Weathering pathways and limitations in biogeochemical models: Application to Earth system evolution

Benjamin J. W. Mills

September 2012

A thesis submitted to the School of Environmental Sciences of the University of East Anglia in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy

© This copy of the thesis has been supplied on condition that anyone who consults it is understood to recognise that its copyright rests with the author and that use of any information derived there from must be in accordance with current UK Copyright Law. In addition, any quotation or extract must include full attribution.
Abstract

Current biogeochemical box models for Phanerozoic climate are reviewed and reduced to a robust, modular system, allowing application to the Precambrian. It is shown that stabilisation of climate following a Neoproterozoic snowball Earth should take more than $10^7$ years, due to long-term geological limitation of global weathering rates. The timescale matches the observed gaps between extreme glaciations at this time, suggesting that the late Neoproterozoic system was oscillating around a steady state temperature below the snowball threshold. In the model, the period of disequilibrium following snowball glaciations is characterised by elevated ocean nutrient and organic burial rates, providing fair correlation with available geochemical proxies. Extending the analysis to consider carbon removed from the ocean via seafloor carbonization does not result in a significant reduction in stabilisation time.

Model timeframe is extended over the last 2Ga. Predicted oxygen concentration is shown to depend on the balance between terrestrial and seafloor weathering, which alters the global nutrient delivery rate and therefore global productivity. Under reasonable assumptions, broad predictions for Proterozoic climate fall within, or close to the bounds imposed by geological proxies. A mechanism for atmospheric oxygenation over Earth history is proposed: the combination of declining mantle heat flux and increasing continental area, aided by colonising land biota, results in a steadily increasing ocean nutrient supply, driving increasing rates of carbon burial.

Methods currently used for assessing Phanerozoic $O_2$ assume only terrestrial weathering fluxes, and are found to give unreasonable results when applied to the Precambrian. Phanerozoic predictions from the model developed here show a significant reduction in the large oxygen peak at 300Ma found in previous studies. This is due to consideration of terrestrial and seafloor weathering balance, and to the longer model timeframe - which allows prediction of crustal abundances in the Cambrian, rather than assuming present day conditions.
## Contents

1 Introduction .................................................. 1
   1.1 Earth history ............................................ 1
       1.1.1 Formation, age and geological time .............. 1
       1.1.2 Earth’s surface environment ..................... 1
       1.1.3 Life and Evolution .................................. 4
   1.2 Biogeochemical modelling ................................. 5
   1.3 This work ................................................ 7

2 Phanerozoic carbon cycle modelling .......................... 9
   2.1 Introduction ............................................. 9
   2.2 The GEOCARB model ..................................... 9
   2.3 The COPSE model ....................................... 11
   2.4 Flux calculation and forcing sets ....................... 12
       2.4.1 Forcings common to both models (figure 2.4.3a) ... 14
       2.4.2 Additional forcings for COPSE (figure 2.4.3b) .... 14
       2.4.3 Additional forcings for GEOCARB (figure 2.4.3c,d) . 15
       2.4.4 Summary ............................................. 16
   2.5 Negative feedback on temperature and CO$_2$ ............ 17
   2.6 Phanerozoic CO$_2$ predictions .......................... 18
       2.6.1 Summary of predictions ............................ 18
       2.6.2 Calculation for carbon dioxide concentration ...... 19
       2.6.3 Serial modification of model forcing sets .......... 19
       2.6.4 Perturbation experiments ........................... 21
       2.6.5 Factors controlling model CO$_2$ predictions ....... 22
       2.6.6 Comparison of Phanerozoic models to CO$_2$ proxy data . 24
   2.7 Phanerozoic O$_2$ predictions ............................. 28
       2.7.1 Summary of O$_2$ predictions ......................... 28
       2.7.2 Calculation of oxygen concentration ............... 30
       2.7.3 Method for calculating organic burial in GEOCARB . 30
       2.7.4 Method for calculating organic burial in COPSE .... 36
       2.7.5 Factors controlling model O$_2$ predictions ......... 39
       2.7.6 Comparison to O$_2$ proxy data ..................... 40
   2.8 Chapter conclusions ..................................... 44
# Modelling the Precambrian carbon cycle

3.1 Introduction ........................................ 47
3.2 Neoproterozoic climate ............................... 47
3.3 Model development ................................... 51
   3.3.1 Box scheme and reservoir calculations ........ 51
   3.3.2 Phanerozoic forcings ............................ 52
   3.3.3 Weathering dependencies and fluxes ............ 53
   3.3.4 Metamorphic/degassing fluxes .................. 55
   3.3.5 Burial of oxidised species ...................... 55
   3.3.6 Optional burial of reduced species via isotope mass balance .................. 56
   3.3.7 Optional burial of reduced species via ocean nutrient model .................. 56
   3.3.8 Full model equations ............................. 59
3.4 Validation against COPSE and GEOCARB models ........ 62
3.5 Minimal model predictions for Proterozoic climate .......... 64
   3.5.1 Extension of forcings ............................ 64
   3.5.2 Baseline predictions ............................. 67
3.6 Weathering enhancement and temperature in the Neoproterozoic .... 69
   3.6.1 Continental position, dispersion and composition ... 69
   3.6.2 Weathering enhancement prior to vascular plant evolution ................. 71
   3.6.3 Model results for Neoproterozoic temperature .......... 72
3.7 Chapter conclusions .................................... 74

# Neoproterozoic snowball glaciations and limitations on global weathering rates

4.1 Introduction ........................................ 77
4.2 Timing of Neoproterozoic glaciations linked to transport-limited global weathering ........ 78
4.3 Supplementary information 1: Estimating the amount of CO2 consumed by rock flour weathering ........ 87
5.7 Summary of the effects of weathering pathways on CO₂ and O₂ predictions ...................................................... 136
5.8 Long term carbon and sulphur cycling between the crust and mantle .......................................................... 137
5.9 Predicted stable isotope fractionation ............................. 139
  5.9.1 Carbon isotopes .................................................. 139
  5.9.2 Sulphur isotopes .................................................. 142
5.10 Chapter summary and conclusions .................................. 144
  5.10.1 Summary of important findings .............................. 144
  5.10.2 Conclusions .................................................... 145

6 Thesis conclusions .......................................................... 147
  6.1 Main findings .......................................................... 147
  6.2 Linking weathering pathways and transport limitation .......................................................... 148
    6.2.1 Effect of OCC pathway on post-snowball CO₂ removal 148
    6.2.2 Transport limitation of weathering over Earth history . 151
  6.3 Model limitations .................................................... 152
  6.4 Future modelling work ................................................ 153
    6.4.1 Low-oxygen solutions ........................................ 153
    6.4.2 Representation of limiting factors for key processes . 154
    6.4.3 Full representation of mantle cycling ....................... 155
    6.4.4 On Phanerozoic modelling ................................... 155
  6.5 Concluding remarks .................................................. 156
    6.5.1 On Earth’s oxygention ....................................... 156
    6.5.2 On exoplanets ................................................ 157
1 Introduction

1.1 Earth history

1.1.1 Formation, age and geological time

The Earth was formed around 4.5 billion years ago (Ga) in a circumstellar disc around the young Sun. In models of planetary formation, gas and fine dust surrounding the stellar body undergoes accretion to first form small planetesimals, then larger planetary embryos, which eventually collide to form planets (e.g. Chambers (2004)). The process takes between 10-100 million years (Myr). It is thought that the Moon was formed near the end of Earth’s accumulation (Canup and Asphaug, 2001) from mass ejected during a collision between the young Earth and a Mars-sized body (Benz et al., 1986; Hartmann and Davis, 1975).

The oldest crustal material known is dated to 4.3-4Ga (Bowring and Williams, 1999; O’Neil et al., 2008) and there is some evidence for existence of continental crust and oceans on the Earth at 4.4Ga (Wilde et al., 2001), however, lack of preservation causes the abundance of rocks to decline exponentially with age (Garrels and Mackenzie, 1969), making early-Earth material scarce today. Figure 1.1.1 shows the currently agreed chronostratigraphic timeline (ICS, 2012) alongside proxy data for atmospheric composition and the timing of glacial periods.

1.1.2 Earth’s surface environment

Multiple geologic proxies are used to infer climatic conditions throughout Earth history. The composition of the atmosphere is thought to have changed significantly since the formation of the planet, but appears to have remained suitable for life (Kasting, 1989). Pillow basalts dated to 3.8Ga provide the first direct evidence of liquid water (Polat et al., 2002), which is a requirement for all known organisms. This indicates that the ocean was not completely frozen at this time, however, placing constraints on early Earth temperature is very difficult. The limited geological evidence suggests a temperate-to-hot Archean climate, but also indicates glacial periods (Kasting and Ono, 2006). Temperature extremes at the local or global level may have been crucial to the origin of life (Bada et al., 1994; Wachtershauser, 1998; Schwartzman,
The Sun is known to have increased in luminosity over time, implying that with contemporary greenhouse gas concentration and planetary albedo, global temperature would be expected to be well below the freezing point of water in the Archean (Sagan and Mullen, 1972). Thus it has been inferred that concentrations of greenhouse gasses must have been higher on the early Earth (Kasting, 1993). Evidence from paleosols (Rye et al., 1995), mineralogy of banded iron formations (Rosing et al., 2010) and ancient river gravels (Hessler et al., 2004) place Archean CO\textsubscript{2} concentration between 1-100 times PAL (present atmospheric level), which is lower than the concentration required to maintain clement surface temperature after consideration of other plausible greenhouse gasses (Haqq-Misra et al., 2008). It has been suggested that lower planetary albedo due to the lack of continents (Rosing et al., 2010) and increased atmospheric pressure due to likely higher nitrogen concentration (Goldblatt et al., 2009a) may have compensated for the weaker solar flux by raising surface temperature. However, recent models allowing for these effects still fail to resolve the paradox (Goldblatt and Zahnle, 2011; Goldblatt et al., 2009a). Mineralogical constraints implying very low Archean CO\textsubscript{2} concentration may suffer from lack of thermodynamic equilibrium between the assemblage and the atmosphere and are at best uncertain (Dauphas and Kasting, 2011; Reinhard and Planavsky, 2011).

Glacial evidence is found sporadically throughout Earth history (see fig 1.1.1), indicating periods of low global temperature. Absence of glacial strata is assumed to represent warm global temperature. Several glacial periods appear to have been long lasting with ice sheets extending to, or very close to the equator. These events occur in the Paleoproterozoic (Papineau, 2010; Evans et al., 1997; Bekker et al., 2001) and Neoproterozoic (Hoffman et al., 1998; Arnaud et al., 2011). Other large but less extensive glaciations occur in the Permo-Carboniferous (330-260Ma) and the Cenozoic (30-0Ma) (Crowley, 1998).

The concentration of atmospheric oxygen has changed by many orders of magnitude over Earth history. Recent reviews of the geological constraints roughly bracket oxygen concentration below 10^{-5} PAL before 2.4 Ga, between 0.01-0.2 PAL during the period 2.4-0.58 Ga, and above 0.6 – 0.8PAL for 400Ma-present (Papineau et al., 2007; Pavlov and Kasting, 2002; Kump, 1999).
This oxygen window is shown in figure 1.1.1. Note the apparent correlation between increasing oxygen concentration and deep glaciation.

**Figure 1.1.1: Compilation of evidence for environmental and biological changes over Earth history.** Grey shaded areas show proxy constraints on atmospheric O$_2$ and CO$_2$, plotted relative to their present day concentrations. Constraints for oxygen (A,B,C) show the three distinct windows described in the text, and follow the review of Kump (2008). Proxy data for CO$_2$ show estimates from paleosol data (D) (Rye et al., 1995), (E) (Sheldon, 2006), carbon isotope modelling (H) (Kah and Bartley, 2004) and a compilation of Phanerozoic indicators from paleosols, plankton and stomatal density (I) (Royer et al., 2004). Grey circles with arrows show upper and lower bound estimates from composition of fossil acritarchs (F) (Kaufman and Xiao, 2003) and cyanobacteria (G) (Kah and Riding, 2007). Blue shaded areas represent times of substantial glaciation (see text). Dark green lines show the earliest agreed evidence for evolutionary advancements, with the light green areas showing the uncertainty, as described in the text. Original in colour.
1.1.3 Life and Evolution

It is thought that the Earth could have been habitable by 10-20 Myrs after the Moon-forming impact (Zahnle et al., 2007). Isotopically light carbon\(^1\) found in 3.8Ga sediment sequences (Mojzsis et al., 1996) is the earliest indicator of the presence of life, as no abiotic processes are known to cause such high degrees of carbon isotope fractionation. Sedimentary structures called stromatolites, which today are produced by microorganisms, are found in increasing numbers beginning at 3.5Ga (Schopf et al., 2007; Hofmann, 2000; Schopf, 2006) although to prove beyond doubt that they are organic in nature is currently not possible due to lack of an associated fossilised microbiota (Grotzinger and Knoll, 1999).

Hard evidence for life comes in the form of microfossils, which are found beginning 3.32Ga (Walsh and Lowe, 1985; Walsh, 1992; Knoll and Barghoorn, 1977). A combination of analytical techniques are used to verify the biological morphology and carbonaceous chemistry of proposed fossils at the micron-scale (House et al., 2000; Boyce et al., 2001; Kudryavtsev et al., 2001; Schopf, 2006), following a rigorous criteria for establishment of biogenicity (Schopf, 2004).

The increasing complexity of life over time can be established from the fossil record, which displays numerous remarkable evolutionary transitions (Szathmry and Maynard Smith, 1995). Chemical composition of carbonaceous matter dated to 3.416 Ga indicate the presence of photosynthetic anoxic microbes (Tice and Lowe, 2004, 2006). Fossils resembling cyanobacteria are found beginning 2.15Ga (Hofmann, 1976), indicating oxygenic photosynthesis was present by this time. Fossilised lipids in rocks dated to 2.7Ga are characteristic of cyanobacteria (Brocks et al., 1999; Summons et al., 1999), however these biomarkers are now known to be non-primary (Rasmussen et al., 2008). It is currently uncertain whether the evolution of oxygenic photosynthesis occurred sometime before, or coincidentally with the 2.4Ga

\(^1\)Organic matter is depleted in the heavy \(^{13}\)C isotope due to biological preference for the lighter \(^{12}\)C isotope (Mook, 1986). The \(\delta^{13}\)C record shows the relative abundance of the heavy isotope in marine carbonates compared to the standard Pee Dee Belemnite (\(\delta^{13}\)C\(_{\text{PDB}}\)=0), and has been traditionally taken as a rough measure of the fraction of total carbon that is buried organically. Bacterial sulphate reduction similarly produces H\(_2\)S in which the sulphur is isotopically light. The standard here is the Canyon Diablo Troilite (\(\delta^{34}\)S\(_{\text{CDT}}\)=0).
great oxygenation event. Eukaryotic cells, which unlike earlier prokaryotes contain complex internal structures (organelles) likely evolved around 2 Ga (Lenton and Watson, 2011), with the first indisputably eukaryotic fossils found at 1.2 Ga (Butterfield, 2000). Elemental ratios and isotopic composition of 2.6-2.7 Ga organic matter suggest that terrestrial biomass may have been present at this point (Watanabe et al., 2000), the first evidence for microbial structures on land is found around 1.2-1 Ga (Prave, 2002) and protein sequence analysis suggests fungi had evolved by this time (Heckman et al., 2001). Fossil land plant fragments appear at 460 Ma (Wellman et al., 2003) and forest ecosystems with rooted trees were present by the Devonian period (415-360 Ma) (Retallack, 1997). Animals may have evolved as early as 760 Ma (Brain et al., 2012), and oxygen-breathing land animals are found by 428 Ma: the millipede *Pneumodesmus Newmani* possesses breathing holes called spiracles that are utilised by modern insects (Wilson and Anderson, 2004). The first recorded mammals are early Cretaceous (145-66 Ma) monotreme fossils (Archer et al., 1985). Rising temperature due to stellar evolution is expected to limit the future of the complex biosphere on Earth to \( \sim 1 \) Gyr (Lenton and Bloh, 2001).

## 1.2 Biogeochemical modelling

The oceans, atmosphere and lithosphere are in constant flux, however their compositions appear to have remained relatively stable over millions of years. This is attributed to the operation of negative feedback loops in global elemental cycles, which rely on a combination of biological, geophysical and chemical processes. Stabilisation of environmental conditions in the ranges suitable for life was first discussed as part of the Gaia hypothesis (Lovelock, 1972; Margulis and Lovelock, 1974; Lovelock, 1979), which proposed that tight coupling between life and its environment constitutes a global cybernetic system, and should tend towards homoeostasis. A hypothetical model demonstrating this idea, Daisyworld (Watson and Lovelock, 1983) showed that on a planet that was gradually heating up due to increasing solar flux, competition between two types of organism that had opposite effects on climate (in this case, black and white daisies that respectively warmed or cooled the planet) could lead to regulation of planetary temperature at the level
most suitable for the survivability of the biosphere as a whole.

The level of control exerted by the biosphere, if any, is both controversial and uncertain, however, numerous stabilising mechanisms have been identified in the Earth system, and modelling studies incorporating these have led to an improved understanding of biogeochemical cycles, as well as providing causal relationships for observed paleoclimatic changes. An early attempt to model an existing Earth system feedback loop was the 'WHAK' model, named after the authors Walker, Hays and Kasting (Walker et al., 1981). This work highlighted that the rate of removal of carbon dioxide from the atmosphere via continental weathering and deposition in sediments is dependent on global temperature. Rising temperature should boost the kinetics of weathering reactions and increase the rate of continental runoff, leading to increased CO$_2$ removal, which would reduce atmospheric greenhouse gas concentration and therefore act to nullify the original temperature rise.

Further models added this feedback loop (Berner et al., 1983; Berner and Barron, 1984), and others (Lenton, 2000; Lasaga and Ohmoto, 2002) to representations of geochemical cycling in order to arrive at predictions for the composition of ancient atmospheres. Currently, feedback-based geochemical box models are used to predict the evolution of climate over the Phanerozoic Eon (Berner, 2006a; Bergman et al., 2004; Arvidson et al., 2006), and allow multiple predictions including concentration of oxygen, ocean sulphate and nutrient levels in addition to carbon dioxide and temperature. For shorter term analysis (e.g. millennial timescale), intermediate complexity Earth system models (e.g. Lenton et al. (2006); Ridgwell and Hargreaves (2007)) allow for a 3D spatial approach and explicit representation of sedimentary processes and ocean circulation. General Circulation Models (e.g. Marotzke et al. (1999)) add further complexity and reduce the timescale of operation accordingly due to computational constraints. Intermediate complexity models or GCMs are well suited to analysing future climate trends, and to compare possible future events to those recorded in the geologic record (e.g. Ridgwell and Schmidt (2010)). Many feedback mechanisms do however remain poorly understood, for example the relation between ocean gas emissions and cloud formation (Charlson et al., 1987).
1.3 This work

The models considered and developed in this thesis are applied over long timescales ($10^6$-$10^9$ years) and consist of simplified systems of differential equations that represent global biological, chemical and geophysical processes. The aim is to construct a robust model framework based on current box models for the Phanerozoic, and to apply this model to the study of Proterozoic climate. Simple carbon cycle models have previously been applied to the Proterozoic period (e.g. (Sleep and Zahnle, 2001; Hayes and Waldbauer, 2006)) but climate predictions are limited to temperature and CO$_2$.

In Chapter 2 the current Phanerozoic modelling techniques are reviewed. Code is obtained for the GEOCARB and COPSE models and the controlling processes in these models are assessed.

Chapter 3 focusses on the development of a robust model framework based on GEOCARB and COPSE. The new ‘Minimal Model’ is validated against the previous works and shows good agreement for the Phanerozoic. The timeframe of the minimal model is extended to the Neoproterozoic, predicted oxygen concentration and causes for the deep glaciations at this time are then investigated.

In Chapter 4, the Minimal Model is modified to allow for snowball Earth (Hoffman et al., 1998) type glaciations by introduction of a ice-albedo positive feedback. The system is then used to test the effect of geological weathering limitation on the time taken to recover from a post-snowball CO$_2$ crisis. The main body work from this chapter has been published (Mills et al., 2011) and is reproduced here with some extension and further discussion.

In Chapter 5, new fluxes and boxes are added to the model framework to represent long term cycling between the surface system and the mantle. The extended model is used to investigate the effect of changing carbon removal pathways (e.g. Caldeira (1995)) on ocean nutrient levels and oxygen concentration over the last 2Ga. The work in this chapter, including some work from chapter 3, is currently being prepared for submission.
2 Phanerozoic carbon cycle modelling

2.1 Introduction

In this chapter I review the literature on the modelling of the long term carbon cycle over the Phanerozoic eon (542-0Ma). Various models have attempted to reconstruct the flow of carbon through the atmosphere, oceans and sediments over this period, and in doing so have provided key estimates for atmospheric CO$_2$, temperature and O$_2$ concentration. Here I focus on two popular Phanerozoic models, GEOCARBSULF (Berner, 2006a) and COPSE (Bergman et al., 2004), which are commonly used as benchmarks from which to test theories on paleoatmospheric conditions (e.g. Belcher et al. (2010)). Whilst there are many apparent similarities between the two models, for some periods of Earth history they produce significantly different results. In this chapter I attempt to trace the root of these differences and assess the key processes controlling model predictions. Estimates for Phanerozoic CO$_2$ and O$_2$ are also cross-examined and compared to proxy data. The goal of this analysis is to define a reduced set of critical processes and parameters that can be used to construct a new, simpler model. It is hoped that the new model can reproduce the broader scale predictions of the established work, but with significant improvements in flexibility, robustness and mathematical simplicity that will allow application to Precambrian climate. The model runs in this section are performed using original code for the 2004 COPSE model (Bergman et al., 2004) and for the 2009 ‘GEOCARBSULFvole’ model (Berner, 2009), obtained directly from the respective authors.

2.2 The GEOCARB model

The first GEOCARB model (Berner, 1991) was a dramatic step forwards in understanding the link between the carbon cycle and global climate over geological time. Following just the cycle of carbon allowed for substantial simplification of a previous model of the carbonate-silicate cycle, which had included explicit representation of the calcium and magnesium cycles (Berner et al., 1983). This step led to improved computational efficiency and allowed the first reconstruction of climate for the whole Phanerozoic.
Figure 2.2.1: Long term carbon and sulphur cycle schematic, as used in GEOCARB and COPSE models. Clear boxes denote the combined atmosphere/ocean reservoirs, grey boxes represent crustal reservoirs. Flux subscripts ‘b’, ‘w’ and ‘m’ refer to burial, weathering and metamorphic/degassing respectively. a, Carbon cycle, G: Organic (reduced) carbon, C: Carbonate (oxidised) carbon, A, Atmosphere and ocean carbon. b, Sulphur cycle, PYR: Pyrite (reduced) sulphur, GYP: Gypsum (oxidised) sulphur, S: Ocean sulphate.

The original GEOCARB model uses a 3-box system to simulate the transfer of carbon between the hydrosphere and crust, which is shown in figure 2.2.1 a. Carbon is assumed to exist as CO$_2$ in the combined atmosphere and ocean system (which is modelled as a single box), and as either oxidised carbonates or reduced organic matter in the crust. Carbon is transferred between the boxes via burial, weathering and degassing. Over long timescales (> 10$^6$ yrs) other elements of the global carbon cycle can be considered to be at steady state, allowing for an estimation of the carbon content of the
atmosphere and ocean over the Phanerozoic based on knowledge of the fluxes between these boxes. The GEOCARB model has been extended many times (Berner, 1994; Berner and Kothavala, 2001; Berner, 2006a,b, 2009), and the most recent models include a similar 3-box treatment for the cycling of sulphur species, shown in figure 2.2.1 b. Sulphur is assumed to exist as oxidised sulphate in the atmosphere/ocean and as gypsum (oxidised) sulphur and pyrite (reduced) sulphur in the crust. In the later versions of GEOCARB the crustal boxes are each split into ‘young’ and ‘ancient’ partitions to explore isotope fractionation effects, but this does not affect the total fluxes between hydrosphere and crust. Further additions include a routine for calculating oxygen concentration, and more complex treatment of volcanism. The series of GEOCARB models do not contain explicit biological processes, and the biologically-influenced burial of organic carbon and pyrite sulphur are estimated based on the isotopic ratios $\delta^{13}C$ and $\delta^{34}S$, which are imposed as an external forcing.

### 2.3 The COPSE model

COPSE uses the same box and flux scheme as GEOCARB for the carbon and sulphur cycles, without assuming a partition between young and ancient rock. The scheme is combined with a previously designed box model for ocean productivity and oxygen (Lenton and Watson, 2000a,b). This adds two boxes to the GEOCARB system which represent the major limiting nutrients phosphate and nitrate, allowing calculation of burial rates for reduced carbon and sulphur via the modelled nutrient concentrations. Calculating organic burial in this manner means that COPSE does not require the isotope record to be used as a model forcing, and allows the model to instead produce predictions for stable isotope fractionation. However additional forcings are required for the nutrient system to function. Figure 2.3.2 shows the fluxes controlling nutrient concentrations, which in turn drive productivity and burial of organic species. Another popular model, MAGic (Arvidson et al., 2006), is not discussed in length here. My aim in this thesis is to understand the factors controlling atmospheric and ocean composition over long periods of Earth history in the simplest terms, I therefore do not analyse the MAGic system in detail, as it can be effectively reduced to the simpler COPSE sys-
tem whilst maintaining the general results. In MAGic, the rate of organic burial is estimated from ecosystem productivity, which is based on delivery of nutrients via weathering. This treatment is similar to the COPSE model, and the resulting predictions for Phanerozoic climate are very similar (see Arvidson et al. (2006)).

Figure 2.3.2: Feedback-based nutrient system for COPSE model O: Oxygen, N: Nitrate, P: Phosphate. Fluxes ending with ‘b’ denote burial, ‘w’ denotes weathering. psea and pland represent the proportion of weathered phosphate delivered to the land biosphere and the ocean. newp is new production, nfix and denit represent nitrogen fixation and denitrification fluxes and anox represents the ocean anoxic fraction. Here arrows show ability of one variable to alter another, not explicit fluxes.

2.4 Flux calculation and forcing sets

For both models, the fluxes between boxes are calculated using knowledge of their present day magnitude and a variety of proposed scaling relationships to both internal model variables and external forcing functions. As noted previously, one key difference between GEOCARB and COPSE is in the
calculation of the organic burial fluxes. Another important difference is in the model forcing sets - the GEOCARB model uses many more external forcings than COPSE. For both models, the magnitude of the external forcing functions is defined relative to present day, with typical magnitude $0.5 < F < 1.5$. The full forcing sets are shown in figure 2.4.3, and described below. Both models are also subject to an increase in solar luminosity over the Phanerozoic (not shown), which affects the global temperature (Caldeira and Kasting, 1992).

![Figure 2.4.3: Model forcings](image)

**Figure 2.4.3: Model forcings**  
2.4.1 Forcings common to both models (figure 2.4.3a)

**U: uplift rate**
The rate of continental uplift over the Phanerozoic has been estimated from a strontium isotope mass balance model (Berner, 1994). This model reconstructs changes in seawater \(^{87}\text{Sr}/^{86}\text{Sr}\) in the absence of Sr input from terrestrial weathering, which is then compared to data to estimate the weathering contribution. The results agree well with data for terriginous sediment abundance (Ronov, 1993). In the model, the uplift/erosion parameter affects the rate of continental weathering via supply of material.

**D: degassing rate**
The GEOCARB and COPSE models use a sea level inversion method (Gaffin, 1987) to calculate the sea floor spreading rate, which is used to estimate global degassing rates (Franck and Bounama, 1997; Lasaga et al., 1985). The degassing forcing controls the rate of release of buried carbon and sulphur into the atmosphere.

**B: burial depth of marine carbonates**
Both models include a forcing affecting carbonate degassing, attributed to the rise of calcareous plankton at \(\sim\)150Ma, which are deposited in deep water. Their evolution is thought to have increased the amount of carbonate entering subduction zones and hence undergoing thermal decomposition (Volk, 1989).

2.4.2 Additional forcings for COPSE (figure 2.4.3b)

**W: weathering rate enhancement due to biosphere changes**
The colonisation of the land surface by vascular plants by \(\sim\)350Ma is thought to have dramatically enhanced continental weathering rates (Stewart and Rothwell, 1983). Roots exudate organic acids, amplifying rates of chemical weathering, as well as physically breaking up rock. Enhancement of weathering by vascular plants is seen in field studies but results vary greatly, therefore the global effect of vascular plant evolution remains uncertain (Cawley et al., 1969; Berner, 1998). Further weathering enhancement is thought to have occurred due to the evolution of angiosperm plants at \(\sim\)100Ma, due to their higher rubisco specificity factor (the preference of the enzyme for \(\text{CO}_2\) over \(\text{O}_2\) (Igamberdiev and Lea, 2006)), and less efficient recycling of nutri-
ents (Knoll and James, 1987). The W forcing in COPSE acts to enhance terrestrial weathering rates as the biosphere evolves.

**E: evolution of biological feedbacks on land**
The effect of the terrestrial biosphere on geochemical cycling is dependent on various local factors such as temperature, CO$_2$ concentration and O$_2$ concentration, which affect productivity both directly (Caldeira and Kasting, 1992; Volk, 1987) and via the rate of biosphere burning due to fires (Wildman et al., 2004; Watson, 1978). The E forcing in COPSE acts to ‘switch on’ these feedbacks once the land biosphere has evolved.

**CPland: carbon-to-phosphorous burial rate on land**
The burial ratio of carbon to phosphorus on land is doubled in the Permo-Carboniferous in the COPSE model. This represents the expectation that extensive burial of organics occurred in coal swamps during this time (Berner and Canfield, 1989; Kump, 1993).

### 2.4.3 Additional forcings for GEOCARB (figure 2.4.3c,d)
The most recent GEOCARBSULF models use a large forcing set, adding the forcings shown in 2.4.3c and 2.4.3d to the forcings in 2.4.3a. The forcing set has grown substantially since the first GEOCARB model, as more processes have been identified as being important to the geological carbon cycle.

**fE: weathering rate enhancement due to biosphere changes**
GEOCARB was the first model to include the effects of plant evolution on the carbon and sulphur cycles (Berner, 1991). The fE forcing in GEOCARB expresses a 2-step increase over the Phanerozoic, from which the COPSE forcing W was derived. There is no equivalent to the COPSE ‘E’ forcing in GEOCARB, as the model does not have an explicit representation of biospheric feedbacks.

**fD: runoff rate**
The assumed changes to continental runoff due to paleogeography are derived by calculating runoff rates for 10 degree ‘latitude slices’ in a reconstruction of Phanerozoic continental drift (Tardy et al., 1989; Berner, 1990). The runoff forcing is assumed to influence the terrestrial weathering rates by increasing rate of flow of material through weathering zones.
fA: total land area
The total land area is also derived from paleogeographic reconstructions (Barron et al., 1980; Ronov, 1976), and influences bulk weathering rates by changing the area exposed to weathering.

fLA: carbonate land area
The relative land area that is underlain by carbonate rocks. Derived from the relative land area forcing, fA, and the paleogeographic maps of Bluth and Kump (1991). This forcing affects the weathering of carbonates.

$\delta^{13}C$ and $\delta^{34}S$: productivity forcings Using data for the fractionation of marine carbonates as a proxy for paleoatmospheric fractionation allows estimation of the rates of organic carbon burial by the biosphere, assuming that the total carbon burial and the fractionation of the crustal reservoirs is known. This isotopic mass balance technique was explored by Garrels and Lerman (1984) and Berner (1987) before being incorporated into the first GEOCARB model (Berner, 1991). The same technique is used in later models to estimate the rate of organic pyrite sulphur burial, based on the isotopic ratio $\delta^{34}S$.

2.4.4 Summary
The GEOCARB and COPSE models share a simple set of forcings: global uplift and degassing rates, and the changes brought about by the evolution of land plants and calcareous plankton. GEOCARB adds further abiotic forcings, and importantly, adds a forcing for the productivity of the biosphere, which is used to prescribe the rates of organic burial. The COPSE model assumes that burial rate of organic carbon and pyrite is governed by the rate of marine new production, which itself is assumed to depend on ocean nutrient concentration. Additional assumptions are therefore required to predict the rate of organic carbon burial via the nutrient model: a complex dependency of the mass of the terrestrial biosphere on atmospheric conditions, and the additional biotic forcings E and CPl, shown in figure 2.4.3b.
2.5 Negative feedback on temperature and CO$_2$

The atmospheric and oceanic reservoir of carbon is around $10^6$ times larger than the yearly fluxes into and out of it, while for oxygen this factor is $10^7$. Therefore an imbalance in fluxes may deplete either reservoir on a timescale far shorter than the duration of the Phanerozoic eon ($\sim 5 \times 10^8$ years). Stability (or homeostasis) in the carbon cycle is achieved via naturally occurring negative feedback mechanisms. A key process for model stability is the temperature-dependence of the silicate weathering process (Walker et al., 1981). Weathering of silicates, followed by transfer to the ocean and eventual burial in sediments results in a net transfer of CO$_2$ from the atmosphere to the crust. Temperature influences the rate of chemical reaction and therefore an increase in temperature results in an increased removal of CO$_2$ from the surface system, lowering the radiative forcing from this gas and therefore lowering temperature. This mechanism is thought to have been extremely important throughout Earth history to stabilise CO$_2$ at levels that permit the removal flux by weathering to equal the input flux from degassing, and was the central focus of carbon cycle models preceding GEOCARB (e.g. Berner et al. (1983). The equation adopted by GEOCARB and COPSE is based on the field work of Berner (1994), combining a term for the rate of chemical dissolution with a term for the rate of runoff:

$$f_B(T) = e^{0.09(T-T_0)} \cdot (1 + 0.038(T-T_0))^{0.65}$$  \hspace{1cm} (2.5.1)

Where $f_B$ is the effect of temperature on the global rate of silicate weathering, $T$ is global average surface temperature and $T_0 = 288K$ is the present day average surface temperature. The full equation for the silicate weathering flux also includes dependence on model forcings, as well as effects of CO$_2$ fertilization of vascular plants (Berner, 1994).
2.6 Phanerozoic CO$_2$ predictions

2.6.1 Summary of predictions

Figure 2.6.4: Phanerozoic CO$_2$ predictions. RCO$_2$ denotes atmospheric carbon dioxide concentration relative to the present day (pre-industrial) concentration. The COPSE model (Bergman et al., 2004) is shown in black, the GEOCARBSULFvolc model (Berner, 2009) is shown in grey.

Figure 2.6.4 shows baseline Phanerozoic CO$_2$ predictions for the COPSE model and the GEOCARBSULFvolc model. The overall pattern predicted by both models is of elevated (10-20 times present day) CO$_2$ from 550-350Ma, dropping to around 1-5 times present day concentration for the period 350-0Ma. From this plot we can highlight three distinct features:

1) Agreement between modelled carbon dioxide concentrations is very strong from the Mesozoic onwards (250-0Ma).

2) Model CO$_2$ predictions from 550-250Ma follow a similar overall trajectory, but GEOCARB predicts lower concentrations than COPSE for this time period.

3) The COPSE CO$_2$ path is smoother than the GEOCARB prediction, with less scatter.
To understand the critical processes in these models it is important to provide a reason for each of these observations.

### 2.6.2 Calculation for carbon dioxide concentration

Both models estimate the change in the atmosphere and ocean carbon reservoir using the flux calculation shown in equation 2.6.1, which sums the sources and sinks of the A reservoir, as shown in figure 2.2.1.

\[
\frac{dA}{dt} = F_{wg} + F_{mg} + F_{wc} + F_{mc} - F_{bg} - F_{bc} \tag{2.6.1}
\]

Here, subscript prefixes ‘w’, ‘m’ and ‘b’ refer to weathering, metamorphic/degassing and burial. Subscript suffixes ‘g’ and ‘c’ refer to organic and carbonate carbon (see figure 2.2.1). Burial of both reduced and oxidised carbon constitutes a sink for atmosphere and ocean CO$_2$, with the sources being the degassing and weathering of both of the crustal carbon reservoirs. All of these fluxes are affected by changes in model forcings and internal variables such as global average temperature.

### 2.6.3 Serial modification of model forcing sets

In order to explain the observed differences in output, the models are now compared under different forcing groups. The results are shown in figure 2.6.5. The assumed enhancement of terrestrial weathering due to the evolution of vascular plants differs between models. COPSE uses a 7-fold increase, as used in the first GEOCARB models (Berner, 1991), whilst GEOCARBSULFvolc uses a more conservative 4-fold increase (Berner and Kothavala, 2001). In figure 2.6.5a, the GEOCARBSULFvolc model (hereafter ‘GEOCARB’) is altered to increase the enhancement factor to match that used in COPSE. The modification does not alter results for 0-350Ma, but brings the model predictions closer to COPSE for 350-550Ma. Note that allowing a larger enhancement of the silicate weathering sink at 350Ma does not alter CO$_2$ predictions for 350-0Ma, as might be expected, but results in a higher CO$_2$ prediction for 550-350Ma. This is because model fluxes are inferred from the present day Earth system, thus the assumption of a ‘7-fold increase’ in weathering efficiency after 350Ma is actually modelled as a 7-fold decrease in efficiency before 350Ma.
Figure 2.6.5: Serial modification of COPSE and GEOCARB models. COPSE model (Bergman et al., 2004) shown in black and GEOCARBSULFvolc model (Berner, 2009) shown in grey. a, GEOCARB is adjusted so that both models use the same value for vascular plant weathering enhancement (7 fold). b, GEOCARB is further adjusted to include only the uplift and degassing forcings, as used in COPSE. c, as b with exclusion of isotope forcings from GEOCARB. d, as c with exclusion of uplift and degassing forcings from both models.

In figure 2.6.5 b, GEOCARB is simplified by removing all abiotic forcings except for uplift and degassing (i.e. everything shown in figure 2.4.3c), thereby limiting the abiotic forcings to the same set used in COPSE. Interestingly, this modification does not significantly impact the model predictions for CO₂. In figure 2.6.5 c, the productivity forcings from the isotope record are also removed from GEOCARB, leaving uplift, degassing and evolutionary forcings only. The forcings for GEOCARB now mimic those in COPSE (with the exception that no biological forcings are now present). This results in almost identical predictions for CO₂. Finally, in figure 2.6.5 d the
uplift, degassing, and carbonate burial depth forcings are removed from both models. The sole forcing is now the enhancement of weathering due to evolution of the land biota. Note that the qualitative shape of CO$_2$ predictions is preserved in both models. Differences remain due to the implementation of various shared parameters such as temperature functions and the land plant evolution forcing.

2.6.4 Perturbation experiments

The CO$_2$ predictions from the GEOCARB model show a more pronounced response to forcings than those from COPSE, this can be seen most clearly in figure 2.6.5c, where the identical forcing sets result in similar CO$_2$ variation, only the magnitude of variation is smaller in COPSE. COPSE appears to include stronger negative feedback on CO$_2$ concentration. This is likely to arise from the systematic treatment of the biosphere. For instance, in both models, an increase in CO$_2$ concentration increases temperature and amplifies the silicate weathering rate, leading to increased burial of atmospheric carbon until CO$_2$ concentration is reduced. In the COPSE model system, this increase in weathering rate also delivers more nutrient to the land and ocean biospheres, increasing the organic carbon burial rate as well as the silicate weathering rate. This should result in increased negative feedback on CO$_2$, and is tested below.

In figure 2.6.6, all forcings except for the solar increase (which is hard-coded in GEOCARB) are removed from both models, and a rise in either degassing or uplift rate is imposed from 200Ma-100Ma. Increased negative feedback is apparent in the COPSE model, which displays damping of imposed changes and slightly reduces their overall effect. Figure 2.6.6c shows the relative variation from the standard run, which is reduced in COPSE.
Figure 2.6.6: Effect of perturbations on GEOCARB and COPSE model. All forcings are held at present day except for solar luminosity, and a doubling of either uplift rate or degassing rate is applied for the period 200Ma-100Ma. 

- **a,** Effects on GEOCARB system for doubling uplift or degassing.
- **b,** Effects on COPSE system for doubling uplift or degassing.
- **c,** Results for both models shown as a fraction of the unforced result.

### 2.6.5 Factors controlling model CO₂ predictions

It is apparent here that the COPSE and GEOCARB predictions for Phanerozoic CO₂ are controlled almost entirely by the model forcing sets. The long term pattern is a stepwise decrease in CO₂ concentration around 350Ma due to the enhancement of the silicate weathering carbon sink by the colonising
vascular plants. The dominance of this forcing is easy to see when considering the magnitude of all forcings used: with the exception of the evolutionary forcing (which invokes a 4-7 fold enhancement), other forcings have a range of between a half and two times the present day magnitude (see fig 2.4.3). Figure 2.6.7 shows the degree of sensitivity to the assumed magnitude of weathering enhancement inferred by vascular plants. Sensitivity is extreme in both models, suggesting that CO$_2$ concentration closer to the present day cannot be ruled out for the early Phanerozoic based on model results alone.

![Figure 2.6.7: Effect of changing assumed vascular plant weathering enhancement factor. a, COPSE model. b, GEOCARB model. Variable denoting relative pre-plant weathering enhancement denoted $k_{15}$ and LIFE respectively.](image)

Revisiting the points of interest described in the summary, the reason GEOCARB predicts lower CO$_2$ for the period 550-350Ma is the use of a different value for the reduction in weathering efficiency before the evolution of vascular plants. Addressing this discrepancy brings the model predictions very close together, which explains the observed strong model agreement for the post-vascular-plant world. The rapid oscillations in CO$_2$ predictions
from the full GEOCARB model can be seen to be a result of the isotope-productivity forcings, which are defined more densely than the other forcing functions. This effect is no longer seen once these forcings are removed (see figure 2.6.5c). As discussed above, the COPSE model has increased negative feedback from the linked biological model, causing CO$_2$ concentration to remain closer to present day, whilst GEOCARB has additional abiotic forcings which can combine to increase the degree of variation in CO$_2$. There are many more proposed negative feedback processes controlling long term climate, and it is possible that current models may over estimate the impact of forcings because they lack representations of sufficient negative feedbacks.

An additional smaller-scale feature of the predicted CO$_2$ records is a rise in concentration from 300-150Ma followed by a gradual decline to the present day. The rise is due to the evolution of calcareous plankton and associated increase of carbonate degassing, which combines with a significant peak in the degassing forcing (see fig 2.4.3) to increase atmospheric carbon dioxide concentration. Relaxation of the degassing rate and the evolution of angiosperms causes CO$_2$ to fall gradually from 100ma to the present day. The final finding is that the additional abiotic forcings employed in the later GEOCARB models do not significantly alter the model predictions, which has been discussed in the GEOCARB papers (e.g. Berner and Kothavala (2001)) as the model has evolved.

2.6.6 Comparison of Phanerozoic models to CO$_2$ proxy data

Figure 2.6.8 shows available proxy data for Phanerozoic CO$_2$ concentration against model predictions and the glacial record, adapted from Royer et al. (2004); Crowley (1998). Proxy data shown are a combination of estimates derived from $\delta^{13}$C of pedogenic minerals in paleosols (Cerling, 1991; Yapp and Poths, 1992), the $\delta^{13}$C of phytoplankton (Freeman and Hayes, 1992; Pagani et al., 1999), stomatal distribution in the leaves of C3 plants (Van der Burgh et al., 1993; McElwain and Chaloner, 1995) and the $\delta^{11}$B signature of planktonic foraminifera (Pearson and Palmer, 2000). See Royer et al. (2004) for individual proxy information. It is important to note that the sampling frequency for this data drops dramatically for more ancient periods (see 2.6.8c), no proxy data currently exists for between 550 and 450Ma.
Figure 2.6.8: Model CO₂ predictions against proxy data. a, Paleolatitude of continental glaciations. b, Combined proxy data from paleosols, phytoplankton, stomata and boron are shown in grey. Plotted in black are model predictions from COPSE (solid line), GEOCARB (dashed line) and MAGic (Arvidson et al., 2006) (dash-dot line). c, Sampling frequency for proxy data in b. Data from Royer et al. (2004). Original in colour.

The models shown are GEOCARB, COPSE and MAGic (Arvidson et al., 2006). The MAGic model is considerably more complex than COPSE and GEOCARB, including explicit representation of the silicate rock reservoir and interaction with the shallow mantle. However, results for CO₂ are very
close to the previous models, implying that control is exerted by the same dominant processes.

Models and proxies show good agreement for 400-0Ma, and the predicted low CO$_2$ in the Permo-Carboniferous and Cenozoic era fit well with the glacial data in fig 2.6.8a. Predicted high Mezozoic CO$_2$ also agrees with the lack of glacial strata from this era, however the proxies disagree somewhat with regard to the magnitude of the CO$_2$ increase here. The stepwise decrease in CO$_2$ concentration from 400-300Ma predicted by all models and hinted at by proxies does not fit as well with the glacial data. CO$_2$ ≥ 15PAL is predicted for the early Phanerozoic (and presumably time before this), simple energy balance models (Caldeira and Kasting, 1992) imply an average surface temperature of around 20°C for this carbon dioxide concentration at 500Ma. We would not expect a world this hot to be glaciated, however there is evidence for continental glaciation in the Ordovician as well as the early Cambrian. Further back, the Neoproterozoic era (1000-541Ma) contains several extremely large glacial events (Macdonald et al., 2010; Halverson et al., 2005), which are very hard to reconcile with the assumed high CO$_2$ due to the lack of vascular plants. A small amount of proxy data in figure 2.6.8b does show elevated CO$_2$ at ∼400Ma, but it is not known whether this is a transient rise or a step change, as suggested by models.

Figure 2.6.9 shows a reconstruction of paleo-temperature from δ$^{18}$O data, reproduced from Royer et al. (2004); Veizer et al. (2000). When adjusted for Ca$^{2+}$ concentration and CO$_2$ concentration either from data or from the GEOCARB model, it shows fair correlation with the glacial record. The authors of the study argue that current CO$_2$ predictions are therefore broadly correct, and that CO$_2$ is responsible for the major temperature changes over the Phanerozoic. However, there is still significant uncertainty in the early Phanerozoic, and a lower model prediction for CO$_2$ here would improve the correlation. Estimations of CO$_2$ concentration from carbon and strontium isotope data (Rothman, 2001) are shown in figure 2.6.10. This data suggests CO$_2$ ≤ 5PAL for the whole Phanerozoic, which is permissible in the models if a lower vascular plant enhancement is assumed, i.e. a doubling of weathering efficiency (see figure 2.6.7).
Figure 2.6.9: Temperature predictions based on $\delta^{18}O$ data. a, Calculated average surface temperature relative to present day. Solid line shows uncorrected curve (Shaviv and Veizer, 2003), dashed line shows curve corrected for seawater Ca$^{2+}$ concentration (Horita et al., 2002) and CO$_2$ proxies (as shown in fig 2.6.8). Grey shaded area shows corrections for Ca$^{2+}$ and GEOCARB model CO$_2$. b, Paleolatitude of continental glaciations (as in fig 2.6.8). Figure modified from Royer et al. (2004).
Figure 2.6.10: Phanerozoic CO$_2$ predictions from combined carbon and strontium isotope data, from Rothman (2001) a, CO$_2$ concentration relative to present day. b, Paleolatitude of continental glaciations (as in fig 2.6.8).

2.7 Phanerozoic O$_2$ predictions

2.7.1 Summary of O$_2$ predictions

The GEOCARB and COPSE models produce very similar predictions for Phanerozoic CO$_2$. However, there is significant difference in the predictions for oxygen concentration, which are shown alongside the model CO$_2$ reconstructions in figure 2.7.11.
As with the CO\textsubscript{2} predictions, there are several observations to note:

1) Both models show a significant peak in O\textsubscript{2} at around 300Ma, coincident with the evolution of vascular plants. Another peak is predicted in both models around 100Ma coincident with angiosperm evolution.

2) COPSE results show a step change in oxygen concentration over the period 400-300Ma, with early Phanerzoic O\textsubscript{2} predicted to be around 0.2PAL. The GEOCARB system predicts no step change in O\textsubscript{2} over the Phanerzoic, and early Cambrian O\textsubscript{2} concentration is predicted to be close to present day.
3) Between 200-100Ma the GEOCARB model predicts oxygen lower than present day, dropping below 0.7PAL (~ 15% of the atmosphere). In contrast the COPSE model predicts oxygen concentration of above the present day value for this time.

4) The COPSE system produces oxygen predictions in antiphase with CO$_2$ for 550-300Ma, and in phase with CO$_2$ for 300-0Ma. GEOCARB shows no clear link between CO$_2$ and O$_2$.

### 2.7.2 Calculation of oxygen concentration

The GEOCARB and COPSE models estimate the change in oxygen concentration using an identical flux calculation, shown in equation 2.7.1.

\[
\frac{dO}{dt} = F_{bg} - F_{wg} + k (F_{bps} - F_{wps})
\]  

(2.7.1)

Here $F_{bg}$ and $F_{bps}$ are the burial fluxes of organic carbon and pyrite sulphur respectively, and $F_{wg}$, $F_{wps}$ denote weathering of the organic carbon and pyrite sulphur reservoirs (see figure 2.2.1). Burial of these reduced species oxidises the surface system, whilst weathering of reduced species in the crust takes up oxygen from the atmosphere and ocean. The constant $k$ represents the amount of oxygen taken up or released during the weathering and burial of pyrite sulphur. GEOCARB takes the value $\frac{15}{8}$ based on the stoichiometry of the burial and weathering reactions (Berner and Canfield, 1989) whilst COPSE simplifies this to 2 (changing between these values in the model runs has a negligible effect on predicted oxygen concentration). The observed differences in oxygen concentration must lie in the calculation of the fluxes $F_{bg}$, $F_{bps}$, $F_{wg}$, $F_{wps}$.

### 2.7.3 Method for calculating organic burial in GEOCARB

The GEOCARB method follows very closely previously described isotope mass balance modelling techniques, in which the isotope records of carbon and sulphur are used to aid calculation of the organic burial rates (Berner, 1987, 2001). The method was originally proposed by Garrels and Lerman (1984), who estimated changes in seawater sulphate concentration from the $\delta^{34}$S record of evaporate gypsum. The overall mass of each carbon and sul-
Phosphorus isotope must be conserved, and assuming the long term balance of the cycles of carbon and sulphur gives the following equations:

\[(\delta_A - \alpha_A) \cdot F_{bg} + \delta_A F_{bc} = \delta G \cdot F_{wg} + \delta C \cdot F_{wc} + \delta C \cdot F_{mc}\] (2.7.2)

\[(\delta_S - \alpha_S) \cdot F_{bps} + \delta_S F_{bgs} = \delta_{PYR} \cdot F_{wps} + \delta_{GYP} \cdot F_{mps} + \delta_{GYP} \cdot F_{mgs}\] (2.7.3)

where \(\delta_A, \delta_G \) and \(\delta_C\) are the \(\delta^{13}C\) values for the reservoirs A, G and C respectively, and \(\delta_S, \delta_{PYR}\) and \(\delta_{GYP}\) are the \(\delta^{34}S\) values for the reservoirs S, PYR and GYP respectively. \(\alpha_A\) and \(\alpha_S\) are the fractionation effects associated with organic carbon burial and pyrite sulphur burial respectively.

Knowledge of the input fluxes to the surface system and isotopic fractionation of the reservoirs A and S therefore allows calculation of the burial fluxes \(F_{bg}\) and \(F_{bps}\). To solve the equations requires the assumption that the carbon and sulphur cycles are at steady state, hence \(F_{bg} = F_{wg} + F_{mg}\) and the equivalent expressions for the other crustal boxes in figure 2.2.1. Equations 2.7.2 and 2.7.3 then reduce to:

\[F_{bg} = \frac{1}{\alpha_A} ((\delta_A - \delta_G) \cdot (F_{wg} + F_{mg}) + (\delta_A - \delta_C) \cdot (F_{wc} + F_{mc}))\] (2.7.4)

\[F_{bps} = \frac{1}{\alpha_S} ((\delta_S - \delta_{PYR}) \cdot (F_{wps} + F_{mps}) + (\delta_S - \delta_{GYP}) \cdot (F_{wgs} + F_{mgs}))\] (2.7.5)

In GEOCARB, \(\delta_A\) and \(\delta_S\) are prescribed as model forcings, following the geological record of \(\delta^{13}C\) and \(\delta^{34}S\). The isotopic composition of the other reservoirs is allowed to vary during the model run, thus allowing a semi-dynamic calculation of organic burial rates. Unlike earlier isotope mass balance models (Garrels and Lerman, 1984; Berner, 2001), the size of the material reservoirs is allowed to change over time in the GEOCARB analysis. However, this does not cause significantly different oxygen predictions to the original works (see fig 17 in Berner (2006a) for a comparison), which closely
follow the shape of the carbon isotope record used for forcing. High values in the $\delta^{13}C$ record translate to increased organic carbon burial by increasing the value of $\delta_A$ in equation 2.7.4. The same is true of the sulphur system, and the production flux of oxygen is also influenced by pyrite burial, however the present day burial rate of organic carbon is around an order of magnitude greater than the burial rate of pyrite, meaning that there is less contribution from the $\delta^{34}S$ record.

Additional assumptions are required to allow for sensible oxygen predictions via the isotope mass balance method (Kump and Garrels, 1986). The GEOCARB models explore both ‘rapid recycling’ between the atmosphere/ocean and younger rock reservoirs, and a dependence of fractionation effects on oxygen concentration. Figure 2.7.12 shows the rapid recycling system from Berner (1987), which is also used in GEOCARB. Each crustal reservoir is split into a ‘young’ and ‘ancient’ partition, young reservoirs undergo more rapid weathering and are smaller than the ancient reservoirs, thus are responsible for the majority of interaction with the surface system. Whilst this does not change the overall fluxes of carbon and sulphur, it leads to changes in isotopic fractionation, amplifying any isotopic signals. In the event of an atmospheric positive isotopic excursion, for instance, the young reservoirs will quickly become isotopically heavy and will ‘rapidly recycle’ this signal back to the atmosphere via weathering and degassing, leading to an amplification of the original excursion. Without rapid recycling, the signal would be diluted by the large crustal reservoir size. When the isotope mass balance model is applied to the rapid recycling scheme, the resulting estimates for organic carbon and pyrite sulphur burial are lower than for the original scheme (Berner, 1987). With a higher rate of recycling, a lower burial rate is inferred from the same $\delta^{13}C$ curve.
Figure 2.7.12: Rapid recycling diagram from Berner (1987). S and C denote atmosphere/ocean sulphate and carbon respectively. F describes a flux, with the subscript numbers defining the flux direction. Here Y represents fluxes of young rock, A represents fluxes of ancient rock.

Lack of negative feedback in isotope mass balance models leads to unrealistic oxygen predictions, even with the addition of rapid recycling (see fig 2 in Berner (2001)). An important feedback added to the GEOCARB isotope mass balance model is the dependence of isotopic fractionation on oxygen concentration. High oxygen levels are associated with increased plant photospiration (Jackson and Volk, 1970), which would allow CO$_2$ to build up in the plant cell and could lead to increased isotopic fractionation, which is observed under high O$_2$ in laboratory studies (Berner et al., 2000). In GEOCARB, the parameters $J$ and $n$ are added to represent the dependence of isotopic fractionation on $pO_2$. 
\[ \alpha_c = 30 + J \left( \frac{O_2}{O_2(0)} - 1 \right) \]  
(2.7.6)

\[ \alpha_s = 35 \left( \frac{O_2}{O_2(0)} \right)^n \]  
(2.7.7)

Here \( \alpha_c \) denotes the isotopic difference between carbonate carbon and organic carbon in per mille (\( \%_{\text{oo}} \)). Similarly \( \alpha_s \) denotes the difference between pyrite and gypsum sulphur. A sensitivity analysis is preformed on these parameters in Berner (2001), finding that in addition to the rapid recycling scheme, values of \( J = 3, n = 1 \) are required to prevent negative results for \( O_2 \). The latest GEOCARB model uses \( J = 4, n = 1.5 \).

![Figure 2.7.13: Strength of rapid recycling feedback in GEOCARB.](image)

To analyse the sensitivity of the GEOCARB system, it is modified to effectively nullify the rapid recycling scheme: The weathering rates of the
young and ancient reservoirs are altered so that they are weighted by reservoir mass. In figure 2.7.13 the model is run for different choices of \( J \) and \( n \), with the rapid recycling scheme switched on or off. The figure shows that realistic oxygen concentration in the model is not possible without the negative feedback provided by oxygen-dependent fractionation (controlled by parameters \( J \) and \( n \)). The rapid recycling scheme adds further negative feedback but is not strictly required for sensible predictions, although the maximum of \( \sim 0.4 \text{atm} \) produced in this case is higher than believed possible due to the increased rate of biosphere burning at this concentration (Watson and Lovelock, (in press), which would be expected to drastically limit the oxygen source from organic burial (Kump, 1988; Lenton, 2000).

Both the rapid recycling scheme and the isotope fractionation parameters \( J \) and \( n \) apply negative feedback to the system, which brings the oxygen predictions closer to the present day level. Another possibility is shown in figure 2.7.14, here the \( \delta^{13}\text{C} \) record used for the calculation in the GEOCARB model is smoothed, producing a similar effect to the negative feedbacks. This figure also highlights the strong dependence of predicted oxygen concentration on the carbon isotope record. Running the model with constant isotope fractionation results in constant oxygen concentration (at 21%), highlighting a potential problem with extending this method further back in time than the Phanerozoic - the \( \delta^{13}\text{C} \) record has remained remarkably stable throughout the whole of Earth history (Shields and Veizer, 2002) and would imply relatively stable oxygen concentration by this method, however it is widely believed that oxygen concentration has varied by many orders of magnitude (Scott et al., 2008; Papineau et al., 2007). The solution to this apparent long-term inconsistency may require the consideration of additional fractionation effects in the carbon cycle (e.g. Bjerrum and Canfield (2004)).
Figure 2.7.14: Effect of smoothing isotope records in GEOCARB. a, Gaussian kernel smoothing with $\sigma = 1$ and $\sigma = 3$ applied to isotope record, which is used as a forcing in GEOCARB. b, Model results for $\text{RO}_2$ subject to forcing.

2.7.4 Method for calculating organic burial in COPSE

Burial of organic carbon and pyrite in COPSE is based on an assumed biological productivity, which is calculated form the other model variables. New production scales linearly with concentration of limiting nutrient, and the sedimentation rate is assumed proportional to the square of the new production rate (see Lenton and Watson (2000a,b) and references within). Ocean nutrients nitrate and phosphate are modelled in the same way as the carbon and sulphur species, with fluxes controlling their production and removal from the surface system estimated from the present day rates and assumed dependences on model forcings and variables. Input of ocean phosphate from
weathering is calculated based on analogy to silicate, carbonate and oxidative weathering fluxes, following Vancappellen and Ingall (1994); VanCappellen and Ingall (1996). Removal of phosphate from the ocean by burial is dependent on the rate of new production and the carbon to phosphorous ratio of organic matter. Input of nitrite is assumed to depend on the rate of nitrogen fixation, with outputs via denitrification and organic nitrate burial. The nutrient feedbacks used in COPSE are shown in figure 2.3.2. This scheme provides a simple mechanistic understanding of the nutrient and oxygen cycles that responds to changes in other model parameters, forming a closed system that requires minimal biological forcings. However, this requires a number of assumptions both in the weathering and burial fluxes, and the exact relationships between ocean nutrient and burial of organic material are uncertain (Berner, 2006a).

Figure 2.7.5 shows the effects of perturbation experiments in COPSE. The model is run in the standard manner, but all forcing functions are held constant at present day values for the entire run. At 200Ma a single forcing is doubled to observe the effects on both CO$_2$ and O$_2$. In figure 2.7.5a, the uplift rate (U) is doubled at 200Ma, which acts to enhance global weathering rates. Increased weathering of silicates draws down CO$_2$ until the system is stabilized at a lower CO$_2$ concentration. The weathering spike during the switch between stable states causes a brief increase in nutrient delivery, however oxygen concentration can be seen to fall in the figure. This is because the uplift rate also increases the rate of oxidative weathering on land - which draws down oxygen until the limitation on weathering due to low oxygen compensates for the increased uplift, and the system is balanced. Figure 2.7.5b shows the effects of a two fold increase in volcanic degassing (D) at 200Ma. This increases the volcanic CO$_2$ source, and atmospheric concentration rises. The system becomes stable once atmospheric CO$_2$ has reached such a level that the temperature-dependent CO$_2$ burial flux is equal to the degassing rate. The higher global weathering rates cause an increase in nutrient delivery, and in ocean nutrient concentration. This allows for a greater rate of organic carbon and pyrite burial, which increases the oxygen concentration. In 2.7.5c, the biotic weathering enhancement parameter W is doubled at 200Ma. W is only assumed to impact the weathering of silicates and carbonates, not oxidative weathering. The CO$_2$ response is very simi-
lar to figure 2.7.5a, due to the increased draw down via silicate weathering. However, without the associated increase in oxidative weathering, the additional nutrient delivery as the system readjusts causes only a small transient spike in oxygen concentration.

As with the GEOCARB system, it may be problematic relating the oxygen predictions of COPSE to time before the Phanerozoic. Degassing rates were likely several times higher than present day during the Proterozoic Eon (Franck and Bounama, 1997), which would imply greatly elevated organic carbon burial rates and oxygen concentration under the COPSE assumptions.

Figure 2.7.15: Effect of perturbations on CO$_2$ and O$_2$ COPSE model. All forcings are held at present day except for solar luminosity, forcings are applied for the period 200Ma-100Ma. a, Uplift is doubled. b, Degassing is doubled. c, Silicate/carbonate weathering is doubled. For all panels, solid line shows CO$_2$, dashed line shows O$_2$. 

38
2.7.5 Factors controlling model O₂ predictions

Figure 2.7.16 relates the oxygen predictions from COPSE (panel a-c) and GEOCARB (panel d-f) to the model processes and forcings which most impact the estimates. Burial of organic carbon is the major oxygen source, and it can be seen in both models that the predicted oxygen concentration follows very closely the calculated rate of organic carbon burial. The weaker oxygen source from pyrite burial, and the variation in the weathering and degassing sinks also impact the predictions, but do not exert significant control. The bottom panels attempt to distinguish the forcing functions that control the organic carbon burial rate in both models.

In COPSE, the rate of organic burial depends predominantly on three model forcings (figure 2.7.16c). The carbon-to-phosphorus burial ratio on land (∼1000 mol/mol) is greater than in the ocean (∼250 mol/mol), meaning the same nutrient supply results in greater rates of burial after the evolution of land plants (E). The beginning of land-based carbon burial causes the step change in oxygen concentration at around 350Ma in COPSE. An additional model forcing (CPland) doubles the carbon-to-phosphorus burial for the Permo-Carboniferous period, representing the abundance of coal swamps at this time (Bergman et al., 2004). This causes a significant transient peak in carbon burial, which then declines as the forcing is relaxed. The second carbon burial and oxygen peak at ∼100Ma is due primarily to the peak in the degassing forcing (D) at this time, and corresponds to the situation in fig b where degassing is doubled.

In GEOCARB, the rate of organic burial can be seen to follow the qualitative shape of the δ¹³C curve, as with other isotope mass balance models (Berner, 1987, 2001). Addition of strong negative feedbacks on burial rate results in O₂ predictions that stay close to present day concentration for the whole Phanerozoic. Low oxygen from 250-150Ma is observed in GEOCARB due to the drop in δ¹³C at this time, which leads to predictions of low organic carbon burial in the isotope mass balance system. This combines with low δ³⁴S and hence a predicted low rate of pyrite burial. In contrast, the low δ¹³C at the beginning of the Phanerozoic is countered by high fractionation in δ³⁴S at this time, which infers high rates of pyrite burial, keeping the overall oxygen production rate closer to the present day value.
Figure 2.7.16: Controlling factors for oxygen in COPSE (a-c) and GEOCARB (d-f). The oxygen predictions of the COPSE model (a) are heavily dependent on the organic carbon burial (b) which is itself controlled by the degassing, evolution and carbon-to-phosphorus burial ratio forcings (c). Oxygen in GEOCARB (d) also depends heavily on organic carbon burial (e), which in this model is closely related to the carbon isotope fractionation forcing (f).

2.7.6 Comparison to $O_2$ proxy data

There is little direct evidence for oxygen concentration in the geological record, and the evidence that exists usually can only determine order of magnitude changes (e.g. Farquhar et al. (2000); Scott et al. (2008)). The majority of Phanerozoic oxygen predictions therefore come from modelling
investigations such as GEOCARB and COPSE. The key Phanerozoic O$_2$ proxy is undoubtedly the geological charcoal record, as the presence of charcoal signifies that sufficient oxygen was present for the biosphere to burn. Because charcoal has only been found for the period 400-0Ma, it is thought that during this time oxygen has remained above at least 0.13atm (Jones and Chaloner, 1991), and perhaps above 0.17atm (Belcher and J.C., 2008; Belcher et al., 2010). As well as defining this ‘fire window’, predictions for oxygen concentration can be made based on the abundance of inertinite (fossilised charcoal from wildfires (Scott and Glasspool, 2007)).

The O$_2$ predictions of Glasspool and Scott (2010) are shown in figure 2.7.17, alongside the model predictions from GEOCARB and COPSE. The inertinite predictions group in the range 0.2-0.3atm for the majority of the 400Myr sample, which is broadly similar to the biogeochemical model outputs. The inertinite-based predictions do not support the low O$_2$ concentration predicted by GEOCARB for 200-100Ma, or the high O$_2$ predicted by COPSE for the Cenozoic. However this does not directly falsify either GEOCARB or COPSE, the authors assume that atmospheric O$_2$ is a function of the abundance of inertinite in rock (inert%), calibrated using the assumed Phanerozoic fire window and a power law relationship (Glasspool and Scott, 2010). Whilst this gives an understandable relationship and a useful reconstruction of oxygen, it is likely that inert% is actually a much more complex function of both climatic conditions and biospheric attributes which define the fuel load and type.

The absence of sedimentary charcoal before 400Ma is attributed to the absence of higher plants, rather than specifically a lack of oxygen, however recent analysis of Mo isotopes and the Mo content of rocks does suggest that a step change in oxygen concentration may have occurred at around 400Ma (Dahl et al., 2010). This is a feature of both the inertinite model and COPSE. A reconstruction of Phanerozoic oxygen from the abundances of organic matter in rocks again shows a similar broad result to GEOCARB and COPSE, with pronounced oxygen peaks at around 300Ma and 100Ma (Berner and Canfield, 1989). This model does agree with the lower Mesozoic oxygen concentration predicted by GEOCARB.
Figure 2.7.17: Phanerozoic oxygen reconstructed from charcoal record. The ‘best guess’ Phanerozoic O$_2$ curve from Glasspool and Scott (2010) is shown in grey, alongside COPSE (solid black line) and GEOCARB (dashed black line) model predictions.

Belcher et al. (2010) measured fire propagation under different concentrations of oxygen to calculate a relationship between oxygen concentration and the ‘burn probability’ of the biosphere as a function of atmospheric O$_2$. Figure 2.7.18 shows the estimated burn probability throughout the Phanerozoic under the oxygen predictions of the COPSE model (panel A) and GEOCARBSULFvolc model (panel B), these are plotted against the number of burn events recorded in the charcoal record. Very low O$_2$ predicted by GEOCARB for 200-100Ma is again shown incompatible with observed burn events. However, neither model shows a strong fit to these results.
Figure 2.7.18: Burn probability throughout the Phanerozoic. a, Calculated from oxygen prediction of COPSE. b, Calculated from oxygen prediction of GEOCARB. Black dashed lines show interquartile range, grey dashed line shows lower 95% quartile. Also shown are the number of burn events per 10Ma (top) and the inertinite record from ref (Glasspool and Scott, 2010).
2.8 Chapter conclusions

2.8.1 Main findings

The COPSE and GEOCARB models represent extensions of the same basic system, meaning that they have many similarities. Both models are based on the 3-box carbon cycle described by Berner (Berner, 1991), and include the same 3-box system for sulphur species. Concentrations of oxygen, carbon dioxide and ocean sulphate are calculated by the same methods, which sum the source and sink fluxes between the hydrosphere and the crust.

The key difference between the models is the method of calculating burial of organic carbon and pyrite sulphur. COPSE assumes the burial fluxes are related to ocean nutrient and incorporates the ocean nutrient model of Lenton and Watson (2000a). GEOCARB does not resolve nutrient concentration and instead infers burial fluxes from the isotopic record of carbon and sulphur, incorporating a previously described isotope mass balance model to do this (Berner, 2001). GEOCARB also uses a larger set of abiotic forcings than COPSE, but this is shown not to significantly alter results over the simpler set (see fig 2.6.5). The addition of biological feedbacks in COPSE gives increased negative feedback on CO\textsubscript{2} concentration, allowing less variation in CO\textsubscript{2} than GEOCARB.

Long term predictions for CO\textsubscript{2} concentration in both models are dominated by the weathering enhancement associated with the evolution of vascular plants, leading to predictions of high (> 10PAL) CO\textsubscript{2} before 350Ma, falling to close to present day thereafter. This assumption leads to the prediction of very high global temperatures for the early Phanerozoic, around 5°C warmer than today. These predictions are somewhat inconsistent with glaciations in the Cambrian and Ordovician, although sufficient model forcing (for example, attributed to the evolution of pre-vascular plants (Lenton et al., 2012)) may still drive temperatures sufficiently low for glaciation at this time. Proxy data for CO\textsubscript{2} is well replicated by both models for 350Ma to present, data before this period is sparse and may show elevated CO\textsubscript{2} levels, however the agreement between different proxies is generally poor, and some CO\textsubscript{2} proxy methods imply that CO\textsubscript{2} was relatively close to present day levels throughout the Phanerozoic.

Critically, the oxygen predictions for both models represent damped ver-
sions of the assumed organic carbon and pyrite burial fluxes, and are predominantly controlled by the organic carbon burial flux. Control in these models is placed on the production fluxes of O$_2$, rather than the sinks, which in general constitute simple negative feedback mechanisms and vary in response to O$_2$ concentration. Because the models use different methods to calculate the organic burial rates, predictions for Phanerozoic O$_2$ differ significantly. The O$_2$ predictions from GEOCARB are dominated by the shape of the $\delta^{13}$C curve, and the COPSE predictions are controlled by the assumed plant evolution and degassing rate forcings. However, there is no detailed and easily applicable proxy with which to test these predictions, and perhaps with the exception of the low Mesozoic O$_2$ in the GEOCARB model, both models adequately satisfy the available oxygen constraints imposed by the abundance of fossilised charcoal.

2.8.2 Considerations for developing a minimal model

The next chapter will focus on building a minimal model of the important processes in Phanerozoic biogeochemistry, which will be used to explore possibilities for Precambrian climate. Following the analysis in this chapter, the following decisions about the model construction can be made:

1) The additional abiotic forcings included in the later GEOCARB models are not required for a minimal model. Their impact on predictions is smaller than the uncertainty in other major forcings.

2) The model must allow for calculation of organic burial via either a nutrient system or via isotope mass balance. Both methods produce encouraging results for Phanerozoic O$_2$ and require testing on a longer timescale.

3) It is highly likely that there are processes important in the Precambrian that are not expressed in these models, therefore the new model framework must be versatile and modular to allow for easy adaption.
3 Modelling the Precambrian carbon cycle

3.1 Introduction

Broadly speaking, both the COPSE and GEOCARB models produce sensible results for the changes in major atmospheric constituents over the Phanerozoic, and are backed up by the majority of available data. The only major disagreement is in the abundance of oxygen, but here the scale of the differences is smaller than can easily be validated by proxies. The intention in this thesis is to apply these analyses to the Precambrian by constructing a minimal model of the important processes. In this chapter a model is described and validated for the Phanerozoic against COPSE and GEOCARB. The model is then run from 900Ma to the present day and compared to available proxies. To inform the model construction, a short review of Neoproterozoic climate is necessary.

3.2 Neoproterozoic climate

The Neoproterozoic era (1000-541Ma) is characterised by massive worldwide glaciation (Halverson et al., 2005; Kirschvink, 1992), periodic perturbations to the carbon cycle (Johnston et al., 2012) and an oxygenation event in the deep ocean (Canfield et al., 2008). The timing of the oxidation and glacial events are reasonably well constrained (Macdonald et al., 2010; Scott et al., 2008), but the specific dynamics of oxygen, greenhouse gas and temperature variations are uncertain.

In figure 3.2.1 the glacial paleolatitude reconstruction of Royer et al. (2004) is extended to include the estimated timing and paleolatitudes of glaciations in the Neoproterozoic (from Hoffman and Li (2009); Condon et al. (2005); Halverson et al. (2005); Zhang et al. (2009)). The Kaigas glaciation at ∼750Ma is shown in a lighter grey, reflecting uncertainty about its global significance (Macdonald et al., 2010). Other light grey sections denote the uncertainties in the extent of the Sturtian (ending at ∼700Ma) and Marinoan (ending at ∼635Ma) glaciations. It has been suggested that these two glaciations may be examples of ‘snowball Earth’ events (Kirschvink, 1992; Hoffman et al., 1998), in which positive feedback between planetary ice cover and albedo causes ice sheets to reach the equator, locking the planet into a
high albedo state. This state would persist until sufficient volcanic CO$_2$ had accumulated in the atmosphere to trigger melting, which would be expected to take $\sim 10^7$ years (Le Hir et al., 2008). Glacial evidence has been found at very low paleolatitudes for both glacial periods, and the inferred durations from the isotope record of carbon are similar to those predicted in the snowball scenario. However these observations may be equally well explained by a series of large glaciations happening over each period (Allen and Etienne, 2008). The Gaskiers glaciation (580Ma) is well constrained and it is unlikely that it extended to low latitudes, although there is some data that suggests this may be a possibility (Hoffman and Li, 2009).

To trigger the severe glaciations in the Neoproterozoic era, global average surface temperature must have been significantly lower than today, perhaps around 10°C (Hoffman and Schrag, 2002). CO$_2$ concentration during the Neoproterozoic must have therefore been sufficiently low to allow for these temperatures, although the trigger for the events may not have been CO$_2$ related (Pavlov et al., 2003). Estimates for Neoproterozoic CO$_2$ concentration have been made by using an isotope model to account for changes in the marine carbon reservoir size (Kah and Bartley, 2004), the results show CO$_2$ concentration...
declining from $\sim 10$PAL to $\sim 1$PAL over the era, which correlates broadly with glaciation in the late Neoproterozoic.

The deep ocean was likely anoxic and ferruginous throughout the Neoproterozoic era, with some surface oxygenation in the late Neoproterozoic and deep ocean ventilation occurring after the Gaskiers glaciation (580Ma) (Canfield et al., 2007; Scott et al., 2008; Frei et al., 2009). During the earlier Proterozoic, the ocean was anoxic and may have been euxinic (sulphidic and anoxic) (Canfield, 1998). Figure 3.2.2 shows a summary of late Neoproterozoic ocean conditions based on data for the speciation of iron in sedimentary rocks (Canfield et al., 2008). In sediments deposited under oxic conditions, a smaller fraction of the total iron exists in a chemically reactive form (Raiswell and Canfield, 1998), allowing estimation of local redox conditions using the ratio of highly reactive iron (FeHR) to total Fe. Calculating the proportion of FeHR bound as sulphide also allows some distinction between ferruginous and euxinic conditions. These data show possible surface ocean oxygenation throughout the Neoproterozoic, with the oxygenation of the deep ocean occurring around the time of the Gaskiers glaciation.

**Figure 3.2.2: Ocean chemical conditions as described in ref (Canfield et al., 2008).** Solid blocks represent distinct evidence for chemical conditions, dashed lines represent uncertainty. Neoproterozoic glaciations shown as vertical grey bars.

Enrichments of the redox-sensitive metal, molybdenum (Mo) in euxinic black shales also suggest ocean oxygenation occurring around 663-551Ma. Figure 3.2.3 shows this enrichment in ppm throughout earth history, which is proposed to represent changes in the input flux from oxidative weathering of the continents (Scott et al., 2008). Note the displayed Mo enrichment earlier
in the Precambrian agrees with many other lines of evidence that describe
the ‘Great Oxidation Event’ at 2.4Ga (Holland, 2006; Farquhar et al., 2000;
Catling et al., 2001; Kasting, 2001). An isotope mass balance model based on
the $\delta^{98}$Mo values of euxinic sediments also supports oxygenation at 580Ma
(Dahl et al., 2010).

Figure 3.2.3: Mo enrichment in black shales. Black circles are from euxinic
environments, grey diamonds are from non-euxinic, organic-rich shales. Figure
copied from Scott et al. (2008). Stages 1, 2 and 3 represent stepwise process of
planetary oxygenation proposed by the authors. Note the x-axis in this figure is
reversed when compared to the other figures in this work.

Whilst there are some quantitative estimates for Neoproterozoic CO$_2$, the
above oxygen proxies do not allow a similar prediction, instead focussing on
the major changes in redox state. Radiation of sulphide-oxidising bacteria,
and the accompanying increase in sulphur isotope fractionation, is thought to
be the result of atmospheric oxygen concentration increasing above a thresh-
hold of about $\sim$ 0.05 – 0.2PAL during the Neoproterozoic era (Canfield and
Teske, 1996). Earlier Proterozoic oxygen concentration has been constrained
using paleosol data to $\geq$ 0.03 atm (0.15PAL) (Rye and Holland, 1998). The
Ediacaran biota, which appear at $\sim$570Ma, have an estimated minimum oxy-
gen requirement of 0.01PAL (Runnegar, 1991), whilst the physiological oxy-
gen requirement for Cambrian animals is proposed to be $> 0.1$PAL (Rhoads
and Morse, 1971). A rough estimation of oxygen concentration based on
these combined proxies gives 0.01 – 0.2PAL for the early Neoproterozoic.
After 580Ma the deep ocean becomes oxygenated and atmospheric O$_2$ con-
concentration rises to between 0.05 – 1PAL. A model for the Neoproterozoic carbon and sulphur cycles should allow for oxygen concentration within the expected range of 0.01 – 1PAL, as well as global average surface temperature $\leq \sim 10^\circ$C.

3.3 Model development

3.3.1 Box scheme and reservoir calculations

A box model is now developed and follows directly the GEOCARB and COPSE formulation (Berner, 1991), using the reservoir and flux definitions from chapter 2, shown in figure 2.2.1. The system equations are shown below:

**Carbon cycle**

Carbon can exist as CO$_2$ in the atmosphere/ocean box (A), and either oxidised carbonate (C) or reduced organic carbon (G) in the crust. Following fig 2.2.1, changes in the reservoirs over time are calculated by summing sources and sinks via weathering, degassing and burial.

\[
\frac{dA}{dt} = F_{mg} + F_{wg} + F_{mc} + F_{wc} - F_{bg} - F_{bc} \tag{3.3.1}
\]

\[
\frac{dG}{dt} = F_{bg} - F_{mg} - F_{wg} \tag{3.3.2}
\]

\[
\frac{dC}{dt} = F_{bc} - F_{mc} - F_{wc} \tag{3.3.3}
\]

**Sulphur cycle**

Sulphur exists in the model as marine sulphate in the atmosphere/ocean box (S), and either oxidised gypsum (GYP) or reduced pyrite (PYR) in the crust. Again following fig 2.2.1 we have:

\[
\frac{dS}{dt} = F_{wps} + F_{wgs} - F_{bps} - F_{bgs} + F_{mps} + F_{mgs} \tag{3.3.4}
\]

\[
\frac{dPYR}{dt} = F_{bps} - F_{wps} - F_{mps} \tag{3.3.5}
\]

\[
\frac{dGYP}{dt} = F_{bgs} - F_{wgs} - F_{mgs} \tag{3.3.6}
\]
3.3.2 Phanerozoic forcings

A subset of the model forcings from the GEOCARB and COPSE models is used, aiming to include the most relevant forcings without overcomplicating the model. To begin with, forcings are only prescribed for the Phanerozoic, following exactly from GEOCARB and COPSE. The current models use a different formulation to express weathering enhancement due to vascular plants, which does not significantly impact results (see figure 2.6.5), for the minimal model the COPSE formulation is chosen. GEOCARB and COPSE also use a different expression for global temperature dependence on solar luminosity and CO$_2$ concentration, however these return very similar values for the parameter ranges that are covered in model runs. For this model I use the change in solar luminosity, and energy balance temperature approximation described by Caldeira and Kasting (Caldeira and Kasting, 1992), as used in COPSE. Model forcings are outlined in the tables below, following the functions and naming conventions from figure 2.4.3. The model is run using a general forcing set in conjunction with either the COPSE or GEOCARB biological forcing set.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Symbol</th>
<th>Source</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Uplift rate</td>
<td>$U$</td>
<td>GEOCARB,COPSE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Degassing rate</td>
<td>$D$</td>
<td>GEOCARB,COPSE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Burial depth of carbonates</td>
<td>$B$</td>
<td>GEOCARB,COPSE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Biotic weathering enhancement</td>
<td>$W$</td>
<td>COPSE ($\approx fE$ in GEOCARB)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Solar luminosity</td>
<td>$S$</td>
<td>COPSE</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Table 1:** General forcings for Minimal Model

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Symbol</th>
<th>Source</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Evolution of vascular plants</td>
<td>$E$</td>
<td>COPSE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C-P burial ratio on land</td>
<td>$CPland$</td>
<td>COPSE</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Table 2:** Additional forcings for COPSE productivity system
Table 3: Additional forcings for GEOCARB productivity system

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Symbol</th>
<th>Source</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Atmospheric carbon  $\delta^{13}$C</td>
<td>$\delta_A$</td>
<td>GEOCARB</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ocean sulphate $\delta^{34}$S</td>
<td>$\delta_S$</td>
<td>GEOCARB</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

3.3.3 Weathering dependencies and fluxes

Silicate weathering

The expression for the dependence of silicate weathering on temperature and $\text{CO}_2$ concentration is shared by COPSE and GEOCARB. To increase robustness to temperature the derivation of Berner (1994) is followed without making the assumption of temperature close to present day. The linear runoff formulation used in the original models becomes invalid when temperature is very low, and is amended by approximation with an exponential term. The resulting equation is:

$$f_{\text{silw}} = e^{(k_{fs1} \frac{T - T_0}{770})} \left(e^{k_{fs2} (T - T_0)}\right)^{0.65} \sqrt{\text{RCO}_2}$$  (3.3.7)

here $k_{fs1} = 7537.69$ and $k_{fs2} = 0.03$. $T$ is average surface temperature in Kelvin, $T_0$ is present day average surface temperature and $\text{RCO}_2$ denotes concentration of $\text{CO}_2$ normalised to pre-industrial concentration. The dependence on $\text{RCO}_2$ for pre-vascular plants is added, but the alteration of this term in the mid Phanerozoic is left out for simplicity.

Carbonate weathering

The expressions for weathering of carbonates and oxidised sulphur are also taken from the GEOCARB and COPSE models, again the original linear term is approximated by an exponential to prevent collapse at low temperature:

$$f_{\text{carbw}} = e^{k_{fc} T} \sqrt{\text{RCO}_2}$$  (3.3.8)

where $k_{fc} = 0.05$. 

53
Oxidative weathering

Oxidative weathering of reduced organic carbon and pyrite sulphur is allowed a dependence on O$_2$ concentration as follows:

$$f_{oxidw} = (RO_2)^a$$

(3.3.9)

here RO$_2$ is the atmospheric oxygen concentration normalised to present. Dependence on oxygen concentration (Lasaga and Ohmoto, 2002) is used in COPSE, but not in GEOCARB. In the minimal model, $a$ is allowed to take the value of 0.5 (Lasaga and Ohmoto, 2002) when the COPSE productivity system is used, or a null-dependence of $a = 0$ when the GEOCARB system is used (Berner, 2006a).

Full weathering fluxes

The dependences above are multiplied by the appropriate forcing functions and the size of the flux at present day to arrive at the full flux equation. As in both previous models (Berner, 1994; Bergman et al., 2004), all weathering fluxes are assumed to depend on the uplift rate, $U$. Silicate and carbonate weathering are assumed to be influenced by an enhancement due to the evolution of land plants, $W$, and the rates of weathering for the crustal reservoirs are assumed to depend on reservoir size. The weathering flux equations are thus:

$$silw = k_{silw} \cdot (k_{preplant} + (1 - k_{preplant})W) \cdot U \cdot f_{silw}$$

(3.3.10)

$$carbw = k_{carbw} \cdot (k_{preplant} + (1 - k_{preplant})W) \cdot U \cdot f_{carbw}$$

(3.3.11)

$$oxidw = k_{oxidw} \cdot U \cdot \frac{G}{G_0} \cdot f_{oxidw}$$

(3.3.12)

$$pyrw = k_{pyrw} \cdot U \cdot \frac{PYR}{PYR_0} \cdot f_{oxidw}$$

(3.3.13)

$$gypw = k_{gypw} \cdot U \cdot \frac{GYP}{GYP_0} \cdot f_{carbw}$$

(3.3.14)
Here $\text{silw} = \text{silicate weathering}$, $\text{carbw} = \text{carbonate weathering}$, $\text{oxidw} = \text{oxidative weathering}$, $\text{pyrw} = \text{pyrite weathering}$ and $\text{gyp} = \text{gypsum weathering}$. $k_{\text{silw}}$, $k_{\text{carbw}}$, $k_{\text{oxidw}}$, $k_{\text{pyrw}}$ and $k_{\text{gypw}}$ denote the present day flux sizes in moles per year. $G$, $C$, $PYR$, $GYP$ are the sizes of the crustal reservoirs. $k_{\text{preplant}}$ denotes the reduced weathering efficiency before vascular plants (equivalent to $k_{15}$ in COPSE, or $k_{\text{LIFE}}$ in GEOCARB), and represents $1/k_{\text{vp}}$, where $k_{\text{vp}}$ is the vascular plant weathering enhancement factor.

### 3.3.4 Metamorphic/degassing fluxes

Degassing fluxes are assumed to depend only on the global rate of degassing, $D$, and the relative crustal abundance of each species. Carbonate degassing is assumed to increase in the Mesozoic following the carbonate-burial depth forcing $B$, as in both the previous models.

\[
\text{ocdeg} = k_{\text{ocdeg}} \cdot D \cdot \frac{G}{G_0} \quad (3.3.15)
\]

\[
\text{ccdeg} = k_{\text{ccdeg}} \cdot D \cdot B \cdot \frac{C}{C_0} \quad (3.3.16)
\]

\[
\text{pyrdeg} = k_{\text{pyrdeg}} \cdot D \cdot \frac{PYR}{PYR_0} \quad (3.3.17)
\]

\[
\text{gypdeg} = k_{\text{gypdeg}} \cdot D \cdot \frac{GYP}{GYP_0} \quad (3.3.18)
\]

Where $\text{ocdeg} = \text{organic carbon degassing}$, $\text{ccdeg} = \text{carbonate carbon degassing}$, $\text{pyrdeg} = \text{pyrite degassing}$, $\text{gypdeg} = \text{gypsum degassing}$. Constants $k_{\text{ocdeg}}$ and $k_{\text{ccdeg}}$, $k_{\text{pyrdeg}}$ and $k_{\text{gypdeg}}$ are the present day degassing fluxes for organic carbon and carbonates, pyrite sulphur and gypsum.

### 3.3.5 Burial of oxidised species

Following both previous models, I assume that over long timescales, all the carbon delivered to the ocean via silicate and carbonate weathering is deposited as marine carbonates. Thus:

\[
\text{mccb} = \text{silw} + \text{carbw} \quad (3.3.19)
\]
The expression for deposition of gypsum sulphur allows dependence on the size of the marine sulphate reservoir (Rees, 1970):

\[
mgsb = k_{mgsb} \cdot \frac{S}{S_0}
\]  

(3.3.20)

Where \( k_{mgsb} \) is the present day burial flux.

### 3.3.6 Optional burial of reduced species via isotope mass balance

The method described in section 2.7.3 is implemented into the model as a set of optional extra equations. Burial of organic carbon and pyrite sulphur follow equations 2.7.4 and 2.7.5. They are subject to the isotope forcings \( \delta_A \) and \( \delta_S \) and the oxygen dependent fractionation effects \( \alpha_c \) and \( \alpha_s \) (shown in equations 2.7.6 and 2.7.7). Calculation of \( F_{bg} \) and \( F_{bps} \) via this method requires knowledge of the isotopic fractionation for the crustal reservoirs at each time step. This is achieved using the same method as employed by GEOCARBSULF (Berner, 2006a): for each reservoir, \( X \), the quantity \( X \cdot \delta^{13}C (X) \), expressing the size of the reservoir multiplied by its isotopic fractionation , is calculated. This is simpler than tracking the isotopic value explicitly, and can be divided by reservoir size to obtain the fractionation value. For simplicity, the rapid recycling scheme (Berner, 1987) is not used in this model.

### 3.3.7 Optional burial of reduced species via ocean nutrient model

For an alternative model solution, a simplified version of the COPSE nutrient system is employed. A single limiting nutrient is assumed and modelled as phosphate using the COPSE equations (Bergman et al., 2004; Vancappellen and Ingall, 1994; VanCappellen and Ingall, 1996). For nutrient weathering we have:

\[
phosw = k_{phosw} \left( \frac{2}{12} k_{silw} + \frac{5}{12} k_{carbw} + \frac{5}{12} k_{oxidw} \right)
\]  

(3.3.21)

where \( k_{phosw} \) is the present day rate of weathering. An assumed quantity of weathered nutrient (\( pland \)) is used by the land biota (if present), the remaining nutrient (\( psea \)) is transferred to the ocean.
\[ pland = k_{\text{landfrac}} \cdot VEG \cdot phosw \] (3.3.22)

\[ psea = phosw - pland \] (3.3.23)

Following COPSE, \( k_{\text{landfrac}} = 0.10345 \) is the present day fraction of weathered phosphate that is used on land, and \( VEG \) represents the relative mass of the terrestrial biosphere, a complex internal variable which depends on the concentration of \( O_2 \), \( CO_2 \) and the surface temperature and is derived from various previous works (Caldeira and Kasting, 1992; Volk, 1987; Fridovich, 1977; Lenton and Watson, 2000b). This includes a simple temperature relationship, \( VEG_T \), which assumes maximum productivity at 25\(^\circ\)C, a Michaelis-Menten type dependency on carbon dioxide concentration, \( VEG_{CO_2} \), and a linear representation of the effects of oxygen toxicity and increased rates of photorespiration. See the COPSE paper for full details (Bergman et al., 2004). As in COPSE, an approximation \( (VEG_{\text{fire}}) \) is added for damage to vegetation by wildfires based on oxygen concentration, and a dependence on the evolutionary forcing, \( E \), to represent lack of vegetation feedback before vascular plant proliferation.

\[ VEG = E \cdot VEG_{O_2} \cdot VEG_{CO_2} \cdot VEG_T \cdot VEG_{\text{fire}} \] (3.3.24)

\[ VEG_{O_2} = 2 \left( 1.5 - 0.5RO_2 \right) \] (3.3.25)

\[ VEG_{CO_2} = \frac{CO_2(\text{ppm}) - 10}{183.6 + CO_2(\text{ppm}) - 10} \] (3.3.26)

\[ VEG_T = 1 - \left( \frac{T - 298}{298} \right)^2 \] (3.3.27)

\[ VEG_{\text{fire}} = \frac{k_{\text{fire}}}{k_{\text{fire}} - 1 + \max \left( 586.2 \cdot RO_2 - 122.102, 0 \right)} \] (3.3.28)
Burial of organic carbon on land is now assumed proportional to the nutrient delivery to land, $pland$, and the carbon-to-phosphorus burial ratio for land plants, $CPland$.

$$locb = k_{locb} \cdot \frac{pland}{pland_0} \cdot CPland$$  \hspace{1cm} (3.3.29)

here $pland_0$ represents the present day flux of nutrient to the land biota and the forcing $CPland$ is also defined relative to present day (i.e. $CPland = 1$ for the present). Marine organic carbon burial is assumed to be proportional to the concentration of ocean phosphate, with the addition of a nonlinearity to account for increased burial in shelf regions, following Lenton and Watson (2000a):

$$mocb = k_{mocb} \left( \frac{P}{P_0} \right)^2$$  \hspace{1cm} (3.3.30)

Burial of pyrite is assumed to occur after bacterial sulphate reduction, and therefore depends on the concentration of marine sulphate (Holland, 1978; Holser et al., 1988) and the rate of organic carbon burial (Raiswell and Berner, 1986). A dependence on oxygen is also added to simulate the inhibition of these anaerobic organisms by increasing oxygen concentration (Berner and Canfield, 1989):

$$mpsb = k_{mpsb} \cdot \frac{S}{S_0} \cdot \frac{1}{\text{RO}_2} \cdot \frac{mocb}{mocb_0}$$  \hspace{1cm} (3.3.31)

Burial of nutrient follows the COPSE system for phosphate burial, assuming three removal pathways to mimic the weathering process: Calcium-associated burial ($capb$), iron-sorbed phosphate removal ($fepb$) and organic phosphate burial ($mopb$) (Vancappellen and Ingall, 1994; Holland, 1994; Broecker and Peng, 1982), with the following dependencies:

$$mopb = k_{mopb} \frac{mocb}{mocb_0}$$  \hspace{1cm} (3.3.32)

$$capb = k_{capb} \frac{mocb}{mocb_0}$$  \hspace{1cm} (3.3.33)
\[ f_{epb} = \frac{k_{epb}}{k_{oxfrac}} \left(1 - anox(O, P) \right) \] (3.3.34)

where \( anox \) is a function representing the degree of ocean anoxia:

\[ anox = 1 - k_{oxfrac} \left( \frac{O}{O_0} \right) \] (3.3.35)

here \( k_{oxfrac} = 0.86 \) is the present day oxic fraction.

### 3.3.8 Full model equations

These fluxes are now substituted into the carbon and sulphur cycle schematics shown in figure 2.2.1, allowing \( F_{bg} = mocb + locb \) (for the isotope mass balance model, it is assumed that the calculated organic burial reflects the sum of land and ocean burial), \( F_{bc} = silw + carbw \), \( F_{bps} = mopb \), \( F_{bgs} = mgsb \), \( F_{wg} = oxidw \), \( F_{wc} = carbw \), \( F_{wps} = pyrw \), \( F_{wgs} = gypw \), \( F_{mg} = ocdeg \), \( F_{mc} = ccdeg \). We now have the following set of ordinary differential equations:

\[
\frac{dA}{dt} = ocdeg + oxidw + ccdeg - mocb - locb - silw
\] (3.3.36)

\[
\frac{dG}{dt} = mocb + locb - ocdeg - oxidw
\] (3.3.37)

\[
\frac{dC}{dt} = silw - ccdeg
\] (3.3.38)

\[
\frac{dS}{dt} = pyrw + gypw - mpsb - mgsb
\] (3.3.39)

\[
\frac{dPYR}{dt} = mpsb - pyrw
\] (3.3.40)

\[
\frac{dGYP}{dt} = mgsb - gypw
\] (3.3.41)
And for ocean nutrient, P:

\[
\frac{dP}{dt} = psea - capb - fepb - mopb
\]  

(3.3.42)

Nutrient concentration is ignored if the isotope mass balance model is used. The size of the oxygen reservoir is calculated in the same manner as for the GEOCARB and COPSE models, taking the \( \frac{15}{8} \) multiplier from GEOCARB:

\[
\frac{dO}{dt} = mocb + locb - ocdeg - oxidw + \frac{15}{8} (mps - pyrw)
\]  

(3.3.43)

The constants required for this model are shown in table 4.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Meaning</th>
<th>Size</th>
<th>Source</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>$k_{silw}$</td>
<td>Present day silicate weathering rate</td>
<td>$6.65 \times 10^{12}$ mol C yr$^{-1}$</td>
<td>For steady state</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$k_{carbw}$</td>
<td>Present day carbonate weathering rate</td>
<td>$13.35 \times 10^{12}$ mol C yr$^{-1}$</td>
<td>GEOCARB, COPSE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$k_{oxidw}$</td>
<td>Present day oxidative weathering rate</td>
<td>$7.75 \times 10^{12}$ mol C yr$^{-1}$</td>
<td>For steady state</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$k_{phosw}$</td>
<td>Present day nutrient (P) weathering rate*</td>
<td>$4.35 \times 10^{10}$ mol P yr$^{-1}$</td>
<td>For steady state</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$k_{pyrw}$</td>
<td>Present day pyrite sulphur weathering rate</td>
<td>$0.45 \times 10^{12}$ mol S yr$^{-1}$</td>
<td>GEOCARB</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$k_{gypw}$</td>
<td>Present day gypsum sulphur weathering rate</td>
<td>$2 \times 10^{12}$ mol S yr$^{-1}$</td>
<td>GEOCARB</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$k_{ocdeg}$</td>
<td>Present day organic carbon degassing rate</td>
<td>$1.25 \times 10^{12}$ mol C yr$^{-1}$</td>
<td>GEOCARB, COPSE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$k_{ccdeg}$</td>
<td>Present day carbonate carbon degassing rate</td>
<td>$6.65 \times 10^{12}$ mol C yr$^{-1}$</td>
<td>GEOCARB, COPSE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$k_{pyrdeg}$</td>
<td>Present day pyrite sulphur degassing rate</td>
<td>$0.25 \times 10^{12}$ mol S yr$^{-1}$</td>
<td>GEOCARB</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$k_{gypdeg}$</td>
<td>Present day gypsum sulphur degassing rate</td>
<td>$0.5 \times 10^{12}$ mol S yr$^{-1}$</td>
<td>GEOCARB</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$k_{mocb}$</td>
<td>Present day marine organic carbon burial rate</td>
<td>$4.5 \times 10^{12}$ mol C yr$^{-1}$</td>
<td>COPSE*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$k_{locb}$</td>
<td>Present day land organic carbon burial rate</td>
<td>$4.5 \times 10^{12}$ mol C yr$^{-1}$</td>
<td>COPSE*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$k_{mpsb}$</td>
<td>Present day pyrite sulphur burial rate</td>
<td>$0.7 \times 10^{12}$ mol S yr$^{-1}$</td>
<td>For steady state</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$k_{mgsb}$</td>
<td>Present day gypsum sulphur burial rate</td>
<td>$2.5 \times 10^{12}$ mol S yr$^{-1}$</td>
<td>For steady state</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$k_{mphb}$</td>
<td>Present day marine organic phosphate burial</td>
<td>$1.8 \times 10^{10}$ mol P yr$^{-1}$</td>
<td>COPSE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$k_{capb}$</td>
<td>Present day Ca-associated phosphate burial*</td>
<td>$1.5 \times 10^{10}$ mol P yr$^{-1}$</td>
<td>COPSE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$k_{fepb}$</td>
<td>Present day Fe-associated phosphate burial*</td>
<td>$6 \times 10^{9}$ mol P yr$^{-1}$</td>
<td>COPSE</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 4: List of Minimal Model constants with sources, * denotes constants not required for isotope mass balance model
3.4 Validation against COPSE and GEOCARB models

The Minimal Model is now run through the Phanerozoic, with burial of reduced species either following the ocean nutrient model of COPSE, or the isotope mass balance model of GEOCARB. Results are plotted against the COPSE and GEOCARB runs, and are shown in figure 3.4.4. Following the original models, the assumed weathering enhancement due to vascular plant colonisation is set at 7 for comparisons to COPSE, and at 4 for comparisons to GEOCARB. For the COPSE runs, oxidative weathering is allowed a dependence on oxygen concentration (Lasaga and Ohmoto, 2002), for the GEOCARB runs this is removed, again following the original model set up.

When the simplified nutrient system is included, agreement with the COPSE model predictions for Phanerozoic CO$_2$ and O$_2$ are very strong (panel a,b). This is expected due to the degree of similarity between the Minimal Model and the COPSE system - the only major omission from the full COPSE model is the nitrate nutrient system, shown here to have minimal effect on model results. Allowing burial rates of reduced species to be calculated via an isotope mass balance model gives results for oxygen that are very close to the predictions of GEOCARBSULFvolc (Berner, 2009) (panel c,d). Differences arise because the minimal model does not include rapid recycling, or many of the abiotic forcings described in the full model. With the removal of negative feedback on oxygen, we would expect predictions to peak at higher values around 300Ma, however the removal of abiotic forcings acts to diminish this peak (see fig 17 of Berner (2006a)), cancelling the effect. Carbon dioxide predictions in the simple model follow the shape of the full model, but variation around long term steady state is reduced in the Minimal Model due to the smaller abiotic forcing set.
Figure 3.4.4: Minimal Model run for the Phanerozoic (black lines), plotted against previous model output (grey). a, Burial of organic carbon and pyrite sulphur controlled by nutrient system, plotted against COPSE model. b, Burial of organic carbon and pyrite sulphur controlled by isotope mass balance, plotted against GEOCARBSULFvolc.

It can be concluded that the minimal model includes the key processes that control predictions of O₂ and CO₂ concentration over the Phanerozoic, whilst representing a simplification over the models it is based on. The most useful feature of the model is its high modularity - the timeframe, forcings and flux calculations can be interchanged easily, and new reservoirs and fluxes can be added. The minimal model is also significantly more robust than the original systems, and utilises the MATLAB inbuilt variable timestep solvers for ‘stiff’
ODE systems (i.e. where the timescale for alteration varies significantly between variables) (Shampine and Reichelt, 1997; Shampine et al., 2003). These numerical schemes alter the size of the model timestep depending on the rate of change of the model reservoirs, minimising computational error and preventing model crashes when values are very far from steady state. The GEOCARB/COPSE model framework can now be easily applied to the Precambrian.

3.5 Minimal model predictions for Proterozoic climate

3.5.1 Extension of forcings

The model forcing set is now extended back in time to 1000Ma using available proxy data. In previous models, the global metamorphic/degassing rate is assumed to be proportional the sea floor spreading rate, which has been estimated over the Phanerozoic via sea level inversion (Gaffin, 1987). For the Precambrian, lack of available data means the spreading rate must be estimated based on models for the thermal history of the Earth. Following Franck and Bounama (1997) the spreading rate, $S$, can be written as:

$$S = \frac{Q^2 \pi \kappa A_{ocean}(t)}{4k^2(T_m - T_s)^2} \quad (3.5.1)$$

where $Q$ is the mantle heat flow, $\kappa$ is the thermal diffusivity, $A_{ocean}(t)$ is the area of ocean basins at time $t$, $k$ is the thermal conductivity, $T_m$ and $T_s$ are the average mantle and surface temperatures respectively. Allowing $T_m - T_s \approx T_m$ and combining constants this becomes:

$$S = k_{sr} \frac{Q^2 A_{ocean}(t)}{T_m^2} \quad (3.5.2)$$

where $k_{sr} = \frac{\kappa \pi}{4k^2}$. Changes in mantle average temperature and ocean basin area over Earth history act to cancel each other out, and are smaller than the relative change in heat flow, allowing simplification to:

$$S_{relative} = k_s \left( \frac{Q}{Q_0} \right)^2 \quad (3.5.3)$$

here $S_{relative}$ is the relative spreading rate and $k_s$ is the present day rate. $\frac{Q}{Q_0}$ is the relative heat flow.
Figure 3.5.5a shows the relative spreading rate calculated from equation 3.5.3 using the mantle high temperature heat flux estimations from Sleep and Zahnle (2001) and Lowell and Keller (2003). Also shown is the spreading rate calculated from equation 3.5.2 using the same heat flux. Here $A_{\text{ocean}}$ is calculated from the relative continental area estimate of McLennan and Taylor (1983), which is used to calculate the heat flux in ref (Lowell and Keller, 2003), and conveniently lies towards the average of the many estimates for continental growth (Rino et al., 2004; Fyfe, 1978; Hurley and Rand, 1969; Condie, 1998). Mantle average temperature is taken from Franck and Bounama (1997), assuming a 3000K average temperature at 4.5Ga. As the difference between the two treatments is minimal, the simpler equation 3.5.3 is adopted for the model.

The rate of tectonic uplift in the parent models is estimated via strontium isotope mass balance (Berner, 1994), and extended here using the normalised seawater $^{87}_{86}$Sr curve of Shields (Shields, 2007) as a rough estimate of the relative material influx to the ocean from terrestrial weathering. The Phanerozoic uplift and degassing forcings are shown with the extended forcings in figure 3.5.5. Note that the long term curves used to extend the forcings show good general agreement with Phanerozoic proxies (shown in figure 3.5.5b,c). The isotope mass balance method for inferring organic burial requires knowledge of the isotopic fractionation of sedimentary carbonates and sulphates for the timeframe of interest.

The isotope records used in GEOCARB are extended using data from Halverson et al. (2005) for $\delta^{13}$C, and data from Canfield (2005) for $\delta^{34}$S, these are shown in figure 3.5.5e,f. The isotope mass balance system does not support large negative carbon isotope fractionation, which causes the system to predict negative burial rates. The maximum negative fractionation for carbon is therefore restricted to -3‰ for the model forcing. The evolutionary forcings required for the nutrient system require no extension as they have no effect before the point at which the given process evolves.
Figure 3.5.5: Forcing extensions for the Precambrian. a, Relative spreading rate calculated from equation 3.5.2 (blue) and equation 3.5.3 (black). b, Grey line shows uplift forcing from COPSE and GEOCARB models, black line shows normalised seawater strontium curve from Shields (2007). c, Degassing forcing used in COPSE and GEOCARB models shown as grey line, black line shows the spreading rate from Franck et al. (1999). d, Resulting extended forcings. e, δ^{13}C record used in GEOCARB, extended into the Precambrian with data from Halverson et al. (2005). Grey dashed line shows large negative excursions as reported in the literature, black line shows an artificial limitation of negative excursions to -3%. b, δ^{34}S forcing used in GEOCARB, extended with data from Canfield (2005). Original in colour.
3.5.2 Baseline predictions

Figure 3.5.6 shows model output when subject to the new forcing set and run for the period 1000-0 Ma, these are plotted from 900-0 Ma to allow for model spinup. The model is run with either the nutrient system from COPSE (panel a-c) or the isotope system from GEOCARB (panel e-g) used to infer organic burial rates. Note that the Phanerozoic predictions are not noticeably altered by the increased model timeframe.

The high expected rate of degassing in the Precambrian allows more CO$_2$ to build up in the atmosphere. This acts to increase global temperature and therefore the silicate weathering flux, balancing the system in the long term. Lower solar luminosity and a reduced global uplift rate in the Neoproterozoic act to limit the silicate weathering process, increasing the CO$_2$ requirement for system stability. Both burial systems result in a drop in CO$_2$ concentration from $\sim$30PAL at 900 Ma to $\sim$15PAL in the late Neoproterozoic. This is consistently higher than the 1-10PAL inferred from carbon isotope modelling, and the associated temperatures predicted by the model do not correlate well with expected severe glaciation in the late Neoproterozoic. When the isotope system is used to predict organic burial, predictions for CO$_2$ show variation around the results for the nutrient system. This is due to productivity spikes that follow the carbon isotope record. Carbon dioxide concentration is increased during the glacial negative excursions of the Neoproterozoic due to assumed lower carbon burial, and lowered during the positive excursions during the long ‘interglacial’ periods, from which high burial is inferred.

Both models show oxygen concentration in the Neoproterozoic reaching higher levels than in the Early Phanerozoic. For the nutrient system, this is due to the assumed higher rate of degassing, which results in a higher rate of continental weathering for system stability. Nutrient delivery from weathering is increased, allowing for a greater rate of burial of organic carbon. As with isotope mass balance models for the Phanerozoic (Berner, 1987), predicted oxygen concentration closely follows the isotopic record of carbon when the isotope system is used. This results in extremely high O$_2$ predictions that correlate with the large positive C isotope excursions in the Neoproterozoic. Both model treatments for oxygen can be effectively falsi-
fied by the available proxy data, $O_2 > 0.5$PAL at 900Ma is very difficult to reconcile with an anoxic deep ocean, as is suggested by many independent proxies (Canfield et al., 2008; Frei et al., 2009).

Figure 3.5.6: Minimal Model run for the period 900-0Ma, using COPSE nutrient system (a-c) or GEOCARB isotope mass balance method (e-g) to approximate organic burial. Results shown for relative atmospheric oxygen and carbon dioxide, and average surface temperature. Glaciation paleolatitude (d,h) shown in each column for comparison.

The conclusion from this preliminary analysis is that the methods used to model oxygen concentration in the Phanerozoic do not produce sensible predictions when extended further back in time. In both model systems, oxygen concentration is tightly coupled to the organic carbon burial rate, which may be reasonable for the Phanerozoic but may not have been the case in earlier Earth history. Modelling the Neoproterozoic oxygen cycle
likely requires additional processes to be considered, with more emphasis on
the sinks for oxygen, such as the input of reduced material from the mantle
(e.g. Holland (2009)). The results for CO$_2$ and temperature presented here
are however somewhat encouraging. Holding oxygen concentration fixed in
model runs therefore allows some evaluation of the Neoproterozoic carbon
cycle. The next section explores possible forcings that may permit the low
CO$_2$ concentration and global temperature suggested by the glacial record.

3.6 Weathing enhancement and temperature in the
Neoproterozoic

3.6.1 Continental position, dispersion and composition

Figure 3.6.7 shows a reconstruction of the position of the continents in the late
Neoproterozoic (Li et al., 2008). It can be seen that continents are grouped at
low latitudes for the period 750-630Ma, drifting to higher latitudes by 600Ma.
Higher surface temperature near the equator should allow for more vigorous
reaction kinetics, as well as an increase in humidity and therefore runoff
rate (Donnadieu et al., 2004). Both of these factors would be expected to
enhance the silicate weathering rate (Berner, 1994), allowing for lower global
temperature at steady state. The relationship between temperature and
runoff is complex and depends on the precipitation and evaporation rates and
therefore the size and distribution of the continents, not simply their position.
There is only a weak relationship, if any between continental mean latitude
and runoff rate (Otto-Bliesner, 1995). For runoff rate to increase there must
be adequate sources of moisture, therefore the dispersal of the continents
is a very important consideration. It has been estimated using a coupled
climate-geochemical model that the breakup of the supercontinent Rodinia
into smaller, dispersed continents between 800-700Ma may have caused a two
fold increase in mid latitude runoff, increasing the weathering rate until the
system is balanced by a decrease in CO$_2$ concentration (Donnadieu et al.,
2004).
Figure 3.6.7: Continental positions throughout the late Neoproterozoic. Figure modified from Li et al. (2008). Dark shaded area shows mantle superplume, ** shows option of Laurentia at low latitude, see ref (Li et al., 2008) for a more detailed picture.

Another factor influencing the silicate weathering rate is the composition of the continents. Weathering of basaltic areas leads to river water with molar ratios of calcium and magnesium that are higher than for typical silicates. Currently around 8.4% of the global silicate area is basaltic, but this area accounts for > 30% of the silicate weathering flux (Dessert et al., 2003). Large basaltic provinces appear in equatorial positions at around 800Ma, and have been linked to the onset of the Sturtian glaciation via enhanced continental weathering (Godderis et al., 2003). It is also possible that increased organic burial due to the opening of new continental margins in the Neoproterozoic caused a decline in CO$_2$ and therefore radiative forcing (Hoffman et al., 1998), a higher rate of organic burial is implied by the carbon isotope record, which shows positive fractionation for much of the period (Halverson et al., 2005).
The combination of dispersed, low latitude continents and an increase in basaltic surface area in the late Neoproterozoic could constitute a significant enhancement of the global silicate weathering rate. As with the weathering enhancement due to vascular plants, evaluation of the magnitude of the continental enhancement at a global scale is extremely difficult. Assuming a 2°C mean surface temperature anomaly between the high latitudes and equatorial regions (Hansen et al., 2006) and following the kinetic rate equation of Berner (1994) yields a 25% increase in the weathering rate. Assuming the majority of continents reside in the tropics could also add a maximum ~2 fold enhancement to this due to increased runoff (Donnadieu et al., 2004). A major uncertainty is the area and position of basaltic rock, as it is responsible for such a large amount of the total weathering flux. Following Godderis et al. (2003), an 8-fold enhancement in the weathering of basalts over granitic provinces is assumed. Allowing this increase for an area of $6 \times 10^6$ km$^2$ (Godderis et al., 2003), or 4% of the continental area, produces a global weathering rate enhancement of ~30%. Taking the factors of continental paleolatitude, dispersion and composition into consideration, and assuming a simplistic multiplicative relationship, it is perhaps possible that the degree of abiotic weathering enhancement in the late Neoproterozoic may have been up to 3-fold ($1.25 \times 1.3 \times 2 = 3.25$).

3.6.2 Weathering enhancement prior to vascular plant evolution

The assumed enhancement of global weathering by vascular plants at around 400Ma implies that reaction kinetics were less influenced by global temperature before this time (i.e. throughout the Precambrian), requiring a much higher surface temperature to balance the carbon cycle (see figure 3a in Sleep and Zahnle (2001)). This leads to the high temperature predictions for the early Phanerozoic in current carbon cycle models (Berner, 2006a; Bergman et al., 2004; Arvidson et al., 2006). Taking this view, a significant enhancement of global weathering is required in the Neoproterozoic to cause the apparent low temperature. However it is likely that the current assumed global weathering enhancement associated with the evolution of vascular plants (around 4-fold (Berner, 2006a)) is excessive. Although this degree of enhancement has been measured in well designed field studies (see Moul-
ton and Berner (1996); Bormann et al. (1987); Berner (1998)), it is unlikely that this enhancement would have been realised globally. Mountainous areas with high relief and erosion rates do not permit formation of stable soils, and are not suited to deep-rooted plants, however it is these areas that supply a large fraction of the present day silicate weathering flux (Gaillardet et al., 1999). Also in many continental cratons and areas where erosion is slow, the silicate weathering rate is limited by transport of material, not by the reaction kinetics (West et al., 2005; Millot et al., 2002), meaning that absence of higher plants from these areas may not necessarily change the weathering dynamics. Further to this, it is also possible that the long term weathering enhancement from vascular plants is less significant than the short term enhancements measured in field studies.

3.6.3 Model results for Neoproterozoic temperature

To demonstrate the effects of the above observations on Neoproterozoic climate, the model is now run the period 900-400Ma with oxygen concentration fixed at 0.01atm. The nutrient system is used to calculate productivity so that the model has greater predictive power (i.e. carbon burial is not imposed but calculated from the other parameters). An additional enhancement of silicate and carbonate weathering is imposed for the period 750-600Ma, reflecting the effect of continental position, increased basaltic area and supercontinent dispersion occurring over this time (Li et al., 2008; Donnadieu et al., 2004). Figure 3.6.8 shows both a 3-fold and 2-fold enhancement (solid and dashed lines respectively) alongside the default run with no enhancement (dotted lines). The black curves show the proposed 4-fold vascular plant enhancement, the grey lines show a more conservative 2-fold enhancement following the reasoning above.

The effect of imposing low oxygen in the model is a reduction in the weathering rate of buried organic carbon, which is a major CO$_2$ source. This leads to lower CO$_2$ and temperature predictions some 1–2°C lower than those of the full system for the late Neoproterozoic. Still, the maximum conceivable weathering enhancement is required to push global temperature to the theoretical snowball trigger (\(\sim 10^\circ C\) (Hoffman and Schrag, 2002)) under the baseline model.
Figure 3.6.8: Model CO$_2$ and temperature for the period 900-0 Ma. Here the nutrient model is used to estimate burial of reduced species, but oxygen is not calculated. Use of isotope mass balance model would yield similar results, but with CO$_2$ fluctuating in the Neoproterozoic, following the isotope record. **a**, Relative atmosphere/ocean CO$_2$ concentration. **b**, Model temperature. **c**, Glacial paleolatitude as in figure 3.2.1. Black lines show 4-fold vascular plant weathering enhancement at 400 Ma, grey lines show 2-fold enhancement. Dashed lines show a 2-fold weathering enhancement from 750-600 Ma, dash-dot lines show a 3-fold enhancement.

If a 2-fold enhancement of continental weathering rates is assumed at 400 Ma, the enhancement required for deep glaciation is relatively small - here a 2-fold increase in weatherability in the late Neoproterozoic results in average global surface temperature below the hypothesised snowball trigger. In this case early Phanerozoic global temperature remains below 15°C, permitting glaciations in the Cambrian and Ordovician. However, rising oxygen concentration around 580 Ma and the expected increase in CO$_2$ release from
weathering of buried organic carbon is not included here, and would act to increase both CO$_2$ and temperature estimates.

### 3.7 Chapter conclusions

Simplification and extension of current Phanerozoic Earth system modelling techniques allows for reasonable predictions for CO$_2$ and temperature over the last 900Myr. As with the Phanerozoic results, these predictions rely heavily on external forcings. As noted by other authors (Godderis et al., 2003; Donnadieu et al., 2004), a combination of continental position at low latitudes, tendency towards smaller and dispersed continents, and a large area of basaltic rock in the late Neoproterozoic may provide sufficient enhancement of the weathering process to allow for the low temperatures required for global glaciation.

The extreme enhancement of silicate weathering associated with the evolution of vascular plants causes problems when attempting to reconcile atmospheric composition and climate during the Neoproterozoic. The predicted high CO$_2$ concentration before vascular plant evolution requires a massive reduction in radiative forcing to produce conditions which could be expected to trigger the low latitude ‘snowball’ glaciations at $\sim 730$Ma and $\sim 650$Ma. Reducing global temperature sufficiently via CO$_2$ drawdown requires a 3-fold enhancement of the silicate weathering flux, which is towards the maximum estimate from a combination of proposed climatic forcings. However, it is likely that the assumed degree of enhancement of the weathering process due to vascular plant evolution may be overestimated, which would relax considerably the required continental forcing.

The methods employed by Phanerozoic biogeochemical models COPSE and GEOCARB for estimating atmospheric oxygen concentration do not give sensible results when extended into the Neoproterozoic. It is also very difficult to test if the current Phanerozoic predictions are correct. It is therefore likely that a significant long term process is missing from the aforementioned models.

Unknown quantities of greenhouse gases other than CO$_2$ are a major limitation of the method explored here. It is likely that a higher concentration of methane would have been present in the more reducing Proterozoic atm-
sphere (Pavlov et al., 2003), meaning that a greater reduction in CO$_2$ would be required to initiate global glaciation.

Previous assessments of Neoproterozoic conditions using a coupled climate-geochemical model have shown that sufficiently low global temperature for snowball glaciations is possible given the likely paleogeographical forcings (Donnadieu et al., 2004; Godderis et al., 2003). The model used by these authors allows for a global degassing rate of $\pm 20\%$ present day rate. The results in this chapter build on this work, showing that glaciation is still possible when a higher degassing rate is used (the spreading rate approximation yields around a 50\% increase in degassing during the Neoproterozoic). The work here also considers the effects of paleouplift rate, and absence of climatically important biota such as vascular plants and calcareous plankton (Volk, 1989). These results constrain the long-term ($> 10^6$yr) steady state temperature, and do not consider system changes occurring on smaller timescales.

Steady state temperature $< 10^\circ$C is not a solid prerequisite for low-latitude glaciation, and it has been shown for example that severe and long-lasting glaciation may instead be the result of amplification of an initial perturbation via feedback on sea level change and related shifts in depositional environments (Ridgwell et al., 2003). This mechanism does not require steady state temperature and CO$_2$ concentration in the Neoproterozoic to be exceptionally low.
4 Neoproterozoic snowball glaciations and limitations on global weathering rates

4.1 Introduction

A Neoproterozoic ‘cold period’, as described in the previous chapter, does not explain the apparently periodic sequence of extreme glaciations seen in the geological record (Halverson et al., 2010). Following both multimillion year glaciations is a 50Myr interglacial period, far longer than the assumed timescale on which the carbon cycle is stable (≈ 1Myr). The late Neoproterozoic also sees dramatic positive and negative excursions in carbonate δ¹³C (Halverson et al., 2005; Macdonald et al., 2010). Both the cause and global applicability of these excursions has been questioned, with authors suggesting either diagenesis (Derry, 2010) or the oxidation of a large organic carbon reservoir as a solution (Rothman et al., 2003), however recent data shows co-variance between the fractionation in organic carbon and in carbonate carbon, indicating that the signal may indeed be both primary and globally significant (Johnston et al., 2012).

To analyse the finer scale dynamics of the Neoproterozoic carbon cycle, a simple ice-albedo feedback was added to the minimal model, allowing a ‘flip’ to high albedo when global average temperature falls below 10°C to imitate the proposed snowball Earth scenario (Hoffman and Schrag, 2002). Extremely rapid weathering in the aftermath of model snowball glaciations prompted investigation into the limiting factors for this process. It was found that given likely tectonic limitation of the maximum global weathering rate, the time taken to bury the CO₂ added to the atmosphere/ocean during glaciation is similar to the duration of the interglacial periods, providing a possible explanation for the oscillatory nature of these events. This would allow for the observed pattern of extreme glaciations under a single, long-term cooling forcing, which may be attributed to the paleogeographical changes in the Neoproterozoic (Li et al., 2008). After discussion with my supervisors and Richard Boyle (who has previously worked on mechanisms for understanding the gaps between Neoproterozoic glaciations (Boyle, 2008)), a letter documenting the work was submitted to the journal Nature Geoscience and is published as B. Mills et al., ‘Timing of Neoproterozoic glaciations linked to

The minimal model is further simplified for this work in order to convey the idea as clearly as possible. The published letter is reproduced below, followed by supplementary information detailing the model derivation and some extension of the work. Unfortunately some restatement of the ideas and terms used previously is unavoidable, but this is kept to a minimum. A complimentary ‘feature’ article explaining the mechanism and some of the wider implications was written for the same issue by Joshua West (West, 2011).

4.2 Timing of Neoproterozoic glaciations linked to transport-limited global weathering

The Earth underwent several snowball glaciations between 1,000 and 541 Myr ago. The termination of these glaciations is thought to have been triggered by the accumulation of volcanic CO$_2$ in the atmosphere over millions of years (Hoffman et al., 1998; Pierrehumbert, 2005). Subsequent high temperatures and loss of continental ice would increase silicate weathering and in turn draw down atmospheric CO$_2$ (Walker et al., 1981). Estimates of the post-snowball weathering rate indicate that equilibrium between CO$_2$ input and removal would be restored within several million years (Le Hir et al., 2009), triggering a new glaciation. However the transition between deglaciation and the onset a new glaciation was on the order of $10^7$ years. Over long timescales, the availability of fresh rock can become a limiting factor for silicate weathering rates (West et al., 2005).

Here we show that when this limitation is incorporated into the COPSE biogeochemical model (Bergman et al., 2004), the stabilization time is substantially higher, $>10^7$ years. When we include a simple ice albedo feedback, the model produces greenhouse-icehouse oscillations on this timescale that are compatible with observations. Our simulations also indicate positive carbon isotope excursions and an increased flux of oxygen to the atmosphere during interglacials, both of which are consistent with the geological record (Halverson et al., 2005; Canfield et al., 2008). We conclude that the long gaps between snowball glaciations can be explained by limitations on silicate weathering rates.
The Neoproterozoic era (1000-541Ma) is punctuated by at least three glaciations (Hoffmann et al., 2004), the severe low-latitude Sturtian and Marinoan episodes being proposed as examples of ‘Snowball Earth’ events (Hoffman et al., 1998; Kirschvink, 1992). Figure 4.2.1 displays Neoproterozoic carbonate carbon isotope data (Halverson et al., 2005), which shows a quasi-periodic pattern. Negative excursions associated with glaciation appear at 50 Myr intervals between long periods of positive fractionation. The long interval between glaciations poses a puzzle given the standard model of a snowball Earth being terminated by very high CO$_2$ and temperature. The time taken to restore equilibrium after such a perturbation depends on the rate of CO$_2$ drawdown via silicate weathering, a process that would be greatly enhanced in the aftermath of snowball Earth. Highly weatherable rock flour produced by glacial grinding would likely cover a large surface area, and increased temperature and runoff should allow for an elevated weathering flux. Linked GCM and kinetic weathering models have determined the maximum weathering rate in this climate to be on the order of 10 times the modern day flux, implying a timescale of around $10^6$ years to reduce atmospheric CO$_2$ to pre-glacial levels (Le Hir et al., 2009). Based on these results, we would expect the system to establish equilibrium in a time far shorter than the interglacial periods following the Sturtian and Marinoan glaciations.

![Figure 4.2.1: $\delta^{13}$C record for the late Neoproterozoic. Isotopic composition of carbonates from ref. (Halverson et al., 2005). The vertical grey bars from left to right denote the Sturtian, Marinoan and Gaskiers glaciations.](image)
Here we propose that the timescale for CO$_2$ drawdown following a snowball glaciation should be extended due to transport limitation of the silicate weathering process. In a transport limited regime, silicate cations are completely leached from fresh regolith and therefore the rate of chemical weathering depends only on the physical erosion rate (West et al., 2005). Modern continental cratons are transport limited, as seen by plotting the rate of denudation of silicate cations against total denudation rate (Millot et al., 2002). In such a regime, increasing temperature or runoff does not increase the rate of CO$_2$ drawdown, because all the available silicate cations are already being processed. As global temperature and humidity rises, we would expect more weathering zones to become transport-limited, implying a theoretical maximum silicate weathering rate, where every available cation is leached.

Over the Phanerozoic, the mean continental erosion rate is estimated to be $\sim 16$ m Myr$^{-1}$ (Wilkinson and McElroy, 2007). Using the average density and area of the present day continents (area = $1.5 \times 10^{14}$ m$^2$, density = $2.5 \times 10^3$ kg m$^{-3}$) yields a total mass of $6 \times 10^{12}$ kg yr$^{-1}$. Assuming a cation weight fraction of 0.08 (West et al., 2005), we estimate a global silicate weathering rate maximum for the Phanerozoic of around $4.8 \times 10^{11}$ kg yr$^{-1}$. This maximum transport limited rate is about 2.4 times greater than present day weathering rate (Gaillardet et al., 1999).

Determining the global erosion rate in the Neoproterozoic is difficult, because it depends on the continental area and rate of uplift. Current estimates for Neoproterozoic uplift rates are close to present day values (Rino et al., 2004), and the majority of studies agree that the total continental area was probably less than it is now. Proxies for global denudation show very low values ($<10$ m Myr$^{-1}$) for the early Phanerozoic, but are likely to be affected by sampling artefacts (Willenbring and Blanckenburg, 2010). The rate of volcanic degassing in the Neoproterozoic is also important, as it is the balance between CO$_2$ degassing and its consumption rate via weathering and burial that dictates the system response time to large perturbations.
In carbon cycle models, degassing is usually assumed to be proportional to the seafloor spreading rate. Accounting for different continental growth models, the Neoproterozoic outgassing rate was probably between 1 and 5 times the present day rate (Rino et al., 2004; Franck and Bounama, 1997). But smaller crustal carbon content in the Neoproterozoic (Hayes and Waldbauer, 2006) may have decreased the CO$_2$ content of volcanic gas by up to 20%.

Figure 4.2.2: Phase portrait: stabilisation time versus maximum weathering rate, $W_{\text{max}}$. Here we assume an initial CO$_2$ concentration of 0.3 atmospheres, and fix the global weathering rate at $W_{\text{max}}$. The three lines show different choices of the relative CO$_2$ degassing rate, D. $W_{\text{max}}$ is defined relative to present day silicate weathering rate, with the grey vertical line showing our estimate of $W_{\text{max}}=2.4$ for the Phanerozoic. Increasing the weathering rate enhances nutrient delivery and therefore increases the organic burial fraction, allowing stability when $W_{\text{max}}$ is somewhat smaller than D, providing $W_{\text{max}}>1$. See supplementary information for full model description.
In figure 4.2.2, we use a modified version of the COPSE biogeochemical model (Bergman et al., 2004) (see supplementary information) to investigate the effect of a weathering rate cap on the time taken to return to steady state after the suggested snowball exit concentration of 0.3 atm CO$_2$ (Hoffman et al., 1998; Pierrehumbert, 2005) is imposed. Silicate weathering rate is fixed at a prescribed maximum value, $W_{\text{max}}$, which is defined relative to the present day rate. We find that choice of $W_{\text{max}}$ has a strong effect on the system: Assuming the Phanerozoic average erosion rate ($W_{\text{max}}=2.4$) yields a stabilisation time of $\sim 10^7$ years, even for conservative estimates of the CO$_2$ degassing rate $D$. A lower erosion rate, and/or a higher degassing rate increases the stabilisation time greatly. For further model runs we let global weathering follow a simple kinetic equation as described by Berner (1994), but asymptote to $W_{\text{max}}$ as the kinetic weathering rate approaches the transport-limited value, placing a cap on global weathering rates. The choice of kinetic weathering function, and the nature of the transition to $W_{\text{max}}$ has negligible effect on results as the rate remains at $W_{\text{max}}$ until CO$_2$ is very close to the stable level.

An important consideration for this work is weathering of rock flour left on the surface after a snowball glaciation, which would be expected to increase weathering kinetics as in the quaternary glacial cycle (Vance et al., 2009). Global weathering fluxes would not become limited by transport of fresh rock until the flour produced during the glaciation had been completely leached. Le Hir et al (Le Hir et al., 2009) assume a thin soil profile following a snowball, due to evidence of persistent weathering during glaciation (Donnadieu et al., 2003). Following their estimate of a 25cm reactive upper layer, we derive a weatherable equivalent of $\sim 10^{17}$ moles C (see supplementary information).

Figure 4.2.3 shows model sensitivity to the initial quantity of rock flour. Here we allow a global weathering rate of 10 times present day when rock flour is present (Le Hir et al., 2009), switching to the transport limited equation once a specified amount of carbon has been buried, analogous to the abundance of glacial flour. We find that a weatherable equivalent on the order of $10^{20}$ moles C is required to significantly affect stabilisation time; we use a increased reactive layer depth of 2.5m ($10^{18}$ mol C equiv.) for future model runs, due to uncertainty in estimation.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Time after deglacation (years)</th>
<th>CO2 (atm)</th>
<th>Weathering rate (relative to present)</th>
<th>Rock flour consumed (mol C equiv.)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>10 \times 10^{16}</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>100</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>10 \times 10^{18}</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1000</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>10 \times 10^{20}</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10,000</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>10 \times 10^{22}</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Figure 4.2.3: Stabilisation time after 0.3 atm CO2 perturbation for different initial abundances of rock flour. a, Rock flour consumed. b, Silicate weathering rate. c, Atmospheric CO2 concentration. Here R_{\text{max}} denotes the maximum amount of carbon (in moles) that can be drawn down via weathering of glacial rock flour before it is depleted. This figure shows the situation where D = 1, W_{\text{max}} = 2.4. The grey vertical line shows the stabilisation time when no flour is present (as in fig 4.2.2). The second drop in weathering rate here occurs as CO2 returns to a stable concentration.

Our results indicate that the sequence of deep glaciations in the Neo-proterozoic could be the result of a change of state in the long-term carbon-climate system to a regime which exhibits self-sustaining oscillations. If there was a long period in which global steady state temperature remained below the value required to trigger a snowball glaciation, this would be manifest as an oscillatory regime, with snowball glaciations alternating with warm...
phases. Such a temperature forcing may well be attributed to the continental configuration at this time. It has been shown that the position of the continents at low latitudes at 750Ma, along with the prevalence of basaltic lithologies, could provide the necessary cooling to trigger the first snowball event (Donnadieu et al., 2004). It is thought that the continents would have remained near low latitudes until 600Ma (Li et al., 2008), after which they begin to drift to higher latitudes, relaxing the forcing. To investigate this possible mechanism we parameterise a runaway ice-albedo feedback in our model by imposing a change in albedo when temperature falls below a given value $T_{\text{crit}}$. Assuming the classic snowball scenario (Hoffman and Schrag, 2002), we choose $T_{\text{crit}} = 283K$ and allow deglaciation at 263K. Because deglaciation begins in the tropics, it is assumed to occur at lower temperature than is required for the ice sheets to initially advance. Throughout this work we assume a solar constant for 650Ma (1298Wm$^{-2}$ (Caldeira and Kasting, 1992)), broadly representing the timeframe of interest. This allows glaciation at 150ppm CO$_2$, close to other estimates (Donnadieu et al., 2004).

We impose the described cooling scenario in the model, adding a parameter $\rho$ to represent enhancement of kinetic weathering. This follows the treatment of vascular plant colonisation in the Phanerozoic COPSE model runs (Bergman et al., 2004), acting as a multiplier on the kinetic weathering rate equation. To trigger oscillations we increase $\rho$ by a factor of three for a period of 150Myrs. The magnitude of this enhancement is roughly analogous to the increase in basaltic surface area and mid-latitude runoff calculated in ref (Donnadieu et al., 2004). For present day CO$_2$ degassing rate (D = 1), we require $W_{\text{max}} = 1.4$ to produce a rough analogue of the Neoproterozoic record. This parameter choice is shown in figure 4.2.4.

Assuming a higher CO$_2$ degassing rate shortens glacial duration and allows for larger values of $W_{\text{max}}$ to produce the observed timing, in line with figure 4.2.2. We use output from the CO2SYS model (Lewis and Wallace, 1998) to approximate the atmospheric fraction of total ocean and atmosphere CO$_2$, assuming that there is gas exchange between atmosphere and ocean during glaciation Hoffman et al. (1998). The total solubility of CO$_2$ is higher in cold water than warm water, therefore deglaciation causes a large transfer of CO$_2$ from ocean to atmosphere.
Figure 4.2.4: Cyclic solution when steady state temperature is forced below the ice-albedo runaway value for 150Myr. Here we let $D = 1$ and $W_{\text{max}} = 1.4$ to produce glacial timing on the order observed in the Neoproterozoic.

a, The imposed kinetic weathering enhancement ($\rho$) is shown in grey; in black is the weathering rate relative to present. b, Total atmosphere/ocean carbon (grey), and atmospheric $\text{CO}_2$ (black). c, Temperature alongside snowball entry/exit thresholds. d, Model $\delta^{13}\text{C}$, solid line shows temperature/$\text{CO}_2$ dependent fractionation (Bergman et al., 2004), dashed line shows solution when fractionation effects are constant.

The solid line for $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ shows the isotopic fractionation of marine carbonates, assuming the fractionation effect on burial takes into account the equilibrium fractionation between oceanic and atmospheric carbon, and a de-
dependence on temperature, as in the full COPSE model (Bergman et al., 2004). The dashed line shows an alternative solution where fractionation effects are constant. Both treatments yield a continued positive fractionation during the interglacial period due to elevated burial of light organic carbon, due in turn to sustained above-average nutrient fluxes from weathering. Higher assumption of $W_{\text{max}}$ increases nutrient delivery and therefore also increases fractionation. Low productivity during glaciations causes a negative excursion. We do not expect a simple model such as this to replicate exactly the isotope record. Negative excursions preceding glaciation are not reproduced by our model, and may be due to direct temperature effects on productivity, which are not included. Our aim is to demonstrate that the extended period of system disequilibrium following a snowball glaciation should contribute to prolonged positive excursions in $\delta^{13}C$, and more complex analysis is required to fully understand the Neoproterozoic carbon cycle.

With the imposition of a suitable long term maximum weathering rate, oscillations in this simple carbon - climate model can provide a qualitative fit to the sequence of glaciations and carbon isotope variations in the Neoproterozoic. The globally transport limited scenario presents a prolonged period of elevated primary productivity, which would support suggested increases in oxygen concentration and phosphorous deposition over this time (Halverson et al., 2005; Canfield et al., 2008; Shields et al., 2007; Porter et al., 2004; Zhu et al., 2007; Scott et al., 2008). There is evidence for phosphorous deposition after the Marinoan glaciation but not after the Sturtian.

It is important to note that the mechanism we describe relies on a particular interpretation of the Neoproterozoic period, namely the Snowball Earth hypothesis (Hoffman et al., 1998; Kirschvink, 1992). It is possible that the Neoproterozoic actually contained more frequent smaller glaciations, which would not terminate via a high CO$_2$ ‘super greenhouse’. Due to our long timeframe for CO$_2$ drawdown, our prediction is highly testable, with for example one recent study proposing a rapid decline in CO$_2$ following the Marinoan glaciation (Kasemann et al., 2005). Further work to establish the duration of any post-glacial greenhouse may thus enable validation or falsification of mechanisms to explain these fascinating events.
4.3 Supplementary information 1: Estimating the amount of CO$_2$ consumed by rock flour weathering

Rapid weathering of post-glacial rock flour is an extremely important consideration for this work. The transport limited weathering flux will not take effect until after the depletion of this reactive surface layer. We therefore attempt to calculate the maximum moles of carbon that can be buried due to rock flour weathering. In model runs, the weathering rate is set to 10 times present day when flour is present, in accordance with Le Hir et al. (2009). This decreases via a step function to the transport limited value when no flour remains. For an initial estimate, we assume a 25 cm surface layer depth (Le Hir et al., 2009) across the entire continental area ($1.5 \times 10^{14}$ m$^2$), giving a volume of $3.75 \times 10^{13}$ m$^3$. We assume a loess density of $1.5 \times 10^6$ g m$^{-3}$ (Bettis et al., 2003), therefore a total mass of $5.6 \times 10^{19}$ g is calculated. Assuming a silicate cation fraction of 0.08 (West et al., 2005) gives a cation mass of $4.5 \times 10^{18}$ g. Averaging the molar masses of Ca, Mg, Na and K gives $\sim 32$ g mol$^{-1}$, therefore we calculate $\sim 10^{17}$ moles for a global depth of 25 cm, meaning that this many moles of carbon can be taken up by silicate weathering. The main uncertainty in this value is in the depth of rock flour following a snowball earth. We therefore test our model with up to three orders of magnitude more rock flour to be sure of results (see main text).

4.4 Supplementary information 2: Model derivation

The 0-D Phanerozoic earth system model, COPSE (Bergman et al., 2004), uses 10 reservoirs to couple the cycles of carbon, oxygen, sulphur and ocean nutrients nitrate and phosphate. We reduce the system to 4 reservoirs: Atmosphere and ocean CO$_2$ ($A$), buried organic carbon ($G$), buried carbonate carbon ($C$) and a single limiting nutrient ($P$), modelled as phosphate.

4.4.1 Model robustness

The following changes were made to COPSE to make it robust under conditions encountered when weathering rates and temperatures are very low, as in the Neoproterozoic glaciations. The silicate weathering formulation used in the GEOCARB models is used with a small modification. We follow the
derivation of Berner (1994) but do not make the simplifying assumption of temperature close to present day. The linear runoff approximation causes a singularity when temperature is low, and is amended by approximating the linear term with an exponential function. This gives an expression for the relative silicate weathering flux, assuming kinetic limitation:

\[ W_K = \rho e^{ \left( k_1 \frac{T-T_0}{T_0} \right)} \left( e^{k_2(T-T_0)} \right)^{0.65} \sqrt{\text{NCO}_2} \]  

(S1)

Here \( k_1 = 7537.69 \) and \( k_2 = 0.03 \). \( T \) is average surface temperature in Kelvin, \( T_0 \) is present day average surface temperature and NCO\(_2\) denotes concentration of CO\(_2\) normalised to pre-industrial concentration. To obtain an expression for the global silicate weathering flux, equation S1 is multiplied by a factor \( \rho \) to represent possible enhancement of weathering due to continental configuration and composition. It is important to note that enhancing the kinetic weathering rate in this way does not affect the maximum transport-limited value. A higher value of \( \rho \) means that the maximum transport-limited rate can be achieved with lower temperature and/or runoff.

COPSE defines the function \( \text{anox} \) which gives a numerical value between 0 and 1 inclusive for the degree of ocean anoxia. The formulation used in the original model allows for negative values when ocean nutrient is extremely low. We truncate these to zero. We also add a dependence on new production to the iron-sorbed phosphorus burial flux (as is already applied to the other nutrient burial fluxes) to prevent unrealistic burial rates when nutrient concentration is low.

### 4.4.2 Temperature approximation

We derive a temperature approximation by first scaling for a lower solar constant, then using a previously calculated climate sensitivity and radiative forcings to adjust for different carbon dioxide concentrations. To scale for a decreased solar constant, we use an energy budget model for a single layer grey atmosphere in radiative equilibrium:

\[ T_{EBM} = \left( \frac{S(1-a)}{4\sigma \left( 1 - \frac{\epsilon}{2} \right)} \right)^\frac{1}{4} \]  

(S2)
Here $S$ is the solar constant in Wm$^{-2}$, $\alpha$ is planetary albedo, $\sigma$ is Stefan’s constant and $\epsilon$ represents the emissivity of the atmosphere. Assuming present day temperature of 288K, solar constant of 1368 Wm$^{-2}$ and albedo of 0.3, we derive an emissivity $\epsilon = 0.773$. The solar constant at 650Ma was 1298 Wm$^{-2}$ (Caldeira and Kasting, 1992). With a constant emissivity (i.e. Modern day greenhouse gas concentrations), equation S2 gives an average surface temperature of $T_{\text{base}} = 284.3$K for the late Neoproterozoic. To account for increased carbon dioxide concentrations, we add a term of radiative forcing from $CO_2$ times climate sensitivity to $T_{\text{base}}$

$$T = T_{\text{base}} + \mu \cdot F_{CO_2}$$  \hspace{1cm} (S3)

Where $F_{CO_2}$ is the radiative forcing from carbon dioxide and $\mu$ is the climate sensitivity (the ratio of change in radiative forcing to change in temperature). Our climate sensitivity is taken from previous runs of a radiative convective climate model and radiative forcings from previous runs of the AER line-by-line radiative transfer code (Clough et al., 2005; Goldblatt et al., 2009b), we take $\mu = 0.1815$ and $F_{CO_2} = a\lambda^4 + b\lambda^3 + c\lambda^2 + d\lambda + e$ where $a = 0.2507$, $b = 3.9216$, $c = 23.8113$, $d = 83.4113$, $e = 131.6138$ and $\lambda = \log (CO_2(\text{atm})).$

We fit a curve for $10^{-5} < CO_2(\text{atm}) < 10^{-1}$ and extrapolate this to $5 \times 10^{-1}$ atm. Correct representation of radiative forcing above $10^{-1}$ atm is a rather involved problem, necessitating representation of pressure broadening from higher total pressure, $CO_2$ self-continuum, many weaker lines and possible line mixing, and is beyond the scope of this paper, hence our approach. For the purpose of this work, it is only important that the temperature be sufficient to ‘max out’ the global weathering rate, which occurs at a much lower $CO_2$ concentration.

The COPSE model combines ocean and atmosphere carbon dioxide into a single reservoir, with a parameter $\phi$ to represent the fraction that exists in the atmosphere (and therefore contributes to the greenhouse effect). As more carbon dioxide accumulates in the atmosphere/ocean reservoir, a greater fraction will reside in the atmosphere. We combine our temperature function with the CO2SYS carbon speciation model (Lewis and Wallace, 1998) to derive a formula for $\phi$ in terms of $A$. The best fit to results is described by:
\[ \phi = \frac{gA}{A + h} \]  
(S4)

where \( g = 0.78 \) and \( h = 1 \times 10^{20} \text{ mol} \) for \( \alpha = 0.3 \), \( h = 5.3 \times 10^{20} \text{ mol} \) for \( \alpha = 0.6 \). This treatment contrasts to the ‘hard snowball’ model, where atmosphere and ocean are unable to exchange species. However, it has been shown that equilibrium between atmosphere and ocean during a snowball event could occur with only 100km\(^3\) of open water (Le Hir et al., 2008), or cracks in sea ice (Hoffman et al., 1998) and thus our approach has been used in previous snowball earth simulations (Higgins and Schrag, 2003).

### 4.4.3 Weathering formulation

For this work we assume that silicate weathering is kinetically limited until the global transport limit is reached. This can be written in the form:

\[
W = \begin{cases} 
W_K : & W_K < W_{\text{max}} \\
W_{\text{max}} : & W_K \geq W_{\text{max}} 
\end{cases} 
\]  
(S5)

where \( W \) is the overall weathering rate, \( W_K \) is the kinetically limited weathering rate and \( W_{\text{max}} \) is the transport limited rate, expressed relative to the present day. We describe the transition from the kinetically limited curve to the transport limited value using a sigmoid function.

\[
W = (W_{\text{max}} - W_K) \left( 1 + e^{-k_3(W_K-W_{\text{max}})} \right)^{-1} + W_K
\]  
(S6)

where \( k_3 = 100 \). Equation S6 follows equation S1 for \( W_K < W_{\text{max}} \), but asymptotes to \( W_{\text{max}} \) for \( W_K > W_{\text{max}} \).

### 4.4.4 Glacial flour abundance and weathering enhancement

We represent the global reservoir of glacial rock flour, \( R \), in terms of the number of moles of carbon it can potentially draw down via weathering. If a snowball glaciation is triggered, \( R \) is set to zero. On deglaciation we set \( \frac{dR}{dt} \) equal to the silicate weathering flux. \( W_{\text{max}} \) is dependent on the size of \( R \), taking the maximum value of 10 for \( R < R_{\text{max}} \) and reverting to the prescribed transport limited value when \( R = R_{\text{max}} \). Here \( R_{\text{max}} \) is the assumed abundance of glacial flour defined by the amount of CO\(_2\) it can potentially
weather. The transition between weathering rates follows a step function. We choose this formulation in order to allow the maximum CO$_2$ drawdown for a given quantity of rock flour, noting that the weathering flux may actually decrease with time (Vance et al., 2009).

4.4.5 Ice-albedo instability

To parameterise an ice-albedo instability we define two distinct albedos in our model and allow the value to change when a certain temperature threshold is reached. For the temperature world we let:

$$\alpha = \begin{cases} 
\alpha_{\text{base}} : & T > T_{\text{crit}} \\
\alpha_{\text{ice}} : & T \leq T_{\text{crit}}
\end{cases}$$  \hspace{1cm} (S7)

For the glaciated world we follow Hoffman and Schrag (2002) and assume a lower escape temperature, $T_{\text{escape}}$:

$$\alpha = \begin{cases} 
\alpha_{\text{base}} : & T > T_{\text{escape}} \\
\alpha_{\text{ice}} : & T \leq T_{\text{escape}}
\end{cases}$$  \hspace{1cm} (S8)

Here $\alpha_{\text{base}} = 0.3$. We let $\alpha_{\text{ice}} = 0.6$, $T_{\text{crit}} = 283K$, $T_{\text{escape}} = 263K$. This allows glaciation at $\sim$150ppm CO$_2$ and deglaciation at $\sim$0.25 atm, broadly in line with previous work on snowball Earth (Hoffman et al., 1998; Pierrehumbert, 2005; Donnadieu et al., 2004). For a simple model, $\alpha$ moves linearly between $\alpha_{\text{base}}$ and $\alpha_{\text{ice}}$ if temperature falls below $T_{\text{crit}}$, and returns to $\alpha_{\text{base}}$ if $T_{\text{escape}}$ is reached whilst in a snowball glaciation.

Reduction of weathering fluxes due to glaciation is modelled using a multiplier, $W_{\text{glacial}}$, for global silicate and carbonate weathering fluxes. $W_{\text{glacial}}$ depends on only the albedo, $\alpha$ and is modelled using a step function so that:

$$W_{\text{glacial}} = \begin{cases} 
1 : & \alpha = \alpha_{\text{base}} \\
10^{k_{\text{ice}}} : & \alpha = \alpha_{\text{ice}}
\end{cases}$$  \hspace{1cm} (S9)

$k_{\text{ice}}$ is chosen to allow temperature during the snowball glaciation to stabilise above $T_{\text{escape}}$ in order that deglaciation can occur. This requires $k_{\text{ice}} = -2$. 

91
4.4.6 Carbon isotopes

To produce results that may be compared to the geological record, we calculate the isotopic composition of carbon throughout model runs. To do this we run a duplicate carbon system that tracks the movement of the lighter isotope carbon-12. The $\delta^{13}C$ value of a sample is a measure of the ratio of carbon-13 atoms to carbon-12 atoms, and is expressed relative to a standard:

$$
\delta^{13}C_{\text{sample}} = \left( \frac{R^{13}\text{sample}}{R^{12}\text{PDB}} - 1 \right) \cdot 1000 \quad (S10)
$$

where $R^{13}_{12}$ is the ratio of carbon-13 atoms to carbon-12 atoms and $R^{13}_{12}\text{PDB} = 0.0112372$. If $F_C$ is a model flux of carbon, we define the corresponding flux of carbon-12 ($F^{12}_C$) as:

$$
F^{12}_C = F_C \cdot R^{12}_{12+13} \quad (S11)
$$

where $R^{12}_{12+13}$ is the ratio of carbon-12 to total carbon in the parent reservoir.

If a flux undergoes a fractionation effect of $\iota$ parts per thousand, the modified ratio of carbon-12 to total carbon in the flux is calculated:

$$
R^{12}_{12+13} = \frac{1}{1 + R^{13}_{12}} = \frac{1}{1 + R^{13}_{12}\text{PDB} \left( \frac{\delta^{13}C + \iota}{1000} + 1 \right)} \quad (S12)
$$

where $\delta^{13}C$ is the fractionation relative to PDB of the parent reservoir. We assume a photosynthetic fractionation effect of $-30\%_o$. For fractionation due to carbonate burial we consider both a constant effect ($+1\%_o$) and a temperature-dependent function as used in COPSE:

$$
\delta_{mccb} = \phi \left( \frac{9483}{T} - 23.89 \right) - \frac{4232}{T} + 15.1 \quad (S13)
$$

Here $\delta_{mccb}$ represents the difference in composition between atmosphere/ocean CO$_2$ and buried carbonate in units of per mille ($\%_o$) relative to PDB. $T$ is temperature in degrees Kelvin and $\phi$ is the fraction of total CO$_2$ that is in the atmosphere.
4.4.7 Full model equations

Reservoirs and fluxes are taken directly from the COPSE model with the following exceptions: Land organic carbon burial ($locb$) is removed to reflect the absence of plants in the Neoproterozoic. Iron-sorbed phosphate burial ($fepb$) is amended as described above. The weathering fluxes $silw$ and $oxidw$ are redefined to include the glacial limitation, $W_{\text{glacial}}$, and transport limitation in the case of $silw$. We hold oxygen concentration (denoted $O$) constant at an assumed Neoproterozoic value of 1% of the atmosphere, and therefore assume no dependence of $oxidw$ on oxygen concentration. Carbonate weathering is assumed to follow the silicate weathering equation for this analysis, as it has no net effect on CO$_2$. The crustal reservoirs of organic and carbonate carbon ($G$ and $C$) are held constant. Table 5 displays model fluxes, table 6 shows the reservoir calculations, table 7 defines the forcing parameters and table 8 shows model constants.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Shorthand</th>
<th>Equation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Marine organic carbon burial</td>
<td>mocb</td>
<td>$k_1 \left( \frac{P}{P_0} \right)^2$</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nutrient weathering</td>
<td>phosw</td>
<td>$k_8 \left( \frac{2}{12} \cdot \text{silw} + \frac{5}{12} \cdot \text{carbw} + \frac{5}{12} \cdot \text{oxidw} \right)$</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Marine organic phosphate burial</td>
<td>mopb</td>
<td>$\frac{\text{mopb}}{\text{mocb}}$</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Calcium-bound phosphate burial</td>
<td>capb</td>
<td>$k_2 \frac{\text{mocb}}{\text{mocb}_0}$</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| Iron-sorbed phosphate burial*             | fepb      | $\frac{k_4}{k_4} \left( 1 - \text{anox} (O, P) \right) \frac{\text{mocb}}{\text{mocb}_0}$  
where $\text{anox} = 1 - k_4 \left( \frac{O}{O_0} \frac{P}{P} \right)$ |
| Silicate weathering*                      | silw      | $k_5 \left\{ (W_{\text{max}} - W_K) \left( 1 + e^{-k_3(W_K-W_{\text{max}})} \right)^{-1} + W_K \right\}$  
where $W_K = W_{\text{glacial}} \rho_e \left( k_1 \frac{T-T_0}{T_0} \right) \left( e^{k_2(T-T_0)} \right)^{0.65} \sqrt{NCO_2}$ |
| Oxidative weathering*                     | oxidw     | $k_7 W_{\text{glacial}}$ |
| Organic carbon degassing                  | ocdeg     | $k_9 D$ |
| Carbonate carbon degassing                | ccdeg     | $k_{10} D$ |

**Table 5:** List of fluxes: (*) indicates a flux that has been modified for this work

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Equation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Phosphate</td>
<td>$\frac{dP}{dt} = \text{phosw} - \text{mopb} - \text{capb} - \text{fepb}$</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Atmosphere/ocean CO$_2$</td>
<td>$\frac{dA}{dt} = -\text{mocb} - \text{silw} + \text{oxidw} - \text{carbw} + \text{ocdeg} + \text{ccdeg} + \text{carbw}$</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Buried organic carbon</td>
<td>$\frac{dG}{dt} = 0$</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Buried carbonate carbon</td>
<td>$\frac{dC}{dt} = 0$</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Table 6:** Reservoir calculations
### Table 7: Model forcings

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Meaning</th>
<th>Size</th>
<th>Source</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>$D$</td>
<td>Relative CO$_2$ degassing rate</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$\rho$</td>
<td>Rock weatherability</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Meaning</th>
<th>Size</th>
<th>Source</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>$k_1$</td>
<td>Total organic carbon burial</td>
<td>$9 \times 10^{12}$ mol C yr$^{-1}$</td>
<td>COPSE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$k_2$</td>
<td>Ca associated phosphorus burial</td>
<td>$1.5 \times 10^{10}$ mol P yr$^{-1}$</td>
<td>COPSE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$k_3$</td>
<td>Fe associated phosphorus burial</td>
<td>$6 \times 10^9$ mol P yr$^{-1}$</td>
<td>COPSE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$k_4$</td>
<td>Initial oxic fraction</td>
<td>0.86</td>
<td>COPSE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$k_5$</td>
<td>Silicate weathering</td>
<td>$6.65 \times 10^{12}$ mol C yr$^{-1}$</td>
<td>for steady state</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$k_6$</td>
<td>Carbonate weathering</td>
<td>$1.335 \times 10^{13}$ mol C yr$^{-1}$</td>
<td>COPSE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$k_7$</td>
<td>Oxidative weathering</td>
<td>$7.75 \times 10^{12}$ mol C yr$^{-1}$</td>
<td>for steady state</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$k_8$</td>
<td>Reactive phosphorus weathering</td>
<td>$5.7 \times 10^{10}$ mol P yr$^{-1}$</td>
<td>for steady state</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$k_9$</td>
<td>Organic carbon degassing</td>
<td>$1.25 \times 10^{12}$ mol C yr$^{-1}$</td>
<td>COPSE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$k_{10}$</td>
<td>Carbonate carbon degassing</td>
<td>$6.65 \times 10^{12}$ mol C yr$^{-1}$</td>
<td>COPSE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$C$</td>
<td>C:P burial ratio</td>
<td>250 mol:mol</td>
<td>COPSE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$A_0$</td>
<td>Present day atmosphere/ocean CO$_2$</td>
<td>$3.193 \times 10^{18}$ mol</td>
<td>COPSE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$P_0$</td>
<td>Present day ocean phosphate</td>
<td>$3.1 \times 10^{15}$ mol</td>
<td>COPSE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$O_0$</td>
<td>Present day atmosphere/ocean O$_2$</td>
<td>$3.7 \times 10^{19}$ mol</td>
<td>COPSE</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Table 8: List of constants
4.5 Application of transport limitation and revised temperature calculation to Phanerozoic modelling

The work in this chapter has produced two ideas worthy of investigation in respect to Phanerozoic climate. Firstly, attempting to model the conditions following a snowball Earth event has required the development of a new temperature approximation, based on a previous radiative-convective climate model and the AER line-by-line radiative transfer code (Clough et al., 2005; Goldblatt et al., 2009b). Secondly, geological limitation of the terrestrial weathering process could also have operated over the Phanerozoic. As discussed in the published letter, if the global degassing rate for CO$_2$ is greater than the maximum possible burial rate via weathering, there would be no mechanism to stop the build up of CO$_2$ in the atmosphere. Current methods of estimating the global degassing rate from the seafloor spreading rate return a maximum degassing rate of around 1.75 times present day for the late Mesozoic (Gaffin, 1987; Berner, 1990). Following the rough estimate for a Phanerozoic weathering rate limit of around 2.4 times present day (Mills et al., 2011), the global erosion rate would only have to fall below 75% of the present day value in order for CO$_2$ degassing to overwhelm the rate of burial, and the system to be unable to stabilise CO$_2$ concentration in the atmosphere. Estimates of uplift rates for the late Mesozoic happen to be around this value (Berner, 1994).

4.5.1 Comparison of temperature functions for Phanerozoic carbon cycle modelling

Figure 4.5.5 plots the CO$_2$-temperature functions used in the GEOCARB and COPSE models with the function derived for the work on transport limitation (Mills et al., 2011; Clough et al., 2005; Goldblatt et al., 2009b). The temperature approximation of Caldeira and Kasting (1992) allows for changes in planetary albedo and is plotted with both fixed and variable albedo. For the other functions albedo is fixed at 0.3. As noted previously, the temperature approximation used in COPSE (Caldeira and Kasting (1992) variable albedo) and in the more recent GEOCARB models (Berner and Kothavala, 2001) show fair agreement over the expected Phanerozoic CO$_2$ range ($\sim 1 - 20$PAL). The RCM-LBL approximation used in Mills et
al. (2011) was designed for application to extremely high CO$_2$ environments, and displays a far more conservative relationship between CO$_2$ and temperature than the previous approximations. The spread of results here highlights the uncertainty in estimating global temperature based on a small number of parameters and over a massive range of CO$_2$ concentrations. None of these approximations should be considered ‘the correct one’, however the effect of the uncertainty in global temperature estimation on Phanerozoic model predictions should be assessed.

Figure 4.5.5: Temperature approximations used in carbon cycle box models. The black lines show the approximation of Caldeira and Kasting (Caldeira and Kasting, 1992), which is used in the COPSE model. Solid line shows fixed albedo, dashed line shows variable albedo solution. Green lines show the approximations derived for the GEOCARB models (Berner, 1994; Berner and Kothavala, 2001) and the red line shows the approximation developed for the work in this chapter (Goldblatt et al., 2009b; Clough et al., 2005). Albedo is fixed in these approximations. The grey shaded area indicates a temperature below 20°C and the grey vertical line shows pre-industrial CO$_2$ concentration for reference.
Figure 4.5.6 shows the results of Phanerozoic runs in the Minimal Model from chapter 3. The black lines show runs with the temperature approximation from Mills et al. (2011), the grey lines show runs using the temperature approximation from Caldeira and Kasting (1992) with variable albedo. These examples are taken as the sensitivity end-members (see figure 4.5.5) and the model uses the nutrient system from COPSE to estimate organic burial rates.

With the more conservative Mills et al. function, around twice the concentration of ocean/atmosphere CO$_2$ is required to stabilise the carbon cycle before the evolution of vascular plants at 400Ma. However the temperature prediction is lower due to the assumption that CO$_2$ has a direct effect on weathering (through plant CO$_2$-fertilization (Berner, 1994)).

The model is run with the assumption of a large (7-fold) increase in weathering efficiency due to the evolution of vascular plants, a smaller (and probably more reasonable (Drever, 1994)) change in weathering efficiency would bring temperature predictions closer to present day for both models, as described in the previous chapter.

The results here show that the climate sensitivity to carbon dioxide is also an important uncertainty in estimating early Phanerozoic temperature, with a lower sensitivity bringing all estimates closer to present day temperature. The prediction of high global temperature by GEOCARB and COPSE for the supposedly glacial periods in the Cambrian and Ordovician may be partly explained by the use in those models of temperature functions that are towards the extreme of plausible relationships. It is important to note that the use of a more conservative CO$_2$-temperature relationship does not significantly change the climatic forcing required to reach extremely low global temperature in the Neoproterozoic. A factor 3 enhancement is required to reach the ice-albedo run-away threshold in section 4.2.
Figure 4.5.6: Phanerozoic COPSE model run for different temperature functions.  

- **a** Relative atmospheric oxygen.  
- **b** Relative atmospheric CO$_2$.  
- **c**, Global average surface temperature.  
  For all panels grey lines show temperature function from Caldeira and Kasting (1992) and black lines show temperature function from Mills et al. (2011)

### 4.5.2 Atmospheric fraction of carbon dioxide

To complement the assessment of temperature functions, this section briefly reviews the function used to express the fraction of total (ocean plus atmosphere) CO$_2$ which resides in the atmosphere, and thus contributes to the greenhouse effect, denoted $\phi$. It has been shown during the COPSE model derivation (Bergman, 2003) that changing this calculation does not alter the
predictions for atmospheric CO$_2$ over the Phanerozoic, this is because the atmospheric reservoir is regulated by the temperature dependence of continental weathering, with the oceanic reservoir changing accordingly as a ‘slave’ variable. Changes to the calculation do however alter the total amount of ocean and atmosphere carbon dioxide for a given atmospheric concentration, which is very important in calculating the timescales for CO$_2$ removal (Mills et al., 2011) as well as the power of processes that are controlled by oceanic CO$_2$ concentration rather than atmospheric (e.g. weathering of deep ocean crust (Sleep and Zahnle, 2001)). Here the approximation derived from the CO2SYS program (see section 4.4) is tested against a physically based treatment used in an extension of the COPSE model (Bergman, 2003).

Kump and Arthur derived a simple expression for the atmospheric fraction of total CO$_2$ by assuming that the ocean is saturated with respect to CaCO$_3$ and equilibrated with atmospheric carbon dioxide. They calculate atmospheric CO$_2$ as:

\[
\text{CO}_2 = \left( \frac{A}{A_0} \right)^2 \cdot \text{CO}_2 (0)
\]

where \( \text{CO}_2 (0) \) is the present day concentration and \( A \) is the size of the combined ocean and atmosphere CO$_2$ reservoir. \( A_0 \) is the size of this reservoir at present day. In COPSE, dependence on temperature and explicit treatment of the oceanic carbon reservoir is added to this analysis, yielding the expression:

\[
R_{\text{CO}_2} = \frac{\text{CO}_2}{\text{CO}_2 (0)} = e^{k_c \cdot (T_0 - T)} \cdot \left( \frac{\Sigma \text{CO}_2}{\Sigma \text{CO}_2 (0)} \right)^2
\]

here \( k_c \) is a constant with value $-0.0448 \text{ K}^{-1}$ (Bergman, 2003), \( \Sigma \text{CO}_2 \) is the number of moles of CO$_2$ in the ocean and \( \Sigma \text{CO}_2 (0) \) is the present day value of this. \( T \) is average surface temperature and \( T_0 \) is the present day value, 288K. In order to compare this treatment to the approximation derived in chapter 4, the above equation must be solved by iteration. Equation 4.5.2 is rearranged so that it may be solved to give the atmospheric fraction \( \phi \) as a function of \( A \) alone.

\[
\frac{\phi A}{\phi_0 A_0} = e^{k_c \cdot (T_0 - T)} \cdot \left( \frac{(1 - \phi) A}{(1 - \phi_0) A_0} \right)^2
\]
\[
\phi = e^{kc(T_0 - T)} \cdot \left( \frac{(1 - \phi) A}{(1 - \phi_0) A_0} \right)^2 \cdot \frac{\phi_0 A_0}{A} \tag{4.5.4}
\]

Here \( \phi_0 = 0.01614 \) as in COPSE.

In order to iterate this equation, the value of \( A \) is fixed, allowing computation of the stable value of \( \phi \). Temperature must be calculated at each stage from the atmospheric \( \text{CO}_2 \) concentration, which itself is calculated from \( A \) and the current value of \( \phi \). For this comparison we assume and albedo of 0.3 and use the temperature approximation from Mills et al. (2011). Figure 4.5.7 plots the relationship between the size of \( A \) and the atmospheric fraction of \( \text{CO}_2 \) for the above formulation. It is compared to the approximation used in Mills et al., which is computed using the ‘CO2SYS’ program of Lewis and Wallace (1998).

Figure 4.5.7: Atmospheric fraction of carbon dioxide The atmospheric fraction \( (\phi) \) is plotted against total atmosphere and ocean \( \text{CO}_2 \) \( (A) \). Black line shows approximation derived from CO2SYS program (Lewis and Wallace, 1998), grey line shows approximation from extended COPSE model (Bergman, 2003)

As the figure shows, both approximations give very similar results. Divergence does occur when \( A \) is above \( 3 \times 10^{20} \) moles, but this is above the maximum value reached in any model runs, including the snowball scenar-
ios. Interchanging these functions therefore has very little effect on model
behaviour, the approximation used in Mills et al. is adopted for further work
because it is more computationally efficient.

4.5.3 Transport limitation of weathering in the Phanerozoic

Earlier in the chapter it was shown that transport limitation of terrestrial
weathering would place an upper limit on the drawdown flux of CO₂, thus
extending the timeframe for stabilisation of the system after a large CO₂ per-
turbation. However there is another potential effect of this limitation: if the
global degassing rate rises above the maximum possible weathering rate the
system would be unable to stabilise and CO₂ could accumulate over millions
of years, greatly increasing surface temperature. Geochemical proxies sug-
gest that CO₂ concentration peaked at around 15 times present atmospheric
level (PAL) in the Mesozoic (Royer et al., 2004), however model predictions
with kinetically based weathering fluxes do not reach this level, typically
staying below 5 times PAL (Bergman et al., 2004; Berner, 1994; Arvidson
et al., 2006). The maximum transport-limited weathering rate is dependent
on material supply via erosion (West et al., 2005). Estimates for Mesozoic
continental uplift rates using both strontium isotope models (Berner, 1994)
and sediment abundance data (Ronov, 1993) give low values, perhaps as low
as 0.5 times present day, whilst estimates of the degassing rate are between 1
and 1.5 times present day. With a higher degassing rate and a lower erosion
rate, it may have been possible that CO₂ outgassing exceeded the maximum
burial rate via silicate weathering in the Mesozoic, which could perhaps ex-
plain the unexpectedly high CO₂ concentration recorded by proxies.

For a simple test of this idea, the minimal model is run through the
Phanerozoic with an imposed maximum weathering rate limit. Again the
COPSE nutrient system is used to infer organic burial rates to retain max-
imum predictive power, and the results are compared to a run in which no
transport limit assumed, roughly equivalent to the original COPSE predic-
tions (Bergman et al., 2004). Figure 4.5.8 shows results when the maximum
weathering rate (W_{max}) is fixed at 1.33 times present day. For this run there
is no dependence of W_{max} on the erosion rate. It can be seen in panel d
that the global silicate weathering rate for the unmodified model rises above
the imposed limit at two points in the Phanerozoic, which correspond to periods of high degassing. When the weathering limitation is imposed, these periods see rapidly rising CO\textsubscript{2} concentration, halted only when the degassing rate falls sufficiently so that the maximum carbon sink from weathering can overwhelm the volcanic CO\textsubscript{2} source.

Figure 4.5.8: COPSE model run through Phanerozoic with a fixed weathering rate limit. Black line shows model run with no transport limitation of weathering, red line shows model predictions when the maximum terrestrial weathering rate (W\textsubscript{max}) is fixed at 1.33 times present day. Grey lines in panel a show CO\textsubscript{2} proxy data from Royer et al. (2004). The dashed grey line in panel d shows the assumed transport limited weathering rate.

This treatment is certainly an oversimplification and the predictions do not line up well with the proxy data, but it serves well to demonstrate the mechanism in question. Allowing W\textsubscript{max} \geq 1.5 removes the possibility of transport limitation occurring and it is likely that W\textsubscript{max} = 1.33 is an unrealistically low assumption - the simple calculation in Mills et al. (2011) gave a value of W\textsubscript{max} \approx 2.4 for the Phanerozoic.
In figure 4.5.9 it is assumed that the transport limited maximum weathering rate is influenced by the rate of erosion due to cation supply (West et al., 2005), i.e. $W_{\text{max}} = k_{\text{transport}} \cdot \epsilon$ where $\epsilon$ is the relative erosion rate. It is assumed that erosion rate scales with the uplift rate forcing in the model.

Because of the assumed lower erosion rate in the Mesozoic, a higher, and more plausible value for the present day transport limited rate ($k_{\text{transport}}$) now results in a CO$_2$ spike similar to the previous model runs. The magnitude of this is very sensitive to the value of $k_{\text{transport}}$, as carbon dioxide quickly builds up once the weathering process becomes transport limited. Notice also that the CO$_2$ spike observed at around 500Ma in the previous model run has not occurred, this is because although the degassing rate at this time was high, the uplift rate is also assumed to be high which compensates for the increase.

The timing of the event in this model still does not fit well with the timing suggested by proxies. The CO$_2$ spike shown by proxy records at $\sim$ 200Ma does appear to coincide with a low global uplift rate, but the possibility of a transport limited global weathering regime can be ruled out based on evidence for comparatively low degassing rates at this time. The combination of predicted low uplift rate and high degassing rate at 100Ma can produce a runaway CO$_2$ event in the model under reasonable assumptions for the transport limited rate, however an event of this kind is not recorded in the available proxies for this time (Royer et al., 2004). In addition, the peak in degassing rate at 100Ma has been questioned by recent estimates of the spreading rate which utilize the age distribution of the oceanic lithosphere (Rowley, 2002), these estimates suggest a constant degassing rate for the last 180Ma.
Figure 4.5.9: COPSE model run through Phanerozoic with a weathering rate limit dependent on the uplift rate. $k_{\text{transport}}$ is the present day maximum achievable weathering rate, relative to the actual weathering rate. Grey lines in panel a show CO$_2$ proxy data from ref (Royer et al., 2004)

This work suggests that a global transport limitation event did not occur in the Phanerozoic. Such an event would necessarily coincide with a high degassing rate and low uplift rate. Taking $\frac{\text{Degassing}}{\text{Uplift}}$ for the Phanerozoic proxies returns a substantial maximum at only $\sim 100$Ma, which corresponds to the CO$_2$ spike in the model runs. The proxy data for low CO$_2$ at this time (Royer et al., 2004) implies that the CO$_2$-weathering feedback was operating, in which case it would be expected to be operating in the earlier Phanerozoic, where the quantity $\frac{\text{Degassing}}{\text{Uplift}}$ is lower. Assuming a constant degassing rate for the period 180-0Ma (Rowley, 2002) removes all significant peaks from the $\frac{\text{Degassing}}{\text{Uplift}}$ curve, leaving no implication of a period of global transport limitation.
4.6 Chapter summary and discussion

4.6.1 Summary of main findings

1) Transport limitation of the terrestrial weathering process places a cap on the global rate of carbon burial via silicate weathering. A rough estimate for the Phanerozoic places this limit at \( \sim 2.4 \) times the present day rate.

2) The transport limit affects the time taken for climate to stabilize following a large \( \text{CO}_2 \) perturbation. Assuming that snowball Earth glaciations terminate via a high-\( \text{CO}_2 \) meltback, the timescale for stabilization is on the order of \( 10^7 \) years, similar to the gap between the Neoproterozoic low latitude glaciations.

3) It is proposed here that a \( \sim 150 \text{Myr} \) climatic cooling event operated over the Neoproterozoic, triggered by the dispersion of the supercontinent Rodinia and associated paleogeographical weathering affects, and was responsible for the sequence of deep glaciations via the transport limitation mechanism.

4) In this situation the periods between glaciations would be characterised by an unbalanced carbon cycle, excess nutrient delivery and high rates of organic burial, but it is unclear exactly how this would have contributed to ocean oxygenation over the Neoproterozoic.

5) It is theoretically possible for the global \( \text{CO}_2 \) degassing rate to exceed the maximum transport-limited burial rate, triggering run-away \( \text{CO}_2 \) buildup. But it is unlikely to have happened during the Phanerozoic.

4.6.2 Discussion

The snowball Earth scenario represents a \( 10^7 \) year perturbation to global biogeochemistry, and it is natural to assume that system recovery would be on the same timescale. The work in this chapter highlights for the first time that the warm climate would be expected to persist for tens of millions of
years following the glacial melt.

The climate and ice sheet dynamics of snowball glaciations have been the subject of intense scrutiny over the last 20 years (Hoffman et al., 1998; Leather et al., 2002; Pierrehumbert, 2005; Lewis et al., 2007; Font et al., 2010; Heron et al., 2011), particularly with the view to establishing the likelihood of the global biota surviving such an event (McKay, 2000; Vincent and Howard-Williams, 2000; Knoll, 2003; Pollard and Kasting, 2005). It has also been proposed that the occurrence of the Neoproterozoic snowball events may have had a dramatic effect on the evolution of early animals (Knoll and Carroll, 1999). Large scale environmental perturbation would be expected to provide an ecological opportunity for the survivors (Bartley et al., 1998), and the environmental selection effects of surviving in refugia during glaciation may have promoted multicellularity (Boyle et al., 2007).

More critical to the evolution of animals is the global abundance of oxygen (Catling et al., 2005; Runnegar, 1991), and the oxygenation event over the Neoproterozoic is proposed to have removed a low-O$_2$ evolutionary barrier (Canfield et al., 2007; Knoll, 2003). A biota-driven oxygenation has previously been inferred directly from the large positive excursions in $\delta^{13}C$ (Derry et al., 1992) and apparent high levels of ocean phosphate (Planavsky et al., 2010; Cook and Shergold, 1984), both of which point to high rates of organic carbon burial following deglaciation.

The work in this chapter provides a direct link between the termination of snowball glaciations and long term high-productivity periods. It is suggested that the persistence of rapid (i.e. above steady state) weathering rates over a $\sim 10^7$ year timescale in the snowball aftermath led to the high global nutrient concentration and organic burial rates recorded by proxies. Global abundance of nutrient may have assisted the diversification of biota surviving the snowball event, and oxygen concentration would be expected to rise during these periods, however the model used does not include dynamic representation of oxygen: the Phanerozoic-based equations break down at the low O$_2$ concentrations predicted during extreme glaciation. Assuming the snowball Earth - transport limitation scenario, the expected oxygen concentration throughout the Neoproterozoic would be oscillatory, rather than the step change inferred from proxies (Scott et al., 2008). A further mechanism is required to explain the apparent system shift from the low-O$_2$ Proterozoic
to the high-O\textsubscript{2} Phanerozoic (e.g. Lenton and Watson (2004)).

Broadly speaking, the results from this chapter support the existence of a link between deep glaciation and long-term oxidation. A period of \( \sim 10^7 \) years of increased oxygen concentration is predicted to follow a snowball Earth event. A sequence of glaciations with a similar timing to those in the Neoproterozoic is recorded in geological record between 2.4-2.1Ga, and appears to contain at least one low-latitude event (Papineau, 2010; Evans et al., 1997; Bekker et al., 2001). These glaciations are synchronous with Paleoproterozoic oxygenation and have been linked to oxygen rise through increased delivery of nutrients during regional postglacial thawing (Papineau et al., 2007) or during a possible snowball aftermath (Harada et al., 2012).

A long 200Myr positive carbon isotope excursion is seen following the glacial period (Karhu and Holland, 1996), and a shorter 50Myr excursion appears to follow the final glaciation (Bekker et al., 2006). The findings in this chapter would imply a long period of oxygenation following the proposed snowball event, and would suggest a carbon isotope signal similar to the 50Myr peak described in ref (Bekker et al., 2006). However, timing of the Paleoproterozoic low latitude glaciation is disputed (Kopp et al., 2005; Hilburn et al., 2005) and more detail is required for full analysis of the implications of the transport limitation mechanism. A further limitation is the likely differences between the early and late Proterozoic carbon cycles (Hayes and Waldbauer, 2006), making application of the current Phanerozoic-based model difficult.

Here it is shown that the existence of a weathering limit may explain how the Earth operates under extreme conditions. However, a detailed understanding of the mechanics of the silicate weathering process is still missing from the models considered in this thesis, the weathering process can be limited by a combination of local kinetic and tectonic factors (Riebe et al., 2004; West et al., 2005; Millot et al., 2002; West, 2008), which makes extrapolation to the global scale difficult.
5 A model for CO$_2$ and O$_2$ over the Proterozoic

5.1 Introduction

The simple biogeochemical models explored in this thesis have proved useful for examining Phanerozoic climate, and whilst they function tolerably well to investigate mechanisms controlling carbon dioxide and temperature in the Neoproterozoic, atmospheric oxygen predictions for this time are not consistent with data. Oxygen concentration over the Proterozoic is presumed to have been between $10^{-1}$ and $10^{-2}$ PAL, but there are is no consensus as to whether this was a generally stable concentration or if there was a continuous rise or decline during this period (Kump, 2008; Canfield, 2005). Changes in carbon and sulphur cycling on the timescale of $10^9$ years may have exerted various controls on oxygen concentration during this time that are not represented in current Phanerozoic models (Hayes and Waldbauer, 2006).

The rise in oxygen during the Neoproterozoic is becoming well constrained but is still poorly understood (Shields-Zhou and Och, 2011), there have been many suggested causes (e.g. Lenton and Watson (2004); Kennedy et al. (2006)) but no firm agreement on the dominating processes or specific characteristics. In this chapter the minimal model is expanded to include long term processes between the crust and mantle, with the intention of investigating both climate and atmospheric oxygen concentration over the last 2Ga.

5.2 Modelling interactions of the mantle with the surface system

In addition to the cycling of carbon and sulphur through the crust, oceans and atmosphere, longer term ‘deep’ cycles exists between the entire surface system and the mantle (Walter et al., 2011; Schidlowski, 1989). Oceanic crust is continually exported deep into the mantle at subduction zones (Hilst et al., 1997), and carbon is transferred from the mantle to the surface at mid ocean ridges and spreading centres (Saal et al., 2002; Resing et al., 2004),
accompanied by significant fluxes of iron and sulphur species (Elderfield and Schultz, 1996; Marais, 1997).

5.2.1 Ocean crust carbonization and long term CO$_2$ stability

The model of Sleep and Zahnle (2001) adds the mantle cycle for carbon to a simple geochemical system similar to the GEOCARB and COPSE models. The paper discusses what is potentially a very important stabilising mechanism in the long term cycle - seafloor basalt carbonization (Francois and Walker, 1992; Caldeira, 1995). In the terrestrial carbon cycle, the silicate weathering mechanism acts to stabilise atmospheric CO$_2$ concentration by transferring carbon from the atmosphere to the crust (Walker et al., 1981) and the assumed changes to the weathering process over time drive current predictions for Phanerozoic CO$_2$ concentration (see chapter 2). Hydrothermal carbonisation of basalts (hereafter ocean crust carbonization (OCC)) occurs when warm seawater flows through the oceanic crust, allowing transfer of carbon from the ocean into the crust, and may be responsible for production of carbonate veins and disseminated carbonate found in drilling exercises (Alt and Teagle, 1999).

The authors argue for a dependence of this process on ocean CO$_2$ concentration that could perhaps be as strong as linear (i.e. $F_{OCC} \propto RCO_2$) if reactions were fast and allowed a superabundance of cations (Francois and Walker, 1992). However experimental evidence places a much weaker dependence on this, the laboratory data of Brady and Gislason (1997) suggests that $F_{OCC} \propto (RCO_2)^{0.23}$. Assuming some dependence on CO$_2$ concentration allows the OCC sink to have negative feedback on atmospheric concentration in a very similar way to the silicate weathering flux, providing an additional stabilising mechanism for the carbon cycle. Note that the high temperature reaction with fresh mid ocean ridge basalts (MORBs) results in CO$_2$ input to the ocean rather than a sink (Su and Langmuir, 2003; Saal et al., 2002; Hayes and Waldbauer, 2006).

Figure 5.2.1 shows the CO$_2$ predictions for Sleep and Zahnle’s model with respect to parameters $\alpha$ and $\beta$, here $\alpha$ is the assumed dependence of OCC on CO$_2$ concentration and $\beta$ is the dependence of terrestrial silicate weathering on CO$_2$. Higher values of $\alpha$ result in lower predictions for atmospheric CO$_2$ in
the Precambrian, as would be expected due to a stronger negative feedback.

The OCC rate is assumed to scale with the rate of creation of warm crust (see equation 12 in Sleep and Zahnle (2001)), which has declined over time (Franck et al., 1999), therefore the feedback on CO$_2$ via this mechanism would be expected to be stronger in the Precambrian than the Phanerozoic. It can been seen in figure 5.2.1 that different choices for $\alpha$ produce model predictions that correlate well for the Phanerozoic, but diverge further back in time. The results here give a CO$_2$ range of 20-40 PAL at 900Ma when vascular plant enhancement is considered, very similar to the predictions of the Minimal Model in this thesis ($\sim$ 30PAL at 900Ma). It is found that maintaining a warm climate further back in Earth history is possible in this model, but requires low choices for both $\alpha$ and $\beta$.

![Figure 5.2.1: Atmospheric CO$_2$ histories from the model of Sleep and Zahnle (2001). Here $\alpha$ shows the dependence of OCC on CO$_2$ concentration and $\beta$ shows the dependence of silicate weathering on CO$_2$. Solid lines show solution when enhancement of terrestrial weathering by vascular plants is not considered, dashed and dotted lines show solutions where enhancement by vascular plants is permitted. Grey line for the Phanerozoic shows results of the GEOCARB model. Copied directly from Sleep and Zahnle (2001) (fig 12a).](image-url)
5.2.2 Carbon dioxide input at mid ocean ridges, the mantle $\text{CO}_2$ cycle, and the growth of the crustal carbon reservoir

Clarification of the input flux of $\text{CO}_2$ at mid ocean ridges (Saal et al., 2002; Resing et al., 2004) has recently allowed for a detailed model of the surface-mantle carbon cycle over the last 4Ga, which allows for a reconstruction of crustal carbon accumulation (Hayes and Waldbauer, 2006). The authors scale mantle $\text{CO}_2$ input to the high temperature heat flow at spreading centres (Lowell and Keller, 2003; Sleep and Zahnle, 2001) and fluxes into the mantle are calculated from the difference between subduction trench input (Holser et al., 1988; Bach and Edwards, 2003) and volatile emissions (Hilton et al., 2002). Figure 5.2.2a shows the estimated time-dependant flux of $\text{CO}_2$ from mid-ocean ridges alongside the crustal carbon content.

![Figure 5.2.2: Model results from Hayes and Waldbauer (2006). a. Mantle-to-crust flux of carbon. b. Total crustal carbon. Both figures copied from Hayes and Waldbauer (2006)](image-url)
Growth of the crustal reservoir occurs because the CO\textsubscript{2} input flux exceeds the export flux of crustal carbon to the mantle. Growth is fastest in early Earth history and declines as mantle heat flow decreases. The overall redox balance of the system requires that the build-up of reduced crustal carbon is coupled with oxygenation of some other species, and the authors suggest this may have been represented by ferric iron being subducted to the mantle (based on a maximum increase in mantle oxygen fugacity of 0.3 log units over the last 3.5Ga (Li and Lee, 2004)). By combining this model carbon cycle with an organic burial fraction derived from the carbon isotope record (Hayes et al., 1999; Melezhik et al., 1999) it is possible to estimate the history of the crustal organic carbon reservoir (see figure 9 in Hayes and Waldbauer (2006)), but the model does not feature a dynamic oxygen reservoir and so does not provide predictions for atmospheric O\textsubscript{2}.

5.3 Model development

The Minimal Model is now expanded following the treatments described above. Figure 5.3.3 shows a cartoon of the processes involved, figure 5.3.4 shows a more practical (though thoroughly less inspiring) flux diagram.

![Figure 5.3.3: Cartoon of Mantle model. Bubbles show model reservoirs, arrows represent fluxes, dashed arrows show subduction fluxes.](image-url)
The nutrient system from COPSE is used to estimate productivity to allow prediction of isotope fractionation and organic burial rates based on the other model variables. The global temperature function follows the RCM approximation described in the previous chapter (Mills et al., 2011).

Figure 5.3.4: Schematic diagram of mantle model fluxes. $F_w$ represents a weathering flux, $F_m$ represents a metamorphic/degassing flux, $F_b$ shows a burial flux, $F_s$ shows a subduction flux, $F_i$ is a mantle input flux and $F_{occ}$ is the ocean crust carbonization flux.
In addition to the minimal model fluxes each crustal reservoir is assumed to undergo subduction to mantle, the ocean crust carbonization sink is assumed to transfer CO$_2$ from the ocean/atmosphere box to the crust and the mantle is assumed to input both CO$_2$ and reduced sulphur. Sulphur input is modelled as pyrite in order to represent both the sulphur and iron fluxes observed at ridges (Elderfield and Schultz, 1996) and to fit with the previous model scheme. Throughout the remainder of this work I will refer to this as the ‘Mantle Model’, in order to compare to the previously developed ‘Minimal Model’.

5.3.1 Model forcings

The intention is to run this model for the last 2Ga, therefore all the forcings described in the simple model must be defined for this period, along with any additional forcings required. The extended forcings for the mantle model are shown in figure 5.3.5, panels a and b show forcings inherited from the minimal model, panel c shows new forcings.

The uplift (U), degassing (D) and solar (S) forcings are extended to 2Ga following their derivation in chapter 4. The uplift rate scales with the normalised seawater strontium curve of Shields (2005) and degassing rate scales with the spreading rate approximated by the square of the heat flow. Note the heat flow used to calculate the spreading rate follows the method used to approximate CO$_2$ input (Lowell and Keller, 2003; Sleep and Zahnle, 2001). Phanerozoic biological forcings for weathering enhancement (W), the C-P burial ratio on land (CPland), burial depth of carbonates (B) and evolution of plant-environment feedbacks (E) require no extension beyond the Phanerozoic and are copied directly from COPSE (Bergman et al., 2004).

The weathering enhancement related to the evolution of vascular plants is taken here as four-fold, following recent GEOCARB models (Berner, 2006a). Three new forcings are added: Q shows the mantle heat flow, and PW1, PW2 represent possible Precambrian weathering forcings that will be trialled in the model. For simplicity, and because of the Precambrian focus of the model, the Q forcing is not altered in the Phanerozoic using sea level inversion data (Gaffin, 1987) as might be attempted (i.e. Q ≈ $\sqrt{D}$).

PW1 shows an assumed enhancement to terrestrial weathering kinetics
during the late Neoproterozoic due to continental dispersal, prevalence of masses land at low latitudes, and increased area of basaltic provinces (Goderis et al., 2003; Donnadieu et al., 2004; Li et al., 2008), the magnitude of this forcing follows Mills et al. (2011) and the work in chapter 3.

![Diagram of mantle model forcings](image)

**Figure 5.3.5: Mantle model forcings.** a,b. Forcings from the simple model extended to 2Ga, W = weathering enhancement due to plant evolution, U = uplift, D = degassing, S = relative solar constant, CPland = C-P burial ratio on land, E = evolution of land plant climate feedbacks, B = burial depth of carbonates. c. Additional forcings for mantle model. PW1 = possible Neoproterozoic weathering efficiency increase, PW2 = possible change in biological weathering enhancement from early land colonisation, Q = relative mantle heat flux.

The PW2 forcing is based on the likely enhancement of weathering due to the radiation of simple organisms on the land surface during the Neoproterozoic (Heckman et al., 2001; Kennedy et al., 2006). Evidence for microbial
structures in dry regions is found as early as 1200-1000Ma (Prave, 2002; Horodyski and Knauth, 1994), fossilised plant spores appear at \( \sim 470\)Ma (Rubinstein et al., 2010; Wellman and Gray, 2000) and the earliest recorded land plant fragments are seen in the 460-450Ma Caradoc period (Wellman et al., 2003). These findings all predate the biotic weathering enhancements used in the COPSE and GEOCARB models and clearly require some representation in a long term model, especially given the power of biotic forcings in current models (Berner, 1997). Land biota mechanically stabilizes soil profiles and increases fluid residence time (Retallack, 2001) and recent microcosm experiments using mosses have shown that non-vascular plants can considerably enhance silicate weathering over background abiotic levels (Lenton et al., 2012). These experiments produce enhancement factors for Ca and Mg removal of \( \sim 1.5 \) times on a granite substrate, and 3.6 (Ca) and 5.4 (Mg) times on andesite. For this model the PW2 biotic forcing is taken to increase linearly over the period 1000-500Ma, representing a two-fold weathering enhancement between the completely abiotic state and the pre-vascular stage.

5.3.2 Additional flux calculations

The following additional fluxes are defined for the mantle model. The naming of fluxes corresponds to the schematic diagram in figure 5.3.4.

**Ocean crust carbonization (OCC)**

Following Sleep and Zahnle (2001), the flux of ocean crust carbonization \((F_{occ})\) is allowed a dependence on CO\(_2\) concentration with a power law relationship denoted by \(\alpha\), and a dependence on the spreading rate, which is taken as the square of the heat flux \(Q\) (see equation 3.5.3).

\[
F_{occ} = k_{occ} \cdot Q^2 \cdot \left( \frac{R_{CO_2}}{R_{CO_2}(0)} \right)^\alpha
\]  
(5.3.1)

where \(k_{occ} = 1.65 \times 10^{12} \) mol/yr is the present day rate (Sleep and Zahnle, 2001; Elderfield and Schultz, 1996).

**Mantle inputs**

The expression for the mantle input of CO\(_2\) follows Hayes and Waldbauer (2006), assuming a present day input rate of \(k_{ic} = 2.2 \times 10^{12} \) mol/yr and
scaling with the mantle heat flux.

\[ F_{ic} = k_{ic} \cdot Q \]  

(5.3.2)

Input of iron and reduced sulphur at mid ocean ridges is modelled as pyrite and added to the crustal pyrite reservoir. This treatment is intended to represent sulphide delivered to the surface as magmatic-hydrothermal ores (Seo et al., 2009; Gustafson and Hunt, 1975), and the input rate is assumed to scale with the rate of generation of new crust, \( Q^2 \).

\[ F_{ips} = k_{ips} \cdot Q^2 \]  

(5.3.3)

here \( k_{ips} \) is the present day rate. Estimated values for Fe input are \( 0.23 - 1.9 \times 10^{11} \) mol/yr and reduced S input of \( 0.95 - 9.6 \times 10^{11} \) mol/yr (Elderfield and Schultz, 1996). The value of \( k_{ips} \) is calculated for system stability and based on these limits.

**Subduction fluxes**

Rates of subduction to the mantle are assumed to be proportional to the size of the crustal reservoir and to the global spreading rate:

\[ F_{sg} = k_{sg} \cdot Q^2 \cdot \left( \frac{G}{G_0} \right), F_{sc} = k_{sc} \cdot Q^2 \cdot \left( \frac{C}{C_0} \right), \]  

(5.3.4)

\[ F_{sps} = k_{sps} \cdot Q^2 \cdot \left( \frac{PYR}{PYR_0} \right), F_{sgs} = k_{sgs} \cdot Q^2 \cdot \left( \frac{GYP}{GYP_0} \right) \]  

(5.3.5)

assuming a present day rate of loss of C to the mantle of \( 1.2 \times 10^{12} \) mol/yr (Hayes and Waldbauer, 2006), dividing according to the mass of the crustal reservoirs gives \( k_{sc} = 1.02 \times 10^{12} \) mol/yr, \( k_{sg} = 1.8 \times 10^{11} \) mol/yr. Annual loss of pyrite sulphur to the mantle is \( k_{sps} = 3.6 \times 10^{11} \) mol/yr (Canfield, 2004), assuming the same fraction of total oxidised sulphur is lost gives \( k_{sgs} = 4 \times 10^{11} \).

**5.3.3 Present day steady state calculation**

In the COPSE and GEOCARB models, unknown fluxes are calculated such that the ocean/atmosphere and crustal reservoirs preserve steady state at present day. A less powerful constraint is applied in this work. It is assumed
that the atmosphere/ocean reservoirs of oxygen, carbon dioxide and sulphate are at steady state at present day, but the crustal reservoirs are not forced to be steady. The size of the mantle reservoirs is not calculated in this model, as none of the mantle fluxes depend on these values.

Using the constants from the previous model and the newly defined fluxes, assuming steady state at present day with respect to oxygen yields:

\[ k_{wg} = k_{bg} - k_{mg} + (15/8) * (k_{bps} - k_{wps} - k_{mps}) = 7 \times 10^{12} \text{mol/yr} \quad (5.3.6) \]

Assuming steady state for present day ocean/atmosphere CO\(_2\) results in:

\[ k_{bc} = k_{wg} + k_{mg} + k_{wc} + k_{mc} + k_{ic} - k_{bg} - k_{occ} = 1.98 \times 10^{13} \text{mol/yr} \quad (5.3.7) \]

For the sulphur cycle, the present day burial rates of oxidised and reduced sulphur are defined and the rates of weathering are calculated for stability. For simplicity, it is assumed that total rate of sulphur loss to the mantle is equal to the sulphur input rate, i.e:

\[ k_{ips} = k_{sps} + k_{sgs} = 7.6 \times 10^{11} \text{mol/yr} \quad (5.3.8) \]

This value for S input is close to the maximum value of \(9.6 \times 10^{11} \text{ mol/yr}\) proposed in Elderfield and Schultz (1996), whilst the assumed Fe input of \(3.8 \times 10^{11} \text{ mol/yr}\) is double the value suggested in the same paper. However, similar global iron input has been estimated by other authors (e.g. \(3 \times 10^{11} \text{ mol/yr}\) (Holland, 2006)). Estimates for the present day rate of pyrite burial range from 0.53 – 1.87 \(\times 10^{12} \text{ mol/yr}\) (Kump and Garrels, 1986; Bottrell and Newton, 2006; Arvidson et al., 2006), an average estimate of \(k_{bps} = 1 \times 10^{12} \text{mol/yr}\) is taken. Following COPSE and GEOCARB gypsum burial is assumed to be double this, i.e. \(k_{bgs} = 2 \times 10^{12} \text{mol/yr}\). This gives a total S burial rate of \(3 \times 10^{12} \text{mol/yr}\) which is roughly equivalent to the total continental S weathering flux calculated in Bottrell and Newton (2006). Degassing fluxes are taken from GEOCARB, giving \(k_{mps} = 0.25 \times 10^{12} \text{mol/yr}\) and \(k_{mgs} = 0.5 \times 10^{12} \text{mol/yr}\). The equation for stability of ocean sulphate then gives:
\[ k_{\text{wgs}} = k_{\text{sgs}} - k_{\text{mgs}} + k_{\text{bgs}} = 1.1 \times 10^{11} \text{mol/yr} \quad (5.3.9) \]

\[ k_{\text{wps}} = k_{\text{bps}} - k_{\text{mgs}} + k_{\text{sags}} = 1.15 \times 10^{12} \text{mol/yr} \quad (5.3.10) \]

These derived weathering rates fall between previous estimates \((k_{\text{wps}}: 0.53 - 1.79 \times 10^{12} \text{ mol/yr} \quad \text{(Arvidson et al., 2006; Kump and Garrels, 1986)}, \ k_{\text{wgs}}: 1 - 2 \times 10^{12} \text{ mol/yr} \quad \text{(Berner, 1994)})\) and follow previous models by assuming steady state of the present day sulphur cycle.

### 5.3.4 Carbon and sulphur isotope fractionation

As in the simplified Neoproterozoic model, the isotopic fractionation of the carbon and sulphur reservoirs is calculated at each timestep. Here a different method is used to improve computational efficiency, instead of explicitly calculating the number of moles of each isotope, the model calculates the size of the reservoir multiplied by its \(\delta^{13}\text{C}\) (for carbon) or \(\delta^{34}\text{S}\) (for sulphur) value. i.e. for the ocean and atmosphere carbon reservoir, \(A\), we require \(A \times \delta^{13}\text{C}(A)\). This new quantity is then divided by the reservoir size to obtain results for isotope fractionation. The treatment here follows from the GEOCARB models (Berner, 2006a, 2009) with the difference that \(\delta^{13}\text{C}\) and \(\delta^{34}\text{S}\) are predicted rather than used as input.

Hypothesised fractionation effects will be tested in this model using an ensemble of runs: a constant fractionation effect upon organic burial of carbon and sulphur, a variable fractionation during marine carbonate burial (Bergman et al., 2004; Mills et al., 2011), a constant fractionation effect during ocean crust carbonization (Bjerrum and Canfield, 2004) and a oxygen-dependent fractionation effect associated with pyrite burial (Berner, 2001).

### 5.3.5 Starting values for 2Ga

This system has many negative feedback mechanisms that regulate the size of the ocean and atmosphere reservoirs on a timescale of the order \(10^6\) years. If the starting concentrations for the atmosphere/ocean species are altered, the model stabilizes within a (typically < 100Myr) spin-up period. To ensure the system is started from a stable state the model is run twice. The 'spun
up’ reservoir sizes for the current parameter configuration are obtained on the first run, which begins at present day reservoir concentrations, the final run is then initiated with these as the starting values. The first 100Ma of model runs are not shown in the figures (model is initiated at 2.1Ga to return predictions for 0-2Ga). The size of the crustal carbon reservoirs is expected to rise over time, it is found that recovery of present day values requires $G = 0.65G_0$ and $C = 0.65C_0$ at 2.1Ga. In the model of Hayes and Waldbauer the total crustal carbon at 2.1Ga is $\sim 0.6$ times present day.

5.3.6 Full model equations

The mantle model system is laid out mathematically in the following tables:
### Table 9: Reservoir calculations for Mantle model

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Equation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Phosphate</td>
<td>[ \frac{dP}{dt} = psea - mopb - capb - fepb ]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oxygen</td>
<td>[ \frac{dO}{dt} = F_{bg} - F_{wg} - F_{mg} + \frac{15}{8} (F_{bps} - F_{wps} - F_{mps}) ]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Atmosphere/ocean CO₂</td>
<td>[ \frac{dA}{dt} = -F_{bg} + F_{wg} + F_{wc} + F_{mg} + F_{mc} - F_{bc} - F_{occ} + F_{ic} ]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ocean sulphate</td>
<td>[ \frac{dS}{dt} = F_{wgs} + F_{wps} - F_{bgs} - F_{bps} + F_{mgs} + F_{mps} ]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Buried organic carbon</td>
<td>[ \frac{dG}{dt} = F_{bg} - F_{wg} - F_{mg} - F_{sg} ]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Buried carbonate carbon</td>
<td>[ \frac{dC}{dt} = F_{bc} + F_{occ} - F_{wc} - F_{mc} - F_{sc} ]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Buried pyrite sulphur</td>
<td>[ \frac{dPYR}{dt} = F_{bps} + F_{ips} - F_{wps} - F_{mps} - F_{sps} ]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Buried gypsum sulphur</td>
<td>[ \frac{dGYP}{dt} = F_{bgs} - F_{wgs} - F_{mgs} - F_{sgs} ]</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Table 10: Model forcings

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Meaning</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>U</td>
<td>Relative global uplift rate</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D</td>
<td>Relative global degassing rate</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>S</td>
<td>Solar forcing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>W</td>
<td>Weathering enhancement in the Phanerzoic due to vascular plant evolution</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PW1</td>
<td>Weathering enhancement in the late Neoproterozoic due to continental configuration</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PW2</td>
<td>Weathering enhancement across the Neoproterozoic due to land colonisation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q</td>
<td>Relative mantle heat flux</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CP_{land}</td>
<td>Carbon-to-phosphorus burial ratio increase during the Permo-Carboniferous</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B</td>
<td>Increased carbonate degassing in the Mesozoic due to burial of calcareous plankton</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Name</td>
<td>Shorthand</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-------------------------------</td>
<td>-----------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nutrient weathering</td>
<td>phosw</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Silicate weathering</td>
<td>silw</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Carbonate weathering</td>
<td>F_wc</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oxidative weathering</td>
<td>F_wg</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pyrite weathering</td>
<td>F_wps</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gypsum weathering</td>
<td>F_wgs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ocean crust carbonization</td>
<td>F_occ</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Organic carbon degassing</td>
<td>F_mg</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Carbonate carbon degassing</td>
<td>F_mc</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pyrite sulphur degassing</td>
<td>F_mps</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gypsum sulphur degassing</td>
<td>F_mps</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Carbonate carbon mantle input</td>
<td>F_ic</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pyrite sulphur mantle input</td>
<td>F_ips</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Organic carbon subduction</td>
<td>F_sg</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Carbonate carbon subduction</td>
<td>F_sc</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pyrite sulphur subduction</td>
<td>F_sps</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gypsum sulphur subduction</td>
<td>F_sgs</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Table 11:** List of fluxes in Mantle model
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Shorthand</th>
<th>Equation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Pyrite sulphur burial</td>
<td>$F_{bps}$</td>
<td>$k_{bps} \left( \frac{S}{S_0} \right)^{mod_{b}}$</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gypsum sulphur burial</td>
<td>$F_{bgs}$</td>
<td>$k_{bgs} \left( \frac{S}{S_0} \right)$</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Marine carbonate carbon burial</td>
<td>$F_{bc}$</td>
<td>$F_{wc} + silw$</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Marine organic carbon burial</td>
<td>$mocb$</td>
<td>$k_{mocb} \left( \frac{P}{P_0} \right)^2$</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Land organic carbon burial</td>
<td>$locb$</td>
<td>$k_{locb}^{pland} \cdot CP_{land}$</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total organic carbon burial</td>
<td>$F_{bg}$</td>
<td>$mocb + locb$</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Marine organic phosphate burial</td>
<td>$mopb$</td>
<td>$mocb^{CP_{sea}}$</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Calcium-bound phosphate burial</td>
<td>$capb$</td>
<td>$k_{capb}^{mocb}$</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Iron-sorbed phosphate burial*</td>
<td>$fepb$</td>
<td>$\frac{k_4}{k_4} \left( 1 - anox \left( O, P \right) \right)$</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>where anox = $1 - k_{oxfrac} \left( \frac{O}{O_0}, \frac{P}{P_0} \right)$</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>P delivered to ocean</td>
<td>$psea$</td>
<td>$phosw - locb$</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Table 12:** List of fluxes in Mantle model (continued)
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Meaning</th>
<th>Size</th>
<th>Source</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>$k_{mocb}$</td>
<td>Marine organic carbon burial</td>
<td>$4.5 \times 10^{12}$ mol C yr$^{-1}$</td>
<td>COPSE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$k_{locb}$</td>
<td>Land organic carbon burial</td>
<td>$4.5 \times 10^{12}$ mol C yr$^{-1}$</td>
<td>COPSE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$k_{capb}$</td>
<td>Ca associated phosphorus burial</td>
<td>$1.5 \times 10^{10}$ mol P yr$^{-1}$</td>
<td>COPSE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$k_{fepb}$</td>
<td>Fe associated phosphorus burial</td>
<td>$6 \times 10^{9}$ mol P yr$^{-1}$</td>
<td>COPSE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$k_{bps}$</td>
<td>Pyrite burial</td>
<td>$1 \times 10^{12}$ mol S yr$^{-1}$</td>
<td>average from Kump and Garrels (1986); Bottrell and Newton (2006); Arvidson et al. (2006)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$k_{bgs}$</td>
<td>Gypsum burial</td>
<td>$2 \times 10^{12}$ mol S yr$^{-1}$</td>
<td>relationship to $k_{bps}$ (Berner, 2006a)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$k_{bc}$</td>
<td>Carbonate carbon burial</td>
<td>$1.98 \times 10^{13}$ mol S yr$^{-1}$</td>
<td>for steady state</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$k_{occ}$</td>
<td>Ocean crust carbonization</td>
<td>$1.65 \times 10^{12}$ mol C yr$^{-1}$</td>
<td>Sleep and Zahnle (2001)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$k_{silw}$</td>
<td>Silicate weathering</td>
<td>$6.45 \times 10^{12}$ mol C yr$^{-1}$</td>
<td>$k_{bc} - k_{wc}$</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$k_{wc}$</td>
<td>Carbonate weathering</td>
<td>$1.335 \times 10^{13}$ mol C yr$^{-1}$</td>
<td>COPSE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$k_{wg}$</td>
<td>Oxidative weathering</td>
<td>$7 \times 10^{12}$ mol C yr$^{-1}$</td>
<td>for steady state</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$k_{phosw}$</td>
<td>Reactive phosphorus weathering</td>
<td>$4.35 \times 10^{10}$ mol P yr$^{-1}$</td>
<td>for steady state</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$k_{wps}$</td>
<td>Pyrite weathering</td>
<td>$1.15 \times 10^{12}$ mol S yr$^{-1}$</td>
<td>for steady state</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$k_{wgs}$</td>
<td>Gypsum weathering</td>
<td>$1.1 \times 10^{12}$ mol S yr$^{-1}$</td>
<td>for steady state</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$k_{mg}$</td>
<td>Organic carbon degassing</td>
<td>$2.5 \times 10^{12}$ mol C yr$^{-1}$</td>
<td>COPSE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$k_{nc}$</td>
<td>Carbonate carbon degassing</td>
<td>$6.65 \times 10^{12}$ mol C yr$^{-1}$</td>
<td>COPSE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$k_{mps}$</td>
<td>Pyrite sulphur degassing</td>
<td>$2.5 \times 10^{11}$ mol S yr$^{-1}$</td>
<td>Berner (2006)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$k_{mgs}$</td>
<td>Gypsum sulphur degassing</td>
<td>$5 \times 10^{11}$ mol S yr$^{-1}$</td>
<td>Berner (2006)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Table 13:** List of constants for Mantle model.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Meaning</th>
<th>Size</th>
<th>Source</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>$k_{ic}$</td>
<td>Mantle carbonate input</td>
<td>$2.2 \times 10^{12}$ mol C yr$^{-1}$</td>
<td>Hayes and Waldbauer (2006)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$k_{ips}$</td>
<td>Mantle pyrite input</td>
<td>$7.6 \times 10^{11}$ mol S yr$^{-1}$</td>
<td>for steady state</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$k_{sg}$</td>
<td>Organic carbon subduction</td>
<td>$1.8 \times 10^{11}$ mol C yr$^{-1}$</td>
<td>derived from Hayes and Waldbauer (2006)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$k_{sc}$</td>
<td>Carbonate carbon subduction</td>
<td>$1.02 \times 10^{12}$ mol C yr$^{-1}$</td>
<td>derived from Hayes and Waldbauer (2006)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$k_{sps}$</td>
<td>Pyrite sulphur subduction</td>
<td>$3.6 \times 10^{11}$ mol S yr$^{-1}$</td>
<td>Canfield (2004)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$k_{sgs}$</td>
<td>Gypsum sulphur subduction</td>
<td>$4 \times 10^{11}$ mol S yr$^{-1}$</td>
<td>derived from Canfield (2004)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$k_{oefrac}$</td>
<td>Initial oxic fraction</td>
<td>0.86</td>
<td>COPSE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$CP_{sea}$</td>
<td>C:P burial ratio</td>
<td>250 mol:mol</td>
<td>COPSE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$pland$</td>
<td>fraction of phosphorus buried on land</td>
<td>0.10345</td>
<td>COPSE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$k_{O2}$</td>
<td>Constant for calculating $O_2$(atm) from oxygen reservoir</td>
<td>3.762</td>
<td>COPSE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$P_0$</td>
<td>Present day ocean phosphate</td>
<td>$3.1 \times 10^{15}$ mol</td>
<td>COPSE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$O_0$</td>
<td>Present day atmosphere/ocean $O_2$</td>
<td>$3.7 \times 10^{19}$ mol</td>
<td>COPSE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$A_0$</td>
<td>Present day atmosphere/ocean $CO_2$</td>
<td>$3.193 \times 10^{18}$ mol</td>
<td>COPSE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$S_0$</td>
<td>Present day ocean sulphate</td>
<td>$4 \times 10^{19}$ mol</td>
<td>COPSE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$G_0$</td>
<td>Present day crustal organic carbon</td>
<td>$1.275 \times 10^{21}$ mol</td>
<td>Hayes and Waldbauer (2006)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$C_0$</td>
<td>Present day crustal carbonate carbon</td>
<td>$7.225 \times 10^{21}$ mol</td>
<td>Hayes and Waldbauer (2006)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$PYR_0$</td>
<td>Present day crustal pyrite</td>
<td>$1.8 \times 10^{20}$ mol</td>
<td>COPSE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$GYP_0$</td>
<td>Present day crustal gypsum</td>
<td>$2 \times 10^{20}$ mol</td>
<td>COPSE</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Table 14:** List of constants for Mantle model (continued).
5.4 Model results and comparison to previous study

The Mantle Model is now run from 2.1Ga to present. The model baseline is subject to the forcings U (Uplift rate), D (degassing rate), S (solar constant), W (weathering enhancement due to vascular plants), B (carbonate burial depth), CPsea (C-P burial ratio) and Q (mantle heat flow). The dependence on OCC rate on CO$_2$ for the baseline model is $\alpha = 0.23$ (Brady and Gislason, 1997), and additional weathering forcings PW1 and PW2 are not included. Figure 5.4.6 shows the mantle model predictions plotted against the predictions from the previous Minimal Model run for the same timeframe. Here the Minimal Model is subject to the same forcing set as the Mantle Model, aside from the heat flow forcing, which does not apply to any of the calculations in the Minimal Model.

Oxygen concentration is plotted against a range of proxy constraints from Goldblatt et al. (2006) (supplementary figure 1). This includes paleosol data (Rye and Holland, 1998), the assumed oxygen demands for fossil fauna (Runnegar, 1991; Canfield and Teske, 1996) and a lower limit for oxygen concentration when fossilised charcoal is found (Rowe and Jones, 2000). Phanerozoic proxy constraints for CO$_2$ are taken from Royer et al. (2004), with Precambrian constraints from the compilation of Kah and Riding (2007). The Precambrian proxies are derived from various methods which are denoted by upper case letters in the figures in which they appear.

The predictions from the Minimal Model (green) show a decreasing trend in oxygen and carbon dioxide concentration over the last 2Ga, following the trend shown when this model was run for 900-0Ma in chapter 3. Further back in time, the solar constant is reduced, which lowers surface temperature and therefore weathering efficiency. This requires higher CO$_2$ to stabilize the system via the silicate weathering feedback (Walker et al., 1981). The degassing rate continuously rises further back in time, requiring more CO$_2$ to be buried via weathering to stabilize the system, which requires a higher global weathering rate and therefore more CO$_2$ residing in the ocean/atmosphere box. Due to higher weathering rates, ocean nutrient concentration is predicted to exceed the present day concentration in the Paleoproterozoic, resulting in atmospheric oxygen concentration around present day levels at 2Ga.
Figure 5.4.6: Mantle model baseline compared to simple model Mantle model shown in black, simple model in green. a, relative atmospheric oxygen concentration. Paleosol data (Rye and Holland, 1998) are shown as grey circles with arrows to distinguish between a minimum or maximum estimate. Grey horizontal lines show assumed fanual requirements (Runnegar, 1991; Canfield and Teske, 1996), with the species name in black, ‘charcoal’ refers to the lower limit for oxygen required by the existence of fossil charcoal. Proxy figure from Goldblatt et al. (2006) b, relative ocean/atmosphere CO$_2$ concentration. Grey shaded areas represent estimates for CO$_2$ concentration from paleosol data (A) (Sheldon, 2006), carbon isotope modelling (D) (Kah and Bartley, 2004) and the Phanerozoic compilation of proxies (Royer et al., 2004). Grey circles with arrows show upper and lower bound estimates from composition of fossil acritarchs (B) (Kaufman and Xiao, 2003) and cyanobacteria (C) (Kah and Riding, 2007). c, average global surface temperature plotted against the glacial record from this work (where the positive y axis indicates more severe glaciation). d, ocean crust carbonization flux. e, ocean phosphate reservoir. f rate of burial of organic carbon. Original in colour.
Results for the mantle model (black) show a notable response to the additional processes included, differing considerably from the minimal model. The ocean crust carbonization flux provides an additional sink for CO₂, and because the rate of carbon removal is linked to the spreading rate, the sink becomes more powerful further back in time. A larger carbon sink in the ocean acts to counter the higher CO₂ degassing rate, requiring less removal of carbon by terrestrial silicate weathering. Predictions for CO₂ from the mantle model fit well with proxies for the Paleoproterozoic but do not replicate the expect low CO₂ and temperature in the Neoproterozoic.

In the Minimal Model, high global weathering rates in the Precambrian result in ocean nutrient concentration markedly higher than present day and result in prediction of high oxygen concentration (0.25-1 PAL) over the Proterozoic. In the Mantle Model, CO₂ removal via OCC results in lower rates of terrestrial weathering and less nutrient is delivered to the surface ocean. The mantle model predicts a fairly stable nutrient concentration through the Proterozoic, at levels close to the present day. The resulting oxygen prediction is 0.1-0.2PAL for the period 2000-400Ma. Stability of Proterozoic O₂ and CO₂ is a result of the dependence of both the degassing rate and OCC rate on the global spreading rate. A higher degassing rate requires that more carbon be buried to stabilise the system, resulting in the high-O₂ solution in the Minimal Model. In the Mantle Model, an equally enhanced OCC rate provides a sink for the additional carbon which does not require elevated productivity.

The oxygen prediction from the Minimal Model does not violate the majority of the proxy data shown in figure 5.4.6a, but there is no evidence for oxic deep oceans until the Neoproterozoic (Canfield et al., 2008), and this would be expected under present day oxygen concentration. Furthermore, carrying on the trend of increasing heat flow further back in time would indicate higher than present day oxygen concentrations for the Archean. It is agreed from multiple lines of evidence that before the great oxidation event at around 2.4Ga the concentration of atmospheric oxygen must have been several orders of magnitude lower than at present day (Holland, 2006; Farquhar et al., 2000). Oxygen predictions from the mantle model baseline fall within the 0.01-0.2 PAL window that is considered compatible with the majority of proxies (Canfield, 2005; Kump, 2008).
Resolving temperature predictions from the current model is difficult. In the early Proterozoic the \( \text{CO}_2 \) predictions line up well with proxy data (Kah and Riding, 2007), however the predicted global temperature would imply global glaciation, for which there is no evidence after 2.1Ga (Kirschvink et al., 2000). Previous modelling has also shown these low \( \text{CO}_2 \) estimates to be difficult to reconcile with temperate climate (Kasting, 1987). It has been suggested that an increased atmospheric methane inventory may account for the additional required warming in the Proterozoic, a mechanism that is plausible considering the assumed low oxygen concentration and likely enhanced anaerobic productivity (Kah and Riding, 2007; Pavlov et al., 2003). In the model runs shown there is no consideration of the Neoproterozoic continental breakup episode and resulting temperature and \( \text{CO}_2 \) predictions for the Neoproterozoic are higher than suggested by both \( \text{CO}_2 \) and glacial proxies.

### 5.5 Effect of the strength of the OCC-\( \text{CO}_2 \) feedback

The additional ocean crust carbonization (OCC) sink for \( \text{CO}_2 \) has a dramatic effect on how we might interpret the Proterozoic Earth system relative to the Phanerozoic. In the mantle model, the strength of the OCC flux is related to \( \text{CO}_2 \) concentration using the \( \alpha \) parameter: \( F_{\text{OCC}} \propto (\text{RCO}_2)^\alpha \). In the baseline results above \( \alpha = 0.23 \) (Brady and Gislason, 1997), but this value is extremely difficult to measure, and in reality the process is much more complex than a simple power law relationship (Sleep and Zahnle, 2001) and requires further study. Therefore it is likely that the OCC flux may constitute perhaps a much weaker, or stronger feedback on \( \text{CO}_2 \) than current estimates. Figure 5.5.7 shows the results of allowing different values of \( \alpha \) in the mantle model.

Allowing \( \alpha = 0.4 \) (blue lines) strengthens the relationship between \( \text{CO}_2 \) concentration. Because Proterozoic \( \text{CO}_2 \) concentrations are predicted to be significantly higher than present day, a larger value for \( \alpha \) results in a generally more powerful OCC flux, as in the model of Sleep and Zahnle (2001). With OCC removing a larger fraction of ocean/atmosphere carbon, colder temperatures are predicted than the baseline model, and less of the total carbon burial occurs via terrestrial weathering. In the mantle model this results...
in predictions for lower nutrient and oxygen concentrations throughout the Proterozoic. The ocean phosphate reservoir is predicted by the model to be around 80% of the present day size at 2Ga, somewhat higher than the 10-25% suggested by an analysis of the phosphorus and iron content of banded iron formations from this time (Bjerrum and Canfield, 2002). Oxygen concentration for this run is predicted to rise from 0.03PAL to 0.2PAL over the proterozoic as terrestrial weathering begins to take over from OCC as the dominant carbon removal pathway, coupled with a decrease in the input rate of reduced sulphur and iron, which scales with $Q^2$. Choosing $\alpha > 0.4$ would imply lower rates of terrestrial weathering, nutrient delivery and oxygen production, especially in the Paleoproterozoic where the OCC flux is stronger. However, oxygen concentration below $10^{-3}$ causes the model to break down under these circumstances.

When $\alpha$ is set to zero (red line), the OCC flux is no longer dependent on carbon dioxide concentration and is therefore a much weaker sink for CO$_2$ throughout the model run. The results become closer to the predictions of the Minimal Model (fig 5.4.6), as the silicate weathering flux is responsible for the majority of carbon burial. However, oxygen is relatively stable throughout the Proterozoic and $< 0.4$PAL, offering a better fit to proxy data than the Minimal Model. Higher CO$_2$ and temperature in the $\alpha = 0$ case show a more plausible link to the lack of glaciation between 2-1Ga, however predicted global temperature is still lower than would be expected for a ice-free world.

As in the model of Sleep and Zahnle (2001) the sensitivity analysis with respect to $\alpha$ gives CO$_2$ predictions that noticeably diverge around 500Ma, and are dramatically different by 2Ga. Paleoproterozoic CO$_2$ predictions from the Mantle model are somewhat lower than in the model of Sleep and Zahnle for the same value of $\alpha$, as the authors of the study assume a more conservative weathering enhancement due to vascular plants, which leads to stronger terrestrial weathering fluxes before their evolution than in the Mantle Model.
Figure 5.5.7: Mantle model baseline for different values of $\alpha$. Coloured lines show different choices of the weathering parameter $\alpha$. a, relative atmospheric oxygen concentration. Paleosol data (Rye and Holland, 1998) are shown as grey circles with arrows to distinguish between a minimum or maximum estimate. Grey horizontal lines show assumed fannal requirements (Runnegar, 1991; Canfield and Teske, 1996), with the species name in black, ‘charcoal’ refers to the lower limit for oxygen required by the existence of fossil charcoal. Proxy figure from Goldblatt et al. (2006). b, relative ocean/atmosphere CO$_2$ concentration. Grey shaded areas represent estimates for CO$_2$ concentration from paleosol data (A) (Sheldon, 2006), carbon isotope modelling (D) (Kah and Bartley, 2004) and the Phanerozoic compilation of proxies (Royer et al., 2004). Grey circles with arrows show upper and lower bound estimates from composition of fossil acritarchs (B) (Kaufman and Xiao, 2003) and cyanobacteria (C) (Kah and Riding, 2007). c, average global surface temperature plotted against the glacial record from this work (where the positive y axis indicates more severe glaciation). d, ocean crust carbonization flux. e, ocean phosphate reservoir. f rate of burial of organic carbon. Original in colour.
5.6 Inclusion of additional weathering forcings

The mantle model baseline is still very simple, but provides reasonable predictions for long term climate over the Proterozoic given the uncertainty in the key parameter \( \alpha \). However there are disagreements between model temperature and proxies for both the early and late Proterozoic, these may be addressed with Precambrian weathering forcings PW1 and PW2.

The forcing PW1 represents enhancement of terrestrial weathering between 750-600Ma due to continental configuration and dispersion (Li et al., 2008; Donnadieu et al., 2004), as has been added to previous models in this thesis (Mills et al., 2011). PW2 represents an assumed two-fold rise in continental weathering efficiency over the Neoproterozoic as the land is colonised by a photosynthetic biosphere. The assumed weathering rate enhancement here is based somewhat on the laboratory results of Lenton et al. (Lenton et al., 2012) and chosen as a benchmark for model testing. Details of the exact timing and nature of land colonisation as well as the effect on weathering rates and the carbon cycle are hotly debated (Kennedy et al., 2006; Knauth and Kennedy, 2009; Lenton and Watson, 2004; Lenton et al., 2012; Prave, 2002). Both weathering forcings are shown in figure 5.3.5. Model predictions when both new forcings are present are shown in figure 5.6.8. The blue line now shows \( \alpha = 0.3 \) rather than \( \alpha = 0.4 \) to avoid model break-down under low \( O_2 \).

The effect of the continental position weathering enhancement PW1 on the Mantle model, as in the previous models where it is applied, is to reduce CO\(_2\) and temperature over the time it is applied. Enhanced weathering between 750 and 600Ma increases CO\(_2\) drawdown via silicate weathering until a lower temperature is reached under which the carbon cycle is balanced. Unlike the previous models, a weathering enhancement of this magnitude does not cause sufficiently low temperature (Hoffman and Schrag, 2002) to directly imply low-latitude glaciation (Donnadieu et al., 2004). This is due to the addition of the PW2 forcing, which invokes the assumption that terrestrial weathering at 750-650Ma was weaker than the early Phanerozoic.
Figure 5.6.8: Mantle model with additional weathering parameters PW1 and PW2. Coloured lines show different choices of $\alpha$. a, relative atmospheric oxygen concentration. Paleosol data (Rye and Holland, 1998) are shown as grey circles with arrows to distinguish between a minimum or maximum estimate. Grey horizontal lines show assumed faunal requirements (Runnegar, 1991; Canfield and Teske, 1996), with the species name in black, ‘charcoal’ shows the lower limit for oxygen required by the existence of fossil charcoal. Proxy figure from Goldblatt et al. (2006). b, relative ocean/atmosphere CO$_2$. Grey shaded areas represent estimates for CO$_2$ concentration from paleosols (A) (Sheldon, 2006), carbon isotope modelling (D) (Kah and Bartley, 2004) and the Phanerozoic compilation of proxies (Royer et al., 2004). Grey circles with arrows show upper and lower bound estimates from composition of fossil acritarchs (B) (Kaufman and Xiao, 2003) and cyanobacteria (C) (Kah and Riding, 2007). c, average global surface temperature plotted against the glacial record from this work (where the positive y axis indicates more severe glaciation). d, ocean crust carbonization flux. e, ocean phosphate reservoir. f rate of burial of organic carbon. Original in colour.
The formulation of the model allows for an increase in nutrient concentration over the PW1 period. This is because the assumed climate dependence for carbonate and silicate weathering is different (Berner, 1994), meaning that the ratio of the two types of continental weathering is different under different temperatures, altering nutrient delivery (Bergman et al., 2004; VanCappellen and Ingall, 1996). If instead it is assumed that nutrient delivery scales with the bulk terrestrial weathering flux, nutrient concentration (and therefore oxygen) would rise when the forcing was applied, but fall back to the initial state once the climate had stabilized. When the forcing is removed at 600Ma they system recovers to match the unforced system shown in the previous figure.

The land colonisation forcing PW2 describes a gradual enhancement of terrestrial weathering from 1000-500Ma as the land surface becomes dominated by photosynthetic organisms. The effect in the model is to increase predicted CO$_2$ concentration and temperature for all time before the colonisation event is complete, as is seen in the Phanerozoic models for the evolution of vascular plants (Berner, 1991). Assuming a forcing such as this increases predicted Paleoproterozoic temperature to better fit the glacial record. However, Mesoproterozoic CO$_2$ is now considerably higher than proxy data would suggest. Assuming an earlier establishment of land-based ecosystems (e.g. 1.1Ga (Sheldon and Hren, 2012)) would shift the associated temperature drop further back in time. For $\alpha > 0$ the model now predicts a gradual rise in nutrient and oxygen concentration over the land colonisation period (1000-500Ma) in addition to the peak between 750-600Ma. This is because further reduction in the efficiency of continental weathering (before PW2 is applied) pushes the weathering balance more in favour of ocean crust carbonization, resulting in less nutrient delivery. The Proterozoic oxygen window is predicted as $O_2 < 0.3$PAL, $\forall \alpha$.

Climate forcings due to continental position, dispersion and the supercontinent cycle (Hawkesworth et al., 2010) have existed throughout Earth history, but are difficult to quantify. The current representation simply expresses an expected peak in this forcing in the Neoproterozoic, but it is likely that climate, specifically atmospheric CO$_2$ and temperature has been tightly coupled to tectonic events over the last 3Gyr. Atmospheric methane concentration has also likely contributed to global temperature (Pavlov et al., 2003).
and affected oxygen concentration (via methane oxidation and hydrogen escape to space (Watson et al., 1978; Catling et al., 2001; Claire et al., 2006)) over Earth history.

5.7 Summary of the effects of weathering pathways on CO$_2$ and O$_2$ predictions

Despite uncertainties in the tectonic and biological forcings, and the omission of methane from this model, some conclusions can be drawn regarding Proterozoic climate:

Addition of the ocean crust carbonization (OCC) flux to the model results in a new pathway for CO$_2$ removal that is unlike the silicate weathering-carbonate deposition process - OCC does not deliver nutrient to the surface ocean. The effect of the addition of the OCC flux is to decouple the CO$_2$ removal rate from the nutrient delivery rate, so that assuming a strong OCC flux leads to significantly lower predictions for ocean nutrient and oxygen concentration. The previous Minimal Model predicted roughly present day levels of oxygen in the Paleoproterozoic because the only CO$_2$ sink was terrestrial weathering. The higher degassing rate requires that more carbon be buried globally, and to do this by increasing only terrestrial weathering rates resulted in nutrient delivery rates higher than the present day. The dependence of OCC on the global spreading rate acts to counteract the higher degassing rate in the mantle model.

The assumed dependence of ocean crust carbonization on CO$_2$ concentration ($\alpha$) is a very important model parameter, effectively controlling the relative strength in the model of the OCC flux. The stronger the OCC flux, the more carbon is buried this way, shifting the balance of carbon removal to include less terrestrial weathering. Therefore a stronger OCC flux results in lower ocean nutrient, productivity and oxygen. CO$_2$ concentration is also reduced because the enhanced OCC flux requires less CO$_2$ in the oceans to balance the carbon cycle (Sleep and Zahnle, 2001).

Additional reductions in the efficiency of continental weathering due to the absence of even simple land biota before the Mesoproterozoic lead to very low oxygen predictions for this time, as the removal of CO$_2$ is dominated by the OCC flux. Assuming a dependence of the OCC flux on CO$_2$ concentration
(Brady and Gislason, 1997), a gradual increase in the oxygen content of the atmosphere is predicted over the Proterozoic. Looking further back to the Archean, the increase in mantle heat flux and further decrease in continental area would lead to even lower oxygen predictions in this model, suggesting that the 2.4Ga great oxidation event (Sessions et al., 2009) may have been caused by increasing ocean primary productivity due to the emerging terrestrial weathering sink for carbon and the associated increase in nutrient supply. A gradual increase in primary productivity (Goldblatt et al., 2006) has been shown as sufficient to cause the observed step change in oxygen concentration, which is expected to occur due to positive feedback between O$_2$ and CH$_4$ concentration during the formation of an ozone layer (Claire et al., 2006).

5.8 Long term carbon and sulphur cycling between the crust and mantle

As seen in Hayes and Waldbauer (2006), on which this model is based, carbon steadily accumulates in the crust over time due to the imbalance between carbon input from the mantle and carbon subduction. The total size of the crustal carbon reservoir in the mantle model is shown in figure 5.8.9b, closely following the results of Hayes and Waldbauer (which are shown in figure 5.2.2).

The simple sulphur cycle used in the model closely links ocean sulphate levels to oxygen concentration by assuming that sulphate input to the ocean through oxidative weathering of rocks containing reduced S is controlled by atmospheric O$_2$ (Bergman et al., 2004). Removal of ocean sulphate via anaerobic microbial reduction and eventual burial as pyrite is also assumed to depend on oxygen concentration, in this case via an inverse relation to the sulphate sink rather than a direct relationship to the sulphate source, thus strengthening the link. The result in the model is a prediction for relative ocean sulphate that very closely follows the predictions for relative O$_2$. The relative abundance of crustal oxidised sulphur (modelled as gypsum) also follows closely the predictions for relative oxygen concentration, as burial of gypsum is a strong function of sulphate concentration.

Predicted sulphate concentration is shown alongside previous results from
sulphur isotope modelling (Kah et al., 2004) (A) and Phanerozoic proxy data (Horita et al., 2002; Hardie, 1996) (B,C). The best match to the Precambrian sulphur isotope model is achieved for high values of $\alpha$, i.e. a strong ocean crust carbonization flux.

**Figure 5.8.9: Sulphur reservoirs and crustal carbon accumulation in the Mantle Model.** For all panels, coloured lines represent different choices of $\alpha$. 

- **a**, ocean sulphate concentration. Grey lines show predictions for Precambrian sulphate concentration from a model for sulphur isotope change (denoted A) (Kah et al., 2004), Phanerozoic sulphate estimated via analysis of fluid inclusions in marine halite (B) (Horita et al., 2002) and by the assumed mixing between river water and hydrothermal brines (C) (Hardie, 1996; Spencer and Hardie, 1990).
- **b**, total crustal carbon.
- **c**, relative crustal pyrite content.
- **d**, relative crustal gypsum content.
Further sulphur isotope modelling by Canfield and Farquhar (2008) gives a ‘best guess’ ocean sulphate concentration of $\sim 1\text{mM}$ for the Proterozoic (Canfield and Farquhar, 2008), similar to the model results for 2Ga but considerably lower thereafter. Agreement with Phanerozoic proxies is reasonable, although there is a large discrepancy between the model and proxies in the Mesozoic, as with the previous COPSE model (Bergman et al., 2004).

The model predicts that crustal abundance of reduced sulphur (modelled as pyrite) would be stable at around double the present day value for the Proterozoic, due to enhanced burial and reduced oxidative weathering. There is little available data to suggest how crustal sulphur abundances have changed during the last 2Ga, however the predicted trend of an increasing oxidised sulphur reservoir, and decreasing reduced sulphur reservoir seems reasonable given the proposed oxygenation scenario. The model of Canfield (2004) for the mantle sulphur cycle predicts a surface sulphur reservoir between 0.5-2 times the present day size at 2Ga, similar to the model here which predicts a surface sulphur reservoir 1-2 times the present day size at 2Ga.

5.9 Predicted stable isotope fractionation

5.9.1 Carbon isotopes

The weathering forcings PW1 and PW2 are included in the model for the following figures. The top row of figure 5.9.10 shows model predictions for the ratio of organic carbon burial to total carbon burial (termed the ‘f’ ratio) for different choices of $\alpha$. As expected, higher values of $\alpha$ cause the f-ratio to become lower further back in time: reduced ocean nutrient and therefore productivity results in a smaller fraction of total carbon burial occurring organically. The lower panels show the corresponding $\delta^{13}C$ of new carbonate, plotted against proxy data from Veizer et al. (Veizer et al., 1999) and Shields and Veizer (Shields and Veizer, 2002). In figure 5.9.10, four model runs are shown for each choice of $\alpha$, allowing for a range of assumed fractionation effects to be considered, these are listed in the table below.
Table 15: Assumed fractionating processes for carbon in the mantle model. ocb = organic carbon burial, ccb = marine carbonate carbon burial, occ = ocean crust carbonization.

In run 1 the fractionation of carbon is assumed to occur only via organic carbon burial, which is assumed to impart a fractionation of -27‰ relative to the atmosphere/ocean reservoir. Added to this in run 2 is the temperature and CO$_2$ dependent fractionation on carbonate burial assessed in COPSE (Bergman et al., 2004) and in Mills et al. (2011). In run 3, a fractionation effect is also added to the ocean crust carbonization flux, following Bjerrum and Canfield (2004), it is set at their maximum estimate of -7‰ relative to the ocean/atmosphere. The crustal carbonate carbon reservoir, C, holds around 80% of global carbon and therefore the assumed isotopic composition of C at model start will buffer atmospheric $\delta^{13}$C considerably. In runs 1-3, the model is initiated with $\delta^{13}$C (C) = -2, which is the steady state value for run 1 and $\alpha = 0$. However, data show a large positive $\delta^{13}$C excursion in the period 2.3-2Ga (Bekker et al., 2006), directly preceeding model startup. It is therefore likely that the crustal carbonate reservoir may have been buffered by this burial of isotopically heavy carbon. To test this we allow $\delta^{13}$C (C) = 0 at model startup in run 4, which also includes the isotopic modifiers from run 3. The runs produce a range of possible $\delta^{13}$C predictions from the same biogeochemical system, illustrating the difficulties (Bjerrum and Canfield, 2004) in determining system characteristics, such as organic carbon burial (Berner, 2001), from isotopic proxies alone.
Figure 5.9.10: Mantle model predictions for carbon isotope fractionation. As before red lines indicate the $\alpha = 0$ model run (a,b), black for the $\alpha = 0.23$ run (c,d) and blue for $\alpha = 0.3$ (e,f). Organic fraction of carbon burial (termed the ‘f’ ratio) is shown in the upper panels. The lower panels show the resulting range of $\delta^{13}C$ predictions, dependent on various fractionation parameters: solid line shows results with a constant fractionation effect for organic carbon burial and no other fractionation, the dashed line adds to this a fractionation effect for marine carbonate burial (Bergman et al., 2004), dash-dot line adds a further fractionation effect to the OCC flux (Bjerrum and Canfield, 2004) and dotted line adds also a fractionation effect due to previous isotope reservoir dilution. See text for full description of fractionation effects. Grey dots show the data of Veizer et al. (Veizer et al., 1999) and of Shields and Veizer (Shields and Veizer, 2002).

For run 1, $\delta^{13}C$ predictions are negative for the period 2-0.5Ga for all values of $\alpha$, largely inconsistent with the data. This highlights the apparent paradox that significantly lower biological productivity on the Early earth
is not permitted by the apparent stability of the δ\textsuperscript{13}C record (Schidlowski, 1988; Catling et al., 2001; Kump et al., 2001). When the additional fractionation processes are considered, each has the effect to increase model δ\textsuperscript{13}C predictions. In run 2 the increase is caused by increased fractionation of carbonates under high CO\textsubscript{2}, as in Mills et al. (2011).

If ocean crust carbonization is assumed to impart a fractionation effect (Beukes et al., 1990; Kaufman et al., 1990) (run 3 and 4), choosing a high value of alpha leads to δ\textsuperscript{13}C ≥ 0 throughout the Proterozoic. The δ\textsuperscript{13}C ‘envelope’ produced for each choice of α is broadly consistent with the proxy records, showing that the impact of various fractionating processes is a key uncertainty, and indeed may allow for very low organic carbon burial rates in the Proterozoic, as discussed by Bjerrum and Canfield (2004). Whilst the uncertainty in these mechanisms means that accurately modelling δ\textsuperscript{13}C variation is difficult, the figure shows that the current model is not necessarily falsified by the predictions for isotopic fractionation.

This model does not reproduce high positive carbon isotope fractionation in the Neoproterozoic era, as there is no inclusion of snowball Earth events, which would likely cause long-term positive isotopic excursions in their aftermath (Mills et al., 2011). The inclusion of oxygen in this model means that a snowball Earth environment cannot be maintained, O\textsubscript{2} concentration quickly falls below the model lower limit on the glaciated Earth. Maintaining a model biosphere during a ‘hard’ snowball glaciation is a future challenge both for biogeochemical models and for the snowball Earth hypothesis.

### 5.9.2 Sulphur isotopes

Figure 5.9.11 shows model predictions for seawater sulphate δ\textsuperscript{34}S, alongside the fraction of sulphur that is buried as pyrite, denoted the ‘fs - ratio’. Burial of pyrite is assumed to decrease with decreasing nutrient availability, but is also assumed to increase in low oxygen conditions, therefore choice of α in the model has no significant impact on the burial ratio.
Figure 5.9.11: Mantle model predictions for sulphur isotope fractionation. Red lines indicate the $\alpha = 0$ model run (a,b), black lines show the $\alpha = 0.23$ run (c,d) and blue lines show $\alpha = 0.3$ (e,f). Fraction of sulphur that is buried as pyrite (here called the ‘fs’ ratio) is shown in the upper panels. Lower panels show the resulting range of $\delta^{34}S$ predictions under either a constant fractionation effect for sulphide burial, or under an oxygen-dependent fractionation with parameter $n$ (see text). Grey lines show proxy constraints reproduced from Canfield (1998); Canfield and Teske (1996), with the two lines representing a 5% uncertainty.

Canfield (2004) calculates the expected fractional pyrite burial from the isotopic records of both seawater sulphate and sedimentary pyrite, concluding that the fraction of sulphur buried as pyrite must have been between 0.5 and 1 during the Proterozoic. This rough estimate is reproduced by the model. The lower panels in figure 5.9.11 show the corresponding predictions.
for $\delta^{34}$S with respect to the assumed fractionation parameter, $n$, against results when the fraction effect is held constant (here $\delta_S = 40\%_o$). Here, as in the GEOCARB models, $n$ represents the effect of changing oxygen concentration on the observed fractionation between seawater sulphate and buried pyrites: $\delta_S = 35(RO_2)^n$ (Berner, 2001, 2006a). This is based on observed high fractionation with increased oxygen, which has been related to further fractionation of reduced material during the oxidative sulphur cycle (Canfield and Teske, 1996; Jorgensen, 1990; Canfield and Thamdrup, 1994).

Sulphur isotope fractionation is extremely sensitive to $n$ parameter, leading to extremely low $\delta^{34}$S predictions for high values of $n$. A vague fit to the proxy data can be achieved by assuming $n=0.1$, but this is very far from the $n=1.5$ used in the work of Berner (2001), which produces incompatible results in this model due to the predicted low oxygen concentration for the Proterozoic. Admittedly the sulphur system used in this model clearly requires improvement to correctly represent Proterozoic climate, but the massive uncertainty is sulphur fractionation effects over time makes falsification via predicted $\delta^{34}$S difficult.

5.10 Chapter summary and conclusions

5.10.1 Summary of important findings

1. Extrapolating the simple carbon, sulphur and nutrient model used in the previous chapters further back through the Proterozoic gives predictions for high $O_2$ throughout the eon, increasing more the further we go back, violating multiple proxy evidence for low $O_2$. This is because the assumed higher degassing rates require that burial must rise to stabilise the system, resulting in increased organic burial and oxygen production.

2. Addition of the Ocean crust carbonization (OCC) carbon removal pathway in the Mantle Model provides a sink for $CO_2$ that does not transfer nutrients to the surface ocean, therefore allowing total carbon burial to be high enough to stabilise the system with a much lower organic carbon burial rate and therefore lower $O_2$ production flux. The result is a predicted Proterozoic oxygen concentration window of $10^{-3}$.
3. Specific predictions for \( \text{O}_2 \) and \( \text{CO}_2 \) depend greatly on the assumed relationship between OCC and oceanic \( \text{CO}_2 \) concentration (\( \alpha \)), which is poorly constrained. The predicted \( \text{O}_2 \) trend for all values is between stability and a gradually increasing concentration over the Proterozoic. Allowing some dependence of OCC rate on \( \text{CO}_2 \) concentration, as well as additional terrestrial weathering forcings, results in a clear \( \text{O}_2 \) rise over the Eon. \( \text{CO}_2 \) predictions for the Mesozoic are consistently higher than some proxies suggest, however the low concentration inferred from these proxies would imply glaciation (Kasting, 1987), for which there is no evidence.

4. The model predictions for ocean sulphate, crustal sulphur species and the fractionation of carbon and sulphur stable isotopes are reasonable when compared to the limited proxy information available and therefore do not falsify the model. However, explicit representation of anoxygenic photosynthesis and bacterial sulphate reduction is required for a more complete view of the Proterozoic sulphur cycle.

5.10.2 Conclusions

The key finding of this chapter is that the change in dominant carbon removal pathways over Earth history, which has well described and modelled (Sleep and Zahnle, 2001; Hayes and Waldbauer, 2006), would be expected to restrict nutrient delivery by terrestrial weathering over the Proterozoic. Despite higher carbon degassing rates, model predictions for total organic carbon burial are \( 25 - 75\% \) of the present day rate. The fraction of carbon buried organically (the f-ratio) is 0.1-0.15, resulting in predictions for atmospheric \( \text{O}_2 \) concentration that agree well with current proxy estimates.

Low carbon burial rates in earlier Earth history have previously been inferred directly from the isotope record. Bjerrum and Canfield (2004) assumed that a fraction, \( \lambda \), of carbon removal from the surface system occurs in the deep ocean. Taking into account the isotope fractionation effect likely to be imparted by this burial pathway (Beukes et al., 1990), the f-ratio is calculated
from the geological record of carbon $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ and is found to have increased significantly over time. The work here compliments this approach by showing that a simple process-based biogeochemical model predicts a low and very similar average f-ratio over the Proterozoic. The isotope fractionation effect associated with ocean crust carbonization here allows for the model to output to agree well with the geological $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ record, however agreement is still fair in its absence providing other fractionation effects are considered.
6 Thesis conclusions

In this chapter I first list the key findings of the thesis, then briefly investigate some ideas linking the two main themes of weathering pathways and material limits. Limitations of the current modelling approach are then discussed, followed by details of model improvements and extensions, and some discussion of the wider context of the work.

6.1 Main findings

• The current generation of Phanerozoic biogeochemical box models: GEOCARB (Berner, 2006a), COPSE (Bergman et al., 2004) and MAGic (Arvidson et al., 2006) are reduced to a single robust, modular system that allows application to Neoproterozoic climate (the ‘Minimal Model’). The methods for calculating atmospheric oxygen concentration in the Phanerozoic are found to give unreasonable results when applied to the Precambrian.

• The time taken for global temperature to stabilize after a snowball glaciation should be on the order of $10^7$ years, roughly matching the interval between deep glaciations in the Neoproterozoic. Therefore it is proposed that the geological record for the late Neoproterozoic shows a system that is oscillating around a global steady state temperature which is below the threshold for low-latitude glaciation.

• Snowball Earth events, as traditionally described (Hoffman et al., 1998), should be followed by prolonged ($>10^7$ yr) periods of carbon cycle disequilibrium, in which enhanced nutrient delivery and carbon burial would be expected to maintain elevated oxygen concentrations. This may have important applications to the apparent oxygen rises at 2.4Ga and 0.58Ga, both of which are loosely associated with low-latitude glaciation, however the mechanisms here suggests a lengthy perturbation rather than a stepwise system change.
Carbon removal via the seafloor weathering pathway, and its link to the mantle heat flux, provides a mechanism for increasing oxygen concentration over Earth history: The fraction of global carbon burial that occurs on the seafloor is expected to have decreased over time (Bjerrum and Canfield, 2004; Sleep and Zahnle, 2001), and it is shown that this would be expected to cause a compensatory rise in terrestrial weathering, hence nutrient delivery and productivity. Coupled model predictions for Proterozoic $O_2$, $CO_2$, temperature and sulphate levels fall within or close to the limits imposed by various geological proxies.

6.2 Linking weathering pathways and transport limitation

Long term global weathering fluxes have been the key focus of this thesis. It has been shown that both changes in dominant weathering pathways, and consideration of material-transport limitations on terrestrial weathering may be able to explain important features of the geological record. In this section, some synthesis of these two key findings is attempted.

6.2.1 Effect of OCC pathway on post-snowball $CO_2$ removal

The model used to demonstrate the effect of transport limitation of terrestrial weathering on snowball Earth recovery times (Chapter 4) did not include the ocean crust carbonization (OCC) flux, and it has been suggested (West, 2011) that this additional sink for $CO_2$ may make significant differences to the stabilization times shown in figure 4.2.2. The important question here is that of the maximum possible global OCC rate, hereafter $W_{\text{max}}(\text{OCC})$, which alongside the calculated maximum terrestrial rate $W_{\text{max}}(\text{terrestrial})$, may constrain the total abundance of material for weathering. This is extremely difficult to quantify, as it is currently uncertain whether present day OCC rates are limited by material transport or reaction kinetics (Sleep and Zahnle, 2001). A representation of the OCC flux is added to the model used in Chapter 4, and follows the form used for this flux in the Mantle model:
\[ F_{occ} = k_{occ} \cdot Q^2 \cdot \left( \frac{R\text{CO}_2}{R\text{CO}_2(0)} \right)^\alpha \] (6.2.1)

where \( k_{occ} = 1.65 \times 10^{12} \text{ mol/yr} \) is the present day rate (Sleep and Zahnle, 2001; Elderfield and Schultz, 1996). As with the model solar flux, the heat flux, \( Q \), is held at the value for 650Ma. The rate of present day silicate weathering in the model is reduced to maintain present day carbon cycle balance under the assumed OCC flux.

Figure 6.2.1 shows the time taken for the model system to stabilize following a 0.3atm CO\textsubscript{2} perturbation against the terrestrial weathering rate limit \( W_{max}(\text{terrestrial}) \). The two panels show different choices of \( \alpha \), red lines show solution under different maximum OCC rates, the black line in each panel shows the original model results from Chapter 4, where OCC was not considered. For the \( \alpha = 0.23 \) case (panel a), little variation is shown under the addition of the OCC flux, despite consideration of a large upper limit. In this panel, the results for \( W_{max}(\text{OCC})=5 \) and \( W_{max}(\text{OCC})=10 \) plot over each other, indicating that the OCC rate in the model does not reach 5 times the present day rate, even under 0.3atm CO\textsubscript{2}. Panel b allows a more powerful dependence of the OCC rate on atmosphere/ocean CO\textsubscript{2} concentration, \( \alpha = 0.5 \). Here it can be seen that the OCC flux reaches a maximum rate of 5-10 times the present day, and assuming this rate can be maintained for millions of years (i.e. \( W_{max}(\text{OCC})>5 \)), acts to reduce the stabilization times as suggested. However, even at this rate, stability times for \( D = 1 \) are \( \geq 7 \times 10^6 \) years, and are increased under a higher estimate of the degassing flux, as would be expected in the Neoproterozoic.

Because the OCC flux buries several times less carbon than terrestrial weathering, a powerful dependency on CO\textsubscript{2} concentration is required for this pathway to significantly alter the timeframe for CO\textsubscript{2} drawdown following a snowball Earth glaciation. In addition to this, it must be assumed that material limitation of this process allows for a \( \geq 5 \) fold increase in this flux to be maintained over a \( 10^7 \) year timescale. Both of these requirements are currently very uncertain, and available laboratory data constraining the CO\textsubscript{2}-OCC relationship (Brady and Gislason, 1997)(panel a) suggests that it is insufficiently strong to significantly change the results of the original study, even when no upper limit is assumed. The conclusions from the original work
therefore remain unaltered, as timescales for system recovery above $10^7$ years are still observed under a wide range of assumptions for the degassing rate and $W_{\text{max(terrestrial)}}$, even with the addition of an extremely strong OCC flux.

![Graph showing stabilization time versus maximum terrestrial weathering rate, $W_{\text{max(terrestrial)}}$.](image)

Figure 6.2.1: Post-snowball stabilization time versus maximum terrestrial weathering rate, $W_{\text{max(terrestrial)}}$. An initial CO$_2$ concentration of 0.3 atmospheres is assumed, and the global terrestrial weathering rate is fixed at $W_{\text{max(terrestrial)}}$. The three red lines show different choices of the OCC rate limit $W_{\text{max(OCC)}}$. $W_{\text{max(terrestrial)}}$ and $W_{\text{max(OCC)}}$ are defined relative to present day rates, with the grey vertical line showing the estimate of $W_{\text{max(terrestrial)}} = 2.4$ for the Phanerozoic. For all runs, the degassing rate is assumed to be equal to the present day. Black line shows results of Mills et al. (2011) for $D=1$. 

150
6.2.2 Transport limitation of weathering over Earth history

In the Mantle Model presented in Chapter 5, there is no consideration of a global weathering rate limitation. However, due to higher degassing rates earlier in Earth history, it is perhaps possible that the terrestrial weathering sink for CO$_2$ may have been insufficient to balance the system. The model is amended here to allow transport-limitation of terrestrial weathering by using the silicate and carbonate weathering fluxes derived for the work in chapter 4. Following the method used here for the Phanerozoic, the maximum rate-limited flux is assumed to depend on the global erosion rate forcing. It is assumed that the OCC rate does not reach a material limitation here. Figure 6.2.2 shows an example model run where $\alpha = 0$ and the maximum terrestrial weathering rate is set to $W_{\text{max}}(\text{terrestrial}) = 1.5$ under present day erosion rates.

Under these conditions, the model predicts a CO$_2$ spike similar to that which may have been possible during the Phanerozoic (see section 4.5.3). This occurs during the period 1300-800Ma, where global erosion rates are expected to be low (panel c). Interestingly, earlier periods for which $\frac{\text{degassing}}{\text{erosion}}$ is higher, are not characterised by transport limitation of global weathering. The higher heat flux at this time increases the CO$_2$ sink via ocean crust weathering, requiring lower rates of terrestrial weathering to balance the system, and therefore allowing carbon cycle balance despite severe limitation of the terrestrial flux. Assuming $\alpha > 0$ allows for the OCC rate to increase in response to elevated CO$_2$ concentration and therefore system stability is retained even for very low values of $W_{\text{max}}(\text{terrestrial})$, such as the scenario in figure 6.2.2.

The apparent paradox of a stable carbon cycle on the early Earth under very high CO$_2$ degassing rates can therefore be addressed: The high mantle heat flux on the early Earth, which is the cause of the rapid degassing, also increases the magnitude of the ocean crust carbonization CO$_2$ sink, and therefore a high terrestrial weathering rate is not required for stability.
6.3 Model limitations

The models explored and constructed in this thesis are semi-quantitative. They are best utilised for the demonstration of specific Earth system mechanisms, and for attaining broad, but falsifiable predictions based on operation of these mechanisms. A persistent problem with these models is the simple formulation of the flux functions - global biogeochemical processes are often limited by a multitude of factors but are traditionally modelled using very few, and often under a single linear or power-law relationship. This can lead to overly-strong negative feedback, and to very powerful but poorly-constrained parameters (e.g. α in this work). As shown in Chapter 4, consideration of multiple limiting factors for the terrestrial weathering flux can lead to dramatically different model predictions in some scenarios.
The predictions for Proterozoic climate presented in Chapter 5 (the Mantle Model) should be taken as a broad envelope, as is displayed on the figures therein, but even so, this envelope only represents the uncertainty in a single key parameter. The simplified ocean nutrient model used has been criticised for its combined global approximation of shelf and open-water burial rates, and the lack of burial limitation by erosion (Berner, 2006a), but criticisms of this nature may just as easily be levelled at any of the fluxes in any of these models. I believe that the Mantle model is very useful, as it demonstrates an intriguing mechanism for planetary oxidation and makes numerous falsifiable predictions. To my knowledge there are currently no published works that attempt to reconstruct Proterozoic oxygen concentration using an a priori model. Falsification of the proposed oxygenation mechanism is hampered by the wide range of model uncertainty, but also by availability of geochemical evidence. Fuller understanding of the Earth system and of paleoclimate requires advances in modelling techniques, but also requires additional geological fieldwork and laboratory studies to constrain both the strength of biogeochemical feedbacks and the knowledge of paleoclimatic conditions.

6.4 Future modelling work

The long-term goal of the work in this thesis is to arrive at a process-based biogeochemical model for the whole of Earth history. A model such as this would be a useful tool for testing a huge list of hypotheses linking the global biota, tectonic regime and hydrospheric composition. Examples include the effects of Paleoproterozoic glaciation, possible triggers for the Great Oxidation event, and application to oxidation of hypothetical exoplanets. Constructing an Earth history model requires many improvements over the current model system, some interesting avenues for model expansion are listed below.

6.4.1 Low-oxygen solutions

Currently the Mantle model timeframe is limited to 2Ga-present because of the low oxygen concentrations that are predicted before this time. The Phanerozoic-based functions for burial of pyrite sulphur and for ocean nutrient balance are strongly dependent on oxygen concentration, and a sim-
plastic representation of ocean anoxia. The system becomes unstable under low nutrient and low ($< 10^{-3}$PAL) oxygen concentrations, in this situation a reduction in $O_2$ causes an ocean sulphate crisis which limits sulphide burial and further decreases $O_2$, this positive feedback loop results in zero oxygen and model breakdown.

Addressing this problem requires reconstruction of the model to include a functioning anaerobic biosphere, of which currently there is only a rough parameterisation. Some preliminary work was undertaken to incorporate the simple biota and methane system from the early Earth model of Goldblatt et al. (2006) into the model framework in this thesis. Powerful negative feedbacks on respiration rates in this system allow oxygen concentration to be stable at $< 10^{-5}$PAL and for the bistability in atmospheric oxygen highlighted in the original work to be reproduced. However, the combination of model approaches did not represent a consistent view of the biosphere and was not suited to semi-quantitative prediction. It does however demonstrate that consideration of negative feedbacks operating around low oxygen concentrations may be a vital addition for future modelling.

6.4.2 Representation of limiting factors for key processes

As has been suggested in this work and others (West et al., 2005; Millot et al., 2002), extrapolation of simple kinetic rate equations to global scale weathering fluxes does not represent the process sufficiently well. In a broad sense, all of the fluxes in the model suffer from a similar over-simplification and are generally limited by a number of factors that do not, as models often assume, act as simple multipliers to the overall rate. For example, oxidative weathering is reasoned to have some dependence on atmospheric $O_2$ (Lasaga and Ohmoto, 2002) but this is not apparent in some field studies, which instead link weathering rates to erosion (Wildman et al., 2004; Bolton et al., 2006). Most likely a combination of these factors controls the overall rate. Recently, attempts have been made to construct a flux equation based on mechanistic understanding of the terrestrial weathering process (West et al., 2012; Dixon et al., 2012). Future models will aim to incorporate these approaches, and an attempt will be made to apply a similar analysis to the degassing, burial and nutrient fluxes.
6.4.3 Full representation of mantle cycling

The current Mantle Model does not track changes in the size or isotopic composition of the mantle reservoirs, composition is assumed to be constant and the size of the mantle inventories of carbon and sulphur are assumed not to have any effect on the model fluxes. A simple extension would allow the mantle inventories and composition to change over time, perhaps allowing an additional route to falsification of predictions. Another intriguing question is that of the oxygen fugacity of the mantle, which may have increased over time (Li and Lee, 2004) and may perhaps be adequately approximated via knowledge of the oxidized and reduced fluxes into and out of the mantle.

6.4.4 On Phanerozoic modelling

Current Phanerozoic models assume for simplicity that the large crustal reservoirs of carbon and sulphur are at present day size at the beginning of the Phanerozoic. Extending the model timeframe to the Proterozoic allows instead for prediction of these values based on likely Precambrian climate. In the Mantle Model, predicted low Precambrian O\textsubscript{2} causes an increase in the crustal abundance of reduced sulphur due to enhanced pyrite burial. The Permo-carboniferous oxygen peak is therefore reduced from \(\sim 1.4\text{PAL}\) in COPSE to \(\sim 1\text{ PAL}\) in the Mantle model because of the more powerful oxygen sink from pyrite weathering.

The work in the Chapter 2 highlights the importance of negative feedback in prediction of Phanerozoic oxygen concentration. One of the most powerful, and most difficult to model, is the feedback provided by wildfires. As with the weathering fluxes, the occurrence and spread of fire may be best understood using a physically based model of the competing limiting factors. Fairly complex fire modules are currently applied in dynamic global vegetation models (DGVMs) (Bachelet et al., 2001; Sitch et al., 2003; Thonicke et al., 2010) and have been applied to paleoclimate (Scheiter et al., 2012). The DGVMs allow characterisation of the global fuel load based on distribution of various biomes, but do not currently include effects of changing oxygen concentration. Simplification of the DGVM systems and addition of sensitivity to oxygen (e.g. Watson and Lovelock (in press); Belcher et al. (2010)) should allow for assessment of the negative feedback strength and
how this may have changed with the evolution of new types of land biota.

This extension should also allow for new Phanerozoic oxygen predictions, testing of hypothesised links between atmospheric O$_2$ and observed paleofire regimes (Scott and Glasspool, 2006) and a new falsification method based on model predictions for the abundance of fossilized charcoal.

6.5 Concluding remarks

The overriding question that has driven the work in this thesis, which was also the initial project title is:

Why does the Earth’s atmosphere contain so much oxygen? and could there be planets elsewhere with breathable atmospheres?

The title of this project was later changed to better reflect the work undertaken and the specific important results, but some thoughts on this question are considered below.

6.5.1 On Earth’s oxygention

The view presented here, demonstrated by the results of the Mantle Model, is one in which the long term change between dominant weathering pathways has resulted in a gradual oxidation of the surface environment. Currently the model system cannot be extended into the Archean, but the Proterozoic results hint at an overall mechanism: On the Early Earth the heat flux from the mantle was significantly higher, and the area of the continents much less than the present day. This suggests an Earth system in which a large proportion of carbon burial occurred on the sea floor during the carbonization of fresh mid ocean ridge basalts, rather than via the weathering of silicate rocks on land, which would likely experience extreme limitation by transport of cations due to greatly diminished continental area. Because nutrient is only transferred to the surface ocean during terrestrial weathering, this world would have much less abundant ocean nutrients, lower rates of organic carbon burial and therefore lower atmospheric O$_2$ concentration. Over time, the combination of a decreasing mantle heat flux and the increase in continental area (as well as improved continental weathering efficiency due to the
colonising biota) should have led to the terrestrial weathering sink becoming gradually more important, slowly increasing nutrient levels and increasing production of $O_2$ via carbon burial. It is argued here (and by Bjerrum and Canfield (2004)) that this interpretation can be consistent with the stability noted in carbon isotope records due to changing isotope fractionation effects over Earth history (see section 5.9).

### 6.5.2 On exoplanets

The research here allows for some thoughts on exoplanet evolution, but necessarily assumes Earth-like elemental composition and biogeochemical cycling regimes. On a hypothetical ‘twin-Earth’, oxygenation to contemporary levels should depend on the emergence and colonisation of terrestrial land masses, the resulting weathering pathway balance, and the associated supply of nutrients to the surface ocean. The size of the planet likely plays a very important role, as this would be expected to affect both the mantle heat flux and the mechanism of plate tectonics and resulting continental growth.
References


