

**THE HISSING SECTARIAN SNAKE:
SECTARIANISM AND THE MAKING OF STATE AND
NATION IN MODERN IRAQ**

Submitted by **Khalil Osman** to the University of Exeter as a thesis for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy in Politics in September 2012

This thesis is available for Library use on the understanding that it is copyright material and that no quotation from the thesis may be published without proper acknowledgement.

I certify that all material in this thesis which is not my own work has been identified and that no material has previously been submitted and approved for the award of a degree by this or any other University.

Signature:*Khalil Osman*26/09/2012.....

To the memory of my mother, Hajjah Hana, a devoted wife, a loving mother and a wonderful grandmother, whose legacy continues to inspire

ABSTRACT

This thesis addresses the relationship between sectarianism and state-making and nation-building in Iraq. It argues that sectarianism has been an enduring feature of the state-making trajectory in Iraq due to the failure of the modern nation-state to resolve inherent tensions between primordial sectarian identities and concepts of unified statehood and uniform citizenry. After a theoretical excursus that recasts the notion of primordial identity as a socially constructed reality, I set out to explain the persistence of primordial sectarian affiliations in Iraq since the establishment of the modern nation-state in 1921. Looking at the primordial past showed that Sunni-Shi'ite interactions before the modern nation-state cultivated repositories of divergent collective memories and shaped dynamics of inclusion and exclusion favorable to the Sunni Arabs following the creation of Iraq. Drawing on primary and secondary sources and field interviews, this study proceeds to trace the accentuation of primordial sectarian solidarities despite the adoption of homogenizing policies in a deeply divided society along ethno-sectarian lines. It found that the uneven sectarian composition of the ruling elites nurtured feelings of political exclusion among marginalized sectarian groups, the Shi'ites before 2003 and the Sunnis in the post-2003 period, which hardened sectarian identities. The injection of hegemonic communal discourses into the educational curriculum was found to have provoked masked forms of resistance that contributed to the sharpening of sectarian consciousness. Hegemonic communal narratives embedded in the curriculum not only undermined the homogenizing utility of education but also implicated education in the accentuation of primordial sectarian identities. The study also found that, by camouflaging anti-Shi'ite sectarianism, the anti-Persian streak in the nation-state's Pan-Arab ideology undermined Iraq's national integration project. It explains that the slide from a totalizing Pan-Arab ideology in the pre-2003 period toward the atomistic impulse of the federalist debate in the post-2003 period is symptomatic of the ghettoization of identity in Iraq. This investigation of the interaction between primordial sectarian attachments and the trajectory of the making of the Iraqi nation-state is ensconced in the project of expanding the range and scope of social scientific applications of the nation-building and primordialism lines of analysis.

LIST OF CONTENTS

ABSTRACT	iii
LIST OF CONTENTS	iv
LIST OF TABLES	vii
LIST OF FIGURES	viii
LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS	ix
ACKNOWLEDGMENTS	x

INTRODUCTION 1

I. Purpose of Study	2
II. Case Study as a Comparative Strategy	3
III. In Search of a Method	8
IV. Sectarianism and Its Discontents: Approaches to the Study of Sectarianism in Iraq	12
a. Understating Sectarianism	14
b. Rethinking Sectarianism	16
c. Historical Approaches	22
d. Political Geographic Approaches	29
e. The Archeology of Repression	30
f. The Post-Saddam Order	32
V. Significance and Organization of the Study	37

CHAPTER 1

A Theoretical Excursus:

State-Making, Nation-Building and the Sectarian Problematique 43

1.1. State of Theory of the Making of Nation and State	44
1.1.1. Historical-Sociological Approach	46
1.1.2. Ascendant Liberal Modernism	48
1.1.3. Marxist and Neo-Marxist Perspectives	51
1.1.4. The Cybernetic Approach	57
1.1.5. Structural Functionalism	62
1.1.6. Revisionist Modernism	65
1.1.6.1. The Politics of Order	66
1.1.6.2. The Dialectics of Tradition and Modernity	68
1.1.6.3. Toward a Critique of Revisionist Modernism	71
1.1.7. Redeeming the Primordial	73
1.2. Sectarianism and the Politics of Identity in the Arab East	82
1.3. Conclusion: Primordialism and the Salience of Sectarian Identity in Iraq	99

CHAPTER 2

The Legacy of History: Nation-Building, Marginalization and Ascendance of Primordial Sectarianism 102

2.1. The Sunni-Shi'ite Chasm	104
2.2. Demons of Sectarian Strife	110
2.3. Clerics and Tribes	113
2.4. Anti-Colonialist Impetus for Unity	116
2.5. Colonial Prelude to Nationhood	119
2.6. Independent Iraq under the Monarchy	126
2.7. The First Republican Decade: The Qassim and 'Arif Brothers' Regimes	131
2.8. Ba'ath Party Rule: From Radical Secularism to Rabid Sectarianism	141
2.8.1. Shi'ite Activism and State Tyranny	142
2.8.2. Shattered Dreams, Nightmares and Schizoid Collective Memory: The 1991 Uprising	147
2.8.3. Antinomies of Assertive Religiosity	151
2.8.4. Identity Politics and the Exiled Opposition	159
2.9. Conclusion: The Quandaries of National Integration	163

CHAPTER 3

Elite Makeup and the Politics of Stratification 168

3.1. From the Monarchy to the Downfall of Saddam Hussein	170
3.1.1. Sectarian Hegemony and Executive Leadership	172
3.1.1.1. The Monarchist Period	172
3.1.1.2. The First Republican Decade	174
3.1.1.3. The Ba'ath Party Regime	180
3.1.1.4. Dictatorship and the Awakening of Primordial Identities	184
3.2. 'Regime Change' and the Institutionalization of Ethno-Sectarianism	187
3.2.1. The de-Ba'athification Purgatory	188
3.2.1.1. The Genesis and Early Development of de-Ba'athification	189
3.2.1.2. Root-and Branch de-Ba'athification	194
3.2.1.3. Imbalanced Softening of de-Ba'athification	196
3.2.1.4. From de-Ba'athification to Accountability and Justice	199
3.2.2. The Apportionment Balancing Act: Ethno-Sectarian Quotas	201
3.2.2.1. In Search of Governance Arrangement	202
3.2.2.2. The Governing Council and the Inauguration of Ethno-Sectarian Quotas	204
3.2.2.3. Identity Politics at the Ballot Box	210
3.2.2.4. Communal Apportionment of Executive Power	223
3.3. Conclusion: The Reproduction of Sectarian Power Inequality	235

CHAPTER 4

Education, Resistance and the Reproduction of Primordial Sectarian Identity 239

4.1. The Formative Years of Curriculum Development in Iraq	240
4.2. Ideological Pedagogy and Sectarianism	243
4.3. Sectarian Narratives and Curriculum Development	252
4.4. The Paradoxes of the Search for Pluralist Education	268
4.5. Conclusion: Sectarian Primordial Identity and the Art of Cultural Resistance	285

CHAPTER 5

Contending Visions of Collective Identity	292
5.1. Persian Ghosts: The Shi'ite 'Other' in Pan-Arab Thought	295
5.2. Differential Citizenship, Deportation and Collective Victimization	309
5.3. Venting Steam: Shi'ite Victimhood and the Discourse of Rage	320
5.4. Federalism and Fractured National Identity	329
5.5. Conclusion: The Dialectics of Unity and Fragmentation	343
CONCLUSION	347
6.1. The Social Construction of Primordial Sectarianism in Iraq	347
6.2. Towards Rethinking the Modern State in the Arab East	356
6.2.1. The State – Society Fault Line	357
6.2.2. The State – Religion/Sect Fault Line	359
6.2.3. The National Identity – Primordial Identity Fault Line	361
6.3. The Way Forward: Research Limitations and Potential Future Directions	362
APPENDIX I The Najaf Charter of 1935	365
APPENDIX II Shaykh Muhammad Ridha al-Shabibi's Memorandum of 1965	368
APPENDIX III The Text of the Fatwa Issued by Ayatollah Abu al-Qassim al-Kho'i on March 5, 1991	374
APPENDIX IV The Text of the Fatwa Issued by Ayatollah Abu al-Qassim al-Kho'i on March 7, 1991	376
APPENDIX V Declaration of the Shia of Iraq	378
APPENDIX VI Full Text of Erbil Agreement	396
APPENDIX VII Procedures for Lifting the Ban on Some Messrs	407
GLOSSARY	408
BIBLIOGRAPHY	411

LIST OF TABLES

Table 1	Election Results in the Transitional National Assembly Elections, January 2005	214
Table 2	Election Results in the Parliamentary Elections, December 2005	216
Table 3	Election Results in the Parliamentary Elections, March 2010	221
Table 4	Point-Score System Used to Allocate Seats in Maliki's Second Cabinet	232

LIST OF FIGURES

Figure 1	Percentages of Ethnic and Denominational Background of Cabinet Members under the Monarchy (1920-1958)	173
Figure 2	Percentages of Ethnic and Denominational Background of Cabinet Members under General Qassim's Rule (1958-1963)	176
Figure 3	Percentages of Ethnic and Denominational Background of Cabinet Members under the 'Arif Brothers' Regime (1963-1968)	178
Figure 4	Percentages of Ethnic and Denominational Background of Cabinet Members under the Ba'ath Party Regime (1968-2003)	183
Figure 5	Percentages of Ethnic and Denominational Background of the Iraqi Governing Council Members (July 13, 2003 – June 30, 2004)	208
Figure 6	Ethnic and Denominational Background of the Iraqi Interim Cabinet Headed by Ayad 'Allawi	224
Figure 7	Ethnic and Denominational Background of the Ja'afari Cabinet	226
Figure 8	Percentages of Ethnic and Denominational Background of the Maliki Cabinet of 2006	229
Figure 9	Ethnic and Denominational Background of the Maliki Cabinet of 2010 before and after the Drawdown of July 2011	233

LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

AJC	Accountability and Justice Commission
AMSI	Association of Muslim Scholars in Iraq
CPA	Coalition Provisional Authority
DPWG	Democratic Principles Working Group
HNCDB	Higher National Commission for de-Ba ^c athification
IAF	Iraqi Accordance Front
ICP	Iraqi Communist Party
IDC	Iraqi de-Ba ^c athification Council
IFND	Iraqi Front for National Dialogue
IGC	Iraqi Governing Council
IHEC	Independent High Electoral Commission
IIA	Iraqi Interim Authority
IIP	Iraqi Islamic Party
INA	Iraqi National Alliance
INAM	Iraqi National Accord Movement
INC	Iraqi National Congress
IRDC	Iraq Reconstruction and Development Council
ISCI	Islamic Supreme Council of Iraq
IUC	Iraq Unity Coalition
KA	Kurdistan Alliance
KDP	Kurdistan Democratic Party
NA	National Alliance
NCHP	National Council for Higher Policies
ORHA	Office of Reconstruction and Humanitarian Assistance
POW	Prisoner of War
PUK	Patriotic Union of Kurdistan
RCC	Revolutionary Command Council
RL	Regional Leadership of the Arab Ba ^c ath Socialist Party
SCIRI	Supreme Council for Islamic Revolution in Iraq
SLC	State of Law Coalition
TAL	Transitional Administrative Law
TNA	Transitional National Assembly
UIA	United Iraqi Alliance

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

This study has had a long period of gestation. In conducting the research, I benefitted in innumerable ways from my years of work on and in Iraq, which provided me with a wide network of contacts and a wealth of insider information. The study has also benefitted from my lifelong interest in Islamic and Middle Eastern history and politics. I am especially grateful to the many interviewees who were willing to share with me their time, thoughts and knowledge. Due to the sensitivity of the issues dealt with, many interlocutors have understandably requested that their anonymity be preserved. While their identity remains hidden, the usefulness of the information they revealed and the insights they shared can by no means be concealed. Special thanks go to my lead supervisor Larbi Sadiki and my second supervisor John Heathershaw, both of who suggested useful sources and helped me along the way refine my approach, argument, and ideas and make them more nuanced. I am also indebted to my internal and external examiners Michael Dumper and Hilal Khashan for their insightful feedback and thoughtful comments which helped sharpen my ideas and analysis. It goes without saying, as I inscribe my acknowledgement to their contributions, that all errors and mistakes, as well as the views expressed in the following chapters, are solely mine.

For many years now, I have been leading what I would call a ‘postmodern nomadic’ lifestyle. My work engagements which require me to be constantly on the move in difficult and, sometimes, dangerous parts of the world preclude easy access to library material. I have benefitted from the support of many friends and family members who helped me surmount this gigantic inconvenience by obtaining loads of digital copies of books, articles and other material and having them sent to me by email. In this regard, I owe special thanks to my nephew Bilal Hadwan, whose outstanding research skills have been essential in locating some rare and not-easy-to-find sources for this study. Over the past few years, Bilal has always been prompt and highly efficient in meeting a steady stream of requests to obtain material.

Last, but not least, I owe an enormous debt to my family who has shown exemplary patience as I worked on this thesis. This study could not have been possible without their encouragement, support, and willingness to sacrifice weekends and holidays. Their unwavering belief in my ability to complete this study has given me the necessary strength, energy and determination to stay the course and see it to completion.