotional, memory and identity regulation for those within Pontanima. Knowledge and belief in this cultural capital has enabled them to feel pride and happiness, and it continues to create memories that reinforce these emotions and beliefs. Finally, it strengthens the sense of who they are, whether it is a singer, a member of Pontanima, a Bosnian, or, as many informants have said, a human being.

Within Songlines, there is also a wealth of embodied cultural capital but it has less institutional cultural capital, in terms of music, since the skill level is for the most part nowhere near as high. There is, however, a greater level of familiarity with, and thus cultural capital in relation to, theatre, movement and creativity amongst all the choristers. This form of capital contributes in other ways to Songlines' institutional cultural capital. For example, Songlines hosts large concerts, sometimes for charity, sometimes to raise funds for their own projects, and these events are often held in large venues such as the Union Chapel in London, which are often sold-out events. The amount of people exposed to their music either through participating or being part of the audience is perhaps as large if not larger then Pontanima, although they generally are London-based and Songlines have not performed anywhere internationally except with Pontanima in Sarajevo and a short tour of Bosnia including a stop at Mostar and Srebrenica. In other words, depending on your measuring tool, Songlines might be considered to have as much cultural capital as
Pontanima as far as input/output is concerned, although it could also be considered to have less specifically musical capital (understood in the traditional sense of familiarity with ‘high’ musical culture) since their collective skill level is less and their international exposure is considerably less. Similar to Pontanima, cultural capital has aided Songlines in exactly the same way: the accumulation and display of cultural capital has strengthened group identity and regulated emotions and memories. In both cases, in other words, the groups have enhanced their social capital through their respective performance identities.

The traditional notion of cultural domination as set out by Bourdieu (1984) and discussed by Dubois and Méon (2013) and Dubois, Méon and Pierru (2013) assumes an agreed set of cultural hierarchies, yet this research demonstrates that the two choirs deal with separate musical currencies. In the traditional sense, Pontanima can be seen to dominate Songlines since Pontanima are more institutionally legitimate yet the markers of distinction within Songlines include open-mindedness, freer body movement and fun. Examined through the lens of Peterson and Kern’s (1996) theory of the omnivore, where groups with a higher social status consume a variety of cultural products and those from a lower status consume very few different forms, Songlines would be considered the dominant cultural group. As a result, Songlines cannot be considered a sub-field of European classical liturgical choirs any more than Pontanima can be considered a sub-field of British world music choirs.

On the one hand, Pontanima have also accumulated a large amount of social capital in as much as they are part of many international networks, have been the subject of many documentaries within Bosnia as well as elsewhere, not to mention the subject of many international art projects and academic enquiries such as my own. They have also competed in international choir competitions and represented the Interreligious network of Bosnia-Herzegovina at world inter-religious meetings, they have been awarded the Beyond Intractability Award, and have performed for the Clintons at the White House in the United States. In fact, Pontanima are probably better known throughout the rest of the world than they are within Bosnia, which is a perverse situation given their mission statement. On the other hand, Songlines have much social capital within London, but very little outside of it. In this light, Songlines
is the exact opposite to Pontanima, having local social networks but very few national or international ones.

The joint choir project can be seen as an attempt to increase the cultural and social capital for both choirs since shared cultural and social capital is doubled rather than diminished, unlike economic capital. Cultural capital was definitely shared and accumulated from and by both choirs, since Pontanima realised, too late, that Songlines were a group of dedicated singers with a very different approach that could be valuable or at least interesting to Pontanima. Songlines gained a deeper understanding of Pontanima’s ways of expressing themselves. Both realised that there was more to the other than what appeared on the surface and it was impossible to judge a different art form using the same criteria that one would use for one’s own art. Social capital, on the other hand, was more skewed towards Songlines’ benefit since through the Pontanima connections Theresa was able to network with those working in music therapy and community music in Mostar and Srebreniça and these connections have proved to be more open, friendly and lasting than those with Pontanima itself. Pontanima have gained no new connections that I am aware of through this project, although the potential was there to meet the film makers that followed the project around, and various other London-based connections that Theresa had offered them.

Both choirs have displayed their cultural capital in events that were as large as they could muster, through their growth of social capital and earn a certain amount of economic capital for their troubles. No one in Pontanima earns any money for their efforts and all earnings go into running the choir and paying for tours and so on. The same applies to Songlines, except Theresa charges all members a small termly fee for her efforts and this is in effect her salary. This is an interesting distinction since on the surface, due to the cultural trappings involved with a classical-style central European choir, Pontanima appears to be a more authoritarian dictatorship and Songlines appears to be a more open and equal partnership or collective, yet the power relationships created by economic capital exchanges are strikingly different: where Pontanima are actually equal in terms of economic capital, Songlines has one member, who is also the leader, who takes all of the economic capital earned by the labour and production of the rest of the choir.
Bourdieu has suggested that there is a polarisation between orthodox and heresy in cultural capital; between the dominant definition of reality that imposes itself on less dominant forms (Bourdieu 1980, p.284). Pontanima and Songlines represent two forms of separate realities with their own sets of orthodoxies; one is not dominant over the other. Some within Pontanima believe themselves to be part of the dominant orthodoxy, especially compared to Songlines, but this is based on an illusory misunderstanding of the purpose of Songlines. Songlines felt at times intimidated by Pontanima due to the institutionalised cultural capital they possess as markers of expertise but the orthodoxy within world music choirs is very different and separate from Pontanima. Bourdieu also believed that there is a dichotomy between continuity of cultural hegemony and revolution (Ibid, p.289), but the two choirs do not fit into this model as they both desire continuity of the traditions within they work but these traditions would appear as revolutionary to the other choir.

This hierarchy, in the Bourdiesian-sense, does not exist between the two choirs. Hierarchy in art requires a belief in its inevitability to function (Bourdieu 1983, p.317), which has resulted in a form dissonance between the choirs because they believed in different hierarchies. Art is only valued based on a belief of its value (Ibid).

The imposition of legitimate cultural production as inseparable from the struggle within the dominant class, as described by Bourdieu (Ibid, p.322) applies within the individual choirs themselves, but it does not apply to the relationship between the two choirs. The choirs maintain separate independent levels of capital that are verified independently by their wider socio-geographic variables. This is verified by DiMaggio and Useem (1978) who noted that, while taste in classical music in America correlated positively to upper class professions, taste in folk music was equally spread over the classes. Perception of hierarchy between the choirs was, therefore, illusory. Furthermore, DiMaggio and Useem’s theory that a new group can separate itself from the hierarchy thereby displacing those further up the old hierarchy (Ibid, p.340) does not seem to apply to the relationships between the choirs since the position either choir is in does not affect the other's position in their respective hierarchies. The prejudices felt and experienced between the choirs was not a competition for cultural capital but a degree of ignorance about the field of the ‘other’ choir. The symbolic hierarchies between the choirs are simply separate.
5.4 Music as tacit cultural knowledge

During interviews with both choirs it became clear fairly quickly that the informants’ sense of identity was not only strong, it was multi-faceted and constantly changing, yet for the most part completely tacit; no one talked about their identity as such in their daily lives. Bringing it up for discussion in interviews rarefied the concept for them, and forced them to verbalise something that they just knew and felt and, importantly, knew and felt that others within their respective groups knew and felt something similar, or at least they believed that they shared this knowledge and emotion about their state of identity. In all cases, active musicking was a strong method in which to verify this tacit cultural knowledge with each other. Singing different parts in support of each other embodied this tacit knowledge. Furthermore, a demonstration of trust is required in order to progress fruitfully in conflict transformation settings, and a demonstration of tacit cultural knowledge verifies a level of understanding which underpins trust capabilities.

This relates to recent work in experiential knowledge, which claims that such knowledge is inseparable from the context of production and reception. In other words, the tacit knowledge of experience is simultaneously produced and received. In the case of music, a performance generates, transmits and propagates tacit experiential knowledge, and this is supported by recent developments in actor network theory (Sutherland and Acord 2007). This highlights a methodological issue of how ethnographic knowledge is the translation of tacit knowledge into language. The very idea of tacit knowledge indicates that such knowledge cannot be fully understood with words but has to be experienced in order to be understood. If it was any other way, then there would be no need for art, music or poetry or any other art form that requires the experiential aspect of it in order for any information and knowledge, be it memory, emotion or aesthetics, to be understood and felt. Music itself is a form, therefore, of tacit knowledge and the key to understanding it is within the doing of it, rather than the writing about it, as writing and reading about it do not transmit, produce, or receive that tacit cultural knowledge.

Words are the dominant form of communication in academia, and therefore the established norm with the academic world, a written account of these experiences is required if the information is to be shared effectively. This act of translating the
experiential to the literal or verbal is inevitably an approximation of the experience of musicking. Cultural knowledge is known and demonstrated through the body and a transmission of this knowledge affords different forms of interactions, especially across cultural boundaries. At this stage it is important to illustrate my own interactions and accessing of the choirs’ tacit knowledge about their identities as it occurred through active musicking with both choirs.

When I first sang with Songlines, it was not explained in words what I should be doing or where I should stand. I was instructed to ‘just join in’ by Theresa, and I was left to quickly observe what was happening and to try to absorb the contextual tacit knowledge as best as possible. The first experience was that everybody paired up and did a warm-up exercise, where one person stood in front of the other singing a variety of notes, sometimes in up and down scales, sometimes random notes, sometimes hummed, sometimes with open vowel sounds, usually with dynamic variation as well. While the singer sang, the other person massaged their back, either with thumbs and fingers in a standard massage practice or, more commonly, by pummelling lightly up and down the back with their fists. The resulting sound was cacophonic surround sound in general, with staccato notes resounding as a result of the pummelling. This was in the background, despite the volume, as it was always quite easy to foreground the sounds of the partner you were doing this with. Within seconds, everyone had paired up in this manner except one woman, Ruby, who I paired up with. No words were exchanged during these exercises and it seemed like I was doing the right things as I did not get any indication, verbal or otherwise, to the contrary. The successful demonstration of this cultural knowledge through embodied action did not mean that I was now a fully accepted member of Songlines, at least at this stage, and I continued to feel vaguely uncomfortable with this part of the rehearsal space every time it occurred, but it demonstrated to the rest of the group that I had at least obtained a basic understanding of their modus operandi, and that I was willing to engage with it in the collectively deemed appropriate manner.

The next example of tacit knowledge within Songlines was more directly musical in nature. Everyone in the choir arranged themselves in what appeared to be a known and pre-existing pattern. They started to sing following the physical motions and singing of Theresa. Bodies swayed to the embodied tempo and beat of the music,
although there were no percussion or drums to keep the beat. Some people did tap their feet on the floor or hands on their legs, however. The lyrics were in an as-yet unknown language to me, and I had not been given a lyric sheet. Some people had lyric sheets but not many. I shifted over to some men who sounded like they had low voices because my voice was low and I thought I would best fit in sonically with them, attempting to demonstrate appropriate musical knowledge and behaviour. I looked over one’s shoulder that had the lyric sheet and tried to join in. This in itself is an interesting experience, since there is but a split second, barely perceptible, between hearing a pitch sung by a neighbour, understanding it to be a particular note, and reproducing that note with that syllable. The result is that it sounded more or less like I was singing correctly along with everybody in the choir, despite not knowing the song at all. The note was not understood in terms of the actual pitch name such as C, D, and E and so on, nor was it understood in terms of perfect pitch, but rather I knew how to reproduce it in my own voice. This took in real time mere seconds. Looking back at this paragraph, it is obvious to see the difference in effort it takes to explain this phenomenon in language versus the amount of time it took to understand tacit knowledge being transmitted and received, and then reproduced through active musicking.

Many in the Western industrialised world, claim that they do not have the ability to sing at all (Sloboda, Wise and Peretz 2005), which would have prevented them from accessing tacit cultural knowledge through embodied practice as I had, but it has been suggested by some neurologists that all humans are born with the ability to perceive and reproduce pitches which implies that many of us spend our lives unlearning what is actually an innate ability (Saffran and Griepentrog 2001). Some of us have trained our ears and bodies in order to attune to this form of knowledge generation and transmission, and that is the tacit knowledge as experienced by musicians. There are many people that have this tacit knowledge without being trained specifically as musicians, and these include people in a variety of contexts, from those who are partial to karaoke group singing to those involved with community music activities. In practice, music does not always transmit, receive and reproduce in this way, but when it does, it simultaneously generates a feeling of
belonging and understanding within the group that participated, and through repetition, it shifts from a direct experience towards a memory.

Within Pontanima, it was very difficult to access some of their tacit knowledge since their mannerisms and patterns of behaviour were less well known to me. This was for the most part further hampered by my role as a pure observer and researcher, not a musician. Through my own experience of singing in the past in classical choirs, I recognised many of the observable characteristics, and therefore I did understand some of the basic tacit knowledge:

- Formal standing positions with correct postures;
- Wide open, rounded mouth shape;
- Deliberate European-style of classical singing, where the vowels are very wide and open, and the consonants very short and clipped just at the very end of sung words;
- the attack and decay of the notes are very sharply inclined;
- close attention was paid to every gesture made by the director;
- they read from sheet music;
- they wore formal robes or uniform casual clothes to concerts;
- they participated in standard Western-classical formal arpeggiated vocal warm-ups in rehearsals and in the green rooms before concerts;

With the joint project, I was able to actually sing with Pontanima for the first time as a bass. As opposed to Songlines, where I on occasion sang along with nearly every part since I was not forced to always sing in my usual vocal range, I was most definitely placed in the bass section due to my precise vocal range. No one else in Songlines was an actual bass, so I was the only one from Songlines singing at this time with the Pontanima basses. When we rehearsed their pieces together, I sang well, and all of the basses at various times turned to me with the Balkan frown while nodding that indicated that they approved. My relationships with the Pontanima choristers changed in that instant, as if all of a sudden they understood that I was indeed a musician and therefore part of their group. I demonstrated that I understood their tacit knowledge and identity in a way that no amount of talking was able to do. As a result, afterwards they were much more open with me in discussions. In other words, a musical demonstration of the tacit understanding of an identity paved the way for future fruitful communications; music paved the way for future fruitful
discussions outside of music, which was a clear indicator of how music could potentially be used in conflict contexts. This is similar to what Simon Procter has labelled “musical proto-social capital” generation as a precursor to developing the standard notion of social capital (2011).

Bergh has stated that musical conflict transformation interventions by their very nature remove music from the everyday, which in effect rarefies the processes involved by elevating the expectations of the outcomes to unrealistic proportions (2010). In the case of both choirs there were no actual conflict transformation interventions as such, at least not in the way that was described in Bergh’s research. Pontanima did intervene with audiences in churches, religious schools and so on since these audiences did not expect a choir led by a Franciscan monk to sing liturgical music from other religious traditions during their first concerts. Fra Jadranko’s purpose for these interventions was that this had been everyday music for Bosnians prior to the war and that it could be again.

Songlines on the other hand specialised in folk music from around the world, so it cannot be said to be part of the everyday musical experience of the choristers, although it would have been everyday music from the traditions that the music originated. Songliners performed by regulating their singing, emotions and memories for internal reasons and their performances were a form of expressing and sharing as best they could these experiences to audiences. Audiences were often invited to join in the singing as and when they felt they could, or felt moved to. This was less an intervention and more of an invitation to become involved. In both cases, however, they have avoided the issues associated with interventions.

Most of those within Pontanima have had direct experience of violent conflict, having lived through the siege of Sarajevo. Some were too young to remember, and only rarely a complete outsider has temporarily joined the choir, such as my informant Nick who had worked in Sarajevo in the British Council office there. Some had experienced extreme trauma, such as Emil, who had been collecting water from the brewery when one of the largest shelling atrocities hit the brewery. Not surprisingly, Emil still suffers from the trauma from that event. Kreso the musical director was actually part of the Bosnian army during the war, and was actively defending the city
in that capacity. These were true "insiders", and as a group they represent the community of Sarajevo or at least the community before and during the war. They represent less the community in its current form as already explained, due to the numerous deaths and the numerous people who fled and were replaced by people with less cosmopolitan experiences, beliefs and memories from the surrounding countryside. Nevertheless these people know about as much about the conflict as is possible, at least from their side. Despite all of this, there was little or no evidence of animosity towards Serbs, especially Serbs from Serbia itself, although there was an element of dread and fear demonstrated when they discussed Bosnian Serbs from Republika Srpska.

As discussed in the literature review section on best possible outcomes in a conflict transformation setting, direct third-party interventions in protracted violent conflicts are sometimes effective at forcing an end to outward violence if supported by sufficient political will and resources. These types of interventions do little to address the underlying reasons for conflict, and therefore these conflicts remain simmering and potentialised. Nevertheless these forms of intervention are the most common across the world, and are often reported as successful ends to conflicts once accords are drawn up and signed by the leaders of the parties involved. Long-term positive transformation of conflicts requires reflexive bottom-up approaches which are currently anathema to the third parties who have the resources and desires to intervene.

The Dayton Accord itself was a third-party intervention. All informants that I spoke to agreed that the Dayton Accord forced the warfare to cease, but that the resultant political climate has forced the entire country to remain in limbo, unable to progress. As a result, many informants have claimed that the war never really ended and, worryingly, that it could manifest again into outright violence again in the future. The separateness of cultures institutionalised by the Accord was deemed by those involved to protect the cultures and rights of those they were representing, yet in fact it had the effect of establishing and propagating separate collective memories of the war and mythologies where the other sides were blamed. Some informants claimed that this meant that children who have grown up in this environment have a deep anger against the other cultures which is not tempered by a direct memory of
traumatic violence of the war. These informants were fearful that these children could spark violent unrest in the near future as they begin to reach adulthood.

Musicking as a social activity is group-identity defining, but it is about in-out group separation as much as the bringing together of those within the group. Collective identities cannot be changed overnight, since they are rooted in experience. This relates to the literature on how new ideas presented to any particular group require much repetition in order to first establish themselves in memory and eventually inform belief structures. The continued musicking of Pontanima enabled this process to develop at least on a small scale, as was demonstrated by how attitudes of audiences in traumatised areas positively changed between when Pontanima first began performing and now.

Despite the problems with outside interventions in conflict contexts, musical or otherwise, it is clear that there remains a strong belief that music has the power to transform lives for the better. This is a belief shared by famous professional musicians, public relations marketers, and the general population. This belief is supported by the reflexive matrix of memory, emotion and identity, and it is clear that belief systems strongly influence behaviour. The combined belief in the power of music is what has made music powerful as a motivational force or concept despite a lack of understanding of how the processes operate in specific contexts. The constantly evolving nature that such an understanding would require is at odds with how intervention funders operate, since specific outcomes could not be predicted at the application phases. Furthermore, in order to attain further funding, reporting of such projects tends to use the language of the funding bodies rather than what is relevant to the context, resulting in an inability to cover the finer or specific characteristics of the situation. Funding organisations generally do not have the time and money to spend on detailed analysis during the feedback phase of a project, and might even be less than willing to do so since it could uncover results that show that the project had been out of touch with what was actually desired and required in that context.
### 5.5 Summary

The field research conducted on the two choir sites of Pontanima in Sarajevo and Songlines in London confirmed that musical meaning is very much context-driven. The similarities experienced between the two choirs could be traced to the similarities in the contexts, despite numerous obvious contrasts. On the surface the choirs were extremely different, yet they shared motivations for achieving a sense of belonging to a community and a sense of normality which they felt they otherwise did not have. This striving for normality was an emotional issue for all, and these emotions were tied to fragmentary memories, both positive and negative. Ultimately, these motivations, memories and emotions helped to form individual beliefs and identities. Where these beliefs and identities were believed to be shared within the group, they were further strengthened through the physical and sonic experiences of active musicking together, which falls squarely in line with Small’s theories of musicking (1998).

John Paul Lederach has been at the forefront of suggesting that metaphors in general and music in particular can provide a safe conceptual workspace in which to test and manage conflict situations (1995). This is in line with DeNora’s workspace theories of music and everyday life (2000). Both sites demonstrated that musical activities were at least indirectly connected to the changing attitudes and behaviours necessary for positive conflict transformation. Furthermore, it was shown that music is strongly connected to the behaviour-influencing matrix of identity, memory, emotion and belief. The combination of a sandbox approach to dealing with actual conflict, where different ideas are tried out before committing to them, with the embodied practice and transmission of tacit peaceful knowledge has demonstrably led to some positive social change by reducing some prejudices that choristers and audiences held about those from different cultural backgrounds. The measurable amount is small, the measuring tools are inadequate and the outcomes are unpredictable due to the variables involved, yet the processes involved can be tracked.

In the following chapter I will further analyse these findings in order to understand the mechanics of these processes and possibly to predict outcomes in the future.
6. Analysis

6.1 Introduction

I will now attempt to advance the perspectives laid out in the Findings chapter by framing the discoveries through the conflict transformation work of Lederach (1995; 2005) and Bercovitch (1984; 2009), the memory theories of Tota (2005) and the emotional theories of Sloboda (2005; 2010), the ethnographic theories of Glaser and Strauss (1968) and Spradley (1979) and the tacit knowledge theories of Michael Polanyi (1962) and DeNora’s models of music and everyday life (2000). This chapter endeavours to understand the links between music’s ability to be embedded in the ordinary day-to-day life of an individual and to simultaneously inspire and move to action a larger group of people. Finally, I will apply Intergroup Contact Theory to both research sites, to determine if and how social change has been afforded. The intention is that these contextualised findings can then be applied practically in the field, by demonstrating that musical analysis can be employed as an ethnographic and tacit cultural knowledge transmission tool.

6.2 Music as Conflict Transformation

In the literature review it was noted that certain criteria needed to be met in order for a successful conflict transformation to occur that was mutually beneficial to all sides involved, or at the very least, on an equal level of desired/undesired outcomes. These criteria included such things as a desire to end the conflict in this manner and equal access to basic needs. No amount of musicking or social activity of any sort would be able to address a conflict where these two primary concerns are not addressed. The second tier of criteria, however, suggests that the parties involved need a safe conceptual space in order to work through their problems, and that working through unrelated problems first is a useful conceptual way in to understanding each other. This in turn can pave the way for real and fruitful negotiations. The things that need addressing here are memories of atrocities and wrongdoing both as victims and perpetrators, the strong emotions that are tied both to these memories and to the present, and how they prevent any moving on, the beliefs tied into the memories and emotions that the "Other" is somehow less than human, and how these three aspects affect current behaviour.
Pontanima have had more financial and media support from outside of Bosnia, as evidenced by their various peace and music awards they have received. In all of these cases, Pontanima have mainly performed for high-level officials, NGOs and government representatives rather than for any grassroots organisations or audiences. This may have been an obstacle if Pontanima’s peacebuilding efforts were expected to target the communities where these events occurred, since research elsewhere has shown that real positive conflict transformation requires the grassroots level to be involved. Since the conflict in question was between cultures found within the choir and within their audiences in Bosnia, the fact that they perform for the elite classes abroad has had no discernible effect.

In both the literature review and with support from the findings, I will now attempt to show how music’s ability to intersect all of these aspects is the reason why music itself can be used for conflict transformation purposes.

I have largely based my conflict transformation analysis on the work of Bercovitch (1984; 2009), Lederach (1995, 2005), who are among the most prominent and well-respected writers and educators in international relations and conflict transformation practices. Bercovitch, for example, has recently been the editor of a major collection of current thoughts on the subject (2009). It is for this reason that these theories of how conflicts can be positively transformed are referred to in this context.

The first step in any conflict transformation setting is to understand the conflict itself. If the conflict has arisen spontaneously due to human basic needs not being met due to shortages, then it is unlikely that conflict will cease until such basic needs have been met. In this type of conflict it is difficult to imagine how music could be of much help. There have been examples of songs being employed as educational tools in order to teach a segment of a population how to avoid AIDS and other serious illnesses, as was the case in Ghana. If the conflict is one of identity and differences, then successful conflict transformation requires the acceptance of

39 A music and drama troupe had successfully improved sexual health education through the teaching of traditional-style songs with health-based lyrics (Bosompra 2008).
differences and a better understanding of the "other." In order for this type of learning about the other side to progress, there needs to be a shared desire on all sides for this to occur. There also needs to be a desire for a relatively equal outcome, as opposed to ‘winning’ outright. If one side is devoted to winning a conflict, then again it is unlikely that arts-based approaches have much chance in succeeding. It is conceivable that music might inspire a winning side to rethink their position in light of a growing feeling towards the other, but there is not much evidence to support this. Indeed, as I have said many times in this thesis, it is this belief itself that is the key to a positive tangible outcome using music. If all sides do manage to have a desire for a relatively equal outcome to a conflict transformation project, then it becomes a matter of how to proceed. It is during this process that music can play an active role.

Looking at the findings we can see that, at least within Pontanima, there was a unified desire to engage with each other on an equal footing.

“We first got together in October of 1996, about fifteen of us, and everybody met Fra Jadranko, heard about his ideas for it all, and somehow we all found ourselves on the same wavelength.” (Kreso).

“But when I got to Pontanima I saw that there really was a good number of people who were just like me in those things; all of us are different in terms of our affinities, our characters and so on, but in general we share the same idea.” (Branka).

Using Small’s analysis of the social aspects of active musicking, the participation in a hierarchical classical choir setting with clear echelons of power did not seem at first to be a useful medium through which to conduct equality-based conflict transformation, but this was countered by a strong belief within the choir for what they considered to be normal behaviour. This desire for normality outweighed other considerations. Indeed, the memory of what was believed to be normal, that is, the memory of good classical choirs with a diverse ethnic and religious membership, outweighed the concept that perhaps such a choir was unequal in itself regarding its structure and style of music. A social situation where everyone is clear about what their role is and what they should be doing for each other was appealing in a context with bubbling tensions, high unemployment and uncertainty about the future.
“I might not know what else is happening in my life, my job, or whatever, but in Pontanima I know I can sing and I know what to do.” (Neno).

Other forms of more equally represented music, such as free improvisation, would be unlikely to have worked in the same capacity in Sarajevo, despite the more equal structures and power relationships found within such music simply because there was no strong memory associated with free improvisation. It would have meant very little to these people, and any engagement with such music would seem more like an outside intervention then a mutually agreed and felt progression.

While Songlines had no overt identity conflict to overcome, there was a unified desire to be on equal footing as a singer under the direction of Theresa. “We are all Songliners.” (Emma). There was much talk about being part of a family from both choirs, and it is in this sense for both choirs that minor internal conflicts were managed.

“Pontanima was a surrogate family for me, since I missed my own family so much.” (Filip).

“I experience it (Pontanima) as a family and as a place where I can be myself and feel relaxed, where every person is either my brother or my mother, my sister.” (Stefan).

“Pontanima became my family in 1997, the place where nobody asked me who I was or where I came from, even though they knew who I was, and where they knew how to treasure the person that I was.” (Milana).

“The social aspect is important – this is like a family – but we also work hard and the demands are enormous.” (Ruža).

“All religions and nationalities, even foreigners, all of them are in the choir and all of us live like one family.” (Boro).

“In some situations the choir is like a second family to me. Well, it is – when you’re with people 24-7, a couple of times a year, then there’s hardly any other way to think about it.” (Draga).

“It really is great, like being part of a family. When I say family, I mean the sort of family where there are both fights and good times – more good times than fights, but it’s perfectly normal.” (Jasna).

“I definitely think of the choir as my family.” (Theresa).
“It’s like a big chaotic family: sure we fight sometimes, what families don’t? But we love each other really.” (Richard).

Everybody did not get along all of the time, but it was rare that these types of conflicts erupted into anything serious and they definitely never resulted in violence or outright physical harm of any sort. The worst situations that ever arose in both choirs were disagreements that became strong enough to prevent a member’s enjoyment of membership and that member would then leave the choir, as was the case with Emma. In both cases, the boundaries of what was considered appropriate for the choir were finally decided by their leaders, which may not seem like the best way to maintain equality for all but this situation was generally accepted by those who remained within the choirs.

“Kreso decides who is in the choir or not by auditioning or maybe he already knows them and knows they can sing well. We trust him to do that.” (Draga).

“Anybody can join Songlines but it’s certainly Theresa’s thing; she’s in control of pretty much everything.” (Richard).

In/out group maintenance requires the support of those that remained within, but is directed by those who are perceived to be the leaders of the groups. In other words, memberships shift and in-group culture changes over time, but the relationships under the group leaders remained relatively stable and equal, which enabled the active and passive peace-making and peace-keeping to take place.

Bercovitch’s model of conflict transformation suggests that if there is a comparable level of ‘win’ for all sides involved in a conflict, then that can be classified as win-win, which is the most desirable outcome (2009). If the sides involved can manage to agree to this principle, then it becomes a matter of figuring out how to do it and this process is often impeded by strong memories and beliefs about the other side, linked to possible atrocities and other ill-doings. This was certainly the case in Pontanima. Many of those within Pontanima lived through one of the most horrendous human-caused catastrophes in recent world history, and it would be understandable if they collectively continued to blame those who laid siege to Sarajevo, but they do not.

“Evil was to blame, not people, not the Serbian people as a whole.” (Jadranko).
“Reconciliation and tolerance are possible, and you have to accept your people back, they aren’t all to blame, you can’t put all the blame on one nation, one people.” (Branka).

Their collective desire to bring normality back to their lives outweighs that urge.

“It doesn’t matter about the war now, we just want to do normal things.” (Melita).

The way forward they had discovered was using music’s links to memory, belief and identity to illustrate simultaneously to themselves and audiences that there was another, more positive way to relate to each other as Bosnians then even in the current, albeit non-violent, segregated environment. Songlines did not have such a situation to counter but it could be said that the choir’s social cohesion has at its core a desire for a win-win outcome, otherwise the enjoyment would be lessened to the point where they would no longer desire to maintain the choir at all.

At the point of desire for a win-win outcome from all sides involved, both Bercovitch and Lederach agree that what is needed next is a deeper understanding and appreciation of the other points of view which includes in some cases, including that in Bosnia, of re-humanising the other (Miall 2004; Lederach 1995). Music fits into Bercovitch’s thinking here, since it arouses emotions which are often perceived to be common emotional responses. The meanings associated with the event, and the memory of the event can then be believed to be shared through a sense of empathy, which is considered by most practitioners as the key ingredient in a successful conflict transformation (Galtung 2000; Fischer 2006). Any music provides a space in which to try out new ideas, wear the clothes of different identities, safe in the knowledge that a person’s normal identity has not been threatened (DeNora 2000), and this links to what was mentioned about finding a safe abstract space. Music can also conjure traumatic memories but how the material is interacted with and how it progresses can abstract the process to the point where it becomes harmless, yet still connected to the trauma itself. The purpose then would be to begin to replace some of the devastating and ultimately unassailable memories with more benign ones associated with musicking. This is clearly in evidence with Pontanima, for example, when they first performed their repertoire that included Serbian Orthodox music in
Catholic churches in Srebrenica and other areas that suffered greatly at the hands of Serbs and Bosnian Serbs.

“People had talked about it as if it were really shocking – how can they interpret ilahijas inside a church, together with all those other songs that are each quite different – it shocked people.” (Jasna).

“In Banja Luka, for example, people there were so shocked by us at first. But, they stayed!” (Yeşim).

The key point here was upon the choir’s return some months later, many of the same people returned and this time they were not as shocked.

“Audiences were less shocked: that which was once completely different, unknown, foreign, which generated fear or even enmity, is suddenly discovered as something similar, intimate, enriching, a chance to look more closely at oneself and the dynamic of one’s own growth.”. (Jadranko).

“I think of some of the concerts that we’ve done, tours to Belgrade, tours to Banja Luka when we’re singing – even there! – Muslim ilahijas, and just shocking the audience but having them up on their feet and in tears, applauding.” (Nina).

For Songlines the goals were vastly different and the primary one was the sense of belonging and family that occurs, not only by being with like-minded people but also the expression of that sense through musical participation; the tacit understanding that is demonstrated in their musical activities together. The variety of singing styles, mouth openings, physical presences, and facial expressions actually embody the essence of Songlines’ projected openness and sense of acceptance and inclusion. In this way, music became the safe ground in which this new desired identity is explored, felt and understood but in a completely musical manner that over time becomes a new shared identity understood at the subconscious, tacit level of culture.

What is considered the key turning point in conflict transformation is that of building a new shared sense of identity amongst all sides in a conflict, for if you share an identity with someone you are less likely to be in overtly harmful conflict with them. Musical activity can help build new identities, at least temporarily, but Bergh was quite cautious in his analysis of this phenomenon. He quite rightly pointed out that this tended to last only about as long as the musical event itself (as was the case for
the West Eastern Divan Orchestra), or that it actually strengthened the boundaries between in and out groups rather than forming a joint identity. While this may be true to an extent, it demonstrates a lack of understanding of how music interacts with identity, especially via memory, emotion and belief. Pontanima has had more success than these other projects, albeit accidentally or intuitively, by strongly linking the temporary musical identity of the musical event itself to the strong memories of religious and cultural identities connected with liturgical musics in that particular social context, in the form of contextual memory management as explored in the previous chapter. It challenged perceptions of the enemy, by placing music associated with the enemy alongside music of their own culture and treating them equally. Performances also triggered memories of a time before their hardships had been manipulated by power-hungry leaders on all sides, and when all religions and cultures got along well and inter-group cooperation was common. The repeated performances were key in order to strengthen this feeling that occurred during performances and to increase the chance of short-term memories becoming long-term memories. Once they became long-term memories, then there was a chance that they could begin to change their beliefs about the former enemies, or at least recognise that their continued hatred was more damaging to all involved.

What began as a temporary music-based identity that was shared by certain individuals of varying backgrounds over time and through repetition, became a primary identity parallel to their personal one, which lasts beyond the musical events. In effect this new shared identity has since been normalised via their performances and this transmission from performer to audience has been less obviously successful although there is some anecdotal evidence that shows it has had some effect. Following Small’s theory of how active musicking not only creates social identities but once they have been established it further strengthens them, with each musical repetition. Pontanima’s musical peace project might have had a longer lasting and far-reaching effect if those in the audiences had been actively involved in the music production rather than just the reception. Although Small has also pointed out that active musicking includes reception, since that is where the meaning-making process occurs, this a less effective way in which to propagate the normalisation of a shared identity. The effects of the repetition can be seen to a degree with the
differences in attitudes in areas of great trauma towards the choir after their first performances and their more recent ones.

As for Songlines, people may have started out with different ideas and attitudes and expectations of the choir but now, despite many minor grievances, those that remain within Songlines identity themselves as Songliners to any outside group. Conversely, they do have sub-groupings that identity themselves to each other, such as the Mondays or Tuesdays or Wednesdays, and there are some other less common groupings such as ‘the inner circle’ and ‘proper musicians’. The point here is that identities are formed temporarily during musical events, and through repetition and combining emotions with the memories of these emotions and musical events the identities become more solid, which relates to the findings on memory management and normalisation. Furthermore, these identities are promoted through performances which are less successful at spreading the identity itself. New memberships in both cases have come from former audience members, which suggest there is some evidence that this works to spread identity to a certain degree.

In conflict transformation settings, it is precisely this moment of realisation, what Lederach refers to as the ‘ah-ha’ moment, when sides suddenly realise a potential way forward, through a certain degree of mutual understanding brought about through a shared sense of discovery and even identity (Lederach 1995). Musical experience in this context operates as a metaphor for both conflict transformation processes themselves, and for the relational processes of reflexivity as discussed in the Findings chapter. Pontanima clearly demonstrate this process, although it has been in an organic, unplanned and patchy manner. What drove this particular project were the beliefs of the leaders and the desire to do music as part of the normality project embarked upon by its members. While Pontanima may have increased the understanding and shared sense of identity amongst its sixty-odd members and even to a lesser degree the hundreds of audience members it has performed to over the years, it has had little or, even more likely, no effect at the policy level or even on the general attitudes of millions of other Bosnians of all persuasions. According to many Fra Jadranko and others in Pontanima, leaders from some religious community groups have refused invitations to attend performances, especially from the Sarajevo Islamic Council, let alone become active participants. What this
illustrates is a category one problem in conflict transformation (Miall 2004): the unwillingness to participate in a process that would result in a win-win outcome. There is a perception within Pontanima that these leaders are looking to expand their power-base or at least protect their power-base which precludes any full cooperation with each other. They believe that at this level there is no desire to end the conflict in a way where all sides are equal, which is why the Dayton Accord is still in effect, enforcing a false equality. It could be argued that Bosnian Croatians have Croatia to fall back on, and Bosnian Serbs have Serbia, whereas Bosnian Muslims have nowhere else to go, so any tri-partition of the country is intrinsically unequal, but the fact remains that all sides continue to have valid grievances, mainly to do with employment, standard of living, and government corruption. The transmission of the tacit knowledge found within Pontanima requires participation with the members, audiences and the musical material that is impossible to accomplish remotely or via any other method. For this reason, any knowledge and lessons learned through Pontanima have failed to reach a wider audience.

Songlines findings show very little about conflict transformation itself, but it does illustrate how music has contextual meaning in terms of social normalisation, memory management and belief construction, as well as a metaphor for the interactive relationships between identity, memory, emotions (especially emotions relating to belonging, i.e. identity), beliefs and behaviour as explored in the previous chapter. Since conflict transformation also relates to these categories from the Findings chapter, it can be seen that Songlines illustrates the processes involved in a successful conflict transformation setting through the interactions between musical experience, identity, emotion, memory and belief, even if not conflict transformation directly occurred.

It would be useful here to determine how Pontanima and Songlines fall in line with Allport’s prejudice reduction theory and Pettigrew’s intergroup contact theory since reducing prejudice is a form of positive belief change and a key component of successful conflict transformation. In the particular case of Pontanima, not all members were considered of equal status at all times. Kreso and Fra Jadranko were considered the musical and spiritual leaders at all times, and therefore of elevated status. When members talked about Pontanima to non-members, however, they
usually placed everyone as just part of Pontanima, regardless of their position within the choir. “At the end of the day, we are all just Pontanima.” (Melita). For most of Pontanima’s existence, the members all shared a common goal which was to sing together as well as they could in order to be a world-class choir and also to spread the idea that co-operating with people from different cultures, especially those cultures that had recently been at war, was normal. This common goal has been challenged in more recent times with a split forming within the choir, with some wanting to carry on as they have been following Fra Jadranko’s mission, while others now believe that they have already achieved Fra Jadranko’s mission and now they want to focus on developing the choir in purely musical terms without a peace mission. Pontanima members clearly cooperate regardless of their religious and cultural heritages, and strong inter-group friendships have developed as a matter of course.

It is less obvious how, if at all, Pontanima met the requirement of having support from an authority, set of laws or customs, but within the choral structure there are embodied cultural norms about how to hold one’s body, move the mouth, and pronounce vowel sounds, as well as understanding certain melodic and harmonic passages being associated with certain religious liturgies. This acts as a tacit authority in this group setting, which is strengthened by the fact this form of choral structure is internationally replicated in Western-classical-style choirs all over the world. Pontanima had, until recently, the full support of the Franciscans in Bosnia, who were popularly believed by most Bosnians of all faiths to be the guardians of Bosnian culture since ancient times. During the recent war, Franciscans often safeguarded Bosnian cultural artefacts and documents, protecting them from looters and vandals, although the Franciscans no longer officially support Pontanima, as was explained in the Findings chapter.

Pontanima have clearly not completely met all of the essential criteria for inter-group contact to reduce prejudice, yet there is no discernible prejudice against any of the groups in Pontanima. This is still acceptable, according to Pettigrew, if enough affecting processes exist. Pontanima has experienced all of these affecting processes at least to some degree. This process, to a certain degree, existed prior to the choir’s formation and this was the primary reason for the relative inter-group
behaviour and attitude success. All members of Pontanima were enabled to learn about the different cultures and religions and their practices but most have remembered these things in any case, especially older members from cosmopolitan Sarajevo.

“Before the war, I had friends who were Muslim, Orthodox, Catholic, whatever. We used to celebrate each others’ holidays because we learned that we could get more cakes that way. I knew all of the religious holiday songs of all the religions.” (Cecilia).

Cooperative behaviour was a requirement within the choir which took precedence over any personal preference of association, but the members were already predisposed to cooperate in this manner.

“If I really had hate in my heart towards another religion, I probably wouldn’t have joined something like Pontanima. You just wouldn’t, would you?” (Yeşim).

As already mentioned, strong friendships between groups developed within the choir over time but inter-religious friendships between many members had already existed.

“It was a good friend, Anita, who was already in Pontanima and she was talking about it, and said you should join, so I did.” (Branka).

Finally, as already mentioned, all members of Pontanima prefer to identify themselves as "Pontanima", a label that is inclusive of all the religions and cultures.

Although Pontanima may have been successful at inter-group contact, the membership was biased in its selection. Being a voluntary group, only those who are interested in inter-group contact would ever be involved, as the quote from Yeşim above illustrates. Members willingly stopped thinking of themselves as a member of their culture or religion for the period of time they were actively involved with Pontanima in singing or socialising. This is evidenced in the number of times informants mentioned Pontanima as their primary identity when talking to outsiders. This in effect was a form of de-categorisation as their differences were broken down. After many repeated instances of meeting and musicking together, personal details began to emerge and they learned each others’ backgrounds, which means the
member groups became more salient. Despite the growing knowledge of difference, by this time Pontanima had definitely reached a point of re-categorisation, where the identity of Pontanima included all of the other identities. Pontanima had successfully produced inter-group contact behavioural and attitudinal change, although the processes and motivations involved were already present.

The findings contain evidence to suggest that those in Pontanima are generally tolerant and open-minded to all out-groups now, not just the ones that they work with, as long as there is an obviously musical connection. One example is their recent collaborations with choirs in Republika Srpska and Serbia; the desire for normal musical interaction outweighed any feelings of animosity and suspicion. I discovered this first hand when I began my research: I was not accepted by a number of the choir until I had the chance to sing with them. I passed the music test and they became immediately more open towards me. The transference of inter-group change from the particular instance of Pontanima to the wider society is more problematic. Pontanima performed regularly throughout Bosnia-Herzegovina but based on anecdotes from the choir, generalisation has been limited. First of all, audiences were almost exclusively from one group, especially during the performances at religious sites, so the only inter-group contact occurred between the choir and the audience. Looking at these two groups, they did not share equal status, common goals or group cooperation. They were supported by the church or religious organisation, but there was such an obvious differentiation between performer and audience that there was little chance for friendship development through this form of interaction. Some of the affecting processes would have positively influenced the audiences, however, since they would have engaged with learning about the ‘other’ as Pontanima presented themselves both musically and philosophically. Their behaviour was regulated by a respect for the religious site, so there were very few reported premature exits during performances, even from those audience members who reportedly were offended by the music. There was little

---

40 Although it could be argued that the audiences did cooperate with the choir in as much as they performed their role as recipients of the music and were even active in the meaning-making process in the Small sense of musicking.
scope for the generating of affective ties between the choir and the audiences, but
after several repetitions of these concerts, there were reports of in-group
reappraisals as some audience members began to tell the choir how they finally ‘got’
what they were trying to do and respected it.

Pontanima satisfies many but not all of the successful conflict transformation
requirements as outlined here. What follows is the same analysis applied to
Songlines and the meeting of the choirs.

Examining Songlines through the inter-group contact theory lens, it is as clear as it
was for the case of Pontanima that not all members were equal. Theresa was the
most obviously differentiated member, being the founder, director, composer,
arranger and the only paid member. There were also those on the management
committee who were referred to as the ’inner circle’ by some, as mentioned in the
previous chapter. Additionally there were the subdivisions by day which included a
tacitly understood premier group, the Wednesdays:

“While there are some really good singers on the Mondays and Tuesdays,
everyone knows that the Wednesdays are Theresa’s elite group.” (Liza).

Songliners had similar common goals as they all desired to sing as well as they
could together, either as a whole choir or within their daily sections. Pat here gave a
typical comment in this regard: “I just try to sing as well as I can.” This was also
Theresa’s goal, although she had additional goals associated with her other roles.

“I want everyone to sing together as a fun, loving community but I also have
big ideas for Songlines. Collaborations and events and trips.” (Theresa).

There was clear inter-group cooperation and friendship potential within Songlines,
although support from authority was less obvious. There were customs and tacit
knowledge about how to behave within the choir that were pretty unique to Songlines
(massage warm-ups for example), and these shared behaviours could be seen to be
normalising customs in that setting. Songlines only partially met the essential inter-
group contact theory conditions but, similar to Pontanima, Songlines not only
engaged with every affecting process, but also these processes were already largely
in play prior to members even joining Songlines. This is tied into the predispositions
of the members, since they would have been at least somewhat aware of what
Songlines was like before joining, and therefore only a certain type of person would do so. The variety of out-groups involved at the beginning all had these shared processes in common, which resulted in a generalisation in as far as they all now identified themselves as being a part of the wider group of Songlines.

Inter-group contact theory does not apply to Songlines as easily as it does with Pontanima, since it is much less obvious what the in and out groups actually are, and there is no particular behaviour or attitude that Songlines was attempting to alter. Nevertheless, the above analysis demonstrates how group cohesion can develop through strong affective processes and at least some of the essential conditions. This is common across both choirs and especially important here is the friendship potential. Members of both choirs have made very strong personal friendships during their membership, with some even becoming romantically involved and marrying each other, and it is this potential that seems to have helped to create the strongest identity bonds.

The meeting of the two choirs presents a more obvious in and out group interaction to be analysed in this manner. Many within both Pontanima and Songlines believed that Pontanima was in a superior technical and cultural position and this manifested itself in a lack of interest or even disdain from some Pontanima members and anxiety by Songliners.

“We just thought Songlines was some amateur choir, not a serious choir, and we didn’t really need to bother if we didn’t want to.” (Melita).

“Pontanima were just so good, we were really intimidated.” (Liza).

Due to the disparity between the agreed common goal between Kreso and Theresa, and what actually occurred during the meeting of the choir, there was only a limited level of cooperation possible. Only a fraction of the whole of Pontanima participated, and those that did just followed Kreso’s lead and they were generally unsure what the real purposes of the meeting were. Authority support was not really an issue here, but the only friendship potential came during the after-party choral wars.

The meeting of the choirs event, therefore, had only partial satisfaction of essential conditions, just as it was within each individual choir, but with the additional problem
of only partially satisfying the affective processes as well. Songliners had made an effort to learn a lot about and from Pontanima, through personal research, asking questions and also an attempt to learn Pontanima songs in the classical traditional choral manner. This was not reciprocated by Pontanima. Behaviour again was changed within Songlines, but not the other way around as Songlines had worked in Pontanima’s manner, while Pontanima’s behaviour had not altered at all. The meeting was too short for affective ties to take place, although the choral wars had provided a turning point where both sides began to understand something about each other. This unfortunately could not be followed up with repeated experiences. As a result no in-group reappraisal occurred, and since no particular attitude change occurred, no generalisation was possible.

This still leaves the question of why and how there came to be a perceptible change in attitudes during and after the choral battle. One way to explain this phenomenon is to view it as a separate event within the meeting event. During this mini-event, the statuses between the choirs were equal and they maintained a common goal of fun competition sanctioned by both choral leaders equally. And friendships were most definitely potentialised, and fun was had by all. The affective processes likewise were more positively engaged with: both sides learned that their commonality was just the pure joy they felt when they sang together. This was a relatively short mini-event, so behaviour alteration, affective ties and in-group appraisals did not occur, nor did any generalisation, but it was a markedly different scenario to that of the official meeting.

6.3 Music as Ethnography/Tacit Culture

During the field research process I noticed two significant things: I was generally less able to gain deeper ethnographic understanding of my subjects until I was active in the music-making process alongside them. Secondly, this process in itself was unspoken. Through musical demonstrative gestures and sounds, I became, at least temporarily, a fully functioning part of the scene I was researching. In other words, the act of musicking is in itself a form of ethnographic research that is not possible to fully accurately translate into language since it is a form of tacit cultural knowledge bound up in its own delivery and reception medium. In the following paragraphs, I will combine findings with Spradley’s (1979) and Glaser and Strauss’s (1968) concepts.
of ethnography as well as looking at more recent work on the understanding of tacit knowledge transmission in order to make sense of music as an ethnographic tool for deeply understanding tacit culture.

Spradley has stated that an excellent ethnography would be an account that demonstrated such a full understanding of a scene that it was almost indistinguishable from the scene itself (1979). In other words, the ethnographer has gained such an in-depth understanding of the scene that they could demonstrate this understanding in everyday life, to the point that was accepted as normal within the scene. Atkinson has famously stated, however, if you want to understand plumbers become a plumber, but then what is different from plumbing and an ethnography of plumbing? Atkinson argued that the only difference is that an ethnographer would then go and write about it; translating the experiences of being a plumber to a mostly sociological audience (2011). The daily content of activity would be largely indistinguishable from that of another plumber.

In my research with both sites I was at least partially immersed within the scene as an active member. This was especially true with Songlines with whom I was for all intents and purposes a full regular member of the Tuesdays sub-group for six months. Practical limitations prevented this same commitment to Pontanima, but I did sing with them as a member on a few songs during the collaboration with Songlines. If I take what Spradley (1979) and Hammersley and Atkinson (2007) have claimed, then I have demonstrated a deep understanding of both scenes when I had been accepted as a member of that scene. Furthermore, the only thing that differentiates me from the scene itself is that fact that I am writing about it in a manner befitting a sociology PhD thesis. This is not, however, an ethnography of the two choirs, it is an attempt to understand if and how music can be used positively in conflict transformation settings. I have used ethnographic methodology to gain access to the tacit knowledge found within the cultures of the choir in order to understand how they manage conflict through musical activity. During this process I have experienced and felt certain connections with my fellow choristers, gained a deep musical understanding of what my role was in given contexts, and how to feel and understand when things were going well and when something needed adjusting in order to make sense. I can write about these experiences but they are not the
experiences themselves; the writing is not the knowledge that I am after; the knowledge is found within the music itself. Any writing about the musical experience as a further understanding of a scene will invariably miss the tacit nature of musical knowledge. In other words, music is both the ethnographic method and the tacit knowledge of a cultural scene. A translation of this into language will inevitably be inaccurate to a degree. Nevertheless, the culture of the sociology PhD world dictates that such writing is necessary so I must continue with the translation. I will explore further, however, just how music has been used in my research as an ethnographic tool, and how it has enabled me to access the tacit cultural knowledge of the choirs. Furthermore, I will illustrate how Pontanima themselves have used this process in their conflict transformation project.

Many of my informants within Pontanima were hesitant, not terribly forthcoming or possibly repeating stories told many times to foreign journalists. Practical constraints meant I could not spend as much time getting to know the people within Pontanima as I had with Songlines, nor could I join the choir as a full member like I did with Songlines. Some informants were naturally open and friendly, and it was these informants that I relied on heavily during the early phase of my research, and they were the ones I managed to maintain contact with after I left the field. After the joint project with both choirs when I actually sang with the basses of Pontanima, things were very different. During one rehearsal I was singing my part as confidently and strongly as I could muster, as being amongst some of the best bass singers I had ever heard I felt I could not be shy. Many of those stood next to me kept turning their heads and glancing at me in a slightly surprised manner. At first I thought perhaps I was singing something very wrong but I checked what I was doing and I knew it was correct. Perhaps I was mispronouncing the words? No, I had my pronunciation checked by native speakers before, and I was confident that I was doing it correctly. Perhaps I was too loud, not blending? I quietened down a bit. These same others moved closer to me at this point, leaning into me even. After the song finished, I was perplexed until one, Entoni, said to me

“I didn’t know this arrangement and you seemed to know it well, so I was trying to listen to you but you kept getting quieter!”
Another long-standing member of the basses, Boro, said with a nod of approval “You’ve got it, you have it!” Another, Emil, said to me “I didn’t realise that you were a real musician!” Up until that point I was tolerated within the choir as a perhaps slightly annoying researcher by most, even though I could demonstrate a musical understanding in the words I used. Linguistic representations of musical understanding was not sufficient in order to gain the full trust of the members of Pontanima, only a musical demonstration that I knew how to fit into the scene gained their trust. Sure enough, after that point many members of Pontanima approached me with smiles and handshakes and not suspicion. This was by no means across the board, since many Pontanima members refused to even take part in the joint project, and they certainly did not change their perception of me and other Songliners as some sort of unwelcome interference in their normal lives. There were a few members of Pontanima that continued to avoid me or were less open, but the change was palpable. Music itself allowed me to gain tacit cultural knowledge about the group and, more importantly, to demonstrate this understanding back to the group in order to be accepted into the group.

The members of Pontanima had gone through a similar process themselves. People became members of Pontanima either through a personal invitation from Kreso or through an audition process. In both cases, they demonstrated the correct posture, mouth shapes, attitude, basic skills and knowledge required to enter the choir. They were prior to meetings and demonstrations an unknown entity and thereafter a member of the choir, and everyone within the choir was confident that they held the tacit cultural understanding required in order to properly function within the choir. This process of acceptance was regardless of ethnic and cultural identity, so through tacit knowledge demonstration, one’s own personal identities could be temporarily disregarded in favour of their musical ones. Over time, as bonds that started within the choir continued beyond the choir into strong friendships, they took on the identity of Pontanima almost as strongly as their original ones. This makes sense in light of how repeated actions via music works alongside identity strengthening and memories of emotions associated with musical activity.
6.4 Linking the Everyday to the Extra-Ordinary

It is the belief in the power of music that gives it its initial power, but it is music's ability to integrate into one's everyday life that gives it a lasting effect. If a musical event is felt and believed to have been special, that starts a possible connection. Through repetition and over time, this once special event becomes familiar and even banal and ceases to be thought about on a conscious level; it starts to feel as if it was always there. It is at this everyday stage that any new relationships formed during the initial exciting phase have been normalised in the everyday. It is at this point that a musical conflict transformation project could be said to have been truly successful. Unfortunately, this has not come into existence as yet. In the meantime, let us have a closer look at the findings using DeNora’s model of musical events (2003) to help understand this process.

Given the already established links between music and memory, it is sensible to examine the differences in social action surrounding a musical event, that is to say, what can be observed before the musical event, during it, and after it finishes. According to DeNora’s model, first the preconditions of an event need to be examined, which include conventions, biographical associations and previous practices. While the event is taking place, five features of the event need to be examined: who are the actors (what people are involved with the music)? What music is occurring (what type, what piece(s))? What is being ‘done’ during the music (are the actors consuming or producing)? What are the local conditions (how did this action come to this music)? What is the environment (what is the setting)? (DeNora 2000, p.49). The next step is of course to apply this model to an actual musical event. In the following paragraphs I will apply this model in a number of ways: first to the series of ‘mission’-based concerts performed by Pontanima from 1996 until 2006. Secondly I will analyse one Pontanima concert in 2009 and a typical Pontanima rehearsal. For Songlines I will look at a typical Songlines concert before the autumn of 2009, and after as well as a typical rehearsal. I will of course apply this to the concert and rehearsal conducted by both choirs when they met in September 2009.

Before Pontanima began their ‘mission’ concerts of equal parts liturgical music from all the dominant religions in the region, there existed several preconditions. Amongst the urban, well-educated middle classes in Sarajevo, at least, there was a long
tradition of classical choral singing and it was felt by this group to be an expression of cultural normality, seeing as they looked to central European cultural expressions as their model. This stems from the centuries of influence (and control) of Austria and Hungary. When Pontanima first formed, it was originally intended to be just a Catholic church choir for St. Anthony’s Church in Sarajevo, which was the church linked to St. Anthony’s Monastery where Fra Jadranko had been chief theologian. Kreso was charged with finding singers for this rebooted Catholic choir but quickly discovered that there were no longer enough quality Catholic singers left in Sarajevo in 1996, so close after the Dayton Accord, with many now dead or living abroad as refugees. It was important even at this stage that the quality of singing should be of a high standard, even if it meant not having a choir. A choir was still desired and Kreso suggested that they look at the other religions and form a choir that was inter-religious. What started as a practical solution resonated deeply with Fra Jadranko who gradually developed the mission around it and began recruiting in earnest people from all cultures, as long as the singing quality was of a very high standard. The primary precondition, therefore, was that there was a deep-rooted connection to choral singing amongst a certain subset of Sarajevo society that was a stronger pull than any separation felt between the different cultures.

Those engaging with Pontanima’s music include the leaders Kreso (musical director) and Fra Jadranko (spiritual leader, sometimes arranger, chorister), the choristers themselves divided into standard SATB and the audiences. Audiences were to begin with predominantly Catholic but increasingly included more Orthodox and Muslim members as time progressed. Others that engaged with Pontanima were other choirs and judges in international choir festivals and competitions, peace organisations and festivals, US Methodist peace activist organisations and occasionally the wider Bosnian public via radio and TV transmissions, when Pontanima sang the Bosnian national anthem. The music itself was to begin with Catholic liturgical music, yet their standard concert repertoire quickly came to include equal parts Orthodox, Islamic and Jewish liturgical music, all being either composed for the choir or pre-existing pieces arranged for the choir, usually by Kreso’s brother, Danko. In the case of the Islamic ilahija, which was traditionally sung monophonically only by males, the arrangements were drastic departures sonically, having been
arranged for SATB mixed choir. This choice of music, which is doggedly adhered to in every standard concert, had had the effect of equalising the cultures to each other, including the ghost Jewish culture which had been such a strong part of Bosnian culture since the 15th century until the 1940s when Hitler invaded Yugoslavia. In effect, 75% of any of the music sung would be unfamiliar to any one member (with the exception of those from mixed marriages) but they were all together in this fact, so it was accepted. People claimed to like the mission but they were primarily concerned with the music and it was the quality of the singing found within Pontanima that continues to gain recruits, not the equal amount of liturgical music.

Types of engagement with a Pontanima concert include, for Kreso, embodying the music slightly in advance of the actual sounds, a physical foreshadowing of the music. This is standard choral conducting practice in central Europe, and it relates to the difference in speeds of light and sound: the sight of a conductor is almost immediately perceived by the choir who then has to interpret, respond and be heard, which takes longer. By making the gestures ahead of when the sound is desired, the sound should resonate at the correct temporal point. The choir on the other hand stand formally, focussing entirely on Kreso and, again, using standard central European choir practices, deploying enunciations that are very crisp at the ends of note durations, very open vowel sounds and a pure un-modulated tone. A Bulgarian influence is noted in the strength of the bass section, which is very deep and resonant, especially when comparing it to a typical Western choir bass section. The audiences normally sit in church pews, and the choir is behind or by the pulpit in a church or synagogue. Pontanima have never performed in a mosque, as music as such is forbidden in these structures, but they have performed numerous times in the courtyards of Islamic schools or Islamic cultural centres. In this case, the performance was much less formal, having no central focus or stage and no structured points of seating, and audiences there, largely consisting of teenagers and teachers, were free to roam in and out of the range of the choir. Kreso has the look of someone in control during these events, and the choir have a unified, peaceful and together manner as they respond to Kreso’s guidance like a well-oiled musical machine. Fra Jadranko during these performances is indistinguishable from any other chorister, except at some point during the concert he always makes a
speech to the audience, explaining the mission and what the choir is doing exactly. The audiences first reacted to the concerts with a mixture of confusion and shock. They, too, would have been unfamiliar with 75% of the music. The audience, unlike the choir, was not aware of this before they were exposed to it, and they chose to come to their church where they felt secure, and sometimes reacted very negatively to strange music invading their sacred spaces. Over time, and repeated performances, these same audiences seemed to begin to accept the concepts and even like some of the unfamiliar music (as it perhaps became less unfamiliar). In general, the most striking music for many was the Orthodox music, at least for those initially unfamiliar with it. Orthodox choral music is usually much more complex harmonically than other liturgical choral music, with very rich bass tones underpinning the complex harmonies on the top. There is more musical material involved, which can provide more sonic information to digest for those who are musically literate to some degree. The Ilahija were often commented on as well. All Bosnians are familiar with these songs, as it is hard to avoid them being broadcast from every mosque five times a day. The Pontanima arrangements, being SATB arranged for mixed choir, are very different beasts, although the melodies are instantly recognisable. Another interesting point is that most times when they perform in different venues across Sarajevo, they received requests for auditions. Some audience members became choristers, inspired by the quality of the music and the normality of singing shoulder to shoulder with all of the Bosnian cultures also resonated positively with them.

Pontanima informants reported that, through their own conversations with audience members, much of the shock experienced by the audiences seems to have stemmed from a cognitive dissonance felt between what is perceived as a safe stable environment, the church, and the perceived antagonistic alien music from the "enemy." Equally shocking, although less consciously understood or expressed, is the feeling that this music of the enemy is at least innocuous or even enjoyable. Some interpreted this as yet another manipulation of their environment for the expansion of enemy territory. They could not conceive at first how the music of their enemy could have any other purpose in their place of worship except as an attempted takeover of that space or to taunt them or make a mockery of them. Three
things in some combination have potentially assuaged this shock and anger into a form of acceptance: Fra Jadranko’s speeches and explanations may have been the key to help audiences understand; repeated performances of the same music may eventually have replaced hateful memories associated with the cultures that produced that music with more benign memories associated with the concerts; and time itself may have eased the strength of emotions associated with the traumas of war and therefore were less emotionally triggered by concerts. Next I will look at each of these possibilities in more detail.

Due to practical issues gathering audience data for this project, it is difficult or impossible to determine with any degree of certainty just how much effect, if any, Fra Jadranko’s speeches had on audience acceptance of Pontanima’s music and of the cultures of perceived enemies. It is possible that it could have hindered progress as well since he is first of all seen as a respectable Catholic monk and theologian. Should such a figure and representative of the Church really be inviting non-Catholics and their music in their most holy spaces? In non-Catholic spaces, the opposite could be true: how dare a Catholic monk boldly bring his own music and ideas into our sacred spaces? On the other hand, if his speeches were the key factor in helping audiences of any denomination gain acceptance of the different cultures found within modern Bosnia, than it suggests the music has accomplished less then perhaps was first thought. The question remains, is it possible for music alone to influence the beliefs and behaviours of audiences for positive social change?

6.5 Inter-Group Theory, Music and Everyday Life and the Reflexive Model

DeNora has posited that when music is utilised habitually in everyday life, it affords a variety of modes of attention and actions dependent on the context. How a particular music becomes habitually used is through repetition and a reinforcing of meanings and associations over time. Interestingly, inter-group contact theory and DeNora’s music and everyday life ideas link very neatly with my earlier reflexive model. I will first relate inter-group contact theory to my reflexive model, followed by the same with everyday life music, and then I will illustrate the mechanics of this model with data from the findings.
Equal status is not an objective fact but rather a perception and expectation (Cohen and Lotan 1995; Cohen 1982; Riodan and Ruggiero 1980; Robinson and Preston 1976) and therefore a belief. Common goals, cooperation and authority support can all be found within any joint musical activity, since the goal would be the musicking itself, which by its very nature requires cooperation, and the authority is the tradition that dictated the approach, playing style, methods and materials utilised. How these authoritative customs developed themselves is steeped in identity and memory and, most likely, some degree of emotion. The shift in inter-group contact theory away from essential static conditions towards affective processes is similar to my attempt to move music and conflict transformation analysis away from music as an object or fixed set of phenomena, towards musicking as a dynamic process as influenced by the reflexive model. The changing behaviour process involves attitude change through repetition which affects both belief and memory. ‘Affective ties’ refers to positive emotions as influencing processes that inter-group contact theory maps almost directly onto my reflexive model. Since this theory has been shown to be useful in understanding positive conflict transformation, music has a direct theoretical connection to conflict transformation.

How music relates to generalisation is through the portability and reproducibility of musical activity. Since the first step is the de-categorisation, this is less likely to occur during the performer – audience dichotomy. This relates to Small’s theory that music production is more likely to produce stronger and closer identity bonds than during the reception of music in an audience. Salient categorisation and re-categorisation are essentially identity-building processes based on changing beliefs and memories. Ultimately and ideally, a new shared identity has been forged which is no longer considered as different but this is only attainable over a long period of time through many repeated contacts, which in effect is a normalisation process which is one of the major findings in my research, especially in Sarajevo. Finally this ties in with DeNora’s concept that music plays a role in memory, identity and emotion regulation only once it has become ingrained in memory through repeated instances; music needs to be normalised in order to become ‘everyday’ (2000).
6.6 Summary

The music and behavioural change reflexive model as outlined in this thesis is a useful model for understanding how music ultimately can affect behaviour. When underpinned with DeNora’s social theories of music and everyday life (2000), and combined with the inter-group contact theory, a robust set of theories and models in which to best understand how music and conflict transformation has worked, or not worked as the case may be, has emerged. This also goes some way to understanding how new more efficient practical projects might be designed.

Music is already overtly recognised within conflict transformation circles as one of the approaches to be used in Track III diplomacy, but there is little understanding of how best to apply this. This has manifested itself in poorly designed and executed projects. Since one of the key requirements in this form of conflict transformation is attitude change, or prejudice minimisation, inter-group contact theory suggests that a combination of conditions (equal status, common goals, cooperation, authoritative support, friendship potential) and processes (learning about the out-group, behavioural change, affective ties and in-group reappraisal) need to be engaged with in order to best achieve this. The musicking and behavioural change model fits nicely in with this approach as it deals with a dynamic processing of music, memory, emotion, identity and belief. Music therefore has a direct and strong link to conflict transformation, yet there has not as yet been a wholly successful music and conflict transformation project, according to the criteria outlined in this thesis, but this can be explained using these two models. Failure of any particular project is likely due to a lack of attention or understanding of one or more of these processes.

One likely reason why these processes have not been fully understood up until now is the tacit nature of music. Music is engaged with as a temporal phenomenon, which is understood both pre- and post-lingually. The understanding of meaning associated with music is felt emotionally as well as physically, but also with a complex ever-changing system of modes of attention involving memory, emotion and identity. This information is transmitted between group members and beyond to out-groups without the necessity of language. There is no inherent message, however, since the ultimate meaning is interpreted by any given recipient with their own matrix of meanings derived from their own memories, emotions and identities. The meaning is
in the music or musicking itself, and it can be perceived as such and any translation of this experience into language loses the very character of music that enables it to affect memories, emotions and identities so effectively in the first place. This tacit musicking produces what Procter coined proto-social capital, which through repetition has normalised behaviour and affords social capital in the traditional sociological sense (2011). Since music is in itself a tacit form of cultural knowledge, musicking acceptably in the culture of study would be a demonstration and confirmation of a deep understanding of that culture. Music therefore is both tacit cultural knowledge but also a form of ethnographic inquiry in and of itself without the necessary translation into language.

In all of the methods and fields discussed, repetition is the key to success. Musical education itself requires much repetition until the music is habitual, normalised, everyday, implanted in long-term memory. Conflict transformation projects require a turning point, but then this turning point needs to be continually developed through repeated instances. Inter-group contact, even if initially positive, will not result in tangible positive change unless the contact is repeated over a long period of time. Extraordinary musical experiences can provide turning points, but repeated musical contacts would need to be engaged with in order to promote both tangible change and moving the extraordinary into the everyday. If a change manages to become everyday, then that is a good indicator that it will last. Unfortunately, due to a lack of understanding and planning with this in mind, all known current music and conflict transformation projects have not been wholly successful in effecting lasting social change beyond small particulars.

A cross-examination of the Analysis and Findings chapters highlights that musicking in these contexts did not completely satisfy the conflict transformation models that were employed. The musical contexts did, however, largely satisfy the inter-group contact theory requirements for prejudice-reduction, and this is considered a key turning point in conflict transformation. These contexts were the most successful at inter-group contact when the musical experience was extraordinary rather than everyday, but this initial experience needed to be followed by many repetitions until the extraordinary became normalised and embedded in long-term memory. This, in turn, formed a shared tacit knowledge between the participants, or a proto-social
capital, that was embodied in their shared behaviour. This procedural complex was felt by participants to be simultaneously normal and extraordinary, and they generally had memories of this type of experience prior to the projects which affected their belief that such a paradoxical experience was possible. Finally, this shared belief in the possibility of a profound yet mundane experience through music is the spark, or key motivation, to become engaged with music for conflict transformation purposes in the first instance.
7. Conclusion

The literature indicates that music should be able positively to affect conflict transformation scenarios if attention is paid to the dynamic matrix of how music interacts with memory, emotion and identity. These in turn largely influence beliefs which ultimately affect behaviour. The findings and analysis from the empirical research conducted for this thesis supports this notion and the fact that the projects researched were not wholly successful at transforming any conflict does not contradict the theory since these projects did not take into consideration many of the complex aspects of the reflexive model. An additional problem is that there is often an assumption that music would positively affect conflict situations in this manner when the opposite is also just as possible. What behaviour is ultimately changed through a musical intervention is completely contextually dependent, and a lack of understanding of contexts will inevitably result in inability to determine just what music might do. Finally, social change through musicking is most likely to occur within the group(s) producing the music itself and this had limited the possible effect of groups such as Pontanima to those within the choir and, to a smaller extent, to their Bosnian audiences.

It is interesting to note the commonalities between the fields of music sociology, ethno-musicology and conflict transformation. Music sociology has largely been concerned with how music represents social group identity, as well as how people interact with music in order to manage their identities. This process of identity management involves modes of attention that highlight certain memories and triggers emotions associated with these memories. Common memories and perceived shared emotions form the basis for collective belief about social identity. DeNora has noted how collective belief is a precursor to collective action, and has labelled this a mode of attention that affords certain actions. Ethno-musicological methods examined pieces of music and styles of music in their social contexts, noting how cultural identity is strongly linked to particular ways of musicking. They also have shown how even within the musical material itself memories and emotions are involved with the creation of any meaning associated with the music. In conflict transformation it has been shown that Track III grassroots diplomacy which involves the changing of attitudes is needed for long-term improvements acceptable for all
sides of a conflict. This belief change needs to consider past events and how they are remembered by all sides as well as an understanding of how these have influenced the various identities involved and how they feel about each other and these past events. In all cases the reflexive relationship of identity, memory, emotion and belief and therefore behaviour are intrinsically linked. Music as a social activity is a particular activity that is well-suited to access this matrix since it has strong connections to every part of it. Musical activity, especially active production rather than reception, can simultaneously strengthen one’s sense of identity as well as challenging its barriers, or at least the belief about where the barriers between in and out groups are. Such an experience can highlight certain memories associated with the music, or type of music or certain aspects within the music, which in the new context can elicit strong emotions. This in effect is a turning point moment sought after in conflict transformation scenarios, where a realisation of new possibilities occurs in the minds of the participants. This alone will not suffice, as this experience turns into memory among all of the other memories. Memories are strengthened by trauma or repetition, so these types of musical interventions need to recur often and frequently in order for the new patterns of belief to become normalised and habitual. It is at the very point that new patterns of behaviour have been normalised that it could be said that the social change has been successfully implemented. It is this complex set of processes that justifies the development of music and conflict transformation as a field in its own right, drawing from sociological and musicological traditions but independent in its trajectory.

There are four key concluding points from this research, therefore, which are that musicking affects beliefs through interacting with memory, emotions and identity which in turn affects behaviour at the personal and social levels; musicking is not an inherently positive activity; how musicking interacts with memory, emotions and identity context dependent; music and musicking are both forms of ethnographic data. I will consider each point with illustrations from my empirical research and the literature followed by some suggestions for future research.
7.1 Point 1- Musicking affects belief through interaction with memory, emotions and identity which in turn affects behaviour at the personal and social levels

Musical meaning cannot exist without memory, as Meyer (1961) pointed out, since musical material as it exists on the temporal plane is a series of aural events that either confirm or confound expectation, and expectation is impossible without some memory of previous musical material. Music has also been shown to highlight, emphasise and retrieve memories through both listening and reproduction, or even a mode of attention akin to reliving the past for the duration of a musical experience. Furthermore, a present musical experience can alter how a memory is perceived by this process of emphasis. Music is strongly linked to emotions, although there is no direct correlation between certain musical elements and corresponding emotional reactions, despite much research conducted by music psychologists. There are two levels of emotional response to sounds, and therefore music, with the first being a universal human evolutionary reaction to sound that is immediately interpreted into basic emotions such as fear. The second level is cognitive, which requires mental processing of meaning through associations with memories and identity. Music has long been seen both to represent the identity of the person(s) who create the music and increasingly those who consume it. More recently there have been discussions about how musicking itself helps to define and strengthen identity, especially for those creating the music and over time with numerous repetitions until it has been normalised into a social group’s collective belief system. Collective belief systems share common memories, emotional responses and senses of identity, and are therefore influenced by these three aspects. Finally, collective belief leads to collective behaviour or action. Therefore music indirectly affects behaviour through this reflexive matrix of meaning-making. This theoretical process has been confirmed by the field work conducted for this thesis, but also in the work of Bergh who had been sceptical about the power of music, since musical conflict transformation projects have been less successful than reported. The reason why these projects are only marginally successful at best is due to a weakness at some stage of the behaviour change model just described.

For example, members of Pontanima collectively remembered a pre-war time in Sarajevo when Catholics, Orthodox and Muslims co-existed not only peacefully but
as an integrated society with inter-marriage being commonplace. This was the case even for those members too young to remember the Tito era with any clarity. The atrocities that occurred during this time against any dissenters were not generally a remembered topic nor were Tito’s economic disasters. These memories brought up feelings of yearning to live in such a time again, combined with a sadness that this situation no longer existed after the Dayton Accord forced the cessation of military conflict. This was followed by a determination to make it happen again in the future. This highlighted a collective sense of identity as Bosnians first, followed by cultural and religious identities that were considered less important. By performing liturgical music from the faiths involved in the war side by side in a mixed cultural choir, they reinforced this matrix of meaning, which only became stronger with each experience, to the point where a new primary identity emerged, that of being a member of Pontanima, who were ‘normal’ people who did not believe that cultural or religious differences should encourage uncivil behaviour towards each other. By performing in public, Pontanima served as a reminder to other Bosnians who had suffered greatly that their suffering had not always existed so divisively and to spread a feeling of hope that peaceful co-existence and better, even friendly, interaction was possible in the future. The strong sense of a new shared identity that Pontanima members feel with each other regardless of cultural background has not propagated itself nearly as well with audiences, and this is due to the difference in how active music production creates stronger social bonds than reception. Audiences experience these musical events much less frequently then those within the choir which also lessens the impact on memory. In other cases, however, musicking has been shown to be much less positive.

The recent tension experienced within Pontanima regarding the desire of some to abolish the "mission" of the choir illustrates how this reflexive process originally inspired a conscious peacebuilding agenda yet at a later point its abolition. The memory and associated emotions of choral singing in a Tito-era Yugoslavia originally brought Pontanima and its mission together but new memories of performing to a high international standard began to emerge over time. As this occurred the shared memories of what was a normal public display of culture and tolerance began to be supplanted by what they perceived as normal cultural displays in other countries;
'normal' countries were not believed to need highly skilled choirs with explicit peacebuilding missions and perhaps Bosnia, Sarajevo and Pontanima would never be considered truly 'normal' until the peacebuilding agenda is completely replaced by a purely musical one.

7.2 Point 2 – Musicking is not an inherently positive activity
Research on music and conflict is more plentiful than the reverse, which illustrates a rather worrying trend in research funding. That aside, it is clear that music can have much less positive effects on social groups than desired by musicians, activists and conflict transformation practitioners. Music has been used in torture by the U.S. military, as deterrents against teenage loiterers in shopping malls, as social control in dictatorships, as intimidation during wars in the Balkans, and as a distraction by democratic capitalist societies. Music as an object and a phenomenon is essentially amoral; the phenomenon itself does not change regardless of how it is interpreted even if the producers and recipients do. Whatever music ends up meaning by any group or what purposes it is utilised, the processes involved are the same. Music affects memory, emotion and identity, which then confirms or challenges beliefs to some degree, which in turn strengthens or challenges behavioural patterns. This is true if an interrogator is attempting to force information out of a detainee or during positive conflict transformation. Unfortunately, good intentions by musicians and activists and peace professionals have blinded them to this process, whereas those who use music for negative purposes have been so far much more systematic in their approach to understanding how music affects people. One of the primary mistakes made by musicians and other practitioners alike in conflict transformation settings is that a particular type of music or piece of music will have similar effects wherever it occurs which ignores the importance that context.

7.3 Point 3 – How musicking interacts with memory, emotions and identity is context dependent
The West-Eastern Divan Orchestra was devised by Daniel Barenboim and Edward Said, under the impression that gathering Israeli and Palestinian musicians to learn and perform Beethoven’s symphonic music would be meaningful enough to assist peacebuilding to some extent. Barenboim is less verbose about the potential of the orchestra now, but it is clear from both the theories espoused above and the
empirical field work that musical meaning is very much tied to the context that it originated in as well as the context in which it occurs. Contexts are influential enough to override certain other processes in music and conflict transformation, so that a lack of attention to the social contexts either results in a poor understanding of what is actually happening or in the ultimate failure of music to achieve its social purpose. This is evident in both of Bergh’s research sites, as well as both of my own. In Norway’s Resonant Communities project, non-Norwegian musicians were brought in to perform at schools where there were immigrant children in an effort to improve attitudes by ethnic-Norwegians to immigrants, but this music as representation act de-contextualised the music of the immigrant culture, so that it had no particular meaning to the audiences except as an excuse to be out of normal class activities. In the Sudanese refugee camps, multi-ethnic bands formed and performed for the people who found themselves there, which seemed to start to become a positive form of conflict transformation through the development of a new shared identity that was very much rooted in the context to which they belonged, but when NGOs became involved and professionalised some of the bands, the bands were no longer part of the context from which they originated. As they performed more at official functions they altered their musical purpose from music as identity-building to music as representation, which is not only less effective at conflict transformation, it has also been shown to worsen conflict by strengthening the barriers between in and out groups. The reason why a choir worked as well as it has in Sarajevo is the history of choral societies there. Pontanima members remember hearing choral music from all the religious traditions at least at their respective major holidays. Many informants remembered having childhood friends from different religions and would often participate in religious ceremonies that differed from their own, during which they would hear and sometimes participate in the musicking. Choral music was and still is considered an outward expression of normal European civil society, which was a legacy from the Austro-Hungarian Empire. It is for this reason that a form of music that contains within it unequal power structures has been beneficial for those that have participated.
7.4 Point 4 – Music and musicking are both forms of ethnographic data

The act of musicking is an act of retrieving emotional, memory and identity data at the same time as influencing them. In this way, musicking as a phenomenological state is itself a form of data which is ethnographic in nature due to the tacit knowledge involved in the social creation of musical meaning. Ethnographic research attempts to understand a social group as those being researched understand themselves, and this is often demonstrated by accurately and correctly talking and behaving appropriately with those being researched. In other words a researcher has embodied cultural tacit knowledge by learning how to co-propagate it with those being researched. The act of musicking in a social group requires a tacit embodied knowledge of what is appropriate and required in a given situation. In both cases the correct body movement and social actions demonstrates to the group that you understand their tacit cultural knowledge and accordingly trust increases between those present. The problem in both cases lies not with this demonstration but with the translation of experience into language. The writing about a musical experience does not transmit the cultural knowledge which is phenomenological in nature. There is little in the way of current research into how musical experience can be used as data itself for the purposes of sociology and ethnographic methodology, but the experiences of demonstrating, displaying and communicating tacit cultural knowledge can be illustrated. Musicking, therefore, is ethnographic in nature due to the deep social understanding that is gained during the activity, but it also simultaneously transmits this understanding to the rest of those musicking. Furthermore, the phenomenological interaction that occurs during musicking alters the meaning of the data as it occurs as the current context, emotions and beliefs are added to the pre-existing sets of overlapping and intermingling memories, emotions and beliefs.

When I began researching Pontanima, there was a certain level of distrust that I felt from many of the members and I found it difficult to get many of them to talk to me until I had the opportunity to put down my notebook, Dictaphone and video recorder and actually sing with them. I was lucky enough to have some practical experience in singing in classical choirs so I could demonstrate a tacit international cultural knowledge to which they aspired as a display of cultural and civil normality. I was
able to mouth words that I did not comprehend through using the correct mouth position. My vocal resonance as a bass was able to blend successfully with the Pontanima basses and as we sang I could see many turning towards me, nodding in approval. Some afterwards commented on how they did not realise that I was a "real" musician and began to open up to me. I had already told them all that I had a musical background, but no amount of saying it would have broken down those barriers, it was the active participation in musicking together that demonstrated an understanding of each other that showed that I understood them in the abstract musical realm as they understood themselves as choral performers.

7.5 Future Research
Despite providing some evidence that supports the notion that music can play a positive role in conflict transformation, the evidence remains scant and it is still some way away from showing how music can be used in other contexts. The complex nature of the evolving relationships between music, belief and behaviour through interactions with memory, identity and emotion implies that to purposefully design a successful music and conflict transformation project, an enormous amount of research and experience would be required beforehand. The foreseeable problem with the reflexive model is that it potentially can create a large workload prior to project initiation, which could be prohibitively expensive. The next step should be to apply the reflexive model of musical meaning and belief building to as many conflict situations as possible. This would stress test the model, refute it or, hopefully, help to improve it. At the end of such a process there should hopefully remain a model that can be transported to many conflict contexts. Once this stress-testing is complete, the lengthy process of researching the complex relationships in a given conflict context could begin with the assurance that the model is fit for purpose. It would be important throughout the lifetime of such a project that it was empirically studied in order to further contribute to the field and the model in a grounded, data-led manner.

7.6 Final Thoughts
The potential for creating projects that most effectively use music is at odds with the current world structures that favour short-term concrete objectives over long-term emerging processes. Common beliefs about music are likewise problematic when
considering any practical application of the research found within this thesis. The current system of funding projects will struggle to implement a music and conflict transformation project that first requires an in-depth background and contextual research process, in order to understand the system of memories, emotions, identities and beliefs involved by all parties in a conflict before any musical approach can even be decided. Once a musical approach is decided, the implementation has been shown to require a protracted period of repeated experiences. Finally, social change would need to be monitored throughout the project and afterwards. Ideally, the project would not actually end, since the point is to repeat such experiences until they are normalised and will continue to exist as a demonstration of a newly emerged shared culture. The only thing that needs to cease is third party involvement at some stage. All of this requires a long-term strategy with funding potentially lasting many years. The current system of funding favours two things that will likely prevent such a project being approved: firstly, funding is more likely to be given to shorter term projects, since funders want to see evidence that they are successful enough in order to fund additional projects. Secondly, funding applications generally require the applicant to specify precise outcomes at precise times in order to qualify for the funds. A successful project as envisioned here is an emergent process, not a specified outcome. If music and conflict transformation is to move away from the theoretically possible towards the practically achievable, then the way in which money is spent on them needs to be drastically redrawn. In the meantime, musicians will likely continue to attempt to use their art for peaceful purposes, which is not only at least somewhat positive, it helps to propagate the belief in the power of music, until which time the structures may change to allow music’s full potential to be realised.
8. Appendices

8.1 Appendix A – Pontanima Information Sheet and Consent Form (English)

Information SHEET/Consent Form FOR INTERVIEWS

Title of Research Project
An Examination of the Role of Music in Transforming Cultural Conflict

Details of Project
I am a PhD research student at Exeter University, Exeter, UK and I am currently researching the potential role of music in conflict transformation. The purpose of this project is to ascertain how music is currently being used by different community groups to aid in conflict transformation. This information is intended to be obtained through a series of observations, interactions and interviews with members of the Songlines Choir in London, UK and the Pontanima Choir in Sarajevo, Bosnia-Herzegovina. This information would then be analysed in an attempt to develop a theory of how music may be used in other conflict transformation situations. I have been involved with Songlines choir as a guest musician in the past and I therefore know a number of the members personally, but I do not believe that this creates any ethical issues or bias.

There are no third-party or commercial interests involved.

Contact Details
For further information about the research or your interview data, please contact:

Craig Robertson, Department of Sociology and Philosophy, Exeter University, Devon UK.

Tel 00 44 (0) 1392 263276, cr264@ex.ac.uk

If you have concerns/questions about the research you would like to discuss with someone else at the University, please contact my supervisor:

Tia De Nora, Professor of Sociology of Music and Director of Research, Sociology/Philosophy.

Tel 00 44 (0) 1392 263280, tdenora@exeter.ac.uk

Confidentiality
Interview recordings and transcripts will be held in confidence. They will not be used other than for the purposes described above and third parties will not be allowed access to them (except as may be required by the law). However, if you request it, you will be supplied with a copy of your interview transcript so that you can comment on and edit it as you see fit (please give your email below). Your data will be held in accordance with the Data Protection Act. Once the project is over and the final thesis published, the collected data will be stored digitally on a password protected hard drive and secured in a safe indefinitely.

You will be able to contact me whenever you wish beyond the completion date of the project should you wish to discuss anything further.

Anonymity

Interview data will be held and used on an anonymous basis, with no mention of your name, but we will refer to the group of which you are a member.

Consent

I voluntarily agree to participate and to the use of my data for the purposes specified above. I can withdraw consent at any time by contacting the interviewers.

TICK HERE: □ DATE.............................................

Note: Your contact details are kept separately from your interview data

Name of interviewee:..........................................................
Signature: ........................................................................................
Email/phone:.....................................................................................
Signature of researcher.................................................................

2 copies to be signed by both interviewee and researcher, one kept by each
8.2 Appendix B - Pontanima Information Sheet and Consent Form (Serbo-Croat)

PRILOG A

INFORMATIVNI ZAPIS / FORMULAR ZA DOZVOLU INTERVJUA

Ime istraživačkog projekta

Ispitivanje uloge muzike u preobražaju kulturološkog sukoba

Detalji projekta

Ja sam student istraživačkog doktorata (Phd) na Exeter univerzitetu u Exeter-u – UK i trenutno istražujem potencijalnu ulogu muzike u preobražaju sukoba. Cilj ovog projekta je da se ustanovi kako različite skupine u zajednici koriste muziku u doprinos preobražaju sukoba. Namjera je da se ove informacije steknu kroz niz osmatranja, uzajamnih utjecaja i intervjua sa članovima Songlines hvora u Londonu – UK i Pontanima hvora u Sarajevu – BiH. Ove informacije bi se onda analizirale u cilju razvoja teorije o načinu na koji bi se muzika mogla koristiti u drugim situacijama preobražaja sukoba. Ja sam u prošlosti bio upleten u Songlines hvor kao muzički gost, tako da lično poznajem izvjestan broj članova, ali ne vjerujem da ovo izaziva i kakav etički spor ili jednostranu naklonost.

Ne postoji ni kakvo treće lice, niti je komercijalni interes umiješan.

Kontakt podaci

Za sve dalje informacije o istraživačkom radu i o podacima vašeg intervjua, molim stupite u kontakt sa:

Craig Robertson, Department of Sociology and Philosophy, Exeter University, Devon UK.
Tel 00 44 (0) 1392 263276, cr264@ex.ac.uk

Ako imate problema / pitanja u vezi sa istraživačkim radom koja biste htjeli razmotriti s nekim drugim na univerzitetu, molim stupite u kontakt sa mojim nadležnim:

Tia De Nora, Professor of Sociology of Music and Director of Research, Sociology/Philosophy.
Tel 00 44 (0) 1392 263280, tdenora@exeter.ac.uk

Povjerljivost podataka
Snimci i prepisi intervjua će bit pouzdano sačuvani. Oni neće biti korišteni ni u kakve svrhe osim onih navedenih gore i trećim licima neće biti dozvoljen pristup (osim u zakonodavnim granicama). Ipak, ako vi zatražite kopiju prepisa vašeg intervjua, ista će vam se dostaviti da na nju možete komentirati i cenzurirati je kako vi želite (priložite vaš e-mail dole molim). Vaši podaci će biti sačuvani u skladu sa Zakonom o zaštiti podataka. Kad projekat bude gotov i zadnja teza izdata, sakupljeni podaci će biti digitalno složeni na hard-drive-u zaštićenom lozinkom i sigurnosno sačuvani u sefu na neograničeno vrijeme.

Vi ćete moći da stupite u kontakt sa mnom kad god želite mimo datuma završetka projekta, u koliko želite da raspravite bilo šta dalje.

Anonimnost

Podaci projekta će biti čuvani i korišteni na anonimnoj osnovi, bez spomena vašeg imena, ali ćemo se pozivati na skupinu kojoj pripadate.

Dozvola

Ja dobrovoljno pristajem da učestvujem i da se moji podaci koriste u ciljevima istaknutim gore. Ja mogu poništiti dozvolu u bilo koje vrijeme, tako što stupim u kontakt sa vođama intervjua.

OZNAČITE OVDJE: ☐ DATUM…………………………

Napomena: vaši kontakt podaci se drže odvojeno od vaših podataka intervjua.

Ime intervjuisanog:.................................................................

Potpis:..................................................................................

Email / telefon:.................................................................

Potpis istraživača:.............................................................

2 kopije da potpišu i intervjuisan i istraživač, za svakog po jedna
8.3 Appendix C: Songlines Information Sheet and Questionnaire

I am currently a PhD candidate at Exeter University and my research area is the potential role of music in conflict transformation. More specifically, I am investigating how the act of doing music can foster a sense new shared cultural identity and how this could be applied practically.

There are currently a number of music-based initiatives that attempt in some way to reduce and/or prevent cultural conflict around the world. I have already examined the effects of two such projects, The West-Eastern Divan Orchestra and Hip Hop, and have theoretically concluded that these projects have ultimately failed to reduce or prevent cultural conflict. Drawing on cultural theory, social geography, anthropology, musicology, music therapy, and conflict resolution studies as well as the rare writing on music and conflict, I have begun to develop a theory as to why these projects did not work as well as they were deemed to have done.

From this theoretical work I have developed a list of criteria that seem to be required in order for a music-based conflict transformation project to be successful. I have yet to come across any such project in existence in the world today. Pontanima, however, meets more of these preliminary criteria than any other project that I have come across. Songlines does not meet many of the criteria but there are two reasons I would like to research Songlines further:

1) The joint project will enable me to research both approaches to doing music in a community setting separately, together and examine the rate of influence or change between the choirs after the collaboration.

2) Even though Songlines is not ostensibly about conflict transformation, it is an all-inclusive community choir and it would be useful to research how the very different methods and approaches employed by Songlines affects any sense of cultural identity shared by the members.

Part of this research is conducted by being a part of it, which is why I asked Sarah to join one of the classes. Another very valuable part of the research is through a series of informal interviews. I would like to conduct a series of interviews with a dozen or so people from all aspects of the choir over the next two years to enable me to develop an idea of what people actually believe is happening socially, personally and
psychologically when they are participating in Songlines activities. Ideally, I would like to interview people that are as different from each other with as different experiences as possible. Some of these differences will need to be determined over time, but, as a starting point, I have included a short list of questions here that would really help me determine who to initially ask for interviews. I am interested in all responses, regardless of whether or not you are going to be involved in the Pontanima project. If you would rather not be involved in this project please just disregard this questionnaire. Any information that you provide is invaluable, however, even if you would rather not be interviewed.

Many thanks for your assistance.

Questions

1) Name________________________________________________________

2) Email or contact________________________________________________

3) Would you be interested in being interviewed?________________________

4) Gender_______________________________________________________

5) Age__________________________________________________________

6) Occupation____________________________________________________

7) Length of time in Songlines_______________________________________

8) Musical Experience_____________________________________________

9) Cultural Background (e.g.: English, Chinese, etc.)____________________

10) Are you going to be involved with the Pontanima project?______________
8.4 Appendix D: Proposal for consideration by HuSS Ethics Committee

Name: Craig Robertson

Department: Sociology

Student (delete as appropriate)

If Student, name of supervisor: Tia De Nora

Email: cr264@exeter.ac.uk

Project title: Examining the Role of Music in Post-Conflict Community Re-Building

Start & end date permission requested for: Start 02/09 End 09/10

Date submitted: 20/01/09

Note: When completing this form be mindful that the purpose of the document is to clearly explain the ethical considerations of the research being undertaken. As a generic form it has been constructed to cover a wide-range of different projects so some sections may not seem relevant to you. Please include the information which addresses any ethical considerations for your particular project which will be needed by the committee to approve your proposal.

SYNOPSIS OF THE RESEARCH PROJECT

There are currently a number of music-based initiatives that attempt in some way to reduce and/or prevent cultural conflict around the world. I have already examined the effects of two such projects, The West-Eastern Divan Orchestra and Hip Hop, and have theoretically concluded that these projects have ultimately failed to reduce or prevent cultural conflict. Drawing on cultural theory (Levy 2004), social geography (Forman 2004, Mitchell 1996), anthropology (Bowman 2001, Clastres 1994, Kloos 2001, Schmidt and Schroder 2001), musicology (Connell and Gibson 2003, Merriam 1964, Small 1998), music therapy (Forrest 2000), and conflict resolution studies (Bercovitch 1984, Burgess 2003, Fisher 2001, Paksoy 2001, Quigley 2002, Ting-Toomey 1999) as well as the rare writing on music and conflict (Skyllstad 2004), I have begun to
develop a theory as to why these projects did not work as well as they were
demed to have done. From the aforementioned sources, it appears that the
following criteria need to be met in order for a music project to have a chance of
successfully transforming a conflict or post-conflict situation:

1. Both sides of a conflict need to desire a transformation
2. A third party mediator is required to assist the process but not lead it
3. The process needs to take place at the community level, not from a
directive
4. The process needs to take place in a neutral environment
5. Music is a particularly effective means in which to conduct mediation
   since it contains within it the cultural values and power structure of the
   societies that created it.
6. New music would need to be created rather than listening or performing
   pre-existing music.
7. The third party would need to help the parties identify cultural and
   musical commonalities on which to build a hybrid form of music. This
   hybrid would need to contain cultural elements that both sides felt were
   equally important to them.
8. Both sides would need to collaborate equally
9. The form and style of music would need to contain desirable i.e.) equal
   power structures. Possibly improvisation or group composition
10. Once a new form of music had been developed to represent a new
    identity, it would need to be propagated amongst the represented
    communities through performances and education.
11. Passive listening is less powerful than active participation so education and encouragement of the communities to continue creating and performing the new music is critical for lasting effect.

Thus far, I have been researching secondary sources. I now wish to engage with primary research and data collection. I have identified a suitable site in the Pontanima Choir in Sarajevo, Bosnia-Herzegovina. Pontanima is an inter-religious choir formed in 1996 immediately following the Balkan conflict by Ivo Marković, a Franciscan priest. The name is derived from the Latin for bridge (pons) and soul (anima). The choir currently has 55 members from various backgrounds including Jewish, Christian Orthodox, Catholic, Islamic and Protestant. Pontanima performs songs from all of these religious traditions as well as newly composed material and they have a very high profile, having performed around the world for such events as UNESCO in Paris (2003) and the World Council of Churches Inter-religious Conference in Geneva (2005).

From their inception, the choir has had to confront resistance from their own community and even within the choir itself. After all, they were singing the songs of their enemies. Despite this they are now widely respected not only in Sarajevo and Bosnia-Herzegovina, but anywhere in the world where music groups have been attempting to transform conflicts.

Comparing Pontanima to my above checklist, it is apparent that they do not meet all of the criteria. They do, however, meet more of the criteria than any other music project involved with conflict transformation that I have discovered thus far.

In addition to Pontanima, I could also like to research a London community choir, Songlines. Songlines was formed in 1996 by Sarah Jewels, a renowned singer, workshop leader and education advisor on world music. The choir has around 100 members split into three smaller choirs that join together for occasional larger performances. The explicit remit of the choir is to use music to create new bonds within divided communities. The membership is open to anyone in the community, with the implicit remit of attempting to include people
from as many different backgrounds as possible. The choir performs mainly folk songs from around the world, but also performs original material. The choir is very different from Pontanima in terms of scope, ability, material and methods and meets even fewer of the above criteria but there are four valid reasons for choosing Songlines as a second site:

1) Members of Songlines and Pontanima will be collaborating on a music project from February 2009 until April 2010. This will consist of various meetings between the choir leaders, a week-long visit by Songlines to Sarajevo in September 2009 for joint rehearsals and concerts, and a reciprocal visit by Pontanima to London in April 2010.

2) I have worked with Songlines in the past as a guest musician and have discussed my plans with Sarah who is very keen to be involved.

3) One member of Songlines was an original member of Pontanima. He had been working for the British Council in Sarajevo throughout the Balkan conflict and afterwards and he is very knowledgeable about the conflict itself, the cultural issues post-conflict, and the musical traditions of the various cultural groups within Sarajevo. In addition he is a good friend of Ivo and has agreed to act as an initial point of contact with Pontanima.

4) Songlines and Pontanima could act as two widely diverse groups in order to discover grounded theory as to how community music groups use music in order to deal with conflict.

The following sections require an assessment of possible ethical consideration in your research project. If particular sections do not seem relevant to your project please indicate this and clarify why.

RESEARCH METHODS

I wish to engage with data collection though ethnographic interviews and acting as a participant-observer in order to discover new substantive theories of how community music groups utilise music for the purposes of transforming conflict.
Finally, these new theories would be compared to my initial research in order to develop a formal theory of how music participation can affect cultures in conflict.

The rationale for using these methods is that there is no current theory of how music affects cultures in conflict except the one that I have already begun developing which is not based on any primary data. It seems prudent, therefore, to engage with grounded theory discovery. The data collection for this grounded theory is proposed to include participant-observation since I have access to the two choirs mainly due to my personal contacts and as a musician. It is therefore possible for me to gain insight into the groups by acting as a participant as well as observing. In addition my musical skills will enable me to analyse situations musically as well as purely socially. For example, if one sub-group within Songlines felt a particular way during a section of one of the songs, I could annotate my observations with actual musical information, including pitch, rhythm, texture, contour, and so on. This would provide useful when comparing the two groups in order to develop a more formal theory.

The purpose of the ethnographic interview is two-fold: 1) to provide another ‘slice of data’ for grounded theory comparisons and 2) to enable me to overcome the practical problems of researching Pontanima without necessarily needing to be in Sarajevo for great lengths of time. Practical issues, including family commitments, prevent me from staying in Sarajevo for very long. This, of course, would mean that a number of interviews would need to take place either by phone, email or possibly webcam.

Although I cannot spend a protracted time in Sarajevo although I am able to spend a lot of time with Songlines, as I live in London. I propose the following research schedule:

Feb 09 – Join Songlines choir and begin participant-observation and ethnographic interviews.

- Have initial discussion with Pontanima
Jun 09 – Week-long visit to Sarajevo for participant-observation and ethnographic interviews with Pontanima. Follow this with continued interviews at a distance.

Sep 09 – Week-long visit to Sarajevo with Songlines to observe how the two choirs interact.

Jan 10 – Week-long visit to Sarajevo to observe any changes to the choir after the collaboration.

Apr 10 – Observe Pontanima’s visit to London.

Sep 10 – Final week-long visit to Sarajevo to tie up any loose ends.

Oct 10 – Analyse data and writing thesis.


Note that ethnographic interviewing would continue throughout this process.

THE VOLUNTARY NATURE OF PARTICIPATION

Note: You should include a brief outline on how participants will be recruited and whether written consent is obtained. If written consent is not obtained, this should be justified. The submission should include the consent form.

As I have already mentioned, I have already worked with Songlines and I know the leader as well as many of the choristers and those that I know have expressed an interest in my project and will likely agree to being observed and interviewed as long as I make it as least disruptive as possible. The others that I do not know as well I can ask directly once I join the choir.

As for Pontanima, I have two points of contact through Sarah from Songlines who has been organising the collaboration and has arranged a meeting between myself and their musical director in February to discuss how I might be able to progress with the rest of the choir. My second point of contact is through the Songlines member already mentioned who is a good friend of the director of Pontanima. Through these two contacts and the upcoming meeting, I feel
confident that I will be able to approach other members of this choir for observation and interviews.

Regarding language issue, most members of Pontanima speak English relatively well. I am unsure about their level of written English so consent may have to be verbal rather than written. If this is the case, then an audio recording would be made of me explaining the consent form and then asking if they agree to it. A copy of this audio would be made available to them. If their written English is good enough for them to read the consent form, they would be able to sign that and get a copy. See Appendix A for the consent form. I will have a copy of the information/consent sheet translated into Bosnian available for any Pontanima participants that wished to have a written consent form in Bosnian. This consent form would also be given to all Songlines participants.

Before any observations or interviews would occur, the participants would either be given a written explanation (see Appendix A) or this would be read out by myself either before an interview with a participant without a good enough level of written English, or in front of the whole choir prior to observing. All participants will be informed from the start that they may stop their involvement at any time with no negative consequences. This procedure would apply to Songlines in the same manner.

Observations for both choirs would take place during their rehearsals and performances. As the research progresses, it may come to light that some observations of the choristers in other settings would be appropriate, such as social gatherings after rehearsals.

THE INFORMED NATURE OF PARTICIPATION

Note: Give a description of how participants will be informed of the nature of the project and whether they will be given an information sheet. If no information sheet is given, it should be justified. The submission should include the information sheet.

All participants will either be given an information sheet (See Appendix A) or have the information sheet read to them. This sheet will contain information about the project and contact details for myself and my supervisor.
ASSESSMENT OF POSSIBLE HARM

Note: Assessment of any possible harm that research may cause participants (e.g. psychological distress or repercussions of legal, political and economic nature). Any information sheet should clearly state any possible disadvantages participating in the study may have. You should also consider your own safety.

I do not foresee any possible harm to either the Songlines participants or myself. I will, however, check the advice from the Foreign Office before and travel to Bosnia. There is a psychological risk of provoking distress of reliving an earlier trauma to Pontanima participants as they have all lived through a war and members were from opposing sides. I plan to reduce this risk by focussing on the music rather than their trauma.

DATA PROTECTION AND STORAGE

Note: You should include i) an account of how the anonymity of the participants will be protected ii) how the security of the data will be guaranteed iii) if and how the material will be anonymised iv) what will happen to the material at the end of the project (if retained advise where and how long for).

Participants identities will be kept anonymous by assigning pseudonyms. An Excel file will be kept to keep track of how the pseudonyms correlate to the real names. All interviews will be recorded on digital audio. Copies of these digital files and their transcriptions will be stored on a password protected hard drive which itself will be stored indefinitely in a secure, fireproof safe in a self-store. Field notes will be digitised and stored on the hard-drive as well. Physical field notes will be destroyed once the final dissertation has been approved.

DECLARATION OF INTERESTS

Note: You should include i) an indication of how the participants are informed of any commercial or other interests involved in the project ii) who funds the research iii) how and for what purposes the results will be used iv) how and where the results will be published.

I do have knowledge of and experience with Songlines, which may bias my position somewhat. This will be included in the information sheet (Appendix A).

USER ENGAGEMENT AND FEEDBACK
I plan to have regular informal discussions with the participants regarding my research. I feel that this will enable a greater rapport with the participants which in turn could lead to deeper insights during observations and interviews. Any interim reports that I write, for example to my supervisor, I will make available to the participants to read if they so wish. If any participants who cannot read English wish to know the content of these reports, I will make an audio recording of me reading it aloud and send it to them. The final thesis will also be made available to all the participants in this manner. If requested, I may investigate hiring a translator to translate the final thesis into Bosnian. I will also be available for contact and discussion with any of the participants beyond the completion of the project.

**ETHICAL REQUIREMENTS OF COUNTRY IN WHICH RESEARCH IS TO BE CONDUCTED (if not UK)**

I will be following the BSA ethics guidelines in the absence of explicit ethics guidelines from Bosnia-Herzegovina.
### 8.5 Appendix E: Alliance Changes in Bosnian Region

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table</th>
<th>Alliance Changes in Bosnian Region</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>700BC</td>
<td>Macedonian Perdiccas I joined Argead tribes together and settled kingdom in Lower Macedonia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>492BC</td>
<td>Macedonia manages to remain friendly with both Greek cities and Persia.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>480BC</td>
<td>Macedonia allies with Athens against the Persians.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>454BC</td>
<td>Macedonia continually switches allegiances from Athens, Thrace, Sparta then Athens again</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>432BC</td>
<td>After threats from Athens Macedonia allies with Sparta and Corinth</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>418BC</td>
<td>Macedonia allies with Sparta and Argos against Athens</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>414BC</td>
<td>Macedonia splits with Sparta and Argos and allies with Athens</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>390BC</td>
<td>Macedonia allies with Sparta</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>179BC</td>
<td>Macedonia allies with Illyria and Odrisia against Rome</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>499</td>
<td>Bulgars and Huns allied</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>527</td>
<td>Avars and Bulgars against Byzantine</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>early 600s</td>
<td>Slavs join Avars and Bulgars against Byzantine</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>620</td>
<td>Slavic Croats and Serbs allied with Byzantine against Avars</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>626</td>
<td>Avars, Slavs (not Croats and Serbs), Bulgars and Persia allied against Byzantine</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>814</td>
<td>Bulgaria and Macedonia allied against Byzantine</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>927</td>
<td>Bulgaria and Byzantine allied through marriage</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1180</td>
<td>Bosnia allies with Hungarian Croatia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1180</td>
<td>Hungary and Zeta allied</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1189</td>
<td>Crusaders join Serbia and Bulgaria against Byzantine</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1204</td>
<td>Bulgaria joins Tartars against Crusaders</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1234-1239</td>
<td>Bulgaria keeps changing allegiances between Byzantinians and Crusaders</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1261</td>
<td>Hungary joins Byzantine against Serbia and Bulgaria</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1321</td>
<td>Byzantine joins Bulgaria against Serbia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1331</td>
<td>Tartar controlled Bulgaria join Serbia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1334</td>
<td>Bosnia joins Ragusa</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1335</td>
<td>Bosnia joins Venice and Hungary against Croatia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1355</td>
<td>Bosnia joins Serbian Lazar Hrebljanovic</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1365</td>
<td>Hungary joins Byzantine against Bulgaria and Ottomans</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Year</td>
<td>Event</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------</td>
<td>-------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1402</td>
<td>Serbians forced to fight with Ottomans against Tartars</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1420</td>
<td>Bosnia joins Hungary against Ottomans</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1444</td>
<td>Serbia joins Hungary against Ottomans</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1466</td>
<td>Herzegovina joins Ragusa and Venice</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1714-1718</td>
<td>Venice joins Austrian Hungary against Ottomans</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1788</td>
<td>Austria joins Russia and Serbia against Ottomans</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1804</td>
<td>Serbia joins Russia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1808</td>
<td>Napoleon joins Ottomans against Serbia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1831</td>
<td>Bosnia joins Herzegovina in revolting against Ottomans</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1842</td>
<td>pan-Slav Illyrian Party in Croatia gains control of Zagreb</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1844</td>
<td>Serbian ministers begin speculating about a Greater Serbia across the Balkans</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1848</td>
<td>Croatia joins Serbia in pan-Slav revolt against Hungary</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1849</td>
<td>Some Serbians begin to publish claims that Bosnians and Dalmatians are actually Serbians</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1860s</td>
<td>Bosnian Orthodox priests begin to encourage their parishes to identify themselves as Serbs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1860s</td>
<td>Montenegro assists Herzegovina revolt against Ottomans.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1870s</td>
<td>Bulgaria, Greece and Serbia begin propaganda campaigns in Macedonia claiming it for themselves</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1875</td>
<td>Bulgaria assists Herzegovina revolt against Ottomans</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1876</td>
<td>Serbia joins Montenegro against Ottomans with the former expressing ideas of annexing Bosnia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1877</td>
<td>Russia, Romania and Bulgaria join Montenegro against Ottomans</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1881</td>
<td>Austria joins Russia and Germany in Emperors’ League</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1906</td>
<td>Croatians Croats and Serbs form political alliance that gains power in Croatia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1909</td>
<td>Bosniaks and Bosnian Serbs join with a view to call for an independent Bosnia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1910</td>
<td>Croatia joins Serbia in developing an idea for a South-Slav state</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1912</td>
<td>Bulgaria, Serbia, Greece and Montenegro form Balkan League against Ottomans, with Macedonia being considered part of Bulgaria</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1914</td>
<td>World War I triggers alliances between Austria-Hungary, Germany and Bulgaria on one side and western powers and Serbia on the other</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1935</td>
<td>Serbs, Slovenes and Bosnians form comprise coalition government after king's assassination</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1941</td>
<td>Cetnicks join Partisans against Ustasa and Axis</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1943</td>
<td>Muslims begin joining anyone except Cetnicks, including the Germans</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1943</td>
<td>Allies join Partisans against Axis and Cetnicks</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Year</td>
<td>Event</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------</td>
<td>-------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1953</td>
<td>Yugoslavia allies with Greece and Turkey</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1957</td>
<td>Yugoslavia allies with the Non-Aligned Movement</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1991</td>
<td>EEC and US declares support for a unified Yugoslavia, which meant supporting Milosevic until war broke out then the UN imposed an arms embargo which only strengthened Milosevic's position. By the end of the year the EU recognised Croatia and Slovenia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1992</td>
<td>Bulgaria recognises Macedonia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1992</td>
<td>EU recognises Bosnia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1992</td>
<td>Republika Srpska joins Federal State of Yugoslavia against Bosnia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1993</td>
<td>UN, UK, France, Germany and Japan recognise Macedonia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1994</td>
<td>Bosnian Croats join Bosniaks against Serbs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1995</td>
<td>NATO joins Bosnian Croats and Bosniaks against Bosnian Serbs until Dayton Accord</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1996</td>
<td>Rest of world recognises independent Balkan states</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1999</td>
<td>NATO joins Kosovo against Yugoslavia</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### 8.6 Appendix F: Border Changes in Bosnian Region

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Event</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>546BC</td>
<td>Persia takes Lydia, E Asia Minor and Macedonia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>512BC</td>
<td>Persia conquers Thrace</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>479BC</td>
<td>Thrace and Macedonia gain independence from Persia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>440BC</td>
<td>Athens begins to expand into Macedonia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>424BC</td>
<td>Some Macedonian towns begin to join Athenian League</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>410BC</td>
<td>Athens and Macedonia conquer Pydna</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>370BC</td>
<td>Thebes conquers Thessaly from Macedonia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>359BC</td>
<td>Both Athens and Macedonia lose and gain territory</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>350BC</td>
<td>Macedonia pushes Illyria out of Macedonia and conquers Thrace</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>357BC</td>
<td>Macedonia gains control of Molossia through marriage and Athenian Amphipolis by force while Thrace splits into civil war</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>356BC</td>
<td>Macedonia takes Upper Macedonia from Illyria</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>355BC</td>
<td>Macedonia takes Methone from Athens</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>346BC</td>
<td>Macedonia pushes Illyrians to Adriatic coast</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>338BC</td>
<td>Macedonia has taken Thessaly, Chalcidice and Greek peninsula from Athens</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>336BC</td>
<td>Alexander the Great unites all areas within Macedonia and Thrace</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>335BC</td>
<td>Macedonia takes Illyria</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>331BC</td>
<td>Macedonia takes Persia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>323BC</td>
<td>Macedonia controlled from the Balkans to India, the Black Sea to Egypt and Libya, but now split after Alexander the Great's death into Persia, Egypt and Macedonia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>230BC</td>
<td>Rome takes Dalmatia (Croatian coast) from Illyrians</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>215BC</td>
<td>Macedonia takes some Adriatic areas from Roman Illyria and Greece</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>200BC</td>
<td>Rome starts expanding into Croatia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>197BC</td>
<td>Greeks gain independence from Macedonia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>168BC</td>
<td>Rome takes Macedonia and splits it into four provinces</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>99BC</td>
<td>Rome changes Macedonian borders to include up to the Danube and all of...</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Year</td>
<td>Event</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------</td>
<td>-------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>27BC</td>
<td>Rome changes Macedonian borders again</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Rome begins to expand into Thrace</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>Rome takes rest of Illyria</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>46</td>
<td>Rome takes Thrace, Dalmatia and Pannonia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>269</td>
<td>Goths advance to Macedonia but Rome forces them back but concedes and gives them Dacia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>284</td>
<td>Roman Empire restructuring moves Pannonia and Dalmatia as part of Italy, Thrace part of Orient, and the rest of the Balkans part of Illyria. Since Dacia was given to the Goths, part of Moesia was renamed Dacia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>285</td>
<td>Rome incorporates Macedonia into Moesia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>305</td>
<td>Rome incorporates Macedonia into Illyria</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>325</td>
<td>Constantine splits empire into Roman and Byzantine</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>395</td>
<td>Goths overrun Balkans and Italy except half of Macedonia that is taken by Byzantine</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>535</td>
<td>Rome takes control of Balkans</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>early 600s</td>
<td>White Croatia emerges in Southern Poland and White Serbia in Czech</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>628</td>
<td>Byzantine expands into Balkans</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>early 800s</td>
<td>Franks take northern Croatia and northern and north-western Bosnia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>812</td>
<td>Byzantine maintained Dalmatia and Franks maintained mountains and Pannonia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>mid 800s</td>
<td>Serbs form principedom in Hum and Duklje</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>852</td>
<td>Bulgaria takes Macedonia from Byzantine</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>877</td>
<td>Byzantine takes Croatia from Franks</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>890</td>
<td>Independent Serb province Daska formed in Byzantine</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>924</td>
<td>Bulgaria takes Raska from Byzantine Serbs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>924</td>
<td>Kingdom of Croatia established, seceding from Byzantine</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>930s</td>
<td>Serbs take Raska from Bulgaria, Zeta, Trebinje, Necretva from Croatia and</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
they already had Hum

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Event</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>958</td>
<td>First mention of Bosnia as a Serb-controlled Byzantine province</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>960s</td>
<td>Croatia retakes Bosnian lands from Serbs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>969</td>
<td>Macedonia gains independence from Bulgaria</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>986</td>
<td>Bulgaria takes South Serbia, Montenegro and Herzegovina</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>996</td>
<td>Macedonia takes Dalmatia from Byzantine and Raska from Serbs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>999</td>
<td>Byzantine takes Thessaly and parts of Macedonia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1001</td>
<td>Byzantine takes Bulgaria</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1014</td>
<td>Byzantine takes rest of Macedonia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1040</td>
<td>Serbs take Nis and Skopje, Durres, Epirus, Thessaly and Sofia from Byzantine</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1054</td>
<td>Bosnia moves from Byzantine to Roman jurisdiction</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1077</td>
<td>Serbian kingdom established including Duklje, Hum, Raska</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1080s</td>
<td>Serbia takes rest of Bosnia from Rome</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1100s</td>
<td>Bosnian diocese moves from Croatian Split to independent Ragusa</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1101</td>
<td>Bosnia leaves Serbia but is in disarray</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Serbia centres its kingdom on Raska while the Albanians already living there</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1101</td>
<td>label this annexation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1102</td>
<td>Hungary takes Croatia and claims Bosnia although no real control there</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1167</td>
<td>Byzantine takes Croatia and Bosnia from Hungary</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1168</td>
<td>Byzantine takes Dalmatia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1180</td>
<td>Croatia goes back to Hungary. Bosnian Kingdom gains independence for first time. Macedonia gains independence.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1180</td>
<td>Serbia annexes Dalmatia, Herzegovina and half of Bosnia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1185</td>
<td>Crusaders take Macedonia from Byzantine</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1202</td>
<td>Crusaders take Croatian Zadar for Venice</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1204</td>
<td>Crusaders abolish Byzantine Empire and split it into feudal states: Constantinople, Salonika, Nicaea, Epirus, Serbia and Bulgaria</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1223</td>
<td>Bulgaria annexes Thrace, Macedonia, Thessaly and Epirus from Constantinople</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1238</td>
<td>Hungary takes south-central Bosnia and Vrhbosa</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1241</td>
<td>Bosnia regains some territory from Hungary as Hungary deals with invading</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Year</td>
<td>Event</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------</td>
<td>-------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1246</td>
<td>Mongols: Nicea takes Salonika and Macedonia from Bulgaria</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1252</td>
<td>Mongols: Bosnia comes under Hungarian bishopric</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1253</td>
<td>Mongolia: Hungary takes parts of northern Bosnia and northern Serbia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1261</td>
<td>Mongols: Nicea takes Constantinople from Crusaders and re-establishes Byzantine.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1299</td>
<td>Mongols: Serbia takes Macedonia from Byzantine</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1300s</td>
<td>Mongols: Austrian Habsburgs take most of Slovenia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1322</td>
<td>Mongols: Bosnia takes parts of Croatia and Dalmatia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1326</td>
<td>Mongols: Bosnia takes Hum from Serbia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1334</td>
<td>Mongols: Serbia takes territories from Byzantine</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1345</td>
<td>Mongols: Serbian Empire established at Pec</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1346</td>
<td>Mongols: Serbian Patriarchate established at Pec</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1348</td>
<td>Mongols: Serbian Empire reaches from Danube to Corinth, from Adriatic to Aegean</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1353</td>
<td>Mongols: Bosnia takes rest of Dalmatia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1361</td>
<td>Mongols: Ottomans take Adrianople from Byzantine and Serbia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1369</td>
<td>Mongols: Bosnia gains independence from Hungary</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1371</td>
<td>Mongols: Ottomans take Bulgaria, Byzantine and most of Macedonia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1374</td>
<td>Mongols: Austria takes Istria</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1377</td>
<td>Mongols: Serbia re-established and they grant to Bosnia land in Hum, Zaet and Dalmatia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1382</td>
<td>Mongols: Bosnia takes most of Dalmatia and some of Croatia and Slavonia from Croatia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1385</td>
<td>Mongols: Ottomans take most of Serbia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1389</td>
<td>Mongols: Ottomans completely destroy Serbia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1400</td>
<td>Mongols: Ottomans take rest of Macedonia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1400s</td>
<td>Mongols: Ottoman Balkans renamed Rumelia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1403</td>
<td>Mongols: Hungary gives northern Serbia and Belgrade to re-establish Serbia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1404</td>
<td>Mongols: Ottomans take Bosnia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1421</td>
<td>Mongols: Serbia regains most of original land</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1427</td>
<td>Mongols: Ottomans and Hungary take parts of Serbia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1435</td>
<td>Mongols: Ottomans take Vrhbosa from Hungary</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1441</td>
<td>Mongols: Ottomans take most of Serbia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Year</td>
<td>Event</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------</td>
<td>-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1444</td>
<td>Serbia retakes most of its land but remains a tributary to Ottomans</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1448</td>
<td>Ottomans rename Vrhbosa Sarajevo</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1453</td>
<td>Ottomans take Constantinople renaming it Istanbul</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1459</td>
<td>Ottomans take rest of Serbia and Serbian church moved to Greece</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1463</td>
<td>Hungary takes some of Bosnia from Ottomans and Ottomans take Herzegovina</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1472</td>
<td>Russia now considered head of all Orthodox churches</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1481</td>
<td>All Balkans except Croatia and Slovenia under Ottomans</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1526</td>
<td>Austria takes Hungary, including Croatia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1537</td>
<td>Serbs given Hungarian borders to patrol under their own name</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1557</td>
<td>Serbian church gains independence from Greece</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1578</td>
<td>Austria establishes frontier along Croatia-Slavonia-Vojna-Krajina</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1580</td>
<td>Ottomans split Rumelia into Rumelia, Bosnia and Buda</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1592</td>
<td>Ottomans take Bihac from Austria</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1596</td>
<td>Ottomans take north Hungary from Austria</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1459</td>
<td>Serbia retakes most of its land but remains a tributary to Ottomans</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1481</td>
<td>Ottomans rename Vrhbosa Sarajevo</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1526</td>
<td>Ottomans take Constantinople renaming it Istanbul</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1537</td>
<td>Ottomans take rest of Serbia and Serbian church moved to Greece</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1557</td>
<td>Hungary takes some of Bosnia from Ottomans and Ottomans take Herzegovina</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1578</td>
<td>Russia now considered head of all Orthodox churches</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1481</td>
<td>All Balkans except Croatia and Slovenia under Ottomans</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1526</td>
<td>Austria takes Hungary, including Croatia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1537</td>
<td>Serbs given Hungarian borders to patrol under their own name</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1557</td>
<td>Serbian church gains independence from Greece</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1578</td>
<td>Austria establishes frontier along Croatia-Slavonia-Vojna-Krajina</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1580</td>
<td>Ottomans split Rumelia into Rumelia, Bosnia and Buda</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1592</td>
<td>Ottomans take Bihac from Austria</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1596</td>
<td>Ottomans take north Hungary from Austria</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1680s</td>
<td>Austria takes land in Dalmatia, Croatia, Slavonia and Hungary from Ottomans</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1687</td>
<td>Venice takes Lika in Croatia, forcing Muslims to convert to Catholicism or flee to Bosnia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1689</td>
<td>Austria takes Belgrade, parts of Macedonia and Kosovo from Ottomans</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1690</td>
<td>Ottomans take Kosovo and Macedonia from Austria while Austria takes Vojvodina from Ottomans</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1697</td>
<td>Austria takes some of southern Hungary and razes Sarajevo</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1699</td>
<td>Austria controls Hungary, Slavonia, Croatia; Venice controls Dalmatia and Greece</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1718</td>
<td>Venice controls some of south western Bosnia, Austria controls parts of Serbia and Bosnia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1719</td>
<td>Austria helps Croatian Rijeka become independent of Venice</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1736</td>
<td>Ottomans take Banja Luka from Austria.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1739</td>
<td>Ottomans take Serbia from Austria</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1745</td>
<td>Croatia absorbs Austrian frontiers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1767</td>
<td>Greek church controls all Ottoman Orthodoxy via Istanbul</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Year</td>
<td>Event</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------</td>
<td>-------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1790</td>
<td>Croatia hands control over to Hungary in order to avoid direct Austrian control</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1805</td>
<td>Napoleon takes Venetia, Istria and Dalmatia and Ragusa</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1809</td>
<td>France controls most of Slovenia and half of Croatia and renames them the Illyrian Provinces</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1813</td>
<td>Napoleon retreats and control of the area reverts to Austria via Hungary</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1815</td>
<td>Ottomans give north central Serbia to Serbs including Belgrade</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1826</td>
<td>Serbia becomes sovereign tributary state of Ottomans</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1831</td>
<td>Serbian church gains independence from Russia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1851</td>
<td>Herzegovina becomes absorbed by Bosnia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1857</td>
<td>Montenegro gains independence from Ottomans</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1864</td>
<td>Ottomans redefine all Balkan borders</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1867</td>
<td>Austria and Hungary join empires, Slovenes under Austrian control as a result.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1868</td>
<td>Croatia gains some independence under Hungarian governorship</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1878</td>
<td>Serbia fully independent and slightly larger</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1878</td>
<td>Austria-Hungary occupies Bosnia, Ottomans gain Macedonia, Kosovo split between Serbia and Montenegro</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1881</td>
<td>Frontier-lands abolished</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1907</td>
<td>Macedonia partitioned between Bulgaria, Serbia and Greece</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1908</td>
<td>Austria-Hungary annexes Bosnia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1912</td>
<td>Serbia and Montenegro take Novi Pazar and Kosovo from Ottomans</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1913</td>
<td>Montenegro becomes part of Serbia and part of Macedonia becomes an autonomous region in Serbia. Bulgaria and Greece absorb their parts of Macedonia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1915</td>
<td>Austria-Hungary, Germany and Bulgaria take Serbia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1918</td>
<td>Region consolidated as Kingdom of Serbs, Croats and Slovenes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1929</td>
<td>Kingdom of Serbs, Croats and Slovenes changed to Kingdom of Yugoslavia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1939</td>
<td>Bosnia was split amongst Yugoslavian banates of Croatia, Vrbaska and Drinska</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1941</td>
<td>Germany takes Yugoslavia. Independent State of Croatia under Ustasa formed controlled by Germany and Italy includes Bosnia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1941</td>
<td>Cetniks and Partisans take parts of Bosnia, Montenegro and western Serbia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Year</td>
<td>Event</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------</td>
<td>-------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1942</td>
<td>Partisans take large area around Bihac from Ustasa from Germany and Ustasa</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1943</td>
<td>Partisans gain territory as Italy leaves Yugoslavia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1944</td>
<td>Germany leave Yugoslavia, Russia and UK take control, splitting Macedonia again</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1945</td>
<td>Macedonia considered an ethnicity in Bulgaria, not considered at all in Greece, and granted republic status in Yugoslavia. Other republics were Slovenia, Croatia, Bosnia, Serbia, Montenegro with two autonomous regions of Vojvodina and Kosovo.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1945</td>
<td>Yugoslavia joins Soviet Union</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1948</td>
<td>Yugoslavia kicked out of Soviet Union</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1953</td>
<td>Croatia and Serbia wanted to partition Bosnia but Tito refused since Bosnia was so mixed</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1974</td>
<td>Kosovo becomes autonomous province of Serbia and nationalism strengthened amongst republics</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1980</td>
<td>Tito dies and nine member presidency established, one for every republic and one for the communist party</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1987</td>
<td>Milosevic takes control of Kosovo presidency</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1988</td>
<td>Communist party presidency abolished, meaning eight members, with Milosevic controlling three after he takes control of Vojvodina</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1989</td>
<td>Milosevic takes control of Montenegro presidency, giving him 4/8 control</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1990</td>
<td>Yugoslav Communist Party dissolved; Kosovo and Vojvodina absorbed by Serbia but retains their presidencies</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1991</td>
<td>Krajina (Serb) declares independence from Croatia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1991</td>
<td>Bosnian SDS declares three Croatian autonomous zones in Bosnia and Serbs do the same</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1991</td>
<td>Croatia, Slovenia and Macedonia declare independence from Yugoslavia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1992</td>
<td>UN takes control of parts of Croatia from Serbia and those Serbs move into Bosnia taking control there. Republika Srpska declared independent from Bosnia. Bosnia declares itself independent from Yugoslavia.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1992</td>
<td>Yugoslavia reformed to include only Serbia and Montenegro and renamed</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Federal State of Yugoslavia

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Event</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1992</td>
<td>Herzegovina declared an independent Croatian zone</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1995</td>
<td>Dayton Accord splits Bosnian into Croat-Muslim Federation and a Serbian Republika Srpska with a rotating three member presidency</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2003</td>
<td>Yugoslavia renamed Serbia and Montenegro</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2006</td>
<td>Montenegro and Serbia become independent from each other</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## 8.7 Appendix G: Mass Population Changes in Bosnian Region

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table 12</th>
<th>Mass Population Changes in Bosnian Region</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Unknown</td>
<td>First settlers were Illyrian herders</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>770BC</td>
<td>Greeks arrive on the Adriatic coast to settle</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>346BC</td>
<td>Illyrians forced to move to Dalmatia (Croatia)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>300BC</td>
<td>Greeks and Celts start settling in modern Croatia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>200BC</td>
<td>Celts forced to leave Croatia by Rome</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>200BC</td>
<td>Iranian nomadic tribes, ancestors of Slavs, begin to arrive in Bosnia as did Illyrian-Celt Scordiscis and Illyrian Daesitates</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>150BC</td>
<td>Retired Roman officers begin to retire and settle in Balkans</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>200</td>
<td>Goths begin settling in region</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>300</td>
<td>Mongol-Turk Huns and Iranian Alans begin to settle</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>353</td>
<td>Huns begin to leave region after Attila dies</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>518</td>
<td>Turkic Avars and Slavs begin to settle</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>535</td>
<td>Goths forced to leave Balkans</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>late 500s</td>
<td>Slavs start settling in Greece</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>600</td>
<td>Slavs start settling in Macedonia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>early 600s</td>
<td>Croats arrive at the Dinaric mountains, Bosnia and Dalmatia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>early 600s</td>
<td>Bulgars begin to settle</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>early 600s</td>
<td>Slovenes established in Austria</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>610</td>
<td>Slavs completely colonised Macedonia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>620</td>
<td>Slavs well established in modern Bulgaria, Serbia and Bosnia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>679</td>
<td>Bulgars consolidate and settle in Moesia/Bulgaria and fuse with the more numerous Slavs to the point where almost no trace of original Bulgar culture is noticeable</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>799</td>
<td>Avars forced to leave region by Franks</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>835</td>
<td>Indian Gypsies arrive</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>877</td>
<td>Franks leaves region</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Year</td>
<td>Event</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-------</td>
<td>----------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>893</td>
<td>Avars and Bulgars forced to leave Pannonia by Magyars</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1081</td>
<td>Normans arrive</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1100s</td>
<td>Vlachs arrive in Dalmatia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1220</td>
<td>Dominicans and Franciscans begin to arrive in Croatia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1238</td>
<td>Dominicans arrive in Bosnia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1299</td>
<td>Saxon miners arrive in Bosnia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1300s</td>
<td>Hungary banishes Jews and Muslims who arrive in Bosnia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1340s</td>
<td>Franciscans arrive in Bosnia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1389</td>
<td>Serbian mass exodus north out of old Serbia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1400s</td>
<td>Slavs leave Greece</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1400s</td>
<td>Vlachs settle on Adriatic islands</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1460s</td>
<td>Vlachs settle in eastern Herzegovina as population devastated by war</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1466</td>
<td>Last of the Bosnian church immigrates to Venice</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1470s</td>
<td>Ottomans encouraged Orthodox Vlachs to settle throughout Herzegovina, central and northern Bosnia to repopulate region</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1492</td>
<td>Spanish Sephardic Jews arrive en masse in Balkans</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1494</td>
<td>Ottomans began to free Slav slaves if they converted to Islam who then mostly settled in Bosnia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1499</td>
<td>Ottomans take most of Montenegro</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>early 1500s</td>
<td>Catholics flee Bosnia and replaced by Orthodox Vlachs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>early 1500s</td>
<td>German protestants arrive in Slovenia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1526</td>
<td>Ottomans free thousands of Hungarian slaves when they converted to Islam</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1590</td>
<td>German protestants leave Slovenia after religious persecution</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1599</td>
<td>Austria encourages Serbs to immigrate to devastated Slavonia and Croatia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1655</td>
<td>Catholics flee Bosnia due to Ottoman-Venetian war</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1680s</td>
<td>Muslims flee Croatia, Slavonia, Dalmatia, Hungary into Bosnia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1690</td>
<td>Thousands of Serbs flee Kosovo to Vojvodina replaced by Albanians</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1697</td>
<td>Thousands of Catholics flee Sarajevo, making Orthodox more populous for first time</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Year</td>
<td>Event</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------</td>
<td>-------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1800s</td>
<td>Gypsies begin to settle around Sarajevo, Banja Luka, Travnik, Visoko, with some immigrating to western Europe and America.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1800s</td>
<td>Vlachs begin to disappear from Adriatic</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1888</td>
<td>Austrians and Hungarians given tax breaks to encourage immigration to Bosnia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1910</td>
<td>Bosnian parliament stops foreigner benefits after a tenfold increase in Austrians and five-fold increase in Hungarians since 1880</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1912</td>
<td>After years of Albanian protests and Serbian exodus, Kosovo is now 90% Albanian</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1913</td>
<td>Greece and Bulgaria exchange Macedonian minorities</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1925</td>
<td>In Greek Macedonia, 600000 Macedonians and been forced to leave and 200000 Greeks had immigrated in</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1930s</td>
<td>Many of the remaining Greek Macedonians immigrate to North America while Bulgarian Macedonians have largely been assimilated</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1941</td>
<td>Serbia had forced 300000 Albanians out of Kosovo and imported 14000 Serbs. Meanwhile, Italy took parts of Macedonia and Montenegro, forming Greater Albania, which forced thousands of Albanians back into Kosovo.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1941</td>
<td>Mass internment of Balkan Jews begins while mass arrests and killing of Serbs in Bosnia begins</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1946</td>
<td>Up to 250000 dissidents killed by Tito</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1965</td>
<td>Many Serbs leave Bosnia for Serbia leaving Muslim majority</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1968</td>
<td>More Serb exodus from Bosnia and Kosovo due to discrimination</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1995</td>
<td>Many Serbs flee Krajina into Bosnia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1998</td>
<td>Yugoslavia begins ethnic cleansing Albanians from Kosovo</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1999</td>
<td>350000 Kosovo refugees flee to Macedonia</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
9. Bibliography


Beaudry, Nicole, 1997. The Challenges of Human Relations in Ethnographic Enquiry: Examples From Arctic and Subarctic Fieldwork. James Clifford and George E. Marcus (Eds.) Writing Culture: The Poetics and Politics of


O'Reilly, Michelle and Nicola Parker, 2013. 'Unsatisfactory Saturation': a critical exploration of the notion of saturated sample sizes in qualitative research. *Qualitative Research*, 13 (2). Pp.190-197.


http://musicandartsinaction.net/index.php/maia/article/view/nationalidentity/40
[Accessed 04 April 2013].


