Outside the norm: An ethnographic study of creative practitioner approaches in an alternative provision site for 14-16 year olds.

Submitted by Margo Greenwood, to the University of Exeter as a thesis for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy in Education, October 2012.

This thesis is available for Library use on the understanding that it is copyright material and that no quotation from the thesis may be published without proper acknowledgement.

I certify that all material in this thesis which is not my own work has been identified and that no material has previously been submitted and approved for the award of a degree by this or any other University.

Signature: .......................................................
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

**TABLE OF FIGURES** .................................................................................................................. 6

**ABSTRACT:** ................................................................................................................................. 8

**1 INTRODUCTION** ...................................................................................................................... 9

1.1 Personal and professional influences ......................................................................................... 9

1.2 Introducing the field ................................................................................................................... 10

1.3 Overview of study ..................................................................................................................... 11

1.4 Purpose of study ....................................................................................................................... 13

1.5 Rationale for conducting the study ........................................................................................... 13

1.6 Setting boundaries ................................................................................................................... 15

**2 LITERATURE REVIEW** ......................................................................................................... 16

2.1 Introduction .............................................................................................................................. 16

2.2 School Exclusion in England .................................................................................................... 17

2.3 Understanding the field of Alternative Provision (AP) .............................................................. 19

2.4 A broader view: disaffection .................................................................................................... 20

2.5 Policy literature on Alternative Provision ................................................................................. 23

2.5.1 Current policy context ......................................................................................................... 23

2.5.2 The White Paper ................................................................................................................ 25

2.6 Creativity, futures, aspiration and pupil voice literature that inform my study .................... 27

2.6.1 Creativity and Possibility Thinking: .................................................................................... 27

2.6.2 Creative Partnership ........................................................................................................... 32

2.6.3 Educational Futures .......................................................................................................... 38

2.6.4 Aspiration ........................................................................................................................ 44

2.6.5 Pupil voice ....................................................................................................................... 47

**3 METHODOLOGY** .................................................................................................................... 51

3.1 Introducing Eastbank ................................................................................................................. 51

3.2 Development of the research questions .................................................................................... 53

3.3 Underpinning perspectives influencing research design: ....................................................... 55

3.4 Methodology: ethnography ....................................................................................................... 57

3.4.1 Critical and classical ethnography ....................................................................................... 57

3.4.2 Virtual ethnography ........................................................................................................... 59
Figure 4.5 What characterised the practitioners’ approaches whilst at Eastbank: core findings

3.5 Research methods ................................................................................................................ 61
3.5.1 Grounded Theory .............................................................................................................. 61
3.5.2 Where grounded theory meets ethnography ...................................................................... 64
3.5.3 Case study .......................................................................................................................... 65

3.6 Data Collection methods ..................................................................................................... 67
3.6.1 Interviews ......................................................................................................................... 67
3.6.2 Observation ....................................................................................................................... 69
3.6.3 Visual methods .................................................................................................................. 70

3.7 Role of the researcher in data collection ............................................................................. 72
3.7.1 Using storytelling as method .......................................................................................... 72
3.7.2 Reciprocity ...................................................................................................................... 75

3.8 Data Analysis: ..................................................................................................................... 77
3.8.1 The coding process ......................................................................................................... 77
3.8.2 Non-coded data .............................................................................................................. 79

3.9 Tensions and dilemmas: ...................................................................................................... 79

3.10 Ethics ................................................................................................................................ 81
3.11 Summary ............................................................................................................................. 85

4 FINDINGS PART 1: ................................................................................................................... 86

WHAT CHARACTERISED THE PRACTITIONER APPROACHES AT EASTBANK? .............. 86

4.1 Introduction ......................................................................................................................... 86
4.1.1 Introductory overview of findings ..................................................................................... 87

4.2 Reflecting ............................................................................................................................ 88
4.2.1 Reflecting on context ....................................................................................................... 88
4.2.2 Reflecting on their own biography .................................................................................. 91
4.2.3 Reflecting on their current practice ................................................................................ 93
4.2.4 Reflecting through voicing ideas/speculating ................................................................. 97
4.2.5 Constructing: where reflecting meets building principles – to conclude ......................100

4.3 Building principles ............................................................................................................ 101
4.3.1 Adapting to pupils’ needs .............................................................................................. 102
4.3.2 Building trust and relationship ...................................................................................... 105
4.3.3 Teamwork ...................................................................................................................... 113
4.3.4 Nurture ........................................................................................................................... 114
4.3.5 Experimenting: where building principles meets exploring practice – to conclude .......117

4.4 Exploring practice .............................................................................................................. 118
4.4.1 Offering space ................................................................................................................. 119
4.4.2 Fostering learner agency ............................................................................................... 124
4.4.3 Working alongside ......................................................................................................... 127
4.4.4 Interpreting: where exploring practice meets reflecting – to conclude .......................133

4.5 What characterised the practitioners’ approaches whilst at Eastbank: core findings ............ 134
4.5.1 Definitions of empathic engagement and mission .......................................................... 134
4.5.2 The relationship between mission and empathic engagement ..................................... 137
4.5.3 How these two overarching themes emerged ................................................................. 138
4.6 Context and complexity: questioning realities ................................................................. 141
  4.6.1 External perception and self-protection within the context of the site ............................ 142

4.7 My lived experiences at Eastbank as embodied through life writing .................................. 147
  4.7.1 Introduction .................................................................................................................... 147
  4.7.2 Life writing and reflections on them .............................................................................. 147

5 FINDINGS PART 2: WHERE DID THE PRACTITIONER APPROACHES LEAD? ............ 161

5.1 Introduction ......................................................................................................................... 161
  5.1.1 Key points in the analytic journey .................................................................................. 163

5.2 Licensed chaos .................................................................................................................... 167
  5.2.1 Authorised releases of licensed chaos: play and immersion .......................................... 168
  5.2.2 Risk taking as a characteristic of licensed chaos ............................................................ 171
  5.2.3 Ownership as a characteristic of licensed chaos ............................................................. 174

5.3 Belonging ............................................................................................................................ 179

5.4 Well-being .......................................................................................................................... 181
  5.4.1 Introduction .................................................................................................................... 181
  5.4.2 Evidence of well-being .................................................................................................. 182
  5.4.3 Contributing factors to well-being ................................................................................ 187
  5.4.4 My own well-being ........................................................................................................ 188

6 DISCUSSION .......................................................................................................................... 192

6.1 Introduction ........................................................................................................................ 192

6.2 Why the oneness of empathic engagement and mission matters ........................................ 192

6.2 The significance of belonging ............................................................................................ 198
  6.2.1 Belonging through the lens of dialogic education, humanising creativity and aspiration 201

6.3 The significance of well-being in AP and beyond ............................................................... 205
  6.3.1 Well-being in the wider literature .................................................................................. 205
  6.3.2 My findings in relation to well-being literature ............................................................. 208

6.4 Mess is more: Licensed chaos ............................................................................................ 213

6.5 The relationship between licensed chaos and creativity .................................................... 215
  6.5.1 Licensed chaos in relation to humanising creativity ....................................................... 218
  6.5.2 Licensed chaos in relation to possibility thinking .......................................................... 220

6.6 Current policy context ........................................................................................................ 225

6.7 A change of perspective: post-critical research ................................................................. 227

7 CONCLUSION ....................................................................................................................... 233

7.1 And for what may I hope? .................................................................................................... 233

7.2 Original contribution to research ....................................................................................... 235

7.3 Significance of the study ...................................................................................................... 236
7.4 My learning journey: overcoming tensions and dilemmas ................................................................. 237

7.5 Limitations of the research .................................................................................................................. 242

7.6 Recommended further areas of scholarship/future research possibilities ........................................... 244

7.7 Dissemination: .................................................................................................................................... 245

APPENDICES........................................................................................................................................ 246

BIBLIOGRAPHY ....................................................................................................................................... 280
Table of Figures

Figure 2.1: Stage 2 analysis of question-posing and question-responding placed back within the original framework (Chappell, 2008, p19) ................................................................. 30
Figure 2.2: Pedagogy that nurtures possibility thinking (Craft et al., 2012, p.60) ................................................................. 31
Figure 2.3: Summary of four-fold model of teacher/artist partnership (Jeffery, 2005, pp.79-85) .................................................. 33
Figure 2.4: The individual, collaborative and communal in creativity (Greenwood et al, 2011) .................................................. 36
Figure 2.5: Becoming the process (Greenwood et al, 2011) ................................................................. 37
Figure 2.6: Mental state in terms of challenge level and skill level ................................................................. 45
Figure 3.1: The grounded theory process (Charmaz, 2006, p.11) .................................................................................. 62
Figure 3.2: My emerging grounded theory process .................................................................................. 63
Figure 4.1: What characterised practitioner approaches at Eastbank? In diagrammatic form (source: author) .................................................................................. 87
Figure 4.2: Reflecting ............................................................................................................................................... 88
Figure 4.3: Geoff’s reflections on his diary notes (names removed digitally) .................................................. 96
Figure 4.4: 2009-12-10:66 Dave reading Geoff’s annotations .................................................................................. 97
Figure 4.5: Constructing ........................................................................................................................................ 100
Figure 4.6: Building principles .................................................................................................................................. 101
Figure 4.7: 2010-03-03:142 Pupil self-expressing through choice of hair colour .................................................. 104
Figure 4.8: 2010-05-28:18 Breakfast .................................................................................................................................. 104
Figure 4.9: 2010-01-16:13 sitting alongside and exploring together .................................................................................. 105
Figure 4.10: 2010-05-18:327; 313; 384a; 334 .................................................................................................................................. 107
Figure 4.11: 2010-5-28; 2009-11-23 Quality time at lunchtime – building trust and relationship .................................................................................. 108
Figure 4.12: 2010-02-11:72 Inhabiting the same space ................................................................................................. 111
Figure 4.13: 2010-05-28 Theft of the sofa from the office ................................................................................................. 111
Figure 4.14: 2009-11-23:08 personalised mugs ................................................................................................................. 112
Figure 4.15: 2009-11-23:47 Main desk in classroom 1 ............................................................................................................ 113
Figure 4.16: Experimenting ........................................................................................................................................ 117
Figure 4.17: Exploring practice ........................................................................................................................................ 118
Figure 4.18: 2010-04-28:09; 2010-03-16:32 Giving space in a music session .................................................................................. 119
Figure 4.19: 2010-02-11:55 Filming of comedy scene ................................................................................................. 121
Figure 4.20: 2010-03-16:22; 2010-03-16:26 The role of audience ................................................................................................. 123
Figure 4.21: 2010-02-11:47 Opportunities for idea generation ................................................................................................. 125
Figure 4.22: 2010-05-10:17 Self-expression through rap ................................................................................................. 126
Figure 4.23: 2009-12-10:56 Pupils working alongside practitioners .................................................................................. 128
Figure 4.24: 2010-01-29:06 practitioner and pupil creating animation .................................................................................. 129
Figure 4.25: 2009-11-25:44 STA bricklaying .................................................................................................................. 130
Figure 4.26: 2009-11-20:06 Working on ‘their’ car with a mechanics tutor .................................................................................. 133
Figure 4.27: Interpreting ............................................................................................................................................ 133
Figure 4.1: What characterised practitioner approaches at Eastbank? In diagrammatic form .................................................................................. 135
Figure 4.28: Coming to understand the data through creative means .................................................................................. 138
Figure 4.29: Transcription excerpt of recorded restorative justice meeting – Sergeant’s introduction. .................................................................................. 144
Figure 5.1: Visual representation of findings for the research question, ‘Where did these approaches lead?’ Source: author .................................................................................. 161
Figure 5.2: early analysis that began to show licensed chaos and belonging as process and outcomes. Source: author .................................................................................. 163
Figure 5.3: early analysis to explore the nature of the connection between categories .................................................................................. 166
Figure 5.4: 2010-03-03:182 Playful ........................................................................................................................................ 168
Figure 5.5: 2010-01-25:56 Recording session .................................................................................................................. 170
Figure 5.6: 2010-12-10:131 Risk taking explorations ................................................................................................. 172
Figure 5.7: 2010-03-23:72 Design for barbecue .................................................................................................................. 176
Figure 5.8: connected relationships within licensed chaos ................................................................. 178
Figure 5.9: 2010-02-11:66 At the kitchen sink .................................................................................. 180
Figure 5.10: Facebook status update .................................................................................................. 183
Figure 5.11: Facebook status update .................................................................................................. 184
Figure 5.13: Facebook group page update .......................................................................................... 185
Figure 5.14: A sense of posse ............................................................................................................ 190
Figure 5.15: researcher playing cards with pupil ................................................................................ 191
Figure 6.1: What characterised the practitioner approaches at Eastbank? (diagrammatic form) ......... 193
Figure 6.2: The relationship between empathic engagement and mission ............................................ 194
Figure 6.3: Pedagogy that nurtures possibility thinking (Craft et al., 2012, p.60) ............................... 221
Abstract:

Outside the norm: An ethnographic study of creative practitioner approaches in an alternative provision site for 14-16 year olds

Alternative Provision, as a sector, is well positioned to offer a remarkable opportunity to cultivate a young person’s humanity through care and challenge. Where practitioners embrace responsibility for young people and their environment, and honour context and complexity, they can mobilise the present as a rich source of possibility and agency. There needs to be a clear understanding of the contribution that Alternative Provision can make to young people’s lives and how this relates to practice and policy perceptions of effectiveness.

Yet because it is difficult to know, track, manage and regulate, Alternative Provision remains largely uninspected and unregulated, with lack of clarity in purpose holding back the potential to inspire change in pupil perception and experience. On top of these issues, schools face the challenge of being held directly accountable for Alternative Provision they commission for their pupils, and responsible for ensuring that it is suitable, safe and effective. Research into current practice and theory is needed to help schools and policy makers fulfil their mandates at a time when policy makers are at the cusp of re-designing the field.

At these key beginnings of re-design for Alternative Provision in England, this ethnographic study offers to fill that research gap through a conceptualisation of practitioner approaches in one Alternative Provision site over an academic year, that led to pupil well-being, a sense of belonging and further training or employment. These outcomes, alongside the practitioner approaches of mutually transforming empathic engagement and mission, I argue, are central to sound thinking about Alternative Provision. The process involved – licensed chaos – with its authorised release of pupils into play, immersion, risk taking and ownership, is presented as one way of embodying this journey and is offered here as a model of process on which other schools could build their own.

Methodological contributions are made through the exploration of life writing as ontology and as a way of communicating the ever-present realities for many pupils attending Alternative Provision. Critical reflection and acknowledgement of the researcher’s role and transformation through the research process is shared. Reciprocal virtual ethnography is explored and put forward as an effective means of researching young people in Alternative Provision.

This thesis tells a story of lives and learning that further humanises and empowers the field of Alternative Provision and its commissioning schools.