

## Abstract

This chapter seeks to dislodge Irish America as the dominant referent in discussions of Irish transnationalism and investigate a substantial tradition that positions Spain as an important space in the Irish transnational imagination. The analysis is divided into two sections. The first provides an overview of some of the existing and emerging critical voices relating to Irish transnational fictions. It emphasizes the centrality of Irish America in extant discussions of transnationalism and points to alternative ways of conceptualizing how Ireland's cultural, historical, economic, and environmental circumstances are enmeshed, literally and imaginatively, with those of other spaces and places. The second part focuses on how Colm Tóibín's *Brooklyn* (2009) might be read in relation to Kate O'Brien's *Mary Lavelle* (1936) and Maura Laverty's *No More Than Human* (1944) as a work that re-routes the iconic Irish-American transatlantic relationship through a much more capacious cis-Atlantic frame of reference.

## Keywords

Ireland, the United States, transnational fiction, Colm Tóibín, Kate O'Brien, Maura Laverty, cis-Atlantic

## CHAPTER 29

### ‘A Sly, Mid-Atlantic Appropriation’:

#### Ireland, the United States, and Transnational Fictions of Spain

SINEAD MOYNIHAN

Let’s try an outrageous generalisation, prompted by the appearance of Sebastian Barry’s mesmerising *On Canaan’s Side* on the longlist for the Booker Prize. It can be contradicted by a thousand qualifications and counter-examples, but it is nonetheless worth positing. It is this: that the great theme of the contemporary Irish novel is not Ireland but the US.<sup>1</sup>

So opined Fintan O’Toole, leading critic and cultural commentator, in 2011, citing in evidence, in addition to Barry’s (1955–) novel of that year, Joseph O’Connor’s (1963–) *Redemption Falls* (2007), Colm Tóibín’s (1955–) *The Master* (2004) and *Brooklyn* (2009), Colum McCann’s (1965–) *This Side of Brightness* (1998) and *Let the Great World Spin* (2009), Joseph O’Neill’s (1964–) *Netherland* (2008), and Roddy Doyle’s (1958–) *Oh, Play That Thing* (2004). O’Toole’s assertion has been echoed several times, implicitly or explicitly, in reviews of contemporary Irish fiction set entirely or partially in the USA. For example, in his review of Paul Lynch’s (1977–) *Red Sky in Morning* (2013), John Boland wrote that the novel’s ‘arduous transatlantic crossing recalls Joseph O’Connor’s *Star of the Sea* and Colm Tóibín’s *Brooklyn*’, while ‘the notion of hostile forces following their quarry from Ireland to America is familiar from Roddy Doyle’s *The Last Roundup* and Sebastian

---

<sup>1</sup> Fintan O’Toole, ‘Irish writers have yet to awake from the American Dream’, *Irish Times*, 30 July 2011, 8.

Barry's *On Canaan's Side*'.<sup>2</sup> Sinéad Gleeson, in a review of Mary Costello's *Academy Street* (2014), proclaimed that 'From Maeve Brennan to Colm Tóibín and Colum McCann, Irish writers have an umbilical connection to America', and went on to note that 'readers may hear echoes of Tóibín's *Brooklyn*' in Costello's novel.<sup>3</sup> Similarly, Sue Gaisford was reminded of Tóibín and 'the awareness of the romantic appeal of America to those living just the other side of the Atlantic'<sup>4</sup> when reviewing Anne Enright's (1962–) *The Green Road* (2015).

Tóibín's novel, in particular, has acquired an iconic status as a kind of emigrant urban narrative, which has only been reinforced and deepened by its 2015 screen adaptation, directed by John Crowley. For Mark Kermode, Crowley's *Brooklyn* taps into 'a rich seam of émigré cinema (Jim Sheridan's 2002 *In America* is a distant cousin)' and 'one sublime sequence ... echoes the poetry of the Pogues' "Fairytale of New York"'.<sup>5</sup> Richard Brody invokes the most oft-cited representation of Irish America, John Ford's *The Quiet Man* (1952), in his much less laudatory review of the film for the *New Yorker*. Brody objects to the film's 'greenwashing' of Ireland and its 'sanitization' of Brooklyn, and finds that, by comparison, 'Whatever the townsfolk are in Ford's film—comical, bumbling, braggadocious, headstrong—they're also deeply, even tragically, in the know.'<sup>6</sup> Like reviews of the film, the

---

<sup>2</sup> John Boland, 'A fine thriller emerges from a flood of adverbs and adjectives', *Irish Independent*, 5 May 2013.

<sup>3</sup> Sinéad Gleeson, 'Academy Street by Mary Costello review: woman on the sidelines', *Guardian*, 25 October 2014.

<sup>4</sup> Sue Gaisford, 'The Green Road by Anne Enright', *Financial Times*, 1 May 2015.

<sup>5</sup> Mark Kermode, 'Brooklyn review: this *Fairytale of New York* casts a spell', *Guardian*, 8 November 2015.

<sup>6</sup> Richard Brody, 'The Sanitized Past of *Brooklyn*', *New Yorker*, 6 November 2015.

few existing scholarly commentaries on *Brooklyn* situate the novel in relation to narratives of Irish migration ranging from George Moore's (1852–1933) *The Untilled Field* (1903), particularly 'Home Sickness', and James Joyce's (1882–1941) 'Eveline' in *Dubliners* (1914) to Edna O'Brien's (1930–) *The Light of Evening* (2006), McCann's *Let the Great World Spin*, and Barry's *On Canaan's Side*.<sup>7</sup> The same commentators have also discerned in *Brooklyn* traces of Tóibín's 'absorption in [non-Irish] canonical' texts, such as Jane Austen's *Pride and Prejudice* (1813) and *Mansfield Park* (1814) and Henry James's *Portrait of a Lady* (1880–81).<sup>8</sup>

This chapter examines Tóibín's novel from a more oblique angle, taking its cue from Aamer Hussein's review of *Brooklyn* for the London *Independent*, in which he claims that the novel is 'like a sly, mid-Atlantic appropriation of the romantic novels of Kate O'Brian [sic] or Maura Laverty—about Irish girls travelling to pre-Civil War Spain in the 1930s, falling in love, and going home heartbroken'.<sup>9</sup> In other words, this reading of Tóibín's novel takes seriously Hussein's assertion that *Brooklyn* is more indebted to O'Brien's (1897–1974) and Laverty's (1907–66) works (although they are set in the 1920s, not the 1930s) than has

---

<sup>7</sup> On links between *Brooklyn* and Moore and Joyce, see Ellen McWilliams, *Women and Exile in Contemporary Irish Fiction* (Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan, 2013), 172–5 and Tory Young, 'Brooklyn as the "Untold Story" of "Eveline": Reading Joyce and Tóibín with Ricoeur', *Journal of Modern Literature* 37, no. 4 (2014), 123–40. On *Brooklyn* and Edna O'Brien, see Eve Walsh Stoddard, 'Home and Belonging among Irish Migrants: Transnational versus Placed Identities in *The Light of Evening* and *Brooklyn: A Novel*', *Éire-Ireland* 47, nos. 1 & 2 (2012), 147–71. On *Brooklyn* and McCann and Barry, see Elizabeth Butler Cullingford, 'American Dreams: Emigration or Exile in Contemporary Irish Fiction?', *Éire-Ireland* 49, nos. 3 & 4 (2014), 60–94.

<sup>8</sup> See McWilliams, *Women and Exile*, 172–3 and Cullingford, 'American Dreams', 70–1, 83.

<sup>9</sup> Aamer Hussein, 'Brooklyn, by Colm Tóibín', *Independent*, 30 April 2009.

previously been acknowledged. Because of the privileged position afforded the Ireland–USA relationship in discussions of Irish transnationalism, the echoes of O’Brien’s and Laverty’s novels in extant scholarship on *Brooklyn* have been missed. This is surprising given that Tóibín has cited and anthologized O’Brien’s work, spent three years living in Barcelona himself, owns a home in Spain, and continues to set some of his fiction there.<sup>10</sup>

Drawing on Amanda Tucker and Moira E. Casey’s definition of Irish transnational literature as ‘writing that places Irish identity in dialogue with other cultural, national, or ethnic affiliations’,<sup>11</sup> the larger concern of this chapter is to dislodge Irish America as the dominant referent in discussions of Irish transnationalism and investigate a substantial tradition that positions Spain as an important space in the Irish transnational imagination. This genealogy is associated particularly with women writers of the 1930s and 1940s: O’Brien’s *Mary Lavelle* (1936) and *That Lady* (1946) and Laverty’s *No More Than Human* (1944) are all set in Spain. Early drafts of Maeve Brennan’s (1917–93) *The Visitor* (composed in the mid-1940s but not published until 2000) have Anastasia King returning to Ireland from Barcelona, rather than Paris, after six years.<sup>12</sup> Meanwhile, in Dorothy

---

<sup>10</sup> One example of Tóibín citing O’Brien is a talk he delivered eight days before the 2015 Irish same-sex marriage referendum, the title of which he borrowed from the sentence in *The Land of Spices* (1941) that ensured the novel’s banning in Ireland. See Colm Tóibín, ‘The Embrace of Love: Being Gay in Ireland Now’, Trinity College Dublin, 14 May 2015, <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=qYzyHtattywE&feature=youtu.be>. Accessed 24 April 2018.

<sup>11</sup> Amanda Tucker and Moira Casey, ‘National and Transnational Irish Literatures’, in Amanda Tucker and Moira Casey (eds), *Where Motley is Worn: Transnational Irish Literatures* (Cork: Cork University Press, 2014), 2.

<sup>12</sup> Unpublished drafts of *The Visitor*, Maeve Brennan Papers, 1940–1993, Stuart A. Rose Manuscript, Archives, and Rare Book Library, Emory University.

Macardle's (1889–1958) *The Uninvited* (1942), which first appeared as *Uneasy Freehold* in 1941, Spain is a significant imagined space because of the way it pits Englishwoman Mary Meredith against Spanish Carmel in profoundly racialized ways. Later in the century, Edna O'Brien's *The High Road* (1988) and Tóibín's *The South* (1990) share several affinities in their treatment of the Irish woman artist in Spain. Meanwhile, if *The South* is a 'straight' novel preoccupied with Katherine Proctor's heterosexual relationships, Tóibín produces a queer reworking of it in 'Barcelona, 1975', a short story from his 2011 collection, *The Empty Family*. Spain is also an important queer destination in *Nights Beneath the Nation* (2008) by first-time novelist Denis Kehoe (1978–).

This chapter focuses particularly on Kate O'Brien's and Laverty's novels, arguing that by displacing the USA and focusing on Spain instead, we begin to see that *Brooklyn*—through its associations with *Mary Lavelle* and *No More Than Human*—re-routes the iconic Irish-American transatlantic relationship through a much more capacious cis-Atlantic frame of reference. Reading the novel as a 'sly, mid-Atlantic appropriation' of O'Brien's and Laverty's novels positions *Brooklyn* as an invitation to readers to interrogate the overwhelming preoccupation with the *transatlantic*, in both fiction and scholarship, and consider instead crossings and journeys between Ireland and other Atlantic-facing spaces, in Tóibín's own work and that of other Irish writers.

The material that follows is divided into two sections. The first provides an overview of some of the existing and emerging critical voices relating to Irish transnational fictions. It emphasizes the centrality of Irish America in extant discussions of transnationalism and points to alternative ways of conceptualizing how Ireland's cultural, historical, economic, and environmental circumstances are enmeshed, literally and imaginatively, with those of other spaces and places. The second part focuses more specifically on how we might productively read Tóibín's novel in relation to *Mary Lavelle* and *No More Than Human*. Identifying

echoes and reverberations across the works that are suggestive and speculative rather than emphatic and categorical, the chapter reads the three works together with a view to expanding the parameters of current research on, and understandings of, Irish transnational fictions.

## **Irish Transnational Fictions: Irish America and Beyond**

It is important to note that the very term ‘transnational’ in Irish studies privileges the relationship between Ireland and the USA, to the extent that the phrase—when applied specifically in literary and cultural studies rather than in disciplines such as business, sociology, or anthropology—is overwhelmingly associated with a US American studies context. In November 2004, the ‘transnational turn’ was the subject of an address to the American Studies Association by its then president, Shelley Fisher Fishkin. Fishkin argued that ‘understanding the multiple meanings of America and American culture in all their complexity’ requires ‘looking beyond the nation’s borders, and understanding how the nation is seen from vantage points beyond its borders’.<sup>13</sup> For Fishkin and other scholars, the importance of challenging US nationalism and exceptionalism was a particularly urgent project, given the aggression that characterized US foreign policy in the aftermath of the attacks of 11 September 2001. If the ‘transnational turn’ in American studies gained momentum through a commitment on the part of Americanist scholars to revealing ‘the workings of the [US] nation’s unilateral projection of power and hegemony over the rest of the world’,<sup>14</sup> transnationalist scholarship in Irish literary and cultural studies has tended to

---

<sup>13</sup> Shelley Fisher Fishkin, ‘Crossroads of Cultures: The Transnational Turn in American Studies—Presidential Address to the American Studies Association, November 12, 2004’ </IBT>, *American Quarterly* 57, no.1 (2005), 20.

<sup>14</sup> *Ibid.*, 21.

focus on Ireland's diaspora and, most particularly, on Irish America. This is not surprising given that, as Khachig Tölölyan declared in the inaugural issue of the journal *Diaspora*, diasporas are the 'exemplary communities of the transnational moment'.<sup>15</sup> Irish studies has, since the 1990s, responded with enthusiasm and commitment to the 'diasporic turn' and much of this work is compelling, important, and profoundly enabling.<sup>16</sup>

However, scholarly work on Irish transnationalism(s) that is not obviously engaged with the Irish diaspora in the USA and Britain has been much slower to develop. The necessity of expanding transnational modes of inquiry beyond the diaspora is underscored by Tucker and Casey who, in their introduction to the first collection of essays devoted to transnational Irish literatures, argue that because diaspora has functioned as 'a sort of de-territorialised nationalism' it risks allowing Irish studies 'to be global in theory and insular in practice'.<sup>17</sup> They further maintain that 'Irish Studies as a field of study has been curiously resistant to new approaches and areas of inquiry',<sup>18</sup> and this has certainly been the case with modes of transnational scholarship that are not diaspora-oriented. This resistance is due, at least in part, to Irish literary scholars' tenacious attachment to postcolonialism and their suspicion of

---

<sup>15</sup> Khachig Tölölyan, 'The Nation-State and Its Others: In Lieu of a Preface', *Diaspora: A Journal of Transnational Studies* 1, no. 1 (1991), 5.

<sup>16</sup> Landmark publications in this area include *Irish Review. Special Issue: Memoir, Memory and Migration* 44 (2012); *Éire-Ireland. Special Issue: New Approaches to Irish Migration* 47, nos. 1 & 2 (2012); *Irish Studies Review. Special Issue: Texts and Textures of Irish America* 23, no. 2 (2015); and *Éire-Ireland. Special Issue: Beyond the Nation: Transnational Ireland* 51, nos. 1 & 2 (2016). In addition, important studies by Liam Harte, Jack Morgan, and Tony Murray, and a volume edited by Oona Frawley, are listed in the Further Reading section at the end of the chapter.

<sup>17</sup> <IBT>Tucker and Casey, 'National and Transnational Irish Literatures' </IBT>, 4.

<sup>18</sup> *Ibid.*, 13.

modes of inquiry that depart from postcolonialism's most established critical iterations. As Andrew Kincaid observes in the same volume, 'to think through the term "transnationalism" inevitably requires paying attention to those other terms, such as postcolonialism, modernism and globalisation, that hover around it, draw on its energies'.<sup>19</sup>

One of the most pressing debates in contemporary postcolonial studies asks whether the 'global' is a more appropriate frame of reference in today's transnational world. As Alfred J. López and Robert P. Marzec observed in 2010: 'What has arguably changed over the past quarter century is not the "post" but its referent: that is, the futures toward which the field known as "postcolonial studies" think and work. This new referent ... is the global.'<sup>20</sup> In other words, if scholars of Irish Studies have been slow to embrace non-diaspora-oriented transnational frameworks, this may be attributed to the perceived suspicious proximity of transnationalism to globalization, which would move critics further away from postcolonialism as more traditionally conceived. This is not to say that there is no compelling scholarly or creative work that links the global, the transnational, and the postcolonial in Ireland. Rather, it is to highlight that the ongoing privileging of postcolonialism as a critical framework in Irish studies has implications not only for that set of paradigms but also for a concatenation of others, including transnationalism, 'that hover around it, draw on its energies'.

One rich and productive site of transnational literary scholarship is the 'archipelagic turn' evident in the work of a number of critics of British and Irish literatures, including John

---

<sup>19</sup> Andrew Kincaid, 'Subverting the Waves of Global Capital: Piracy and Fiction in the Wake of the Union', in Tucker and Casey (eds), *Where Motley is Worn*, 181.

<sup>20</sup> Alfred J. López and Robert P. Marzec, 'Postcolonial Studies at the Twenty-Five Year Mark', *Modern Fiction Studies* 56, no. 4 (2010), 677–8.

Brannigan, Claire Connolly, Nick Groom, and Jos Smith, and emerging, to a significant extent, from the Atlantic Archipelagos Research Consortium (AARC), which involves academics in Irish, British, and American universities.<sup>21</sup> The referenda on Scottish independence in 2014 and on U.K. membership of the European Union in 2016, as well as the extensive interest they generated in the archipelago more broadly, testify to the ongoing negotiation of questions of political sovereignty, affective bonds, and regional distinctions or similarities between Scotland, England, Wales, Ireland, and Northern Ireland and their peoples. As Smith points out, archipelagic approaches to the literature and the culture of the British Isles arose in the late 1990s out of ‘a growing political and national uncertainty over precisely what was meant by the obviously Anglocentric implications of the terminology in titles such as “Great Britain” or the “United Kingdom”’.<sup>22</sup> Meanwhile, Brannigan has recently argued that an emphasis on archipelagic relations between Britain and Ireland ‘implies a plural and connective vision’ that challenges both ‘the cultural and political homogenisation’ of the unionist project and the ‘exceptionalism and insularity’ that have characterized Scottish, Welsh, and Irish nationalisms.<sup>23</sup>

---

<sup>21</sup> See <https://willson.uga.edu/research/associations/aarc/>. Accessed 24 April 2018.

<sup>22</sup> Jos Smith, ‘An Archipelagic Literature: Re-framing “The New Nature Writing”’, *Green Letters: Studies in Ecocriticism* 17, no. 1 (2013), 8–9.

<sup>23</sup> John Brannigan, *Archipelagic Modernism: Literature in the Irish and British Isles, 1890–1970* (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2015), 6. Recent research in the area of archipelagic literary studies includes Claire Connolly’s comparative work on ‘Four Nations Fiction’ and a 2015 workshop at University College Cork on comparative coastal topographies which focused on ‘shared codes and conventions in the depiction of coastal landscapes in Ireland, Wales, Scotland and the West Indies’; *The Irish Sea* and *Women and the Sea* symposia at Dun Laoghaire in,

Taking its cue from this body of work—which is ‘Atlanticist’ to the extent that it seeks ‘to imagine, map, and develop the identities, cartographies and cultural ecologies of the Atlantic Archipelago’<sup>24</sup>—this chapter aims to think more transnationally about Atlantic space. One of the ironies of scholarship in transatlantic literary studies is that despite its assault on critical frameworks that took for granted the primacy of the nation-state, it has itself been characterized by a number of telling assumptions and exclusions. For one thing, it has been dominated historically by an exceptionalist idea of what the ‘transatlantic’ is: the Anglo-American relationship. As Christopher Cusack notes, despite the fact that Ireland, ‘an island in the Atlantic ocean, has been a conspicuous presence in the Atlantic world in various ways’, it constitutes a ‘lacuna’ in the field of Atlantic studies.<sup>25</sup> Two recent examples of the opening up of this field of inquiry to Irish perspectives are the special issues of, respectively, *Atlantic Studies* (2014) on ‘Irish Global Migration and Famine Memory’ and *Symbiosis: A Journal of Transatlantic Literary and Cultural Relations* (2015) on ‘The Irish Atlantic’. Meanwhile, in an Irish studies context, it could be argued that the transatlantic relationship between Ireland and North America (but usually the USA) has overshadowed all other kinds of inter-Atlantic engagement. Of David Armitage’s influential ‘three concepts of Atlantic history’, this chapter is interested particularly in his delineation of a ‘cis-Atlantic’ approach that ‘studies particular places as unique locations within an Atlantic world and seeks to define

---

respectively, 2014 and 2015; and Nicholas Allen, Nick Groom, and Jos Smith (eds), *Coastal Works: Cultures of the Atlantic Edge* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2017).

<sup>24</sup> Atlantic Archipelagos Research Project (AARP), University of Exeter,

<http://humanities.exeter.ac.uk/english/research/projects/aarp/>. Accessed 24 April 2018.

<sup>25</sup> Christopher Cusack, ‘Beyond the Emerald Isle: Studying the Irish Atlantic’, *Atlantic Studies* 8, no. 3 (2011), 381.

that uniqueness as the result of the interaction between local particularity and a wider web of connections and comparisons'.<sup>26</sup>

There are deeply suggestive literal and imaginative connections between Ireland and Spain. As Gayle Rogers observes, Spain has long occupied a position of 'internal other' in Europe. Its 'European marginality and its proximity to Africa have been geographical features that fed myths such as its allegedly sanguinary Catholicism and its "qualified Westernness" throughout its cultural history'.<sup>27</sup> In its perceived position on the (Atlantic) periphery of European modernity, with its predominantly Catholic population and having undergone a bloody civil war which was viewed by some disaffected Irish republicans as 'a reincarnation of the Irish Civil War of 1922–23',<sup>28</sup> it certainly bears similarities to Ireland in the first half of the twentieth century. The forging of literary affinities, to echo the literal ones, between Ireland and Spain is not at all unusual. Indeed, as Rogers further argues, Joyce's *Ulysses* (1922) posits similarities between 'the marginal states of Ireland and Spain' through its positioning of Molly Bloom as a 'Spanish type' who was born and grew up in Gibraltar.<sup>29</sup>

Meanwhile, Ute Anna Mittermaier suggests that, between the 1930s and the 1970s,

---

<sup>26</sup> David Armitage, 'Three Concepts of Atlantic History', in David Armitage and Michael J. Braddick (eds), *The British Atlantic World, 1500–1800* (Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan, 2002), 21.

<sup>27</sup> Gayle Rogers, *Modernism and the New Spain: Britain, Cosmopolitan Europe, and Literary History* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2012), 9, 12.

<sup>28</sup> Daniel Gomes, 'Good-Bye, Twilight: Ireland, Spain, and the Ballad Resurgence', *Éire-Ireland* 50, nos. 3 & 4 (2015), 36.

<sup>29</sup> Rogers, *Modernism and the New Spain*, 25.

Irish and Spanish society and culture were marked by the dominant influence of the Catholic Church and its state supported propagation of a patriarchal family model, the idealization of the nation and the glorification of its history, governmental efforts to promote language (Irish and Castilian respectively) over another (or several others in the case of Spain), the exaltation of rural life and tradition above urban life and modernity, and the cultural isolation from the modern world by means of rigid censorship.<sup>30</sup>

Mittermaier contends that Kate O'Brien 'repeatedly used Spain as a reference point for her indirect critique of socio-political conditions in Ireland'.<sup>31</sup> For example, in *Pray for the Wanderer* (1938), the novel that immediately succeeded *Mary Lavelle*, censored writer Matt Costello reflects, in a description that evokes General Franco, that Éamon de Valera is 'a more subtle dictator than most—though he also, given time, might have the minds of her people in chains. He did not bring materialism out for public adoration, but materialistic justice controlled by a dangerous moral philosophy, the new Calvinism of the Roman Catholic. ... A clever man, Dev.'<sup>32</sup>

For many other writers, the internal political, religious, and linguistic divisions of both Spain and Ireland offer fruitful comparative possibilities. Tóibín's first novel, *The South*, follows Katherine Proctor, an Irish Protestant, from 1950, when she leaves her Wexford-based husband and son and travels to Barcelona, hoping to become a painter, to the early

---

<sup>30</sup> Ute Anna <IBT>Mittermaier, 'Kate O'Brien's Subtle Critique of Franco's Spain and de Valera's Ireland, 1936–46' </IBT>, in Dorothea Depner and Guy Woodward (eds), *Irish Culture in Wartime Europe, 1938–48* (Dublin: Four Courts Press, 2015), 117–18.

<sup>31</sup> *Ibid.*, 114.

<sup>32</sup> Kate O'Brien, *Pray for the Wanderer* (Harmondsworth: Penguin, 1958), 30.

1970s, by which time she has left Spain, returned to Ireland, reconnected with her estranged son, and enjoyed some modest success with her painting career. For Ellen McWilliams, the setting of the novel in Catalonia is significant because ‘it amplifies the meaning of the title of the novel; it holds up a mirror to Irish Catholic culture but also, importantly, forges a direct connection between Irish nationalisms current and past and the nationalist zeal of the Catalan community in which Katherine settles’.<sup>33</sup> When Katherine meets a fellow Wexford native in Barcelona, she tells him she is from an area ‘Between Newtownbarry and Enniscorthy’, to which he replies, ‘they don’t call [Newtownbarry] that any more. I’m from Enniscorthy.’<sup>34</sup> This brief exchange between an Irish Protestant and Irish Catholic, who were born and raised within ten or fifteen miles of each other, conjures up in a couple of sentences the fraught colonial history inscribed upon their shared landscape.

Newtownbarry was the name of a landed estate that came to attach itself to the estate’s adjoining village (previously known as Bunclody) from about the mid-seventeenth century. After independence in 1922, efforts were made to change the name of the village back to Bunclody, efforts that came to fruition in 1950 when Newtownbarry was officially renamed by Local Government Order.<sup>35</sup> The implied connection between ‘nationalisms current and past’ in *The South* echoes Delia Scully’s claim of ‘a close kinship between the Catalonians and the Irish’ in *No More Than Human*: ‘Their long fight for independence, their yearning for individualism as expressed in the way they clung to their language and customs, and their love of liberty as shown in their demand for republican status—all these things made a

---

<sup>33</sup> McWilliams, *Women and Exile*, 160.

<sup>34</sup> Colm Tóibín, *The South* (London: Picador, 1992), 36.

<sup>35</sup> S.I. No. 281/1950 Local Government (Change of Name of Non-Municipal Town) Order, 1950, available online via [irishstatutebook.ie](http://irishstatutebook.ie).

brother-bond for us.’<sup>36</sup> It also recalls other internal nationalisms in Spain. On a day trip to Altono (Bilbao), Mary Lavelle is amused to hear the names “‘Arthur Griffiths” [sic] and “Patrick Pearse””<sup>37</sup> mentioned in the oration of a Basque nationalist. Meanwhile, when Juanito’s beautiful wife Luisa tells Mary that she ‘admire[s] the Irish-Spanish hero, de Valera, thought the civil war in Ireland tragic but inevitable, and the Treaty compromise a grave mistake’, Mary immediately interprets her views on Ireland as an indirect comment on Spain, and asks her: ‘Do you then sympathise with the nationalist ambitions of the Catalans and the Basques?’<sup>38</sup>

## **Kate O’Brien, Maura Laverty, and ‘Unlooked-for Spain’**

As Tucker and Casey state, ‘Transnational Irish literature is invested in the multiple points of identification and belonging that result from a writer’s commitment to Ireland, to other countries, and to the world at large.’<sup>39</sup> Spain features in several texts as one node that connects Ireland and the wider world. *Mary Lavelle* charts four months in the life of the eponymous twenty-two-year old ‘Miss’, who decides to spend a year governessing in Spain (specifically, the area around Portugalete and Bilbao in the Basque country), while her fiancé back in Mellick (Limerick) earns enough money to set them up in a comfortable married life. However, Mary returns to Ireland to break off her engagement after embarking on a doomed affair with Juanito, the married son of the family for whom she works. *Mary Lavelle* is

---

<sup>36</sup> Maura Laverty, *No More Than Human* (London: Virago, 1986), 189.

<sup>37</sup> Kate O’Brien, *Mary Lavelle* (London: Virago, 2006), 112.

<sup>38</sup> *Ibid.*, 132.

<sup>39</sup> Tucker and Casey, ‘National and Transnational’, 2.

notable as a novel that features a lesbian character, Agatha Conlan, a fellow governess who eventually confesses her desire for Mary. Laverty's *No More Than Human* is the sequel to *Never No More* (1942), which describes the experiences of a teenage girl, Delia Scully, growing up in the home of her cherished grandmother in Ballyderrig, County Kildare. After her grandmother's death in 1924, and aged just seventeen, Delia secures a position as a governess (and subsequently works as an English-language instructor and clerk) in Madrid. Her professional and romantic adventures in Spain are the subject of *No More Than Human*, at the conclusion of which she returns to Ireland and marries local Ballyderrig man and her long-time correspondent, Michael Walsh.

Published over six decades later, Tóibín's novel sees Eilis Lacey emigrate reluctantly to the USA in the early 1950s to work in a Brooklyn department store. For several months, before the sudden death of her sister Rose precipitates a return visit to Ireland, Eilis dates Tony, an Italian-American plumber, who persuades her to marry him prior to her departure. Back in Enniscorthy, Eilis is wooed by local publican Jim Farrell and contemplates leaving Tony and returning to live permanently in Ireland. However, she sails back to Brooklyn after her former employer hints that she is aware of—and will reveal—the fact that Eilis is already married. In all three novels, oppositions between home place and cosmopolitan experience are deconstructed; they trace what Eve Walsh Stoddard, writing about *Brooklyn*, calls 'a dialectic of parochial sameness in difference'.<sup>40</sup> If the *transatlantic* crossing is often framed as a journey from the Old World to the New, from economic and political backwardness to progressive modernity, from monoculture to multicultural, routing *Brooklyn* through Spain allows for a consideration of the relationship between gender, sexuality, and cis-Atlantic journeying in much more complex and multifaceted ways.

---

<sup>40</sup> Stoddard, 'Home and Belonging', 154.

There are a number of evocative overlaps and intersections between the three novels in terms of character and event. As McWilliams notes, Eilis's 'apparent passivity and lack of agency [is] an aspect of the character that has been commented on with some frequency and with some frustration in reviews of the novel'.<sup>41</sup> Indeed, the narrator tells us early on that

Eilis had always presumed that she would live in the town all her life, as her mother had done, knowing everyone, having the same friends and neighbours, the same routines in the same streets. She had expected that she would find a job in the town, and then marry someone and give up the job and have children.<sup>42</sup>

Eilis even contemplates suggesting that Rose, who is more extroverted and energetic than she is, go to Brooklyn in her place. Eilis's passivity is better understood, perhaps, when she is viewed as a latter-day Mary Lavelle who, similarly, has 'a modest estimate of herself and [has] no very urgent desire to hurl a lance against the vague and mighty world'.<sup>43</sup> Even before meeting her fiancé, she 'realised the limitations of Mellick, and of her place in it, were she to be married or single—nothing glamorous or amazing'.<sup>44</sup> Just as *Mary Lavelle*—and O'Brien's work more generally—was, until relatively recently, dismissed as an inconsequential romance, so too has Tóibín's centralizing of romance in *Brooklyn* puzzled some reviewers and irked others.<sup>45</sup> However, as Siobhan Somerville observes, 'Questions of

---

<sup>41</sup> McWilliams, *Women and Exile*, 172.

<sup>42</sup> Colm Tóibín, *Brooklyn* (London: Viking, 2009), 27–8.

<sup>43</sup> O'Brien, *Mary Lavelle*, 24.

<sup>44</sup> *Ibid.*

<sup>45</sup> On the critical tendency to dismiss O'Brien's work because she writes in the genres of family saga and romance, see Aintzane Legarreta Mentxaka, *Kate O'Brien and the Fiction of Identity: Sex, Art*

citizenship and national belonging have long been understood to be embedded within structures of desire and affect. For better or worse, in the words of Benedict Anderson, “nations inspire love, and often profoundly self-sacrificing love.”<sup>46</sup>

Equally, as Stoddard observes, while the cosmopolite finds in migration ‘an expanded sense of belonging’, some nations ‘demand of their citizens a monogamous attachment, a choice’.<sup>47</sup> In other words, the romance is a useful vehicle for interrogating questions of migration, displacement, and exile, and O’Brien’s and Tóibín’s novels evidence a keen awareness of this fact. Both Mary and Eilis engage in forbidden romances that symbolize larger betrayals of, respectively, home (Mary’s fiancé in Mellick) and adopted home (Tony in Brooklyn), and both women end up questioning their national attachments as a result of these illicit, and eventually thwarted, romances. In both novels, the poignant ‘what-ifs’ of their forbidden affairs are memorialized in cherished items. During their passionate day trip to Toledo, Juanito buys a postcard and inscribes it to Mary. While she is packing for her return to Ireland and worrying about the postcard’s safety, it is swept out of the window by a sudden gust of wind and Mary is devastated that her ‘one sweet treasure’<sup>48</sup> has disappeared. In *Brooklyn*, while Eilis prepares to return to Tony, she conceals photographs of her seaside outing with Jim, George, and Nancy in the bottom of her suitcase, knowing that on some

---

*and Politics in Mary Lavelle and Other Writings* (Jefferson, NC: McFarland, 2011), 102. On the labelling of Tóibín’s novel as ‘chick lit’, see John Spain, ‘Colm Tóibín’s “chicklit” novel makes him No. 1’, *Irish Independent*, 23 May 2009.

<sup>46</sup> Siobhan B. Somerville, ‘Notes Toward a Queer History of Naturalization’, *American Quarterly* 57, no. 3 (2005), 659.

<sup>47</sup> Stoddard, ‘Home and Belonging’, 155.

<sup>48</sup> O’Brien, *Mary Lavelle*, 255.

future date she will ‘look at them and remember what would soon, she knew now, seem like a strange, hazy dream to her’.<sup>49</sup>

Laverty’s Delia is a more spirited protagonist than either Eilis or Mary. Nonetheless, there are some striking echoes of Laverty’s novel in *Brooklyn*, notably in the deployment of the boarding-house setting to foreground the tensions and complementarities of local, national, and diasporic attachments. Two parallel scenes in *No More Than Human* and *Brooklyn*—which depict the challenges of on-board self-fashioning prior to Delia’s and Eilis’s arrivals in Madrid and New York respectively—speak to the ways in which the novels imagine the particularly gendered negotiations of space and place required of single, female migrants leaving Ireland.

In *No More Than Human*, lipstick and dress connote Delia’s mistaken assumption that she will enjoy freedoms in Spain that were unavailable to her in Ireland. Before leaving the boat at Santander, Delia dons ‘the light blue satin dress’ her grandmother had bought for her to wear to a local dance the previous Christmas, thinking that ‘Madrid deserved the best in [her] wardrobe’.<sup>50</sup> Her cabin mate, a young Jewish woman from Liverpool, gives her a box of white powder and a lipstick, which Delia applies in the lavatory of the train from Santander to Madrid before meeting her new employer. Señora Basterra (an Irishwoman and former governess herself) is unimpressed, however, and promptly informs her that to wear lipstick or rouge as a governess is entirely inappropriate. Forced to ‘deglamourize’ herself by taking off her blue satin dress and make-up, Delia notes ruefully that ‘so far as appearances went I

---

<sup>49</sup> Tóibín, *Brooklyn*, 251.

<sup>50</sup> <IBT>Laverty, *No More Than Human*</IBT>, 6.

might be going to sit down to bacon-and-cabbage in Ballyderrig instead of high lunch in Madrid'.<sup>51</sup>

A comparable scene in *Brooklyn* seems to allude quite explicitly to Laverty's novel, except that Eilis's cabin mate, a stylish blonde Englishwoman called Georgina, mentors Eilis more effectively with regard to suitable dress and appearance. Still, both Eilis and Delia encounter difficulties with the limitations of primping at sea. Speculating that there must have been 'something wrong with the water on that boat' or with the shampoo she used, Delia recalls that her hair—'never what could be called tractable'—now 'stood up on [her] head like a furze bush and pushed [her] navy straw hat up into the air'.<sup>52</sup> Meanwhile, Georgina counsels Eilis against washing her hair again before disembarking and, on the Englishwoman's advice, does not make the same sartorial blunders that Delia does. Georgina recommends that Eilis wear 'nothing fancy' when disembarking, to avoid 'looking like a tart'; nonetheless, it is important that Eilis not look 'too innocent'.<sup>53</sup> Although Eilis 'almost never' wears make-up at home, Georgina spends twenty minutes 'applying a thin cake of make-up and then some rouge, with eye-liner and mascara'.<sup>54</sup> Eilis is struck by the confidence with which her mask of make-up equips her: 'It would be easier, she imagined, to go out among people she did not know ... if she could look like this', but it would also make her nervous because 'people would look at her and might have a view on her that was wrong if she were dressed up like this every day in Brooklyn'.<sup>55</sup> Unlike Delia's arrival in Madrid,

---

<sup>51</sup> Ibid., 9.

<sup>52</sup> Ibid., 6.

<sup>53</sup> <IBT>Tóibín, *Brooklyn*</IBT>, 49.

<sup>54</sup> Ibid., 50.

<sup>55</sup> Ibid.

Eilis's entrance to the USA sees her balance successfully the need to look 'plain' or unobtrusive alongside the necessity of not looking 'too innocent'.

For Delia, the journey to Spain is not experienced as liberation from Irish mores. She observes ruefully how similar Spain is, in its multiple prohibitions, to Ireland. As Delia recounts: 'A governess must wear her skirts well below the knees. A governess must not use cosmetics. A governess must never be seen in male company. A governess must not smoke.'<sup>56</sup> She eventually concedes that whereas she had 'visualized Spain as a laughing bare-shouldered girl with a rose in her hair', she had 'turned out to be a bleak-eyed, forbidding wardress, with a bunch of keys in one hand, a penal code in the other'.<sup>57</sup> Time and again, Delia's (sexually) transgressive behaviour is linked to her sartorial choices, none more so than when, in Madrid, she purchases a scarlet swimsuit which, her fellow governesses warn her, she will not be allowed to wear when she travels to her employer's holiday home at Neguri in the Basque country. The Marquesa de la Roja duly confirms that unless she furnishes herself with more appropriate bathing attire, Delia will not be permitted to swim on the beach. Delia compares the proscription on her sartorial choices with conservative attitudes to dress in Ireland, just as she does when her attire upon arrival in Madrid meets with her first employer's disapproval. The preferred bathing suit, as described by her employer, is 'identical with the creation which [Delia's] poor mother had preserved from her Tramore honeymoon—a bloomer-legged, long-sleeved, befrilled garment of navy serge and white braid'.<sup>58</sup> Delia trades her scarlet swimsuit for the regulation one, thus dashing her hopes of attracting the attention of wealthy young men who visit the beach in the mornings.

---

<sup>56</sup> <IBT>Laverty, *No More Than Human*</IBT>, 75.

<sup>57</sup> Ibid.

<sup>58</sup> Ibid., 76.

However, after befriending a young Scot called Art McBain, Delia goes swimming with him and wears the forbidden swimsuit. When her behaviour with Art is observed by her employer, she loses her job.

The swimsuit motif is enlarged upon in *Brooklyn* in an important scene that alludes to both *No More Than Human* and *Mary Lavelle*. Tóibín's deployment of the swimsuit as a signifier of transgressive sexuality is reminiscent of Laverty; however, for the scene's queer undertones, Tóibín is likely indebted to O'Brien. In a compelling analysis of *Mary Lavelle*, Katherine O'Donnell argues that the novel invites the careful reader to interpret Mary's (apparently heteronormative) desire for Juanito as a transfer of affections from Juanito's wife Luisa. 'For a number of pages at the heart of *Mary Lavelle*', O'Donnell writes, 'it appears that the central love affair is to be between [Mary and Luisa]: their meeting is dramatic, intense and immediately intimate'.<sup>59</sup> As such, the novel 'houses queer desires'<sup>60</sup> beyond those that Agatha Conlan confesses to harbouring for Mary. In this context, and given the other similarities between Mary and Eilis, the note-trading on their Italian-American boyfriends between Eilis and her immediate superior at Bartocci's, Miss Fortini, is deeply suggestive. In one especially provocative passage, Miss Fortini orders swimming costumes for Eilis to try on, after the store has closed, with a view to Eilis purchasing one for her forthcoming outing to Coney Island with Tony:

She walked around Eilis so that she could inspect how it fitted from behind and, moving closer, put her hand under the firm elastic that held the bathing suit in

---

<sup>59</sup> Katherine O'Donnell, "'But Greek ... Usually Knows Greek": Reading Sexuality in Kate O'Brien's *Mary Lavelle*', in Patricia Boyle Haberstroh and Christine St. Peter (eds), *Opening the Field: Irish Women: Texts and Contexts* (Cork: Cork University Press, 2007), 79.

<sup>60</sup> *Ibid.*, 80.

place at the top of Eilis's thighs. She pulled the elastic down a fraction and then patted Eilis twice on the bottom, letting her hand linger the second time.<sup>61</sup>

Several times, Miss Fortini undertakes this ritual of touching Eilis close to her genitalia. She also encourages Eilis to try on different costumes several times over, ostensibly to assess their suitability. As a result, Eilis's breasts are exposed to Miss Fortini and, on one occasion, she is entirely naked. Eventually, Eilis puts an end to the encounter but is in no doubt about what it meant: 'there was in the way [Miss Fortini] stood and gazed at her something clear that Eilis knew she would never be able to tell anyone about'.<sup>62</sup> When Eilis subsequently goes swimming with Tony at Coney Island, and feels 'his erect penis hard against her', she thought 'come[s] into her mind of telling him who the last person to touch her bottom was'.<sup>63</sup> It is as though Tóibín here overwrites *Mary Lavelle* in the kind of homoerotic episode that O'Brien herself did not dare to commit to print until she published her final novel, *As Music and Splendour* (1958), featuring a year-and-a-half long romantic relationship between Irish Clare Halvey and Spanish Luisa Carriaga.<sup>64</sup>

While the romance framework performs useful cultural work by raising larger questions about national (un)belonging, gender, and sexuality, all three novels are also explicitly engaged with cis-Atlantic geography. At the outset of *Mary Lavelle*, the similarities between Mary's home place and new environment, Cabantes (Portugalete), are framed in terms of

---

<sup>61</sup> Tóibín, *Brooklyn*, 153.

<sup>62</sup> *Ibid.*, 154.

<sup>63</sup> *Ibid.*, 160.

<sup>64</sup> See, for example, the overt treatment of Clare's and Luisa's physical relationship in the twelfth chapter of *As Music and Splendour* (London: Penguin, 2005), 239–76.

their Atlantic locations.<sup>65</sup> Mary notes in a letter to her fiancé soon after her arrival that ‘it is not a bit like my idea of Spain’: ‘Perhaps it’s the sea under my window that gives me the illusion—because now the tide is out, and the smell of seaweed is coming into the room exactly as if I were in Kilbeggan. I suppose that makes me feel less strange.’<sup>66</sup> Since the ‘real’ Kilbeggan is a landlocked town in the Irish midlands, it is likely that O’Brien’s Kilbeggan is a fictionalized version of one of County Clare’s Atlantic coastal villages—Kilkee, Lahinch, or Spanish Point—that are within easy reach of Limerick (Mellick).<sup>67</sup> In a moment of nostalgia, Mary reflects on her new surroundings and finds the view ‘had no proclamation in it. In that it was—surprisingly—like Mellick.’<sup>68</sup>

If Mary is surprised by the unexpected similarities between Mellick and the Basque country, the connectedness of Cabantes, ‘a little fishing village’, to global trade routes is emphasized at the outset: ‘Ships from everywhere—and fairly big ones, about as big as come into Mellick—sail past my windows up to Altono. The children say that I will get to know all the flags of the world from watching the ships.’<sup>69</sup> In addition, the mining industry in Altono (Bilbao) and its surrounding areas not only draws in foreign workers (‘there is a large English colony in Altono’) but the area’s iron-rich mountains are the ‘fertile womb’ from

---

<sup>65</sup> For the ‘real-life’ equivalents of *Mary Lavelle*’s place names, I am indebted to Éibhear Walshe, *Kate O’Brien: A Writing Life* (Dublin: Irish Academic Press, 2006), 62 and Mentxaka, *Kate O’Brien and the Fiction of Identity*, 174.

<sup>66</sup> O’Brien, *Mary Lavelle*, 6.

<sup>67</sup> In a further historical connection between Ireland and Spain, Spanish Point is named for the ill-fated ships of the Spanish Armada that were wrecked off Ireland’s west coast in 1588.

<sup>68</sup> O’Brien, *Mary Lavelle*, 19.

<sup>69</sup> *Ibid.*, 1, 7.

which are eventually produced luxury goods that are, presumably, exported all over the world.<sup>70</sup> Mary's is a touristic gaze as she looks upon mining villages and thinks they are 'sadder and wilder than any poverty she knew in Ireland'.<sup>71</sup> This is 'an unlooked-for Spain. Busy, rich, common and progressive on the one hand—on the other, grave and pitiful. Where were the castanets and the flowers in the hair?'<sup>72</sup>

The very same landscape—the seaside towns around Bilbao, specifically Neguri and Las Arenas—also causes Delia to make rather unexpected connections between rural life in her home place and new location. While reading to her charges at her employer's villa by the sea, she likes to watch the peasants who come in from the country to do their shopping in Las Arenas. Despite the notable physical differences between these 'Indian-brown men' and 'sun-dried women' and her own 'light-skinned heavy-suited friends who at that very moment were making ready to save the turf and earth the potatoes', there is still 'a similarity between them' that expresses itself in their shared 'easy-going walk'.<sup>73</sup> The sight of the Basque peasants transports Delia imaginatively to Ballyderrig, reminding her of 'how the gorse would be scattering its golden sovereigns at home, and how the banks along the Monasterevin road would be cream-splashed with primroses'.<sup>74</sup> Her imagination assumes 'a restlessness that had no way of easing itself except in a poem',<sup>75</sup> the publication of which captures the attention of Michael Walsh and thus begins their extensive correspondence.

---

<sup>70</sup> Ibid., 7, 64.

<sup>71</sup> Ibid., 64.

<sup>72</sup> Ibid.

<sup>73</sup> <IBT>Lavery, *No More Than Human*</IBT>, 65.

<sup>74</sup> Ibid., 66.

<sup>75</sup> Ibid.

On several occasions, the connections Delia forges between Spain and Ireland prove both aesthetically and financially fruitful. On Michael's advice, she researches the similarities between Irish and Spanish folktales and thereafter receives payment when she publishes English translations of Spanish legends in the Irish Catholic magazine *Our Boys*. Travelling 'to and from Tablada between the arid Castilian acres', she feels 'a great longing to rest [her] eyes on the rich freshness of an Irish wheatfield'; the resulting poem is published in an Irish magazine.<sup>76</sup> Finally, while recovering from scarlet fever, Delia manages to finance her return to Ireland by writing twelve stories with a Spanish setting for *Our Boys*.

In *Brooklyn*, too, seaside locations provide important 'mirror scenes' through which Wexford and Brooklyn are mutually reflected and refracted. At first glance, the scenes seem to function in terms of contrasts.<sup>77</sup> However, closer inspection reveals, as with other mirror scenes in *Brooklyn*, that what Wexford's Irish Sea (the comforts and limitations of 'home') and New York's Atlantic shoreline (the anxieties and opportunities of an alien environment) represent are ultimately not all that different from one another. During one of her bouts of homesickness, Eilis becomes lost in a reverie about her home county's coastal locations: 'She was flying, as though in a balloon, over the calm sea on a calm day. Below, she could see the cliffs at Cush Gap and the soft sand at Ballyconnigar. The wind was propelling her towards Blackwater, then the Ballagh, then Monageer, then Vinegar Hill and Enniscorthy.'<sup>78</sup> When

---

<sup>76</sup> *Ibid.*, 211.

<sup>77</sup> On mirror scenes in *Brooklyn*, see Sinéad Moynihan, "'We Are Where We Are': Colm Tóibín's *Brooklyn*, Mythologies of Return and the Post-Celtic Tiger Moment', in Leslie Elizabeth Eckel and Clare Frances Elliott (eds), *Edinburgh Companion to Atlantic Literary Studies* (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2016), 88–102.

<sup>78</sup> <IBT>Tóibín, *Brooklyn*</IBT>, 68.

Eilis returns to Wexford and goes on a seaside outing with her friends, they eschew Curraclloe, fearing that it might be too crowded, and opt instead for Cush Gap. This idealized setting could not be more different from Eilis's experience of Coney Island: she and Tony travel on a teeming subway train, only to arrive at a beach that is similarly overcrowded. Despite the fact that the water, when compared with that of the Irish Sea, seems warm to Eilis, she realizes, in a none-too-subtle passage, 'that she would have to be careful not to swim too far out of her depth in this unfamiliar sea. Tony, she saw, was afraid of the water, hated her for swimming away from him.'<sup>79</sup>

Before Eilis leaves Brooklyn, Tony shares with her his plans to build family houses on a plot of land by the sea on Long Island. Despite the apparent opportunities offered by 'this unfamiliar sea', Eilis realizes that her life on the Atlantic seaboard will not be all that different from what it would have been had she not emigrated at all. Prior to leaving Enniscorthy, she expected 'she would find a job in the town, and then marry someone and give up the job and have children'.<sup>80</sup> After marrying Tony, she acknowledges that, despite the fact that she would like to keep working, 'she would stay at home, cleaning the house and preparing food and shopping and then having children and looking after them as well'.<sup>81</sup>

## Coda

If *Brooklyn* is 'a sly, mid-Atlantic appropriation' of elements of *Mary Lavelle* and *No More Than Human*, Tóibín's *The Empty Family* challenges readers to look beyond the transatlantic

---

<sup>79</sup> Ibid., 160.

<sup>80</sup> Ibid., 28.

<sup>81</sup> Ibid., 220.

by explicitly rewriting aspects of the novel that immediately preceded it. Most of the stories in the collection thematize various forms of displacement and exile, with one in particular engaging very provocatively with *Brooklyn*. In the title story, set in the contemporary moment, the unnamed narrator returns to County Wexford from California. The story's mode of address, to a male 'you' who is implicitly the estranged lover of the narrator whom s/he left behind in Ireland, recalls the 'what-if' of Eilis Lacey's thwarted romance with Jim Farrell. Like Eilis, who only understands as she walks through the Enniscorthy graveyard 'the extent to which she had been dreading' visiting Rose's grave, the narrator of 'The Empty Family' realizes that 'Home [is] some graves where my dead lay outside the town of Enniscorthy.'<sup>82</sup> However, the story reworks *Brooklyn*'s Irish Sea/Atlantic mirror scenes by replacing the Atlantic with the Pacific Ocean: the narrator returns to Ireland when s/he realizes that s/he was taking repeated day trips to Point Reyes on the Pacific coast because s/he missed the views of Rosslare Harbour and Tuskar Rock lighthouse that the family home at Ballyconnigar afforded: 'I went out to Point Reyes every Saturday so I could miss home.'<sup>83</sup> S/he therefore returns to 'my own forgiving sea, a softer, more domesticated beach, and my own lighthouse, less dramatic and less long-suffering'.<sup>84</sup> At the family graves, the narrator leaves stones they have carried from California, stones that have been 'washed by the waves of the Pacific'.<sup>85</sup>

This chapter has suggested that one productive way of reading *Brooklyn* is to reroute it through Spanish-set Irish fictions of the 1930s and 1940s. *The Empty Family* further invites

---

<sup>82</sup> Tóibín, *Brooklyn*, 209; Colm Tóibín, *The Empty Family* (New York: Scribner, 2012), 30.

<sup>83</sup> <IBT>Tóibín, *The Empty Family*</IBT>, 29.

<sup>84</sup> Ibid.

<sup>85</sup> Ibid., 30.

readers to consider Tóibín's recycling of certain locations, motifs, and scenarios as a formal complement to his capacious engagement with forms of transnationalism that both flirt with and reject the 'grand narrative' of Irish America.

## Further Reading

Appadurai, Arjun. *Modernity at Large: Cultural Dimensions in Globalization*. Minneapolis, MN: University of Minnesota Press, 1996.

Armitage, David. 'Three Concepts of Atlantic History'. In David Armitage and Michael J. Braddick (eds), *The British Atlantic World, 1500–1800*. Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan, 2002: 11–25.

Brannigan, John. *Archipelagic Modernism: Literature in the Irish and British Isles, 1890–1970*. Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2015.

Doyle, Laura. 'At World's Edge: Post/Coloniality, Charles Maturin, and the Gothic Wanderer', *Nineteenth-Century Literature* 65, no. 4 (2011): 513–47.

Fishkin, Shelley Fisher. 'Crossroads of Cultures: The Transnational Turn in American Studies—Presidential Address to the American Studies Association, November 12, 2004', *American Quarterly* 57, no. 1 (2005): 17–57.

Frawley, Oona (ed.). *Memory Ireland, Volume 2: Diaspora and Memory Practices*. Syracuse, NY: Syracuse University Press, 2012.

Harte, Liam (ed.). *The Literature of the Irish in Britain: Autobiography and Memoir, 1725–2001*. Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan, 2009.

McWilliams, Ellen. *Women and Exile in Contemporary Irish Fiction*. Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan, 2013.

Morgan, Jack. *New World Irish: Notes on One Hundred Years of Lives and Letters in American Culture*. Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan, 2011.

Murray, Tony. *London Irish Fictions: Narrative, Diaspora and Identity*. Liverpool: Liverpool University Press, 2012.

Tucker, Amanda and Moira Casey (eds). *Where Motley is Worn: Transnational Irish Literatures*. Cork: Cork University Press, 2014.

Vertovec, Steven. 'Conceiving and Researching Transnationalism', *Ethnic and Racial Studies* 22, no. 2 (1999): 447–62.