**An investigation into pedagogical knowledge and teaching practices of reading among primary school teachers in Botswana.**

Submitted by

**Rosinah Thando Mokotedi**

to the University of Exeter as a thesis for the degree of
Doctor of Education in TESOL

(December, 2012)

This thesis is available for library on the understanding that it is copyright material and that no quotation from the thesis may be published without proper acknowledgment.

I certify that all the material in this thesis which is not my own work has been identified and that no material is included for which a degree has previously been conferred upon me.

Signature: R. T. Mokotedi

**Abstract**

The thesis focuses on teachers' pedagogical subject knowledge and teaching of reading in English as a second language (L2) in Botswana Primary Schools. The participants consisted of ten teachers from four lower primary classrooms setting. To carry out the research, I adopted the qualitative methodology. The three modes of inquiry used in the study are semi-structured interviews, classroom observations and stimulated recall interviews. All the data were transcribed, coded and analysed qualitatively. For organisation purposes, the NVivo 8 software package was used in handling the interview data gathered from the study.

The findings revealed that teachers' classroom practices were not always consistent with their pedagogical subject knowledge. They demonstrated having knowledge on how reading ought to be taught and it was observed that in most cases, their beliefs were not put into their classroom practices. This research highlighted the importance of the phonics instructions in teaching early reading, which most of the teachers' practices revealed that they lack confidence in teaching. Therefore, this seems to have an impact on the learners in lower classes because this level is considered the foundation, which needs solid base of reading strategies. Most recent studies have revealed that a lack of phonics based on reading instructions leave learners without important decoding skills necessary in recognizing letter/sound relationships in reading. It emerged that most of the activities observed focussed on word level because more emphasis was placed on decoding than comprehension. Although the study indicates that teachers face a number of challenges, which might have an impact in practising their espoused beliefs, it seems that they did not get proper foundation from pre-service training with phonics instructions.

Hopefully the insights presented in this study can lead to increased awareness of how reading can be effectively taught and how teachers base classroom practices on their experiences and the contexts within which they work.

# Table of Contents

Dedication ..... i
Abstract ..... ii
Acknowledgements ..... iii
Chapter 1 Introduction ..... 1
1.0 Introduction ..... 1
1.1 Rationale for doing the study ..... 1
1.2 Research questions ..... 2
1.3 Purpose of the study ..... 2
1.4 Significance of the study ..... 2
1.5 Overview of the study ..... 3
1.6 Conclusion ..... 5
Chapter 2 Research Context ..... 6
2.0 Introduction ..... 6
2.1 Brief history of Botswana ..... 6
2.2 Overview of Botswana Primary Education ..... 7
2.3 Literacy and reading across the curriculum ..... 9
2.4 Teachers' professional development in the teaching of reading ..... 13
2.5 Conclusion ..... 14
CHAPTER 3: LITERATURE REVIEW ..... 15
3.0 Introduction ..... 15
3.1 Reading ..... 15
3.2 Theoretical models of reading ..... 16
3.2.1 Reading as a cognitive process ..... 16
3.2.2 The bottom-up model ..... 17
3.2.3 The top-down model ..... 18
3.2.4 The Interactive model of reading ..... 19
3.2.5 Schema Theory ..... 20
3.2.6 The Simple View of Reading ..... 22

3.2.7 Reading as a constructivist process ..... 24
3.2.8 Reading as a social process ..... 25
3.3 The phonics instruction controversy ..... 26
3.4 Theoretical thinking on comprehension ..... 30
3.5 Social factors which influence reading development ..... 31
3.5.1 Socioeconomic status ..... 31
3.5.2 Absence of books in the home ..... 33
3.5.3 Value of school libraries ..... 34
3.5.4 Links between enjoyment of reading and success in reading ..... 36
3.6 The relationship between L1 and L2 reading ..... 36
3.7 From the literature review to the present study ..... 39
3.8 Reading pedagogy ..... 41
3.9 Summary ..... 44
CHAPTER 4 RESEARCH DESIGN AND METHODOLOGY ..... 45
4.0 Introduction ..... 45
4.1 Research Paradigm ..... 45
4.2 The interpretive paradigm ..... 46
4.3 The generation of qualitative data ..... 48
4.4.0 Research questions ..... 49
4.4.1 Research design ..... 50
4.4.2 Sample of the study ..... 51
4.5 Data collection instruments ..... 52
4.5.1 The Interviews ..... 52
4.5.1.1 The semi-structured interview ..... 53
4.5.1.2 Construction of the interview protocol ..... 53
4.5.1.3 Piloting of the interview ..... 55
4.5.1.4 Conducting the interviews ..... 56
4.5.1.5 Stimulated recall interviews ..... 57
4.5.1.6 Translation and transcription of the interviews ..... 58
4.5.2 Classroom observation ..... 58
4.5.2.1 Construction of structured observation protocol ..... 59

4.5.2.2 Process of classroom observation ..... 60
4.5.2.3 Analysis of the interviews ..... 61
4.5.2.4 Analysis of classroom observation ..... 63
4.6 Trustworthiness of the study ..... 64
4.6.1 Credibility ..... 64
4.6.2 Transferability ..... 64
4.6.3 Dependability ..... 65
4.6.4 Confirmability ..... 65
4.7 Ethical issues ..... 65
4.8 Summary of methodological framework and methods ..... 67
CHAPTER FIVE: DATA FINDINGS AND INTERPRETATION OF THE SEMI-STRUCTURED INTERVIEW ..... 68
5.0 Introduction ..... 68
5.1 Teachers' pedagogical beliefs and subject knowledge ..... 68
5.2 Teachers' pedagogical practices ..... 74
5.3.1 The significance of knowing learners' background in teaching reading ..... 75
5.3.2 The specified syllabus objectives for teaching reading ..... 76
5.3.3 The teachers' attributes that should be displayed when teaching reading ..... 77
5.3.4 The teaching strategies used by teachers to teach reading ..... 78
5.4 The challenges faced by teachers and children in the teaching of reading ..... 79
5.4.1 The challenges faced by children in learning how to read ..... 80
5.4.2 The challenges faced by teachers' when teaching reading ..... 81
5.5 Conclusion ..... 83
CHAPTER SIX: INVESTIGATING CLASSROOM PRACTICES ..... 86
6.1 Introduction ..... 86
6.2 Teachers' classroom practices ..... 86
6.2.1 The activation of prior knowledge ..... 86
6.2.2 The engagement of learners in the reading task ..... 89
6.2.3 The teacher engages the learners in the construction of meaning from the text ..... 90
6.2.4 The teacher gives the learners adequate time to engage in authentic reading tasks ..... 95
6.3 The role of the teacher in the teaching of reading ..... 96

6.3.1 The teacher engages the learners in the development of phonemic awareness, phonics, and fluency through a variety of authentic literacy opportunities, models and demonstrations ..... 96

6.3.2 The teacher arranges schedule to provide extra time for struggling readers ..... 99

6.3.3 The teacher used on-going assessments (formal and informal) to inform and change their daily instruction, specifically to meet individual needs ..... 100

6.4 Teachers' teaching strategies for comprehension ..... 101

6.4.1 The teacher engages learners in learning how to use comprehension strategies through modelling, guided practice and independent practice ..... 101

6.4.2 The teacher engages the learners in instruction to develop word recognition strategies ..... 102

6.4.3 The teacher values the learners' understanding of print ..... 104

6.5 The role of Pre-service training ..... 104

6.5.1 The teacher plans and implements instruction that corresponds to the curriculum and teachers guides ..... 104

6.6 Conclusion ..... 104

CHAPTER SEVEN: TEACHERS' PEDAGOGICAL SUBJECT KNOWLEDGE AND CLASSROOM PRACTICES: CASE STUDIES ..... 107

7.0 Introduction ..... 107

7.1 The three case studies and their classroom practices ..... 107

7.2 Presentation of the data ..... 108

7.2.1 Case study 1 ..... 108

7.2.2 Teachers' pedagogical subject knowledge and practice of teaching reading ..... 108

7.2.3 The challenges that the teachers face when teaching reading ..... 112

7.2.4 Comment ..... 114

7.3 Case study 2 ..... 115

7.3.1 Teacher's pedagogical subject knowledge and practice in teaching reading ..... 115

7.3.2 The challenges that the teachers face when teaching reading ..... 119

7.3.3 Comments ..... 120

7.4 Case study 3 ..... 121

7.4.1 Teacher's pedagogical subject knowledge and practice in teaching reading ..... 121

7.4.2 The challenges that the teachers face when teaching reading ..... 125

7.4.3 Comments ..... 126

7.5 Conclusion ..... 126

CHAPTER 8: DISCUSSION ..... 127
8.0 Introduction ..... 127
8.1 Teachers' classroom practices are not always consistent with their espoused pedagogical beliefs about teaching reading ..... 127
8.1.1 Approaches used to teach reading ..... 128
8.1.2 Integrating the language skills ..... 130
8.1.3 Assessment ..... 131
8.1.4 Phonics approach ..... 132
8.1.5 Pre-reading strategies ..... 133
8.2 The role of the teacher in the teaching of reading ..... 135
8.2.1 Teacher-learner classroom interaction ..... 135
8.2.2 Questioning technique ..... 136
8.2.3 Issue of control of learning ..... 137
8.2.4 Cultural view of role of teachers and learners is different from child-centred pedagogy ..... 138
8.3 Teachers place more emphasis on decoding than comprehension ..... 140
8.3.1 Sounding of words ..... 140
8.3.2 Comprehension at word level ..... 141
8.3.3 Translation ..... 142
8.4 The role of Pre-service training ..... 143
8.4.1 Pre-service training ..... 143
8.4.2 Teaching as generalists ..... 145
8.5 Challenges ..... 146
8.5.1 Teaching and learning resources ..... 146
8.6 Conclusion ..... 147
CHAPTER 9: IMPLICATIONS L IMITATIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS FOR FURTHER RESEARCH ..... 149
9.0 Introduction ..... 149
9.1 Implications ..... 149
9.2 Limitations imposed by the scale of the study ..... 151
9.3 Recommendations ..... 152
9.4 Conclusion ..... 153
Appendices ..... 155

Appendix 1 Interview Protocol ..... 155
Appendix 2: Sample transcript of interview ..... 156
Appendix 3: Sample transcript of interview codes from NVivo ..... 160
Appendix 5: Original observation Protocol by Madden, & Almasi, (2006) ..... 168
Appendix 6: Modified Observation Protocol ..... 170
Appendix 7: Consent form ..... 171
References ..... 173

**List of Figures**

**Chapter 4**

Figure 4.1: Assumptions underlying the qualitative methodology.....51

Figure 4.2: The exploration process of the interview protocol.....57

**List of tables**

**Chapter 4**

Table 4.1: Outline of the research design.....52-53

Table 4.2: Sample of the study .....53-54

Table 4.3: parallel criteria for positivist and interpretative research.....66

**Chapter 5**

Table 5.1: Codes, their description and simple frequency counts, showing comments made for each code .....71

Table 5.2: Codes, their description and simple frequency counts, showing comments made for each code .....76-77

Table 5.3: Codes, their description and simple frequency counts, showing comments made for each code .....81

**Chapter 7**

Table 7.1: Profile for the three participants .....109