

1 **Effects of permafrost aggradation on peat properties as**
2 **determined from a pan-arctic synthesis of plant macrofossils**

3
4 **C. C. Treat^{1,2}, M. C. Jones³, P. Camill⁴, A. Gallego-Sala⁵, M. Garneau⁶, J. W.**
5 **Harden², G. Hugelius⁷, E. S. Klein⁸, U. Kokfelt⁹, P. Kuhry⁷, J. Loisel¹⁰, P. J. H.**
6 **Mathijssen¹¹, J. A. O'Donnell¹², P. O. Oksanen¹³, T. M. Ronkainen¹¹, A. B. K.**
7 **Sannel⁷, J. Talbot¹⁴, C. M. Tarnocai¹⁵ and M. Väliranta¹¹**

8 [1] Water and Environmental Research Center, University of Alaska Fairbanks, Fairbanks, AK,
9 USA

10 [2] U.S. Geological Survey, Menlo Park, CA, USA

11 [3] U.S. Geological Survey, Reston, VA, USA

12 [4] Bowdoin College, Earth and Oceanographic Science Dept. and Environmental Studies
13 Program, Brunswick, ME, USA

14 [5] Department of Geography, University of Exeter, Amory Building, Rennes Drive, Exeter,
15 EX4 4RJ, UK

16 [6] Department of Geography and GEOTOP Research Center, Université du Québec à Montréal,
17 CP 8888 Succ. Centre-Ville, Montréal, Québec, Canada, H3C 3P8

18 [7] Department of Physical Geography, Stockholm University, 106 91 Stockholm, Sweden

19 [8] Department of Biological Sciences, University of Alaska Anchorage, Anchorage, AK, USA

20 [9] Department of Geosciences and Natural Resource Management, Center for Permafrost
21 (CENPERM), University of Copenhagen, Denmark

22 [10] Department of Geography, University of California Los Angeles, Los Angeles, CA, USA

23 [11] Department of Environmental Sciences, P.O.Box 65, 00014 University of Helsinki, Finland

24 [12] National Park Service, Arctic Network, Anchorage, AK, USA

25 [13] Bladintie 44-46 A 4, 64260 Kaskinen, Finland

26 [14] Department of Geography, Université de Montréal, Montreal, Québec, Canada

27 [15] Research Branch, Agriculture and Agri-Food Canada, Ottawa, Ontario, Canada.

28 Correspondence to: C. C. Treat (ctreat@usgs.gov)

29

30 **Key Points**

31 - Permafrost aggradation history in peatlands was examined using plant macrofossil
32 records

33 - Peat properties may reflect permafrost aggradation, especially nitrogen content

34 - Ecosystem succession in permafrost peatlands is highly dynamic and not uni-directional

35

36

37 **Abstract**

38 Permafrost dynamics play an important role in high-latitude peatland carbon balance and are key
39 to understanding the future response of soil carbon stocks. Permafrost aggradation can control
40 the magnitude of the carbon feedback in peatlands through effects on peat properties. We
41 compiled peatland plant macrofossil records for the northern permafrost zone (515 cores from
42 280 sites) and classified samples by vegetation type and environmental class (fen, bog, tundra
43 and boreal permafrost, thawed permafrost). We examined differences in peat properties (bulk
44 density, carbon (C), nitrogen (N) and organic matter content, C/N ratio) and C accumulation
45 rates among vegetation types and environmental classes. Consequences of permafrost
46 aggradation differed between boreal and tundra biomes, including differences in vegetation
47 composition, C/N ratios, and N content. The vegetation composition of tundra permafrost
48 peatlands was similar to permafrost-free fens, while boreal permafrost peatlands more closely
49 resembled permafrost-free bogs. Nitrogen content in boreal permafrost and thawed permafrost
50 peatlands was significantly lower than in permafrost-free bogs despite similar vegetation types
51 (0.9% versus 1.5% N). Median long-term C accumulation rates were higher in fens (23 g C m⁻²
52 y⁻¹) than in permafrost-free bogs (18 g C m⁻² y⁻¹), and were lowest in boreal permafrost peatlands
53 (14 g C m⁻² y⁻¹). The plant macrofossil record demonstrated transitions from fens to bogs to
54 permafrost peatlands, bogs to fens, permafrost aggradation within fens, and permafrost thaw and
55 re-aggradation. Using data synthesis, we've identified predominant peatland successional
56 pathways, changes in vegetation type, peat properties, and C accumulation rates associated with
57 permafrost aggradation.

58

59 **1 Introduction**

60 Northern peatlands are one of the largest stocks of soil carbon (C) within the permafrost zone,
61 storing nearly 30% of the 1035 ± 150 Pg C found in the top 3m of soils in the permafrost zone
62 [Hugelius *et al.*, 2014]. Permafrost presence in the northern high latitudes has significant
63 ramifications for the future of the peatland C stock as high latitudes warm [Tarnocai, 2006].
64 Permafrost aggradation in peatlands results in protection of soil organic matter from
65 decomposition, as well as changes to soil hydrology that result in altered carbon exchange and
66 increased vulnerability to wildfire [Camill *et al.*, 2009; Turetsky *et al.*, 2011]. Permafrost thaw

67 can increase the decomposition of previously frozen soil organic matter and the release of
68 greenhouse gases to the atmosphere including carbon dioxide, methane, and nitrous oxide
69 [Goulden *et al.*, 1998; Marushchak *et al.*, 2011; Schuur *et al.*, 2009; Turetsky *et al.*, 2002]. In
70 addition to soil temperature and moisture, the amount of C released during decomposition
71 depends on peat composition and degree of decomposition at the time of permafrost aggradation
72 [e.g. Kuhry and Vitt, 1996; Sannel and Kuhry, 2009; Treat *et al.*, 2014; Vardy *et al.*, 2000].
73 Therefore, understanding the history of permafrost aggradation and thaw in peatlands is
74 important to understanding future climate feedbacks. However, determining the history of
75 permafrost aggradation within peatlands still remains difficult due to a lack of distinct
76 permafrost-specific plant indicator species [Camill *et al.*, 2009; Oksanen and Väliranta, 2006;
77 Sannel and Kuhry, 2008]. Using changes in plant macrofossil *assemblages* and the presence of
78 physical indicators such as cryostructures, charcoal, and highly humified peats, we synthesize
79 peatland records with known permafrost history to examine how peat properties and carbon
80 accumulation rates change with permafrost aggradation in boreal and tundra peatlands.

81 Permafrost aggradation in peatlands can alter hydrology, thus affecting vegetation
82 composition, productivity, and decomposition, ultimately altering C accumulation rates. In
83 boreal regions, permafrost aggradation and subsequent frost heave result in an elevated peatland
84 surface that is drier than the surrounding unfrozen fens and bogs [Bhiry *et al.*, 2007; Zoltai and
85 Tarnocai, 1975]. Drier surface conditions alter vegetation composition, increase the likelihood of
86 wildfire [Camill *et al.*, 2009], increase the decomposition of surface peat [Lamarre *et al.*, 2012;
87 Turetsky *et al.*, 2007] and ultimately result in lower C accumulation rates in boreal permafrost
88 peatland environments than permafrost-free peatlands [Camill *et al.*, 2009; Oksanen *et al.*, 2001;
89 Robinson and Moore, 2000; Sannel and Kuhry, 2009]. In tundra regions, permafrost aggradation
90 also alters soil hydrology. Water infiltration is limited by permafrost presence, leading to
91 saturated soils and subsequent wetland development [Tarnocai and Zoltai, 1988]. Ice-wedge
92 development within polygonal peatlands results in microtopographical vegetation differences
93 between the polygon wet centers with herbaceous vegetation and dry rims with woody
94 vegetation [Ellis and Rochefort, 2004; Mackay, 1990; Tarnocai and Zoltai, 1988]. In contrast
95 with boreal permafrost peatlands, simultaneous permafrost aggradation and peat deposition (i.e.,
96 syngenetic permafrost aggradation) in tundra and continuous permafrost regions can result in the
97 assimilation of relatively undecomposed material into permafrost peat and relatively high rates of

98 C accumulation [*O'Donnell et al.*, 2012; *Sannel and Kuhry*, 2009; *Treat et al.*, 2014; *Vardy et al.*,
99 1997].

100 Permafrost thaw is associated with increased productivity, higher methane emissions, and higher
101 rates of C accumulation [*Camill et al.*, 2001; *Robinson and Moore*, 2000; *Turetsky et al.*, 2007].
102 However, peat in permafrost thaw features is relatively young and more easily decomposed than
103 other types of peat [*Jorgenson et al.*, 2013; *Payette et al.*, 2004; *Turetsky*, 2004], which may
104 lower rates of long-term C accumulation as this peat decomposes. Despite high C accumulation
105 rates following permafrost thaw, the net C loss from the former permafrost plateau can persist for
106 decades to millennia [*O'Donnell et al.*, 2012].

107 Permafrost aggradation and thaw have been linked to a range of local and regional factors.
108 Climate, both spatially and temporally, plays a role in permafrost aggradation. Permafrost
109 aggradation can occur in regions where mean annual temperatures are lower than 0°C. Late-
110 Holocene Neoglacial cooling and Little Ice Age [820 - 150 cal yr BP; *Irvine et al.*, 2012] cooling
111 resulted in wide-spread permafrost aggradation in many regions of Canada and Europe [*Halsey*
112 *et al.*, 1995; *Hugelius et al.*, 2012; *Oksanen et al.*, 2003]. Additional factors affecting permafrost
113 aggradation include the colonization of peatland surfaces by *Sphagnum* species (spp.),
114 microtopography, tree and shrub cover, snow cover duration and depth, and disturbance [*Allard*
115 *and Seguin*, 1987; *Camill*, 2000; 2005; *Johansson et al.*, 2006; *Payette et al.*, 2004; *Seppälä*,
116 2011; *Zoltai and Tarnocai*, 1975]. These factors cause changes in the soil thermal regime and
117 result in decreased thermal conductivity during the summer or increased exposure to cold winter
118 temperatures [*Halsey et al.*, 1995; *Oksanen et al.*, 2003; *Seppälä*, 1994; 2011; *Zoltai*, 1993;
119 1995; *Zoltai and Tarnocai*, 1975]. Permafrost thaw in peatlands can be associated both with
120 climate and local factors such as disturbance, wildfire, and increased snow cover [*Camill*, 2005;
121 *Johansson et al.*, 2006; *Payette et al.*, 2004; *Zoltai*, 1993].

122 Plant macrofossils can be used in conjunction with other physical indicators to determine the
123 timing of transitions among peatland environmental classes, including transitions among fens,
124 bogs, aggradation of permafrost, and thawing of permafrost (Figure 2). Transitions from brown
125 moss (i.e., non-*Sphagnum* mosses such as *Amblystegiaceae* and *Calliergonoideae* sub-families)
126 and *Cyperaceae*-dominated peat to *Sphagnum*-dominated peat is commonly associated with
127 ombrotrophy and the fen-to-bog transition [*Vitt*, 2006], although *Sphagnum* alone cannot be used

128 as a primary indicator of ombrotrophy because of the wide-range in nutrient status of *Sphagnum*
129 species [Laine *et al.*, 2011]. Permafrost aggradation can result in plant macrofossil shifts to
130 species tolerant of dry conditions, such as lichens, feather mosses, and dwarf shrubs [Camill *et*
131 *al.*, 2009; Oksanen *et al.*, 2001; Oksanen and Väliranta, 2006; Zoltai and Tarnocai, 1975].
132 Permafrost aggradation that is concurrent with peat accumulation (syngenetic permafrost) can be
133 indicated either by cryostructures or intermixing of mineral sediments and basal peat [Kanevskiy
134 *et al.*, 2014; Washburn, 1979; Zoltai, 1995]. Changes in peat chemistry or peat properties, such
135 as C/N ratios, have been used to aid in the identification of permafrost aggradation within a core
136 [e.g. Sannel and Kuhry, 2009], but it is unknown whether permafrost widely affects peat
137 properties. An abrupt transition from dry hummock bog species to wet fen or bog species can be
138 used to indicate permafrost thaw [Camill *et al.*, 2009; Jones *et al.*, 2013; Myers-Smith *et al.*,
139 2008; Nicholson *et al.*, 1996; Oksanen *et al.*, 2001; Robinson and Moore, 2000; Zoltai, 1993;
140 1995]. Plant macrofossil records show repeated cycles of permafrost aggradation and thaw over
141 the past several thousand years [Jorgenson *et al.*, 2013; Kuhry, 2008; Oksanen *et al.*, 2001; 2003;
142 Sannel and Kuhry, 2008; Zoltai, 1993] in some records, but it is unclear how widespread these
143 aggradation-degradation cycles are. These transitions sometimes contained a charcoal layer
144 between the permafrost and thaw layers indicating wildfire in boreal permafrost peatlands that
145 removed the insulating surface organic matter and, subsequently, resulted in thaw [Kuhry, 2008;
146 Oksanen *et al.*, 2001; 2003; Sannel and Kuhry, 2008; Zoltai, 1993].

147 The objectives for this study were to first determine if a combination of plant macrofossil
148 assemblages and peat properties can be used to identify permafrost aggradation and degradation
149 based on a compilation of circumboreal/arctic peat cores. If these proxies can be used for
150 permafrost history, then 1) determine to what degree permafrost aggradation and degradation
151 impact carbon accumulation rates, 2) determine the frequency of transitions among peatland
152 environmental classes and frequency of freeze/thaw cycles in Holocene peat cores, and 3)
153 improve conceptual models of peatland succession by incorporating permafrost aggradation and
154 thaw. We compiled existing plant macrofossil records from the boreal and tundra permafrost
155 zone along with associated peat properties (carbon (C), nitrogen (N), carbon to nitrogen ratio
156 (C/N), organic matter content (OM), bulk density, and C accumulation rates). To the best of our
157 knowledge, a large-scale integrative comparison of peat properties and C accumulation rates

158 among peatlands with permafrost has not yet been undertaken. In this study, we hypothesized
159 that:

- 160 1) Environmental conditions associated with permafrost aggradation affect peat properties
161 and C accumulation rates. Drying in boreal peatlands associated with permafrost
162 aggradation increases decomposition, thereby decreasing C/N ratios and C accumulation
163 rates. In tundra peatlands, syngenetic permafrost aggradation decreases decomposition
164 through the freezing of relatively undecomposed organic matter, thereby increasing C/N
165 ratios and C accumulation rates.
- 166 2) Repeated events of permafrost aggradation and thaw are more common in boreal regions
167 than tundra regions.

168

169 **2 Methods**

170 **2.1 Data compilation**

171 We compiled records of plant macrofossils, radiocarbon dates, lithologies, and peat properties
172 from cores collected within or adjacent to the contemporary northern permafrost zone. We
173 identified studies using: 1) Web of Science search with the terms peatland, boreal, tundra,
174 permafrost, carbon, macrofossil, and/or Holocene; 2) contributions of published and unpublished
175 data, and 3) references from published studies. We included studies that contained data on peat
176 properties (e.g., bulk density, C, N, organic matter content) and/or chronologic information in
177 addition to information about lithology, macrofossil information, or stratigraphy for the entire
178 peat record. We extracted depth information, peat properties, chronology, plant macrofossil data,
179 and data interpretation from publicly available data, contributions, and published studies. Data
180 were extracted from figures using a data extraction tool (PlotDigitizer;
181 <http://plotdigitizer.sourceforge.net/>). Bulk density was measured on dry soils for 515 cores using
182 gravimetric methods (Table S1). Organic matter content was measured using the loss-on-ignition
183 technique at combustion temperatures $\geq 550^{\circ}\text{C}$ for the 446 cores that reported values (Table S1).
184 Total carbon and nitrogen were measured on bulk samples using elemental combustion analyzers
185 for the 93 cores (%C) and 80 cores (%N) that reported data (Table S1). Total C and N data are
186 reported per gram dry weight of sample for easy comparison with other studies. The C/N ratio is

187 calculated on a mass basis. We excluded mineral soils from analysis based either on a %C cutoff
188 (< 20% C by dry mass), organic matter cutoff (< 65% OM), or lithology descriptions (sand, silt,
189 clay).

190 In this study, peat properties are presented for 517 cores from 280 pan-arctic permafrost zone
191 sites with and without permafrost (Figure 1; Table S1). Fifty-three cores without permafrost were
192 also included from a previous synthesis effort focused on northern hemisphere non-permafrost
193 peatlands [Loisel *et al.*, 2014].

194 **2.2 Vegetation type and environmental classification**

195 Each sampling depth of each peat core was classified in two different categories, dominant
196 vegetation type and environmental class, using plant macrofossil composition and/or lithology.
197 Vegetation type was categorized using the dominant macrofossil component (> 35%) or the
198 dominant description in the lithology. The categories for vegetation type included brown moss
199 [Tuittila *et al.*, 2013], feather moss [Tuittila *et al.*, 2013], herbaceous (grasses, forbs, *Equisetum*,
200 Cyperaceae), lichen, ligneous (shrubs, trees, rootlets), limnic (gyttja, organic rich silt, silty peat),
201 *Sphagnum* spp., or amorphous (no discernable dominant macrofossil type due to decomposition).
202 A grouped “*Sphagnum*” vegetation type was used because *Sphagnum* functional types
203 [hummock, lawn, hollow; Laine *et al.*, 2011; Tuittila *et al.*, 2013] were more similar to each
204 other than to other vegetation types (Table S2).

205 Samples were also classified as one of six environmental classes using the macrofossil
206 assemblages (Figure 2): fens [Group, 1988; Zoltai and Vitt, 1995], bogs [Group, 1988; Zoltai
207 and Vitt, 1995], tundra permafrost peatlands, boreal permafrost peatlands, thawed permafrost
208 (including collapse scar fens, bogs, and thaw ponds), and open water (ponds, pools, marshes,
209 lakes, swamps, that all precede peat deposition). Boreal permafrost peatlands included fens and
210 bogs with permafrost in the peat, palsas, and peat plateaus. Tundra permafrost peatlands included
211 high center polygons, low center polygons, and tundra sites with organic soil horizons greater
212 than 30 cm, where organic soil was defined by bulk organic C content of > 20%. We used
213 authors’ interpretation of their own cores to classify the macrofossil assemblages unless it
214 strongly deviated from our criteria for classification (Figure 2). When authors did not make a
215 classification and sufficient information was available, we used plant macrofossil assemblages,

216 specific species composition information (e.g. *Sphagnum riparium* vs. *Sphagnum fuscum*) or
217 taxonomic section, and other physical evidence from the depth interval in the environmental
218 class determination (Figure 2) to classify the macrofossil assemblages. Because the threshold of
219 detail was lower for the vegetation type classification than the environmental classification, there
220 are more samples for the vegetation type category (n=10,647) than for environmental class
221 (n=8778). Occasionally, macrofossil composition from a sample indicated conditions found
222 either in a dry bog or a boreal peat plateau; in these situations, we conservatively classified these
223 samples as “bog” [Camill *et al.*, 2009]. Polygonal peat plateaus occur in both boreal and tundra
224 vegetation zones [Zoltai *et al.*, 1988] and were partitioned using the delineation of tundra and
225 boreal permafrost peatlands from maps of vegetation zones [Olson *et al.*, 2001]. “Permafrost
226 aggradation” refers to the moment of the transition towards peatland vegetation characteristically
227 found in permafrost peatlands in the plant macrofossil assemblages rather than the distinction
228 between the seasonally thawed soil active layer and the permafrost layers.

229 **2.3 Carbon accumulation rates**

230 Apparent C accumulation rates were calculated using dry bulk density, carbon content (%C), and
231 peat accumulation rates based on depth and dating constraints (radiocarbon dates, ²¹⁰Pb
232 radiogenic dates, tephtras) for each depth interval within a core. These apparent C accumulation
233 rates are not necessarily reflective of rates of C accumulation at the time of deposition due to
234 subsequent decomposition [Frolking *et al.*, 2014]. In the case of permafrost thaw, C losses from
235 formerly frozen peat plateaus (boreal permafrost class) can exceed the high rates of C
236 accumulation in the permafrost thaw class and thus result in a net C loss [O'Donnell *et al.*, 2012].
237 A single peat accumulation rate was calculated between each adjacent set of calibrated
238 radiocarbon dates (linear interpolation) [Reimer *et al.*, 2013]. Carbon accumulation rates for each
239 depth interval within a core were then calculated using the carbon density of the depth interval
240 and the peat accumulation rate. To calculate C density for cores missing bulk density, we
241 estimated (or gap-filled) bulk density measurements using mean bulk density for each vegetation
242 type (Table 1), which was a better predictor of bulk density than age or depth ($F = 850$, $P <$
243 0.0001). To calculate C density for cores missing C content (Table S1), C content was calculated
244 from organic matter content (% LOI, if available) using an empirical relationship from our
245 dataset for the vegetation type (Table 1, $n = 3380$). For the amorphous vegetation type, we used

246 the mean %C values from *Loisel et al.* [2014]. Bulk density was not filled for boreal or tundra
247 permafrost soils for depths greater than 50 cm due to error arising from variable ice content.
248 Estimated bulk density and C content were used for the calculation of C density for C
249 accumulation rates but gap-filled data points (n= 416) were excluded from the analysis of peat
250 properties (Table S5, S6). These efforts resulted in a record of C accumulation rates from 147
251 cores across 80 sites; however, many of these cores had poorly constrained peat accumulation
252 rates due to low frequency or sporadic dating of peat horizons. We set a minimum threshold of
253 one date per thousand years (Loisel et al., 2014), which resulted in 80 cores from 40 sites and
254 represents an additional 48 cores within the pan-arctic permafrost and boreal regions from the
255 previous synthesis effort (Loisel et al., 2014). Median C accumulation rates are calculated based
256 on samples older than ca. 1000 cal. y BP to minimize the artifact of mixing peat that is stabilized
257 in the catotelm versus undergoing continued decomposition in the acrotelm, whereas recent
258 median C accumulation rates are calculated from samples < 1000 y age.

259 **2.4 Statistical analysis**

260 Means and standard errors are presented for most physical peat properties. Median C
261 accumulation rates are presented due to the presence of outliers that met the chronologic control
262 thresholds but exceeded known rates of productivity [$> 200 \text{ g C m}^{-2} \text{ y}^{-1}$; Table S3, S4; e.g.
263 *Sannel and Kuhry, 2009*]. The C accumulation rates were not normally distributed; median rates,
264 1st and 3rd quantiles (Q1 = 25%, Q3= 75% percentiles) of the C accumulation rates are reported,
265 while the natural log-transformed data were used in the statistical analysis to improve normality.
266 Mixed-effects modeling was used to test for statistical differences in peat properties and C
267 accumulation rates among vegetation types and environmental classes. Core, age, and depth were
268 included as random effects for both dependent variables. Vegetation type was included as an
269 additional random effect in the analysis for differences among environmental classes to account
270 for effects of vegetation type. Mixed-effects modeling was necessary because of the bias
271 introduced from having multiple samples from the same core, to account for the effects of peat
272 depth and age resulting from physical and decomposition processes, and to account for
273 differences in vegetation types within the environmental classes. We implemented the mixed
274 effects model using the lmer command from the lme4 package [*Bates, 2010*] for R statistical
275 software [*R Core Development Team, 2008*]. Models were selected using Akaike's Information

276 Criterion (AIC) and χ^2 test. Differences among samples were determined from 95%
277 confidence intervals.

278

279 **3 Results**

280 **3.1 Peat properties**

281 Peat properties (organic matter content, C, N, and C/N mass ratios) differed significantly among
282 different vegetation types (Table 1). Organic matter content was generally > 85% per gram dry
283 weight across all vegetation types, with the exception of limnic peat, which was $77 \pm 7\%$ (sd)
284 organic matter (Table 1; $P < 0.0001$). The mean C content of organic matter was 49.5% and did
285 not differ significantly among vegetation types (Table 1). Bulk C content was generally greater
286 than 42% C per gram dry mass except in limnic peat (39%) and amorphous peat (37%; Table 1;
287 $P < 0.0001$). The mean N content of organic matter ranged from $1.0 \pm 0.5\%$ in *Sphagnum*
288 vegetation types to $2.2 \pm 1.0\%$ in limnic peat, with a mean of $1.6 \pm 0.9\%$ among all vegetation
289 types. N content was significantly higher in herbaceous peat ($1.8 \pm 0.7\%$ per gram dry mass)
290 than in *Sphagnum*-dominated peat ($0.9 \pm 0.4\%$; Table 1; $P < 0.0001$). Differences in bulk density
291 among vegetation types were not statistically significant after accounting for differences among
292 cores, depths, and ages using mixed effects modeling (Table 1). The C/N ratio was lowest in the
293 amorphous peat (30) and limnic peat present at the initial stages of peat formation in many cores
294 (31) and was approximately double in *Sphagnum* and lichen-dominated vegetation types (62;
295 Table 1; $P < 0.0001$), likely reflecting the differences in initial C/N ratios among taxa and
296 decomposition effects.

297 Peat properties differed significantly among different environmental classes even after
298 accounting for differences in vegetation types (Table 2). The C/N ratio was significantly higher
299 in boreal permafrost peatlands (67) and thawed permafrost peatlands (53) than all other
300 environmental classes, and 40 – 80% higher than the C/N of bogs (Table 2; Figure 5a; $P <$
301 0.0001). C/N remained higher in boreal permafrost and permafrost thaw environmental classes
302 with age (Figure 5a). Organic matter content was greatest in bogs (97%) but similar among all
303 other types (91%) except for the open water environmental class (74%; Table 2; $P < 0.0001$).
304 Mean C content in organic matter was lowest in thawed permafrost ($47 \pm 2\%$), followed by

305 boreal and tundra permafrost (48%), bogs ($49 \pm 4\%$), and fens ($51 \pm 5\%$). Mean N content in
306 organic matter was lowest in thawed permafrost ($0.8 \pm 0.3\%$), followed by boreal permafrost (0.9
307 $\pm 0.9\%$), bogs ($1.1 \pm 0.4\%$), tundra permafrost ($1.7 \pm 0.8\%$), and fens ($2.4 \pm 1.1\%$). Bulk C
308 content was significantly higher in bogs, fens, and boreal permafrost environmental classes
309 (mean: 47%, respectively) than in other tundra permafrost and thawed permafrost (Table 2; $P <$
310 0.0001). Bulk N differed significantly among environmental classes (Table 2; Figure 5b). N
311 contents in fens were higher than all other classes ($1.9 \pm 0.7\%$), followed by bogs ($1.6 \pm 0.7\%$).
312 N contents in tundra permafrost were significantly lower ($1.4 \pm 0.6\%$), but were still significantly
313 larger than boreal permafrost and thawed permafrost environmental classes ($0.9 \pm 0.4\%$; Table 2;
314 Figure 5b; $P < 0.0001$). Low N in boreal permafrost and thawed permafrost environmental
315 classes persisted with age (Figure 5b). Bulk density did not differ significantly among
316 environmental classes (Table 2).

317 **3.2 Ecosystem dynamics in permafrost peatlands**

318 The relative frequency of the dominant peat vegetation type varied between boreal and tundra
319 permafrost environmental classes (Figure 3). Ligneous vegetation types were common in boreal
320 and tundra permafrost environmental classes (20% and 25%, respectively), although
321 macrofossils from trees were common in boreal permafrost, whereas ericaceous shrubs were
322 common in tundra permafrost. *Sphagnum* was the primary vegetation type found in the boreal
323 permafrost ecosystems ($> 50\%$), while it was less common in tundra permafrost ecosystems ($<$
324 30% ; Figure 3). Herbaceous (23%) and brown mosses (12%; including species from both tundra
325 hummocks and wet depressions) vegetation types were the other common components of tundra
326 permafrost ecosystems.

327 Our interpretation of environmental class based on plant macrofossil assemblages (Figure 2)
328 showed that permafrost aggraded in 72% of boreal cores and 97% of tundra cores, based on our
329 assumption of permafrost-free conditions when macrofossil assemblages were ambiguous.
330 Twenty-five percent of cores with permafrost layers in the boreal zone showed evidence of
331 permafrost thaw (Figure 4), based on an abrupt transition to herbaceous and *Sphagnum* species
332 tolerant of wetter conditions (Figure 2). Subsequent permafrost re-aggradation occurred in 21%
333 of these cores. A maximum of 18% of tundra cores showed evidence of permafrost thaw based

334 on the increase in species indicative of wetter conditions in previously dry conditions, but more
335 than half of these re-aggraded permafrost (62%; Figure 4).

336 Using environmental classifications obtained from the macrofossil assemblages (Figure 2), a
337 majority of cores showed transitions among the different environmental classes (Figure 4). Open
338 water preceded peat accumulation in 30% of all cores; of these cores, 85% subsequently
339 transitioned to fens while 6% transitioned directly to bogs and 9% aggraded syngenetic
340 permafrost (permafrost aggradation concurrent with peat accumulation). The later occurred
341 nearly exclusively in drained thaw lake basins. The majority (nearly 80%) of all cores were
342 characterized by fen vegetation at some depth within the core (Figure 4). Of these fen sites, 55%
343 transitioned to permafrost-free bogs, 38% aggraded permafrost, and 7% remained fens.
344 Aggradation of permafrost in fens was more common in tundra than boreal biomes (24% and
345 14%, respectively). A bog stage was present in 51% of cores. Permafrost aggraded in 54% of
346 bog cores, while 31% of bog cores transitioned back to fens, and the final 15% remained
347 permafrost-free bogs.

348 **3.3 Peat and carbon accumulation rates**

349 In addition to differences in peat properties among vegetation types, rates of C accumulation also
350 differed among vegetation types (Figure 6b; $\text{Chi}^2 = 2300$, $\text{df} = 6$, $P < 0.0001$). Median rates of C
351 accumulation were greatest in brown moss (median = 32.7, Q1 = 23.3, Q3 = 41.2 $\text{g C m}^{-2} \text{y}^{-1}$)
352 and limnic peat (median = 52.2, Q1 = 45, Q3 = 82 $\text{g C m}^{-2} \text{y}^{-1}$). Ligneous (median = 15.5, Q1 =
353 12.4, Q3 = 24.9 $\text{g C m}^{-2} \text{y}^{-1}$), *Sphagnum* (median = 16.7, Q1 = 11.6, Q3 = 24.9 $\text{g C m}^{-2} \text{y}^{-1}$),
354 herbaceous (median = 19.1, Q1 = 13.6, Q3 = 27.3 $\text{g C m}^{-2} \text{y}^{-1}$), and amorphous vegetation types
355 (median = 20.8, Q1 = 16.0, Q3 = 26.1 $\text{g C m}^{-2} \text{y}^{-1}$) had lower median C accumulation rates than
356 brown moss and limnic vegetation types.

357 Rates of C accumulation varied significantly among environmental classes throughout the
358 Holocene after accounting for differences in vegetation type (Figure 6a; $\text{Chi}^2 = 80$, $\text{df} = 2$, $P <$
359 0.0001). Median rates of C accumulation were greatest in the open water stage (median = 27.3,
360 Q1 = 23.8, Q3 = 34.1 $\text{g C m}^{-2} \text{y}^{-1}$) and in permafrost tundra environmental classes (median = 108,
361 Q1 = 14.9, Q3 = 111.0 $\text{g C m}^{-2} \text{y}^{-1}$), but both values represented a limited number of cores for the
362 open water stage ($n = 6$) and permafrost tundra ($n = 3$). The median rates of C accumulation were

363 greater in fens (median = 23.2, Q1 = 15.1, Q3 = 35.5 g C m⁻² y⁻¹) than bogs (median = 17.7, Q1
364 = 11.6, Q3 = 26.8 g C m⁻² y⁻¹), and lower still for the boreal permafrost environmental classes
365 (median = 14.2, Q1 = 9.5, Q3 = 19.8 g C m⁻² y⁻¹). Median rates of recent C accumulation (ages <
366 1000 years) were highest in the permafrost thaw (median = 33, Q1 = 17, Q3 = 64 g C m⁻² y⁻¹)
367 and boreal permafrost environmental classes (median = 33, Q1 = 20, Q3 = 65 g C m⁻² y⁻¹).
368 Including recent peat accumulation, median vertical peat growth rates were greatest in the
369 permafrost thaw peat class (0.9 mm y⁻¹), followed by the boreal permafrost peat class (0.8 mm y⁻¹)
370 ¹). Fen and bog classes had similar rates of vertical peat accumulation of 0.5 mm y⁻¹, while the
371 open water and tundra permafrost classes were slightly less (both 0.4 mm y⁻¹).

372

373

374 **4 Discussion**

375 **4.1 Broad patterns in permafrost peatland ecosystem dynamics**

376 Using plant macrofossils for environmental classification should not rely on a single species,
377 since vegetation types overlap among among different environmental classifications (Figure 3).
378 For example, the transition to *Sphagnum*-dominated peat is commonly associated with
379 ombotrophic transition to bogs [Vitt, 2006] but can also be associated with the oligotrophic
380 conditions found in fens. Distinguishing between these two environmental classes can be
381 accomplished by identifying *Sphagnum* species (spp.) to the section level [Laine et al., 2011], or
382 using the macrofossil vegetation assemblage as a whole. Similarly, individual species found in
383 present-day permafrost peatlands, such as *Sphagnum fuscum* and *Picea mariana*, are also found
384 in dry, unfrozen bogs [Camill et al., 2009]. Therefore, it is important to carefully consider the
385 vegetation assemblage, including moss species, as a whole and the regional context [Oksanen et
386 al., 2001; 2003; Oksanen and Välranta, 2006; Sannel and Kuhry, 2008]. Supplemental
387 indicators of environmental transitions, such as changes in peat properties, would be helpful to
388 better elucidate the history of permafrost aggradation and thaw at sites within the permafrost
389 zone.

390 Peatlands in the high-latitude permafrost zone did not show straightforward successional
391 trajectories from fens to bogs to permafrost peatlands. First, not all fens transitioned to bogs.

392 While the majority transitioned to bogs (55%), over 10% remained permafrost-free fens for the
393 entire macrofossil record, including sites from the discontinuous permafrost regions of Eurasia
394 that ranged from ca. 5000 – 9000 years in age [Andreev *et al.*, 2004; Hugelius *et al.*, 2012;
395 Mäkilä and Moisanen, 2007; Oksanen, 2006] and Western Canada that ranged from ca. 1300 –
396 10,300 years in age [Kettles *et al.*, 2003; Robinson, 2006; Yu *et al.*, 2014]. Persistent fen
397 conditions are related to the regional hydrologic dynamics, such as groundwater input,
398 precipitation, throughflow, and input from adjacent water bodies, combined with catchment
399 topography [Glaser *et al.*, 2004; Nicholson and Vitt, 1990; Quinton *et al.*, 2003; Zoltai and
400 Johnson, 1985]. Changes in regional hydrology can also result in transitions from bog to fen
401 [Hájková *et al.*, 2012; Van Bellen *et al.*, 2013], which occurred in 16% of all cores [Camill *et al.*,
402 2009; Kettles *et al.*, 2003; Van Bellen *et al.*, 2013]. Second, permafrost aggraded in 35% of fens
403 as shown by the beginning transitions to more ligneous vegetation associated with the
404 development of polygons, which means that many sites with permafrost were never bogs. In
405 tundra regions, permafrost underlies low-center polygons with brown mosses, *Carex* spp., and
406 *Eriophorum* spp. [Figure 2, 3; Tarnocai and Zoltai, 1988]. In Fennoscandia and boreal Canada,
407 aapa mires, string fens, and earth hummocks contain permafrost under ridges or hummocks
408 [Luoto and Seppälä, 2002; Mäkilä and Moisanen, 2007; Oksanen, 2006; Seppälä, 1998; Zoltai *et*
409 *al.*, 1988].

410 Throughout the Holocene, permafrost aggradation and thaw were common processes in boreal
411 and tundra peatlands within the permafrost zone. Permafrost aggradation occurred in ~ 70% of
412 boreal and 97% of tundra cores that we analyzed from the modern permafrost zone. While
413 *Sphagnum* moss presence has been cited as a factor promoting permafrost aggradation within
414 bog hummocks, especially in more southern permafrost regions [Camill *et al.*, 2009; Zoltai,
415 1995; Zoltai and Tarnocai, 1975], *Sphagnum* presence was not required for permafrost formation
416 at higher latitudes in our study and was less common in tundra permafrost than boreal permafrost
417 (Figure 3). Permafrost thaw occurred in 25% of boreal and 12% of tundra cores. Most of the
418 permafrost thaw in the tundra occurred in the discontinuous permafrost zone, and, following
419 thaw, more cores in tundra re-aggraded permafrost than in boreal zones (62% in tundra vs. 21%
420 in boreal; Figure 4). Repeated cycles of permafrost aggradation and thaw have previously been
421 described at two sites in Western Canada in the isolated permafrost zone [Zoltai, 1993].
422 However, in this compilation of records, cyclical permafrost aggradation of more than two

423 aggradation/thaw events was limited to a few additional sites located in Western Canada [nb.
424 *Bauer and Vitt*, 2011 sampled same peatland complex as Zoltai (1993); *Kuhry*, 2008] and two
425 Eurasian sites [*Oksanen et al.*, 2001; 2003]. Single events of permafrost thaw followed by
426 permafrost re-aggradation were more common in this study zone (16 additional sites). While it
427 appears that the cyclical pattern of multiple permafrost thaw and re-aggradation events was rare
428 in peatlands within the permafrost zone, material from thawed areas may be poorly preserved
429 and best identified using techniques such as chemical biomarkers [*Ronkainen et al.*, 2015].

430 **4.2 Peat properties in high-latitude wetlands**

431 The peat properties described in this study are in general agreement with the trends found by
432 previous studies. Organic matter content in this study agreed well with previously reported
433 values [*Bauer et al.*, 2006; *Loisel et al.*, 2014]. The mean carbon content of organic matter in this
434 study ($49.5 \pm 5.1\%$ (sd), $n = 739$) was slightly higher than the 49.2% reported by Loisel et al.
435 [2014], but nearly identical to other values reported for North America [*Gorham*, 1991], Western
436 Canada [*Vitt et al.*, 2000], and Siberia [*Sheng et al.*, 2004]. Median C accumulation rates were
437 within the range reported by *Gorham et al.* [2003], *Yu et al.* [2009], and *Loisel et al.* [2014].

438 There were large differences in the C/N ratio between our data and previous syntheses, with
439 much lower mean C/N ratios in this study (41) compared to *Loisel et al.* [2014] (55), likely due
440 to many fewer *Sphagnum* peat samples in this study. The C/N ratio in bogs was greater than in
441 fens, similar to findings for a large number of peatlands in temperate and boreal Ontario, Canada
442 [*Wang et al.*, 2015], and consistent with higher C/N in *Sphagnum* peat compared to other peat
443 types [*Loisel et al.*, 2014]. The N contents for *Sphagnum*, herbaceous and woody/ligneous peats
444 were moderately higher (5 – 24%) relative to mean values reported by *Loisel et al.* [2014]. This
445 study encompassed a much larger number of permafrost peat samples than that of *Loisel et al.*
446 [2014], who focused on the northern peatland domain as a whole.

447 **4.3 Effects of permafrost aggradation on peat properties**

448 The effects of permafrost aggradation on peat properties is somewhat difficult to discern because
449 peat properties differed significantly between boreal and tundra permafrost environmental
450 classes. The boreal permafrost environmental class had higher organic matter content (92 and
451 72%, respectively), higher C/N ratios (67 and 34, respectively; Figure 5a), but significantly

452 lower N content (0.9 and 1.4%, respectively; Table 2; Figure 5b) and lower rates of C
453 accumulation compared with tundra permafrost (median: 14 and 108 g C m⁻² y⁻¹ for boreal and
454 tundra permafrost, respectively). This could reflect differences in vegetation type (Figure 3;
455 Table 1)[*Kuhry and Vitt, 1996*] or more frequent disturbance (wildfire) in boreal than tundra
456 regions that results in C and N loss from soils [*Harden et al., 2002; Mack et al., 2011*].

457 The history of permafrost aggradation can be difficult to distinguish using vegetation types alone
458 because of the similarity among vegetation types, even with additional information from
459 considering plant macrofossil assemblages. However, if we compare the permafrost
460 environmental classes to the other classes with similar vegetation and nutrient status (Figure 3),
461 differences emerge that may be attributed to permafrost presence. Both permafrost-free fens and
462 tundra permafrost had a high abundance of herbaceous peat. Ligneous and *Sphagnum* peat were
463 more abundant in tundra permafrost classes than in permafrost-free fens (Figure 3), likely
464 resulting from microtopography created by permafrost aggradation and polygon formation [*de*
465 *Klerk et al., 2011*]. Both boreal permafrost peatlands and permafrost-free bogs had a high
466 abundance of *Sphagnum* peat, but again, ligneous peat was more abundant in boreal permafrost
467 class (Figure 3). Based on this analysis, ligneous peat appears to be more prevalent in permafrost
468 environmental classes than the comparable permafrost-free environmental classes.

469 Permafrost aggradation affects peat properties such as C/N ratios, nitrogen content, and organic
470 matter content when permafrost peatlands are compared to permafrost-free peatlands with
471 similar vegetation. Compared to permafrost-free fens, tundra permafrost peatlands had higher
472 C/N ratios (34 versus 29; Figure 5a), lower N content (1.4% vs. 1.9%, Figure 5b), and a higher
473 occurrence of intermixed mineral sediments (Figure 3). When compared to permafrost-free bogs,
474 boreal permafrost environmental classes had higher C/N ratios (67 versus 37; Figure 5a) but
475 significantly lower N content (0.9% versus 1.6%; Figure 5b).

476 Higher C/N ratios in the permafrost environmental classes than permafrost-free environmental
477 classes may reflect the initial botanical composition of the vegetation types, differences in degree
478 of decomposition, or differences in the peat N content. Vegetation differences between tundra
479 permafrost and permafrost-free fens, such as higher abundance of *Sphagnum* peat (C/N = 62) and
480 ligneous peat (32), could explain the higher mean C/N in tundra permafrost (34) than permafrost
481 free-fens (27). Using the composition of vegetation types among environmental classes (Figure

482 3) and mean C/N ratios for those vegetation types (Table 1), we predict higher C/N ratios for
483 tundra permafrost (41) than fens (36) based on vegetation differences. Accordingly, due to the
484 higher frequency of *Sphagnum* peat in bogs (Figure 3), we predict that C/N ratios in bogs should
485 be higher than the boreal permafrost environmental class (bog = 57 and boreal permafrost = 49),
486 but this is not the case (bog = 37 and boreal permafrost = 67). Decomposition lowers C/N ratios
487 in peat [Kuhry and Vitt, 1996]. Higher C/N ratios in permafrost peats than permafrost-free peats,
488 especially in older peat (Figure 5a), might reflect a lack of decomposition related to the cold
489 temperatures found in permafrost. Relatively high C/N throughout the record in boreal
490 permafrost environmental classes (Figure 5a) suggests limited decomposition of boreal
491 permafrost peats throughout the Holocene, whereas C/N ratios in the bog environmental class
492 decreases in older samples, indicating a legacy of decomposition.

493 Nitrogen contents were also lower in tundra and boreal permafrost than their permafrost-free
494 counterparts and may be attributable to disturbance losses, denitrification, or storage in the
495 undecomposed, frozen organic matter in permafrost. Nitrogen could be lost from permafrost
496 ecosystems as N₂O from denitrification [Marushchak et al., 2011; Repo et al., 2009] or N could
497 be lost during wildfire from both boreal permafrost peatlands [relatively common; Harden et al.,
498 2002] and tundra permafrost ecosystems [relatively uncommon; Mack et al., 2011]. Permafrost
499 presence and the resulting N storage in frozen organic matter may result in N limitation, resulting
500 in N resorption into tissues prior to litterfall, reduced rates of decomposition and positive
501 feedbacks to low nitrogen concentration in permafrost peats [Aerts et al., 1999; Harden et al.,
502 2012; Shaver and Chapin, 1991; Vitousek, 1982], whereas N can be remineralized from greater
503 depths in permafrost-free peats. Similarly, permafrost aggradation and shifts in hydrology
504 associated with uplift can further increase the isolation of the peat surface from hydrologic
505 sources of N. Alternatively, relatively low N content in boreal and tundra permafrost peatlands
506 could reflect the relatively undecomposed peat material compared to similar peatlands without
507 permafrost, as indicated by the C/N ratios (Figure 5a). Finally, differential amounts of nitrogen
508 fixation among the peat classes may also be reflected in the peat N contents [e.g. Berg et al.,
509 2013; Harden et al., 2002; Larmola et al., 2014; Vile et al., 2014]. Using the synthesis approach,
510 we are unable to directly evaluate these mechanisms, although the differences in C/N ratios
511 among environmental classes support the hypothesis of limited decomposition in permafrost
512 peats.

513 **4.4 Effects of permafrost aggradation on apparent C accumulation rates**

514 Permafrost aggradation and thaw changes C accumulation rates (Figure 6a) as well as peat
515 properties (Table 2). Boreal and tundra permafrost peatlands had significantly different rates of C
516 accumulation, but the magnitude of change associated with permafrost aggradation also differed
517 when compared to environmental classes with similar vegetation types but without permafrost.
518 Greater C accumulation rates occurred in tundra permafrost than fen environmental classes,
519 while C accumulation rates were lower in boreal permafrost than bog environmental classes. In
520 the short-term, recent C accumulation rates increased following permafrost thaw, although C is
521 also simultaneously lost from deeper soils. At several sites included in this study, syngenetic
522 permafrost aggradation limited decomposition and resulted in high C accumulation rates at depth
523 [O'Donnell *et al.*, 2012; Sannel and Kuhry, 2009; Vardy *et al.*, 2000]. This may have been a
524 factor in the relatively high rates of C accumulation observed in tundra permafrost peat classes
525 compared to fens.

526 **4.5 Limitations to reconstructing ecosystem and climate dynamics**

527 Reconstruction of ecosystem dynamics requires more detailed macrofossil analysis than is
528 common in many descriptions of core lithologies. Using the lithology or vegetation type to
529 determine the environmental classification can be problematic because of the frequent presence
530 of *Sphagnum* peat among different environmental classes (Figure 3). Therefore, the transition to
531 *Sphagnum*-dominated peat cannot be used as a proxy for the fen-bog transition without
532 consideration to the other common indicators of ombrotrophy [Laine *et al.*, 2011]. The
533 environmental classification in this study uses plant macrofossil assemblages along with other
534 physical and biological indicators rather than simply the surface vegetation or vegetation type,
535 which can be ambiguous and change through time [Figure 4; Yu *et al.*, 2013].

536 Determining the timing of permafrost aggradation can require multiple lines of evidence. Using
537 temporal changes in the plant macrofossil composition and shifts in assemblages is the most
538 widespread and reliable but requires caution due to overlapping habitats among species. Several
539 common macrofossils are found in multiple environmental classes and make discerning the onset
540 of permafrost aggradation difficult [Camill *et al.*, 2009; Oksanen, 2006; Oksanen *et al.*, 2001;
541 Sannel and Kuhry, 2008]. In addition to plant macrofossil composition, previous studies have

542 used several techniques to infer permafrost aggradation, including testate amoeba [*Jones et al.*,
543 2013; *Lamarre et al.*, 2012; *Swindles et al.*, 2015], changes in physical and chemical properties
544 including charcoal presence [*Camill et al.*, 2009; *de Klerk et al.*, 2011; *Oksanen*, 2006; *Oksanen*
545 *et al.*, 2001; *Sannel and Kuhry*, 2008; *Tarnocai and Zoltai*, 1988; *Zoltai*, 1993], and analysis of
546 cryostructures [*Kanevskiy et al.*, 2014; *O'Donnell et al.*, 2012; *Vardy et al.*, 1997]. We propose
547 that N content could be used as an additional proxy of permafrost aggradation. Our analyses
548 show significantly lower N content in peat deposited following permafrost aggradation; these
549 differences persist over time (Figure 5b). Using > 3000 measurements from 90 peat profiles
550 across the pan-arctic, N content in boreal permafrost and tundra permafrost environmental
551 classes was significantly lower than in permafrost-free peats with similar vegetation (Figure 5b).
552 While C/N ratios showed similar trends, the variability in N content was smaller than variability
553 in C/N ratios, making this metric more useful (Figure 5). Other promising chemical and
554 biological analyses that warrant further exploration and might help to discern permafrost history
555 within high latitude peatland peat core profiles include stable C and N isotopes, lipid biomarker
556 extraction, testate amoeba, oribatid mites and ancient DNA extraction [*Andersson et al.*, 2011;
557 *Andersson et al.*, 2012; *Lamarre et al.*, 2012; *Markkula*, 2014; *Parducci et al.*, 2014; *Ronkainen*
558 *et al.*, 2014; *Routh et al.*, 2014; *Swindles et al.*, 2015].

559 The interpretation of climate dynamics from peatland records of permafrost aggradation and
560 thaw is difficult due to the combination of autogenic processes, local factors and regional
561 climate. Regional differences in climate, glacial history, and geomorphology affect peatland
562 development and permafrost history [*Ellis and Rochefort*, 2004; *Nicholson et al.*, 1996]. For
563 example, the history of two arctic regions differs greatly. Peat in many tundra permafrost
564 peatlands in Western Canada accumulated during warmer and wetter climatic conditions [e.g.
565 *Tarnocai and Zoltai*, 1988; *Zoltai*, 1995], while in regions of Alaska and Siberia, the thawing of
566 massive Pleistocene ice wedges in loess sediments has resulted in thermokarst lakes and
567 subsequent, on-going peat accumulation [*Jones et al.*, 2012; *Kanevskiy et al.*, 2014; *O'Donnell et*
568 *al.*, 2012; *Walter Anthony et al.*, 2014]. Ideally, multiple proxies, such as diatoms, pollen, testate
569 amoeba, or chemical analyses, and multiple sites could be used to support site-specific processes
570 versus regional climate influences. The approach of synthesizing macrofossils records used in
571 this study offers great promise for future studies with the goal of understanding historical
572 permafrost dynamics across the high-latitude permafrost zone.

573

574 **5 Conclusions**

575 Ecological and hydrological changes associated with permafrost aggradation in peatlands altered
576 vegetation types as well as carbon and nitrogen cycling, and ultimately affected peat properties,
577 ecosystem productivity, decomposition, and net carbon balance. Using the frequency of
578 vegetation types and common successional transitions among environmental classes, we found
579 that boreal permafrost peats were most similar to permafrost-free bogs, while tundra permafrost
580 peats were most similar to permafrost-free fens. Using this comparison, permafrost aggradation
581 reduced peat N content relative to their permafrost-free counterparts (Figure 5b), although the
582 exact mechanism remains unclear and should be explored with further research. This would
583 enable the use of N as a supplementary indicator of permafrost aggradation. Permafrost
584 aggradation also increased C accumulation rates in boreal permafrost peat relative to permafrost-
585 free bogs due to slightly higher rates of C accumulation in the surface peat that may have been
586 related to the presence of relatively undecomposed organic matter, which is supported by the
587 relatively high C/N ratios (Figure 5a). Finally, the interactions between permafrost aggradation,
588 productivity, decomposition, disturbance and nitrogen illustrated here warrant further research.

589

590 **Acknowledgements**

591 We thank Jonathan Nichols, Kristen Manies, Jessica Rodysill, and two anonymous reviewers for
592 critical comments that helped to improve this manuscript. CT and MJ acknowledge funding from
593 The National Science Foundation (ARC-1304823). MJ is funded by the Climate and Land-use
594 Change Research and Development Program at the USGS. MV, TR and PM acknowledge
595 funding from the Academy of Finland (projects 131409 and 1140900) and from the University of
596 Helsinki. BS received financial support from the Royal Swedish Academy of Science and the
597 Ymer-80, Knut & Alice Wallenberg and Ahlmann Foundations. PC was supported by NSF (DEB
598 0092704). All data for this paper are properly cited in Supplemental Table 1. Additionally, data
599 can be accessed following registration from the International Soil Carbon Network
600 (<http://iscn.fluxdata.org/Pages/default.aspx>; DOI pending). Any use of trade, firm, or product
601 names is for descriptive purposes only and does not imply endorsement by the U.S. Government.

602

603

604 **References**

- 605 Aerts, R., J. T. A. Verhoeven, and D. F. Whigham (1999), Plant-mediated controls on nutrient
606 cycling in temperate fens and bogs, *Ecology*, 80(7), 2170-2181.
- 607 Allard, M., and M. K. Seguin (1987), The Holocene evolution of permafrost near the tree line, on
608 the eastern coast of Hudson Bay (northern Quebec), *Canadian Journal of Earth Sciences*, 24(11),
609 2206-2222, doi:10.1139/e87-209.
- 610 Andersson, R. A., P. Kuhry, P. Meyers, Y. Zebühr, P. Crill, and M. Mörth (2011), Impacts of
611 paleohydrological changes on n-alkane biomarker compositions of a Holocene peat sequence in
612 the eastern European Russian Arctic, *Organic Geochemistry*, 42(9), 1065-1075.
- 613 Andersson, R. A., P. Meyers, E. Hornibrook, P. Kuhry, and C.-M. Mörth (2012), Elemental and
614 isotopic carbon and nitrogen records of organic matter accumulation in a Holocene permafrost
615 peat sequence in the East European Russian Arctic, *Journal of Quaternary Science*, 27(6), 545-
616 552, doi:10.1002/jqs.2541.
- 617 Andreev, A. A., P. E. Tarasov, V. A. Klimanov, M. Melles, O. M. Lisitsyna, and H. W.
618 Hubberten (2004), Vegetation and climate changes around the Lama Lake, Taymyr Peninsula,
619 Russia during the Late Pleistocene and Holocene, *Quaternary International*, 122, 69-84.
- 620 Bates, D. (2010), lme4: Mixed-effects modeling with R, edited, p. 145 pp., Springer, Madison,
621 WI.
- 622 Bauer, I. E., J. S. Bhatti, K. J. Cash, C. Tarnocai, and S. D. Robinson (2006), Developing
623 statistical models to estimate the carbon density of organic soils, *Canadian Journal of Soil*
624 *Science*, 86(2), 295-304.
- 625 Bauer, I. E., and D. H. Vitt (2011), Peatland dynamics in a complex landscape: Development of
626 a fen-bog complex in the Sporadic Discontinuous Permafrost zone of northern Alberta, Canada,
627 *Boreas*, 40(4), 714-726, doi:10.1111/j.1502-3885.2011.00210.x.
- 628 Berg, A., Å. Danielsson, and B. Svensson (2013), Transfer of fixed-N from N₂-fixing
629 cyanobacteria associated with the moss *Sphagnum* riparium results in enhanced growth of the
630 moss, *Plant and Soil*, 362(1-2), 271-278, doi:10.1007/s11104-012-1278-4.
- 631 Bhiry, N., S. Payette, and E. C. Robert (2007), Peatland development at the arctic tree line
632 (Quebec, Canada) influenced by flooding and permafrost, *Quaternary Research*, 67(3), 426-437.
- 633 Brown, J., O.J. Ferrians Jr., J.A. Heginbottom, and E. S. Melnikov (1998, revised 2001), Circum-
634 Arctic map of permafrost and ground-ice conditions., *Digital Media*, National Snow and Ice Data
635 Center/World Data Center for Glaciology, Boulder, CO.
- 636 Camill, P. (2000), How much do local factors matter for predicting transient ecosystem
637 dynamics? Suggestions from permafrost formation in boreal peatlands, *Global Change Biology*,
638 6(2), 169-182.
- 639 Camill, P. (2005), Permafrost thaw accelerates in boreal peatlands during late-20th century
640 climate warming, *Climatic Change*, 68(1-2), 135-152.

641 Camill, P., A. Barry, E. Williams, C. Andreassi, J. Limmer, and D. Solick (2009), Climate-
642 vegetation-fire interactions and their impact on long-term carbon dynamics in a boreal peatland
643 landscape in northern Manitoba, Canada, *J. Geophys. Res.*, *114*, doi:10.1029/2009jg001071.

644 Camill, P., J. A. Lynch, J. S. Clark, J. B. Adams, and B. Jordan (2001), Changes in biomass,
645 aboveground net primary production, and peat accumulation following permafrost thaw in the
646 boreal peatlands of Manitoba, Canada, *Ecosystems*, *4*(5), 461-478, doi:DOI: 10.1007/s10021-
647 001-0022-3.

648 de Klerk, P., N. Donner, N. S. Karpov, M. Minke, and H. Joosten (2011), Short-term dynamics
649 of a low-centred ice-wedge polygon near Chokurdakh (NE Yakutia, NE Siberia) and climate
650 change during the last ca 1250 years, *Quaternary Science Reviews*, *30*, 3013-3031.

651 Ellis, C. J., and L. Rochefort (2004), Century-scale development of polygon-patterned tundra
652 wetland, Bylot Island (73° N, 80° W), *Ecology*, *85*(4), 963-978.

653 Froking, S., J. Talbot, and Z. M. Subin (2014), Exploring the relationship between peatland net
654 carbon balance and apparent carbon accumulation rate at century to millennial time scales, *The
655 Holocene*, doi:10.1177/0959683614538078.

656 Glaser, P. H., B. C. S. Hansen, D. I. Siegel, A. S. Reeve, and P. J. Morin (2004), Rates, pathways
657 and drivers for peatland development in the Hudson Bay Lowlands, northern Ontario, Canada,
658 *Journal of Ecology*, *92*(6), 1036-1053, doi:10.1111/j.0022-0477.2004.00931.x.

659 Gorham, E. (1991), Northern Peatlands - Role in the Carbon-Cycle and Probable Responses to
660 Climatic Warming, *Ecological Applications*, *1*(2), 182-195.

661 Gorham, E., J. A. Janssens, and P. H. Glaser (2003), Rates of peat accumulation during the
662 postglacial period in 32 sites from Alaska to Newfoundland, with special emphasis on northern
663 Minnesota, *Canadian Journal of Botany-Revue Canadienne De Botanique*, *81*(5), 429-438.

664 Goulden, M. L., et al. (1998), Sensitivity of boreal forest carbon balance to soil thaw, *Science*,
665 *279*(5348), 214-217.

666 Group, N. W. W. (1988), Wetlands of Canada. Ecological land classification series, no. 24,
667 *Sustainable Development Branch, Environment Canada, Ottawa, Ontario, and Polyscience
668 Publications Inc., Montreal, Quebec, 452.*

669 Hájková, P., A. Grootjans, M. Lamentowicz, E. Rybničková, M. Madaras, V. Opravilová, D.
670 Michaelis, M. Hájek, H. Joosten, and L. Wołejko (2012), How a Sphagnum fuscum-dominated
671 bog changed into a calcareous fen: the unique Holocene history of a Slovak spring-fed mire,
672 *Journal of Quaternary Science*, *27*(3), 233-243, doi:10.1002/jqs.1534.

673 Halsey, L. A., D. H. Vitt, and S. C. Zoltai (1995), Disequilibrium Response of Permafrost in
674 Boreal Continental Western Canada to Climate-Change, *Climatic Change*, *30*(1), 57-73.

675 Harden, J. W., et al. (2012), Field information links permafrost carbon to physical vulnerabilities
676 of thawing, *Geophysical Research Letters*, *39*, doi:L15704
677 10.1029/2012gl051958.

678 Harden, J. W., M. Mack, H. Veldhuis, and S. T. Gower (2002), Fire dynamics and implications
679 for nitrogen cycling in boreal forests, *Journal of Geophysical Research-Atmospheres*, *108*(D3).

680 Hugelius, G., J. Routh, P. Kuhry, and P. Crill (2012), Mapping the degree of decomposition and
681 thaw remobilization potential of soil organic matter in discontinuous permafrost terrain, *Journal*
682 *of Geophysical Research: Biogeosciences*, 117(G2), G02030, doi:10.1029/2011JG001873.

683 Hugelius, G., et al. (2014), Estimated stocks of circumpolar permafrost carbon with quantified
684 uncertainty ranges and identified data gaps, *Biogeosciences*, 11(23), 6573-6593, doi:10.5194/bg-
685 11-6573-2014.

686 Irvine, F., L. Cwynar, J. Vermaire, and A. H. Rees (2012), Midge-inferred temperature
687 reconstructions and vegetation change over the last ~15,000 years from Trout Lake, northern
688 Yukon Territory, eastern Beringia, *Journal of Paleolimnology*, 48(1), 133-146,
689 doi:10.1007/s10933-012-9612-7.

690 Johansson, T., N. Malmer, P. M. Crill, T. Friborg, J. H. Akerman, M. Mastepanov, and T. R.
691 Christensen (2006), Decadal vegetation changes in a northern peatland, greenhouse gas fluxes
692 and net radiative forcing, *Global Change Biology*, 12(12), 2352-2369.

693 Jones, M. C., R. K. Booth, Z. Yu, and P. Ferry (2013), A 2200-Year Record of Permafrost
694 Dynamics and Carbon Cycling in a Collapse-Scar Bog, Interior Alaska, *Ecosystems*, 16(1), 1-19.

695 Jones, M. C., G. Grosse, B. M. Jones, and K. M. Walter Anthony (2012), Peat accumulation in
696 drained thermokarst lake basins in continuous, ice-rich permafrost, northern Seward Peninsula,
697 Alaska, *Journal of Geophysical Research*, 117, G00M07, doi:10.1029/2011JG001766.

698 Jorgenson, M. T., et al. (2013), Reorganization of vegetation, hydrology and soil carbon after
699 permafrost degradation across heterogeneous boreal landscapes, *Environmental Research*
700 *Letters*, 8(3), 035017.

701 Jorgenson, M. T., Y. L. Shur, and E. R. Pullman (2006), Abrupt increase in permafrost
702 degradation in Arctic Alaska, *Geophysical Research Letters*, 33(2), L02503, doi:DOI:
703 10.1029/2005GL024960.

704 Kanevskiy, M., T. Jorgenson, Y. Shur, J. A. O'Donnell, J. W. Harden, Q. Zhuang, and D. Fortier
705 (2014), Cryostratigraphy and Permafrost Evolution in the Lacustrine Lowlands of West-Central
706 Alaska, *Permafrost and Periglacial Processes*, n/a-n/a, doi:10.1002/ppp.1800.

707 Kettles, I. M., S. D. Robinson, D.-F. Bastien, M. Garneau, and G. E. M. Hall (2003), Physical,
708 geochemical, macrofossil and ground penetrating radar information on fourteen permafrost-
709 affected peatlands in the Mackenzie Valley, Northwest Territories, edited by G. S. o. Canada,
710 Geological Survey of Canada Open File 4007, Ottawa.

711 Kuhry, P. (2008), Palsa and peat plateau development in the Hudson Bay Lowlands, Canada:
712 timing, pathways and causes, *Boreas*, 37(2), 316-327, doi:10.1111/j.1502-3885.2007.00022.x.

713 Kuhry, P., and D. H. Vitt (1996), Fossil carbon/nitrogen ratios as a measure of peat
714 decomposition, *Ecology*, 77(1), 271-275.

715 Laine, J., P. Harju, T. Timonen, A. M. Laine, E. S. Tuittila, K. Minkkinen, and H. Vasander
716 (2011), *The Intricate Beauty of Sphagnum Mosses*, 191 pp. pp., University of Helsinki
717 Department of Forest Ecology, Helsinki.

718 Lamarre, A., M. Garneau, and H. Asnong (2012), Holocene paleohydrological reconstruction
719 and carbon accumulation of a permafrost peatland using testate amoeba and macrofossil

720 analyses, Kuujjuarapik, subarctic Quebec, Canada, *Review of Palaeobotany and Palynology*,
721 186, 131-141, doi:10.1016/j.revpalbo.2012.04.009.

722 Larmola, T., S. M. Leppänen, E.-S. Tuittila, M. Aarva, P. Merilä, H. Fritze, and M. Tirola
723 (2014), Methanotrophy induces nitrogen fixation during peatland development, *Proceedings of*
724 *the National Academy of Sciences*, 111(2), 734-739, doi:10.1073/pnas.1314284111.

725 Loisel, J., et al. (2014), A database and synthesis of northern peatland soil properties and
726 Holocene carbon and nitrogen accumulation, *The Holocene*, 24(9), 1028-1042,
727 doi:10.1177/0959683614538073.

728 Luoto, M., and M. Seppälä (2002), Characteristics of earth hummocks (pounus) with and without
729 permafrost in Finnish Lapland, *Geografiska Annaler: Series A, Physical Geography*, 84(2), 127-
730 136, doi:10.1111/1468-0459.00166.

731 Mack, M. C., M. S. Bret-Harte, T. N. Hollingsworth, R. R. Jandt, E. A. G. Schuur, G. R. Shaver,
732 and D. L. Verbyla (2011), Carbon loss from an unprecedented Arctic tundra wildfire, *Nature*,
733 475(7357), 489-492.

734 Mackay, J. R. (1990), Some observations on the growth and deformation of epigenetic,
735 syngenetic and anti-syngenetic ice wedges, *Permafrost and Periglacial Processes*, 1(1), 15-29,
736 doi:10.1002/ppp.3430010104.

737 Mäkilä, M., and M. Moisanen (2007), Holocene lateral expansion and carbon accumulation of
738 Luovuoma, a northern fen in Finnish Lapland, *Boreas*, 36, 198-210,
739 doi:10.1080/03009480600994460.

740 Markkula, I. (2014), Permafrost dynamics structure species compositions of oribatid mite (Acari:
741 Oribatida) communities in sub-Arctic palsa mires, 2014, doi:10.3402/polar.v33.22926.

742 Marushchak, M. E., A. Pitkamaki, H. Koponen, C. Biasi, M. Seppälä, and P. J. Martikainen
743 (2011), Hot spots for nitrous oxide emissions found in different types of permafrost peatlands,
744 *Global Change Biology*, 17(8), 2601-2614, doi:10.1111/j.1365-2486.2011.02442.x.

745 Myers-Smith, I. H., J. W. Harden, M. Wilking, C. C. Fuller, A. D. McGuire, and F. S. Chapin
746 Iii (2008), Wetland succession in a permafrost collapse: interactions between fire and
747 thermokarst, *Biogeosciences*, 5(5), 1273-1286.

748 Nicholson, B. J., L. D. Gignac, and S. E. Bayley (1996), Peatland distribution along a north-
749 south transect in the Mackenzie River Basin in relation to climatic and environmental gradients,
750 *Vegetatio*, 126(2), 119-133.

751 Nicholson, B. J., and D. H. Vitt (1990), The Paleoecology of a Peatland Complex in Continental
752 Western Canada, *Canadian Journal of Botany-Revue Canadienne De Botanique*, 68(1), 121-138.

753 O'Donnell, J. A., M. T. Jorgenson, J. W. Harden, A. D. McGuire, M. Kanevskiy, and K. P.
754 Wickland (2012), The effects of permafrost thaw on soil hydrologic, thermal, and carbon
755 dynamics in an Alaskan Peatland, *Ecosystems*, 15, 213-229, doi:DOI: 10.1007/s10021-011-9504-
756 0.

757 Oksanen, P. O. (2006), Holocene development of the Vaisjeäggi palsa mire, Finnish Lapland,
758 *Boreas*, 35(1), 81-95, doi:10.1111/j.1502-3885.2006.tb01114.x.

- 759 Oksanen, P. O., P. Kuhry, and R. N. Alekseeva (2001), Holocene development of the Rogovaya
760 River peat plateau, European Russian Arctic, *Holocene*, 11(1), 25-40.
- 761 Oksanen, P. O., P. Kuhry, and R. N. Alekseeva (2003), Holocene development and permafrost
762 history of the Usinski Mire, Northeast European Russia, *Geographie Physique Et Quaternaire*,
763 57(2-3), 169-187.
- 764 Oksanen, P. O., and M. Väiliranta (2006), Palsa mires in a changing climate, *Suo*, 57(2), 33-43.
- 765 Olson, D. M., et al. (2001), Terrestrial Ecoregions of the World: A New Map of Life on Earth: A
766 new global map of terrestrial ecoregions provides an innovative tool for conserving biodiversity,
767 *BioScience*, 51(11), 933-938, doi:10.1641/0006-3568(2001)051[0933:teotwa]2.0.co;2.
- 768 Parducci, L., M. Väiliranta, J. S. Salonen, T. Ronkainen, I. Matetovici, S. L. Fontana, T. Eskola,
769 P. Sarala, and Y. Suyama (2014), Proxy comparison in ancient peat sediments: pollen,
770 macrofossil and plant DNA, *Philosophical Transactions of the Royal Society of London B:*
771 *Biological Sciences*, 370(1660).
- 772 Payette, S., A. Delwaide, M. Caccianiga, and M. Beauchemin (2004), Accelerated thawing of
773 subarctic peatland permafrost over the last 50 years, *Geophysical Research Letters*, 31(18),
774 L18208, doi:DOI:10.1029/2004GL020358.
- 775 Quinton, W. L., M. Hayashi, and A. Pietroniro (2003), Connectivity and storage functions of
776 channel fens and flat bogs in northern basins, *Hydrological Processes*, 17(18), 3665-3684.
- 777 Reimer, P. J., et al. (2013), *IntCal13 and Marine13 Radiocarbon Age Calibration Curves 0–*
778 *50,000 Years cal BP*.
- 779 Repo, M. E., S. Susiluoto, S. E. Lind, S. Jokinen, V. Elsakov, C. Biasi, T. Virtanen, and P. J.
780 Martikainen (2009), Large N₂O emissions from cryoturbated peat soil in tundra, *Nature Geosci*,
781 2(3), 189-192, doi:http://www.nature.com/ngeo/journal/v2/n3/supinfo/ngeo434_S1.html.
- 782 Robinson, S. D. (2006), Carbon accumulation in peatlands, southwestern Northwest Territories,
783 Canada, *Canadian Journal of Soil Science*, 86(2), 305-319.
- 784 Robinson, S. D., and T. R. Moore (2000), The influence of permafrost and fire upon carbon
785 accumulation in high boreal peatlands, Northwest Territories, Canada, *Arctic Antarctic and*
786 *Alpine Research*, 32(2), 155-166.
- 787 Ronkainen, T., E. L. McClymont, E. S. Tuittila, and M. Väiliranta (2014), Plant macrofossil and
788 biomarker evidence of fen–bog transition and associated changes in vegetation in two Finnish
789 peatlands, *The Holocene*, 24(7), 828-841, doi:DOI: 10.1177/0959683614530442.
- 790 Ronkainen, T., M. Valiranta, E. L. McClymont, C. Biasi, J. S. Salonen, S. L. Fontana, and E. S.
791 Tuittila (2015), A combined biogeochemical and palaeobotanical approach to study permafrost
792 environments and past dynamics, *Journal of Quaternary Science*, *in press*.
- 793 Routh, J., G. Hugelius, P. Kuhry, T. Filley, P. Kaislahti Tillman, M. Becher, and P. Crill (2014),
794 Multi-proxy study of soil organic matter dynamics in permafrost peat deposits reveal
795 vulnerability to climate change in the European Russian Arctic, *Chemical Geology*, 368(0), 104-
796 117, doi:http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.chemgeo.2013.12.022.
- 797 Sannel, A. B. K., and P. Kuhry (2008), Long-term stability of permafrost in subarctic peat
798 plateau, west-central Canada, *The Holocene*, 18(4), 589-601.

799 Sannel, A. B. K., and P. Kuhry (2009), Holocene peat growth and decay dynamics in sub-arctic
800 peat plateaus, west-central Canada, *Boreas*, 38(1), 13-24, doi:10.1111/j.1502-
801 3885.2008.00048.x.

802 Schuur, E. A. G., J. G. Vogel, K. G. Crummer, H. Lee, J. O. Sickman, and T. E. Osterkamp
803 (2009), The effect of permafrost thaw on old carbon release and net carbon exchange from
804 tundra, *Nature*, 459, 556 - 559, doi:DOI: 10.1038/nature08031.

805 Seppälä, M. (1994), Snow depth controls palsa growth, *Permafrost and Periglacial Processes*,
806 5(4), 283-288, doi:10.1002/ppp.3430050407.

807 Seppälä, M. (1998), New permafrost formed in peat hummocks (pounus), Finnish Lapland,
808 *Permafrost and Periglacial Processes*, 9(4), 367-373.

809 Seppälä, M. (2011), Synthesis of studies of palsa formation underlining the importance of local
810 environmental and physical characteristics, *Quaternary Research*, 75(2), 366-370,
811 doi:http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.yqres.2010.09.007.

812 Shaver, G. R., and F. S. Chapin (1991), Production: Biomass Relationships and Element Cycling
813 in Contrasting Arctic Vegetation Types, *Ecological Monographs*, 61(1), 1-31,
814 doi:10.2307/1942997.

815 Sheng, Y. W., L. C. Smith, G. M. MacDonald, K. V. Kremenetski, K. E. Frey, A. A. Velichko,
816 M. Lee, D. W. Beilman, and P. Dubinin (2004), A high-resolution GIS-based inventory of the
817 west Siberian peat carbon pool, *Global Biogeochemical Cycles*, 18(3).

818 Swindles, G. T., et al. (2015), Evaluating the use of testate amoebae for palaeohydrological
819 reconstruction in permafrost peatlands, *Palaeogeography, Palaeoclimatology, Palaeoecology*,
820 424(0), 111-122, doi:http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.palaeo.2015.02.004.

821 Tarnocai, C. (2006), The effect of climate change on carbon in Canadian peatlands, *Global and*
822 *Planetary Change*, 53(4), 222-232.

823 Tarnocai, C., and S. Zoltai (1988), Wetlands of Arctic Canada, in *Wetlands of Canada*, edited by
824 N. W. W. Group, pp. 28-53, Sustainable Development Branch, Environment Canada, Ottawa.

825 Team, R. D. C. (2008), R: A language and environment for statistical computing, edited, R
826 Foundation for Statistical Computing, Vienna, Austria.

827 Treat, C. C., W. M. Wollheim, R. K. Varner, A. S. Grandy, J. Talbot, and S. Frohling (2014),
828 Temperature and peat type control CO₂ and CH₄ production in Alaskan permafrost peats,
829 *Global Change Biology*, 20(8), 2674–2686, doi:10.1111/gcb.12572.

830 Tuittila, E.-S., S. Juutinen, S. Frohling, M. Väiliranta, A. M. Laine, A. Miettinen, M.-L. Seväkivi,
831 A. Quillet, and P. Merilä (2013), Wetland chronosequence as a model of peatland development:
832 Vegetation succession, peat and carbon accumulation, *The Holocene*, 23(1), 25-35,
833 doi:10.1177/0959683612450197.

834 Turetsky, M. R. (2004), Decomposition and organic matter quality in continental peatlands: The
835 ghost of permafrost past, *Ecosystems*, 7(7), 740-750.

836 Turetsky, M. R., E. S. Kane, J. W. Harden, R. D. Ottmar, K. L. Manies, E. Hoy, and E. S.
837 Kasischke (2011), Recent acceleration of biomass burning and carbon losses in Alaskan forests
838 and peatlands, *Nature Geoscience*, 4(1), 27-31, doi:10.1038/ngeo1027.

839 Turetsky, M. R., R. K. Wieder, and D. H. Vitt (2002), Boreal peatland C fluxes under varying
840 permafrost regimes, *Soil Biology & Biochemistry*, 34(7), 907-912.

841 Turetsky, M. R., R. K. Wieder, D. H. Vitt, R. J. Evans, and K. D. Scott (2007), The
842 disappearance of relict permafrost in boreal north America: Effects on peatland carbon storage
843 and fluxes, *Global Change Biology*, 13(9), 1922-1934.

844 Van Bellen, S., M. Garneau, A. A. Ali, A. Lamarre, É. C. Robert, G. Magnan, H. Asnong, and S.
845 Pratte (2013), Poor fen succession over ombrotrophic peat related to late Holocene increased
846 surface wetness in subarctic Quebec, Canada, *Journal of Quaternary Science*, 28(8), 748-760,
847 doi:10.1002/jqs.2670.

848 Vardy, S. R., B. G. Warner, and R. Aravena (1997), Holocene climate effects on the
849 development of a peatland on the Tuktoyaktuk Peninsula, northwest Territories, *Quaternary*
850 *Research*, 47(1), 90-104.

851 Vardy, S. R., B. G. Warner, J. Turunen, and R. Aravena (2000), Carbon accumulation in
852 permafrost peatlands in the Northwest Territories and Nunavut, Canada, *Holocene*, 10(2), 273-
853 280.

854 Vile, M., et al. (2014), N₂-fixation by methanotrophs sustains carbon and nitrogen accumulation
855 in pristine peatlands, *Biogeochemistry*, 121(2), 317-328, doi:10.1007/s10533-014-0019-6.

856 Vitousek, P. (1982), Nutrient Cycling and Nutrient Use Efficiency, *The American Naturalist*,
857 119(4), 553-572, doi:10.2307/2461143.

858 Vitt, D. H. (2006), Function Characteristics and Indicators of Boreal Peatlands, in *Boreal*
859 *Peatland Ecosystems*, edited by R. K. Wieder and D. H. Vitt, pp. 9-24, Springer-Verlag Berlin
860 Heidelberg, New York

861 Vitt, D. H., L. A. Halsey, I. E. Bauer, and C. Campbell (2000), Spatial and temporal trends in
862 carbon storage of peatlands of continental western Canada through the Holocene, *Canadian*
863 *Journal of Earth Sciences*, 37(5), 683-693.

864 Walter Anthony, K. M., et al. (2014), A shift of thermokarst lakes from carbon sources to sinks
865 during the Holocene epoch, *Nature*, 511(7510), 452-456, doi:10.1038/nature13560
866 <http://www.nature.com/nature/journal/v511/n7510/abs/nature13560.html> - supplementary-
867 information.

868 Wang, M., T. R. Moore, J. Talbot, and J. L. Riley (2015), The stoichiometry of carbon and
869 nutrients in peat formation, *Global Biogeochemical Cycles*, 2014GB005000,
870 doi:10.1002/2014GB005000.

871 Washburn, A. L. (1979), *Geocryology: a Survey of Periglacial Processes and Environments*,
872 John Wiley, New York.

873 Yu, Z., D. W. Beilman, and M. C. Jones (2009), Sensitivity of northern peatland carbon
874 dynamics to Holocene climate change, in *Northern Peatlands and Carbon Cycle*, edited by A.
875 Baird, American Geophysical Union.

876 Yu, Z., J. Loisel, M. R. Turetsky, S. Cai, Y. Zhao, S. Frohking, G. M. MacDonald, and J. L.
877 Bubier (2013), Evidence for elevated emissions from high-latitude wetlands contributing to high

878 atmospheric CH₄ concentration in the early Holocene, *Global Biogeochemical Cycles*, 27(1),
879 131-140, doi:10.1002/gbc.20025.

880 Yu, Z., D. H. Vitt, and R. K. Wieder (2014), Continental fens in western Canada as effective
881 carbon sinks during the Holocene, *The Holocene*, doi:10.1177/0959683614538075.

882 Zoltai, S. C. (1993), Cyclic Development of Permafrost in the Peatlands of Northwestern
883 Alberta, Canada, *Arctic and Alpine Research*, 25(3), 240-246.

884 Zoltai, S. C. (1995), Permafrost Distribution in Peatlands of West-Central Canada During the
885 Holocene Warm Period 6000 Years Bp, *Geographie Physique Et Quaternaire*, 49(1), 45-54.

886 Zoltai, S. C., and J. D. Johnson (1985), Development of a Treed Bog Island in a Minerotrophic
887 Fen, *Canadian Journal of Botany-Revue Canadienne De Botanique*, 63(6), 1076-1085.

888 Zoltai, S. C., and C. Tarnocai (1975), Perennially Frozen Peatlands in Western Arctic and
889 Subarctic of Canada, *Canadian Journal of Earth Sciences*, 12(1), 28-43.

890 Zoltai, S. C., C. Tarnocai, G. F. Mills, and H. Veldhuis (1988), Wetlands of Subarctic Canada, in
891 *Wetlands of Canada*, edited by N. W. W. Group and C. C. o. E. L. Classification, pp. 54-96,
892 Polyscience Publication Inc., Montreal.

893 Zoltai, S. C., and D. H. Vitt (1995), Canadian Wetlands - Environmental Gradients and
894 Classification, *Vegetatio*, 118(1-2), 131-137.

895

896 Table 1. Mean peat properties, standard deviation (sd), and number of samples (n) among vegetation types, including C/N ratio,
 897 carbon (%C), nitrogen (%N), organic matter (%OM), carbon content in organic matter (%) and bulk density. Vegetation types were
 898 determined from the dominant plant macrofossil (>30%). Different superscript letters indicate significantly different means among
 899 groups ($P < 0.05$).

| Vegetation type | C/N ratio | | | %C | | | %N | | | % OM | | | Carbon content in organic matter (%) | | | Bulk density (g cm ⁻³) | | |
|--------------------------|-------------------|----|------|--------------------|------|------|----------------------|------|------|-----------------------|------|------|--------------------------------------|------|-----|------------------------------------|-------|--------|
| | mean | sd | n | mean | sd | n | mean | sd | n | mean | sd | n | mean | sd | n | mean | sd | n |
| Amorphous | 30 ^c | 15 | 118 | 36.5 ^d | 10.7 | 119 | 1.47 ^{bc} | 0.73 | 118 | 86.2 ^e | 9.4 | 258 | 59.4 | 9.5 | 20 | 0.153 | 0.075 | 382 |
| Brown Moss | 40 ^b | 19 | 106 | 44.1 ^{ab} | 8.1 | 145 | 1.32 ^{cd} | 0.64 | 106 | 91.6 ^c | 4.9 | 979 | 50.1 | 3.5 | 79 | 0.111 | 0.046 | 1008 |
| Feather Moss | 36 ^{abc} | 15 | 3 | 46.8 ^{ab} | 1.8 | 6 | 1.43 ^{abcd} | 0.47 | 3 | 92.5 ^{abcde} | 11.5 | 6 | 48.6 | 3.5 | 5 | 0.160 | 0.060 | 6 |
| Herbaceous | 29 ^c | 16 | 323 | 44.5 ^b | 8.5 | 406 | 1.77 ^a | 0.71 | 406 | 90.6 ^d | 6.1 | 2905 | 51.4 | 4.2 | 218 | 0.123 | 0.051 | 3033 |
| Lichen | 62 ^a | 22 | 13 | 47.3 ^{ab} | 4.9 | 13 | 0.89 ^{de} | 0.47 | 13 | 94.0 ^{abcde} | 4.2 | 2 | 53.0 | | 1 | 0.062 | 0.045 | 13 |
| Ligneous | 32 ^{bc} | 16 | 180 | 42.1 ^b | 8.6 | 204 | 1.47 ^{bc} | 0.55 | 180 | 93.2 ^b | 6.0 | 972 | 49.7 | 3.9 | 90 | 0.124 | 0.070 | 1060 |
| Limnic | 31 ^c | 21 | 20 | 39.4 ^c | 8.2 | 25 | 1.76 ^{ab} | 0.88 | 20 | 76.5 ^f | 6.7 | 99 | 57.1 | 11.1 | 2 | 0.168 | 0.100 | 121 |
| <i>Sphagnum</i> * | 62 ^a | 28 | 612 | 45.4 ^a | 4.6 | 691 | 0.88 ^{de} | 0.40 | 612 | 95.7 ^a | 4.3 | 3243 | 47.8 | 3.9 | 276 | 0.083 | 0.045 | 3664 |
| All samples | 41 | 26 | 2778 | 45.6 | 6.3 | 3012 | 1.48 | 0.72 | 2779 | 92.4 | 6.4 | 9161 | 49.5 | 5.1 | 739 | 0.110 | 0.063 | 11,029 |
| Chi ² (df =7) | 12,994 | | | 7465 | | | 3385 | | | 2818 | | | 12 | | | 0 | | |
| <i>P</i> | < 0.0001 | | | < 0.0001 | | | < 0.0001 | | | < 0.0001 | | | 0.11 | | | 1 | | |

900 * Means for different *Sphagnum* groups (hummock, hollow, lawn) can be found in Table S2.

901 Table 2. Mean peat properties, standard deviation (sd), and number of samples (n) among environmental classifications, including
 902 C/N ratio, carbon (%C), nitrogen (%N), organic matter (% OM), and bulk density for different environmental classes.
 903 Environmental classification was determined from the plant macrofossil records. Different superscript letters indicate significantly
 904 different means among groups ($P < 0.05$).

| Environmental class | C/N ratio | | | %C | | | %N | | | % OM | | | Bulk density (g cm ⁻³) | | |
|---------------------------|-------------------|----|------|--------------------|------|------|---------------------|------|------|--------------------|-----|------|------------------------------------|-------|------|
| | mean | sd | n | mean | sd | n | mean | sd | n | mean | sd | n | mean | sd | n |
| Open water | 18 ^{abc} | 3 | 2 | 34.5 ^{ab} | 10.1 | 2 | 2.0 ^{abcd} | 0.90 | 2 | 74.0 ^d | 6.2 | 8 | 0.243 | 0.124 | 11 |
| Fen | 29 ^c | 15 | 1082 | 46.5 ^a | 5.9 | 1217 | 1.89 ^a | 0.66 | 1076 | 91.8 ^{bc} | 6.8 | 2603 | 0.120 | 0.058 | 3369 |
| Bog | 37 ^c | 19 | 733 | 47.0 ^a | 4.2 | 783 | 1.55 ^b | 0.66 | 732 | 96.6 ^a | 3.7 | 1825 | 0.094 | 0.050 | 2482 |
| Permafrost: boreal | 67 ^a | 33 | 576 | 46.7 ^a | 5.3 | 594 | 0.88 ^{cd} | 0.45 | 576 | 92.4 ^b | 7.9 | 348 | 0.109 | 0.079 | 913 |
| Permafrost: tundra | 34 ^{bc} | 18 | 273 | 39.5 ^b | 9.0 | 290 | 1.35 ^c | 0.55 | 273 | 91.3 ^c | 8.3 | 390 | 0.165 | 0.214 | 384 |
| Permafrost thaw: boreal | 53 ^b | 23 | 211 | 42.0 ^b | 6.3 | 219 | 0.93 ^d | 0.40 | 212 | 92.5 ^b | 5.2 | 196 | 0.089 | 0.072 | 422 |
| Chi ² (df = 5) | 192 | | | 154 | | | 105 | | | 208 | | | 0 | | |

905

906

907 Figure 1. The locations of sites included in this synthesis of peat properties across the permafrost
908 zones [Brown *et al.*, 1998, revised 2001]. Sites included in the analysis of peat properties
909 (PeatProp, circles), carbon accumulation (C acc.; squares), peat properties and carbon
910 accumulation (PP + C acc.; triangles), or ecosystem transitions (black crosses). Sites included in
911 previous analysis by Loisel *et al.* [2014] are indicated by an interior black dot; original sites are
912 indicated within the legend (orig.). Labels indicate the site number and correspond with
913 additional site information in Table S1.

914
915 Figure 2. Schematic diagrams showing relationships between peatland classes used in this study
916 and macrofossil assemblages, taxonomic examples, and other physical indicators used to interpret
917 peatland classes for boreal zone ecosystems (A) and tundra zone ecosystems (B).

918 ¹ Open water peatland classes included ponds, pools, marshes, swamps and first-generation thermokarst lakes formed
919 in upland, un-glaciated terrain that later accumulate sufficient organic matter to meet the peatland criteria (> 30cm)
920 [e.g. Jones *et al.*, 2012; Walter Anthony *et al.*, 2014].

921 ² Fen in the boreal zone included minerotrophic rich fens, mesotrophic fens, and oligotrophic poor fens [Group,
922 1988].

923 ³ Permafrost: boreal included permafrost bogs, palsas, peat plateaus, aapa mires with permafrost, and polygonal peat
924 plateaus within the boreal zone [Camill *et al.*, 2009; Group, 1988; Oksanen and Väiliranta, 2006; Sannel and Kuhry,
925 2009; Zoltai and Tarnocai, 1975].

926 ⁴ Permafrost thaw included collapse scar bogs, collapse scar fens, and thaw ponds within peatland complexes [Camill
927 *et al.*, 2009; Oksanen and Väiliranta, 2006; Robinson and Moore, 2000; Zoltai, 1993] but excludes first-generation
928 thermokarst lakes formed in upland, un-glaciated terrain.

929 ⁵ Fens in the tundra zone included rich fens, mesotrophic fens and poor fens and are well described by Tarnocai and
930 Zoltai [1988]. Here, tundra fens include fens without permafrost in the organic soil. However, in the continuous
931 permafrost zone, permafrost was likely present in the underlying mineral soils.

932 ⁶ Permafrost tundra includes high-center polygons, low-center polygons, tundra with more than 30 cm of organic
933 soil, and polygonal peat plateaus. In polygons, the plant macrofossil assemblages reflect vegetation differences that
934 are generally controlled by microtopography and relative water table position [de Klerk *et al.*, 2011; Ellis and
935 Rochefort, 2004; Nicholson *et al.*, 1996; Vardy *et al.*, 1997]. Microtopography and polygonal patterns develop over
936 many centuries with ice wedge and permafrost aggradation [Mackay, 1990]. In this case, permafrost aggradation
937 refers to the occurrence of permafrost within the organic soil rather than underlying mineral soil. Permafrost thaw in

938 polygons results in a deepening of wedges and troughs, which resemble the earlier sedge meadow communities
939 [Jorgenson *et al.*, 2006] but may contain more inter-mixed mineral soil [de Klerk *et al.*, 2011].

940
941 Figure 3. The relative composition of vegetation types among the environmental classifications.
942 The order of bars from left to right follows the order of the legend. The vegetation type of
943 samples were classified using the dominant species, which generally represented > 30% of the
944 sample count.

945
946 Figure 4. The relative frequency of transitions among environmental classifications and
947 frequency of environmental class occurrence based on macrofossil records in peat cores within
948 the permafrost region. The thickness of the arrows is proportional to the frequency of transitions
949 between environmental classes. The relative frequency of the environmental classes was
950 determined relative to the total number of cores (fens, bogs) and number of cores in each region
951 (boreal, tundra) and is labeled beneath each environmental class (number of cores in
952 environmental class / number of cores per region). The percentage of cores that transitioned
953 among environmental classes was considered relative to the number of cores in each initial
954 environmental class. Shading represents permafrost aggradation.

955
956 Figure 5. Mean values of (a) C/N ratio and (b) nitrogen content (% dry mass) for each
957 environmental classification during the Holocene for non-permafrost and permafrost (PF) sites
958 for the past 1000 cal. y BP (< 1000) and earlier time periods (>1000). Error bars represent
959 standard error. Open water is excluded due to insufficient data with associated time periods
960 (n=0).

961
962 Figure 6. Median long-term apparent rate of C accumulation (LARCA) among a) environmental
963 classes and b) vegetation types during the Holocene for the past 1000 years (< 1000) and before
964 (> 1000). Error bars represent first and third quantiles. PF = permafrost. Rates met the most
965 stringent dating criteria of one or more dates per thousand years and included 80 cores and 5754

966 measurements. Feathermoss and lichen are not shown because of the limited number of samples
967 that met the dating criteria (≤ 3 samples among all cores).

968











